Vincent Lloyd, PH.D.

April 20, 2011

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA ATLANTA DIVISION

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS, OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS, INC., and SAGE PUBLICATIONS, INC.,

CIVIL ACTION FILE

Plaintiffs, NO. 1:08-CV-1425-ODE

VS.

MARK P. BECKER, in his official capacity as Georgia State University President, et al.,

Defendants.

VIDEOTAPE DEPOSITION OF VINCENT WILLIAM LLOYD, Ph.D.

April 20, 2011

9:10 a.m.

Conference Room 16-K 1180 Peachtree Street, N.E. Atlanta, Georgia

S. Julie Friedman, CCR-B-1476

		2		
1	APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL			
2	On behalf of the Plaintiffs:			
3	BONDURANT, MIXSON & ELMORE, LLP EDWARD B. KRUGMAN, ESQ.			
4	Suite 3900, One Atlantic Center 1201 West Peachtree Street, N.W.			
5	Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3417 404.881-4106			
6	404.881.4111 Fax krugman@bmelaw.com			
7				
8	WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES  JONATHAN BLOOM, ESQ.  767 Fifth Avenue			
9	New York, New York 10153 212.310.8775			
10	212.310.6773 212.310.8007 Fax jonathanbloom@weil.com			
11				
12	On behalf of the Defendants:			
13	KING & SPALDING LLP JOHN W. HARBIN, ESQ. 1180 Peachtree Street, N.E.			
14	Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3521 404.572.2595			
15	404.572.5100 Fax jharbin@kslaw.com			
16				
17				
18	Also Present:  Henry Stewart, Videographer			
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				

	Vincent Lloyd, PH.D. Apr	cil 20, 2011
1	INDEX OF EXAMINATIONS	3
2	WITNESS:	
3	Vincent William Lloyd, Ph.D.	Page
4	DIRECT EXAMINATION	9
_	By Mr. Harbin	
5	CROSS-EXAMINATION	21
6	By Mr. Krugman	
7	REDIRECT EXAMINATION	80
8	By Mr. Harbin	
10	INDEX TO EXHIBITS Defendant's	
10	Exhibit Description	Page
11	1 Fall of 2009, Syllabus for Honors	11
12	1000 Course - Love, Religious and	
13	Philosophical Perspectives, GaState0066182-183	
14	2 11-18-10 Fair Use Checklist,	16
1 -	Fragility of Goodness	
15	3 Photocopy Beginning with the Cover	12
16	of "The Fragility of Goodness, Luc	κ
17	and Ethics in Greek Tragedy and Philosophy," by Nussbaum, Through	
18	the Table of Contents	
ΤΟ	4 Chapter 6 - The Speech of	14
19	Alcibiades: Reading of the Symposium, pp. 165 - 199	
20		
21	INDEX TO EXHIBITS	
22	Plaintiff's Exhibit Description	Page
23	5 7-15-08 12:53 PM E-mail, from	34
24	Library Reserves, to Lloyd, Subject: Need title page,	J <sub>T</sub>
25	GaState0065625-627	

·	Vincent Lloyd,	PH.D.	April	20,	201	1	
1		INDEX TO EXHIBITS			4	F	
2	Plaintiff's Exhibit	Description		Pag	e		
3	6	7 17 00 11:04 AM E mail from		2	6		
4	0	7-17-09 11:04 AM E-mail, from Library Reserves, to Lloyd, Subject: Password for REL1000		3	0		
5	7	Consideration With a set Winner W		_	0		
б	7	Curriculum Vitae of Vincent W. Lloyd		5	0		
7	8	Policy on the Use of Copyrighte Works in	d	7	1		
8		Education and Research					
9							
10	(Original Defendant's Exhibits 1 through 4 and						
11	Original Plaintiff's Exhibits 5 through 8 have been attached to the original transcript.)						
12							
13							
14							

1	Videotape Deposition of Vincent William Lloyd, Ph.D.
2	April 20, 2011
3	
4	(Reporter disclosure made pursuant to
5	Article 10.B. of the Rules and Regulations of
6	the Board of Court Reporting of the Judicial
7	Council of Georgia.)
8	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is Tape No. 1 to
9	the videotape deposition of Professor Vincent
10	Lloyd, in the matter of Cambridge Press versus
11	Mark Becker. This deposition is being held at
12	King & Spalding, 780 Peachtree Street in
13	Atlanta, Georgia, on April 20th, 2011. The time
14	is now 9:10 a.m.
15	We're on the record. My name is Henry
16	Stewart. I'm the videographer. The court
17	reporter is Julie Friedman.
18	Counsel, will you please introduce
19	yourselves and affiliations, and the witness
20	will be sworn.
21	MR. HARBIN: John Harbin with King &
22	Spalding for the defendants.
23	MR. KRUGMAN: Edward Krugman of Bondurant,
24	Mixson & Elmore for the plaintiffs.
25	MR. BLOOM: And I'm Jonathan Bloom, Weil,

Gotchal & Manges, for the plaintiffs.

VINCENT WILLIAM LLOYD, Ph.D., having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:

MR. KRUGMAN: Okay. Before we proceed with it, I want to state that the plaintiffs object to this deposition to the extent that it is intended to be offered as trial testimony.

We understand that the witness resides within subpoena range of the United States
District Court for the Northern District of
Georgia and is represented by counsel for the defendants; and presumably the defendants could, if they chose, subpoena the witness to appear at trial and provide live testimony.

In addition, presumably the -- certain of the individual defendants could -- could direct the witness to appear for trial, if they -- if they so chose.

In addition, this deposition was scheduled, along with several additional depositions, that the defendant has -- have described as testimonial in nature to accommodate the defendants and pursuant to an agreement that -- that each of the professors

that the defendants have expressed an intent to call at trial would be produced for -- for a discovery deposition in advance of trial.

Several were taken last week, and many more have been scheduled for this week.

At approximately 11:30 last night, defendants received a -- an e-mail communication from -- from Steve Schaetzel at King & Spalding announcing that the defendants were unilaterally -- had unilaterally decided that they would not be producing any of the professors for discovery depositions, but fully intended to proceed with what they describe as testimonial depositions.

We reserve, you know, all rights where we don't -- We do not waive the right to object to any attempts by defendants to introduce the deposition testimony of Professor Lloyd, because he supposedly is not available within the meaning of the Federal Rules of Evidence or the Federal Rules of Civil -- Civil Procedure or our local rules, and we reserve all rights.

MR. HARBIN: Well, let me briefly stand up and get some water.

Just to briefly respond to the second

point and -- And we can take it up. As you think you know, I'm just a soldier in this war, but the --

Briefly the defendants, as has been reflected in the e-mail correspondence, understood there was agreement that the discovery depositions would be limited to an hour and a half; and the plaintiffs have said that now that they don't -- There is no such agreement, so that that is the basis for the decision not to produce these professors voluntarily for discovery depositions.

But also, it's my understanding, as reflected in the e-mail correspondence, that the plaintiffs said they did not want to take a discovery deposition of Professor Lloyd, and that we responded by e-mail saying just to be certain, we are planning to take a evidentiary deposition of him and that --

And the plaintiff's response after being told that was still, as I understand it, we're going to cross-examine him, not ask to do a discovery deposition first.

So that's my understanding as to Professor Lloyd.

MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah. We still -- We still 1 2 object to his testimony being -- being taken and 3 offered at trial; but obviously, that's an issue 4 that the Court will determine irrespective --5 MR. HARBIN: Right. 6 MR. KRUGMAN: -- really of the -- of the 7 other issues. 8 MR. HARBIN: And I understand that, so you 9 can deal with it a little bit, you can question 10 him, if you wanted to. And we -- which I 11 MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah. 12 will, but we had -- we had indicated that we 13 were -- and I believe it's reflected in e-mail 14 communications that -- that -- as well as conversations that I believe Randy Singer 15 16 had with -- with Steve Schaetzel that it was our 17 plan -- our -- our intent to -- to not present 18 at trial the -- the -- Professor Lloyd's, I 19 guess, the one works that was on the joint 20 filing. 21 MR. HARBIN: Right. Right. Okay. 22 MR. KRUGMAN: But --

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. HARBIN:

23

24

25

Q. With that, Professor Lloyd, we can get

started.

Would you introduce yourself to the Court and state your full name, please.

- A. Vincent Lloyd.
- Q. Okay. And would you tell us what your -- where you got your undergraduate degree and in what.
  - A. At Princeton University in religion.
- Q. Okay. And summarize, please, your graduate education.
- A. I was a -- a graduate student at the University of Chicago and the University of California, Berkeley. At Berkeley I received a doctorate from the Rhetoric Department.
- Q. Okay. And how long have you taught at Georgia State University?
  - A. I am finishing my third year now.
- Q. Okay. And what will you be -- Where will you be teaching in the -- in the fall?
- A. My employment at Georgia State is ending, and I'm starting a job at Syracuse University.
- Q. Okay. And in that regard, what are your plans during the second half of May, beginning the week of May 16th?
- A. I'm moving from Atlanta to Syracuse, New York, where I'll be starting a job at Syracuse --

- Q. Okay.
- A. -- and ending my employment at Georgia State.
- Q. Okay. Did you teach a course in the fall of 2009, an Honors 1000 course titled, "Love, Religious and Philosophical Perspectives"?
  - A. Yes. That's correct.
- Q. Let me hand you what's been marked as Lloyd Exhibit 1 and ask you if that is a syllabus, copy of the -- a copy of the syllabus for the course.
  - A. This is an overview of the course. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Can you summarize what was covered in this course.
- A. We were interested in thinking about the concept and practice of -- of love in works of literature, philosophy, and religion in western culture as broadly understood from ancient Greece to the present.
- Q. Okay. What was the nature of this course as an honors course?
- A. So this was for a freshmen in Georgia State's honors program. It was a one-credit, pass-fail course, which was intended to orient new, bright students at Georgia State to the university and to provide them with a small seminar that's

relatively informal in their first year.

- Q. And how many students approximately were in the class in the fall of 2009?
  - A. There were about 15 students.
- Q. Have you taught this course since the fall of 2009?
  - A. No. It was a one-off course.
- Q. Well, how many -- how many -- How often did the course meet in the fall of 2009?
  - A. Once a week for one hour a week.
- Q. Okay. And how many courses overall have you taught at Georgia State since the fall of 2009?
  - A. Two courses.
- Q. Okay. In this course in the fall of 2009, did you use an excerpt of a book called, quote, "The Fragility of Goodness, Luck and Ethics in Greek Tragedy and Philosophy," closed quote?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. Let me hand you what's been marked as Lloyd Exhibit No. 3.

I can't even keep a certain number in order, but a small number. There you --

MR. KRUGMAN: Was -- The first one was one?

MR. HARBIN: Right.

MR. KRUGMAN: And this one's three?
MR. HARBIN: Correct.

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Is this -- Do you recognize this as a title and including the index of that publication?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. And if you look at the next to last page,
  I think it is, was the publication including, you
  know, bibliography and the index over 536 pages long?
- A. That's correct. Yeah. This is a title and contents.
- Q. And was the publication, if you focus just on the chapters, the substantive chapters, approximately 421 pages?

MR. KRUGMAN: Objection. Leading.

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Yeah. I think that's -- Plaintiff has said that, but go ahead.
  - A. Oh. Yes. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. And so did -- In your excerpt, did you use less than 10 percent of the book by pages?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. What was your purpose in -- in assigning this excerpt, this chapter?
- A. Uh-huh. In class we had read one of the seminal texts on love in western culture, Plato's

"Symposium"; and we were looking at critical responses to Plato's "Symposium."

This is one of several critical responses that we -- that we looked at, and this is an important and widely discussed piece of philosophy that's very central to recent discussions on love in -- by philosophers.

- Q. Okay. And if you look at the index, was it Chapter 6, entitled, "The speech of Alcibiades" that you assigned?
  - A. Yes. In the contents of said Chapter 6.
- Q. And let me hand you what's been marked as Lloyd Exhibit 4 and ask you if that is a copy of the excerpt that you assigned.
  - A. Yes. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. And you may have already indicated this. But what was your purpose in assigning this chapter?
- A. This was a important work of recent philosophy dealing with a classic text central to the course.
  - O. And what was the classic text?
  - A. Plato's "Symposium."
    - Q. And --
- 25 A. And this is looking at Plato's "Symposium"

differently than most previous readers had -- had looked at it. Instead of focussing on the speech of Diotima which most -- most readers of Plato focus on, this is focussing on a different speech, Alcibiades' speech, to -- And the chapter makes us think about the -- think about Plato's text differently by changing that focus.

- Q. Okay. And would you tell the Court whether or not you viewed this chapter as the heart of or the critical part of this book as a whole?
  - A. I did not view it --

MR. KRUGMAN: Objection.

THE WITNESS: -- as the --

MR. KRUGMAN: Leading.

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) You can answer.
- A. I -- I did not view it as the -- the central part of the heart of this -- this book.
  - Q. Okay. And why do you say that?
- A. Nussbaum's book is a collection of essays on a variety of topics in ancient Greek philosophy that are all -- Each essay is making a similar point about the significance of luck and fragility in different ways.

This is -- This chapter is one among many, many ways that Nussbaum is making that -- that

argument. There's not one chapter or one place, one essay which is central in this book or the heart of the book.

- Q. And did you use a fair -- the fair use checklist provided by the university in deciding to use this excerpt in the course in the fall of 2009?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. And did you report to the library you had reviewed this work under the fair use checklist and concluded it would constitute fair use?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. Let me show you a -- what's been marked as Lloyd Exhibit No. 2. This appears to be a checklist about that excerpt of that "Fragility of Goodness" publication.

Is it dated November 18, 2010?

- A. That's correct. Yes.
- Q. And so did you prepare this written checklist on or about November 18, 2010?
  - A. That's correct.
  - Q. Obviously, after the class?
  - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. Were you attempting to re-create what analysis you made or underwent as far as whether this was fair use --

MR. KRUGMAN: Objection.

Q. (By Mr. Harbin) -- for the course in the fall of 2009?

MR. KRUGMAN: Objection. Leading.

THE WITNESS: Yes. I was.

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Let me ask you. What was your purpose in filing out this checklist in November of 2010?
- A. I wanted -- My purpose was to re-create the reasoning that I -- I used when I was originally using the -- the fairness guidelines when I was putting the material on Ereserve.
- Q. Do you recall if you actually filled out a checklist and stored it in the fall of 2009?
- A. In the fall of 2009, I -- I used a checklist for the -- I -- I filled out a checklist for the first couple of readings for -- for the course and used the reasoning that the checklist lays out when deciding what excerpts to use for -- for the rest of the -- the selections on Ereserve.
- Q. Okay. All right. And I just wanted to talk about a couple of entries on the checklist.

You determined that in your view it was a small portion of the work you were using on the second page?

- A. It's -- Yes.
- Q. Okay. You checked that the use stimulates the market, in your view would stimulate.

You checked the box that says "Use stimulates market for original work." Do you see that?

- A. Yes.
- Q. And what was your meaning there in checking that?
- A. I thought that some students who read the excerpts that was placed on Ereserve might be interested in reading more of Nussbaum's work particularly and -- and possibly purchasing this -- this book.
- Q. Have you ever had a student indicate he or she bought a book after you used an excerpt in a class?
  - A. Yes. I have.
    - MR. KRUGMAN: Objection. Hearing -- Hearsay.
- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) And approximately how many times has that happened in your experience?

  MR. KRUGMAN: Same objection. Hearsay.

  THE WITNESS: Several times.
  - Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Okay. You check user

owns lawfully acquired or purchased copy of the work?

- A. That's correct. Yes.
- Q. And why did you check that?
- A. Because in the -- I own a copy of Nussbaum's book.
- Q. Okay. And you check restricted access. And what did you -- What was your meaning or understanding there?
- A. That the selection on Ereserve would be password-protected, and the password would only be available to the students in my course.
- Q. Okay. And you checked on the second page under that "Factor 4: Effect on Market for Original," on the bottom lower right-hand rows, "Weighs Against Fair Use," you check "Required classroom reading"?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. Is it correct this was required classroom reading for this course?
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. It was pass-fail.
- Okay. And overall what was your conclusion as to whether or not your use of this excerpt in fall of 2009 constituted fair use?
  - A. I concluded that my use of the excerpt did

constitute fair use.

