

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

MIAMI DIVISION

CASE NO. 07-21221 CIV ALTONAGA/Turnoff

RENEE BLASZKOWSKI, *et al.*,  
individually and on behalf of  
others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs/Class Representatives,  
vs.

MARS INC., *et al.*,  
Defendants.

---

**NOTICE OF FILING OBJECTIONS TO DEFENDANTS' DECLARATIONS  
IN SUPPORT OF NATURA PET PRODUCTS, INC.'S  
OPPOSITION TO CLASS CERTIFICATION**

Plaintiffs hereby file their Objections to Defendants' Declarations in Support of Natura  
Pet Products, Inc.'s Opposition to Class Certification.

Dated: January 16, 2009  
Miami, FL

/s Catherine J. MacIvor  
CATHERINE J. MACIVOR (FBN 932711)  
[cmacivor@mlegal.com](mailto:cmacivor@mlegal.com)

PATRICK N. KEEGAN  
[pkeegan@keeganbaker.com](mailto:pkeegan@keeganbaker.com)  
JASON E BAKER  
[jbaker@keeganbaker.com](mailto:jbaker@keeganbaker.com)  
KEEGAN & BAKER, LLP  
4370 La Jolla Village Drive  
Suite 640  
San Diego, CA 92122  
Tel: 858-552-6750 / Fax 858-552-6749

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

WE HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court via CM/ECF on January 16, 2009. We also certify that the foregoing was served on all counsel or parties of record on the attached Service List either via transmission of Notices of Electronic Filing generated by CM/ECF or in some other authorized manner for those counsel or parties who are not authorized to receive electronic Notices of Filing.

/s Catherine J. MacIvor

Catherine MacIvor

**SERVICE LIST**

**CASE NO. 07-21221 ALTONAGA/Brown**

**CATHERINE J. MACIVOR**

[cmacivor@mflegal.com](mailto:cmacivor@mflegal.com)

**JEFFREY B. MALTZMAN**

[jmaltzman@mflegal.com](mailto:jmaltzman@mflegal.com)

**JEFFREY E. FOREMAN**

[jforeman@mflegal.com](mailto:jforeman@mflegal.com)

**DARREN W. FRIEDMAN**

[dfriedman@mflegal.com](mailto:dfriedman@mflegal.com)

**MALTZMAN FOREMAN, PA**

One Biscayne Tower  
2 South Biscayne Boulevard -Suite 2300  
Miami, Florida 33131  
Tel: 305-358-6555 / Fax: 305-374-9077

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

**EDGAR R. NIELD**

[enield@nieldlaw.com](mailto:enield@nieldlaw.com)

4370 La Jolla Village Drive  
Suite 640  
San Diego, CA 92122  
Telephone: 858-552-6745  
Facsimile: 858-552-6749

*Attorney for Plaintiffs*

**LONNIE L. SIMPSON**

E-Mail: [Lonnie.Simpson@dlapiper.com](mailto:Lonnie.Simpson@dlapiper.com)

**S. DOUGLAS KNOX**

E-Mail: [Douglas.knox@dlapiper.com](mailto:Douglas.knox@dlapiper.com)

**DLA PIPER US LLP**

100 N. Tampa Street, Suite 2200  
Tampa, Florida 33602-5809  
Telephone: (813) 229-2111  
Facsimile: (813) 229-1447

*Attorneys for Defendants Menu Foods, Inc.  
and Menu Foods Income Fund*

**PATRICK N. KEEGAN**

[pkeegan@keeganbaker.com](mailto:pkeegan@keeganbaker.com)

**JASON E BAKER**

[jbaker@keeganbaker.com](mailto:jbaker@keeganbaker.com)

**KEEGAN & BAKER, LLP**

4370 La Jolla Village Drive  
Suite 640  
San Diego, CA 92122  
Telephone: 858-552-6750  
Facsimile: 858-552-6749

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

**ALEXANDER SHAKNES**

E-Mail: [Alex.Shaknes@dlapiper.com](mailto:Alex.Shaknes@dlapiper.com)

**AMY W. SCHULMAN**

E-Mail: [Amy.schulman@dlapiper.com](mailto:Amy.schulman@dlapiper.com)

