IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA ATLANTA DIVISION

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY
PRESS, OXFORD UNIVERSITY
PRESS, INC., and SAGE
PUBLICATIONS, INC.,

CIVIL ACTION FILE

Plaintiffs, NO. 1:08-CV-1425-ODE

vs.

MARK P. BECKER, in his official capacity as Georgia State University President, et al.,

Defendants.

VIDEOTAPE DEPOSITION OF

DAPHNE GREENBERG, Ph.D.

April 21, 2011

1:41 p.m.

Conference Room 16-M
1180 Peachtree Street, N.E.
Atlanta, Georgia

S. Julie Friedman, CCR-B-1476



Toll Free: 877.495.0777 Facsimile: 404.495.0766

2700 Centennial Tower 101 Marietta Street Atlanta, GA 30303 www.esquiresolutions.com

```
2
1
                      APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL
2
     On behalf of the Plaintiffs:
           WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES
3
           JONATHAN BLOOM, ESQ.
4
           767 Fifth Avenue
           New York, New York 10153
5
           212.310.8775
           212.310.8007 Fax
6
           jonathanbloom@weil.com
7
     On behalf of the Defendants:
8
           KING & SPALDING LLP
           JOHN W. HARBIN, ESQ.
9
           1180 Peachtree Street, N.E.
           Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3521
10
           404.572.2595
           404.572.5100 Fax
11
           jharbin@kslaw.com
12
     Also Present:
13
           Henry Stewart, Videographer
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```



		<u>-</u>	<u>, </u>	
			3	
1		INDEX OF EXAMINATIONS		
2	WITNESS:			
		nberg, Ph.D.		
3	_		Page	
4	DIRECT EXA	MINATION	6	
	By Mr. Har			
5		26		
_	CROSS-EXAMINATION			
6 7	By Mr. Blo	OIII		
8				
		INDEX TO EXHIBITS		
9				
	Defendant's			
10	Exhibit	Description	Page	
11	1	Syllabus for Educational Psychology	9	
12		8070, Understanding and		
12		Facilitating Adult Learning, Fall Semester 2009, GaState0066231-241		
13		Semester 2009, Gastate0000231-241		
	2	Title Page, Table of Contents,	10	
14		Index for "Handbook of Adult		
		Development and Learning"		
15				
	3	Chapter 3, Research Design and	12	
16		Methodological Issues for Adult		
17		Development and Learning, by Caskie and Willis; Chapter 20, Advanced		
Ι/		Avenues in Adult Development and		
18		Learning: The Role of Doctoral		
		Study, by Stevens-Long and Barner		
19				
	4	7-1-09 Fair Use Checklist, EPY	16	
20		8070, Understanding and		
21		Facilitating Adult Learning Fall 09		
21	5	Curriculum Vitae	26	
22	5	Culliculum vicae	∠ 0	
23				
24				
25				



			4
1		INDEX TO EXHIBITS	
2	Plaintiff's	3	
	Exhibit	Description	Page
3			
	1	Policy On the Use of Copyrighted	39
4		Works in Education and Research	
5			
6			
	(Origi	nal Defendant's Exhibits 1 through 5	and
7	Original Pl	aintiff's Exhibit 1 have been attached	d to
	the origina	al transcript.)	
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			



Videotape Deposition of Daphne Greenberg, Ph.D.

April 21, 2011

(Reporter disclosure made pursuant to Article 10.B. of the Rules and Regulations of the Board of Court Reporting of the Judicial Council of Georgia.)

(Defendant's Exhibits 1 through 4 were marked for identification.)

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is Tape No. 1 to the videotape deposition of Professor Daphne Greenberg, in the matter of Cambridge University Press versus Mark Becker.

This deposition is being held at King & Spalding, 1180 Peachtree Street in Atlanta, Georgia on April 21st, 2011. The time is now 1:41 p.m. We're on the record.

My name is Henry Stewart. I'm the videographer. The court reporter is Julie Friedman.

Counsel, will you please introduce yourselves and affiliations; and the witness will be sworn.

MR. BLOOM: Jonathan Bloom, Weil, Gotshal & Manges, LLP, for the plaintiffs.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

6

MR. HARBIN: And John Harbin with King & Spalding for the defendants.

DAPHNE GREENBERG, Ph.D., having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. HARBIN:

- Q. Professor Greenberg, would you state your full name for the Court, please.
 - A. Daphne Greenberg.
- Q. Great. Thank you. And you're a professor at Georgia State University?
- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And how long approximately have you taught at Georgia State?
 - A. Since 2001.
 - Q. Could you tell the Court what your undergraduate degree is in and where you obtained it?
 - A. It's in psychology from Brandeis University.
- Q. And what postgraduate education do you have?
- A. A master's degree in general psychology from Yeshiva University, Ferkauf School, graduate school, of Psychology.



And then a Ph.D. from the graduate center of the City University of New York in educational psychology.

Q. And we'll mark a copy of your CV as an exhibit so the -- for the Court's reference.

But have you published several articles and -- Well, first, you published several articles in your field?

- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And what department do you teach in at Georgia State?
- A. Educational psychology and special education.

MR. BLOOM: John, I'm sorry. If I can interrupt for a sec. This -- Sorry to throw you off. Let me just, if I could, just get my objection on the record. I think compared to the --

MR. HARBIN: Oh, yeah. That's fine. Yes, yes.

MR. BLOOM: Just for the record, plaintiffs object to the deposition of -- of Professor Greenberg to the extent it's intended to be offered as trial testimony.

The witness resides within the subpoena



range of the United States District Court for the Northern -- Northern District of Georgia and is represented by counsel for the defendants, who presumably could subpoena the witness to appear at trial to provide live testimony.

