UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA MIAMI DIVISION

CASE NO. 07-21221-CIV-ALTONAGA/BROWN

RENEE BLASZKOWSKI, et al., individually and on behalf of others similarly situated, Plaintiffs,

vs.

MARS, INCORPORATED, *et al.*, Defendants.

DECLARATION OF KRISTEN E. CAVERLY IN SUPPORT OF NATURA PET PRODUCTS, INC.'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

1. I, Kristen E. Caverly, am over the age of 18 and have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein or know of such facts from my review of the case files for this action, which are maintained by my office in the normal course of business. I am lead counsel for defendant Natura Pet Products, Inc., and admitted *pro hac vice* in this action.

2. On August 25, 2008, I took the deposition of Plaintiff Susan Peters in Miami, Florida. True and correct copies of the following pages of the deposition of Ms. Peters are attached hereto as Exhibit A: 1, 2, 11-13, 63-64, 74, 80-81, 104, 112, and 113.

3. A true and correct copy of Plaintiff Susan Peters' response to

Interrogatory No. 4 issued by defendant Mars is attached as Exhibit B.

The foregoing is stated under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America. Executed in Rancho Santa Fe, California on October 20, 2008.

With E Courty Kristen E. Caverly

EXHIBIT A

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA 2 CASE NO. 1:07-21221 CIV-ALTONGA/BROWN 3 RENEE BLASZKOWSKI, et al., individually 4 and on behalf of others similarly situated, 5 Plaintiffs, б vs. 7 MARS, INC., et al., 8 Defendants. -----/ 9 Miami, Florida 10 August 25, 2008 10:17 o'clock a.m. 11 12 13 VOLUME I PAGES 1 - 200 14 15 _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ 16 VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION 17 OF 18 SUSAN PETERS 19 _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ 20 21 22 JOB NO: 950663 Reported By: 23 Evan A. Ferguson, RPR Notary Public, State of Florida 24 Esquire Deposition Services Fort Lauderdale Office Phone 954-331-4400 25

```
1
      APPEARANCES:
 2
 3
          LAW OFFICES OF EDGAR R. NIELD
          BY: EDGAR R. NIELD, ESQUIRE,
 4
          4370 La Jolla Village Drive, Suite 640
          San Diego, California 92122
 5
          858.552.6745
          Appearing on behalf of the Plaintiffs.
 6
 7
          HENDERSON, CAVERLY, LLP.,
 8
          BY: KRISTEN E. CAVERLY, ESQUIRE,
          16236 San Dieguito Road, Suite 4-13
 9
          Rancho Santa Fe, California 92067
          858.756.6342
10
          Appearing on behalf of Natura Pet Products.
11
          ALSO PRESENT: ROBERT PACHECO, VIDEOGRAPHER,
12
          Esquire Deposition Services.
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	Q What is your current name?
2	A Susan Peters. I also use Jones.
3	Q Is Jones a legal name?
4	A Yes.
5	Q What is your maiden name?
б	A Crail.
7	Q Can you spell that?
8	A C-R-A-I-L.
9	Q When did you assume the name Peters?
10	A Approximately two years ago.
11	Q Was that a result of marriage or some other
12	reason?
13	A Marriage.
14	Q And when did you assume use of the name Jones?
15	A Approximately 25 years ago.
16	Q Is that also a married name?
17	A Yes.
18	Q When were you divorced from Mr. Jones?
19	A Approximately 20 years ago.
20	Q After that divorce or as part of that divorce
21	did you have your name legally changed?
22	A No, I continued with Jones.
23	Q Have you had your name legally changed to
24	Peters?
25	A Yes. Excuse me, I may not have answered that

1	correctly. I have I think we need to have that
2	question asked again.
3	MR. NIELD: Do you understand the question?
4	It may call for a legal
5	THE WITNESS: I am not sure exactly what
б	legally changed is.
7	BY MS. CAVERLY:
8	Q What is the name on your driver's license
9	today?
10	A Jones.
11	Q Have you ever filed any papers with any court
12	in the United States representing that your name is or
13	you would like it to be Susan Peters?
14	A No.
15	Q What other names, if any, have you used in the
16	past other than Crail, Peters and Jones?
17	A M-O-G-C-K.
18	Q Can you pronounce that for me?
19	A Mogck.
20	Q During what period of time did you use the
21	name Mogck?
22	A Approximately 1992 to '98, '99, I am unsure of
23	the dates.
24	Q Was your use of the name Mogck in relationship
25	to a marriage?

1	A	Yes.
2	Q	And do you know if your name was ever legally
3	<mark>changed t</mark>	o Mogck?
4	A	It was not.
5	Q	Any other names other than those that you have
б	<mark>told me a</mark>	bout so far that you have used in your
7	<mark>lifetime?</mark>	
8	A	No.
9	Q	And if you could please tell me again what
10	your midd	le name is?
11	A	Beth.
12	Q	What is your current residence address?
13	A	Route 6 Fox 95 Eufaula, E-U-F-A-U-L-A,
14	Oklahoma.	
15	Q	That's the address in which you receive mail;
16	correct?	
17	A	Yes.
18	Q	Is there also a street name or a street house
19	number th	at you have?
20	A	It's on a street referred to as Texanna Road.
21	Q	And do you have a house number?
22	A	No.
23	Q	How long have you lived at the Eufaula
24	address?	
25	A	Two years.

1 best dog food in the world or pet food in the world. 2 I don't think that the ingredients are 3 actually as they are advertised to be. I pretty much 4 feel like I could buy a Purina product over-the-counter 5 at a lot less cost and have the same results. б 0 Has Natura in any fashion ever represented to 7 you what results you would achieve from --8 А Yes, they talked about it being a healthy 9 product, and when I see the ear infections and all of the allergic reactions in my pet, I don't believe that 10 is the case. 11 12 Q After you purchased the California Natura supplements from PetSmart, when was the next time that 13 you purchased a Natura product? 14 A It would have been on the cusp of 2006/2007. 15 My mom and I we like to shop as our -- my mother likes 16 17 to shop, I don't, so when I visit her over the holidays between Christmas and New Year's, then to help get my 18 interest we go pet food shopping. 19 Q So over the Christmas New Year holidays, 2006 20 21 to 2007, you and your mother went and purchased a Natura 22 product, correct? A Several. 23 Q Where did you go to purchase the products? 24 25 A We shopped at both PetSmart and PetCo and that

1	would be in Independence, I believe it lists as a Kansas
2	City, address but it's a suburb.
3	Q Kansas City, Kansas or Missouri?
4	<mark>A Missouri.</mark>
5	Q What products did you and your mother purchase
6	that were manufactured by Natura Pet Products from
7	PetSmart and PetCo at the end of 2006, beginning of
8	2007 <mark>?</mark>
9	A I purchased the it's in a yellow bag,
10	Innova, I probably have to look at my responses, but the
11	red meat, the 95 percent, the canned one with chicken
12	and turkey; the reduced fat large breed, I think that
13	there is like seven all together, I am not sure exactly.
14	We will have to look back at my responses to
15	know for sure.
16	Q Which of the seven Natura products that you
17	purchased did you buy from PetSmart?
18	A Idon't know.
19	Q Which of the seven products that you purchased
20	did you buy from PetCo?
21	A Idon't know.
22	Q Other than PetSmart and PetCo, have you ever
23	purchased a Natura manufactured or distributed product
24	from any other store?
25	A I don't believe so.

1 А Yes. And did you then only feed the large breed 2 0 3 puppy formula until it was completely used? 4 Α Yes. 5 0 And then what did you feed next, if anything б that Natura --7 Α I don't remember. At that point whatever I had left I just finished out. Any unopened products I 8 9 opened and fed. Q When you ran out of all of the Natura products 10 that you had purchased at the end of 2007, beginning of 11 12 2006, you never bought any more, correct? 13 A That's right. And you never fed Odie any more Natura 14 Q manufactured or distributed products, correct? 15 A That is correct. 16 What did you move Odie to in terms of food 17 0 18 after the Natura products? I went to Nutro, Nutro products. 19 А Did Odie continue to experience the symptoms 20 0 21 that you have described to me? 22 А Yes. How long into 2007 did Odie continue to 23 Q 24 experience the shaking, the skin problems, the other 25 symptoms that you have described?

1 Natura made that caused you to want to buy the original Innova formula for your dog? 2 3 Α It was the original one. 4 Q Anything else? 5 Α No. б And for the large breed, was there a Q particular representation that Natura made that you were 7 aware of that caused you to want to buy that particular 8 9 formula for your dog? 10 А Yes, they recognized - the company recognized that a large dog didn't just need more food, it did need 11 12 more nutrients and not just a lot of carbs and what have 13 you. 14 Q Anything else that Natura said that you relied on in deciding to purchase the large breed puppy 15 16 formula? That's all that stands out in my mind now. 17 А 18 And for the 95 percent, is there any 0 representation other than that it could be a supplement 19 or replacement to home cooked meals that you relied on 20 21 in deciding to buy that product? 22 Of course I believed in the product name, but Α 23 not the individual -- not just the 95 percent, no, other 24 than the homemade. 25 Q Now, when you went to the store, PetCo and

PetSmart to buy the Natura products that you tried, did 1 you read the ingredient list on any of the products 2 3 before you purchased them? 4 А Yes. 5 0 On all of them or just some? б Α I know I did on at least some and probably all 7 of them. 8 In terms of knowing what you are feeding to Q 9 your pets you advise your readers to read the ingredient list, correct? 10 А 11 Yes. 12 Do you think that that is a key way that 0 consumers can be informed about what products they are 13 14 buying? 15 А Not necessarily. How other than reading the ingredient list 16 Q 17 would you think a consumer could be well informed about 18 a pet food that he or she is buying? There is a lot of information not given to the 19 А consumer that they need to learn. I don't know what to 20 21 tell them, where to turn to. 22 There is a lot of by-products that are put 23 into pet foods that can be listed as something else and 24 you will never see them, you don't know. 25 0 Let's start with the original Innova formula

1	Food; Innova Evo Red Meat Small Bite Dry Dog Food;
2	Innova Evo Reduced Fat Dry Dog Food; and Innova Large
3	Breed Dry All Natural Puppy Dog Food; do you see those?
4	A Yes.
5	Q Those are the products that you contend that
6	you purchased at the end of 2006 beginning of 2007 in
7	your shopping trip with your mother that you have
8	described previously, correct?
