

Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorney Fees

Al-Haramain Islamic Found. Oregon et al. v. Obama et al.
(07-cv-109-VRW) (3:06-md-1791-VRW)

Appendix 5

DUPLICATIVE HOURS BY ATTORNEY

Appendix 5 - Duplicative Hours by Counsel

The following spreadsheet lists the counsel who worked on an identified project in the case (*e.g.*, complaint, motion) and sets forth a calculation of the combined hours that all counsel worked on the project. This combined duplicative number of hours is then reduced by 25%. Estimates of time devoted to a particular project were made by taking the number of hours in a block entry that identifies the subject area of the project (*e.g.*, complaint) and dividing by the number of subject areas identified in block. More than one discrete activity that relates to work on the same project is treated as one subject area (*e.g.*, research, writing, analysis, review of defendants' motion, and prepare opposition to motion, is treated as one subject area for purposes of this calculation). These estimates for duplicative hours attempt to account for separate reductions made for consultations with co-counsel in Appendix 4 by treating consultations as a separate activity added to the divisor (thus reducing the amount of time attributed to the particular project). For example, an entry indicating that counsel researched and drafted a work product (*e.g.*, complaint) and consulted with co-counsel, for a total of 18 hours, is treated as 9 hours for work on the complaint.

Note: Page references in the chart are to the page numbers indicated in the ECF generated header at the **top** of the declaration cited.

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Complaint</i>	Albies	2/5/06 - 2/27/06	2	18.3	9.1	Albies Decl. 3:10-11
	Eisenberg	2/27/2006	2	1	0.5	Eisenberg Decl. 5:14-15
	Goldberg	12/16/05-2/28/06	2	12.2	6.1	Goldberg Decl. 5:2
	Hassan	2/19/06-2/28/06	2	10.6	5.3	Hassan Decl. 3:26-27
	Nelson	12/16/05-2/28/06	1	96	96	Nelson Decl. 7:4-10
				TOTAL:	117	
<i>Recusal Judge</i>	Eisenberg	3/2/06-3/7/06	2	1.7	0.85	Eisenberg Decl.5:16-17
	Goldberg	2/28/06-12/20/06	2	3.4	1.7	Goldberg Decl. 5:5-6
	Nelson	3/1/06-12/20/06	5	65.6	13.12	Nelson Decl. 7:13-19
				TOTAL:	15.67	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Preparation of Discovery; Motion to Compel</i>	Albies	3/2/06-4/17/06	5	54.8	10.96	Albies Decl. 3:13-15
	Albies	5/16/06-8/29/06	4	52.5	13.13	Albies Decl. 3:22-24
	Eisenberg	3/18/06-4/14/06	5	26.5	5.3	Eisenberg Decl. 5:20-22
	Eisenberg	5/3/06-5/21/06	2	7.2	3.6	Eisenberg Decl. 5:27-28
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	2	11	5.5	Goldberg Decl. 5:21-22
	Goldberg	7/2/06-9/22/06	1	18	18	Goldberg Decl. 6:7-8
	Goldberg	7/1/06-8/29/06	3	23	7.6	Goldberg Decl.6:9-13
	Goldberg	3/14/07-3/27/07	5	17	3.4	Goldberg Decl. 6:24-28
	Hassan	3/17/06-5/25/06	8	21.5	2.7	Hassan Decl. 4:1-4
	Hassan	5/26/06-6/28/06	2	5.4	2.7	Hassan Decl. 4:26-27
	Jaskol	5/17/06-9/14/06	4	7.3	1.8	Jaskol Decl. 5:1-3
	Nelson	3/1/06-12/20/06	5	65.6	13.12	Nelson Decl. 7:13-19

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Nelson	3/25/06-5/1/06	5	112.1	22.42	Nelson Decl. 8:1-2
	Nelson	5/6/06-9/22/06	13	214.5	16.9	Nelson Decl. 8:3-15
				TOTAL:	127.13	
<i>Opposition to Ex Parte Filing by USG</i>						
	Albies	4/18/06 - 4/23/06	3	33.5	11.2	Albies Decl. 3:16-18
	Albies	5/16/06-8/29/06	1	1	1	Albies Decl.3:25-26
	Eisenberg	4/18/06-5/22/06	2	70	35	Eisenberg Decl.5:23-24
	Eisenberg	5/25/06-5/26/06	2	1.5	0.75	Eisenberg Decl. 6:1-2
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	5	10.9	2.18	Goldberg Decl.5:15-18
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	2	15.5	7.75	Goldberg Decl. 5:10-14
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	4	34	8.5	Goldberg Decl. 5:7-9
	Hassan	3/17/06-5/25/06	8	21.5	2.7	Hassan Decl. 4:1-4
	Hassan	3/17/06-5/25/06	4	46.1	11.5	Hassan Decl. 4:7-13