**DLA PIPER US LLP**

1251 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, New York 10020  
Telephone: (212) 335-4829

*Attorneys for Defendants Menu Foods, Inc.  
and Menu Foods Income Fund*

**WILLIAM C. MARTIN**

E-Mail: [william.martin@dlapiper.com](mailto:william.martin@dlapiper.com)

**DLA PIPER RUDNICK GRAY CARY US  
LLP**

203 North LaSalle Street  
Suite 1900  
Chicago, Illinois 60601-1293

*Attorneys for Defendants Menu Foods, Inc.  
and Menu Foods Income Fund*

**MARK C. GOODMAN**  
[mgoodman@ssd.com](mailto:mgoodman@ssd.com)  
**SQUIRE, SANDERS & DEMPSEY LLP**  
One Maritime Plaza  
Suite 300  
San Francisco, CA 94111-3492  
Telephone: (415) 954-0200  
Facsimile: (415) 393-9887

*Attorneys for Defendants PETCO Animal  
Supplies Stores Inc., PetSmart, Inc., Wal-Mart  
Stores, Inc. and Target Corporation*

**JEFFREY S. YORK**  
E-Mail: [jyork@mcguirewoods.com](mailto:jyork@mcguirewoods.com)  
**MICHAEL GIEL**  
E-Mail: [mgiel@mcguirewoods.com](mailto:mgiel@mcguirewoods.com)  
**McGUIRE WOODS LLP**  
50 N. Laura Street, Suite 3300  
Jacksonville, FL 32202  
Telephone: (904) 798-2680  
Facsimile: (904) 360-6330

*Attorneys for Defendant Natura Pet Products,  
Inc.*

**OMAR ORTEGA**  
Email: [ortegalaw@bellsouth.net](mailto:ortegalaw@bellsouth.net)  
**DORTA & ORTEGA, P.A.**  
Douglas Entrance  
800 S. Douglas Road, Suite 149  
Coral Gables, Florida 33134  
Telephone: (305) 461-5454  
Facsimile: (305) 461-5226

*Attorneys for Defendant Mars, Inc.  
and Mars Petcare U.S. and Nutro Products,  
Inc.*

**JOHN B.T. MURRAY, JR.**  
E-Mail: [jbmurray@ssd.com](mailto:jbmurray@ssd.com)  
**ROBIN L. HANGER**  
E-Mail: [rlhanger@ssd.com](mailto:rlhanger@ssd.com)  
**BARBARA BOLTON LITTEN**  
[blitten@ssd.com](mailto:blitten@ssd.com)  
**SQUIRE, SANDERS & DEMPSEY LLP**  
1900 Phillips Point West  
777 South Flagler Drive  
West Palm Beach, Florida 33401-6198  
Telephone: (561) 650-7200  
Facsimile: (561) 655-1509

*Attorneys for Defendants PETCO Animal  
Supplies Stores Inc., PetSmart, Inc., Wal-Mart  
Stores, Inc. and Target Corporation*

**KRISTEN E. CAVERLY**  
E-Mail: [kcaverly@hcesq.com](mailto:kcaverly@hcesq.com)  
**HENDERSON & CAVERLY LLP**  
16236 San Dieguito Road, Suite 4-13  
P.O. Box 9144 (all US Mail)  
Rancho Santa Fe, CA 92067-9144  
Telephone: 858-756-6342 x)101  
Facsimile: 858-756-4732

*Attorneys for Natura Pet Products, Inc.*

**ALAN G. GREER**  
[agreer@richmangreer.com](mailto:agreer@richmangreer.com)  
**RICHMAN GREER WEIL BRUMBAUGH  
MIRABITO & CHRISTENSEN**  
201 South Biscayne Boulevard  
Suite 1000  
Miami, Florida 33131  
Telephone: (305) 373-4000  
Facsimile: (305) 373-4099

*Attorneys for Defendants The Iams Co.*

**BENJAMIN REID**

E-Mail: [bried@carltonfields.com](mailto:bried@carltonfields.com)

**ANA CRAIG**

E-Mail: [acraig@carltonfields.com](mailto:acraig@carltonfields.com)