9	A Yes.
10	Q Now that you have the list in front of you,
11	can you tell me in which order you fed these products to
12	Odie?
13	A No.
14	Q You have no idea?
15	A No.
16	Q In total based on your interrogatory responses
17	I have added up that you have purchased and fed over 620
18	foods since May of 2003 to your own pets and to boarding
19	pets; does that sound about right to you?
20	A Yes, it does.
21	Q For someone who doesn't like shopping, how is
22	it that you have gotten 600 different kinds of food in
23	that period of time?
24	MR. NIELD: It's vague and ambiguous, it's
25	argumentative, lacks foundation, and calls for

1 MR. NIELD: Lacks foundation, may call for speculation, vague and ambiguous, overly broad, may 2 3 call for an expert opinion, it probably does call 4 for an expert opinion, but you can go ahead. 5 THE WITNESS: Would you repeat her question, б please? 7 (Whereupon, the above referred to question was read back by the Court Reporter.) 8 9 MR. NIELD: If I didn't say vague and 10 ambiguous, add that. Go ahead. THE WITNESS: I would have to say I don't 11 12 know. 13 BY MS. CAVERLY: Q If we go back to Exhibit 1 that you still have 14 in front of you on page 38, actually let's start with 15 16 page 37, because it starts down at the very bottom, you 17 see the word Natura - PetSmart, PetCo? 18 A Yes. Q And that's to indicate where you purchased the 19 Natura products that you purchased, correct? 20 A That is correct. 21 Q And then if we turn on to page 38 there are 22 six different products listed at the very top of that 23 24 list: Evo Small Bite Dry Dog Food; Innova Adult Dry Dog Food; Innova Evo 95% Meat Chicken & Turkey Canned Dog 25

1	Food; Innova Evo Red Meat Small Bite Dry Dog Food;
2	Innova Evo Reduced Fat Dry Dog Food; and Innova Large
3	Breed Dry All Natural Puppy Dog Food; do you see those?
4	A Yes.
5	Q Those are the products that you contend that
6	you purchased at the end of 2006 beginning of 2007 in
7	your shopping trip with your mother that you have
8	described previously, correct?
9	A Yes.
10	Q Now that you have the list in front of you,
11	can you tell me in which order you fed these products to
12	Odie?
13	A No.
14	Q You have no idea?
15	A No.
16	Q In total based on your interrogatory responses
17	I have added up that you have purchased and fed over 620
18	foods since May of 2003 to your own pets and to boarding
19	pets; does that sound about right to you?
20	A Yes, it does.
21	Q For someone who doesn't like shopping, how is
22	it that you have gotten 600 different kinds of food in
23	that period of time?
24	MR. NIELD: It's vague and ambiguous, it's
25	argumentative, lacks foundation, and calls for

EXHIBIT B

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

MIAMI DIVISION

CASE NO. 07-21221 CIV ALTONAGA/Brown

RENEE BLASZKOWSKI, *et al.*, individually and on behalf of others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs/Class Representatives,

vs.

MARS INC., et al.

Defendants.

NOTICE OF SERVING PLAINTIFF SUSAN PETERS' RESPONSES TO MARS INCORPORATED'S FIRST SET OF INTERROGATORIES

Dated: June 30, 2008 Miami, FL

> /s Catherine J. MacIvor CATHERINE J. MACIVOR (FBN 932711) cmacivor@mflegal.com MALTZMAN FOREMAN, PA One Biscayne Tower 2 South Biscayne Boulevard -Suite 2300 Miami, Florida 33131 Tel: 305-358-6555 / Fax: 305-374-9077 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

WE HEREBY CERTIFY that these responses were served on all counsel or parties of record on the attached Service List via e-mail on June 30, 2008.

/s Catherine J. MacIvor CATHERINE J. MACIVOR

PLAINTIFF, SUSAN PETERS' RESPONSES TO DEFENDANT, MARS' INCORPORATED'S FIRST SET OF INTERROGATORIES

PLAINTIFFS' OBJECTIONS TO DEFINITIONS IN DEFENDANT MARS INC.'S FIRST SET OF INTERROGATORIES

Definition #1

The Plaintiffs object to the definition of "you" "yours" and "yourselves" because it is overbroad to the extent that it includes a "spouse, relative, officers, employees, agents, investigators, representatives or other persons acting, or purporting to act, on behalf of the Plaintiffs. For example, in the context of interrogatory number 6, Defendant Mars, Inc., requests the Plaintiffs to "identify each website or electronic community (including weblogs, internet bulletin boards, and listservs) which you have maintained or to which you have contributed during the past five (5) years and for each, state the registered name you used, the nature of the website or electronic community, the internet address (URL), and the date or period of time during which you maintained or contributed to it." See Interrogatory number 6. Thus, based on this definition, as to only one interrogatory, each Plaintiff would have to interview a spouse, relatives, representatives, employees, etc. about whether they maintained or contributed to any sort of electronic internet communication whether or not it was related to this case or even a single issue in this case over a five (5) year period of time." The definition makes each and every interrogatory overbroad and unduly burdensome for the Plaintiffs to formulate a response. Johnson v. Kraft Foods N. Am., 238 F.R.D. 648, 658-59 (D. Kan. 2006) ("[a] request may be overly broad on its face 'if it is couched in such broad language as to make arduous the task of deciding which of numerous documents may conceivably fall within its scope.' A request seeking documents 'pertaining to' or 'concerning' a broad range of items 'requires the respondent either to guess or move through mental gymnastics . . . to determine which of many pieces of paper may conceivably contain some detail, either obvious or hidden, within the scope of the request.""). The unnecessary definitional complexity is no less problematic with interrogatories. In re U. S. Financial Sec. Litigation, 74 F.R.D. 497, 498 (S.D. Cal. 1975) ("to avoid oppressiveness, interrogatories must be tailored to discover only what is reasonable and necessary to the litigation at hand"); T&H Landscaping, LLC v. Colo. Structures Inc., 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 63532, *5 (D. Colo. 2007) (interrogatory requesting plaintiff to identify all persons "who have any knowledge of any fact relating to the claims Plaintiffs are alleging against any Defendant" is "hopelessly broad" and must be revised); Puerto Rico Aqueduct & Sewer Auth. v. Clow Corp., 108 F.R.D. 304, 313 (D.P.R. 1985) (holding that interrogatories seeking the identification of "all persons who have knowledge of any facts pertaining to this lawsuit" are overbroad or unduly burdensome) (emphasis added); Alexander v. FBI, 2000 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 8859, *9 (D.D.C. 2000) (holding that a plaintiff's interrogatory request for all documents that "in any way contain information relevant to" interrogatory answers is vague and overly broad because it does not allow the responding party to determine what documents plaintiff considers relevant).

Colo. Structures Inc., 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 63532, at *5 (interrogatory requesting plaintiff to identify all persons "who have any knowledge of any fact relating to the claims Plaintiffs are alleging against any Defendant" is "hopelessly broad" and must be revised); Clow Corp., 108 F.R.D. 304, 313 (D.P.R. 1985) (holding that interrogatories seeking the identification of "all persons who have knowledge of any facts pertaining to this lawsuit" are overbroad or unduly burdensome) (internal quotations omitted); Pioneer Res. Corp., 2006 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 38005, at *2 (holding that a request for documents identifying "any persons with knowledge about such offers" to buy or sell the defendant company is irrelevant); Woodford, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 22438, at *2 (holding that interrogatories requesting defendant to "identify all witnesses with potential knowledge of the basis of your response" as well as the identity of "all witnesses past and present employees of CDC/CDCR who have personal knowledge of CDCR's compliance with the [Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act]" are overbroad, unduly burdensome, and vague). While "[t]he legal tenet that relevancy in the discovery context is broader than in the context of admissibility . . .," the concept of relevancy "should not be misapplied so as to allow fishing expeditions in discovery." Martinez v. Cornell Corrs. of Tex., 229 F.R.D. 215, 218 (D.N.M. 2005)(Browning, J.); Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC, 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 29159, at *19-20; Wang's Int'l, Inc., 2006 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 38701, at *4-5; Haas Co., 1998 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 11141; GMC, 173 F.R.D.

Notwithstanding the objection, and without waiving it, as to her pets <u>only</u>, Ms. Peters will produce veterinarian bills for the time period between May 9, 2003 and May 9, 2007 for all of the companion pets referenced in the response to interrogatory number 1 in lieu of a response per Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 33(d).