- Q. Did the university ever encourage you to use Ereserve to post excerpts?
  - A. No. The university did not.
- Q. Did the university ever encourage you to use uLearn to post excerpts of reading material?
  - A. No.
  - Q. Do you use uLearn currently?
  - A. No. I don't.
  - Q. Did you use uLearn in the fall of 2009?
  - A. No. I've never used uLearn.
- Q. Okay. And have you ever had the library challenge your determination that the use of a particular excerpt would constitute fair use?
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. And when approximately was that?
  - A. It was before fall of 2009.
- Q. Okay. And to the best you can judge, what would you have done if you had determined in the fall of 2009 or the library had told you that using this excerpt, Chapter 6 of Miss Nussbaum's book, was not fair use? What would you have done?
- A. I would have either -- either put the book on physical reserve; used a different version of the chapter, for example, the version that was published

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

in a -- in a journal a few years before the book, or I would have changed the syllabus that we were not reading -- reading the book, or two of the -- two of the above.

MR. HARBIN: Okay. That's all I have. Thank you.

THE WITNESS: Uh-huh. Okay.

Q. (By Mr. Harbin) Well, let me ask one question.

Is it your understanding that the university has a license, authority to use that journal you're referring to --

- A. Yes.
- Q. It has?

MR. HARBIN: Okay. Thank you. That's all I have.

17 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

BY MR. KRUGMAN:

- Q. Okay. So I understand, with respect to the works, the Nussbaum work, if the library had instructed you to remove that from the Ereserve, you would have done so?
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. If the -- Who was the provost of Georgia

State University?

- A. First, could I clarify. I don't have the capacity to remove -- remove works from Ereserve.

  The library does that, so I, I mean -- I --
- Q. You would have requested the library to do so?
- A. I mean, if the library told me that -Could -- Could you restate the question,
  sir.
- Q. Yeah. If the library, if someone with the library indicated to you that they believed that the Nussbaum work -- that posting of the Nussbaum work would somehow violate copyright law, would you request the library to remove it from Ereserve?
  - A. Yes. I -- Yes.
- Q. Who is currently the provost of the -- of Georgia State University?
  - A. I believe it's Risa Palm.
- Q. Yeah. And she's also senior vice president for academic affairs at the university?
  - A. I would imagine that's the case.
- Q. Yeah. If Provost Palm were -- were to direct you to remove any work from or -- or direct you to cause any work to be removed from the Ereserve system at Georgia State that you had caused to be

posted through the library, would you follow Provost's Palm's direction?

- A. So Provost Palm -- Just to understand your question, if Provost Palm instructed me to instruct the library staff to remove a work, then I would. Then, yes, I would follow Provost -- Provost Palm's instructions.
- Q. And would the same be true if President Becker of the university made that direction to you?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. You had testified that the library has or had on one occasion, I guess, challenged or questioned one of the works that you had requested be posted on the Ereserve system at Georgia State?
- A. I don't think I specified the number of times; but I did say that in the past, prior to fall of 2009, the -- the library had -- staff had objected to -- had raised concerns about material posted on Ereserve.
  - Q. Okay. What material was that?
  - A. I don't recall.
  - O. How many times did that occur?
- A. I don't recall precisely. I would imagine two or three times.
  - Q. Do you recall whether they were excerpts

of books that you had requested be posted?

A. I don't recall, but I -- I can also add something to clarify.

I mean, including in the fall of 2009, the library Ereserve staff had asked for further information about the material that I had posted on Ereserves, for example, title page of a work that I'd only put in excerpts -- that I'd put in excerpts without a title page.

I'd requested that an excerpt without a title page be put on Ereserves, and they -- They responded that I would have to put the title page as well on the Ereserves.

- Q. And then --
- A. So there was correspondence going back and forth with the library.
  - Q. And did you do that?
- A. Yes.
  - Q. What were the concerns that the library staff had raised in the past with respect to works that you sought to have posted on Ereserve?

Were they of the similar nature, that they needed some additional information?

A. That was one set of concerns. There were concerns raised about the size of an excerpt. I

believe there were concerns raised about the size of an excerpt at one point.

- Q. And do you recall what that work was?
- A. No. I don't.
- Q. Do you recall what class it had to do with?
  - A. No. I don't.
- Q. Was it prior to the adoption of the new policy on copyright at Georgia State?
- A. I believe it was prior to fall 2009. I don't remember when the new policy was adopted.
- Q. Do you recall whether it was a work that you had completed a checklist for prior to submitting it to the library?
  - A. I don't recall.
- Q. And you've never used the uLearn system at Georgia State?
- A. I know nothing about uLearn. I mean, I -- I have not used uLearn.
- Q. Yeah. You've never used for it for any purpose including in connection with classes that you've taught?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. You testified in response to Mr. Harbin's question, that you -- that you concluded that the

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

25

Nussbaum work satisfied fair use; and therefore, you were permitted to request the library to post it on Ereserve; is -- is that right?

- A. Based on the checklist that I completed, yes.
- Q. Yeah. And that -- That determination was based on your completion of -- of Exhibit 2, which is the fair use checklist dated November 18th, 2010; is that correct?
  - MR. HARBIN: Object to the form of the question. Ambiguous.

But you -- You can answer.

THE WITNESS: My -- My determination was based on the -- on the -- the reasoning outlined in the checklist. That's correct.

- Q. (By Mr. Krugman) Okay. It was not based on any -- any specialized knowledge of fair use?
  - A. That's correct.
    - Q. And you're not a lawyer; is that correct?
    - A. That's correct. I'm not a lawyer.
  - Q. You've had no legal training?
- 22 A. I mean --
  - Q. Certainly in reference to copyright law?
- 24 A. That's correct.
  - Q. Have you taken any courses on copyright?

- A. No.
- Q. Have you taken courses on any other type of intellectual property?
  - A. Not that I recall, and probably not.
- Q. If you can, please take a look at Exhibit 2, which is the -- the checklist.
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Now -- Yeah. You completed this checklist in Exhibit 2 on November 18th of 2010; is that correct?
  - A. I completed this checklist. Yes.
- Q. Yeah. Okay. Why -- Why did you complete this checklist on November 18th of 2010 when the course that it relates to was taught in the fall of 2009?
- A. I completed the checklist following a conversation with Georgia State counsel.
- Q. Okay. And I don't -- I don't want you to reveal any confidential communications that you had with -- with counsel. But you had a conversation with counsel and then -- and then filled out this fair use checklist?
- A. I had communication with counsel, and then I followed up -- I filled out the checklist.
  - Q. And it was filled out because you were

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

asked to do so, correct?

MR. HARBIN: Objection.

MR. HARBIN: Objection. Just to preserve to the extent it calls --

MR. KRUGMAN: Yes.

MR. HARBIN: -- for privilege.

But as long as you don't claim waiver --

MR. KRUGMAN: No. I'm not.

MR. HARBIN: -- you can answer.

THE WITNESS: Yes.

- Q. (By Mr. Krugman) Now in connection with the fall 2009 class, if you look at Exhibit 1, which is the syllabus for this class --
  - A. The overview. Yes.
- Q. The overview. And there are -- Okay.

  There are a -- There are a number of readings. Do
  you see that?
  - A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)
  - Q. And this is on Page 1 --
  - A. Oh, excuse me.
    - Q. -- first of all.
  - A. Oh, yes.
  - Q. And it says readings are available through the GSU library's Ereserves, go to a certain link, and provides the -- the password. And then you must bring a paper copy of the readings to class during

the relevant weeks.

Do you see that?

- A. I see that.
- Q. And the -- the works that you're referring to then are listed on the second page of the syllabus, which provides a schedule for the course and a variety of readings for each week?
- A. Yes. The second page lists works that were on Ereserve.
- Q. And each -- And I take it each of those readings that are reflected on Page 2 were required readings for the -- for the course --

MR. HARBIN: Objection.

- Q. (By Mr. Harbin) -- is that correct?
- A. That's -- That's correct.
- Q. And it was your expectation that the students would be able to obtain electronic copy of these works using Georgia State's Ereserve system; is that correct?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. And then it was your expectation that the -- that the students would then print out a copy of that work each week and bring it with them to class; is that correct?
  - A. As the course evolved, students -- Some

students printed out work. Some students brought laptop computers and read the -- read the works on their computers. Both of those were acceptable.

- Q. Okay. So it worked both ways. Some students had hard copies that they had printed out. Others simply had their laptops in class and --
  - A. That's correct.
  - Q. -- accessed the works electronically --
  - A. Uh-huh.
  - Q. -- is that correct?
  - A. That's correct. Yes.
- Q. Now in the -- I -- I believe in response to Mr. Harbin's question that you -- with respect to what you did in the fall of 2009, you -- you --

Am I correct that you completed in the fall of 2009 a fair use checklist for -- for perhaps two of the works that are listed on Page 2 of Exhibit 1?

- A. To the best of my recollection, that's correct.
- Q. Okay. And that would be -- Would the first two be -- be the Augustine's "City of God"?
- A. I -- I was not doing them sequentially as I was entering them into the Ereserve system.
  - Q. Okay. Do you recall which works that are

listed on Exhibit 1 on Page 2 you completed a fair use checklist in the fall of 2009?

- A. I -- I don't recall.
- Q. Did you retain copies of the fair use checklist that you completed for works in the fall of 2009?
  - A. I -- I don't believe so.
  - Q. Okay. Now you -- on Page 2 -On -- on Exhibit 2 -- I'm sorry --
  - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. -- the fair use checklist says, "Complete and retain a copy of this checklist for each 'fair use' of a copyrighted work in order to establish a 'reasonable...good faith' attempt at applying fair should any dispute regarding such use arise."

You see that?

- A. Oh. This is in the --
- Q. Yeah.
- A. Yes. I see that. Yeah.
- Q. That's the last full paragraph --
- A. Uh-huh.
  - Q. -- above Factor 1.

And I take it you did not comply with that direction to complete and retain a copy of the checklist for each fair use of a copyrighted work?

- A. And please keep a copy of this checklist.

  That's correct.
- Q. Why not?
- A. I -- I used the -- My understanding of the intention of the checklist was that it provided reasoning that should be used in deciding what was appropriate to place on electronic reserve.

I used the -- the reasoning outlined in the checklist in each decision I made about placing material on electronic reserve, and I felt that using that reasoning fulfilled the intent of -- of the -- of the checklist.

- Q. Even though the checklist directed you to complete it and keep a copy for your records?
- A. I felt that I was complying with the intent of the checklist.
- Q. Okay. And how you did discern what the intent of the checklist was?
- A. I read the document, and I acted in a way that I felt was following what the document was essentially asking for.
- Q. Did you complete a fair use checklist in -- you know, prior to the fall 2009 semester for the Martha Nussbaum work that has been marked as Exhibit 4?

1 I -- I used the reasoning outlined in Α. 2 the -- in the checklist when deciding whether to put 3 the Nussbaum work on Ereserve. I don't recall, and 4 I -- whether I completed a physical checklist. 5 If this happened to be one of the first 6 couple of works that I was using, I may have. 7 don't recall whether I did or not. 8 THE COURT REPORTER: One? 9 MR. KRUGMAN: One. Yes. (Discussion ensued off the record.) 10 11 MR. KRUGMAN: Well, actually, why don't 12 we -- why don't we -- There's enough confusion 13 with overlapping --14 MR. HARBIN: I've got a --15 MR. KRUGMAN: -- exhibit numbers. 16 MR. HARBIN: -- copy of that marked. Ιf 17 you want to --Is that the communication with the ERes? 18 19 MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah. I have a --20 MR. HARBIN: -- on it? 21 MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah. I mean, we can mark 22 it; but it will be a Defendant's -- a 23 Plaintiff's exhibit, I quess. MR. HARBIN: Yeah. Is it marked --24 25 MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah.

MR. HARBIN: -- as --1 2 MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah. But let's mark it as 3 5 since that's --4 MR. HARBIN: Lloyd 5. There, is that it? 5 MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah. Well, actually, 6 there --7 THE COURT REPORTER: At the top? 8 MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah. Well, actually, mark 9 that as -- Yeah. Mark this one as five, and 10 then mark that one as six. 11 (Plaintiff's Exhibits 5 and 6 were marked 12 for identification.) 13 MR. KRUGMAN: Okay. That's five. 14 MR. HARBIN: Thank you. 15 MR. KRUGMAN: Yours is easier to read, 16 though. 17 (By Mr. Krugman) Professor Lloyd, let me 0. 18 first hand you what's been marked as Plaintiff's 19 Exhibit No. 5 for the -- for your deposition. 20 And can you identify this document. 21 Α. This is correspondence with the library 22 Ereserve system where they're noting that in order to 23 be in compliance with copyright issues, I should provide additional information to the library 24 25 Ereserve's people.

Q. And that's at the top where it says on July 15th, 2009.

And I take it this is relating to the materials that were -- that you used in the Love, Religious and Philosophical Perspectives course; is that correct?

- A. That's correct. The library Ereserves is -- was not satisfied with the copyright issues surrounding -- surrounding that.
- Q. Yeah. And the library at that point said, Hi Professor Lloyd. We're working on your page. Can you please bring over the title page and copyright page of Love's Work by Gillian Rose? We need to have that information before we can post to your page. Thanks, ERes staff.
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. Did -- What was your understanding as to, if any, as to why the library needed the -- the title page and copyright page --
  - A. I don't --
  - Q. -- for that work?
- 22 A. I have no idea.
  - 0. Okay.
- 24 A. I mean, I don't know.
- Q. You don't know?

- A. I don't know.
- Q. And then Plaintiff's Exhibit No. 6.

  MR. KRUGMAN: Do you have another copy of that, John?

MR. HARBIN: Yeah. Yeah.

MR. KRUGMAN: Yeah. Thank you.

- Q. (By Mr. Krugman) And <u>Plaintiff's Exhibit</u>
  No. 6 is a subsequent communication that you had with the library staff regarding your request that certain materials be posted on Ereserve; is that correct?
  - A. Yes. That's correct.
- Q. And here the library on July 17th, 2009, said, Professor Lloyd, the -- the password for Religion one, oh -- 1000 is 1h87wekeF.

That's the library advising you of the password that you could then inform the students of, so they would be able to access the works that were being posted on Ereserve; is that correct?

- A. The library is advising me of the password and raising these copyright issues.
- Q. Okay. The copyright issues were before we can post the chapter by Gillian Rose, we will -- we will need a copy of the title page and copyright page of the book: Love's Work.

And that's essentially the request that

had been made on the -- two days earlier on July 15th; is that correct?

- A. That's correct.
- Q. That's the -- and -- And they said, "Please bring copies by, and we will scan them."

There were no other concerns expressed by the library other than they wanted a copy of the title page and copyright page of the work; is that correct?

- A. Not in this correspondence. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. And there are no other concerns expressed by the library with respect to any of the works that you requested be posted on Ereserve for the fall of 2009 other than the library's request that it be provided a copy of the title page and copyright page?
  - A. I don't recall other concerns.
- Q. Okay. And why don't we -- We can look on -- focusing on Exhibit 6 and -- and if you'll look at Exhibit 1 --
  - A. (Witness complies with request of counsel.)
    - Q. -- as well, which -- on Page 2 --
- A. Uh-huh.

Q. -- on Exhibit 6, you -- you represented to the library in your -- in your communication requesting works be posted on Ereserve with respect to the work by George Bataille, which was to be -- which was a required reading for September 23rd and September 30th, that -- that you -- you advised the library that, "It falls under fair use according to the Fair Use Checklist I completed."

Do you see that?