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Jaskol	4/19/06-5/25/06	1	21.5	21.5	Jaskol Decl. 4:25-28
	Nelson	3/25/06-5/1/06	5	112.1	22.42	Nelson Decl. 8:1-2
				TOTAL:	124.5	
<i>Plaintiffs Access to Sealed Documents</i>						
	Albies	3/2/06-4/17/06	5	54.8	10.96	Albies Decl. 3:13-15
	Albies	3/2/06-4/17/06	4	52.5	13.13	Albies Decl. 3:22-24
	Eisenberg	5/28/06-6/16/06	2	55.7	27.85	Eisenberg Decl. 6:3-5
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	4	34	8.5	Goldberg Decl. 5:7-9
	Goldberg	5/28/06-6/7/06	2	18	9	Goldberg Decl. 5:23-26
	Hassan	5/28/06-6/7/06	2	7.1	3.5	Hassan Decl. 4:14-16
	Jaskol	3/17/06-6/19/06	3	32.9	10.9	Jaskol Decl. 4:22-24

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Nelson	3/1/06-12/20/06	5	65.6	13.12	Nelson Decl. 7:13-19
				TOTAL:	96.96	
<i>Oregonian Motion to Unseal</i>	Albies	4/18/06-4/23/06	3	33.5	11.2	Albies Decl. 3:16-18
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	2	15.5	7.75	Goldberg Decl. 5:10-14
	Goldberg	3/17/06-5/25/06	5	10.9	2.18	Goldberg Decl.5:15-18
	Hassan	3/17/06-5/25/06	4	46.1	11.5	Hassan Decl. 4:7-13
	Nelson	3/1/06-12/20/06	5	65.6	13.12	Nelson Decl. 7:13-19
	Nelson	5/6/06-9/22/06	13	214.5	16.9	Nelson Decl. 8:3-15
				TOTAL:	62.65	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Opposition to 2006 Motion to Dismiss</i>	Albies	5/16/06-8/29/06	4	52.5	13.13	Albies Decl. 3:22-24
	Eisenberg	6/12/06-7/4/06	2	66.5	33.25	Eisenberg Decl. 6:6-7
	Eisenberg	8/17/06-8/29/06	1	41.6	41.6	Eisenberg Decl. 6:15-16
	Goldberg	7/1/06-8/29/06	3	23	7.6	Goldberg Decl.6:9-13
	Hassan	7/1/06-8/29/06	4	21	5.25	Hassan Decl. 4:22-25
	Jaskol	6/6/09-9/7/06	3	26.3	8.76	Jaskol Decl. 5:10-13
				TOTAL:	109.59	
<i>Opposition to MDL Transfer</i>	Eisenberg	6/20/06-6/27/06	2	45.7	22.85	Eisenberg Decl.6:8-9
	Eisenberg	9/12/06-9/25/06	1	20.8	20.8	Eisenberg Decl. 6:22
	Eisenberg	10/24/06-10/26/06	1	10.1	10.1	Eisenberg Decl. 6:25
	Eisenberg	11/8/06-11/9/06	1	5.7	5.7	Eisenberg Decl.7:4-5
	Goldberg	6/21/06-10/28/06	2	22.5	11.25	Goldberg Decl. 6:1-3

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Hassan	6/22/06-9/18/06	1	13.4	13.4	Hassan Decl. 4:17-21
	Jaskol	6/2/06-9/5/06	4	9.9	2.5	Jaskol Decl. 5:5-8
	Jaskol	9/21/06-11/9/06	1	13.4	13.4	Jaskol Decl. 5:20-22
	Nelson	5/6/06-9/22/06	13	214.5	16.9	Nelson Decl. 8:3-15
				TOTAL:	116.9	
<i>Preparation Plaintiffs 2006 Partial Summary Judgment</i>						
	Albies	10/23/2006-11/1/06	2	30.5	15.25	Albies Decl.4:6-8
	Eisenberg	8/30/06-10/31/06	2	71.2	35.6	Eisenberg Decl. 6:20-21
	Goldberg	10/23/06-11/1/06	2	22	11	Goldberg Decl. 6:14-19
	Hancock	11/1/06-11/27/06	5	5.7	1.14	Hancock Decl. 4:6-7
	Hassan	9/7/06-11/1/06	5	18.6	3.72	Hassan Decl. 5:1-6