4. For each pet identified in response to Interrogatory No. 1, please identify all foods, whether commercially available or not, provided by you to the pet since the date your care of it began and for each such food, state the brand and product name (if any), the name and address of the retail store where it was purchased (if applicable), the date or time period during which it was purchased (if applicable), the date or time period during which it was provided to the pet, and the amount and frequency with which the food was provided to the pet.

Objection. The request is facially overbroad based upon the defined term "you" and "your"because the Plaintiffs would have to inquire as to a spouse, relatives, employees, etc. to determine whether any of these persons who are not parties to this action actually have any sort of information regarding the purchase of food for the Plaintiffs' companion cats or dogs. See Kraft Foods N. Am., 238 F.R.D. 648, 658-59; Socas, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 16683, *3 ("the Court may restrain any discovery requests that are overbroad or would be unduly burdensome to produce"); Aero Holdings, Inc., 2000 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 19817, at *16-17 (holding that an interrogatory was overbroad because party would have been required to identify many people who had "no relevant knowledge concerning" the case) (emphasis added); In re U. S. Financial Sec. Litigation, 74 F.R.D. at 498 ("to avoid oppressiveness, interrogatories must be tailored to discover only what is reasonable and necessary to the litigation at hand"); Woodford, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 22438, at *2 (holding that interrogatories requesting defendant to "identify all witnesses with potential knowledge of the basis of your response" as well as the identity of "all witnesses past and present

employees of CDC/CDCR who have personal knowledge of CDCR's compliance with the [Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act]" are overbroad, unduly burdensome, and vague); *Brooks*, 1990 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 19395, *7 (stating that the prevailing law of the Seventh Circuit is that parties are limited in their interrogatories to the identity and location of "persons having knowledge of *relevant facts*") (emphasis added); *Clow Corp.*, 108 F.R.D. at 313 (holding that interrogatories seeking the identification of "all persons who have knowledge of any facts pertaining to this lawsuit" are overbroad or unduly burdensome") (internal quotations omitted). While "[t]he legal tenet that relevancy in the discovery context is broader than in the context of admissibility . . .," the concept of relevancy "should not be misapplied so as to allow fishing expeditions in discovery." *Martinez v. Cornell Corrs. of Tex.*, 229 F.R.D. 215, 218 (D.N.M. 2005)(Browning, J.); *Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC*, 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 29159, at *19-20; *Wang's Int'l, Inc.*, 2006 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 38701, at *4-5; *Haas Co.*, 1998 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 11141; *GMC*, 173 F.R.D. at 224.

The temporal scope of this interrogatory is also unlimited in time and is therefore overbroad since it encompasses information well beyond the relevant time period of the Fourth Amended Complaint. The relative time period defined in the Fourth Amended Complaint is May 9, 2003 through May 9, 2007, which encompasses a four (4) year period of time. Cases in this jurisdiction have held that an appropriate time period for discovery is between 3 and 5 with 5 being the outermost edge of the proper scope of discovery. Ten (10) vears well exceeds the outermost bound of the temporal scope of discovery. Avirgan, 116 F.R.D. at 593 (In limiting discovery to approximately four years, the court stated "there is no logical need to permit discovery into predicate acts alleged to have occurred ten or fifteen years ago" when the plaintiff has established that the requisite acts "occurred within a specified time frame"); Cherenfant, 2004 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 30458, *8 (in a discrimination case, the court held that a five year discovery time period was appropriate when it sufficiently covered the discriminatory acts in question); Cohen v. Status-One Invs., Inc., 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 74365, *2-3 ("if discovery is sought nationwide for a ten-year period, and the responding party objects on the grounds that only a five-year period limited to activities in the state of Florida is appropriate, the responding party shall provide responsive discovery falling within the five-year period as to the State of Florida"); Adkins v. Christie, 488 F.3d at 1330 (finding no abuse of discretion when trial court reduced discovery from a seven to five years to pertain to the relevant time period); Mawulawde v. Bd. of Regents, 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 62700, *33-34 (stating that three to f

Notwithstanding the objection, the Plaintiffs will respond to this request for the time period between May 9, 2003 and May 9, 2007, which is the Class Period defined in the Fourth Amended Complaint.

The following information applies to Ms. Peters' pets <u>only</u> during the Class Period defined in the Fourth Amended Complaint to the best of her recollection.

STORES WHERE PET FOOD/TREATS PURCHASED:

A Feathered Affair - 69 E Shawnee Rd Muskogee, OK 74403 - 3017 Azalea

30

CASE NO. 07-21221 CIV ALTONAGA/Brown MALTZMAN FOREMAN, PA, 2 South Biscayne Boulevard, Miami, FL 33131 Tel: 305-358-6555 / Fax: 305-374-9077

Park Dr Muskogee, OK 74401

Albertsons - (918) 686-6730 | 2410 Chandler Rd Muskogee, OK 74403 Boy Howdy # 2 – Buisness 69 Hwy, Eufuala, Ok. 74432 Brandon's Grocery - Ed and Fern's (918) 689-2911 Rr 6 Box 356 Eufaula, OK Burdine Farm Supply (918) 689-5433 320 N Front St Eufaula, OK 74432 Costco (816) 200-2009 | 19040 E Valley View Pkwy Independence, MO Dog Dish (918) 624-2600 | 6502 E 51st St Tulsa, OK Dollar General (816) 252-7791 | 3611 S Noland Rd Independence, MO Dollar General (918) 463-2015 PO Box 1103, Warner, OK 74469 Dollar General (918) 473-2050 1002 W. Gentry Ave. Checotah, OK 74426 Dollar General (918) 689-2277 Rt 5 Box 169, Eufaula, OK 74432 Eufaula Food Market (918) 689-9136 | 402 S Main St Eufaula, OK Family Dollar Store (918) 689-9949 | 100 N 1st St Eufaula, OK Greens Elevator Inc (918) 473-5715 106 W Gentry Ave Checotah, OK 74426 Hackamyers Grocery (918) 618-6029 | Texanna Rd Eufaula, OK Homeland (918) 687-6151 | 3115 W Okmulgee St Muskogee, OK Homeland Stores 1300 S York ST Muskogee, OK Hy-Vee Food & Drug Stores - (816) 478-1968 4545 S Noland Rd Independence, MO Kmart (816) 254-1180 | 4023 SOUTH NOLAND INDEPENDENCE, MO Kmart (918) 687-7591 | 4 EAST SHAWNEE ROAD MUSKOGEE, OK Nelson Feed & Seed (918) 689-2632 200 N Front St Eufaula, OK 74432 Nichols Dollar Saver (918) 689-5211 | 2nd & Pine Eufaula, OK Nichols Dollar Saver (918) 473-6513 | 207 S Broadway St Checotah, OK PETCO (479) 443-0504 | 4132 N. COLLEGE AVENUE FAYETTEVILLE, AR PETCO (816) 478-3811 | 4802 NOLAND ROAD KANSAS CITY, MO PETCO (918) 252-1857 | 8802-B EAST 71ST ST TULSA, OK PETCO (918) 660-4997 | 4915-C 41ST ST TULSA, OK PetSmart (479) 443-0504 | 4132 N. COLLEGE AVENUE FAYETTEVILLE, AR PetSmart (816) 350-2100 | 4010 S Bolger Dr Independence, MO PetSmart (816) 478-3811 | 4802 NOLAND ROAD KANSAS CITY, MO PetSmart (918) 252-1857 | 8802-B EAST 71ST ST TULSA, OK PetSmart (918) 254-4905 | 10117 E 71st St Tulsa, OK PetSmart (918) 622-6900 | 5418 E 41st St Tulsa, OK PetSmart (918) 660-4997 | 4915-C 41ST ST TULSA, OK Price Chopper (816) 380-3266 | 2059 N Commercial St Harrisonville, MO Price Chopper (816) 478-3088 | 4201 S Noland Rd Independence, MO Price Chopper (816) 833-0784 | 16611 E 23rd St S Independence, MO Save-A-Lot (918) 686-7776 | 2105 Okay Rd Muskogee, OK

Save-A-Lot Foods (918) 423-1766 | 1732 E Carl Albert Pkwy Mcalester, OK Shelton's Warehouse Foods (918) 473-6136 | 1000 W Gentry Ave Checotah, OK Sooner Surplus – 2300 North 32nd Street, Muskogee, Ok. 74401 Southern Agriculture - 6501 E 71st St S Tulsa, OK 74133 Trevers – Arrow Head Mall – Muskogee Ok (out of business) Voss Veterinary Clinic (918) 473-2761 | 2215 N Broadway St Checotah, OK Wal-Mart (816) 350-1687 | 4100 Bolger Road Independence, MO Wal-Mart 1110 West Gentry Checotah, OK

FOOD PURCHASED:

Food Odie ate: 9Lives - Wal Mart, Dollar General, Family Dollar, PetSmart, PetCo, Grocery Stores 9Lives Dry Cat Food Bagged 9Lives 4 Flavor Canned Cat Food 9Lives Daily Essentials Roasted Chicken & Smoked Salmon Flavor Dry Cat Food 9Lives Chicken & Tuna Dinner Canned Cat Food 9Lives Grilled Tuna & Egg Flavor Dry Cat Food 9Lives Liver & Bacon Canned Cat Food 9Lives Ocean Whitefish Canned Cat Food 9Lives Prime Entree with Real Salmon Canned Cat Food 9Lives Primed Grill with Beef Canned Cat Food 9Lives Seafood Platter Canned Cat Food 9Lives Shredded Turkey in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Beef in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Chicken in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Veal in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Super Supper Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Carvings Salmon and Crab Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Cuts with Chicken Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Nibbles with Ocean Whitefish & Tuna in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tuna Select Flaked Tuna and Egg Bits in Sauce Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tuna Select Flaked Tuna in Sauce Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tuna Select Tuna & Cheese Bits in Sauce Canned Cat Food 9Lives Turkey & Giblet Canned Cat Food Alpo Dog and Cat/treats - Wal Mart, Dollar General, Family Dollar, Grocery Stores, PetSmart, & PetCo Alpo Al's Grill Flame Broiled Drum Sticks Dog Treat Pouch Alpo Al's Grill Flame Broiled Steaks Treat Pouch Alpo Al's Grill Flame Grilled Burgers Dog Treat pouch Alpo Al's Grill Smokey Riblets Treat Pouch Dog Treat **Alpo Beef Banquet Canned Cat Food** Alpo Chop House Originals Filet Mignon Flavor Canned Dog Food

