

Yeh Exhibit 151

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA
3 CASE NO. 11-20427-WILLIAMS
4

5 DISNEY ENTERPRISES, INC.,)
TWENTIETH CENTURY FOX FILM)
6 CORPORATION, UNIVERSAL CITY)
STUDIOS PRODUCTIONS LLLP,)
7 COLUMBIA PICTURES)
INDUSTRIES, INC., and)
8 WARNER BROS. ENTERTAINMENT)
INC.,)
9)
10 Plaintiffs,)
11)
v.)
12)
HOTFILE CORP., ANTON TITOV)
13 and DOES 1-10,)
14 Defendants.)

15
16
17 Deposition of JAMES BOYLE
18 (Taken by the Plaintiffs)
19 Raleigh, North Carolina
20 December 21, 2011
21
22

23 Reported by: Marisa Munoz-Vourakis -
RMR, CRR and Notary Public
24 TSg Job # 44315
25

1 APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL:

2 For the Plaintiffs:

3 DUANE POZZA, ESQ.

4 Jenner & Block

5 1099 New York Avenue, NW, Suite 900

6 Washington, DC 20001

7

8

9

10 For the Defendants:

11 DEEPAK GUPTA, ESQ.

12 Farella Braun & Martel

13 Russ Building

14 235 Montgomery Street

15 San Francisco, CA 94104

16

17

18

19 Deposition of JAMES BOYLE, taken by the

20 Plaintiffs, at Office Suites Plus, 3737 Glenwood

21 Avenue, Suite 100, Raleigh, North Carolina, on the 21st

22 day of December, 2011 at 11:04 a.m., before Marisa

23 Munoz-Vourakis, Registered Merit Reporter, Certified

24 Realtime Reporter and Notary Public.

25

█ [REDACTED]

█ [REDACTED]

█ [REDACTED]

█ [REDACTED]

5 Q. In the course of your research, do you have
6 any experience designing statistical studies?

7 MR. GUPTA: Objection, vague and
8 ambiguous.

9 A. No, I do not.

10 Q. Are you trained in statistics?

11 A. No, I am not.

12 Q. In the course of your research, do you have
13 any experience analyzing large data sets?

14 MR. GUPTA: Objection, vague and
15 ambiguous.

16 A. No, I would say that I do not have the
17 experience as a statistician analyzing large data sets.
18 As an academic, I have to consider large amounts of
19 data all of the time and try and draw conclusions from
20 it, so it depends exactly what you mean by large data
21 sets.

█ [REDACTED]

█ [REDACTED]

█ [REDACTED]

█ [REDACTED]

C E R T I F I C A T E

1
2 I, Marisa Munoz-Vourakis, RMR, CRR and Notary Public,
3 the officer before whom the foregoing proceeding was
4 conducted, do hereby certify that the witness(es) whose
5 testimony appears in the foregoing proceeding were duly
6 sworn by me; that the testimony of said witness(es) were
7 taken by me to the best of my ability and thereafter
8 transcribed under my supervision; and that the foregoing
9 pages, inclusive, constitute a true and accurate
10 transcription of the testimony of the witness(es).

11 I do further certify that I am neither counsel for,
12 related to, nor employed by any of the parties to this
13 action in which this proceeding was conducted, and
14 further, that I am not a relative or employee of any
15 attorney or counsel employed by the parties thereof, nor
16 financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the
17 action.

18 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto subscribed my name
19 this 27th of December, 2011.

20 _____
MARISA MUNOZ-VOURAKIS

21 Notary #20032900127
22
23
24
25

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA
3 CASE NO. 11-20427-WILLIAMS
4

5 DISNEY ENTERPRISES, INC.,)
6 TWENTIETH CENTURY FOX FILM)
7 CORPORATION, UNIVERSAL CITY)
8 STUDIOS PRODUCTIONS LLLP,)
9 COLUMBIA PICTURES)
10 INDUSTRIES, INC., and)
11 WARNER BROS. ENTERTAINMENT)
12 INC.,)
13 Plaintiffs,)
14 v.)
15 HOTFILE CORP., ANTON TITOV)
16 and DOES 1-10,)
17 Defendants.)

18 Continued Deposition of JAMES BOYLE

19 Volume II

20 (Taken by the Plaintiffs)

21 Raleigh, North Carolina

22 January 19, 2012

23
24 Reported by: Marisa Munoz-Vourakis -
25 TSG Job # 45588 RMR, CRR and Notary Public

1 APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL:

2 For the Plaintiffs:

3 DUANE POZZA, ESQ.

4 Jenner & Block

5 1099 New York Avenue, NW, Suite 900

6 Washington, DC 20001

7

8

9

10 For the Defendants:

11 DEEPAK GUPTA, ESQ.

12 Farella Braun & Martel

13 Russ Building

14 235 Montgomery Street, 17th Floor

15 San Francisco, CA 94104

16

17

18 o0o

19

20 Continued Deposition of JAMES BOYLE,

21 taken by the Plaintiffs, at Office Suites Plus, 3737

22 Glenwood Avenue, Suite 100, Raleigh, North Carolina, on

23 the 19th day of January, 2012 at 9:38 a.m., before

24 Marisa Munoz-Vourakis, Registered Merit Reporter,

25 Certified Realtime Reporter and Notary Public.

[REDACTED]

8 But I would certainly repeat and stress
9 that no, I do not know what number of these 57 million
10 uploads with no registered downloads are actually
11 examples of storage.

[REDACTED]

SIGNATURE PAGE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

you.

(Whereupon the deposition was
concluded at 5:43 p.m.)

(Signature reserved.)



Digitally signed by James Boyle
DN: cn=James Boyle, o, ou,
email=boyle@law.duke.edu, c=US
Date: 2012.01.31 15:55:27 -05'00'

JAMES BOYLE

SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN to before me this _____
day of _____, 2012

NOTARY PUBLIC

My Commission expires: _____

C E R T I F I C A T E

1
2 I, Marisa Munoz-Vourakis, RMR, CRR and Notary Public,
3 the officer before whom the foregoing proceeding was
4 conducted, do hereby certify that the witness(es) whose
5 testimony appears in the foregoing proceeding were duly
6 sworn by me; that the testimony of said witness(es) were
7 taken by me to the best of my ability and thereafter
8 transcribed under my supervision; and that the foregoing
9 pages, inclusive, constitute a true and accurate
10 transcription of the testimony of the witness(es).

11 I do further certify that I am neither counsel for,
12 related to, nor employed by any of the parties to this
13 action in which this proceeding was conducted, and
14 further, that I am not a relative or employee of any
15 attorney or counsel employed by the parties thereof, nor
16 financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of the
17 action.

18 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto subscribed my name
19 this 23rd of January, 2012.
20
21

22 _____
MARISA MUNOZ-VOURAKIS

23 Notary #20032900127
24
25