UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA MIAMI DIVISION

CASE NO. 07-21221-CIV-ALTONAGA/BROWN

RENEE BLASZKOWSKI, et al., individually and on behalf of others similarly situated, Plaintiffs,

VS.

MARS, INCORPORATED, et al., Defendants.

SUPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF KRISTEN E. CAVERLY IN SUPPORT OF NATURA PET PRODUCTS, INC.'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

- 1. I, Kristen E. Caverly, am over the age of 18 and have personal knowledge of the facts set forth herein or know of such facts from my review of the case files for this action, which are maintained by my office in the normal course of business. I am lead counsel for defendant Natura Pet Products, Inc., and admitted *pro hac vice* in this action.
- 2. On August 25, 2008, I took the deposition of Plaintiff Susan Peters in Washington, DC. True and correct copies of the following pages of the deposition of Ms. Peters are attached hereto as Exhibit C: 1, 2, 54-58, 63-65, 77-78, 80-81, 96-97, 104-105, 126-127, 215-218, 248, and 270-272.
- 3. I have been notified of no changes to Ms. Peters deposition testimony. The foregoing is stated under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America. Executed in Rancho Santa Fe, California on November 14, 2008.

Kristen E. Caverly

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA
2	
3	CASE NO. 1:07-21221 CIV-ALTONGA/BROWN
4	RENEE BLASZKOWSKI, et al., individually and on behalf of others similarly situated,
5	Plaintiffs,
6	vs.
7	MARS, INC., et al.,
8	Defendants.
9	/
10	Miami, Florida
11	August 25, 2008 10:17 o'clock a.m.
12	
13	VOLUME I PAGES 1 - 200
14	
15	
16	
17	VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION
	OF
18	SUSAN PETERS
19	
20	
21	
22	JOB NO: 950663
23	Reported By: Evan A. Ferguson, RPR
24	Notary Public, State of Florida Esquire Deposition Services
25	Fort Lauderdale Office Phone 954-331-4400

1	APPEARANCES:
2	
3	LAW OFFICES OF EDGAR R. NIELD
4	BY: EDGAR R. NIELD, ESQUIRE, 4370 La Jolla Village Drive, Suite 640
5	San Diego, California 92122 858.552.6745
6	Appearing on behalf of the Plaintiffs.
7	HENDEDGON GAMEDIA IID
8	HENDERSON, CAVERLY, LLP., BY: KRISTEN E. CAVERLY, ESQUIRE,
9	16236 San Dieguito Road, Suite 4-13 Rancho Santa Fe, California 92067
10	858.756.6342 Appearing on behalf of Natura Pet Products.
11	
12	ALSO PRESENT: ROBERT PACHECO, VIDEOGRAPHER,
13	Esquire Deposition Services.
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

```
1 O They are actually humans for vitamins --
```

- 2 excuse me, they are actually vitamins for humans,
- 3 correct?
- A Absent the iron, yes, that is correct.
- 5 Q What brand of vitamins do you give Odie?
- 6 A That varies. I do a test to determine how
- 7 well it will be dissolved. Right now it was one that
- 8 was available at Wal-Mart and it may be the Equate
- 9 brand, but I am not sure.
- 10 Q What is the test that you do to see how well
- it will be dissolved?
- 12 A You put a tablet in some vinegar, and that
- 13 represents the acidity of your stomach, and you time the
- 14 breakdown of the vitamin, and if it happens in a short
- 15 period of time, then it's digestible in that fashion.
- And there is a lot of vitamins you would be
- 17 surprised will never break down.
- 18 Q Other than Equate, do you recall any other
- 19 brands of vitamins that you have given to Odie?
- 20 A I did try the California Natural, whatever
- 21 their stuff was way back, it was a brief thing. I
- 22 didn't feel like it did everything that I needed it to
- do, that would have been in 2006.
- 24 But as far as an actual supplement for the
- 25 meals that I am preparing, I don't remember any other