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Jaskol	10/23/06-10/27/06	2	5.6	2.8	Jaskol Decl. 5:23-25
				TOTAL:	69.51	
<i>Opposition to Petition for Interlocutory Review & Stay Pending Appeal</i>						
	Albies	8/18/06-9/25/06	2	5.6	2.8	Albies Decl.4:1-3
	Albies	9/25/06-10/24/06	2	27.9	13.95	Albies Decl.4:4-5
	Eisenberg	8/10/06-8/15/06	2	5	2.5	Eisenberg Decl. 6:12-14
	Eisenberg	9/20/06-11/1/06	2	44.3	22.15	Eisenberg Decl. 6:23-24
	Eisenberg	2/1/07-2/19/07	3	21.3	7.1	Eisenberg Decl. 7:26-27
	Eisenberg	3/26/07-3/28/07	1	23	23	Eisenberg Decl. 8:6-7
	Eisenberg	4/5/07-4/6/07	1	1	5.2	Eisenberg Decl. 8:8-9
	Goldberg	3/14/07-3/27/07	5	17	3.4	Goldberg Decl. 6:24-28
	Hancock	2/05/07-2/20/07	2	4.5	2.25	Hancock Decl. 4:10-11
	Hassan	9/7/06-11/17/06	2	12.7	6.35	Hassan Decl. 5:7-9

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Hassan	11/17/06-3/22/07	8	12.3	1.54	Hassan Decl. 5:11-15
	Hassan	3/24/07-4/12/07	2	3.9	1.95	Hassan Decl. 5:16-19
	Jaskol	9/20/06-9/29/06	2	11.2	5.8	Jaskol Decl. 5:17-19
	Jaskol	10/24/06-11/1/06	1	3.6	3.6	Jaskol Decl. 5:26-27
	Nelson	5/6/06-9/22/06	13	214.5	16.9	Nelcon Decl. 8:3-15
				TOTAL:	118.49	
<i>Work on Merits of 2006 Appeal</i>	Albies	5/31/07-8/28/07	2	31.5	15.75	Albies Decl.4:14-16
	Eisenberg	3/26/07-4/26/07	1	22.7	22.7	Eisenberg Decl. 8:4-5
	Eisenberg	4/17/07-4/20/07	2	12	6	Eisenberg Decl. 8:10-11
	Eisenberg	4/27/07-7/5/07	2	177.1	88.5	Eisenberg Decl. 8:12-13
	Eisenberg	6/15/07-6/26/07	1	9.8	9.8	Eisenberg Decl. 8:14-15
	Eisenberg	7/2/07-8/16/07	1	121.1	121.1	Eisenberg Decl. 8:16-18
	Eisenberg	7/21/07-7/25/07	1	7.4	7.4	Eisenberg Decl. 8:19
	Eisenberg	8/4/07-8/6/07	1	6.5	6.5	Eisenberg Decl. 8:20

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Eisenberg	8/17/07-8/31/07	1	33.9	33.9	Eisenberg Decl. 8:21-22
	Eisenberg	8/16/07-8/31/07	1	6.6	6.6	Eisenberg Decl. 8:23-24
	Eisenberg	11/16/07-11/26/07	1	13.2	13.2	Eisenberg Decl. 8:28-9:1
	Goldberg	5/31/07-8/28/07	2	80.8	40.4	Goldberg Decl. 7:1-10
	Hancock	5/1/07-6/30/07	1	12.6	12.6	Hancock Decl. 4:14-16
	Hancock	7/1/07-9/30/07	1	41	41	Hancock Decl. 4:17-19
	Hancock	3/13/07-4/30/07	4	7.3	1.8	Hancock Decl. 4:12-13
	Hancock	10/1/07-12/31/07	1	4.3	4.3	Hancock Decl. 4:20-21
	Hassan	5/31/07-8/31/07	2	46.8	23.4	Hassan Decl. 5:20-28
	Jaskol	6/10/07-8/30/07	1	29	29	Jaskol Decl. 6:11-16
	Nelson	1/1/07-6/29/07	7	152.7	21.8	Nelson Decl. 9:1-9
	Nelson	7/1/07-12/14/07	6	48.1	8	Nelson Decl. 9:10-18
				TOTAL:	513.75	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Plaintiffs 2007 Partial Summary Judgment</i>	Eisenberg	3/12/07-3/23/07	2	30.2	15.1	Eisenberg Decl.8:2-3
	Eisenberg	12/28/07-2/5/08	2	71.5	35.75	Eisenberg Decl. 9:4-5
	Hancock	3/13/07-4/30/07	4	7.3	1.8	Hancock Decl. 4:12-13
				TOTAL:	52.65	
<i>Opposition to USG Second Motion to Dismiss</i>	Albies	3/15/08-4/23/08	2	12.3	6.15	Albies Decl.4:20-22
	Eisenberg	2/11/08-3/31/08	1	87.5	87.5	Eisenberg Decl. 9:8-9
	Eisenberg	4/9/08-4/14/08	1	19.1	19.1	Eisenberg Decl. 9:10-11