- A. I see that.
- Q. Did you, in fact, at the time you made this submission to the library complete a fair use checklist for that work?
- A. I don't recall. I recall using the reasoning outlined in the fair use checklist in order to determine whether I believed the work -- the -- the selection fell under the fair -- under fair use.
- Q. But when you advised the library that you had completed a check -- a fair use checklist, in fact, it's possible you had not done so, correct?
  - A. I don't recall whether or not I had --
- 22 O. Yeah.
  - A. -- physically completed the checklist.
  - Q. Okay.
    - A. I recall using the guidelines.

Q. Okay. And you -- The next work, Gillian Rose, you reported to the library that you had completed a checklist.

And are -- Sitting here today, are you able to testify that, in fact, you had completed a fair use checklist for that work?

- A. I don't recall whether I completed the physical checklist. I do recall using the rationale outlined in the checklist in determining whether the selection fell under the fair use guidelines.
- Q. If you turn to the next page of Exhibit 6 --
- A. (Witness complies with request of counsel.)
- Q. -- electronic books, there's a work by Plato. You said that you completed a checklist for that work. And I take it you don't recall one way or another sitting here today?
- A. I don't recall whether I -- I completed the physical checklist, although I do recall using the rationale in that checklist to determine whether that selection fell under the fair use guidelines that the university put forth.
- Q. Okay. Under the -- The next entry is actually the -- for the Martha Nussbaum work, "The

Fragility of Goodness," publisher, Cambridge University Press.

And when you -- When you advised the library that you had completed a fair use checklist for that work, in -- in fact, it is possible, if not likely, you hadn't -- you had not actually completed one for that work, but you had gone through the reasoning?

- A. That's correct.
- Q. And -- And would your answer be the same for all of the other works that are listed on Exhibit 6 where you represented and reported to the library that you had completed a fair use checklist for those works, that, in fact, all -- for most, if not all of those, you had only engaged in the -- the reasoning behind the fair use checklist without actually completing?
- A. I mean, I recall completing a fair use checklist. I recall using the reasoning behind that checklist, so I mean, depending on how one interprets the phrase, I completed a fair use checklist. I mean, I completed a fair use checklist.

I used that reasoning. For each reading, I completed a fair use checklist for readings in this course.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- Q. But you did not complete a checklist for each and every work that you offered in this course, correct?
  - A. I don't recall.
- Q. Now you've testified earlier that you've completed it for a couple of works --
  - A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)
  - Q. And then you used the reasoning --
  - A. (Witness nods head affirmatively.)
  - Q. -- for the remaining works, correct?
  - A. I -- I believe that's what I said. Yeah.
- Q. Yeah. So, in fact, you did not complete a fair use checklist for all of the works, correct?
  - A. I believe that's the case.
  - Q. When you completed Exhibit 2, which was the fair use checklist for the Nussbaum work, what were you attempting to do when you filled out this checklist?
  - Were -- Were you attempting to put yourself in the -- your shoes at -- back -- as back in the fall of 2009 --
- 22 A. I --
- 23 | 0. -- with this --
- 24 A. I mean, I --
- 25 Q. -- or -- or were you -- or were you

looking at it, analyzing it anew in -- in November of 2010?

- A. I was attempting to re-create -- or in -- In November of 2010, I was attempting to re-create the reasoning that I had used and the thinking that had gone into filling out this form when I originally filled it out -- or when I originally was -- was using -- using the reasoning.
- Q. Using the reasoning, 'cause you didn't fill out the form for -- for Nussbaum back in the fall of --

MR. HARBIN: Objection.

Q. (By Mr. Krugman) -- 2009?

MR. HARBIN: Asked and answered several times.

Your answer again.

THE WITNESS: I mean, I don't recall.

Q. (By Mr. Krugman) On -- On Exhibit 2, the fair use checklist, under purpose and character of the use, you checked nonprofit educational and teaching, including multiple -- multiple copies for -- for classroom use.

Do you see that?

- A. I see that. Yes.
- Q. What, is -- What do you understand the

difference, if any, to be between those two factors?

A. I would imagine that nonprofit -- I mean, at the time I --

I mean, I believe that at the time I interpreted nonprofit educational to be in contrast to, for example, a for-profit college and teaching use to be in contrast to, say, research use or some other sort of nonteaching -- nonteaching use.

Not distinguishing the sort of institution, but rather, distinguishing the sort of -- sort of activity.

- Q. Okay. So for -- for works that you wanted students -- or that for works that you wanted to make available to students on Georgia State's Ereserve system, because Georgia State is a nonprofit educational institution and you were a professor, an instructor at Georgia State, you would always check nonprofit educational and teaching; is that correct?
- A. If the work was to be used in -- in a classroom setting, I would -- for instructional purposes, I would -- I would check teaching.

If it was to be used at Georgia State University, I would check nonprofit educational.

- Q. And teaching?
- A. I mean, I would --

MR. HARBIN: He said that. Yeah.

Q. (By Mr. Krugman) Okay. I -- I didn't hear the teaching.

You would always check those two boxes --

- A. Uh-huh.
- Q. -- if you were using it for a -- for a course taught at Georgia State, correct?
- A. Yes. I mean, if I was using it in an -- in an instructional -- like instructional way in a course, I would check teaching.

If I using it at Georgia State, I would check nonprofit educational.

- Q. You also -- well, can you think of any instance where -- If you were using a particular work for a course you were teaching at Georgia State, can you think of any instance where you would not check both of those boxes?
- A. I cannot think of an instance where I would not check nonprofit educational.

 $\label{thm:condition} \mbox{There are scenarios where teaching, I} $$ \mbox{might find ambiguous; and I} $$ -- $$$ 

So, for example, if there was a -- a final project that students were assigned to do and they were to look at, you know, one of, you know, 10 or 15 different works as part of a research project, I

mean, there -- there are cases where I would be sort of uncertain about whether to check teaching.

But I -- I would definitely be -- check -- I would -- I would in all cases teach nonprofit educational.

- Q. Yeah. And the possible exception for teaching, that is if the -- if there were multiple works that the students were to utilize for research?
  - A. Yeah. For research, yes.
- Q. And if that were the case, presumably you would then check the third box research -- research or -- or scholarship?
  - A. That's correct.

I -- I should say, I mean, my -- one -The exception that I stated to the teaching, it was
not exhaustive. I might think of --

I mean, if I were to think about it longer, there might be other scenarios where teaching was not the primary purpose; but that was one example.

- Q. Okay. Now sitting here today, that's only the example you can think of --
  - A. Well --
- Q. -- okay, if you were using a particular work for a course that you were teaching at Georgia

State and wanted that work to be available to students on Georgia State's electronic reserve system?

A. Now there -- there are cases where in graduate courses, I want to provide students with a background information that might not be part of the teaching of that class. It might be related to broader topics than -- than the specific material of the class, which would not necessarily be teaching-related and not necessarily be research- or scholarship-related.

So that would be another case where it -- I would think it would be ambiguous, right, whether I would check teaching.

- Q. Have you ever completed a fair -- a fair use checklist or gone through the reasoning behind the fair use checklist and not concluded that a particular work was both for nonprofit educational and for teaching, including multiple copies for classroom use?
- A. I don't recall a case where that's -- where that's so --
- Q. You also checked under Factor 1 "Use is necessary to achieve your intended educational purpose."

Why did you check that box?

A. I thought about the goals of the course and how the Nussbaum selection tied in with the goals of the course and concluded that the Nussbaum selection was -- and the other selections were -
Well, the Nussbaum selection, because this is -- this -- this checklist is relating to the

is -- this -- this checklist is relating to the Nussbaum selection, was necessary to achieve the intended educational purpose.

Q. Okay. There are boxes on the left, one for "Transformative, use changes work for new utility or purpose"; and on the right, "Non-Transformative."

What do you understand the term "transformative" to mean?

- A. That my use of -- of the -- the selection would do something with it other than what Nussbaum intended when she was writing -- writing the work.
  - Q. Was -- was --
- A. Yeah, yeah. That -- That it would be sort of significantly altering the way that Nussbaum intended that -- that her -- that Nussbaum could envision her work being -- being used.
- Q. Do you believe simply providing a copy of the -- of that chapter from Nussbaum's work, that -- for which this fair use checklist relates was

transformative of the work?

- A. I -- I don't believe it would reach that threshold of significantly changing the purpose for which Nussbaum thought it would be used.
- Q. Is Exhibit 4 -- I mean, Exhibit 4 was what was provided to students, correct, at least in electronic form?
  - A. I believe so.
- Q. All right. This is simply a copy of that chapter from Nussbaum's book, correct?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Yeah. Is there any way that simply providing a copy of a chapter from Professor Nussbaum's work could be anything other than nontransformative?

MR. HARBIN: Object to the extent it calls for a legal conclusion, but you can answer.

THE WITNESS: While I concluded that there was not a significant change in the way that Nussbaum intended her chapter to be used, I also do not conclude that there was absolutely no change in the way that the -- the work was being used.

Nussbaum's project as a whole in -- in "Fragility of Goodness" is a wide-ranging

re-evaluation of ancient Greek ethics. In our course we were not thinking about the context of ancient Greek ethics. We were not thinking about the context of -- of Plato's work.

We were only thinking about very specific -- specific work that Nussbaum talks about in a different context than Nussbaum was -- was envisioning. We were thinking about the tradition of reflection on love in -- in western thought, which was not Nussbaum's purpose in writing that chapter.

So while I -- I didn't think that the -the change was significant, I also did not think
that there was no change whatsoever, so I
neither checked transformative nor
nontransformative.

- Q. (By Mr. Krugman) Do you know what Nussbaum's intention was with respect to the use of that work?
- A. I mean, I -- I can -- I -- I have views about that. I don't -- I don't know for certain.
- Q. You don't know. So you really were not able, at least under your definition of whether a particular work was transformative or nontransformative, you -- you really don't --

23

24

25

1 It's all speculation on your part as to 2 what Nussbaum's intention was? 3 MR. HARBIN: Object to the form of the 4 question. 5 You can answer. 6 THE WITNESS: I mean, as an academic who 7 publishes with university presses, who publishes in the same field as Nussbaum, I felt confident 8 9 that I could reasonably understand Nussbaum's 10 intention in this chapter. 11 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 7 was marked for 12 identification.) 13 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 14 (By Mr. Krugman) Okay. Is Exhibit 7 a O. copy of your CV? 15 16 Α. Yes. 17 And I -- I show -- I show it to you only 0. 18 because of what you just mentioned, that you've --19 you've -- You have published a great deal; is that 20 correct? 21 Α.

- A. I mean, I have published a number of academic works. That's correct.
- Q. Yeah. Two books that are referenced on the first page, "The Problem With Grace:

  Reconfiguring Political Theology."

And what's -- What's the subject of that work?

- A. I -- That work deals with the philosophy of religion and specifically how issues raised in the philosophy of religion can address contemporary religious and political concerns.
- Q. And -- And then there's another book,
  "Law and Transcendence on the Unfinished Project of
  Gillian Rose." And that's a work that was published
  two years ago.
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. And what was the subject matter of that book?
- A. I was examining the work of Gillian Rose, a British philosopher and social theorist, against the background of more recent work in contemporary philosophy.
- Q. Okay. Were the -- Are these books considered nonfiction?
  - A. I hope so. Yes.
- Q. Yes. That although nonfiction these books contain your original analysis on the subject matter of the books; is that correct?
  - A. That's correct.
  - Q. And they're -- The books are not simply a

recitation of facts; is that correct?

- A. That's correct.
- Q. And would you consider the -- the -- your expression and analysis in these books to be creative?
- A. I -- I -- Can you say more about what you mean by creative.
- Q. Well, I mean, it's -- It's not simply a recitation of facts. You've -- You've undertaken some analysis; and hopefully, in a way that others in the past have not thought about?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. In -- In fact, it's your hope that -- that scholars reading these books would consider them to be highly creative?
- A. Creative is a difficult term in academia. Right. In one sense one wants to be faithful to the works one is analyzing, but also to offer novel interpretations, so I'm not sure -- I am not sure whether I would embrace the word "creative," but I think the spirit of your question.
- Q. Certainly novel, was your -- was your -- that was your goal?
- A. To -- I mean, again, novel is a -- is a complicated word. Right. In the sense that if one

is writing a book about Gillian Rose, who's a, you know, a significant figure from twentieth century British philosophy, one, you know, wants to be faithful to interpreting what she -- she was saying and the significance of her work.

You know, if that interpretation is novel -- I mean, if that interpretation was not offered before, that would be praiseworthy.

- Q. And you've also -- Turning to the second page, you've -- you've authored many articles and chapters as well --
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. -- that are referenced on Page 2 of Exhibit 7.

And would it be fair to say that these articles and chapters also were works of nonfiction as distinguished from fiction?

- A. Yes. That's correct.
- Q. And -- And I -- I take it, it was your at least hope that's these -- these works contain your original analysis on the -- on the subject matters of each of the works?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Now okay. There -- There are certainly a number of benefits to having -- as a -- you know, as

- a -- as a scholar having your works published and then made available to the others in the field of your expertise.
- A. There -- There are benefits to having your work disseminated.
- Q. Yeah. One is that it benefits your reputation, is that correct, hopefully?
  - A. That's correct. Yeah.
- Q. It's beneficial for career advancement; is that correct?
- A. The dissemination of one's works is beneficial to career advancement.
- Q. It's hopefully promotive of gaining tenure at a university?
  - A. That's often the case.
- Q. Yeah. Did you obtain tenure at Georgia State?
- A. I -- I'm only in my third year. At Georgia State I would not go for tenure for another --
- Q. All right. Okay. And your -- when -- When does your employment with Georgia State end?
- A. We're in negotiations for -- between the two institutions as to when the date of employment will end at one and start at the other.

- Q. Okay. Okay. So the Georgia State and Syracuse University are in negotiations as to when your employment with Georgia State will end and --
- A. The three parties are in discussions, me being one of the parties.
  - Q. With you being one of the three parties?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. What is your expectation as to when your --
  - A. I mean --
  - Q. -- employment will end?
- A. -- the negotiations are at somewhat of an impasse at the moment; but I mean, Syracuse wants me to start, wants me to be teaching in the fall. There are just issues like health insurance and so on; and we have to figure out when they -- when one stops and when the other starts.
- Q. Okay. So -- So Syracuse wants you there to teach in the fall --
  - A. As soon as possible.
  - Q. -- 2011 semester?
- A. They want me to -- They want me in Syracuse as soon as possible. Georgia State would prefer for me to be at Georgia State as long as possible.

- Q. Okay. So there's currently an impasse between -- among the three on -- on --
  - A. We --
  - Q. -- the issue?
  - A. We have not as yet reached a resolution.
- Q. When do -- When do you anticipate a resolution?
  - A. Next week.
- Q. Okay. So even though there's an impasse, you expect that to be resolved next week?
- A. I mean, I -- I expect that the date of the end of employment will be determined quite soon. Well, probably next week.
- Q. What is your expectation as to what the end of your employment at Georgia State will be, if you have an expectation?
- A. I mean, Georgia -- I -- I do not currently have an expectation, that it is unclear to me. These, you know, legal and financial issues are opaque to me.
- Q. So it's certainly possible that you'll -- that -- You're currently employed by Georgia State?
- A. I'm currently on leave from Georgia State.

  I'm not currently teaching at Georgia State, and I'm

  not currently in residence or have any administrative

obligations at Georgia State.

I'm currently on leave teaching at Emory University.

- Q. Okay. Who provides your health insurance --
  - A. Georgia --
  - Q. -- currently?
- A. -- State currently does. I mean, my -- my contract with Georgia State is -- Well, I don't know how much detail we need about this, but my --

Georgia State employs people -- does not employ people over the summer, so my contract with Georgia State is ending at the end of -- I believe it's a nine-month or a ten-month contract.

So my Georgia contract is ending and will not be renewed; but the summer is a sort of ambiguous, administratively ambiguous period.

- O. Yeah. When does the contract end?
- A. I -- my -- I believe it's either early May or mid-May, but I'm not absolutely sure.
  - Q. Do you have a copy of the contract?
  - A. Not with me.
- Q. I take it you could provide counsel with a copy?
  - A. I believe counsel could obtain a copy.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

Yes. We could provide.