- 1 brands at this time.
- Q When did you start giving Odie human vitamins?
- 3 A Recently, over the last six months.
- 4 Q How long did you use the California Natural
- 5 Supplements with Odie?
- 6 A Not very long, she ate the bottle, or the
- 7 container, and I didn't buy anymore, so a week maybe.
- 8 Q Do you mean she ate it all at one time?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 Q She got a hold of it and just ate it all?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q I see.
- MR. NIELD: She is very healthy.
- 14 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 15 Q So for the California Natural Supplements you
- 16 purchased those one time, correct?
- 17 A That's right.
- 18 Q And that was sometime in 2006, yes?
- 19 A Yes.
- 21 California Natural Supplements?
- 22 A That would have been at PetSmart.
- Q What location?
- 24 A I don't remember that. I shop -- that would
- 25 have been either in Arkansas or in Oklahoma.

```
1 O Do you have any way to narrow down what state
```

- 2 it was that you purchased the California Natural
- 3 Supplements in 2006?
- 4 A No, I don't.
- 5 Q You mentioned that the California Natural
- 6 supplement didn't do everything you wanted it to do,
- 7 what did you mean by that, other than he ate it all at
- 8 once?
- 9 MR. NIELD: So it didn't last very long.
- 10 THE WITNESS: Yes, it didn't last so long.
- 11 That was mostly it, I felt like if she was
- drawn to the flavor, how could I measure it out and
- 13 know when she needed something, so it was just it
- 14 wasn't convenient for me, it was when she learned
- to eat the packaging, it wasn't a good idea. I
- 16 didn't give it a fair try.
- 17 (BY Ms. Caverly)
- 18 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 19 Q There was nothing about its performance that
- 20 you didn't like, you just thought it probably wasn't
- 21 very good to use something she liked the taste of for a
- 22 vitamin?
- 23 A Yes, that's right.
- Q Okay. Are there any representations that
- 25 Natura has made related to the California Natural

- 1 supplement that you feel are false?
- 2 A No, I don't, I don't know. I had a coupon to
- 3 try it, and at that point I became familiar with some of
- 4 the other products.
- 5 Q Did you initially buy the California Natural
- 6 Supplements because you had the coupon?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q Where did you get the coupon?
- 9 A I don't remember.
- 10 Q Was it a coupon for a free sample or a
- 11 discount?
- 12 A I don't remember. I don't know for sure.
- 13 Q Was the California Natural Supplement that you
- 14 purchased for Odie the first time that you purchased a
- 15 Natura pet product?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 Q Can you pinpoint any better in time when in
- 18 2006 that initial purchase of Natura Pet Products
- 19 products occurred?
- 20 A The fall of 2006. I don't know beyond that.
- 21 Q Do you have any receipts or any other written
- 22 evidence that would pinpoint where and when you
- 23 purchased the California Natural Supplements that was
- your initial purchase of Natura products?
- 25 A I don't believe I do.

```
1 Q Before you purchased the California Natural
```

- 2 Supplement product, had you ever heard of Natura Pet
- 3 Products?
- 4 A No.
- 5 Q Is it fair to say that you first learned of
- 6 Natura's products because you got a coupon for one of
- 7 the products?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q And other than going to the store and using
- 10 the coupon to buy the California Natural product, did
- 11 you do any investigation of the product before the
- 12 purchase?
- 13 A I did not investigate -- I did a little bit of
- investigating, but I didn't investigate the other lines
- 15 until after I had the supplement.
- 16 Q So the fall of 2006 you got a coupon and went
- 17 to PetSmart and bought California Natural Supplements,
- 18 correct?
- 19 A Yes.
- Odie had eaten them all; then you chose to investigate
- Natura's products further; is that right?
- 23 A That's right.
- Q What did you do next as part of that
- 25 investigation?