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Eisenberg	4/15/08-4/24/08	1	29	29	Eisenberg Decl. 9:13-14
	Goldberg	2/7/08-4/23/08	2	83.3	41.65	Goldberg Decl. 7:16-22
	Hancock	1/1/08-5/31/08	4	14.3	3.57	Hancock Decl.3: 22-24
	Hassan	1/30/08-7/3/08	4	15.8	3.95	Hassan Decl. 6:4-10
	Jaskol	3/16/08-7/2/08	2	19.3	9.65	Jaskol Decl. 6:19-23
	Nelson	2/3/08-7/2/08	8	11.7	1.5	Nelson Decl. 9:19-24
				TOTAL:	202.07	
<i>Plaintiffs Amended Complaint</i>						
	Albies	7/3/08-7/21/08	3	3.6	1.2	Albies Decl.3:23-24
	Eisenberg	7/4/08-7/29/08	2	72.9	36.45	Eisenberg Decl. 9:17-18
	Goldberg	7/2/08-9/15/08	4	34.8	8.7	Goldberg Decl. 7:23-27

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Hancock	6/1/08-7/31/08	3	27.6	9.2	Hancock Decl. 4:25-27
	Hassan	11/17/06-3/22/07	8	12.3	1.54	Hassan Decl. 5:11-15
	Hassan	7/2/08-9/15/08	6	12.3	2.05	Hassan Decl. 6:11-15
	Jaskol	7/6/08-7/24/08	2	11.1	5.5	Jaskol Decl. 6:24-26
	Nelson	1/1/07-6/29/07	7	152.7	21.8	Nelson Decl. 9:1-9
	Nelson	7/3/08-12/15/08	3	22.3	7.4	Nelson Decl. 10:3-10
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	104.11	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:	
<i>Opposition to Third USG Motion to Dismiss</i>	Albies	10/7/08-12/18/08	3	18.1	6	Albies Decl. 4:25-28	
	Eisenberg	11/16/08-12/9/08	3	27.1	9	Eisenberg Decl. 9:27-28	
	Eisenberg	9/30/08-10/23/08	2	90.6	45.3	Eisenberg Decl. 9:23-24	
	Goldberg	9/24/08-12/2/08	3	43.7	14.56	Goldberg Decl.8:1-4	
	Hancock	8/1/08-12/31/08	6	17.6	2.9	Hancock Decl. 5:1-5	
	Hassan	9/4/08-12/2/08	4	16	4	Hassan Decl. 6:16-20	
	Jaskol	10/3/08-1/7/09	2	8.1	4.05	Jaskol Decl. 7:8-10	
	Nelson	2/3/08-7/2/08	8	11.7	1.5	Nelson Decl. 9:19-24	
					TOTAL:	87.31	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
Work on Plaintiffs 1806(f) Motion	Albies	10/7/08-12/18/08	3	18.1	6	Albies Decl. 4:25-28
	Eisenberg	8/26/08-9/30/08	2	70.7	35.35	Eisenberg Decl. 9:21-22
	Eisenberg	10/23/08-11/14/08	2	51	25.5	Eisenberg Decl. 9:25-26
	Goldberg	11/18/07-1/29/08	4	12.4	3.1	Goldberg Decl. 7:12-15
	Goldberg	9/24/08-12/2/08	3	43.7	14.56	Goldberg Decl.8:1-4
	Hancock	8/1/08-12/31/08	6	17.6	2.9	Hancock Decl. 5:1-5
	Hassan	9/1/07-1/29/08	4	26.2	6.55	Hassan Decl. 6:1-3
	Hassan	9/4/08-12/2/08	4	16	4	Hassan Decl. 6:16-20
	Jaskol	9/4/08-11/3/08	2	3.1	1.55	Jaskol Decl. 7:5-6
	Nelson	2/3/08-7/2/08	8	11.7	1.5	Nelson Decl. 9:19-24
	Nelson	7/3/08-12/15/08	3	22.3	7.4	Nelson Decl.10:3-10

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
				TOTAL:	108.41	
<i>Work on USG Appeal in Jan. 2009 1292(b), Stay Pending Appeal, Ninth Circuit Work</i>	Eisenberg	1/17/09-2/23/09	2	53.5	26.75	Eisenberg Decl. 10:7-8
	Eisenberg	1/26/09-2/6/09	2	32.5	16.25	Eisenberg Decl. 10:9-10
	Eisenberg	2/12/09-2/13/09	2	11.6	5.8	Eisenberg Decl. 10:13-15
	Eisenberg	2/23/09-2/26/09	1	17.5	17.5	Eisenberg Decl. 10:16-17
	Eisenberg	2/27/2009	1	1	1	Eisenberg Decl. 10:18-19
	Goldberg	1/28/09-2/25/09	2	21.4	10.7	Goldberg Decl. 8:12-15
	Hancock	1/1/09-3/31/09	1	10.7	10.7	Hancock Decl. 5:6-8
	Jaskol	1/17/09-2/26/09	2	4.6	2.3	Jaskol Decl. 7:11-13