- Q. What's your -- Where do you reside? What's your -- what -- What's your residence address?
- A. 215-A Mitchell Street, Apartment 9, Atlanta, Georgia 30303.
  - O. And that's in downtown Atlanta?
  - A. That's correct.
  - Q. Located close to the university or relatively close to the university; is that --
    - A. Yes.
- 12 0. -- correct?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- Q. Is that an apartment?
- 15 A. Yes. That's correct.
- Q. And do you have a lease for that apartment?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. When does that lease --
- 20 A. May 1st.
- Q. It expires May 1st?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- Q. Why are you leaving Georgia State for Syracuse?
- A. A combination of -- I mean, the -- the

opportunity -- Syracuse has a very strong religion department, and I'm looking forward to joining that department.

- Q. If you go back to Exhibit 2 --
- A. Plaintiff's or Defendant's?
- Q. Yeah. Defendant's Exhibit 2. I'm sorry.
- A. Okay. So going back. Well --
- O. It's the fair -- fair use checklist --
- A. Uh-huh.
- Q. -- again; and for Factor 1, there were three in favor and -- in favor of fair use and none against; is that correct?
- A. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. On Factor No. 2, you checked published work?
  - A. That's correct.
  - Q. And factual or nonfiction work, you -- you checked both those two boxes?
    - A. That's correct.
  - Q. And could there -- Could you envision any instance where you were using a published work of -- of nonfiction where you would not check both of those two boxes in connection with a fair use determination utilizing the fair use checklist?
    - A. If I understood the word -- work to be

published, I would check published. If I understood
the work to be factual or nonfiction, I would check
factual --

- Q. Okay.
- A. -- or nonfiction.
- Q. So for a published nonfiction work, you would always check those two boxes, correct?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. All right. And -- And I take it you would also not -- you would not check unpublished work, which is on the right, because it was published, correct?
  - A. If a work was --
- Q. Yeah.
  - A. -- published, I would check published.
- Q. Would you check -- What do you understand the highly creative work factor to mean on the right -- right-hand column of Factor 2?
- A. I mean, I -- I take the examples art, music, novels, films, plays, poetry, fiction to be illustrative, but not exhaustive of what that would mean; and I mean, I find them fairly straightforward.
- Q. Okay. Is it your understanding under the -- under this checklist that a work of nonfiction could never satisfy the highly creative work

criterion?

- A. No. I could imagine in a case where I would check both nonfiction and highly creative.
- Q. Did you do that with any of the fair use checklists you -- that you either physically completed or considered in connection with any works that you made available to students?
  - A. Not that I recall.
- Q. Okay. Is there any reason that you concluded the Nussbaum work not to be highly creative?
- A. Given the examples provided of highly creative works, I did not see -- I did not understand Nussbaum's work to be -- to have a family resemblance or to be generally similar to -- to those.
- Q. And the examples are listed parenthetically --
  - A. Yes.
- Q. -- art, music, novels, films, plays, poetry, fiction?
  - A. That's correct. I did not consider it to be creative nonfiction. I did not consider it to be highly creative nonfiction either.
    - Q. Perhaps creative, but not highly creative?
    - A. As I mentioned when we were speaking about

the term "creative" earlier, creative is a very difficult term and -- in academic and especially philosophical writings, and it's one that would only be used in sort of special cases in referring to a philosophical work, for example.

- Q. You also checked important to educational objectives. You see that under -- under Factor 2?
  - A. Yes. I see that.
  - Q. And why did you check that box?
- A. When I was considering specific to this course and the design of this course and my stated description of this course how I -- what I wanted the students to understand at the end of the day, at the end of -- at the end of the semester, I understood Nussbaum's work to be important to achieving that.
- Q. Okay. You had -- you -- We noted earlier that you had -- that when you completed this in November of 2009, you checked use is necessary to achieve your intended educational purpose under Factor 1?
  - A. November of 2010?
  - Q. I'm sorry. 2010. Yes.
- A. Use is necessary to achieve your intended educational purpose. That's correct.
  - Q. Yeah. Can you -- Can you think of an

instance in which you would not check important to educational objectives under fair -- under Factor 2 if you had checked use is necessary to achieve your intended educational purpose under chapter -- under Factor 1?

A. As I stated when we were discussing the important -- what important to educational objectives means, I interpret this as being specific to the course description and the constellation of issues laid out in the course, whereas when we were speaking about use is necessary to achieve your intended educational purpose, I believe I said or I intended to say something more like, you know, the broad goals that might be achieved in -- in this course.

So, for example, if -- you know, this -- This course specifically, you know, is about love; but it's also a part of a -- a honors freshman seminar which is intended to provide the students with a orientation to what it means to take a university class.

So if there are -- were sort of background readings about, say, you know, students, what it means to be in your first year at a university, right, I might consider that, you know, part of the educational purpose of the course, because the course

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

is this broader scope educational purpose, but not the narrow scope of the objectives, which sometimes in my syllabi, I state explicitly. This time, they're more implicit in the description of the course.

- Q. With -- with -- that was a long -- long answer that I'm not quite sure --
  - A. Broad scope versus narrow scope. Right.
  - Q. -- responded to the question.

But can you -- Sitting here today, can you think of any instance where you -- for any fair use checklist that you either physically or mentally completed where you checked use is necessary to achieve your intended educational purpose, but did not check important to educational --

- A. I don't --
- O. -- objectives?
- A. -- recall one way or the other.
- Q. Under Factor 3 you checked small portion of work used.

Well, first of all, before we go on, under Factor 2 it was three -- three ways in favor of fair use and zero against; is that correct?

- A. That's what I checked. That's correct.
- Q. Under Factor 3 you checked small portion

of work used. How did you make that determination?

- A. I -- I considered that one chapter of a -- of Nussbaum's quite weighty book would be a small portion. I didn't -- Yeah.
- Q. Yeah. What if you had used two chapters, would that have qualified as a small portion?
  - A. I --

MR. HARBIN: Object to the extent it calls for speculation.

You can answer.

THE WITNESS: Yeah. I'm not sure.

- Q. (By Mr. Krugman) Did -- do you know what -- Is there any threshold above which the use of a particular work is no longer a small portion at least as you understand the fair use checklist and the policy on copyright at Georgia State?
- A. I -- I was aware of the previous guidelines; and I mean, I was generally aware. I didn't remember the specifics -- specifics of the previous guidelines, but I mean, I -- I mean, I -- I wouldn't imagine if I was putting a third of a work on reserve, that would not be a small portion.
  - O. What were the previous guidelines?
- A. I believe it was something like one chapter or a percentage.

- Q. All right. Do you know what the percentage or do you recall what the percentage was?
- A. I don't recall precisely. It was greater than 10 percent.
- Q. Okay. Was it your understanding that the previous guidelines did not apply under the new policy and fair use checklist?
- A. My understanding was that the fair use checklist was what should be used in determining whether materials should be put on Ereserve or not.
- Q. And that if you completed it and it -- the factors weighed in favor of fair use, then you were allowed to use --
  - A. Yes.
  - O. -- the work?
  - A. That was my understanding.
- Q. You also checked amount taken as narrowly tailored to educational purpose such as criticism, comment, research, or subject being taught. What do you understand that subfactor to mean?
- A. There was a lot of material in Nussbaum's book which was not related to the topic of the course. I only chose the material which was related to the topic of the course.
  - Q. And under Factor 3, there were two for --

two weighing in favor of fair use and zero against; is that correct?

- A. That's what I checked. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. Under Factor 4, effect on market for original, in response to Mr. Harbin's questions, you've indicated that you had checked that use stimulates market for original work.

Do you see that?

- A. Yes.
- Q. What was the market for the original work that you considered?
- A. I imagine that students in my course might be introduced to Nussbaum's work in the course, and it was possible that they could purchase -- that they might purchase Nussbaum's book either during the course or at a later point.
- Q. Do you know of any student who purchased Nussbaum's work?
- A. I am not aware of -- of any student who purchased Nussbaum's work.
- Q. I think you had testified earlier that you believe that some students may have purchased works that --
- A. I -- I said generally in my teaching career; and specifically, you know, this semester,

I've had a student who has purchased a book based on -- after having read an excerpt in -- in course.

- Q. Yeah. Do you know of any student that purchased any of the works that were posted on Ereserve for the Religion 1000 class that you taught during the fall semester of 2009?
- A. No student spoke with me about their book purchases.
- Q. Yeah. Does the market that you considered include a market for licensing or permissions for works?
- A. That was not a primary factor in my -- in my thinking.
- Q. Did you -- Did you undertake any investigation to determine whether licensing or permissions were available for the Nussbaum work that you requested the library to make available to students on the electronic reserve system?
- A. I did not investigate licensing possibilities.
- Q. So when you didn't check the licensing or permission reasonably available box, that was because you had undertook no investigation to determine whether that factor might apply; is that correct?
  - A. I -- I did not. I mean, as an academic

at Georgia State, I'm generally aware of what's happening in the academic community; and I was not aware of easy -- Or I was not aware of reasonably available licensing or permission opportunities for -- for this work.

- Q. Did you -- But you didn't -- You didn't ask anyone whether licensing or permissions for this work were reasonably available?
- A. I -- I did not go beyond my understanding as a -- a academic working in the academic community in investigating that. No, no.
  - Q. Did you ask anyone at the library?
- A. I did not go beyond my general understanding as a member of the academic community.
- Q. When -- how did -- During 2009 you learned that Georgia State had adopted a new policy on copyright that included the checklist that's been marked as Exhibit 2; is that correct?
  - A. I don't recall when I learned that.
- Q. You -- You do recall at some time learning of a new policy --
  - A. Yes.
    - Q. -- that included the fair use checklist --
  - A. Yeah.
    - Q. -- which had not been a part of the policy

in the past?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- A. That's correct.
- Q. How did you learn about that new policy?
- A. I believe there was a -- I mean, it's likely that there was an e-mail. I don't recall exactly.
- Q. Were you provided a copy of the new policy?
- A. It's likely that there was a link to the new policy in the e-mail, but I don't recall exactly.
- Q. And do you recall who told you? I mean, who -- who sent the e-mail that you recall?
- A. I don't recall. Yeah.
- Q. Did you undergo any training with respect to the new policy?
- A. I don't recall any sort of in-service training.
  - Q. Okay. Do you recall meeting with anyone within the legal affairs department at Georgia State in reference to the new policy --
    - A. I --
    - O. -- at or about the time it was adopted?
  - A. I don't recall that.
  - Q. Did you read a copy of the policy when it was --

- A. I mean, I recall --
- Q. -- enacted?
- A. -- following the links in the -- I mean, to my -- To the best of my recollection, I -- I remember seeing an e-mail, following the links, and taking a look at -- at what was posted on the website regarding the new policy.

THE COURT REPORTER: Eight.

MR. HARBIN: Yeah.

(<u>Plaintiff's Exhibit 8</u> was marked for identification.)

THE WITNESS: Yeah. Thank you.

MR. KRUGMAN: You're welcome. Just hand you there.

- Q. (By Mr. Krugman) Can you identify Exhibit 8 as the policy on the use of copyrighted works in education and research that -- that the university adopted at least or was adopted, at least, sometime prior to your fall 2009 course?
  - A. Yes. This is it.
- Q. And did you review the policy at or about the time it was adopted?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. If you turn to page -- up at the top, Page 13 of 19.

- A. (Witness complies with request of counsel.)
  - Q. And there's a page on permissions.
  - A. Uh-huh.
- Q. And do you recall reviewing that page in connection or -- or following the adoption of the new policy?
- A. Now I -- I recall generally looking at this document. I don't recall more than that.
- Q. Yeah. If you turn over two pages to Page 15 of 19 --
- A. (Witness complies with request of counsel.)
- Q. -- and the reference to collective licensing agencies, and you see for works in print a copyright clearance center, that the CCC should be your starting point. If you're looking to get permission for a text-based work, the CCC can grant permission for thousands of work -- works, many instantly on-line.

Do you see that?

- A. I see that on this document.
- Q. Yeah. Did you undertake to contact the copyright clearance center to determine whether a license -- a license or permission was available for

the Nussbaum work?

- A. I did not.
- Q. And did you do that for any of the works that you requested?
  - A. No. I did not.
  - Q. And why not?
- A. I was following general academic practice which I had seen as an undergraduate at Princeton and as a graduate student at Chicago and Berkley and as a instructor in the Indiana University system and the University of California system where that was not part of the standard procedure.
- Q. Okay. So you didn't do it because it wasn't done at other universities?
- A. I was following the standard academic procedure as I understood it.
  - MR. HARBIN: Can we go off the record for a second.

THE WITNESS: Sure.

MR. HARBIN: If you've got much longer, could we take a short break. Oh.

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: I'm sorry. 10:30 a.m. Off the record.

(Discussion ensued off the record.)

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: 10:30 a.m. Back on the

record.

- Q. (By Mr. Krugman) Professor Lloyd, you did not check numerous copies made or distributed under Factor 4, effect on market for original.
  - A. Yes. That's --
  - Q. Now --
  - A. -- correct.
- Q. Now -- Now these copies, there were certainly numerous copies made available at least electronically to all of the students in your -- in your class on the Ereserve system; is that correct?
- A. I would not characterize 15 as numerous but --
- Q. What -- What would you characterize as numerous?
- A. I don't have a fixed number in mind, but I would not characterize a small seminar as numerous copies.
- Q. Okay. So that whether that -- At least as you understand the policy, whether that box would be checked would depend upon the size of the class?
- A. That would depend on the size of -- the number of individuals who had access to the documents. That would be my understanding.
  - Q. Okay. So at some point, it would be --

It would become numerous, but you just -- You have no understanding as to what that number is?

- A. I mean, I have an understanding as to what numerous is. I don't have a specific number in mind.
  - Q. And what would be numerous?
- A. Again, I don't have a specific number in mind. I would become concerned if there were a thousand people. I would not be concerned if there were five people. Beyond that I -- I mean, I don't have a specific number in mind.
  - Q. Do you know what a course pack is?
  - A. Yes. I do.
    - Q. And what is a course pack?
- A. It is a compilation of articles or readings put together for a specific class.
- Q. And those are actually physical copies of the readings?
  - A. Physical copies. That's correct.
- Q. Yeah. And at least with respect to the Religion 1000 class, there were numerous readings that were provided to students, but not --
- A. I -- I would not characterize the number of readings as numerous. Again, the number of readings is perhaps 15 or so --
  - Q. Okay.

- A. -- which as we stated earlier, I don't consider numerous.
- Q. Okay. I think we were talking numerous in terms of the number of students in -- in the class, but I was -- Here I was talking about the number of works --
  - A. Right.
  - O. -- that were made?
- A. And I was saying 15, in general, I don't consider numerous.
- Q. Okay. There were a number -- number of works made available electronically?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. And these works could have been provided to the students as a course pack; is that correct?
  - A. That -- I believe so.
- Q. Yeah. And the difference would have been one would be in electronic form and the other in paper form --
  - A. That's --
  - Q. -- is that correct?
  - A. -- one of the differences. Yeah.
- Q. Is it your understanding the students would purchase the course pack --
  - A. I mean --

- O. -- from the bookstore?
- A. Or read it in the library or however they were going to do it. I have not used a course pack at Georgia State.
- Q. Okay. All right. You understand -- have any understanding with respect to the use of course packs whether the -- whether the publisher of the book or the -- or other owner of the copyright receives any -- any fees with connection with the use of the course pack materials?
- A. I have not used course packs at Georgia State. I -- I don't know the -- the policies for course packs.
- Q. So you have no understanding one way or another whether any fees or permissions are paid for use of the works that are compiled as a part of the course pack material?
  - A. I wouldn't want to speculate.
  - Q. So the answer is no?

    MR. HARBIN: Yeah. Just say. If you don't know, say you don't know.

THE WITNESS: No.

