# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

#### MIAMI DIVISION

CASE NO. 07-21221 CIV ALTONAGA/Turnoff

RENEE BLASZKOWSKI, *et al.*, individually and on behalf of others similarly situated,

Defendante

Plaintiffs/Class Representatives,

VS.

MARS INC., et al.,

Defendants.		

# PLAINTIFF'S UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT

Plaintiffs/Class Representatives, Renee Blaszkowski, *et al.*, respectfully request this Court to enter an Order granting them leave to file their Second Amended Complaint pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 15 and as grounds therefor, states as follows:

- 1. The Plaintiffs filed their Class Action Complaint ("original Complaint") on May 9, 2007. [DE 1]. Based upon the extraordinary number of problems and concerns with the advertising of Defendants' pet food products as well as the products themselves, the Plaintiffs amended the original Complaint [DE 153] to add additional Plaintiffs and Defendants in July 2007.
- 2. Certain Defendants moved to dismiss the Amended Complaint based upon personal jurisdiction and all of the Defendants moved to dismiss based upon other grounds. The Court granted the Plaintiffs leave for personal jurisdiction discovery [DE 232], and the Defendants sought reconsideration of same. [DE 244]. This Court granted the Defendants'

Page 2 of 10

Motion for Reconsideration of leave for personal jurisdiction discovery as to all but New Albertsons, Inc. [DE 251] without prejudice because the allegations regarding personal jurisdiction were not specific as to the Defendants connection to Florida and indicated that upon amendment, the Court would reconsider allowing the Plaintiffs leave for such discovery. [DE 251 p. 5 and fn. 5].

- 3. The Plaintiffs have prepared a Second Amend Complaint that is attached hereto as Exhibit "A" (without exhibits). The Second Amended Complaint details the personal jurisdiction allegations as to each Defendant so that the Plaintiffs can renew their request for leave for personal jurisdiction as to those Defendants who have contested same.
- 4. Moreover, while the Plaintiffs firmly believe that the Amended Complaint was more than adequate under the pleading requirements of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, in order to avoid a number of the issues raised in the Defendants' Motion to Dismiss, the Plaintiffs shortened the pleading substantially, made the relief sought crystal clear, alleged the Plaintiffs' injuries with specificity<sup>1</sup> and otherwise addressed issues raised by the Defendants in order to narrow the issues to be raised in any subsequent motion to dismiss.
- 5. Since the Plaintiffs filed the Amended Complaint, a number of lethal issues have arisen relating to the Defendants pet food products and, as a consequence, the Plaintiffs have added a request to certify equitable claims under Rule 23(b)(2) and claims for injunctive relief. The Plaintiffs are extremely concerned regarding the ongoing false advertising which has, and continues to, result in the illness and injury of the Plaintiffs' and consumers' cats and dogs. Equitable relief in the form of an injunction is thus imperative to the Plaintiffs to avoid further injury. Finally, the Plaintiffs have added a claim for strict liability.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The injuries were also specifically alleged in the Amended Complaint.

- 6. The Second Amended Complaint also adds two Plaintiffs and an additional pet food manufacturer, Natura Pet Products, Inc. The Plaintiffs do not contemplate adding other parties to the lawsuit unless new information becomes available during discovery which would require the Plaintiffs to add same.
- 7. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 15(a) provides that leave to amend "shall be given freely." Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a). The Eleventh Circuit has also determined that leave to amend should be granted liberally. *See Thomas v. Town of Davie*, 847 F.2d 771, 773 (11<sup>th</sup> Cir. 1988)("Unless there is a substantial reason to deny leave to amend, the discretion of the district court is not broad enough to permit denial."). In this case, there is no such substantial reason to deny leave to amend because this Motion has been brought in good faith, to cure the personal jurisdiction allegation deficiencies and in an attempt to narrow the issues to be brought before the Court on any subsequent motion to dismiss that the Defendants may file.
- 8. While the Plaintiffs have filed a Motion to Dismiss, the facts of the Second Amended Complaint are much shorter, they are identical to the previous pleadings and specifically address issues raised in the Defendants' Motion to Dismiss, which will moot those issues. Based upon the identical factual and legal issues having been raised, the Defendants can re-file whatever portions of the Motion to Dismiss that they determine they want to pursue.
- 9. The Plaintiffs will be prejudiced if they are not allowed to amend the Complaint to clarify personal jurisdiction allegations, to add these two additional Plaintiffs, the one Defendant and claims for equitable relief and strict liability based upon the events that have transpired since the filing of the Amended Complaint.

Page 4 of 10

WHEREFORE, the Plaintiffs, Renee Blaszkowski, et al., respectfully request this Court to enter an Order granting them leave to amend and file their Complaint and for all other relief that this Court deems just and proper.