And on that basis, plaintiffs expressly reserve and do not waive the right to object to any attempt by defendants to introduce Professor Greenberg's testimony at trial on the grounds that she's unavailable within the meaning of the Federal Rules of Evidence, the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, or the applicable rules of the Northern District of Georgia.

Thank you. Sorry to interrupt.

MR. HARBIN: Sure.

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) In that regard, what are your plans during the second half of May this year?
- A. The -- Between May 8th and May 24th, I'll be in Australia.
- Q. Okay. And is that something that's been scheduled for some time?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And I think you describe -- You've named the department you teach in.
 - A. Yes.



- Q. And are you presently the director for Georgia State University's Coalition for the Study of Adult Literacy?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Was that previously the Center for the Study of Adult Literacy?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Did you teach a course in the fall of 2009 entitled "Understanding and Facilitating Adult Learning"?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Let me show you what's been marked as

 Defendant's Exhibit Greenberg 1 and ask if that is -
 I think you have a copy of it -- the syllabus for

 your course that -- in fall of 2009?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Can you summarize what is covered in this course?
- A. Sure. It -- It's basically to introduce students to the whole field of adult learning. We talk about the heterogeneity of adult learners. We talk about development of adults. We talk about theory of adult learning, and we talk about all types of adult learners and research issues in terms of adults.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. Okay. And approximately how many students were in the class, if you recall?
- A. The -- The classes are capped at about 20, so give or take a few.
- Q. Do you recall if there was approximately 15 in the fall of '09?
 - A. It would probably be between 15 and 20.
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. And if you look at the syllabus on the second page, were there books that the students were required to purchase in the course?
- A. Yes. Those two books, the Merriam text and the King text.
- Q. Okay. The plaintiffs are challenging your use of one excerpt of a publication in that class, and I want to ask you in this course in the fall of 2009, did you use an excerpt of a book called "The Handbook of Adult Development and Learning"?
 - A. Yes. I believe so.
- Q. And let me hand you what's been marked as Defendant's Exhibit Greenberg 2 --
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. -- and ask if you recognize that as the title page of that book --



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. Uh-huh.
- Q. -- and some of the contents, including particularly the table of content -- contents and the index of what's in the book.
 - A. Yes. I'm familiar with this.
- Q. So is this -- Is it correct this book is approximately over -- over 563 pages long if you include the author and subject indexes?
 - A. That's what it says. Yes.
- Q. And it's about 536 pages of material overall if you exclude the author and subject index; is that right?
 - A. That looks like that's correct. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And can you briefly describe what this handbook is.
- A. Sure. It's -- At the time that it was written, it would be the -- represent the different researchers at that time in terms of different areas of adult learning, both development and learning, in fact, and different chapters regarding different aspects of adult learning and -- and development.
- Q. Okay. And is it a compilation of articles or essays by different authors?
- A. Yes. It's a compilation of different chapters by different authors.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

24

Q.	Okay.	And it	looks	like	there	are	22
chapters;	is that	right?					

- A. I believe so. Yes.
- Q. And did you use two chapters -- all or part of two chapters of this book, if you recall?
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. Okay. And let me hand you what's been marked together as Defendant's Exhibit Greenberg 3 and ask you if this comprises the excerpts that you used.

And I'll show you here that you have -The first page is chapter -- is the title page for
Chapter 3 and the first page of Chapter 3, and then
here there's a first page and continuing thereafter
of Chapter 20?

- A. Uh-huh.
- Q. You see that?

So do you recall that's the excerpt of this book that you used?

- A. I believe --
 - MR. BLOOM: Object.

22 THE WITNESS: -- so.

23 MR. BLOOM: Object to the form of the

question.

MR. HARBIN: Sorry?



13 1 MR. BLOOM: I just objected to the form. 2 You can answer. 3 THE WITNESS: Oh. 4 MR. HARBIN: Okay. 5 THE WITNESS: So I ignore that objection? 6 Oh. 7 MR. BLOOM: Yes. THE WITNESS: Okay. So yeah. 8 9 Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Okay. So if you look at the pages, did you use Pages 52 to 70 of Chapter 3? 10 11 Α. Uh-huh. 12 And Pages 455 to 475 of Chapter 20? Ο. 13 Yes. Α. 14 So you used approximately 39 pages Q. 15 total --16 Α. Uh-huh. 17 -- of that publication? Q. 18 Α. Yes. 19 Ο. So is it correct that you used something 20 less than 8 percent of the book by pages? Uh-huh. 21 Α. 22 Ο. And what was your purpose in using these 23 chapters? 24 Well, the Chapter 3 was a nice Α. 25 introduction to the students for learning about



methodological issues when you Windows research in adult learning.

And the second chapter on the doctoral, I believe -- what was it, Chapter 20 --

- 0. 20.
- A. -- yeah, was an example of adult learners -- of a type of adult learner, which would be doctoral students.
- Q. Okay. Did you view -- Did you view either chapter as the heart or critical part of the book?
 - A. No.
 - Q. And why do you say that?
- A. Because this is a handbook of many different aspects of adult learning. It was just two out of many chapters, and it definitely was not the heart. The heart of it is really learning theory and -- and development.

And the two chapters that I picked was, one, introduction to research; and the other one was just one aspect of adult learning, of learners, a type of adult learner, which was the doctoral students. Those are considered pretty minor aspects of the book in my opinion.

Q. Okay. Did you own a copy of this book?



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And do you know if the library also owned a copy?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. In -- In making your decision to use this excerpt in the class, there -- these two excerpts in the class in fall of 2009, did you utilize the fair use checklist provided by Georgia State University?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. At the time you were preparing the reading list for the class, the fall 2009 class, had you been trained in the university's copyright policy that encompasses the use of the checklist?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. So did you attend a training session, one or more training sessions about that?