Q. (By Mr. Krugman) Which is fine. Which is fine. I'm not asking you to -- to speculate.

Now did you teach this course only once?

- A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And earlier you testified that you -- you checked the -- the last two boxes on Factor 4 so -- and, also, the check for required classroom reading. So in this instance there were three in favor of fair use, and one's against?
  - A. That's what I checked.
- Q. Yeah. Now by the time you -- you got to the fourth factor, you had already concluded three factors weighed factor -- in favor of fair use, is that correct -- Factors 1, 2, and 3?
  - A. That's correct.
- Q. So the -- Whatever conclusions you reach under the fourth -- fourth factor would not impact your overall conclusions in any event as to whether the work could be used?
- A. I mean, it -- I'd have to review the guidelines here to see how they wanted us to -- to decide that.
- Q. Yeah. Well, to help you, see under the instruction where the factors favoring fair use outnumber those against it, reliance on fair use is justified.
  - A. Okay.
  - Q. So if you --

- A. Uh-huh.
- Q. So if Factors 1, 2, and 3 weigh in favor of fair use, what you conclude with respect to the fourth -- fourth factor is irrelevant to your overall conclusion, at least as you understand the fair use checklist to operate?
- A. That does appear to be what -- Yeah. Yes.
- Q. Have you ever completed either physically or mentally a fair use checklist where you concluded that use of the particular use -- use of the particular work was not fair use?
  - A. No. I haven't.
- Q. Did you consult with anyone about the fair use checklist that you completed?
  - A. No.
- Q. And just -- I know you -- I believe you answered this, but just so I -- Just to make it clear, you -- you undertook no training in the new copyright policy with anyone at Georgia State after it was adopted?
  - A. I don't recall that. Yeah.
- Q. Does -- Has anyone attempted to serve you with a subpoena to appear at trial in this case beginning in May -- beginning on May 16th of 2011?

1 Not that I'm aware of. Α. 2 MR. KRUGMAN: That's all I have. 3 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 4 BY MR. HARBIN: 5 Q. Well, Professor, I just have one 6 logistical detail question about the library and the 7 Ereserve system. You were asked some questions about if the 8 library had determined -- If the library staff had 9 10 determined in their view a proposed excerpt did not 11 fall within fair use, would you request that they 12 take it off. Now is it --13 In your understanding, if the library 14 staff determined that one of your proposed excerpts 15 for a class did not constitute fair use, what would 16 happen? 17 Specifically would it ever be uploaded to 18 the Ereserve system? 19 They would not post it. Α. 20 MR. HARBIN: Okay. That's all I have. 21 Thank you. 22 /// 23 /// 24 /// 25 ///

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This concludes the videotape deposition of Professor Vincent Lloyd, April 20th, 2011, 10:38 a.m. We're off the record. (Whereupon, the deposition was concluded at 10:38 a.m.) (Pursuant to Rule 30(e) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and/or O.C.G.A. 9-11-30(e), neither a party nor the deponent having requested right of review of the deposition, the reading and signing of the deposition is waived.) 

## CERTIFICATE

STATE OF GEORGIA:

COUNTY OF FULTON:

I hereby certify that the foregoing transcript was taken down, as stated in the caption, and the questions and answers thereto were reduced to typewriting under my direction; that the foregoing pages 1 through 81 represent a true, complete, and correct transcript of the evidence given upon said hearing, and I further certify that I am not of kin or counsel to the parties in the case; am not in the regular employ of counsel for any of said parties; nor am I in anywise interested in the result of said case.

This, the 25th day of April, 2011.

S. JULIE FRIEDMAN, CCR-B-1476

## COURT REPORTER DISCLOSURE

Pursuant to Article 10.B of the Rules and Regulations of the Board of Court Reporting of the Judicial Council of Georgia which states: "Each court reporter shall tender a disclosure form at the time of the taking of the deposition stating the arrangements made for the reporting services of the certified court reporter, by the certified court reporter, the court reporter's employer or the referral source for the deposition, with any party to the litigation, counsel to the parties, or other entity. Such form shall be attached to the deposition transcript," I make the following disclosure:

I am a Georgia Certified Court Reporter. I am here as a representative of Esquire Deposition Solutions. Esquire Deposition Solutions was contacted to provide court reporting services for the deposition. Esquire Deposition Solutions will not be taking this deposition under any contract that is prohibited by O.C.G.A. 9-11-28(c).

Esquire Deposition Solutions has no contract/agreement to provide reporting services with any party to the case, any counsel in the case, or any reporter or reporting agency from whom a referral might have been made to cover this deposition. Esquire Deposition Solutions will charge its usual and customary rates to all parties in the case, and a financial discount will not be given to any party to this litigation.

S. Julie Friedman, CCR-1476

A	add	ago	analysis	apply
a.m	24:2	51:10	16:24 51:22	66:6 68:24
81:6	addition	agreement	52:4,10 53:21	applying
able	6:16,20	6:25 8:6,10	analyzing	31:14
29:17 36:17	additional	ahead	42:1 52:18	appropriate
39:5 49:23	6:21 24:23	13:17	ancient	32:7
	34:24	al	11:17 15:20	approximate
absolutely 48:21 57:20	address	1:10	49:1,3	
	51:5 58:4	Alcibiades	and/or	<b>У</b> 7:612:2
academia	administrati	3:19 14:9	81:8	13:14 18:21
52:16		Alcibiades'	anew	20:16
academic	<b>ve</b> 56:25	15:4	42:1	April
22:20 50:6,22			announcing	1:17 5:2,13
62:2 68:25	administrati	allowed	7:9	81:3 82:18
69:2,10,14	vely	66:13		
73:7,15	57:17	along	<b>another</b> 36:3 39:18	argument 16:1
acceptable	adopted	6:21	46:12 51:7	
30:3	25:11 69:16	already	54:20 77:15	arise
access	70:22 71:18,	14:16 78:9		31:15
19:6 36:17	22 79:21	Also	answer	arrangements
74:23	adoption	2:17 8:13	15:15 26:12	83:5
accessed	25:8 72:6	22:19 24:2	28:8 40:10 42:16 48:17	art
30:8	advance	44:13 46:23	50:5 64:7	60:19 61:19
accommodate	7:3	48:20 49:13	65:10 77:19	Article
6:24	advancement	52:18 53:9,16		5:5 83:3
achieve	54:9,12	60:10 62:6	answered	articles
46:24 47:8		63:17 66:17	42:14 79:18	53:10,16
62:19,23	advised	78:4	answers	75:14
63:3,11 64:14	38:6,18 40:3	altering	82:8	asked
achieved	advising	47:20	anticipate	24:5 28:1
63:14	36:15,19	although	56:6	42:14 80:8
	affairs	39:20 51:21	anywise	_
achieving	22:20 70:19	always	82:16	asking
62:15	affiliations	43:17 44:4	Apartment	32:21 77:24
acquired	5:19	60:7	58:5,14,17	assigned
19:1	affirmativel	Ambiguous	, ,	14:10,14
acted		26:11 44:21	<b>appear</b> 6:14,18 79:7,	44:23
32:19	<b>y</b> 28:17 41:7,9	46:13 57:17	24	assigning
ACTION	-			13:23 14:17
1:5	agencies	among 15:24 56:2	APPEARANCES	ATLANTA
activity	72:15	15:24 56:2	2:1	1:2,22 2:5,14
43:11	agency	amount	appears	5:13 10:24
	83:15	66:17	16:13	58:6,7

Atlantic	46:6 51:16	20:18 30:19	18:16	1:45:1040:1
2:4	63:21	71:4	box	cannot
attached	Based	between	18:4 45:11	44:18
4:11 83:8	26:4,7,14,16 68:1	43:1 54:23 56:2	47:1 62:9 68:22 74:20	capacity 1:9 22:3
attempt	basis	beyond	boxes	
31:14	8:10	69:9,13 75:9	44:4,17 47:10	caption 82:8
attempted	Bataille	bibliography	59:18,23 60:7	
79:23	38:4	13:9	78:3	career
attempting	BECKER	bit	break	54:9,12 67:25
16:23 41:17,	1:85:11 23:9	9:9	73:21	case
19 42:3,4			briefly	22:21 41:14
attempts	<b>Beginning</b> 3:15 10:22	BLOOM 2:85:25	7:23,258:4	45:10 46:12, 21 54:15 61:2
7:17	79:25		bright	79:24 82:14,
Augustine's		Board	11:24	17 83:15,17
30:22	behalf 2:2,11	5:6 83:3	bring	·
authored		BONDURANT	28:25 29:23	cases 45:1,446:4
53:10	being	2:35:23	35:12 37:5	62:4
authority	5:11 8:20 9:2 36:18 47:22	book	British	cause
21:11	48:22 55:5,6	12:15 13:20	51:15 53:3	22:24
available	63:8 66:19	15:10,17,19		
7:19 19:11	believe	16:2,318:14, 1619:5	<b>broad</b> 63:13 64:8	caused 22:25
28:22 43:14	9:13,15 22:18	20:21,23		
46:1 54:2	25:1,10 30:12	21:1,3 36:24	broader	CCC
61:7 68:16,	31:7 41:11,14	48:10 51:7,13	46:8 64:1	72:16,18
17,2269:4,8	43:4 47:23	53:1 65:3	broadly	CCR-1476
72:25 74:9	48:2,857:13,	66:22 67:15	11:17	83:21
76:12	19,25 63:12	68:1,777:8	brought	CCR-B-1476
Avenue	65:24 67:22	books	30:1	1:24 82:20
2:8	70:4 76:16	24:1 39:15	C	Center
aware	79:17	50:23 51:18,	c	2:4 72:16,24
65:17,18	believed	21,23,25	82:1	central
67:19 69:1,3 80:1	22:11 38:16	52:4,14	California	14:6,20 15:17
	beneficial	bookstore	10:12 73:11	16:2
В	54:9,12	77:1	call	century
В	benefits	Both	7:2	53:2
2:3	53:25 54:4,6	30:3,444:17	called	certain
back	Berkeley	46:18 59:18,	12:15	6:16 8:18
24:15 41:20	10:12	22 61:3		12:21 28:23
42:10 59:4,7	Berkley	bottom	calls 28:3 48:16	36:9 49:21
73:25	73:9	19:14	65:8	Certainly
background	best	bought		26:23 52:22
		I	CAMBRIDGE	1

	I	I	I	I
53:24 56:21	44:4,10,12,	checklists	15:19	completing
74:9	17,19 45:2,3,	61:5	collective	40:17,18
certified	11 46:14 47:1	Chicago	72:14	completion
83:6,10	59:22 60:1,2,	10:11 73:9	college	26:7
certify	7,10,15,16	chose	43:6	compliance
82:6,13	61:3 62:9 63:1 64:15	6:14,19 66:23	column	34:23
challenge	68:21 74:3	City	60:18	complicated
20:13	78:4	30:22	combination	52:25
challenged	checked	CIVIL	58:25	
23:12	18:2,419:12	1:57:2181:8	comment	complies 37:22 39:13
change	42:20 46:23		66:19	72:1,12
48:19,22	49:15 59:14,	claim		· ·
49:13,14	18 62:6,18	28:6	communicatio	comply 31:23
changed	63:3 64:13,	clarify	n	
21:2	19,24,25	22:2 24:3	7:8 27:23	complying
	66:17 67:3,6	class	33:18 36:8 38:2	32:15
changes 47:11	74:21 78:3,7	12:3 13:24		computers
	checking	16:21 18:17	communicatio	30:2,3
changing	18:9	25:5 28:11,	ns	concept
15:7 48:3	Checklist	12,25 29:24 30:6 46:7,9	9:14 27:19	11:15
Chapter	3:14 16:5,9,	63:20 68:5	community	concerned
3:18 13:23	13,19 17:7,	74:11,21	69:2,10,14	75:7,8
14:9,11,18	14,16,18,22	75:15,20 76:4	compilation	concerns
15:5,9,24 16:1 20:21,25	25:13 26:4,8,	80:15	75:14	23:18 24:19,
36:22 47:24	15 27:6,9,11,	classes	compiled	24,25 25:1
48:10,13,20	13,16,22,24	25:21	77:16	37:6,12,18
49:11 50:10	30:16 31:2,5,	classic	complete	51:6
63:4 65:2,25	11,12,25	14:20,22	27:12 31:11,	conclude
chapters	32:1,5,9,12, 13,16,18,22		24 32:14,22	48:21 79:3
13:13 53:11,	33:2,438:8,	classroom	38:12 41:1,12	concluded
16 65:5	13,15,19,23	19:16,18 42:22 43:20	82:11	16:10 19:25
character	39:3,6,8,9,	46:20 78:5	completed	25:25 46:17
42:19	16,20,21		25:13 26:4	47:4 48:18
characterize	40:4,13,16,	<b>clear</b> 79:19	27:8,11,16	61:10 78:9
74:12,14,17	19,20,21,22,		30:15 31:1,5	79:10 81:5
75:22	24 41:1,13,	clearance	33:4 38:8,19,	concludes
	16,18 42:19	72:16,24	23 39:3,5,7,	81:1
charge 83:16	46:16,17	close	16,19 40:4,6,	conclusion
	47:7,25 59:8,	58:9,10	13,21,22,24	19:23 48:17
check	24 60:24	closed	41:6,15 46:15	79:5
18:25 19:3,6, 15 38:19	64:12 65:15 66:7,9 69:17,	12:17	61:6 62:17 64:13 66:11	conclusions
43:17,21,23	23 79:6,10,15	collection	79:9,15	78:13,15
13.11,21,23	23 79.0,10,13	l	' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' ' '	

Conference 1:21	3:17 13:11 14:11	Copyrighted 4:7 31:13,25	Council 5:783:4	15:8 33:8 34:7 71:8
confident	context	71:16	COUNSEL	83:1,3,4,6,
50:8	49:2,4,7	correct	2:15:186:12	10,11
confidential	contract	11:7 12:18	27:17,20,21,	Cover
27:19	57:9,12,14,	13:2,10,18,	23 37:23	3:15 83:16
confusion	15,18,21	21 14:15	39:14 57:23,	covered
33:12	83:12	16:7,11,17,	25 72:2,13	11:12
	contract/agr	20 19:2,17,18	82:13,15	creative
connection 25:21 28:10	eement	23:10 25:23	83:7,15	52:5,7,15,
59:23 61:6	83:14	26:9,15,18,	COUNTY	16,20 60:17,
72:6 77:9	contrast	19,20,24	82:4	25 61:3,11,
	43:5,7	27:10 28:1 29:14,15,19,	couple	13,22,23,24
consider 52:3,14	conversation	20,24 30:7,	17:17,22 33:6	62:1
61:21,22	27:17,20	10,11,15,20	41:6	criterion
63:24 76:2,10		32:2 35:6,7,	Course	61:1
considered	conversation	16 36:10,11,	3:12 11:4,5,	critical
51:19 61:6	s	18 37:2,3,9,	10,11,13,19,	14:1,3 15:10
65:2 67:11	9:15	11 38:20 40:9	20,2312:5,7,	criticism
68:9	copies	41:3,10,13	9,1414:21	66:18
considering	30:5 31:4	43:18 44:7	16:617:2,18	CROSS-
62:10	37:5 42:21	45:13 48:6,10	19:11,19	EXAMINATION
	46:19 74:3,8,	50:20,22	27:14 29:6, 12,25 35:5	3:5 21:18
constellatio		51:11,23,24	40:25 41:2	cross-
n	copy	52:1,2,12 53:12,18	44:7,10,15	
63:9	11:10 14:13	54:7,8,10	45:25 47:2,4	examine
constitute	19:1,4 28:25 29:17,22	58:8,12,13,	49:262:11,12	8:22
16:10 20:1,14	31:12,24	15,2259:12,	63:9,10,14,	culture
80:15	32:1,14 33:16	13,16,19	16,25 64:5	11:17 13:25
constituted	36:3,23 37:7,	60:7,8,12	66:23,24	currently
19:24	16 47:23	61:21 62:24	67:12,13,16	20:8 22:16
consult	48:9,13 50:15	64:23,24	68:2 71:19	56:1,18,22,
79:14	57:21,24,25	67:2,368:24	75:11,13	23,24,25
contact	70:7,24	69:18 70:2	76:15,24	57:2,7,8
72:23	copyright	74:7,11 75:18	77:3,6,10,	Curriculum
contacted	22:13 25:9	76:13,15,21	11,13,17,25	4:5
83:11	26:23,25	78:11,12	courses	customary
contain	34:23 35:8,	82:11	12:11,13	83:17
51:22 53:20	12,19 36:20,	corresponden	26:25 27:2 46:5	CV
contemporary	21,23 37:8,17	ce		50:15
51:5,16	65:16 69:17	8:5,14 24:15	COURT	D
Contents	72:16,24 77:8	34:21 37:10	1:1 5:6,16 6:11 9:4 10:2	date
Concents	79:20		∪·⊥⊥ ጛ·⁴ ⊥∪·∠	