Alpo Chop House Originals Pork Tenderloin Canned Dog Food

Alpo Chop House Originals Prime Rib Canned Dog Food Alpo Chop House Originals Ribeye Canned Dog Food Alpo Chop House Originals Roasted Chicken Canned Dog Food Alpo Chop House Originals Top Sirloin Flavor Canned Dog Food Alpo Diced Cuts in Sauce with Beef Canned Dog Food Alpo Diced Cuts Simmered in Sauce with Chicken Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Classics With Beef Bacon and Cheese Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Classics with Beef Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Classics with Chicken Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Classics With Liver Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Loaf Beef Bacon Cheese Canned Dog Food Alpo Liv-A-Snaps Treats Boxed dog treats Alpo Ocean Whitefish Canned Cat Food **Alpo Poultry Canned Cat Food** Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy Beef and Liver Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy Beef and Vegetable Stew Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy Beef Stew Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy Gourmet Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy Lean Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy London Grill Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy Senior Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy with Beef and Rice Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy with Beef Bacon and Cheese Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy with Beef Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy with Chicken Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy with Lamb and Rice Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Cuts in Gravy with Turkey and Bacon Canned Dog Food **Alpo Prime Cuts Meaty Shapes Canned Dog Food** ALPO Prime Entrees in Gravy With Beef Vegetables and Rotini Canned Dog Food ALPO Prime Entrees in Gravy With Chicken Rotini Pasta and Vegetables Canned Dog Food Alpo Prime Slices in Gravy with Lamb Canned Dog Food **Alpo Savory Grill Canned Cat Food** Alpo Sliced Chicken in Gravy Canned Cat Food Alpo Tuna Canned Cat Food **Alpo Turkey and Giblets Canned Cat Food Alpo Variety Snaps Pouch Dog Treat** Alpo with Chicken and Rice – Canned Cat Food Alpo with Salmon and Shrimp Canned Cat Food Alpo with Tuna and Rice Canned Cat Food **Chew-eez Bacon Flavor Chew Stix Pouch Dog Treat Chew-eez Beefhide Chew Strips Chicken Dog Treat Pouch** Come N Get It Dog Food Dry Dog Food Small bag Hearty Classics no Gravy Trio Chicken and Liver Canned Dog Food Purina Beneful Original bagged Dog Food Small and Large Bags **Best Choice – Canned Cat and Dog food Various flavors**

Bil-Jac Clifford The Big Red Dog Tummy Teasers Treats Pouch Bil Jac Select Bagged Dog Food Bil-Jac Senior with Chicken & Oatmeal Dog Food Canine Carry Outs Flavored Dog Treats Pouch Cesar - Wal Mart, Dollar General, Family Dollar, PetSmart, PetCo, Grocery Stores Cesar Select Chicken & Veal in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub **Cesar Select Dinners Pork Tenderloin Flavor in Sauce Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Dinners Top Sirloin Flavor in Sauce Dog Food Tub** Cesar Select Dinners with Chicken & Beef in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Dinners with Chicken & Liver in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub **Cesar Select Dinners with Filet Mignon Flavor in Sauce Dog Food Tub** Cesar Select Dinners with Lamb in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Dinners with Porterhouse Steak Flavor in Sauce Dog Food Tub **Cesar Select Dinners with Turkey in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Duck in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Cesar Select for Puppies With Chicken & Beef Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Grilled Chicken in Sauce Dog Food Tub Cesar Select with Beef in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Chicken Soup Dry Cat Food Chicken Soup Dry Dog Food Diamond Hi-Energy Sporting Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Large Regular Dog Biscuits Diamond Maintenance Adult Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Naturals Senior 8+ Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Lamb & Rice Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Performance Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Performance Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Original Dry Dog Food Diamond Original Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Performance Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Premium Adult Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Professional Adult Cat Food Professional Dry Dog Food Deli-Cat Dry Cat Food jug Dollar General Beef Flavored Beef Sticks Dollar General dog/cat/treats Dollar General Jerky Strips Bagged** Eukanuba Adult Lamb & Rice Formula Dry Bagged Cat Food * PetSmart **Eukanuba Cat Food - Adult Sensitive Stomach Formula Bagged** Eukanuba Natural Lamb & Rice Senior Medium Breed Bagged Dog Food Eukanuba Senior Large Breed Maintenance Formula Dry Dog Food Eukanuba Senior Maintenance Formula Dry dog Food Eukanuba Senior Small Breed Dog Formula Dry Dog Food

Fancy Feast - Wal Mart, Dollar General, Family Dollar, PetSmart, PetCo, Grocery Stores **Fancy Feast Chopped Grill Feast Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Chunky Chicken Feast Cat Food Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys Shredded White Meat Chicken Fare with Garden Greens **Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys White Meat Chicken Florentine with Garden Greens Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys White Meat Chicken Whipped Egg Souffle' with Garden **Greens Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys Yellowfin Tuna Garden Greens Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Flaked Fish & Shrimp Feast Cat Food Canned Fancy Feast Flaked Ocean Fish Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Flaked Salmon & Ocean Whitefish Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Beef & Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Beef & Liver Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Chicken Feast Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Cod, Sole & Shrimp Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Gold Oceanfish and Salmon Formula for Cats Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Gold Savory Chicken & Turkey Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Ocean Whitefish & Tuna Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Savory Salmon Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Tender Liver & Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Turkey & Giblets Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Grilled Salmon Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Grilled Turkey Canned Cat Food **Fancy Feast Minced Beef Feast Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Sliced Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Sliced Chicken Hearts & Liver Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Sliced Turkey & Giblets Canned Cat Food **Fancy Feast Marinated Variety Canned Cat Food** Flint River Ranch Dog and Cat/Treats – Bought direct from Flint River Flint River Ranch Biscuits Dog Treats Flint River Ranch Bonita Flakes Treats Cat Treats Flint River Ranch Cat and Kitten Flint River Ranch Drv Dog Food Flint River Ranch Fish n Chips Dog Food **Flint River Ranch Hairball Cat Food** Flint River Ranch Jubilee Wafers Dog Treats Flint River Ranch Lamb Millet and Rice Wafers Dog Food Flint River Ranch Lamb, Millet, and Rice Dog Food **Flint River Ranch Lite Cat Food** Flint River Ranch Nugget Dog Food Flint River Ranch Original Kibble Dog Food Flint River Ranch Senior LITE Dog Food Flint River Ranch Senior Plus Dog Food