- A. You know, I don't remember completely.

 I -- I know that there was, I believe, a training session at the library and a training session in my department. I believe I actually went to both, but they're kind of fuzzy in my memory.

But I know that I must have -- that received training, 'cause I wouldn't have known how to do it. I wouldn't have even known anything about it.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. Okay. Did you understand there were resources available, if you had questions, you could look at on-line?
 - A. Yes. And I did.
- Q. And did you understand there were personnel available --
 - A. Absolutely.
 - Q. -- to consult if you had questions?
 - A. Absolutely.
- Q. Let me hand you what's been marked as Defendant's Exhibit Greenberg No. 4 and ask you if you could identify what this document is.
- A. It's the fair use checklist that I used for -- for this book for this class.
- Q. Okay. And it says -- It's kind of small print, but it says portions. You say two chapters total of -- I think you said 38 or 39 pages. I can't read it.

Do you see that?

- A. Yeah. It's hard to say. Maybe 38 but it's --
- Q. You say the entire book has 20-something chapters and 537 pages, I think you wrote; is that right?
 - A. Right. I obviously did not include the



17 subject index. 1 2 Ο. Right. 3 Α. Yeah. 4 MR. BLOOM: John. I'm sorry. Did you 5 mark this? 6 MR. HARBIN: Yes. It's -- It's Exhibit 7 4, Greenberg Exhibit 4. (By Mr. Harbin) And when did you fill 8 O. this out? 9 It would have been the summer before the 10 Α. fall --11 12 Ο. Was --13 Α. -- 'cause that's when I prepare my 14 classes. 15 Ο. Okay. Was it on or about July 1, 2009, the date up at the top --16 17 Α. Oh. -- first page? 18 Q. There you go. I did do it. Okay. July 19 Α. 20 1st, yeah, 2009. And the handwriting at the top of the 21 Q. 22 first page, is that your handwriting? 23 Α. Yes, sir. 24 What does that say? Q. 25 It was a note to myself that I should not Α.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

throw this out; and I should just basically keep forever because it was something I was supposed to keep forever; and I was worried that I would throw it out, so I wrote that little note to myself.

- Q. Okay. And that's what it says, keep forever?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. And it was your understanding from the instructions from GSU you were to retain the checklist that you filled out?
 - A. Yes, sir. That's why I wrote that.
- Q. Okay.
- MR. BLOOM: Just object to the form of the last question.
 - Q. (By Mr. Harbin) And I'm not going to go through every factor, but just a couple of them.

If you look at the second page, the third factor, you checked a small portion of the work used -- of work used?

- A. Yes.
- Q. And you checked -- You checked portion used is not central or significant to entire work as a whole?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. And was that for the reason you testified



to earlier?

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

A. Yes.

MR. HARBIN: Excuse me. Let's go off the record one second.

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: 1:54 p.m. Off the record.

(Discussion ensued off the record.)

(Defendant's Exhibit 5 was marked for identification.)

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: 1:55 p.m. Back on the record.

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) And you checked the box under that amount taken as narrowly tailored to educational purpose, et cetera?
 - A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. And what was your thinking about that?
- A. Well, the specific chapters that I picked, they were directly related to -- to a few points that I wanted them to get from the course.
- Q. And then under Factor 4, just a couple questions. You checked use stimulates market for original work.
 - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. What was your thinking in checking that box?



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

- A. That if students found the chapters interesting, they may want to purchase the book to read the other chapters.
- Q. Okay. And the handwriting on -- lower down on the Factor 4 on that second page, what appears to say "mistake" beside supplemental classroom reading and then checked required classroom reading --
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. -- is that your handwriting?
- 11 A. Yes. It is.
- Q. And what does it say on the right-hand side? Does that say --
 - A. "Correct answer."
 - Q. Okay. And so you checked -- In the form you checked it's -- it is required classroom reading --
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. -- under Weighs Against Fair Use?
- 20 A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. Okay. And what was your overall conclusion in 2009 about whether or not the use of this excerpt or these two chapter excerpts in your class would constitute fair use, as --
 - A. I --



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

- Q. -- you understood it?
- A. I believed that it was fine to use under the fair use guidelines because it only had one checkmark in -- in one of the factors --
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. -- and --
 - Q. And --
- A. -- that was against fair use, so I -- I believed it met the fair use.
- Q. And you checked several that were in favor of fair use?
 - A. Yes. Uh-huh. And there were -- there were quite a few in the -- the fair use category.
 - Q. Okay. Is this something you did lightly, or did you take time to do this and analyze this?

 How would you --
- 17 A. Oh.
- 18 Q. -- characterize your evaluation of fair 19 use?
- A. Yeah.
- 21 MR. BLOOM: Objection to form.
- You can answer.
- When I object, unless your counsel instructs you not to answer, you can --
- 25 THE WITNESS: Oh.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

MR. BLOOM: -- go ahead.

THE WITNESS: Okay. Thank you.

I'm sorry. What was the question again?

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Let me just -- How would you characterize your deliberations about this, these excerpts, and whether or not they're fair use?
- A. Oh, I took it extremely seriously. I mean, that -- That's why when there was a mistake, I pointed out the correct answer, and I wrote keep forever, and so forth.
- Q. Okay. In that regard, if you look back at the syllabus that is Greenberg Exhibit 1 --
- A. (Witness complies with request of counsel.)
 - Q. -- do you have -- if you look at -- Do you give instructions about not copying --
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. -- copyrighted materials, not duplicating necessarily or -- or selling such materials on the first page --
 - A. Yeah. Yes. I do.
 - Q. -- under professional behavior?
- A. Exactly.
- Q. And do you give oral -- Did you give oral instructions in your class about that?



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

- A. Yes. I go over the syllabus, and there are a few things that I highlight orally; and that's one of them, because students are generally surprised. They don't know this, so I make sure that they understand it.