- best dog food in the world or pet food in the world.
- I don't think that the ingredients are
- 3 actually as they are advertised to be. I pretty much
- 4 feel like I could buy a Purina product over-the-counter
- 5 at a lot less cost and have the same results.
- 6 Q Has Natura in any fashion ever represented to
- 7 you what results you would achieve from --
- 8 A Yes, they talked about it being a healthy
- 9 product, and when I see the ear infections and all of
- 10 the allergic reactions in my pet, I don't believe that
- 11 is the case.
- 12 Q After you purchased the California Natura
- 13 supplements from PetSmart, when was the next time that
- 14 you purchased a Natura product?
- 15 A It would have been on the cusp of 2006/2007.
- 16 My mom and I we like to shop as our -- my mother likes
- 17 to shop, I don't, so when I visit her over the holidays
- 18 between Christmas and New Year's, then to help get my
- interest we go pet food shopping.
- 20 Q So over the Christmas New Year holidays, 2006
- 21 to 2007, you and your mother went and purchased a Natura
- 22 product, correct?
- 23 A Several.
- Q Where did you go to purchase the products?
- 25 A We shopped at both PetSmart and PetCo and that

- 1 would be in Independence, I believe it lists as a Kansas
- 2 City, address but it's a suburb.
- 3 Q Kansas City, Kansas or Missouri?
- 4 A Missouri.
- 5 Q What products did you and your mother purchase
- 6 that were manufactured by Natura Pet Products from
- 7 PetSmart and PetCo at the end of 2006, beginning of
- 8 2007?
- 9 A I purchased the -- it's in a yellow bag,
- 10 Innova, I probably have to look at my responses, but the
- 11 red meat, the 95 percent, the canned one with chicken
- 12 and turkey; the reduced fat large breed, I think that
- there is like seven all together, I am not sure exactly.
- We will have to look back at my responses to
- 15 know for sure.
- 16 Q Which of the seven Natura products that you
- 17 purchased did you buy from PetSmart?
- 18 A I don't know.
- 19 Q Which of the seven products that you purchased
- 20 did you buy from PetCo?
- 21 A I don't know.
- Q Other than PetSmart and PetCo, have you ever
- 23 purchased a Natura manufactured or distributed product
- from any other store?
- 25 A I don't believe so.

- 1 Q And were your purchases -- Strike that. Other
- than the purchase of the California Natural Supplements
- 3 in the fall-ish timeframe of 2006, in this period of
- 4 time during the holidays of 2006 to 2007, have you ever
- 5 purchased a Natura Pet Product manufactured or
- 6 distributed by them?
- 7 A I don't believe so.
- 8 Q Was it on a single day that you bought the
- 9 seven or so products from PetSmart and PetCo?
- 10 A I can't say that for sure. It was over the
- 11 holiday period, so I don't know that for sure.
- 12 Q Either on the same day or within a few days of
- each other, correct?
- 14 A Yes.
- Q What was your purpose in buying so many
- 16 different Natura Pet Products during that short period
- 17 of time?
- 18 A I don't like to shop. I didn't buy -- I was
- 19 purchasing -- I don't like to shop, I went with my mom,
- and I bought an array to take home, and should have
- 21 lasted my dog quite until I could get back for my
- 22 mom's birthday and we could do it again.
- 23 Q How long a period is that?
- 24 A About four months, three months probably.
- 25 Q Why did you buy so many different varieties?

1 meat as a replacement for home cooked or as a supplement

- 2 to home cooked do you find false?
- 3 A I wouldn't use natural flavors, I don't know
- 4 what natural flavored -- that is an added ingredient or
- 5 it wouldn't be added to the list of ingredients.
- 6 There is potatoes that -- there is potatoes,
- 7 there is garlic, there is a number of ingredients that
- 8 are toxic to pets if they are not prepared correctly.
- 9 And when I learned that kitchen isn't
- 10 necessarily at Nutro and that they are not in control of
- 11 what is being produced, that and like I said my dog
- 12 didn't care for it, it was not a product that she
- 13 enjoyed, but, no, I think it's very disappointing to
- 14 read the label.
- I think it's very false in its representation,
- 16 it's not what I would fix at home or recommend to you to
- 17 fix at home.
- 18 Q You just said in your answer Nutro, did you
- 19 misspeak?
- 20 A I am sorry, I did, I meant Natura, I am very
- 21 sorry.
- Q When you went to the stores where you bought
- 23 the Natura product, the PetCo and PetSmart, how did you
- 24 decide while you were standing there what Natura
- 25 products to purchase?

```
1 A I had researched the company, but it was
```