Case 1:07-cv-21221-CMA

DATED: November 16, 2007

#### Rule 7.1 Certificate

Prior to filing this Motion, the undersigned contacted Carol Licko, Esquire, who agreed to contact all of the Defendants regarding their position on this Motion. As of the time of filing this Motion, Ms. Licko indicated the Defendants' position to be as follows: "Defendants will not formally oppose Plaintiffs' motion to amend with the second amended complaint, but will oppose any further amendment. If the Court grants Plaintiffs' motion, Defendants request that the Court also set a briefing schedule allowing Defendants 30 days to serve one consolidated response to the second amended complaint, allowing Plaintiffs 30 days to serve any opposition to Defendants' motion to dismiss, and allowing Defendants 20 days to serve one consolidated any (sic) reply."

Catherine J. MacIvor

CATHERINE J. MACIVOR (FBN 932711)

cmacivor@mflegal.com

MALTZMAN FOREMAN, PA

One Biscayne Tower

2 South Biscayne Boulevard – Suite 2300

Miami, Florida 33131

Tel: 305-358-6555 / Fax: 305-374-9077

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

4

Page 5 of 10

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

WE HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court via CM/ECF on this 16 day of November, 2007. We also certify that the foregoing was served on all counsel or parties of record on the attached Service List either via transmission of Notices of Electronic Filing generated by CM/ECF or in some other authorized manner for those counsel or parties who are not authorized to receive electronic Notices of Filing.

> s/ Catherine J. MacIvor CATHERINE J. MACIVOR

Page 6 of 10

### **SERVICE LIST**

Document 256

#### CASE NO. 07-21221 ALTONAGA/Turnoff

CATHERINE J. MACIVOR

cmacivor@mflegal.com

JEFFREY B. MALTZMAN

jmaltzman@mflegal.com

JEFFREY E. FOREMAN

jforeman@mflegal.com

DARREN W. FRIEDMAN

dfriedman@mflegal.com

MALTZMAN FOREMAN, PA

One Biscayne Tower

2 South Biscayne Boulevard -Suite 2300

Miami, Florida 33131

Tel: 305-358-6555 / Fax: 305-374-9077

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

ROLANDO ANDRES DIAZ

E-Mail: rd@kubickdraper.com

**CASSIDY YEN DANG** 

E-Mail: cyd@kubickidraper.com

MARIA KAYANAN

E-Mail: mek@kubickidraper.com

**KUBICKI DRAPER** 

25 W. Flagler Street

Penthouse

Miami, Florida 33130-1712

Telephone: (305) 982-6708

Facsimile: (305) 374-7846

Attorneys for Defendant Pet Supermarket, Inc.

WILLIAM C. MARTIN DLA PIPER LLP

203 North LaSalle Street

**Suite 1900** 

Chicago, Illinois 60601-1293

E-Mail: William.Martin@dlapiper.com

Attorneys for Defendants Menu Foods, Inc.

And Menu Foods Income Fund

JOHN B.T. MURRAY, JR.

E-Mail: Jbmurray@ssd.com

SQUIRE, SANDERS & DEMPSEY L.L.P.

1900 Phillips Point West

777 South Flagler Drive

West Palm Beach, Florida 33401-6198

Telephone: (561) 650-7200

Facsimile: (561) 655-1509

Attorneys for Defendants PETCO Animal Supplies Stores, Inc., PetSmart, Inc., Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.,

Target Corporation and Meiner, Inc.

**ALEXANDER SHAKNES** 

E-Mail: Alex.Shaknes@dlapiper.com

**AMY W. SCHULMAN** 

E-Mail: Amy.schulman@dlapiper.com

LONNIE L. SIMPSON

E-Mail: Lonnie.Simpson@dlapiper.com

S. DOUGLAS KNOX

E-Mail: Douglas.knox@dlapiper.com

**DLA PIPER LLP** 

1251 Avenue of the Americas

New York, New York 10020

Attorneys for Defendants Menu Foods, Inc.

and Menu Foods Income Fund

HUGH J. TURNER, JR. AKERMAN SENTERFITT

350 E. Las Olas Boulevard

**Suite 1600** 

Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301-2229

Telephone: (954)463-2700 Facsimile: (954)463-2224

E-Mail: hugh.turner@ackerman.com

**GARY L. JUSTICE** 

E-Mail: gjustice@gibsondunn.com

**CHARLES H. ABBOTT** 

E-Mail: cabbott@gibsondunn.com

GAIL E. LEES

E-Mail: glees@gibsondunn.com WILLIAM EDWARD WEGNER

E-Mail: wwegner@gibsondunn.com

GIBSON DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP

333 South Grand Avenue Los Angeles, California 90071 Telephone: (213) 229-7000

Attorneys for Defendant Nutro Products, Inc.