- Q. And did you do that in this class in the fall of 2009, to your recollection?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. Do you generally do that?
 - A. I -- Yeah. I do it every class. It's --
- 11 Q. Okay.
 - A. -- one of the things I always do.
 - Q. All right. Have you had occasions where you've undertaken an analysis of a work using this checklist and determined that in your view at least it would not be fair use --
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. -- or -- or was close enough call that caused you concern?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. And what did you do in those cases?
- 22 A. Did not use the readings.
 - Q. Okay. And what would you have done in this case if you determined that these excerpts, Chapters 3 and 20, would not have constituted fair



use?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. I would not have used them.
- Q. Okay. Did the university encourage you to use Ereserve to post excerpts of works?
 - A. No.
 - Q. Did you ever use uLearn in this class in posting excerpts of books for the class?
 - A. No.
 - Q. Following the university's adoption of the copyright policy including the use of the fair use checklist, did your practice about putting excerpts on Ereserve change in any way?
 - A. Absolutely.

MR. BLOOM: I'm sorry.

Q. (By Mr. Harbin) How did it change?

MR. BLOOM: Could I just have that
question and answer read back.

(Whereupon, the record was read by the reporter as requested.)

MR. HARBIN: Let me rephrase the question if you've got stopping, 'cause that's not what I intended to ask.

THE COURT REPORTER: Excuse me. Adoption.

MR. HARBIN: Right. Yeah. That's it.

THE COURT REPORTER: Do you want me to --



MR. HARBIN: I'll just reask it. I'll just reask it.

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Following the university's adoption of the current copyright policy that incorporates the use of the fair use checklist, did your practice about putting excerpts on Ereserve change in any way?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. How did it change?
- A. I was a lot more careful. I realized it wasn't just a matter of pages, but I had to go through this checklist.

And over time I started to use fewer and fewer and fewer chapters, to the point that today, like if you looked at my syllabus for this semester, I have zero chapters.

- Q. And why is that?
- A. Because, to be quite honest, this is very onerous; and I take it seriously; and so it's -It's just not worth it to me to -- to have to do this for every single thing that I want to assign to them, so I don't.
 - Q. Okay.
 - MR. BLOOM: I just move to strike the last two answers to the extent that they address



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Professor Greenberg's practice following the fall of 2009.

Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Okay. And let me just -- As I said, I wanted to put this in the record.

Let me hand you what's been marked as Green -- Defendant's Greenberg Exhibit 5 and ask you if that is a copy of your CV that -- your curriculum vitae with names of students that appeared on Pages 2 through 4 redacted.

A. Yes.

MR. BLOOM: Can I get a copy of that, John.

MR. HARBIN: Oh, yes, yes. I'm sorry.

MR. BLOOM: Thanks.

MR. HARBIN: That's all I have right now.

Thank you, ma'am.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. BLOOM:

Q. Okay. Good afternoon, Professor

Greenberg. I'm Jonathan Bloom with Weil, Gotshal &

Manges on behalf of the plaintiffs. I'll be asking

you some additional questions.

Can you give me your best guess as to how many individual readings you've completed a checklist for in your career at GSU?



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. I really don't know. No.

All I can say is that since the fair use checklist became something that we were supposed to do, I did it for every reading from a book that I was thinking of assigning.

- Q. Okay. So would -- you -- You can't give me a ballpark guess?
 - A. (Witness shakes head negatively.)
- Q. Okay. And you testified a moment ago, I think, that there were a few instances in which you determined that a reading that you were contemplating posting on the reserves was not fair use; is that correct?
 - A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. Okay. Do you recall when that occurred --
 - A. No.
- 17 Q. -- specifically?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 | Q. You don't. Okay. Do you recall the year?
 - A. No.
 - Q. Okay. Can you tell me a little bit more specifically with respect to those instances why you concluded that the use would not be fair use?
 - A. I do not know. All I know is that I would do this checklist, and it would become apparent that



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

there were too -- either not enough factors in favor of fair use and/or too many against fair use.

- Q. Okay. Do you have a recollection as to any of the specific readings that you decided would not be fair use?
 - A. No.
- Q. Okay. Do you recall how long they were in -- in, you know, in length?
 - A. (Witness shakes head negatively.)
 - Q. Okay.
 - MR. HARBIN: If you could, answer audibly.
- 12 THE WITNESS: Oh, sorry.
- 13 MR. HARBIN: Even though it's being
- 14 videotaped --
- THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 16 MR. HARBIN: -- it will be more clear.
- 17 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 18 Q. (By Mr. Bloom) Okay.
- 19 A. So the answer to that was no.
- Q. (By Mr. Bloom) Okay. Do you recall with respect to those works any of the factors on the weighs against fair use side of the ledger on
- 23 Greenberg Exhibit 4 that you checked?
- 24 A. Can you repeat that one more time, please.
- 25 Q. Yeah. With respect to these works that



you concluded would not be fair use --

- A. Uh-huh.
- Q. -- I'm wondering which of the boxes on the weighs against fair use side of the checklist you checked when you were completing the checklist for those works.
- A. It's not really an easily answerable question, because I don't remember what works they were, so I don't see how I could really know what I would have checked or what I checked. I can't.

 Yeah.
- Q. Okay. If you don't remember, that's fine.

 Were there ever any -- Was there ever an occasion where you presented a proposed reading to the library staff to be posted on a reserve where they informed you that the reading would not be fair use?
 - A. For 2009?
 - Q. Yes. Let's stick to 2009.
 - A. Okay. And so what's the question again?
- Q. The question is whether during 2009 there was ever a situation where you presented a reading to the library for posting on Ereserves where they told you it would not be fair use?