- 2 strictly the packaging. I felt that one product should
- 3 be equal to the next through the same company, and so it
- 4 was just size, portion, container size, packaging size,
- 5 and just packaging more than anything, maybe how tall I
- 6 am versus where it was on the shelf.
- 7 Q Did you purchase all of the Natura products
- 8 that PetCo and PetSmart carried or only certain of them?
- 9 A Certain, I selected certain of it.
- 10 Q And you made that selection based on the
- 11 packaging that you were looking at that held the food,
- 12 correct?
- 13 A I would say so, it was just whatever grabbed
- 14 my attention at the time. I knew there were a couple of
- 15 them I that I did want to try. Other than that it was
- just what was accessible.
- 17 O What were the couple that you knew you wanted
- 18 to try when you went into the store?
- 19 A The large breed puppy formula, and I wanted
- 20 the original, and then I just grabbed a can of the
- 21 homemade, the 95 percent, because it said that about the
- homemade.
- 23 Q And did it say that about the homemade on the
- 24 product that you actually purchased?
- 25 A I am pretty sure it did.

- 1 Natura made that caused you to want to buy the original
- 2 Innova formula for your dog?
- 3 A It was the original one.
- 4 Q Anything else?
- 5 A No.
- 6 Q And for the large breed, was there a
- 7 particular representation that Natura made that you were
- 8 aware of that caused you to want to buy that particular
- 9 formula for your dog?
- 10 A Yes, they recognized the company recognized
- 11 that a large dog didn't just need more food, it did need
- 12 more nutrients and not just a lot of carbs and what have
- 13 you.
- 14 Q Anything else that Natura said that you relied
- on in deciding to purchase the large breed puppy
- 16 formula?
- 17 A That's all that stands out in my mind now.
- 18 Q And for the 95 percent, is there any
- 19 representation other than that it could be a supplement
- or replacement to home cooked meals that you relied on
- 21 in deciding to buy that product?
- 22 A Of course I believed in the product name, but
- 23 not the individual -- not just the 95 percent, no, other
- than the homemade.
- 25 O Now, when you went to the store, PetCo and

- 1 PetSmart to buy the Natura products that you tried, did
- 2 you read the ingredient list on any of the products
- 3 before you purchased them?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q On all of them or just some?
- 6 A I know I did on at least some and probably all
- 7 of them.
- 8 Q In terms of knowing what you are feeding to
- 9 your pets you advise your readers to read the ingredient
- 10 list, correct?
- 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q Do you think that that is a key way that
- 13 consumers can be informed about what products they are
- 14 buying?
- 15 A Not necessarily.
- 16 Q How other than reading the ingredient list
- 17 would you think a consumer could be well informed about
- 18 a pet food that he or she is buying?
- 19 A There is a lot of information not given to the
- 20 consumer that they need to learn. I don't know what to
- 21 tell them, where to turn to.
- There is a lot of by-products that are put
- 23 into pet foods that can be listed as something else and
- you will never see them, you don't know.
- 25 Q Let's start with the original Innova formula

```
1 (Whereupon, the above referred to document
```

- was marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 1.)
- 3 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 4 Q If you would take a look at those for me, and
- 5 see if you recognize that those are the answers that you
- 6 prepared for the interrogatories in this case.
- 7 MR. NIELD: That is just the service list, you
- 8 need to go back a few pages here.
- 9 That is just the instructions. It starts
- 10 where it says interrogatories.
- 11 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 12 Q You don't need to read them all to yourself
- 13 right now, just familiarize yourself with the document
- 14 to see if you recognize those as being your responses
- and then we will go through them individually in more
- 16 detail.
- 17 A Yes.
- 18 Q On the last page of these interrogatories that
- 19 I have marked as Exhibit 1, did you see your signature
- 20 there?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q And before you signed this verification
- 23 stating under penalty of perjury that the responses to
- 24 these interrogatories were correct, you reviewed them
- 25 carefully, didn't you?

```
1 A Yes.
```