16:16 26:8   depending   40:20   49:12 65:4,19   dispute   31:15   each   dispute   31:15   dispute	E
dated         74:21,22         didn't         discussions           16:16:26:8         depending         42:9 44:2         dispute         82:1           62:13:82:18         deponent         68:21:65:4,19         dispute         82:1           37:1         DEPOSITION         difference         43:1.76:17         disseminated         6:25:19           deal         1:14:5:1,9,11         differences         76:22         76:22         77:12           dealing         34:19:81:2,5         differences         76:22         76:22         76:22           deals         11:12:83:5,7         15:4,23:20:24         distinguish         62:11           decide         41:16         different         distinguish         62:11           78:19         decided         76:17         distinguish         62:11           78:19         decided         76:17         distinguish         62:11           78:19         decided         76:17         distinguish         62:11           78:19         decided         77:12         difficult         76:17           decided         77:12         distributed         74:3         62:17           deciding         7:13         15:3         74:	E
day         40:20         49:12 65:4,19         dispute         82:1           days         81:9         68:21 69:6         31:15         each           37:1         DEPOSITION         difference         43:1 76:17         disseminated         6:25 19           deal         1:14 5:1,9,11         differences         76:22         disseminatio         31:12,           dealing         8:16,19,23         differences         n         54:11         53:22 8           deals         11,12 83:5,7,         different         distinguish         earlie           51:3         8,10,11,12,         44:25 49:7         distinguish         62:1,1           78:19         depositions         15:1,6         distinguish         62:1,7           78:19         describe         Diotima         distributed         34:15           78:19         describe         Diotima         distributed         34:15           78:19         described         Direct         15:3         74:3         easy           16:517:19         32:6 33:2         described         DIRECT         DISTRICT         69:3           32:6 33:2         described         32:12 3         doctorate         ducat <th< td=""><td></td></th<>	
day         40:20         49:12 65:4,19 68:21 69:6 73:13         dispute 31:15 disseminated 54:5         82:1           days         81:9         difference 43:1 76:17 disseminated 54:5         49:12 65:4,19 disseminated 54:5         6:25 19:4:1           deal         1:14 5:1,9,11 9:9 50:19 6:7,20 7:3,18 dealing 14:20         8:16,19,23 34:19 81:2,5, 11,12 83:5,7, 12 41:20         difference 76:22 different 15:4,23 20:24 different 17:10 depositions 6:22 7:12,14 decided 78:19 decided 78:19 decided 7:10 describe 7:13 described 6:22 7:12,14 described 7:13 described 6:23 32:6 33:2 decision 8:11 32:9 described 6:23 decision 8:11 32:9 defendant 6:23 decision 8:11 32:9 defendant 6:22 6:12 63:9 decided 6:22 6:13 17         Diotima distributed 1:2 document 16:11 decided 1:2 71:17 document 17:17 document 15:13 document 16:18, 8:2:9         DINTRICT document 16:18 document 16:18, 8:2:19,20           Defendants 1:1 2:11 5:22 6:13 17         design 23:2,9 31:24 document 16:18, 42:20           1:1 2:11 5         decoument 16:18, 8:9	
62:13 82:18         deponent         68:21 69:6         31:15         each           37:1         DEPOSITION         difference         43:1 76:17         disseminated         6:25 1!           deal         1:14 5:1,9,11         differences         76:22         disseminatio         31:15           dealing         8:16,19,23         differences         76:22         54:11         40:23 4           deals         11,12 83:5,7,         different         distinguishe         62:1,1           51:3         8,10,11,12,         44:25 49:7         distinguishe         62:1,1           78:19         depositions         6:22 7:12,14         difficult         53:17         62:1,1           7:10         describe         Diotima         74:3         easy           16:5 17:19         32:6 33:2         described         DIRECT         11:1 6:11         Educat           32:13         description         3:10,22 4:2         directed         1:2         71:17           6:22         64:4         direction         10:13         42:20           doctorate         62:11         23:2,9 31:24         document         16,18,           1:1 2:11         5:22         31:2,9         32:19,20         4	
days         81:9         73:13         difference         54:5         29:7,1           deal         1:14 5:1,9,11         difference         43:1 76:17         disseminated         6:25 19:7,1           dealing         8:16,19,23         differences         n         40:23 4           dealing         11,12 83:5,7,         different         distinguishe         arlie           deals         8,10,11,12,         44:25 49:7         distinguishe         62:1,1           51:3         44,16         differently         distinguishi         62:1,1           78:19         decide         depositions         15:1,6         distinguishi         62:1,1           7:10         describe         Diotima         74:3         easier           decided         7:13         DIRECT         DISTRICT         69:3           16:5 17:19         32:6 33:2         described         DIRECT         DIVISION         4:8 10           8:11 32:9         defendant         6:22 12 63:9         directed         1:2         71:17           defendants         6:21         43:2:19,20         44:12.2	
37:1         DEPOSITION         difference         43:1 76:17         disseminatio         29:7,1           9:9 50:19         6:7,20 7:3,18         differences         n         40:23           dealing         8:16,19,23         differences         n         53:22           14:20         34:19 81:2,5, 11,12 83:5,7, 8,10,11,12, 14,16         different 15:4,23 20:24         distinguishe 62:1,1           decide         depositions 6:22 7:12,14         difficult 53:17         62:1,1           78:19         decided 8:7,12         difficult 52:16 62:2         distributed 75:19           decided         7:13         describe Diotima 15:3         74:3         easy           16:5 17:19 32:6 33:2         described 6:23         DIRECT 74:3         DISTRICT 69:3         69:3            decision 8:11 32:9         3:10,22 4:2         directed 32:13         1:1 6:11         Educat 71:17           defendant 6:22         64:4         direction 23:2,9 31:24         doctorate 10:13         document 22:20:42:20           Defendants 1:1 2:11 5:22 6:13 17         62:11         82:9         32:19,20         44:12,	0 1
deal         1:145:1,9,11         43:176:17         disseminatio         31:12,40           dealing         8:16,19,23         76:22         54:11         53:22 8           deals         11,1283:5,7,12         different         15:4,23 20:24         distinguish         earlie           decide         78:19         depositions         6:22 7:12,14         difficult         76:178           decided         8:7,12         difficult         ng         57:19           decided         7:10         describe         Diotima         distributed         34:15           7:10         describe         Diotima         distributed         34:15           7:10         describe         Diotima         DISTRICT         69:3           16:5 17:19         32:6 33:2         described         32:23         DIVISION         4:8 10           8:11 32:9         defendant         6:23         32:13         doctorate         educat           0:22         0efendants         design         32:2,9 31:24         document         16,18,           1:12:11         5:22 6:13 17         72:20         44:12.2	
9:9 50:19         6:7,20 7:3,18         differences         76:22         n         53:22 8         62:1,1         53:17         62:1,1         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         62:1,1         76:1 78         62:1,1         62:1,1         74:3         74:3         74:3         74:3         74:3         74:3	
dealing         8:16,19,23         76:22         54:11         53:228           deals         34:19,81:2,5,         different         distinguishe         arlie           51:3         8,10,11,12,         44:25,49:7         d         53:17         62:1,1           decide         depositions         6:22,7:12,14         difficult         ng         57:19           decided         8:7,12         52:16,62:2         43:9,10         easier           7:10         describe         Diotima         74:3         easy           16:5,17:19         32:6,33:2         described         DIRECT         DISTRICT         69:3           32:6,33:2         described         6:23         DIVISION         4:810           8:11,32:9         Description         32:13         doctorate         educat           defendant         6:22         64:4         directed         10:13         42:20           Defendants         design         23:2,9,31:24         document         16,18,           1:12:11         15:22         61:13,17	
dealing       34:19 81:2,5,       different       37:14         deals       11,12 83:5,7,       44:25 49:7       d         51:3       8,10,11,12,       44:25 49:7       d         decide       depositions       15:1,6       53:17       62:1,1         78:19       decided       8:7,12       difficult       ng       57:19         decided       8:7,12       difficult       34:15       easier         7:10       describe       Diotima       distributed       34:15         16:5 17:19       described       15:3       DISTRICT       69:3         16:5 17:19       32:6 33:2       described       53:17       69:3         decision       15:3       DISTRICT       69:3         15:2       3:4 6:17 9:23       DIVISION       4:8 10         71:17       32:13       doctorate       4:8 10         6:22       64:4       32:13       doctorate       60:23         Defendants       62:11       32:2,9 31:24       document       16,18,         1:12       32:19,20       44:12,	
deals       11,1283:5,7,       15:4,2320:24       distinguishe       37:14:62:11         decide       8,10,11,12,       44:2549:7       d       62:1,1         decide       depositions       15:1,6       distinguishi       62:1,1         decided       78:19       describe       difficult       ng       57:19         decided       7:10       describe       Diotima       15:3       74:3       easy         deciding       7:13       DISTRICT       69:3         16:517:19       described       DIRECT       DISTRICT       69:3         decision       Description       3:46:179:23       DIVISION       4:810         8:1132:9       defendant       design       32:13       doctorate       educat         6:22       64:4       design       23:2,931:24       document       16,18,         Defendants       1:12:11       2:20:6:13:17         1:12:11       2:20:6:13:17       4:20:20:40         1:2       4:2:20:40         1:2       4:2:20:40         1:2       4:2:20:40         1:2       4:2:20:40         1:10:11       1:10:11         1:10:12       1:10:11       1:10:11 <td></td>	
deals       8,10,11,12,       44:25 49:7       d       62:1,1         51:3       decide       depositions       15:1,6       distinguishi       62:1,1         78:19       decided       8:7,12       difficult       ng       57:19         decided       7:10       describe       Diotima       15:3       distributed       34:15         deciding       7:13       DIRECT       DISTRICT       69:3         decision       Described       0:23       DIVISION       4:8 10         8:11 32:9       defendant       6:21 2 63:9       directed       1:2       71:17         design       43:2,9 31:24       document       10:13       42:20 4         design       23:2,9 31:24       document       16,18,         3:2:26:13       17       17       17	
decide       14,16       differently       53:17       76:178         78:19       depositions       15:1,6       distinguishi       early         decided       8:7,12       52:16 62:2       43:9,10       easier         7:10       describe       Diotima       74:3       easy         16:5 17:19       described       DIRECT       DISTRICT       69:3         decision       0:23       3:46:17 9:23       1:16:11       Educat         defendant       6:23       3:10,22 4:2       directed       1:2       71:17         defendant       6:22       32:13       doctorate       educat         0efendants       1:11 2:11       62:11       23:2,9 31:24       document       16,18,         1:12:11       5:22 6:13 17       32:19,20       44:12,	
decide         depositions         distinguishi         early           78:19         6:227:12,14         difficult         ng         57:19           decided         8:7,12         52:16 62:2         43:9,10         easier           7:10         describe         Diotima         74:3         easy           16:517:19         described         52:16 62:2         DISTRICT         69:3           decision         6:23         3:4 6:17 9:23         1:1 6:11         Educat           defendant         62:12 63:9         directed         1:2         71:17           defendants         64:4         direction         10:13         42:20           Defendants         1:1 2:11         23:2,9 31:24         document         16,18,           1:12:11         62:11         82:9         32:19,20         44:12,	
78:19       6:22 7:12,14       difficult       ng       57:19         7:10       describe       Diotima       distributed       34:15         16:5 17:19       describe       Diotima       74:3       easy         16:5 17:19       described       DIRECT       DISTRICT       69:3         decision       Description       3:4 6:17 9:23       1:1 6:11       Educat         8:11 32:9       defendant       directed       1:2       71:17         6:22       64:4       direction       10:13       42:20 4         Defendants       design       23:2,9 31:24       document       16,18,         1:11 2:11       62:11       82:9       32:19,20       44:12,	. <del>-</del>
decided       8:7,12       52:16 62:2       43:9,10       easier         7:10       describe       7:13       15:3       74:3       easy         16:5 17:19       described       52:16 62:2       Diotima       74:3       easy         15:3       DIRECT       DISTRICT       69:3         decision       Description       22:23       DIVISION       4:8 10         8:11 32:9       3:10,22 4:2       directed       1:2       71:17         6:22       64:4       direction       10:13       42:20 4         Defendants       1:11 2:11       62:11       23:2,9 31:24       document       16,18,         1:12 2:11       32:2 6:13 17       32:19,20       44:12,	
deciding         describe         Diotima         distributed         34:15           16:5 17:19         described         5:3         DIRECT         6:23         6:23         DISTRICT         69:3           decision         Description         3:46:179:23         DIVISION         4:8 10           3:10,224:2         directed         1:2         71:17           defendant         6:22         64:4         direction         10:13         42:20           Defendants         1:11 2:11         62:11         23:2,9 31:24         document         16,18,           5:22 6:13 17         17         32:19,20         44:12,	
deciding       7:13       15:3       74:3       easy         16:5 17:19       32:6 33:2       described       6:23       DIRECT       DISTRICT       69:3         decision       Description       3:4 6:17 9:23       1:1 6:11       Educat         8:11 32:9       3:10,22 4:2       directed       1:2       71:17         defendant       62:12 63:9       32:13       doctorate       educat         6:22       design       23:2,9 31:24       document       16,18,         1:11 2:11       62:11       82:9       32:19,20       44:12,	
16:5 17:19       described       6:23       DIRECT       DISTRICT       69:3         decision       0escription       3:46:179:23       1:16:11       Educated         10:22       0escription       3:10,224:2       0escription       1:2       71:17         defendant       6:22       0escription       32:13       0escription       1:2       71:17         defendants       6:22       0esign       10:13       10:13       16,18,12         1:11 2:11       0esign       23:2,931:24       0esign       16,18,12         1:12       1esign       16,18,12       16,18,12         1:12       1esign       16,18,12         1:12       1esign       16,18,12         1:12       1esign       16,18,12         1:12       1esign       1esign	
32:6 33:2       6:23       3:4 6:17 9:23       1:1 6:11       Educat         8:11 32:9       3:10,22 4:2       directed       1:2       71:17         6:22       64:4       direction       10:13       42:20         0efendants       1:11 2:11       23:2,9 31:24       0cument       16,18,         1:12:11       3:2:13       3:2:19,20       0cument       16,18,	
decision       Description       3:40.179.23       DIVISION       4:810         8:11 32:9       3:10,22 4:2       directed       1:2       71:17         6:22       64:4       direction       10:13       42:20 4         Defendants       1:11 2:11       23:2,9 31:24       document       16,18,         5:22 6:13 17       62:11       82:9       32:19,20       44:12,	
8:11 32:9     3:10,22 4:2     directed     1:2     71:17       6:22     64:4     direction     10:13     42:20       Defendants     1:11 2:11     23:2,9 31:24     document     16,18, 32:19,20       5:22 6:13 17     42:20     44:12, 42:20	
defendant       62:12 63:9         6:22       64:4         Defendants       design         1:11 2:11       62:11         62:11       23:2,9 31:24         82:9       document         32:19,20       44:12,	: 9
6:22 64:4 direction 23:2,9 31:24 document 16,18, 5:22,6:13, 17 62:11 82:9 document 32:19,20 44:12,	
Defendants     design     23:2,931:24     document     16,18,       5:226:13 17     62:11     82:9     32:19,20     44:12,	
1:11 2:11 62:11 62:11 23:2,9 31:24 document 32:19,20 44:12,	
$\begin{bmatrix} 5 \cdot 22 & 6 \cdot 13 & 17 \end{bmatrix}$ $\begin{bmatrix} 02 \cdot 11 & 82 \cdot 9 & 32 \cdot 19 & 20 \end{bmatrix}$ $\begin{bmatrix} 44 \cdot 12 & 9 & 44 \cdot 12 & 9 & 9 \end{bmatrix}$	
1 3 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4	
24 7:1,7,9,17   detail   discern   34:20 72:9,22   40:10,	24 47:9
$\begin{vmatrix} 8:4 \end{vmatrix}$ $\begin{vmatrix} 5/:10.80:6 \\ 62:2.4 \end{vmatrix}$ documents $\begin{vmatrix} 62:6,1 \\ 63:2.4 \end{vmatrix}$	9,24
Defendant's determinatio disclosure 74.24 25.64:	1, 1, 12, 15
3:10 4:10   n   5:4 83:1,4,9   doing   66:18	-,, - 5
33:22 59:5,6   20:13 26:6,13   discount   30:23	
definitely   59:23 65:1   83:17   down   2:3 5:2	
determine discovery 82:7	
definition 9:4 38:16 7:3,12 8:7, downtown 10:13	
39:21 68:15, 12,16,23 58:7	
23 72:24 diagraged dul-	) / • <del>'1</del>
degree $\begin{vmatrix} \text{determined} \\ 10.6 \end{vmatrix}$ $\begin{vmatrix} \text{determined} \\ 14.5 \end{vmatrix}$ $\begin{vmatrix} \text{Eight} \\ 6.3 \end{vmatrix}$	J / • <del>'1</del>
17:23 20:19 discussing discussing	J / • <del>'</del> ±
56:12 80:9, 63:6	
10.13 39.2,3 10,14	
$\begin{vmatrix} 70:19 \\ \end{vmatrix}$ determining $\begin{vmatrix} \text{Discussion} \\ \end{vmatrix}$ $\begin{vmatrix} 67\cdot15 & 68\cdot6 \\ \end{vmatrix}$ $\begin{vmatrix} 61:5,2 \\ \end{vmatrix}$	57:19