**CARLTON FIELDS, P.A.**

100 S.E. Second Street, Suite 4000

Miami, Florida 33131-0050

Telephone: (305)530-0050

Facsimile: (305) 530-0050

*Attorneys for Defendants Hill's Pet Nutrition,  
Inc.*

**KARA L. McCALL**

[kmccall@sidley.com](mailto:kmccall@sidley.com)

**SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP**

One S. Dearborn Street

Chicago, ILL 60633

Telephone: (312) 853-2666

*Attorneys for Defendants Hill's Pet Nutrition,  
Inc.*

**SHERRIL M. COLOMBO**

E-Mail: [scolombo@cozen.com](mailto:scolombo@cozen.com)

**COZEN O'CONNOR**

200 South Biscayne Boulevard

Suite 4410

Miami, Florida 33131

Telephone: (305) 704-5945

Facsimile: (305) 704-5955

*Attorneys for Defendant Del Monte Foods Co.*

**JOHN J. KUSTER**

[jkuster@sidley.com](mailto:jkuster@sidley.com)

**JAMES D. ARDEN**

[jarden@sidley.com](mailto:jarden@sidley.com)

**SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP**

787 Seventh Avenue

New York, New York 10019-6018

Telephone: (212) 839-5300

*Attorneys for Defendants Hill's Pet Nutrition,  
Inc.*

**RICHARD FAMA**

E-Mail: [rfama@cozen.com](mailto:rfama@cozen.com)

**JOHN J. McDONOUGH**

E-Mail: [jmcdonough@cozen.com](mailto:jmcdonough@cozen.com)

**COZEN O'CONNOR**

45 Broadway

New York, New York 10006

Telephone: (212) 509-9400

Facsimile: (212) 509-9492

*Attorneys for Defendant Del Monte Foods*

**DANE H. BUTSWINKAS**

E-Mail: [dbutswinkas@wc.com](mailto:dbutswinkas@wc.com)

**PHILIP A. SECHLER**

E-Mail: [psechler@wc.com](mailto:psechler@wc.com)

**THOMAS G. HENTOFF**

E-Mail: [thentoff@wc.com](mailto:thentoff@wc.com)

**PATRICK J. HOULIHAN**

E-Mail: [phoulihan@wc.com](mailto:phoulihan@wc.com)

**AMY R. DAVIS**

[adavis@wc.com](mailto:adavis@wc.com)

**JULI ANN LUND**

[jlund@wc.com](mailto:jlund@wc.com)

**WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP**

725 12<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W.

Washington, DC 20005

Telephone: (202)434-5000

*Attorneys for Defendants Nutro Products, Inc.  
Mars, Incorporated and Mars Petcare U.S.*

**JOHN F. MULLEN**

E-Mail: [jmullen@cozen.com](mailto:jmullen@cozen.com)

**COZEN O'CONNOR**

1900 Market Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Telephone: (215) 665-2179

Facsimile: (215) 665-2013

*Attorneys for Defendant Del Monte Foods, Co.*

**CAROL A. LICKO**

E-Mail: [calicko@hhlaw.com](mailto:calicko@hhlaw.com)

**HOGAN & HARTSON**

Mellon Financial Center

1111 Brickell Avenue, Suite 1900

Miami, Florida 33131

Telephone (305) 459-6500

Facsimile (305) 459-6550

*Attorneys for Defendants Nestle Purina  
Petcare Co.*

**ROBERT C. TROYER**

E-Mail: [rctroyer@hhlaw.com](mailto:rctroyer@hhlaw.com)

**HOGAN & HARTSON**

1200 17<sup>th</sup> Street

One Tabor Center, Suite 1500

Denver, Colorado 80202

Telephone: (303) 899-7300

Facsimile: (303) 899-7333

*Attorneys for Defendants Nestle Purina  
Petcare Co.*

**CRAIG A. HOOVER**

E-Mail: [cahoover@hhlaw.com](mailto:cahoover@hhlaw.com)

**MIRANDA L. BERGE**

E-Mail: [mlberge@hhlaw.com](mailto:mlberge@hhlaw.com)