- 2 Q And in fact all of the responses to these
- 3 interrogatories you believe as you sit here today are
- 4 true and correct; is that right?
- 5 A With the exception to the California
- 6 Supplement not being listed.
- 7 Q Yes, you recalled that today, correct?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q Other than that, nothing that we have talked
- 10 about or that has happened since you signed this
- 11 verification on June 29th, 2008, leads you to think that
- anything in these interrogatory responses is false; is
- 13 that right?
- 14 A That is correct.
- 15 Q If you would go to page 32 of Exhibit 1 for
- 16 me, do you see that in the middle of the page where it
- 17 starts and it says food Odie ate?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q And then there is a list of food that goes on
- through to page 41, do you see that?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q That is a correct representation of all of the
- 23 foods that you have fed to your dog Odie, correct?
- MR. NIELD: Asked and answered. You can
- answer it again.

```
1 Q And in your list if we go over to PetCo that
```

- 2 starts on page 31. Can you identify for me which of
- 3 these PetCo stores which you bought the Natura dog food
- 4 products that you have previously testified to?
- 5 A No.
- 6 Q Didn't you tell me it was with your mother in
- 7 Kansas City, Missouri?
- 8 A It was with my mother in Missouri. Whether it
- 9 was Kansas City or Independence, oh, I'm sorry, I should
- 10 have said better. Then, yes, I can identify it, PetCo,
- 11 I was looking at PetSmart.
- 12 Q So for PetCo your testimony is that you bought
- 13 the Natura products that you fed to your dog Odie at the
- 14 PetCo located at 4802 Noland Road Kansas City, correct?
- 15 A That is correct.
- 16 Q Now, for PetSmart it sounds like you are a
- 17 ahead of me already on your answers can you tell which
- 18 of the list of PetSmart stores you purchased Natura Pet
- 19 Products in?
- 20 A It would be either Independence or Kansas
- 21 City, but which one I am not sure.
- 22 Q So it's either the PetSmart store located at
- 23 4010 South Bolger Drive, Independence or the PetSmart
- 24 store located at 4802 Noland Road, Kansas City, correct?
- 25 A Correct.

```
1 Q PetCo and PetSmart are located at the exact
```

- 2 same location?
- 3 A No, no. Are they? No, that is an error.
- 4 Q That is a mistake?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Do you know which store, if either of these
- 7 PetSmart or PetCo, is located on Noland Road?
- 8 A They both are, but I don't know which store,
- 9 they are not in the same location.
- 10 Q But they are located near to each other on the
- 11 same strip?
- 12 A Uhm-hum, yes.
- 13 Q Does the fact that you bought the products
- 14 close in time to each other and that those two stores
- 15 are located on the same street refresh your memory that
- 16 you bought them both on the Noland Road locations?
- 17 A No.
- 18 Q Okay. If you turn to page 41 in your
- interrogatory responses, please.
- 20 You have a list starting Food Bruno and Meeko
- 21 Ate about two thirds down the page; do you see that?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q Now, when were you testifying earlier I
- 24 thought you had told me that those two dogs ate only
- 25 Diamond food while you owned them?

1	about what is in paragraph 5, I am not going to
2	stop her from answering proper questions, but that
3	last question was improper.
4	MS. CAVERLY: Can you find the question?
5	(Whereupon, the above referred to question
6	was read back by the Court Reporter.)
7	MR. NIELD: That wasn't the question, you can
8	answer that question. Again, it's the attorneys,
9	the author of the complaint, but go ahead, if you
10	can answer it.
11	THE WITNESS: No, that is not correct.
12	BY MS. CAVERLY:
13	Q Why between the filing of the Fourth Amended
14	Complaint in April of 2008 and your submitting responses
15	to interrogatories in June of 2008, did you suddenly
16	identify Natura Pet Products as a manufacturer from whom
17	you had purchased products?
18	MR. NIELD: That lacks foundation, calls for
19	speculation, it may seek attorney-client
20	information. If you actually did that, go ahead
21	and answer the question.
22	THE WITNESS: I didn't suddenly include them,
23	they have been included all along.
24	(BY Ms. Caverly)