 - A. I believe that the answer would be no; but



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

that would be because I did this so carefully and seriously, that it wouldn't have been an issue.

- Q. And hypothetically --
- A. Okay.
- Q. -- if the university provost were to tell you that a reading that you wanted to post on Ereserves would violate fair use --
 - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. -- would you -- and -- and asked you to take remedial action, i.e., not post it on Ereserves, would you follow that instruction --
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. -- from the provost?
- A. Yes. I would not post anything that violated fair use.
 - Q. Okay. And if the head of the library had told you the same thing, that posting an excerpt would not be fair use, would you follow that instruction?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. The same question with respect to the university president?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Same question with respect to the Board of Regents?



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Turning back to the -- Oh, strike that.

Just if you would, refer to Exhibit 1, which is the -- the syllabus. We were looking a moment ago at the paragraph on the first page on professional behavior.

- A. Uh-huh.
- Q. Right. You see about halfway down the -- or actually, I guess the second to last sentence -- I'm sorry -- third to last sentence in the paragraph says, "Duplicating copyrighted materials is illegal, and copying and selling such material is a felony."

Do you see that?

- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Okay. Do you have an understanding as to whether copying is involved in the process of -- is involved with the Ereserve -- Ereserves system?
 - A. What do you mean?
 - O. Strike that.

Do you have an understanding as to whether when you instruct a -- when you select a reading for posting on Ereserves and the library staff posts it on Ereserves at your direction, do you have an understanding as to whether copying is involved in



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that process, posting the work on Ereserves?

- A. I'm not involved with the process of how it gets on Ereserves, but it would have followed the fair use act (indicating).
- Q. Okay. But do you have an understanding one way or the other as to whether there are acts of copying involved in the posting of the reading on Ereserves?
- A. I've never asked nor -- I don't -- Huh.

 I mean -- I mean I -- I guess copying would be involved but -- But I don't know that for a fact.
- Q. Okay. Do you have any understanding as to whether copying is involved when a student accesses a reading on Ereserves?
 - A. I do not know.
- Q. Okay. In your experience when -- And let's talk specifically with respect to this course.
 - A. Okay.
- Q. In your experience do students in this class sometimes print out the readings from Ereserves and bring them to class?
- A. They do sometimes print out readings. Which readings they print out, I do not remember.
- Q. Do you make a recommendation to them that they should print out readings and bring them to



class?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. Yes.
 - Q. Okay. And what do you tell them?
- A. That sometimes students find it helpful to bring copies of the readings to the class.
- Q. Okay. So do you tell them that it's something that they may want to do?
 - A. Like I say, sometimes it's helpful.
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. Okay. Would you say most students in -- in this class follow that advice?
- A. No. Not necessarily, because there are a lot of readings and a lot of articles; and this generation of students are very comfortable reading off the screen.
 - Q. Okay.
- A. And they don't necessarily need to bring hard copies of anything.
- Q. Okay. And when a student prints a copy of a reading off of Ereserve, do you have an understanding one way or the other as to whether an act of copying is involved in that process?
- A. It -- It feels like you're trying to trick me into something 'cause --



- 1 Q. No.
- 2 A. I mean, you know. I mean --
- Q. I assure you I'm not.
- A. -- if -- if they're bringing a -- a

5 copy -- I mean, this is a copy (indicating), right?

6 So I -- I'm not sure exactly how to

answer your question; but if they're bringing a copy,

then yes. I guess it's a copy.

- Q. Well, let -- Let me rephrase the
- 10 question. If -- If a student downloads --
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. -- a reading from Ereserve and prints it
- 13 out --

7

8

9

- 14 A. Okay.
- 15 Q. -- and brings it to class, is it your
- 16 understanding one way or the other as to whether a --
- 17 | a copy is made?
- 18 A. I would have to say yes, a copy has been
- 19 made.

23

- 20 Q. Okay. Mr. Harbin asked you, I believe,
- 21 whether GSU encouraged you to use Ereserves. Do you
- 22 remember that?
 - A. Uh-huh.
- 24 | Q. Okay. And your answer was no. Am I --
- 25 Is that right?



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. No. He -- He asked about -- specifically about excerpts from chapters.
 - Q. Okay.
- A. We were encouraged, if we had readings which could include articles -- I mean, we were encouraged to use Ereserves --
 - Q. Okay.
- A. -- as a place; but, you know, that -- He specifically asked about book chapters.
- Q. Okay. And just following up on that, what -- what do you recall you were told with -- Strike that.

So at some point, I take it, you were advised that Ereserves was an alternative way for you to make readings available to students; is that correct?

- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And do you recall when that was?
- A. No, sir.
- Q. Okay. Do you recall -- Do you recall anyone in the university administration ever saying to you either one on one or as a part of a meeting of some kind that it was a good idea to use Ereserves?
- A. To be honest, I don't -- I don't remember how I learned about Ereserves in general. I -- I



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

know that at some point I learned that Ereserves was a good place to put materials for classes.

- Q. Okay. And I believe for this course, according to the syllabus, the readings for Ereserves were articles. The -- the readings that were placed on Ereserves were articles; is that correct?
- A. It would be whatever is on the syllabus with -- except for the physical books that were physically available to the students, so it included mainly articles. You're correct.
 - Q. Okay.
- A. But it did include, as you know, these two chapters.
 - Q. Okay. When did you start teaching at GSU?
 - A. About 2001. It's possible that --
- I -- I taught I think one class as a staff member, and that would have been in the late 1990s, but I became a faculty member in 2001.
- Q. Okay. What was your position at the time when you were -- in 2001?
- A. Two -- You mean where did I come from as staff?
 - Q. No. I mean what was your title?
 - A. Oh. Assistant professor.
 - Q. Okay. And your title today is?