Flint River Ranch Trout and Sweet Potato Wafers Dog Food **Friskies Hairball Remedy Moist Cat Treats Pouch Friskies Chef's Blend Dry Cat Food Friskies Crunch Chicken and Liver Treats Friskies Feline Favorites Cat Food Bag Friskies Gourmet Poultry Flavors Bag Cat Food Friskies Indoor Treats Bag Cat Food** Friskies Special Diet Ocean Whitefish Dinner Canned Cat Food **Friskies Turkey and Giblets Dinner Cat Food Canned** Friskies® Ocean Fish Cat Food Dry **Friskies Tender Treats With Chicken Cat Treats** Friskies Tender Treats with Salmon & Shrimp Cat Food Friskies Tender Treats with Salmon and Shrimp Cat Food Giant Companion Companion Dry Cat Food Bagged * I don't know where I got it Gravy Train - Wal Mart, Dollar General, Family Dollar, Grocery Stores Gravy Train Chunks in Gravy with Beef Dog Food Gravy Train Chunks in Gravy with Chicken Canned Dog Food Gravy Train Strips in Gravy with Turkey Dog Food Greenies Dental Chews For Cats * Wal Mart and Company mailed sample Greenies Dental Chews For Dogs * Wal Mart and Company mailed sample **G Whiskers – Family Dollar G Whiskers Dry Cat Food** Happy Tails - Dollar General Dog Treats pouch Hill's Science Diet dog and cat - PetSmart, Vet's Office, PetCo, Feed Stores **Dog Food Natures Best Box** Hill's Science Diet Adult 7+ Original Dog Food * All Hill's Products from PetCo and **PetSmart** Hill's Science Diet Adult 7+ Small Bites Dog Food Hill's Science Diet Adult Canine Maintenance Treats Bag Dog Food Hill's Science Diet Adult Gourmet Beef Entrée Canned Dog Food Hill's Science Diet Adult Large Breed Lamb Meal & Rice Recipe Dry Dog Food Bag Hill's Science Diet Adult Savory Chicken Entrée Canned Dog Food Hill's Science Diet Adult Small Bites Lamb Meal & Rice Recipe Dry Dog Food Hy-Vee - Grocery Stores - Canned Dog and Cat Foods - various flavors **Iams Active Maturity Dog Food Iams Dry Cat Food Iams Original Dog Food** Jerky Treats - Wal Mart Kibbles 'n Bits Brushin Bites Dry Dog Food **Kibbles 'n Bits Golden Years Dog Food** Kibbles 'n Bits Homestyle Beef Steak & Vegetable Flavor Dry Dog Food **Kibbles N Bits Original Dry Dog Food** Kirkland Super Premium Chicken Dry Dog Food Costco (816) 200-2009 | 19040 E Valley View Pkwy Independence, MO Lick Your Chops - On line purchase Lick Your Chops Senior Dry Dog Food

Life's Abundance – Direct from company

CASE NO. 07-21221 CIV ALTONAGA/Brown

MALTZMAN FOREMAN, PA, 2 South Biscayne Boulevard, Miami, FL 33131 Tel: 305-358-6555 / Fax: 305-374-9077

Life's Abundance Premium Health Cat Food Life's Abundance Premium Health Puppies & Adult Dog Food Life's Abundance Weight-Loss Adult Dog Food **Mighty Dog Canned Dog Food - various flavors** Maxximum Nutrition Adult Recipe Cat Formula Dry Cat Food * Wal Mart Maxximum Nutrition Adult Recipe Chicken & Rice Formula Dry Dog Food Maxximum Nutrition Kitten Recipe Chicken & Rice Formula Dry Cat Food Maxximum Nutrition Indoor Recipe Cat Formula Dry Cat Food Meow Mix Cluck-a-Doodle-Doo with Chicken & Liver in Gravy Cat Pouches Meow Mix Deep Sea Delight with Mackerel in Sauce Pouch Meow Mix Fillet Meow with Beef in Gravy Cat Pouches Meow Mix Go Fish Moist Cat Treats Pouch **Meow Mix Original Dry Bag Cat Food** Milk-Bone - Wal Mart, Dollar General, Family Dollar, PetSmart, PetCo, Grocery Stores **Milk-Bone Chewy Dog Treats Milk-Bone Flavor Snacks Biscuits for Dogs** Milk-Bone Mar-O-Snacks Dog Treats **Milk-Bone Original Bacon Dog Training Treats Milk-Bone Original Dog Biscuits** Mixables - PetSmart, PetCo **Mixables Cape Cod Picnic for Small to Medium Pouch Dog Food** Mixables Colorado Cookout for Medium to Large Pouch Dog Food Mixables Colorado Cookout for Small to Medium Pouch Dog Food **Mixables Country Variety Pack for Medium to Large Pouch Dog Food Mixables Country Variety Pack for Small to Medium Pouch Dog Food** Mixables Grandma's Country Stew for Small to Medium Pouch Dog Food Mixables Grandma's Country Stew Medium to Large Pouch Dog Food **Mixables Greek Banquet for Medium to Large Pouch Dog Food Mixables International Variety for Small to Medium Pouch Dog Food** Mixables International Variety Pack for Medium to Large Dogs Pouch Nature's Recipe – PetCo, PetSmart Nature's Recipe Adult Chicken Meal & Rice Recipe Cat Food Dry Nature's Recipe Carved Chicken & Rice with Vegetables Canned Nature's Recipe Easy-To-Digest Chicken Meal Rice & Barley Dog Food Dry Nature's Recipe Easy-To-Digest Fish Meal & Potato Bag Dog Food Nature's Recipe Easy-To-Digest Lamb, Rice & Barley Dog Food Dry Nature's Recipe Farm Stand Selects Dry Dog Food Nature's Recipe Healthy Skin Venison Meal & Rice Recipe Dog Food Nature's Recipe Lamb Meal & Rice Dog Food Dry Dog Food Nature's Recipe Large Breed Puppy Recipe Dog Food Dry Dog Food Nature's Recipe Puppy Carved Lamb & Rice with Vegetables Canned Dog Food Newman's Own – Hy-Vee, PetSmart, PetCo Newman's Own Advanced Chicken & Rice Formula for Active or Senior Dogs Dry Dog **Food Bagged** Newman's Own Organic Adult Cat Food Canned Natura – PetSmart, PetCo

Evo Small Bite Dry Dog Food Innova Adult Dry Dog Food Innova EVO 95% Meat Chicken & Turkey Canned Dog Food **Innova EVO Red Meat Small Bite Dry Dog Food Innova Evo Reduced Fat Dry Dog Food Innova Large Breed Dry All Natural Puppy Dog Food Master Choice – Price Chopper** Nutro - PetSmart, PetCo **Nutro Crunchers Dog Treats Box** Nutro Max Adult Cat Hairball Management Chicken & Rice Formula Canned Nutro Max Adult Chicken & Lamb Protein Bagged Dog Food Nutro Max Adult Chicken, Rice & Lamb Dinner Canned Dog Food Nutro Max Adult Chicken, Rice & Turkey Dinner Canned Dog Food Nutro Max Bones Chicken & Lamb Flavor Dog Treats Natural Choice – PetSmart and PetCo Nutro Natural Choice Adult Lamb and Pasta Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Adult Lamb and Rice Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Chicken & Brown Rice in Gravy Pouch Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Chicken and Rice Canned Senior Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Chicken, Rice & Oatmeal Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Dog Savory Lamb Stew Slices in Gravy Pouch Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice High Energy Formula Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Lamb & Rice Large Breed Adult Canned Nutro Natural Choice Lamb & Rice Large Breed Puppy Canned Formula Nutro Natural Choice Lamb & Rice Senior Can Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Lamb Duck and Pasta Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Lamb Meal Senior Dog Food Dry Nutro Natural Choice Large Breed Adult Chicken & Rice Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Large Breed Puppy Chicken & Rice Chunks in Gravy Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Large Breed Senior Dry Dog Food Bagged Nutro Natural Choice Large Breed Weight Management Chicken & Rice Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Lite Lamb and Rice Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Midwest Beef Stew Chunks in Gravy Pouch Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Original Lamb and Rice Dry Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Puppy Yankee Pot Roast Chunks in Gravy Pouch Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Senior Chicken & Rice Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Senior Dry Dog Food Bagged Nutro Natural Choice Senior Lamb and Rice Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Senior Large Breed Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Senior Turkey and Rice Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Small Bites Senior Dry Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Turkey & Veggie Casserole Chunks in Gravy Pouch Dog Food Nutro Natural Choice Turkey, Lamb & Pasta Canned Dog Food Nutro Natural Choices Senior Biscuits Dog Food **Ol Roy – Wal Mart**

CASE NO. 07-21221 CIV ALTONAGA/Brown

MALTZMAN FOREMAN, PA, 2 South Biscayne Boulevard, Miami, FL 33131 Tel: 305-358-6555 / Fax: 305-374-9077

Ol Roy Hearty Strips In Gravy Pouch Dog Food Ol Roy Lean Hearty Cuts in Gravy Dog Food Ol' Roy Pouch Dog Food Party Animal "Organic" Gourmet Dog Food Organic Chicken Canned * ordered from company Party Animal "Organic" Gourmet Dog Food Organic Turkey Canned **Pedigree Breath Buster Dog Food** Pedigree Chicken, Rice & Vegetables Dry Dog Food Pedigree Choice Cuts in Sauce Country Stew Canned Dog Food Pedigree Choice Cuts in Sauce with Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Choice Cuts in Sauce with Chicken Dog Food Canned Pedigree Chunky Turkey & Bacon Dog Food Canned Pedigree Complete Small Crunchy Bites Original Beef Dry Dog Food **Pedigree Dentabone Pouch Dog Food** Pedigree DENTAStix pouch dog food Pedigree Healthy Maturity for Seniors Chicken Rice Dry Dog Food **Pedigree Jumbone Pouch Dog Food Pedigree Large Breed Adult Dry Dog Food** Pedigree Lean Beef & Liver in Meaty Juices Canned Dog Food Pedigree Little Champions Beef & Chicken Variety Pack Pouch Dog Food Pedigree Little Champions Casserole Beef, Noodles & Vegetables Pouch Dog Food Pedigree Little Champions Chunks in Gravy with Chicken Pouch Dog Food Pedigree Little Champions Grilled Cuts in Sauce With Beef Pouch Dog Food Pedigree Little Champions Healthy Start Morsels in Sauce with Chicken Dog Food Pouch **Pedigree Marrobone Dog Treat Pouch** Pedigree Pet Food Traditional Ground with Chunky Chicken Canned Dog Food **Pedigree Pet Foods Canned Dog Food Pedigree Puppy Original Chicken Dry Dog Food** Pedigree Puppy Traditional Ground Dinner Chicken & Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Puppy Traditional Ground Dinner with Lamb & Rice Canned Dog Food **Pedigree Small Breed Adult Dry Dog Food Pedigree Super Chew Treat Pouch Dog Food** Pedigree Traditional Ground Dinner with Chopped Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Traditional Ground Dinner with Chopped Chicken Canned Dog Food Pedigree Traditional Ground Dinner with Chopped Liver & Beef Canned Dog Food Pouch Pedigree Traditional Ground Dinner with Chunky Liver & Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Traditional Ground with Chunky Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Traditional Ground with Chunky Beef, Bacon & Cheese Canned Dog Food **Pedigree Weight Maintenance Dry Dog Food** Pedigree with Real Lamb & Rice Dry Dog Food Pounce Caribbean Catch Tuna Flavor Crunchy Cat Treats Cat Food Pounce Caribbean Catch Tuna Flavor Soft Cat Treats Cat Food Pounce Cat Treat - Crunchy Tartar & Plaque Control Cat Food Pounce Cat Treat - Tartar & Plaque Crunchy Salmon Cat Food Pounce Cat Treat - Tartar & Plaque Control Ocean Whitefish & Crab Cat Food Pounce Cat Treats Moist Tuna Flavor Cat Food