- 1 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 2 Q They are not included in Exhibit 2 at
- 3 paragraph 5 which sets forth the Defendants who you
- 4 purchased product from, are they?
- 5 A I --
- 6 MR. NIELD: Well, it lacks foundation, calls
- for speculation, it's vague and ambiguous, overly
- 8 broad and argumentative, but you can answer the
- 9 question.
- 10 THE WITNESS: I don't see a detailed list in
- 11 item 5. I do not feel that with the mention of
- 12 PetSmart and PetCo that Natura was not included.
- 13 (BY Mr. Nield)
- MR. NIELD: You have answered the question.
- 15 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 16 Q Is it your position that because the retailers
- 17 PetSmart and PetCo where you assert that you purchased
- 18 Natura products are included in paragraph 5 that it was
- 19 your intention to name Natura Pet Products as one of the
- 20 products that you personally were suing over?
- 21 MR. NIELD: That is another -- it's another
- improper question, it lacks foundation, calls for
- 23 speculation, assumes facts not in evidence. It's
- getting into attorney-client privilege.
- 25 MS. CAVERLY: You don't need to instruct --

- 1 (BY Mr. Nield)
- 2 MR. NIELD: I'm sorry, counsel, was that an
- 3 Exhibit?
- 4 MS. CAVERLY: Yes.
- 5 MR. NIELD: Oh, here it is. Are you done with
- 6 this?
- 7 THE WITNESS: Are we anywhere near another
- 8 break time?
- 9 MS. CAVERLY: If you need a break, we can take
- 10 a break.
- 11 THE WITNESS: I would like one.
- MS. CAVERLY: Certainly.
- 13 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the video record
- 14 4:53 p.m.
- 15 (Whereupon, a short recess was had.)
- THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are now back on the
- video record 5:11 p.m., Tape Number 5.
- 18 (BY Ms. Caverly)
- 19 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 20 Q Ms. Peters, when you purchased the Innova and
- 21 Evo products that you bought from PetSmart and Petco at
- the end of 2006, beginning of 2007, did you pay for
- those products or did your mother?
- 24 A I did.
- Q How did you pay?

- 1 A Cash. It is possible that it could have been
- on my mother's receipt. Each company has a pet perk
- 3 type little membership card, the more you purchase with
- 4 them, the more benefit that they -- the purchaser
- 5 receives, so it's possible I used her card.
- 6 Q You don't have one of those cards yourself,
- 7 correct?
- 8 A I do, but we don't have store locations near
- 9 us, and my mom would benefit more from it than I would.
- 10 Q What is your mother's name?
- 11 A Carmen, C-A-R-M-E-N, Crail, C-R-A-I-L.
- 12 Q Is there some reason that you paid cash for
- 13 these purchases, because they would add up to a
- 14 considerable amount?
- 15 A I always do.
- 16 O Does your mother, she has a card that you used
- 17 at both PetSmart and Petco?
- 18 A She has a card at both PetSmart and Petco. I
- 19 most likely used her card. I don't really remember for
- 20 sure.
- 21 Q For your own card, do you have a card at both
- 22 Petco and PetSmart?
- 23 A No.
- Q Do you have a card at either, a frequent buyer
- 25 card at either of those stores?

```
1 A Yes.
```

- Q What is the name on your account?
- 3 MR. NIELD: Do you have a card for both
- 4 stores?
- 5 THE WITNESS: Yes. I don't --
- 6 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 7 Q Let's start with PetSmart, do you have a
- 8 frequent buyer card in your own name for PetSmart?
- 9 A I am going to assume it's in my name, it's not
- 10 embossed to tell me.
- 11 Q Okay. If I can look at it I will just take
- 12 down the little bar code, because that is probably what
- they would look at to tell them whose card this is.
- Ms. Peters has given me her PetSmart Pet Perks
- card, and the number under the bar code is 44008045320.
- 16 Thank you.
- 17 And Ms. Peters has also given me her Petco
- 18 Palls Card. The number on the back of that card under
- 19 the bar code is 318254210.
- Is it your practice at Petco to always use
- 21 either yours or your mother's frequent buyer card?
- 22 A I rarely use mine. I don't shop enough to get
- 23 the perks, but for my mom I will, I will use hers.
- Q So when you are with your mother at Petco you
- would use her frequent buyer card, correct?

```
1 A Yes.
```