37 1 Α. Associate. 2 Associate. Okay. And are you a Ο. tenured --3 4 Α. Yes. 5 -- faculty member? Q. 6 Okay. And do you recall when you began 7 using Ereserves --8 Α. No. 9 Q. -- at GSU? You don't? 10 11 Α. No. 12 Was it sometime after 2001? Ο. Yes. It wasn't immediately at 2001. 13 Α. 14 Okay. And -- And how did you make Q. 15 articles available to your students prior to the time 16 you started using Ereserves? 17 Through a course packet. Α. 18 Q. Do you recall just roughly sort of over 19 how many years you used course packs? 20 Α. I do have a recollection of using it It's possible I used it more. 21 twice. 22 Okay. Twice meaning for two classes? Ο. 23 Α. Yes, sir. 24 Okay. And would you say -- is it a --Q. 25 and -- and --



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So now do you continue to use course packs?

- A. No.
- Q. Okay. And do you have an understanding as to whether with respect to those course packs any fees were paid to the publishers of the materials you used in the course packs?
 - A. I do not know.
- Q. Okay. You don't know one way or the other?
 - A. No.
- Q. Okay. Okay. And with respect to the readings that have been posted on Ereserves at your direction, do you have an understanding as to whether any fees were paid for any of those readings to the publisher?
 - A. I do not know.
- Q. Okay. Okay. And when did you first become aware of the -- of the new GSU copyright policy?
- A. Whenever they told us we were supposed to use it. Sorry. I don't remember.
 - Q. Okay. It was prior to the fall of 2009?
 - A. No. I don't remember.
 - Q. Okay. Do you recall reading the policy?



- A. I would have. Yes.
- Q. Okay.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. I don't have a strong memory of it, but I would have read it in order to -- to understand what I'm supposed --
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. -- to be doing.
- Q. Do you today have a physical copy of the GSU copyright policy?
- A. I don't know for a fact, but my guess is that in the same place that I keep all these things (indicating), I probably have that copyright.
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. A memo whatever it's called.
- Q. Okay. I'm just going to show you a document.
 - (Plaintiff's Exhibit 1 was marked for identification.)
- 19 Q. (By Mr. Bloom) Oops.
 - Let me show you a document that I've marked as Greenberg Plaintiff's Exhibit 1 and ask you if you recall having seen this before.
 - A. It looks familiar.
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. So yes. I believe it --



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. And what -- What is this?
- A. It's -- Well, it says a whole bunch of different things; but it's basically all the things that can help me know how to do this. It's the actual policy, the general policy; and let's see. It's all about fair use and how to use the fair use checklists and so forth.
- Q. Okay. For the record, the first page of this document is titled, "Policy on the Use of Copyrighted Works in Education and Research."
- Okay. So do you -- Do you recall reading the -- reading this document?
- 13 A. It looks very familiar, so yes. I believe 14 I did read it.
 - Q. Okay. If I could direct your attention to Page 15.
 - A. Okay.
 - Q. You'll see toward the bottom there, there's a -- Under the heading "Online Works," there are two bullets, and the first one says, "Copyright Clearance Center."
 - A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. Do you see that?
- Do you know what the Copyright Clearance
- 25 | Center is?



3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

23

24

25

41

- A. No. I don't.
- Q. Okay. Have you ever heard of it before?
 - A. I don't think so.
 - Q. Okay. So given that answer, I take it the -- Strike that.

So you don't recall anyone from GSU ever explaining to you what the Copyright Clearance Center is?

- A. It's possible they did. I don't remember.
- Q. Okay. And you said you've -- You testified earlier I think that you -- you believe you attended a training session --
 - A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. -- at least one --
- A. Right.
- 16 Q. -- correct?

Okay. Do you recall whether there were any materials distributed at --

- A. Yeah.
- Q. -- at a meeting?
- A. I have a vague memory of PowerPoint stuff and some stuff from this packet.
 - Q. Okay. Now turning for a moment to the fair use checklist --
 - A. Okay.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. -- this was Exhibit 4. Looking at the first page under Factor 1, you did not check on the left-hand side transformative use, correct?
 - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. And on the right-hand side, you didn't check nontransformative either, correct?
 - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. Okay. Do you have an understanding as to what transformative means in the context of copyright law?
- A. I believe it means that you are -- are doing something to the actual document that changes it.
- Q. And with respect to these excerpts from adult development and learning, do you have an understanding as to whether they -- whether your use of them in connection with Ereserves is transformative?
 - A. I don't believe they are.
- Q. Okay. Okay. Is there a reason you didn't check nontransformative?
 - A. Don't remember.
 - Q. Okay. And by the way, you did not for any of the factors check either factor weighs in favor of fair use or factor weighs against fair use. Is that





- A. I don't remember if I concluded that for every factor, but I do know that I would have concluded that overall. It qualified as fair use.
- Q. And just in -- in general, did you have an understanding as to whether each -- each of the subfactors, that is, each -- each box was to be given equal weight in the fair use analysis?
- A. You know, it's been such a long time since I've done these checklists. I -- I guess I would -- I would have gone by whatever the instructions say.
- Q. So sitting here today, you don't recall; is that correct?
 - A. Right.
- Q. Okay. And do -- do you -- Let me ask you. Sitting here today --
 - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. -- do you have any understanding as to whether Factors 1, 2, 3, and 4 are each to be given equal weight in the fair use analysis?
- A. That feels a little bit like an unfair question, because I don't put -- I don't assign chapters from books anymore that -- unless I require students to buy them, so it's been a really long time since I've studied the fair use checklist, so I don't know.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

45

I mean, if you want me to study, you know, this stuff now, I can tell you what I think.

- Q. Okay.
- A. But I just don't remember.