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	101.27	
Work Proposed Protective Order	Eisenberg	4/20/09-5/15/09	2	29.4	14.7	Eisenberg Decl. 11:2-4
	Goldberg	3/2/09-6/3/09	4	32.4	8.1	Goldberg Decl. 8:16-23
	Jaskol	4/21/09-4/23/09	1	3	3	Jaskol Decl. 7:17
	Jaskol	5/15/2009	1	1	1.7	Jaskol Decl. 7:18-20
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	37.77	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
<i>Work on Order to Show Cause re: Protective Order Sanctions</i>	Albies	1/5/09-6/5/09	6	33.2	5.5	Albies Decl. 5:1-5
	Eisenberg	5/25/09-5/31/09	2	39.7	19.85	Eisenberg Decl. 11: 7-10
	Eisenberg	6/1/09-6/3/09	1	15.9	15.9	Eisenberg Decl. 11:11-12
	Goldberg	3/2/09-6/3/09	4	32.4	8.1	Goldberg Decl. 8:16-23
	Hancock	4/1/09-6/30/09	5	30.9	6.2	Hancock Decl. 4:9-15
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
				TOTAL:	65.82	

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
Work on Plaintiffs 2009 Partial Summary Judgment Motion	Albies	6/11/09-9/23/09	2	21.5	10.75	Albies Decl. 4:6-10
	Eisenberg	6/4/09-7/9/09	2	63.9	31.95	Eisenberg Decl. 10:13-14
	Eisenberg	7/13/09-9/9/09	2	82.2	41.1	Eisenberg Decl. 10:16-18
	Eisenberg	7/10/09-7/12/09	1	7	7	Eisenberg Decl. 11:15
	Eisenberg	9/17/09-9/23/09	1	23.5	23.5	Eisenberg Decl. 11:25-26
	Goldberg	6/16/09-9/23/09	3	35.8	11.9	Goldberg Decl. 8:25-28
	Hancock	7/1/09-12/31/09	3	6.8	2.26	Hancock Decl. 4:16-18
	Hassan	5/27/09-3/30/10	2	10.4	5.2	Hassan Decl. 6:23-27
	Jaskol	5/27/09-4/13/10	2	14	7	Jaskol Decl. 7:23-25
	Nelson	1/09-present	11	113	10.27	Nelson Decl. 10:12-24
					TOTAL:	150.93

Al- Haramain Islamic Foundation

v.

Obama

Duplicative Hours

TASK:	TIMEKEEPER:	DATES:	NO. OF SUBJECT AREAS	HOURS IN BLOCK	HOURS: (Total Hours Claimed / No. of Subjects)	DECL. CITATION:
SUMMARY						
Timekeeper:	2006 / (25%)	2007 / (25%)	2008 / (25%)	2009 / (25%)	2010	TOTAL
Albies	141.56 / (35.4)	x	19.35 / (4.83)	16.25 / (4.1)	x	177.16 / (44.33)
Eisenberg	262.6/ (65.65)	366.1 / (91.52)	341.05 / (85.26)	190.8 / (47.7)	x	1160.55 / (290.13)
Goldberg	114.61 / (28.65)	43.8 / (10.95)	82.57 / (20.64)	38.8 / (9.7)	x	279.78 / (69.94)
Hancock	1.14 /(.28)	63.75 / (15.93)	18.57 / (4.64)	19.16 / (4.79)	x	102.62 / (25.64)
Hassan	62.27 / (15.57)	28.43 / (7.1)	20.55 / (5.13)	5.2 / (1.3)	x	116.45 / (29.1)
Jaskol	71.06 / (17.76)	29 / (7.25)	20.75 / (5.16)	14 / (3.5)	x	134.81 / (33.67)
Nelson	260.92 / (65.23)	51.6 / (12.5)	19.3 / (4.82)	51.35 / (12.83)	x	383.17 / (95.38)
TOTAL:	914.16 / (228.54)	582.68 / (145.25)	522.14 / (130.48)	335.56 / (83.92)	x	2354.54 / (588.19)

Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorney Fees

Al-Haramain Islamic Found. Oregon et al. v. Obama et al.
(07-cv-109-VRW) (3:06-md-1791-VRW)

HEARING ATTENDANCE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)
INC., et al.)
)
Plaintiffs,) CV No. 06-274-KI
)
vs.) April 25, 2006
)
GEORGE W. BUSH, et al,) Portland, Oregon
)
Defendants.)