**OMAR ORTEGA** DORTA AND ORTEGA, P.A.

Douglas Entrance

800 S. Douglas Road, Suite 149 Coral Gables, Florida 33134 Telephone: (305) 461-5454 Facsimile: (305) 461-5226

E-Mail: oortega@dortandortega.com

Attorneys for Defendant Mars, Incorporated And Mars Petcare U.S.

**BENJAMIN REID** 

E-Mail: bried@carltonfields.com

**OLGA M. VIEIRA** 

E-Mail: ovieira@carltonfields.com

**CARLTON FIELDS, P.A.** 

100 S.E. Second Street, Suite 4000

Bank of America Tower at International Place

Miami, Florida 33131-0050 Telephone: (305)530-0050 Facsimile: (305) 530-0050

Attorneys for Defendants Colgate-Palmolive

Attorneys for Defendants Publix Super Markets, Inc.

and H.E. Butt Grocery Co. **MARTY STEINBERG** 

E-Mail: msteinberg@hunton.com ADRIANA RIVIERE-BADELL E-Mail: ariviere-badell@hunton.com

**HUNTON & WILLIAMS, LLP** 

Mellon Financial Center

1111 Brickel Avenue, Suite 2500

Miami, Florida 33131 Telephone: (305) 810-2500 Facsimile: (305) 810-2460

Attorneys for Defendant Nutro Products, Inc.

DANE H. BUTSWINKAS

E-Mail: dbutswinkas@wc.com

PHILIP A. SECHLER E-Mail: psechler@wc.com THOMAS G. HENTOFF

E-Mail: thentoff@wc.com

CHRISTOPHER M. D'ANGELO

E-Mail: cdangelo@wc.com PATRICK J. HOULIHAN

E-Mail: phoulihan@wc.com

WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP 725 Twelfth Street, N.W.

Washington, DC 20005

Attorneys for Defendants Mars, Incorporated And Mars Petcare U.S.

MARCOS DANIEL JIMINEZ

E-Mail: ndj@kennynachwalter.com

ROBERT J. ALWINE, II

E-Mail ralwine@kennynachwalter.com

KENNY NACHWALTER, P.A.

1100 Miami Center

201 South Biscayne Boulevard

Miami, Florida 33131

Telephone: (305) 373-1000 Facsimile: (305) 372-1861

Attorneys for Defendants Safeway, Inc. and

Company and Hill's Pet Nutrition, Inc.

## SHERRIL M. COLOMBO COZEN O'CONNOR

Wachovia Center, Suite 4410 200 South Biscayne Boulevard

Miami, Florida 33131 Telephone: (305) 704-5945 Facsimile: (305) 704-5955 E-Mail: scolombo@cozen.com

Attorneys for Defendant Del Monte Foods Co.

# JOHN F. MULLEN COZEN O'CONNOR

1900 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103 Telephone: (215) 665-2179 Facsimile: (215) 665-2013 E-Mail: jmullen@cozen.com

Attorneys for Defendant Del Monte Foods, Co.

# ROBERT C. TROYER HOGAN & HARTSON L.LP.

1200 17<sup>th</sup> Street
One Tabor Center, Suite 1500
Denver, Colorado 80202
Telephone: (303) 899-7300
Facsimile: (303) 899-7333

E-Mail: rctroyer@hhlaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant Nestle USA, Inc. Nestle Purina Petcare Co. and Nestle S.A. The Stop & Shop Supermarket Company LLC

#### **RICHARD FAMA**

E-Mail: <a href="mailto:rfama@cozen.com">rfama@cozen.com</a> **JOHN J. McDONOUGH** 

E-Mail: jmcdonough@cozen.com

#### **COZEN O'CONNOR**

45 Broadway

New York, New York 10006 Telephone: (212) 509-9400 Facsimile: (212) 509-9492

Attorneys for Defendant Del Monte Foods

## CAROL A. LICKO HOGAN & HARTSON L.L.P

Mellon Financial Center 1111 Brickell Avenue, Suite 1900 Miami, Florida 33131 Telephone (305) 459-6500 Facsimile (305) 459-6550 E-Mail: calicko@hhlaw.com

Attorneys for Nestle U.S.A., Inc. Nestle Purinia Petcare Co. and Nestle S.A.