MR. BLOOM: Okay. Well, recognizing that my question invited it, I'm going to move to strike the answer to the -- prior answer to the extent it addresses your current practice, which is not something I'm faulting you for.

THE WITNESS: Okay.

- Q. (By Mr. Bloom) But let's -- Let's cast your mind back --
 - A. Okay.
- Q. -- to the fall of 2009. Do you recall if at the time --
 - A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. -- you had an understanding as to whether each of the Factors 1 through 4 was to be weighed equally?
 - A. I really don't remember.
 - Q. Okay. That's fine.
 - Referring you to your curriculum vitae --
 - A. Okay.
- Q. -- it's Exhibit 5. You note that
- 25 beginning on Page 10, there's a list of what is



called refereed journal articles.

- A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Can you explain what a refereed journal article is.
- A. Sure. It's an article that's published in a journal; and in order to be accepted into the journal, blind reviewers review the -- the manuscript. I don't know who's reviewing the manuscript. They don't know who's written the manuscript.

And then based on their reviews, it either gets accepted; or you have to make changes; or it gets rejected for publication.

- Q. Okay. And why is it that you list these articles as a sort of separate category on the -- on your curriculum vitae?
- A. Because that's what we do in academia. I guess it's also for promotion and tenure purposes.

 It -- It served, I guess, many different purposes.

But having a journal article that has been refereed is considered higher status, higher scientific value than an article that is not, so you're expected to differentiate the types of publications you have.

Q. All right. And how -- how does the



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

17

23

24

25

referee -- refereeing process work? Is that something that is organized by the publisher of the journal --

- A. I believe --
- Q. -- if you know?
- A. -- it's the editor; and -- and what the interaction is between editor and publisher, I do not know.
- Q. Okay. And so is a refereed journal article considered a -- an important credential for the academic promotion process?
- A. Yes.
 - Q. Okay. And have you published books?
- A. I have published chapters, two chapters in two different books, but I have not edited or published a whole book.
 - Q. Okay.
- 18 A. They're on Page 13, the top of Page 13.
- Q. Okay. And were -- Were those refereed, those chapters?
- A. The first one, "Tales from the field," was invited.
 - The second one, I do not know. It's a long time ago.
 - Q. Okay.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- A. I was still a student.
- Q. Okay. And have you ever published a -- either a journal article or a book chapter where the publisher played a role in helping you shape the content of the --
 - A. No.
 - Q. -- article?

Okay. With respect to these book chapters, did you -- did you sign a -- a contract with the publisher?

A. Wow. The second one, I was still a student. I do not remember. I was a second coauthor, so my guess is probably not. Probably the first author did it.

The first one, I vaguely remember signing something, but I don't know if that was with the editor or the publisher or what it was.

- Q. Okay. Okay. So do you endeavor to publish regularly in your field of expertise?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. Okay. Why is that?
- A. I guess for two reasons. One is that that's the only way to move the field forward is by getting your work out there, and then from the selfish reason I need it for my job.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. Okay. Why do you need it for your job?
- A. Because that's -- I -- I guess I don't strictly need it at this point; but that's how you're valued on your job, by what you produce.
- Q. Okay. How important are publications in -- in the tenure evaluation process at GSU?
- A. Refereed article publications are important.
- Q. Okay. And what about -- What about books?
- A. I -- I do not know for a fact, but my understanding is that books are given lower currency than articles.
- Q. And -- And do you have an understanding as to why that is the case?
- A. Because they don't go through as -- the more -- as more of a -- as much of a vigorous refereeing process as articles do --
 - Q. Okay.
- A. -- or as refereed articles do. There isn't that blind review.
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. But I could be wrong. I've never been involved. That's what I mean.
 - Q. Yeah. I was just going to ask you.



Have you -- have you ever served as a referee for --

- A. Oh, yeah.
- Q. -- someone else's scholarly work?
- A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. Okay.
 - A. Oh, for articles.
 - Q. For articles. But never for a book.
 - A. No.
 - Q. Okay. And who asked you to participate as a referee with respect to the -- let's just --
 - A. It really varies. You know, for instance, a -- a journal will -- will not specialize, let's say, in adult literacy, which is my area of expertise; and all of a sudden, someone submits an article -- a manuscript for possible publication in their journal on adult literacy.

So they know of my name; and they'll contact me, asking me if I can review this one manuscript.

In other situations I'm actually on their editorial board, so I routinely get manuscripts from them.

- Q. Okay. Going back for a moment to course packs --
 - A. Uh-huh.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. -- just a couple of questions. Comparing a course pack to a reading on Ereserve from the student's perspective, can you identify any -- any differences between the two types of reading materials?
- A. I don't know. Well, that's probably because I was never a student that had access to -
 When I was a student, things were not electronic yet, so yeah.
- Q. But I mean other -- other than the fact that one is paper and one is --
 - A. Yeah.
- Q. -- digital, are -- can you identify any distinction?
 - A. No.
 - Q. Were you asked to collect any documents in collect -- in connection with this litigation?
 - A. No.
 - Q. Okay. Did you provide any documents to counsel in connection with this litigation?
 - A. Just my vitae (indicating).
 - Q. Okay. How about the fair use checklist?
- A. Oh, yes. This was awhile ago, though. I don't -- I don't remember when but -- so I'm guessing it was with this case.



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

But yeah. At some point I got an e-mail from -- from I think one of the GSU lawyers asking me for my fair use checklists of some --

- Q. Okay.
- A. -- year or something.
- Q. Okay. And what, if anything, did you do to prepare for this deposition?
- A. Look up when I first started at GSU, because I never remember.
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. But that's it.
- Oh. And I met -- I met with him (indicating). Last week.
- Q. Okay. And did you look at any documents with John?
 - A. Oh, with John, yes. He showed me my syllabus, and he showed me the fair use checklist, and he showed me the two readings.