**HOGAN & HARTSON L.L.P.**

555 13<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20004

Telephone: (202) 637-5600

Facsimile: (202) 637-5910

*Attorneys for Defendants Nestle Purina  
Petcare Co.*

**JAMES K. REUSS**

E-Mail: [jreuss@lanealton.com](mailto:jreuss@lanealton.com)

**LANE ALTON & HORST**

Two Miranova Place

Suite 500

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Telephone: (614) 233-4719

*Attorneys for Defendant The Kroger Co. of  
Ohio*

**D. JEFFREY IRELAND**

E-Mail: [djireland@ficlaw.com](mailto:djireland@ficlaw.com)

**BRIAN D. WRIGHT**

E-Mail: [bwright@ficlaw.com](mailto:bwright@ficlaw.com)

**LAURA A. SANOM**

E-Mail: [lsanom@ficlaw.com](mailto:lsanom@ficlaw.com)

**FARUKI IRELAND & COX**

500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W.

10 North Ludlow Street

Dayton, Ohio 45402

*Attorneys for Defendant The Iams Co.*

**W. RANDOLPH TESLIK**

E-Mail: [rteslik@akingump.com](mailto:rteslik@akingump.com)

**ANDREW J. DOBER**

E-Mail: [adober@akingump.com](mailto:adober@akingump.com)

**AKIN GUMP STRAUSS HAUER & FELD  
LLP**

1333 New Hampshire Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Telephone: (202) 887-4000  
Facsimile: (202) 887-4288

*Attorneys for Defendants New Albertson's Inc.  
and Albertson's LLC*

**RALPH G. PATINO**

E-Mail: [rpato@patinolaw.com](mailto:rpato@patinolaw.com)

**DOMINICK V. TAMARAZZO**

E-Mail: [dtamarazzo@patinolaw.com](mailto:dtamarazzo@patinolaw.com)

**CARLOS B. SALUP**

E-Mail: [csalup@patinolaw.com](mailto:csalup@patinolaw.com)

**PATINO & ASSOCIATES, P.A.**

225 Alcazar Avenue  
Coral Gables, Florida 33134  
Telephone: (305) 443-6163  
Facsimile: (305) 443-5635

*Attorneys for Defendants Pet Supplies "Plus"  
and Pet Supplies Plus/USA, Inc.*

**HUGH J. TURNER, JR.**

E-Mail: [hugh.turner@akerman.com](mailto:hugh.turner@akerman.com)

**AKERMAN SENTERFITT & EDISON**

350 E. Las Olas Boulevard  
Suite 1600  
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301-2229  
Telephone: (954)463-2700  
Facsimile: (954)463-2224

*Attorneys for Defendant Publix Super Markets,  
Inc.*

**CRAIG P. KALIL**

E-Mail: [ckalil@aballi.com](mailto:ckalil@aballi.com)

**JOSHUA D. POYER**

E-Mail: [jpoyer@abaili.com](mailto:jpoyer@abaili.com)

**ABALLI MILNE KALIL & ESCAGEDO**

2250 Sun Trust International Center  
One S.E. Third Avenue  
Miami, Florida 33131  
Telephone: (303) 373-6600  
Facsimile: (305) 373-7929

*Attorneys for New Albertson's Inc. and  
Albertson's LLC*

**ROLANDO ANDRES DIAZ**

E-Mail: [rd@kubickdraper.com](mailto:rd@kubickdraper.com)

**PETER S. BAUMBERGER**

E-Mail: [psb@kubickdraper.com](mailto:psb@kubickdraper.com)

**KUBICKI DRAPER**

25 W. Flagler Street, Penthouse  
Miami, Florida 33130-1712  
Telephone: (305) 982-6708  
Facsimile: (305) 374-7846

*Attorneys for Defendant Pet Supermarket, Inc.*

**C. RICHARD FULMER, JR.**

E-Mail: [rfulmer@Fulmer.LeRoy.com](mailto:rfulmer@Fulmer.LeRoy.com)

**FULMER, LEROY, ALBEE, BAUMANN,  
&  
GLASS**

2866 East Oakland Park Boulevard  
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33306  
Telephone: (954) 707-4430  
Facsimile: (954) 707-4431

*Attorneys for Defendant The Kroger Co. of  
Ohio*