#### CRAIG A. HOOVER

E-Mail: cahoover@hhlaw.com

MIRANA L. BERGE

E-Mail: <a href="mailto:mlberge@hhlaw.com">mlberge@hhlaw.com</a> **HOGAN & HARTSON L.L.P.** 

555 13<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004 Telephone: (202) 637-5600 Facsimile: (202) 637-5910

Attorneys for Defendants Nestle USA, Inc. Nestle Purina Petcare Co. and Nestle S.A.

## JAMES K. REUSS LANE ALTON & HORST, LLC

Two Miranova Place

Suite 500

Columbus, Ohio 43215 Telephone: (614) 233-4719

E-Mail: JReuss@lanealton.com

Attorneys for Defendant The Kroger Co. of Ohio

Document 256

#### D. JEFFREY IRELAND

E-Mail: djireland@ficlaw.com

BRIAN D. WRIGHT

E-Mail: <a href="mailto:Bwright@ficlaw.com">Bwright@ficlaw.com</a>

LAURA A. SANOM

E-Mail: <a href="mailto:lsanom@ficlaw.com">lsanom@ficlaw.com</a>

### FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W. 10 North Ludlow Street Dayton, Ohio 45402

Attorneys for Defendant Proctor & Gamble Co. and The Iams Co.

#### **RALPH G. PATINO**

E-Mail: <a href="mailto:rpatino@patinolaw.com">rpatino@patinolaw.com</a>
<a href="mailto:patinolaw.com">DOMINICK V. TAMARAZZO</a>
<a href="mailto:temarazzo@patinolaw.com">E-Mail: dtmarazzo@patinolaw.com</a>

CARLOS B. SALUP

E-Mail: <u>csalup@patinolaw.com</u> **PATINO& ASSOCIATES, P.A.** 

225 Alcazar Avenue

Coral Gables, Florida 33134 Telephone: (305) 443-6163 Facsimile: (305) 443-5635

Attorneys for Defendants Pet Supplies "Plus" and Pet Supplies Plus/USA, Inc.

## ALAN G. GREER RICHMAN GREER, P.A.

Miami-Center – Suite 1000 201 South Biscayne Boulevard

Miami, Florida 33131 Telephone: (305) 373-4000 Facsimile: (305) 373-4099

Attorneys for Defendants Proctor & Gamble Co. and The Iams Co.

## ROBIN L. HANGER SQUIRE, SANDERS & DEMPSEY L.L.P.

200 S. Biscayne Boulevard

40<sup>th</sup> Floor

Miami, Florida 33131-2398 Telephone: (305) 577-7040 Facsimile: (305) 577-7001 E-Mail: rlhanger@ssd.com

Attorneys for Defendants PETCO Animal Supplies Stores, Inc.

### **ROBERT VALADEZ**

E-Mail: rvaladez@shelton-valadez.com

**JAVIER THOMAS DURAN** 

E-Mail: jduran@shelton-valadez.com SHELTON & VALADEZ, P.C.

600 Navarro, Suite 500 San Antonio, Texas 78205 Telephone: (210) 349-0515 Facsimile: (210) 349-3666

Attorneys for Defendant H.E. Butt Grocery Co.

CRAIG P. KALIL

E-Mail: ckalil@aballi.com JOSHUA D. POYER

E-Mail: jpoyer@abailli.com

ABALLI, MILNE, KALIL & ESCAGEDO,

2250 Sun Trust International Center

One S.E. Third Avenue Miami, Florida 33131

Telephone: (303) 373-6600 Facsimile: (305) 373-7929

Attorneys for Defendant's Inc. and Albertson's

LLC

C. RICHARD FULMER, JR. FULMER, LEROY, ALBEE, BAUMANN, & GLASS, PLC

2866 East Oakland Park Boulevard Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33306 Telephone: (954) 707-4430 Facsimile: (954) 707-4431

E-Mail: rfulmer@Fulmer.LeRoy.com

Attorneys for Defendant The Kroger Co. of Ohio

W. RANDOLPH TESLIK

E-Mail: rteslik@akingump.com

ANDREW DOBER

E-Mail: adober@akingump.com

AKIN GUM STRAUSS HAUER & FELD LLP

Page 10 of 10

1333 New Hampshire Avenue, NW

Washington, D.C. 20036 Telephone: (202) 887-4000 Facsimile: (202) 887-4288

Attorneys for Defendants New Albertson's Inc. and

Albertson's LLC

**JASON JOFFE SQUIRE SANDERS & DEMPSY, LLP** 

200 South Biscayne Boulevard

**Suite 4000** 

Miami, Florida 33131

Telephone: (305) 577-7000 Facsimile: (305) 577-7001 E-Mail: jjoffee@ssd.com

Attorneys for Defendant Meijer, Inc.