CASE NO. 07-21221 CIV ALTONAGA/Brown

MALTZMAN FOREMAN, PA, 2 South Biscayne Boulevard, Miami, FL 33131 Tel: 305-358-6555 / Fax: 305-374-9077

Pounce Crunchy Tartar & Plaque Control Tuna & Salmon Treats Cat Food Pounce Crunchy with Tartar & Plaque 3 Cheese Treats Cat Food Pounce Crunchy with Tartar & Plaque Control Catnip Flavor Treats Cat Food **Pounce Moist Chicken Flavor Cat Treats Cat Food Pounce Tartar & Plaque Control Albacore Tuna Flavor Cat Food** Pounce Tartar & Plaque Original Chicken & Roasted Turkey Cat Food **Pounce Tartar & Plaque Original Chicken Cat Food Pounce Treats Seafood Medley Cat Food Price Chopper Canned Cat Food – Various Flavors** Pro Pac – Greens, Nelsons, Burdine **Pro Pac Adult Chunk Dog Food Bagged** PRO PAC Adult/Senior Chicken Meal & Rice Dry Dog Food **PRO PAC Earthborn Holistic Premium Dry Dog Food PRO PAC High Performance Premium Dry Dog Food PRO PAC Large Breed Puppy Dry Dog Food** Pup-Peroni – Wal Mart Oven Roasted Chicken Pouch Dog Treat **Purina Appawtizers Party Mix Treat Dog Food Pouch Purina Aquari-Yums Cat Treats Cat Food** Purina Cat Chow Indoor Formula Dry Cat Food Bag Purina Cat Chow Naturals Dry Cat Food Bagged **Purina Dog Chow Dry Dog Food** Purina Dog Chow Healthy Morsels Dry Dog Food Purina Dog Chow Senior 7+ Dry Dog Food **Purina HiPro Dog Food Dry** Purina Kibbles and Chunks dry dog food Purina Kit N Kaboodle Cat Food Dry Bagged Purina Moist and Meaty Burger With Cheddar Box Dog Food Purina Moist and Meaty Chicken Box Dog Food Purina Moist and Meaty Turkey and Rice Less Active Box Dog Food Purina Moist and Meaty with Lamb and Rice Box Dog Food **Purina Naturally Complete Dog Food Dry** Purina One Adult Beef & Rice Dry Dog Food Purina One Adult Cat Sensitive Formula Dry Cat Food Purina One Adult Dog Lamb & Rice Dry Dog Food Purina One Chicken & Rice Formula Dry Cat Food Purina One Healthy Kitten Formula Dry Cat Food Purina One Healthy Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Purina One Healthy Weight Dry Dog Food Purina Pro Plan Adult Beef & Rice Dry Dog Food **Purina Puppy Chow Dry Dog Food Purina Selects Pro Plan Dry Dog Food** Purina Whisker Lickin's Deli Slices Chicken Treat Cat Food Whisker Lickin's Tender Moments Cat Treats Cat Food **Beggin Chew Beggin Chew Dog Snacks Dog Food Pouch – various flavors** Purina Beggin' Strips Cheese and Bacon Flavor Pouch Dog Food Purina Beggin' Strips Beef and Bacon Flavor Pouch Dog Food

Save-A-Lot Special Blend Canned Cat Food – Various Flavors Sheba Cat Food - Alaskan King Crab Tub Sure Fresh - Nichols Dollar Saver Cat Food canned and dry various flavors **Snausages Bacon & Cheese Flavor Treat Dog Food Snausages Beef & Cheese In a Blanket Flavor Dog Treat Snausages Beef In a Blanket Treat Dog Food Snausages Fortune Snookies Chicken Chewy Treats Dog Food Snausages Party Sack Treat Dog Food Snausages to Go! Mini Training Treats Dog Food** Sophistacat - PetSmart, PetCo Supreme Gourmet Canned Food For Cats - Various Flavors The Goodlife Recipe dog and cat – Wal Mart, Grocery Stores The GoodLife Recipe Wholesome Biscuits Medium and Large Dog Treats Bag The GoodLife Recipe Wholesome Biscuits Small Dog Treats Bag The GoodLife Recipe with Natural Chicken, Brown Rice & Vegetables Dry Dog Food The Goodlife Recipe with Real Chicken, Brown Rice & Garden Greens Dry Cat Food Twin Pet - Dollar General, Family Dollar Twin Pet Beef Canned Dog Food Wagwells - PetSmart, PetCo WagWells Treats Dog Food - Pouch Wal Mart Brand Special Kitty Gourmet Blend Cat Food **Special Kitty Gourmet Canned Cat Food Special Kitty Select Beef In Gravy Pouch Cat Food Special Kitty Select Tuna in Sauce Canned Cat Food** Special Kitty Select With Mixed Grill In Gravy Pouch Cat Food Special Kitty Select With Turkey and Giblets In Gravy Cat Food Pouch Whiskas - Wal Mart, Dollar General, Family Dollar, PetSmart, PetCo, Grocery Stores Whiskas CatMilk Drink Carton Whiskas Choice Cuts Chicken Cat Food Pouch Whiskas Choice Cuts With Poached Salmon in Sauce Pouch Cat Food Whiskas Meaty Selections Dry Cat Food Whiskas Seafood Selections Dry Cat Food Whiskas Temptations Chicken Treat Pouch Cat Food

Food Bruno and Meeko ate: Chicken Soup Dry Cat Food Chicken Soup Dry Dog Food Diamond Hi-Energy Sporting Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Large Regular Dog Biscuits Diamond Maintenance Adult Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Naturals Senior 8+ Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Lamb & Rice Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Performance Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Performance Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Performance Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Original Dry Dog Food Diamond Original Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Performance Formula Dry Dog Food

Diamond Premium Adult Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Iams Original Dog Food Professional Adult Cat Food Professional Dry Dog Food

Food my cats ate:

9Lives Chicken & Tuna Dinner Canned Cat Food 9Lives Grilled Tuna & Egg Flavor Dry Cat Food 9Lives Liver & Bacon Canned Cat Food 9Lives Ocean Whitefish Canned Cat Food 9Lives Prime Entree with Real Salmon Canned Cat Food 9Lives Primed Grill with Beef Canned Cat Food 9Lives Seafood Platter Canned Cat Food 9Lives Shredded Turkey in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Beef in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Chicken in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Veal in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Super Supper Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Carvings Salmon and Crab Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Cuts with Chicken Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Nibbles with Ocean Whitefish & Tuna in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tuna Select Flaked Tuna and Egg Bits in Sauce Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tuna Select Flaked Tuna in Sauce Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tuna Select Tuna & Cheese Bits in Sauce Canned Cat Food 9Lives Turkey & Giblet Canned Cat Food **Alpo Beef Banquet Canned Cat Food Best Choice Canned Cat Food various flavors Chicken Soup Dry Cat Food Companion Dry Cat Food Bagged Companion Dry Cat Food Bagged Deli-Cat Dry Cat Food jug Dollar General cat/treats** Eukanuba Adult Lamb & Rice Formula Dry Bagged Cat Food Eukanuba Adult Lamb & Rice Formula Dry Bagged Cat Food Eukanuba Cat Food - Adult Sensitive Stomach Formula Bagged Eukanuba Cat Food - Adult Sensitive Stomach Formula Bagged **Fancy Feast Chopped Grill Feast Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Chunky Chicken Feast Cat Food Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Elegant Medlevs Shredded White Meat Chicken Fare with Garden Greens **Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys White Meat Chicken Florentine with Garden Greens Canned **Cat Food** Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys White Meat Chicken Whipped Egg Souffle' with Garden **Greens Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys Yellowfin Tuna Garden Greens Canned Cat Food

Fancy Feast Flaked Fish & Shrimp Feast Cat Food Canned Fancy Feast Flaked Ocean Fish Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Flaked Salmon & Ocean Whitefish Canned Cat Food **Fancy Feast Gourmet Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Gourmet Beef & Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Beef & Liver Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Chicken Feast Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Cod, Sole & Shrimp Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Gold Oceanfish and Salmon Formula for Cats Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Gold Savory Chicken & Turkey Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Ocean Whitefish & Tuna Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Savory Salmon Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Tender Liver & Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Turkey & Giblets Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Grilled Salmon Canned Cat Food **Fancy Feast Grilled Turkey Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Marinated Variety Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Minced Beef Feast Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Sliced Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Sliced Chicken Hearts & Liver Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Sliced Turkey & Giblets Canned Cat Food Flint River Ranch Bonita Flakes Treats Cat Treats Flint River Ranch Cat and Kitten **Flint River Ranch Hairball Cat Food** Flint River Ranch Jubilee Wafers Dog Treats **Flint River Ranch Lite Cat Food Flint River Ranch Lite Cat Food Friskies Chef's Blend Dry Cat Food Friskies Crunch Chicken and Liver Treats Friskies Feline Favorites Cat Food Bag Friskies Gourmet Poultry Flavors Bag Cat Food Friskies Hairball Remedy Moist Cat Treats Pouch Friskies Indoor Treats Bag Cat Food** Friskies Special Diet Ocean Whitefish Dinner Canned Cat Food **Friskies Tender Treats With Chicken Cat Treats** Friskies Tender Treats with Salmon & Shrimp Cat Food **Friskies Tender Treats with Salmon and Shrimp Cat Food Friskies Turkey and Giblets Dinner Cat Food Canned Friskies® Ocean Fish Cat Food Dry G** Whiskers Dry Cat Food Hy-Vee Canned Cat Foods – various flavors **Iams Drv Cat Food** Life's Abundance Premium Health Cat Food Life's Abundance Instinctive Choice Premium Canned Cat Food Maxximum Nutrition Adult Recipe Cat Formula Dry Cat Food **Maxximum Nutrition Indoor Recipe Cat Formula Dry Cat Food**