- 2 Q And when your mother -- Strike that. When you
- 3 are with your mother at PetSmart it's your practice to
- 4 use her frequent buyer card at that store, correct?
- 5 A Correct.
- 6 (Whereupon, the below referred to document
- 7 was marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 13.)
- 8 (BY Ms. Caverly)
- 9 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 10 Q Show you what I will mark as Exhibit 13, Bates
- 11 numbered Plaintiff Peters 471 through 474.
- 12 Do you recognize this as a review that you
- 13 posted on the Internet related to California Natural
- 14 Chicken & Brown Rice?
- 15 A Yes.
- 16 Q At the beginning of this review you write on
- 17 page 1:
- 18 "I have trouble getting behind a pet food
- 19 which the company has a class action filed against them
- 20 for false advertising."
- Do you see that sentence?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q Nowhere in this review do you tell your
- 24 readers that you are a Plaintiff in that class action,
- 25 do you?

- 1 taken them to the vet?
- 2 A No.
- Q Did the price that you paid for the Natura Pet
- 4 Products that you purchased have any bearing on your
- 5 purchase?
- 6 A No.
- 7 Q Can you recall whether you spent say \$20, \$50,
- 8 \$100, \$200 or any estimate of what you spent on the
- 9 Natura products that you bought at the end of 2006,
- 10 beginning of 2007 at PetSmart or Petco?
- 11 A I don't know.
- 12 Q Do you even have any sense in your mind that
- 13 they were expensive or inexpensive relative to the other
- 14 foods that you had to choose from?
- MR. NIELD: It's vague and ambiguous.
- 16 THE WITNESS: I don't recall how it was
- 17 priced.
- 18 BY MS. CAVERLY:
- 19 Q Price was not a concern to you, correct?
- 20 A That is correct.
- 21 Q Do you feel that you got any benefits at all
- 22 from the Natura Pet Products that you fed to Odie?
- 23 A No.
- Q Odie did stay Aleve for three or four months
- 25 eating those foods, correct?

1	
2	
3	
4	READING AND SIGNING
5	
6	
7	
8	(DATE) (NAME)
9	(DATE) (NAME)
10	
11	
12	Sworn to and subscribed before me this day of, 2008.
13	me this day or, 2000.
14	Notary Public My Commission expires:
15	My Committee of Captices
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1			ERRATA	SHEET		
2	PAGE NO.	LINE NO.				
3						
4						
5						
5						
6						
_						
7						
8						
0						
9						-
,	-	·	-			
10						
11						
12						
13						
14						
15						
1.0						
16						
17						
Ι,						
18						
19						
20						
21						
21			-			
22						
4 4						
23						-
. =						
24						
25	SIGNATURE_				DATE	

1	September 6, 2008
2	
3	TO: SUSAN PETERS, DEPONENT C/O PATRICK N. KEEGAN, ESQUIRE
4	4370 La Jolla Village Drive, Suite 640 San Diego, California 92122
5	
6	RE: Blaszkowski vs. Mars, Inc., et al. CASE NO. 1:07-21221 CIV-ALTONGA/BROWN
7	Please take note that on Monday, the 25th day of August 2008, you gave a deposition in the above
8	referred to matter. At that time, you did not waive signature. It is now necessary that you sign
9	your deposition.
10	As previously agreed to, the transcript will be furnished to you through your counsel. Please read the following instructions:
11	
12	At Page 271 you will find an errata sheet. As you read your deposition, any changes or corrections that you wish to make should be noted on the errata
13	sheet, citing page and line number of said change. DO NOT write on the transcript itself. Once you
14	have read the transcript and noted any changes, be sure to sign and date the errata sheet and
15 16	return these pages in the self-addressed envelope that has been provided for your convenience. You need not return the entire transcript.
17	If you do not read and sign the deposition within thirty (30) days, the original, which has already
18	been forwarded to the ordering attorney, may be filed with the Clerk of the Court. If you wish to
19	waive your signature, sign your name in the blank at the bottom of this letter and return it to us.
20	Very truly yours,
21	Evan A. Ferguson
22	(Esquire Deposition Services)
23	I do hereby waive my signature.
24	GUGAN, PETERS
25	SUSAN PETERS CC: Wie transcript: KPISTEN E CAVERLY ESCUIPE