67:15 79:9	57:13,18	24:7,11,13	   examining	15
electronic	62:13,14	28:23 35:7	51:14	EXHIBITS
29:17 32:7,10	ending	Ereserve's	example	3:9,214:1,
39:15 46:2	10:19 11:2	34:25	20:25 24:7	10,11 34:11
48:7 68:18	57:13,15	especially	43:6 44:22	expect
76:18	engaged	62:2	45:20,2262:5	56:10,11
electronical	40:15	ESQ	63:15	expectation
ly	enough	2:3,8,13	examples	29:16,21 55:8
30:8 74:10	33:12	Esquire	60:19 61:12,	56:14,16,18
76:12	ensued	83:10,11,12,	16	experience
ELMORE	33:10 73:24	14,16	exception	18:22
2:3 5:24	entering	essay	45:6,15	expertise
E-mail	30:24	15:21 16:2	excerpt	54:3
3:23 4:3 7:7	entitled	essays	12:15 13:19,	expires
8:5,14,17	14:9	15:19	23 14:14	58:21
9:13 70:5,10,	entity	essentially	16:6,14 18:16	explicitly
12 71:5	83:8	32:21 36:25	19:24,25 20:14,21	64:3
embrace	entries	establish	24:10,25 25:2	expressed
52:20	17:22	31:13	68:280:10	7:1 37:6,13
Emory	entry	et	excerpts	expression
57:2	39:24	1:10	17:19 18:11	52:4
employ	envision	Ethics	20:3,623:25	extent
57:12 82:15	47:22 59:20	3:16 12:16	24:8 80:14	6:7 28:3
employed	envisioning	49:1,3	excuse	48:16 65:8
56:22	49:8	event	28:19	F
employer	ERes	78:15	exhaustive	
83:6	33:18 35:15	Evidence	45:16 60:21	<b>F</b> 82:1
employment	Ereserve	7:20 82:12	  Exhibit	
10:19 11:2	17:12,20	evidentiary	3:10,224:2	fact
54:22,24	18:11 19:9	8:18	11:9 12:20	38:11,20 39:5 40:5,14 41:12
55:3,11	20:3 21:22	evolved	14:13 16:13	52:13
56:12,15	22:3,14,24	29:25	26:7 27:5,9	
employs	23:14,19	exactly	28:11 30:17	<b>Factor</b> 19:13 31:22
57:11	24:5,21 26:3	70:6,10	31:1,9 32:25	46:23 59:10,
enacted	29:9,18 30:24	-	33:15,23	14 60:17,18
71:2	33:3 34:22	<b>EXAMINATION</b> 3:4,79:23	34:19 36:2,7	62:7,20 63:2,
encourage	36:10,18	80:3	37:20,21 38:1 39:11 40:11	5 64:19,22,25
20:2,5	37:14 38:3 43:14 66:10		41:15 42:18	66:25 67:4
end	68:5 74:11	EXAMINATIONS 3:1	48:5 50:11,14	68:12,24 74:4
54:22,25	80:7,18		53:14 59:4,6	78:4,9,10,14
55:3,11		examined 6:3	69:18 71:10,	79:4
56:12,15	Ereserves	0.3	ĺ	

43:166:12 78:10,11,21 79:2 facts 52:1,9 factual 59:1760:2,3 Fair 3:1416:4,9,	11:4 12:3,5, 9,12,14 16:6 17:3,14,15 19:24 20:10, 17,19 23:16 24:4 25:10 27:14 28:11 30:14,16 31:2,5 32:23 37:15 41:21 42:11 55:14,	Fifth 2:8 figure 53:255:16 FILE 1:5 filing 9:2017:7	focusing 37:20 focussing 15:2,4 follow 23:1,6 followed	32:11 full 10:3 31:20 fully 7:12 FULTON 82:4
43:1 66:12 78:10,11,21 79:2 facts 52:1,9 factual 59:17 60:2,3 Fair 3:14 16:4,9,	17:3,14,15 19:24 20:10, 17,19 23:16 24:4 25:10 27:14 28:11 30:14,16 31:2,5 32:23 37:15 41:21	2:8  figure 53:255:16  FILE 1:5 filing	37:20 focussing 15:2,4 follow 23:1,6	10:3 31:20 <b>fully</b> 7:12 <b>FULTON</b>
78:10,11,21 1 79:2 1 facts 52:1,9 2 factual 3 59:17:60:2,3 3 Fair 3:14:16:4,9, 4	19:24 20:10, 17,19 23:16 24:4 25:10 27:14 28:11 30:14,16 31:2,5 32:23 37:15 41:21	53:255:16 FILE 1:5 filing	15:2,4 follow 23:1,6	fully 7:12 FULTON
79:2 facts 52:1,9 factual 59:17 60:2,3 Fair 3:14 16:4,9,	17,19 23:16 24:4 25:10 27:14 28:11 30:14,16 31:2,5 32:23 37:15 41:21	53:255:16 FILE 1:5 filing	15:2,4 follow 23:1,6	7:12 FULTON
facts 52:1,9 factual 59:17 60:2,3 Fair 3:14 16:4,9,	24:4 25:10 27:14 28:11 30:14,16 31:2,5 32:23 37:15 41:21	FILE 1:5 filing	<b>follow</b> 23:1,6	7:12 FULTON
52:1,9  factual 59:17 60:2,3  Fair 3:14 16:4,9,	27:14 28:11 30:14,16 31:2,5 32:23 37:15 41:21	1:5 filing	23:1,6	FULTON
factual 33 59:17 60:2,3 33 Fair 3:14 16:4,9, 4	30:14,16 31:2,5 32:23 37:15 41:21	filing	-	
59:17 60:2,3 3 <b>Fair</b> 3:14 16:4,9, 4	31:2,5 32:23 37:15 41:21	_	followed	182:4
Fair 3:14 16:4,9, 4	37:15 41:21	9:20 17:7		
3:14 16:4,9, 4	-		27:24	further
0 = - = 0 = // /	42:11 55:14	fill	following	24:5 82:12
	<i>'</i>	42:10	27:16 32:20	G
/ /	19 68:6 71:19	filled	71:3,572:6	gaining
	80:11	17:13,16	73:7,15 83:8	54:13
1	falls	27:21,24,25	follows	
	38:7	41:17 42:7	6:4	GaState00656
31:1,4,11, 14,05,33:33	family	filling	foregoing	25-627
14,25 32:22	61:14	42:6	82:6,10	3:25
38:7,8,12, 15,17,19 <b>f</b>	far		•	GaState00661
10,1,10	16:24	films	form	82-183
39.0,10,22	favor	60:20 61:19	26:10 42:6,10 48:7 50:3	3:13
	59:11 64:22	final	76:18,19	
1 ' ' ' 1	66:12 67:1	44:22	83:4,8	<b>general</b> 69:13 73:7
1	78:6,10 79:2	financial	-	76:9
117 47.05		56:19 83:17	for-profit	
-	favoring	find	43:6	generally
11,23,24 61:4	78:21	44:21 60:22	forth	61:15 65:18
63:264:11 22 F	Fax	fine	24:16 39:23	67:24 69:1
65:15 66:7,8,	2:6,10,15	77:23,24	forward	72:8
	Federal		59:2	George
	7:20,2181:7	finishing	fourth	38:4
	fees	10:16	78:9,14 79:4	GEORGIA
	77:9,15	first	•	1:1,9,22 2:5,
1 1 5	fell	6:3 8:23	Fragility	14 5:7,13
	38:17 39:10,	12:1,23 17:17	3:14,16 12:16	6:12 10:15,19
l	22	22:2 28:20	15:22 16:14	11:2,21,24
l <sub>-</sub> .   -		30:22 33:5	40:1 48:25	12:12 21:25
	felt	34:18 50:24	freshman	22:17,25
-	32:10,15,20	63:23 64:21	63:17	23:14 25:9,17
	50:8	five	freshmen	27:17 29:18
	fiction	34:9,13 75:9	11:21	43:14,15,17,
Tarchirar	53:17 60:20	fixed	Friedman	22 44:7,11,15
52:17 53:4	61:20	74:16	1:24 5:17	45:25 46:2
Fall  f	field	focus	82:20 83:21	54:16,19,22
	50:8 54:2	13:12 15:3,7	fulfilled	55:1,3,23,24
	l	10.17 10.0	-arrrrea	56:15,17,22,

23,2457:1,6,	73:9	12:25 13:2,3,	82:6	64:15
9,11,13,15	grant	16 15:15	   Hi	include
58:6,23 65:16	72:18	17:2,618:21,	35:11	68:10
69:1,16 70:19		25 21:5,8,15		
77:4,11 79:20	great	26:10 28:2,5,	highly	included
82:3 83:4,10	50:19	8 29:13,14	52:15 60:17,	69:17,23
Gillian	greater	33:14,16,20,	25 61:3,10,	including
	66:3	24 34:1,4,14	12,23,24	13:4,8 24:4
35:13 36:22	Greece	36:5 42:12,14	Honors	25:21 42:21
39:1 51:9,14	11:17	44:1 48:16	3:11 11:5,20,	46:19
53:1		50:3 65:8	22 63:17	INDEX
Given	Greek	71:9 73:17,20	hono	3:1,9,21 4:1
61:12 82:12	3:16 12:16	77:20 80:4,20	hope	
83:17	15:20 49:1,3		51:20 52:13	13:4,914:8
go	GSU	Harbin's	53:20	Indiana
13:17 28:23	28:23	25:24 30:13	hopefully	73:10
54:19 59:4	guess	67:5	52:10 54:7,13	indicate
64:21 69:9,13	9:19 23:12	hard	hour	18:15
73:17	33:23	30:5	8:8 12:10	indicated
		haven't	—	9:12 14:16
goal	guidelines	79:13		22:11 67:6
52:23	17:11 38:25		idea	
goals	39:10,22	head	35:22	individual
47:2,363:13	65:18,20,23	28:17 41:7,9	identificati	6:17
God	66:6 78:18	health		individuals
30:22	H	55:15 57:4	on 34:12 50:12	74:23
	hadn't	hear	71:11	inform
going 8:22 24:15	40:6	44:3		36:16
59:7 77:3			identify	
39.111.3	half	Hearing	34:20 71:15	informal
gone	8:8 10:22	18:19 82:12	illustrative	12:1
40:7 42:6	hand	Hearsay	60:21	information
46:16	11:8 12:19	18:20,23	  imagine	24:6,23 34:24
Goodness	14:12 34:18	heart	22:21 23:23	35:14 46:6
3:14,16 12:16	71:13	15:9,17 16:2	43:261:2	in-service
16:14 40:1	happen	held	65:21 67:12	70:16
48:25	80:16	5:11		
			impact	instance
Gotchal	happened	help	78:14	44:14,16,18
0.1	18:22 33:5	78:20	impasse	59:21 63:1
GOTSHAL	happening	Henry	55:13 56:1,9	64:11 78:5
2:7	69:2	2:18 5:15	implicit	instantly
Grace	HARBIN	her	64:4	72:20
50:24	2:13 3:4,7	47:21,22		Instead
graduate	5:21 7:23	48:20 53:5	important	15:2
10:9,10 46:5	9:5,8,21,24		14:5,19 62:6,	institution
-0 , 10 10 5	5,5,21,21	hereby	15 63:1,7	Inscreamen
1				