Maxximum Nutrition Kitten Recipe Chicken & Rice Formula Dry Cat Food Meow Mix Cluck-a-Doodle-Doo with Chicken & Liver in Gravy Cat Pouches Meow Mix Deep Sea Delight with Mackerel in Sauce Pouch Meow Mix Fillet Meow with Beef in Gravy Cat Pouches **Meow Mix Go Fish Moist Cat Treats Pouch Meow Mix Original Dry Bag Cat Food** Nature's Recipe Adult Chicken Meal & Rice Recipe Cat Food Dry Nature's Recipe Adult Chicken Meal & Rice Recipe Cat Food Dry Nature's Recipe Adult Chicken Meal & Rice Recipe Cat Food Dry Nature's Recipe Adult Chicken Meal & Rice Recipe Cat Food Dry Newman's Own Organic Adult Cat Food Canned Newman's Own Organic Advanced Cat Food Nutro Max Adult Cat Hairball Management Chicken & Rice Formula Canned Pounce Caribbean Catch Tuna Flavor Crunchy Cat Treats Cat Food Pounce Caribbean Catch Tuna Flavor Soft Cat Treats Cat Food Pounce Cat Treat - Crunchy Tartar & Plaque Control Cat Food Pounce Cat Treat - Tartar & Plaque Crunchy Salmon Cat Food Pounce Cat Treat -Tartar & Plaque Control Ocean Whitefish & Crab Cat Food **Pounce Cat Treats Moist Tuna Flavor Cat Food** Pounce Crunchy Tartar & Plaque Control Tuna & Salmon Treats Cat Food Pounce Crunchy with Tartar & Plaque 3 Cheese Treats Cat Food Pounce Crunchy with Tartar & Plaque Control Catnip Flavor Treats Cat Food **Pounce Moist Chicken Flavor Cat Treats Cat Food Pounce Tartar & Plaque Control Albacore Tuna Flavor Cat Food** Pounce Tartar & Plaque Original Chicken & Roasted Turkey Cat Food **Pounce Tartar & Plaque Original Chicken Cat Food Pounce Treats Seafood Medley Cat Food Price Chopper Canned Cat Food – Various Flavors Professional Adult Cat Food Purina Aquari-Yums Cat Treats Cat Food** Purina Cat Chow Indoor Formula Dry Cat Food Bag **Purina Cat Chow Naturals Dry Cat Food Bagged** Purina Kit N Kaboodle Cat Food Dry Bagged Purina One Adult Cat Sensitive Formula Dry Cat Food Purina One Chicken & Rice Formula Dry Cat Food Purina One Healthy Kitten Formula Dry Cat Food Purina Whisker Lickin's Deli Slices Chicken Treat Cat Food Save-A-Lot Special Blend Canned Cat Food – Various Flavors Sheba Cat Food - Alaskan King Crab Tub **Special Kitty Gourmet Canned Cat Food Special Kitty Select Beef In Gravy Pouch Cat Food Special Kitty Select Tuna in Sauce Canned Cat Food** Special Kitty Select With Mixed Grill In Gravy Pouch Cat Food Special Kitty Select With Turkey and Giblets In Gravy Cat Food Pouch The Goodlife Recipe with Real Chicken, Brown Rice & Garden Greens Dry Cat Food Whiskas CatMilk Drink Carton

Whiskas Choice Cuts Chicken Cat Food Pouch Whiskas Choice Cuts With Poached Salmon in Sauce Pouch Cat Food Whiskas Meaty Selections Dry Cat Food Whiskas Seafood Selections Dry Cat Food Whiskas Temptations Chicken Treat Pouch Cat Food Whisker Lickin's Tender Moments Cat Treats Cat Food

Dog food for boarders:

Alpo Al's Grill Flame Broiled Drum Sticks Dog Treat Pouch Alpo Al's Grill Flame Broiled Steaks Treat Pouch Alpo Al's Grill Flame Grilled Burgers Dog Treat pouch Alpo Al's Grill Smokey Riblets Treat Pouch Dog Treat Alpo Chop House Originals Filet Mignon Flavor Canned Dog Food Alpo Chop House Originals Pork Tenderloin Canned Dog Food Alpo Chop House Originals Prime Rib Canned Dog Food Alpo Chop House Originals Ribeye Canned Dog Food Alpo Chop House Originals Roasted Chicken Canned Dog Food Alpo Chop House Originals Top Sirloin Flavor Canned Dog Food Alpo Diced Cuts in Sauce with Beef Canned Dog Food Alpo Diced Cuts Simmered in Sauce with Chicken Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Classics With Beef Bacon and Cheese Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Classics with Beef Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Classics with Chicken Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Classics With Liver Canned Dog Food Alpo Hearty Loaf Beef Bacon Cheese Canned Dog Food **Bil Jac Select Bagged Dog Food Bil-Jac Clifford The Big Red Dog Tummy Teasers Treats Pouch** Cesar Select Chicken & Veal in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub **Cesar Select Dinners Pork Tenderloin Flavor in Sauce Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Dinners Top Sirloin Flavor in Sauce Dog Food Tub** Cesar Select Dinners with Chicken & Beef in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Dinners with Chicken & Liver in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub **Cesar Select Dinners with Filet Mignon Flavor in Sauce Dog Food Tub** Cesar Select Dinners with Lamb in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Dinners with Porterhouse Steak Flavor in Sauce Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Dinners with Turkey in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub **Cesar Select Duck in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Cesar Select for Puppies With Chicken & Beef Dog Food Tub Cesar Select Grilled Chicken in Sauce Dog Food Tub Cesar Select with Beef in Meaty Juices Dog Food Tub Chicken Soup Dry Dog Food Diamond Hi-Energy Sporting Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Large Regular Dog Biscuits Diamond Maintenance Adult Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Naturals Senior 8+ Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Lamb & Rice Formula Dry Dog Food**

Diamond Nutra Nugget Performance Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Nutra Nugget Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Original Dry Dog Food Diamond Original Dry Dog Food Diamond Original Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Original Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Performance Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Premium Adult Formula Dry Dog Food Diamond Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food Dollar General Beef Flavored Beef Sticks Eukanuba Senior Large Breed Maintenance Formula Dry Dog Food Gravy Train Chunks in Gravy with Beef Dog Food Gravy Train Chunks in Gravy with Chicken Canned Dog Food Gravy Train Strips in Gravy with Turkey Dog Food **Greenies Dental Chews For Dogs** Happy Tails - Dog Treats pouch Hy-Vee Canned Dog Foods - various flavors **Iams Active Maturity Dog Food** Maxximum Nutrition Adult Recipe Chicken & Rice Formula Dry Dog Food Maxximum Nutrition Adult Recipe Lamb & Rice Formula Dry Dog Food **Mighty Dog Canned Dog Food - various flavors Milk-Bone Chewy Dog Treats Milk-Bone Flavor Snacks Biscuits for Dogs** Pedigree Pet Food Traditional Ground with Chunky Chicken Canned Dog Food **Pedigree Pet Foods Canned Dog Food** Pedigree Puppy Original Chicken Dry Dog Food Pedigree Puppy Traditional Ground Dinner Chicken & Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Puppy Traditional Ground Dinner with Lamb & Rice Canned Dog Food **Pedigree Small Breed Adult Dry Dog Food Pedigree Super Chew Treat Pouch Dog Food** Pedigree Traditional Ground Dinner with Chopped Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Traditional Ground Dinner with Chopped Chicken Canned Dog Food Pedigree Traditional Ground Dinner with Chopped Liver & Beef Canned Dog Food Pouch Pedigree Traditional Ground Dinner with Chunky Liver & Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Traditional Ground with Chunky Beef Canned Dog Food Pedigree Traditional Ground with Chunky Beef, Bacon & Cheese Canned Dog Food **Pedigree Weight Maintenance Dry Dog Food** Pedigree with Real Lamb & Rice Dry Dog Food **Professional Dry Dog Food Pup-Peroni Oven Roasted Chicken Pouch Dog Treat**

Purina Beneful Original bagged Dog Food Small and Large Bags **Purina Dog Chow Dry Dog Food** Purina Dog Chow Healthy Morsels Dry Dog Food Purina Dog Chow Senior 7+ Dry Dog Food Purina HiPro Dog Food Dry Purina Kibbles and Chunks dry dog food Purina Moist and Meaty Burger With Cheddar Box Dog Food Purina Moist and Meaty Chicken Box Dog Food Purina Moist and Meaty Turkey and Rice Less Active Box Dog Food Purina Moist and Meaty with Lamb and Rice Box Dog Food **Purina Naturally Complete Dog Food Dry** Purina One Adult Beef & Rice Dry Dog Food Purina One Adult Dog Lamb & Rice Dry Dog Food Purina One Healthy Puppy Formula Dry Dog Food **Purina One Healthy Weight Dry Dog Food** Purina Pro Plan Adult Beef & Rice Dry Dog Food **Purina Puppy Chow Dry Dog Food Purina Selects Pro Plan Dry Dog Food Snausages Bacon & Cheese Flavor Treat Dog Food Snausages Beef & Cheese In a Blanket Flavor Dog Treat Snausages Beef In a Blanket Treat Dog Food Snausages Fortune Snookies Chicken Chewy Treats Dog Food Snausages Party Sack Treat Dog Food Snausages to Go! Mini Training Treats Dog Food** The GoodLife Recipe Wholesome Biscuits Medium and Large Dog Treats Bag The GoodLife Recipe Wholesome Biscuits Small Dog Treats Bag The GoodLife Recipe with Natural Chicken, Brown Rice & Vegetables Dry Dog Food **Twin Pet Beef Canned Dog Food**

Cat food for boarders:

9Lives Chicken & Tuna Dinner Canned Cat Food 9Lives Grilled Tuna & Egg Flavor Dry Cat Food 9Lives Liver & Bacon Canned Cat Food 9Lives Ocean Whitefish Canned Cat Food 9Lives Prime Entree with Real Salmon Canned Cat Food 9Lives Primed Grill with Beef Canned Cat Food 9Lives Seafood Platter Canned Cat Food 9Lives Shredded Turkey in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Beef in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Chicken in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Sliced Veal in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Super Supper Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Carvings Salmon and Crab Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Cuts with Chicken Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tender Nibbles with Ocean Whitefish & Tuna in Gravy Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tuna Select Flaked Tuna and Egg Bits in Sauce Canned Cat Food

9Lives Tuna Select Flaked Tuna in Sauce Canned Cat Food 9Lives Tuna Select Tuna & Cheese Bits in Sauce Canned Cat Food 9Lives Turkey & Giblet Canned Cat Food **Alpo Beef Banquet Canned Cat Food Best Choice Canned Cat Food various flavors Chicken Soup Dry Cat Food Companion Dry Cat Food Bagged Deli-Cat Dry Cat Food jug Dollar General cat/treats Fancy Feast Chopped Grill Feast Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Chunky Chicken Feast Cat Food Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys Shredded White Meat Chicken Fare with Garden Greens **Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys White Meat Chicken Florentine with Garden Greens Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys White Meat Chicken Whipped Egg Souffle' with Garden **Greens Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Elegant Medleys Yellowfin Tuna Garden Greens Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Flaked Fish & Shrimp Feast Cat Food Canned Fancy Feast Flaked Ocean Fish Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Flaked Salmon & Ocean Whitefish Canned Cat Food **Fancy Feast Gourmet Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Gourmet Beef & Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Beef & Liver Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Chicken Feast Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Cod, Sole & Shrimp Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Gold Oceanfish and Salmon Formula for Cats Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Gold Savory Chicken & Turkey Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Ocean Whitefish & Tuna Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Savory Salmon Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Tender Liver & Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Gourmet Turkey & Giblets Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Grilled Salmon Canned Cat Food **Fancy Feast Grilled Turkey Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Marinated Variety Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Minced Beef Feast Canned Cat Food** Fancy Feast Sliced Chicken Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Sliced Chicken Hearts & Liver Canned Cat Food Fancy Feast Sliced Turkey & Giblets Canned Cat Food **Friskies Chef's Blend Dry Cat Food Friskies Crunch Chicken and Liver Treats Friskies Feline Favorites Cat Food Bag Friskies Gourmet Poultry Flavors Bag Cat Food Friskies Hairball Remedy Moist Cat Treats Pouch Friskies Indoor Treats Bag Cat Food** Friskies Special Diet Ocean Whitefish Dinner Canned Cat Food

Friskies Tender Treats With Chicken Cat Treats Friskies Tender Treats with Salmon & Shrimp Cat Food Friskies Tender Treats with Salmon and Shrimp Cat Food **Friskies Turkey and Giblets Dinner Cat Food Canned Friskies® Ocean Fish Cat Food Drv G** Whiskers Dry Cat Food Hv-Vee Canned Cat Foods - various flavors **Iams Dry Cat Food Maxximum Nutrition Adult Recipe Cat Formula Dry Cat Food Maxximum Nutrition Indoor Recipe Cat Formula Dry Cat Food** Maxximum Nutrition Kitten Recipe Chicken & Rice Formula Dry Cat Food Meow Mix Cluck-a-Doodle-Doo with Chicken & Liver in Gravy Cat Pouches Meow Mix Deep Sea Delight with Mackerel in Sauce Pouch Meow Mix Fillet Meow with Beef in Gravy Cat Pouches **Meow Mix Go Fish Moist Cat Treats Pouch Meow Mix Original Dry Bag Cat Food** Pounce Caribbean Catch Tuna Flavor Crunchy Cat Treats Cat Food Pounce Caribbean Catch Tuna Flavor Soft Cat Treats Cat Food **Pounce Cat Treat - Crunchy Tartar & Plague Control Cat Food** Pounce Cat Treat - Tartar & Plaque Crunchy Salmon Cat Food Pounce Cat Treat - Tartar & Plaque Control Ocean Whitefish & Crab Cat Food **Pounce Cat Treats Moist Tuna Flavor Cat Food** Pounce Crunchy Tartar & Plaque Control Tuna & Salmon Treats Cat Food Pounce Crunchy with Tartar & Plaque 3 Cheese Treats Cat Food Pounce Crunchy with Tartar & Plaque Control Catnip Flavor Treats Cat Food **Pounce Moist Chicken Flavor Cat Treats Cat Food Pounce Tartar & Plaque Control Albacore Tuna Flavor Cat Food** Pounce Tartar & Plaque Original Chicken & Roasted Turkey Cat Food **Pounce Tartar & Plaque Original Chicken Cat Food Pounce Treats Seafood Medlev Cat Food** Price Chopper Canned Cat Food – Various Flavors **Professional Adult Cat Food Purina Aquari-Yums Cat Treats Cat Food** Purina Cat Chow Indoor Formula Dry Cat Food Bag **Purina Cat Chow Naturals Dry Cat Food Bagged** Purina Kit N Kaboodle Cat Food Dry Bagged Purina One Adult Cat Sensitive Formula Dry Cat Food Purina One Chicken & Rice Formula Dry Cat Food Purina One Healthy Kitten Formula Dry Cat Food Purina Whisker Lickin's Deli Slices Chicken Treat Cat Food Save-A-Lot Special Blend Canned Cat Food – Various Flavors Sheba Cat Food - Alaskan King Crab Tub **Special Kitty Gourmet Canned Cat Food Special Kitty Select Beef In Gravy Pouch Cat Food Special Kitty Select Tuna in Sauce Canned Cat Food** Special Kitty Select With Mixed Grill In Gravy Pouch Cat Food

Special Kitty Select With Turkey and Giblets In Gravy Cat Food Pouch The Goodlife Recipe with Real Chicken, Brown Rice & Garden Greens Dry Cat Food Whiskas CatMilk Drink Carton Whiskas Choice Cuts Chicken Cat Food Pouch Whiskas Choice Cuts With Poached Salmon in Sauce Pouch Cat Food Whiskas Meaty Selections Dry Cat Food Whiskas Seafood Selections Dry Cat Food Whiskas Temptations Chicken Treat Pouch Cat Food Whisker Lickin's Tender Moments Cat Treats Cat Food

5. Please identify yourself, including your full name and any prior names used, all electronic identities used at any time during the past five (5) years (including email addresses, user names, or screen names), all addresses at which you have lived for the past ten (10) years, your date of birth, and your driver's license number and state of issuance.

Objection. The Plaintiffs object because the request is facially overbroad based upon the defined term "you" and "your" because the Plaintiffs would have to inquire as to a spouse, relatives, employees, etc. to determine whether any of these persons who are not parties to this action actually have any sort of information regarding electronic identities that they used during the past five (5) years, which is wholly irrelevant. See Kraft Foods N. Am., 238 F.R.D. 648, 658-59; Socas, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 16683, at *3 ("the Court may restrain any discovery requests that are overbroad or would be unduly burdensome to produce"); In re U. S. Financial Sec. Litigation, 74 F.R.D. at 498 ("to avoid oppressiveness, interrogatories must be tailored to discover only what is reasonable and necessary to the litigation at hand"); Aero Holdings, Inc., 2000 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 19817, at *16-17 (holding that an interrogatory was overbroad because party would have been required to identify many people who had "no relevant knowledge concerning" the case) (emphasis added); Brooks, 1990 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 19395, at *7 (stating that the prevailing law of the Seventh Circuit is that parties are limited in their interrogatories to the identity and location of "persons having knowledge of relevant facts") (emphasis added); Rivera v. NIBCO, Inc., 384 F.3d 822, 825 (9th Cir. 2004) (discovery of plaintiff's birthplace is irrelevant); Myricks v. FRB, 480 F.3d 1036, 1042 (11th Cir. 2007) (Upholding district court's decision to deny "irrelevant discovery" of severance agreements not related to the claim); Allstate Ins. Co. v. Langston, 655 So. 2d 91, 95 (Fla. 1995) (a litigant is not "entitled carte blanche to irrelevant discovery"); Woodford, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 22438, at *2 (holding that interrogatories requesting defendant to "identify all witnesses with potential knowledge of the basis of your response" as well as the identity of "all witnesses past and present employees of CDC/CDCR who have personal knowledge of CDCR's compliance with the [Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act]" are overbroad, unduly burdensome, and vague). The definition of "you" and "yours" would also require the Plaintiffs to divulge the date of birth, social security numbers and drivers license information of a spouse, relatives, agents, employees, etc., which is highly confidential and completely irrelevant since these persons are not parties to this lawsuit and such information cannot be obtained without a properly issued subpoena under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 45. While "[t]he legal tenet that relevancy in the discovery context is broader than in the context of admissibility . . .," the concept of relevancy "should not be misapplied so as to allow fishing expeditions in

I, Susan Peters, declare and state the foregoing responses to interrogatories are true and correct under penalty of perjury.

Executed on June 29, 2008.

Susan Peters