 - Q. Okay. I don't want you to tell me anything that the two of you discussed. I'm not asking for that.
 - A. Oh, okay.
 - Q. Did you speak to anyone other than -- other than John about this deposition?
 - A. I -- I did speak to -- I -- I think



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

they're called GSU lawyers in terms of practicalities like scheduling and stuff like that.

- Q. Okay. And I don't want to know anything else --
 - A. Okay.
- Q. $\operatorname{\mathsf{--}}$ any substance of what you talked about with them either.

Have you read anything about this case in the press or the blogosphere?

- A. No.
- Q. Okay. Did you ever ask for help from anyone in completing a fair use checklist?
- A. I don't have specific examples, but I would have -- I do remember talking to librarian staff, whether it was for this particular class or not.

But there -- there would sometimes be occasions where that -- where I would get to some item, and I wouldn't know how to fill it out, and I would call and ask for help.

- Q. Okay. And do you have any specific recollection of -- of any of those conversations?
 - A. No. I just know that I had them.
- Q. Okay. Do you recall who specifically you spoke to?



- A. Whoever was assigned to help me, 'cause I don't remember who --
 - Q. It was --
 - A. -- it was.
 - Q. -- someone in the library --
- A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

7

8

19

20

21

22

- Q. -- correct?
- A. I believe so.
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. Or it might have been somebody in the legal department. I -- I don't remember.
- 12 Q. You don't recall?
- 13 A. It would be one of those two.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 A. Or maybe both.
- Q. Okay. And is it your testimony that you had a question about a specific item on the checklist?
 - A. No. My testimony is that I remember having questions, but I don't remember what they were, and I remember seeking help about --
 - Q. Okay.
- A. -- about them.
- Q. And do you remember getting the help that you were seeking?



55 1 Α. Yes. 2 MR. BLOOM: Okay. Go off the record for a 3 minute. 4 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: 2:37 p.m. Off the 5 record. 6 (Discussion ensued off the record.) 7 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: 2:39 p.m. Back on the 8 record. 9 (By Mr. Bloom) Okay. Professor Ο. 10 Greenberg, if I could direct your attention back to fair use checklist --11 12 Uh-huh. Α. -- on the second page, Factor -- Factor 4, 13 Ο. 14 on the right-hand side, the second box is "Licensing 15 or permission reasonably available." 16 Do you see that? 17 Α. Uh-huh. 18 Q. And you didn't check that, correct? 19 Α. Uh-huh. 20 Can you tell me why not? 0. I don't remember. 21 Α. 22 Okay. Do -- do you have -- Strike that. Ο. 23 Do you recall whether you investigated 24 whether licensing or permission was reasonably

available for use of portions of -- of this text?



25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- A. I don't remember. I'm sorry.
- Q. Okay. And you concluded that use of these excerpts would not have a significant effect on the market or potential market for the copyrighted work, correct?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Okay. And can you just explain to me what your thinking was on that factor.
- A. I thought that two chapters or 30-some-odd pages from such a big book would not impact the selling of the book in -- in any kind of major way.
- Q. Okay. And in evaluating that subfactor, did you take into consideration the market for the -- the licensing of excerpts from the book?
 - A. I do not know.
 - Q. Okay. You don't recall doing so?
- A. No. I don't -- I don't remember one way or the other.
- MR. BLOOM: Okay. I have no further questions.
 - MR. HARBIN: All right. Thank you, ma'am.
 - I don't have anything else.
 - THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This --
- MR. HARBIN: You're done.
- THE WITNESS: Cool.



57 1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This concludes the 2 videotape deposition of Professor Daphne 3 Greenberg, April 21, 2011, 2:42 p.m. We're off 4 the record. 5 (Whereupon, the deposition was concluded 6 at 2:43 p.m.) 7 (Pursuant to Rule 30(e) of the Federal 8 Rules of Civil Procedure and/or O.C.G.A. 9 9-11-30(e), neither a party nor the deponent having requested right of review of the 10 deposition, the reading and signing of the 11 12 deposition is waived.) 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25



CERTIFICATE

STATE OF GEORGIA:

COUNTY OF FULTON:

I hereby certify that the foregoing transcript was taken down, as stated in the caption, and the questions and answers thereto were reduced to typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages 1 through 57 represent a true, complete, and correct transcript of the evidence given upon said hearing, and I further certify that I am not of kin or counsel to the parties in the case; am not in the regular employ of counsel for any of said parties; nor am I in anywise interested in the result of said case.

This, the 25th day of April, 2011.

S. JULIE FRIEDMAN, CCR-B-1476



COURT REPORTER DISCLOSURE

Pursuant to Article 10.B of the Rules and Regulations of the Board of Court Reporting of the Judicial Council of Georgia which states: "Each court reporter shall tender a disclosure form at the time of the taking of the deposition stating the arrangements made for the reporting services of the certified court reporter, by the certified court reporter, the court reporter's employer or the referral source for the deposition, with any party to the litigation, counsel to the parties, or other entity. Such form shall be attached to the deposition transcript," I make the following disclosure:

I am a Georgia Certified Court Reporter. I am here as a representative of Esquire Deposition Solutions. Esquire Deposition Solutions was contacted to provide court reporting services for the deposition. Esquire Deposition Solutions will not be taking this deposition under any contract that is prohibited by O.C.G.A. 9-11-28(c).

contract/agreement to provide reporting services with any party to the case, any counsel in the case, or any reporter or reporting agency from whom a referral might have been made to cover this deposition.

Esquire Deposition Solutions will charge its usual

Esquire Deposition Solutions has no

and customary rates to all parties in the case, and a financial discount will not be given to any party to this litigation.

S. Julie Friedman, CCR-1476

24