TRANSCRIPT OF TELEPHONIC CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: J. Ashlee Albise
Zaha S. Hassan
Thomas H. Nelson
Steven Goldberg
Lisa R. Jaskol

FOR THE DEFENDANTS: Anthony J. Coppolino
Andrea Marie Gacki
James L. Sutherland

FOR OREGON PUBLISHING: Charles F. Hinkle

COURT REPORTER: Dennis R. Grube
1000 S.W. Third Ave, Rm. 301
Portland, OR 97204
(503) 326-8180

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)	
INC., an Oregon nonprofit)	
corporation, et al.,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	No. CV-06-274-KI
)	
vs.)	June 19, 2006
)	
GEORGE W. BUSH, President of the)	Portland, Oregon
United States, et al.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	

TELEPHONE CONFERENCE
TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

APPEARANCES

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:

Steven Goldberg
Attorney at Law
621 S. W. Morrison
Suite 1450
Portland, OR 97205

Jon B. Eisenberg
Attorney at Law
1970 Broadway
Suite 1200
Oakland, CA 94612

Jessica Ashlee Albies
Law Office of J. Ashlee Albies
621 S.W. Alder Street
Suite 621
Portland, OR 97205

1 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Zaha S. Hassan
2 Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
3 825 N.E. Multnomah Street
Suite 925
Portland, OR 97232-2150

4 Lisa R. Jaskol
5 Attorney at Law
6 15760 Ventura Boulevard
18th Floor
Encino, CA 91436

7 FOR THE DEFENDANTS: Andrea Marie Gacki
8 U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
9 Room 7334
Washington, DC 20001

10 Andrew H. Tannenbaum
11 U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
12 P. O. Box 883
Washington, DC 20044

13 James L. Sutherland
14 Assistant United States Attorney
U.S. Attorney's Office
15 1000 S.W. Third Avenue
Suite 600
16 Portland, OR 97204

17 Carl Nichols

18 COURT REPORTER: Nancy M. Walker, CSR, RMR, CRR
19 United States District Courthouse
1000 S. W. Third Avenue, Room 301
20 Portland, OR 97204
(503) 326-8186

21 Proceedings recorded stenographically,
22 computer-aided transcription
23
24
25

1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2 FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON
3 AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)
4 INC., an Oregon nonprofit)
corporation, et al.,)
5 Plaintiffs,) No. CV-06-274-KI
6 vs.) June 27, 2006
7 GEORGE W. BUSH, President of the)
United States, et al.,) Portland, Oregon
8 Defendants.)
9 -----

10

11

TELEPHONE CONFERENCE

12

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

13

BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING

14

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

15

16

APPEARANCES

17

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Steven Goldberg
Attorney at Law
621 S. W. Morrison
Suite 1450
Portland, OR 97205

18

19

20

Jon B. Eisenberg
Attorney at Law
1970 Broadway
Suite 1200
Oakland, CA 94612

21

22

23

Jessica Ashlee Albies
Law Office of J. Ashlee Albies
621 S.W. Alder Street
Suite 621
Portland, OR 97205

24

25

♀

2

1 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Thomas H. Nelson
Zaha S. Hassan
Page 1

2 062706king
Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
3 825 N.E. Multnomah Street
Suite 925
4 Portland, OR 97232-2150

5 Lisa R. Jaskol
Attorney at Law
6 15760 Ventura Boulevard
18th Floor
7 Encino, CA 91436

8 FOR THE DEFENDANTS: Anthony J. Coppolino
U.S. Department of Justice
9 20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Room 6102
10 Washington, DC 20530

11 Andrea Marie Gacki
U.S. Department of Justice
12 20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Room 7334
13 Washington, DC 20001

14 Andrew H. Tannenbaum
U.S. Department of Justice
15 20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
P. O. Box 883
16 Washington, DC 20044

17 James L. Sutherland
Assistant United States Attorney
18 U.S. Attorney's Office
1000 S.W. Third Avenue
19 Suite 600
Portland, OR 97204

20 COURT REPORTER: Nancy M. Walker, CSR, RMR, CRR
United States District Courthouse
21 1000 S. W. Third Avenue, Room 301
Portland, OR 97204
22 (503) 326-8186

23 Proceedings recorded stenographically,
24 computer-aided transcription

25

♀

3

1 P R O C E E D I N G S
2 THE CLERK: Good afternoon, Counsel.
3 Mr. Sutherland?
4 MR. SUTHERLAND: Yes.
5 THE CLERK: Mr. Nelson?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)	
INC., an Oregon nonprofit)	
corporation, et al.,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	No. CV-06-274-KI
)	
vs.)	August 29, 2006
)	
GEORGE W. BUSH, President of the)	Portland, Oregon
United States, et al.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	

MOTION HEARING
TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

APPEARANCES

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:

Steven Goldberg
Attorney at Law
621 S. W. Morrison
Suite 1450
Portland, OR 97205

Jon B. Eisenberg
Attorney at Law
1970 Broadway
Suite 1200
Oakland, CA 94612

Jessica Ashlee Albies
Law Office of J. Ashlee Albies
621 S.W. Alder Street
Suite 621
Portland, OR 97205

Thomas H. Nelson
Zaha S. Hassan
Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
825 N.E. Multnomah Street
Suite 925
Portland, OR 97232-2150

Lisa R. Jaskol
Attorney at Law
15760 Ventura Boulevard
18th Floor
Encino, CA 91436

FOR THE DEFENDANTS:

Anthony J. Coppolino
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Room 6102
Washington, DC 20530

Andrea Marie Gacki
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Room 7334
Washington, DC 20001

Andrew H. Tannenbaum
U.S. Department of Justice
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
P. O. Box 883
Washington, DC 20044

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COURT REPORTER: Nancy M. Walker, CSR, RMR, CRR
United States District Courthouse
1000 S. W. Third Avenue, Room 301
Portland, OR 97204
(503) 326-8186

Proceedings recorded stenographically,
computer-aided transcription

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF OREGON

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC FOUNDATION,)
INC., an Oregon nonprofit)
corporation, et al.,)

Plaintiffs,) No. CV-06-274-KI

v) November 1, 2006

GEORGE W. BUSH, President of the) Portland, Oregon
United States, et al.,)

Defendants,)

_____)

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

BEFORE THE HONORABLE GARR M. KING,
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

APPEARANCES

FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Steven Goldberg
Attorney at Law
621 SW Morrison, Suite 1450
Portland, OR 97205

Jon B. Eisenberg
Attorney at Law
1970 SW Broadway, Suite 1200
Oakland, CA 94612

Jessica Ashlee Albies
Law Office of Jessica Ashlee Albies
621 SW Alder Street, Suite 621
Portland, OR 97205

1 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS: Zaha S. Hassan
2 Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
3 825 NE Multnomah St. Suite 925
4 Portland, OR 97232

5 Lisa R. Jaskol
6 Attorney at Law
7 15760 Ventura Blvd, 18th Floor
8 Encino, CA 91436

9 FOR THE DEFENDANTS: Andrea Marie Gacki
10 US Department of Justice
11 20 Massachusetts Ave, NW, Room 7334
12 Washington, DC 20001

13 Andrew H. Tannenbaum
14 US Department of Justice
15 20 Massachusetts Ave, NW
16 PO Box 883
17 Washington, DC 20044

18 Anthony J. Coppolino
19 US Department of Justice
20 20 Massachusetts Ave, NW Room 6102
21 Washington, DC 20530

22 James L. Sutherland
23 Assistant US Attorney
24 US Attorney's Office
25 1000 SW Third Ave, Suite 600
Portland, OR 97204

* * * * *

23 **KAREN M. EICHHORN, CSR, CM**
24 Certified Shorthand Reporter
25 8502 SW 43rd Ave.
Portland, Oregon 97219
503-936-4805

Karen M. Eichhorn, CSR, CM

Transcript 120208 PM AHIF
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20530
By: Anthony Coppolino, Esquire
Carl J. Nichols, Esquire
Alex Haas, Esquire
Tim

4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
0

3

1 Tuesday, December 2, 2008 2:00 p.m.

2 P R O C E E D I N G S

3 THE CLERK: Calling MDL 06-1791, In re: NSA
4 Telecommunications Records Litigation.

5 This hearing this afternoon is related to case No.
6 07-0109, Al-Haramain Foundation versus George Bush, et al.

7 Appearances, Counsel.

8 MR. EISENBERG: Jon B. Eisenberg.
Page 2

Volume 1

Pages 1 - 42

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

BEFORE THE HONORABLE VAUGHN R. WALKER

In Re National Security Agency)	MDL 06-1791-VRW
Telecommunications Records)	
Litigation)	
Al-Haramain Islamic Foundation,)	
Inc., et al.,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	
)	
vs.)	NO. C 07-0109-VRW
)	
George W. Bush, et al.,)	
)	San Francisco, California
Defendants.)	Friday
)	January 23, 2009
)	10:30 a.m.

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

APPEARANCES:

For Plaintiffs	Eisenberg & Hancock
Al-Haramain Islamic	1970 Broadway, Suite 1200
Foundation, Inc.;	Oakland, CA 94612
Asim Ghafoor;	(510) 452-2581
Wendell Belew:	(510) 452-3277 (fax)

BY: JON B. EISENBEG
WILLIAM N. HANCOCK

For Plaintiffs:	Steven Goldberg
Al-Haramain Islamic	Attorney at Law
Foundation, Inc.;	River Park Center, Suite 300
Asim Ghafoor;	205 SE Spokane Street
Wendell Belew:	Portland, OR 97202

BY: STEVEN GOLDBERG

(Appearances Continued On Next Page)

Reported By: Lydia Zinn, CSR #9223, RPR
Official Reporter - U.S. District Court

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES (CONT'D)

For MDL Plaintiffs: Electronic Frontier Foundation
454 Shotwell Street
San Francisco, CA 94110
(415) 436-9333 x 108

BY: CINDY ANN COHN

For Defendants U.S. Department of Justice
FBI; NSA; OFAC; Civil Division
President Barack Obama; 20 Massachusetts Ave., N.W., Room 6102
Keith B. Alexander; Washington, D.C. 20530
Robert S. Mueller, (202) 514-4652
III; Adam Szubin; Washington, D.C. 20530
Alexander K. Haas: **BY: ANTHONY JOSPEH COPPOLINO**

For Defendants U.S. Department of Justice
FBI; NSA; OFAC; Federal Programs Branch
President Barack Obama; 20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.
Keith B. Alexander; Washington, D.C. 20001
Robert S. Mueller, (202) 307-3937

Adam Szubin: BY: ALEXANDER KENNETH HAAS

For Defendant National Security Agency
National Security Fort George G. Meade MD 20755
Agency: **BY: TIMOTHY STINSON**

United States District Court

Northern District of California

Before The Honorable Vaughn R. Walker

In re: National Security)
Agency Telecommunications)
Records Litigation,)
)
)
)
)
)

No. C06-1791 VRW

San Francisco, California
Wednesday, June 3, 2009

Reporter's Transcript Of Proceedings

Appearances:

For Plaintiff: Eisenberg And Hancock, LLP
1970 Broadway, Suite 1200
Oakland, California 94612
By: Jon B. Eisenberg, Esquire
William Hancock, Esquire

Steenson Schumann Tewksbury
Creighton and Rose, PC
500 Yamhill Plaza
815 S.W. Second Avenue
Portland, Oregon 97204
By: J. Ashlee Albies, Esquire

Also Present:
at Plaintiff
Counsel Table:

Alan Kabot
(Interested Party)

(Appearances continued on next page.)

Reported By: Sahar McVickar, RPR, CSR No. 12963
Official Reporter, U.S. District Court
For the Northern District of California

(Computerized Transcription By Eclipse)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Appearances, continued:

For Plaintiff: Law Office of Steven Goldberg
 205 S.E. Spokane Street, Suite 300
 Portland, Oregon 97202
 By: **Steven Goldberg, Esquire**
 (Telephonically)

 Thomas H. Nelson & Associates
 P.O. Box 1211
 Welches, Oregon 97067
 By: **Thomas H. Nelson, Esquire**

For Defendant: United States Department of Justice
 Civil Division
 20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W., Rm. 7344
 Washington, DC 20530
 By: **Anthony Joseph Coppolino, Esquire**

 Office of the General Counsel
 National Security Agency
 9800 Savage Road
 Ft. George Meade, Maryland 20755
 By: **Timothy Stinson, Esquire**

---o0o---

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

BEFORE THE HONORABLE VAUGHN R. WALKER, JUDGE

AL-HARAMAIN ISLAMIC)
FOUNDATION, ET AL.,)
)
PLAINTIFFS,)
)
VS.)
)
GEORGE W. BUSH, ET AL.,)
)
DEFENDANTS.)
)

NO. C 07-109 VRW

SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA
WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 2009

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

APPEARANCES :

FOR PLAINTIFF:

EISENBERG & HANCOCK
1970 BROADWAY
SUITE 1200
OAKLAND, CA 94612

BY: JON B. EISENBERG
THOMAS HANCOCK
ATTORNEYS AT LAW

STEVEN GOLDBERG
ATTORNEY AT LAW
205 S.E. SPOKANE ST.
SUITE 300
PORTLAND, OREGON 97202

(APPEARANCES CONTINUED ON FOLLOWING PAGE)

REPORTED BY:

JAMES YEOMANS, CSR #4039, RPR
OFFICIAL REPORTER

COMPUTERIZED TRANSCRIPTION BY ECLIPSE

1 APPEARANCES: (CONTINUED)

2 FOR PLAINTIFF: THOMAS HOWARD NELSON
3 ATTORNEY AT LAW
4 24525 E. WELCHES ROAD
5 WELCHES, OREGON 97067

6 FOR DEFENDANT: U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
7 CIVIL DIVISION
8 20 MASSACHUSETTS AVENUE, N.W.
9 ROOM 6102
10 WASHINGTON, DC 20530
11 BY: ANTHONY JOSEPH COPPOLINO
12 TIMOTHY STINSON
13 ATTORNEYS AT LAW