43:10,16	  interpretati	2:13 5:21	know	last
institutions	ons	36:4	7:15 8:2 13:9	7:4,613:7
54:24	52:19	joining	25:18 32:23	31:20 78:3
instruct		59:2	35:24,25 36:1	later
23:5	<pre>interpreted 43:5</pre>	joint	44:24 49:17,	67:16
instructed		9:19	21,2253:2,3,	law
21:22 23:4	<pre>interpreting 53:4</pre>	JONATHAN	6,25 56:19	22:13 26:23
instruction		2:8 5:25	57:9 63:13,	51:8
78:21	interprets	jonathanbloo	15,16,22,24	lawfully
	40:20		65:12 66:1 67:17,25 68:3	19:1
instructiona	introduce	m@weil.com 2:10	75:11 77:12,	
1	5:18 7:17		21 79:17	<b>lawyer</b> 26:19,20
43:20 44:9	10:2	journal		,
instructions	introduced	21:1,12	knowledge	lays
23:7	67:13	judge	26:17	17:18
instructor	investigate	20:18	KRUGMAN	Leading
43:17 73:10	68:19	Judicial	2:3 3:6 5:23	13:15 15:14
insurance	investigatin	5:6 83:4	6:5 9:1,6,11, 22 12:23	17:4
55:15 57:5	q	Julie	13:1,15	learn
intellectual	69:11	1:24 5:17	15:12,14	70:3
27:3	investigatio	82:20 83:21	17:1,418:19,	learned
intended	_	July	23 21:19	69:16,19
6:87:13	n 60.15 00	35:2 36:12	26:16 28:4,7,	learning
11:23 46:24	68:15,23	37:1	10 33:9,11,	69:21
47:9,17,21	irrelevant	Just	15,19,21,25	lease
48:20 62:19,	79:4	7:25 8:2,17	34:2,5,8,13,	58:16,19
23 63:4,11,	irrespective	13:12 17:21	15,17 36:3,6,	least
12,18 64:14	9:4	23:3 28:2	7 42:13,18	48:6 49:23
intent	issue	50:18 55:15	44:2 49:17	53:20 65:15
7:19:17	9:3 56:4	71:13 75:1	50:14 65:12	71:18 74:9,19
32:11,16,18	issues	77:20 79:17,	71:13,15 74:2 77:23 80:2	75:19 79:5
intention	9:7 34:23	18 80:5		leave
32:5 49:18	35:8 36:20,21	justified	krugman@bmel	56:23 57:2
50:2,10	51:4 55:15	78:23	aw.com	leaving
interested	56:19 63:9	K	2:6	58:23
11:14 18:12	J	keep	L	left
82:16	jharbin@ksla	12:21 32:1,14	laid	47:10
interpret	w.com	kin	63:10	legal
63:8	2:15	82:13	laptop	26:21 48:17
interpretati	job	KING	30:2	56:19 70:19
on	10:20,25	2:12 5:12,21	laptops	less
53:6,7		7:9	30:6	13:20
	JOHN	-		-5 25

	l		l	I
let's	11:16	14:1,25 42:1	66:21,23	mid-May
34:2	litigation	59:2 72:8,17	77:17	57:20
Library	83:7,18	lot	materials	mind
3:24 4:4 16:8	little	66:21	35:4 36:10	74:16 75:4,7,
20:12,20	9:9	Love	66:10 77:10	10
21:21 22:4,5,	live	3:12 11:5,15	matter	Miss
7,10,11,14	6:15	13:25 14:6	5:10 51:12,22	20:21
23:1,5,11,17	LLOYD	35:4 49:9	matters	Mitchell
24:5,16,19	1:15 3:2,24	63:16	53:21	58:5
25:14 26:2	4:4,65:1,10	Love's	  mean	
34:21,24	6:27:18	35:13 36:24	22:4,724:4	MIXSON 2:35:24
35:7,10,18	8:16,25 9:25	lower	25:18 26:22	
36:9,12,15,	10:4 11:9	19:14	33:21 35:24	moment
19 37:7,13 38:2,7,12,18	12:20 14:13	Luck	40:18,20,22	55:13
39:240:4,12	16:13 34:4,17	3:16 12:16	41:24 42:17	most
68:17 69:12	35:11 36:13	15:22	43:2,4,25	15:1,3 40:14
77:280:6,9,	74:2 81:2		44:8 45:1,14,	moving
13	Lloyd's		17 47:14 48:5	10:24
library's	9:18	making	49:20 50:6,21	multiple
28:23 37:15	LLP	15:21,25	52:7,8,24 53:755:10,13	42:21 45:7
license	2:3,12	MANGES	56:11,17 57:8	46:19
21:11 72:25	local	2:7 6:1	58:25 60:17,	music
	7:22	MARK	19,22 65:18,	60:20 61:19
licensing 68:10,15,19,	Located	1:85:11	20 66:20	must
21 69:4,7	58:9	33:21 34:2,8,	68:25 70:4,11	28:24
72:15	logistical	9,10	71:1,3 75:3,9	N
likely	80:6	marked	76:25 78:17	N.E
40:6 70:5,9	long	11:8 12:19	meaning	1:21 2:13
	10:14 13:9	14:12 16:12	7:20 18:8	
limited 8:7	28:6 55:24	32:24 33:16, 24 34:11,18	19:7	N.W
	64:6	50:11 69:18	means	2:4
link	longer	71:10	63:8,19,23	name
28:23 70:9	45:18 65:14		meet	5:15 10:3
links	73:20	market 18:3,519:13	12:9	narrow
71:3,5	look	67:4,7,10	meeting	64:2,8
listed	13:7 14:8	68:9,10 74:4	70:18	narrowly
29:5 30:17	27:5 28:11	Martha	member	66:17
31:1 40:11	37:19,20	32:24 39:25	69:14	nature
61:16	44:24 71:6			6:23 11:19
lists	looked	material 17:12 20:6	mentally 64:12 79:10	24:22
29:8	14:4 15:2	23:18,20 24:6		necessarily
literature	looking	32:10 46:8	mentioned	46:9,10
	LOOKTING		50:18 61:25	l

necessary	nontransform	Nussbaum	obviously	23 61:9 62:16
46:24 47:8	ative	3:17 15:25	9:3 16:21	66:5 67:4
62:18,23	48:15 49:16,	21:21 22:12	occasion	70:18 73:13
63:3,11 64:13	25	26:1 32:24	23:12	74:19,25
Need	N o n -	33:3 39:25	occur	75:25 76:3,11
3:24 35:13		41:16 42:10	23:22	77:5 78:2,24 80:20
36:23 57:10	Transformati	47:3,4,6,8,	offer	
needed	ve	16,20,21	52:18	Once
24:23 35:18	47:12	48:4,20 49:6,		12:10 77:25
negotiations	NORTHERN	7 50:8 61:10	offered	one-credit
54:23 55:2,12	1:16:11	68:16 73:1	6:8 9:3 41:2	11:22
	noted	Nussbaum's	53:8	one-off
neither	62:16	15:19 18:12	official	12:7
49:15 81:9	nothing	19:5 20:21	1:9	one's
never	25:18	47:24 48:10,	Oh	13:1 54:11
20:11 25:16,		14,24 49:10,	13:18 28:19,	78:6
20 60:25	noting 34:22	18 50:2,9	21 31:17	on-line
New		61:14 62:15	36:14 73:21	72:20
2:9 10:24	novel	65:3 66:21 67:13,15,18,	Okay	
11:23 25:8,11	52:18,22,24	20	6:5 9:21	opaque
47:11 66:6	53:7		10:5,8,14,	56:20
69:16,21	novels	o	17,2111:1,4,	operate
70:3,7,10,	60:20 61:19	O.C.G.A	12,19 12:11,	79:6
15,20 71:7	November	81:8 83:13	14 13:19,22	opportunitie
72:6 79:19	16:16,19 17:7	object	14:8,16 15:8,	ន
night	26:8 27:9,13	6:77:169:2	18 17:21	69:4
7:6	42:1,462:18,	26:10 48:16	18:2,25 19:6,	opportunity
nine-month	21	50:3 65:8	12,22 20:12,	59:1
57:14	number	objected	18 21:5,7,15,	
nods	12:21,22	23:17	20 23:20	order 12:22 31:13
28:17 41:7,9	23:15 28:15		26:16 27:12,	34:22 38:15
nonfiction	50:21 53:25	Objection 13:15:15:12	18 28:14	
51:19,21	74:16,23	17:1,418:19,	30:4,21,25	orient
53:16 59:17,	75:2,4,6,10,	23 28:2 29:13	31:8 32:17 34:13 35:23	11:23
22 60:2,5,6,	22,2376:4,5,	42:12	36:21 37:12,	orientation
24 61:3,22,23	11		19 38:24	63:19
	numbers	objectives	39:1,24 43:12	Original
nonprofit 42:20 43:2,5,	33:15	62:7 63:2,7	44:2 45:21,24	4:10,11 18:5
15,18,23	numerous	64:2,17	47:10 50:14	19:14 51:22
44:12,19 45:4	74:3,9,12,	obligations	51:18 53:24	53:21 67:5,7,
46:18	15,17 75:1,4,	57:1	54:21 55:1,18	10 74:4
	5,20,2376:2,	obtain	56:1,957:4	originally
nonteaching 43:8	3,10	29:17 54:16	59:7,14 60:4,	17:10 42:6,7
10.0		57:25	<u> </u>	
ı				

outlined 26:14 32:8 33:1 38:15 39:9 outnumber 78:22 over	16,17,24 39:1150:24 53:10,13 71:2472:3,5, 10 pages 13:9,14,20	<pre>pass-fail 11:23 19:21 Password 4:4 19:10 28:24 36:13, 16,19 password-</pre>	3:12 11:6 35:5 62:3,5 <b>Philosophy</b> 3:17 11:16 12:17 14:5,20 15:20 51:3,5, 17 53:3	10:22  Plato 15:3 39:16  Plato's 13:25 14:2, 23,25 15:6 49:4
13:9 35:12 57:12 72:10 overall 12:11 19:22 78:15 79:4 overlapping 33:13 overview	72:10 82:10  paid 77:15  Palm 22:18,22 23:3,4  Palm's 23:2,7	protected 19:10 Peachtree 1:21 2:4,13 5:12 people 34:25 57:11, 12 75:8,9	Photocopy 3:15 phrase 40:21 physical 20:24 33:4 39:8,20 75:16,18	<pre>plays 60:20 61:19 please 5:18 10:3,8 27:5 32:1 35:12 37:5 poetry 60:20 61:20</pre>
11:11 28:13, 14 owner 77:8 owns 19:1	<pre>paper 28:25 76:19 paragraph 31:20 parenthetica 1ly 61:17</pre>	<pre>percent 13:20 66:4 percentage 65:25 66:2 period 57:17</pre>	<pre>physically 38:23 61:5 64:12 79:9 piece 14:5 place 16:1 32:7</pre>	<pre>point 8:115:21 25:235:10 67:1672:17 74:25 policies 77:12</pre>
OXFORD  1:4  P  P  1:8  pack  75:11,13  76:15,24  77:3,10,17  packs  77:7,11,13	part 15:10,17 44:25 46:6 50:1 63:17,24 69:25 73:12 77:16 particular 20:14 44:14 45:24 46:18 49:24 65:14 79:11,12	permission 68:22 69:4 72:18,19,25 permissions 68:10,16 69:7 72:3 77:15 permitted 26:2 Perspectives 3:12 11:6 35:5	placed 18:11 placing 32:9 Plaintiff 13:17 Plaintiffs 1:62:25:24 6:1,68:8,15 Plaintiff's	Policy 4:7 25:9,11 65:16 66:7 69:16,21,25 70:3,8,10, 15,20,24 71:7,16,21 72:7 74:20 79:20 Political 50:25 51:6
Page 3:3,10,22,24 4:213:7 17:2519:12 24:7,9,11,12 28:18 29:5,8, 11 30:17 31:1,8 35:11, 12,13,14,19 36:23 37:8,	particularly 18:13 parties 55:4,5,6 82:14,15 83:7,17 party 81:983:7,15, 17	Ph.D 1:15 3:2 5:1 6:2 philosopher 51:15 philosophers 14:7 Philosophica 1	3:22 4:2,11 8:20 33:23 34:11,18 36:2,7 50:11 59:5 71:10 plan 9:17 planning 8:18 plans	<pre>portion 17:24 64:19, 25 65:4,6,14, 22 possibilitie s 68:20 possible 38:20 40:5</pre>

45:655:20, 23,2556:21 67:14 <b>possibly</b> 18:13 <b>post</b> 20:3,626:2 35:1436:22 80:19	presumably 6:13,16 45:10 previous 15:1 65:17, 20,23 66:6 primary 45:19 68:12 Princeton	81:2 professors 6:25 7:12 8:11 program 11:22 prohibited 83:13	1:5  published 20:25 50:19, 21 51:9 54:1 59:15,21 60:1,6,12,15  publisher 40:1 77:7	qualified 65:6 question 9:9 21:9 22:8 23:4 25:25 26:11 30:13 50:4 52:21 64:9 80:6
<pre>posted 23:1,14,18 24:1,6,21 36:10,18 37:14 38:3</pre>	10:7 73:8 print 29:22 72:15 printed 30:1,5	<pre>project 44:23,25 48:24 51:8 promotive 54:13</pre>	<pre>publishes 50:7 purchase 67:14,15 76:24</pre>	<pre>questioned 23:13 questions 67:5 80:8 82:8</pre>
68:471:6  posting 22:12  pp	prior 23:16 25:8, 10,13 32:23 71:19	property 27:3 proposed 80:10,14	<pre>purchased 19:1 67:17, 20,22 68:1,4 purchases 68:8</pre>	<pre>quite 56:12 64:7 65:3 quote 12:15, 17</pre>
3:19 practice 11:15 73:7 praiseworthy 53:8	privilege 28:5 probably 27:4 56:13 Problem	<pre>provide 6:15 11:25 34:24 46:5 57:23 58:1 63:18 83:11,</pre>	purchasing 18:13 purpose 13:22 14:17	12:15,17 R 82:1 raised
precisely 23:23 66:3 prefer 55:24	50:24  Procedure 7:21 73:12,16 81:8	provided 16:5 32:5 37:16 48:6 61:12 70:7	17:7,9 25:21 42:19 45:19 46:25 47:9,12 48:3 49:11 62:19,24	23:18 24:20, 25 25:1 51:4 raising 36:20
<pre>prepare 16:18 Present 2:17 9:17</pre>	proceed 6:57:13 produce 8:11 produced	75:21 76:14 <b>provides</b> 28:24 29:6 57:4	63:4,12,25 64:1,14 66:18 purposes 43:21 pursuant	Randy 9:15 range 6:10 rates
11:18 preserve 28:2 President 1:10 22:20 23:8	7:2 producing 7:11 Professor 5:9 7:18	providing 47:23 48:13 provost 21:25 22:16, 22 23:3,4,6 Provost's	5:46:2481:7 83:3 put 20:2324:8, 11,1233:2	83:17  rationale 39:8,21  reach 48:278:13
PRESS 1:4,55:10 40:2 presses 50:7	8:16,24 9:18, 25 34:17 35:11 36:13 43:16 48:13 74:2 80:5	23:2  publication 13:5,8,12 16:15  PUBLICATIONS	39:23 41:19 66:10 75:15 putting 17:12 65:21 Q	reached 56:5 read 13:24 18:10 30:2 32:19

34:15 68:2	20 70:5,10,	  referring	  remember	22:5 23:13
70:24 77:2	11,12,13,16,	21:12 29:4	25:11 65:19	24:1,10 37:14
readers	18,2371:1	62:4	71:5	68:17 73:4
15:1,3	72:5,8,9	reflected	remove	81:10
Reading	79:22	8:5,14 9:13	21:22 22:3,	requesting
3:19 18:12	received	29:11	14,23 23:5	38:3
19:16,19 20:6	7:710:12		'	Required
21:3 38:5	receives	reflection 49:9	removed 22:24	19:15,18
40:23 52:14	77:9			29:11 38:5
78:5 81:11	recitation	regard	renewed	78:4
readings	52:1,9	10:21	57:16	Research
17:17 28:15,	,	regarding	report	4:8 43:7
22,25 29:7,	recognize	31:15 36:9	16:8	44:25 45:8,9,
11,12 40:24		71:7	reported	11,1266:19
63:22 75:15,	recollection	regular	39:2 40:12	71:17
17,20,23,24	30:19 71:4	82:14	Reporter	research-
really	Reconfigurin	Regulations	5:4,17 33:8	46:10
9:6 49:22,25	g	5:5 83:3	34:7 71:8	resemblance
reason	50:25	REL1000	83:1,4,6,10,	61:14
61:9	record	4:4	15	
reasonably	5:15 33:10	related	reporter's	reserve 7:15,22 20:24
50:9 68:22	73:17,23,24	46:7 66:22,23	83:6	32:7,10 46:2
69:3,8	74:1 81:4	relates	Reporting	65:22 68:18
	records	27:14 47:25	5:6 83:3,5,	
reasoning	32:14		11,14,15	Reserves 3:24 4:4
26:14 32:6,8,	re-create	relating 35:3 47:7	represent	
11 33:1 38:15	16:23 17:9		82:10	reside
40:8,15,19,	42:3,4	relatively 12:1 58:10	representati	58:2
23 41:8 42:5,	REDIRECT		_	residence
8,946:16	3:7 80:3	relevant	<b>ve</b>   83:10	56:25 58:3
recall	reduced	29:1		resides
17:13 23:21,	82:9	reliance	represented	6:9
23,25 24:2		78:22	6:12 38:1 40:12	resolution
25:3,5,12,15		religion		56:5,7
27:4 30:25	evaluation	10:7 11:16	reputation	resolved
31:3 33:3,7	49:1	36:14 51:4,5	54:7	56:10
37:18 38:14,	reference	59:1 68:5	request	respect
21,25 39:7,8,	26:23 70:20	75:20	22:14 26:2	21:20 24:20
17,19,20	72:14	Religious	36:9,25	30:13 37:13
40:18,19 41:4	referenced	3:12 11:6	37:15,22 39:13 72:1,12	38:3 49:18
42:17 46:21	50:23 53:13	35:5 51:6	80:11	70:14 75:19
61:8 64:18 66:2,3 69:19,	referral	remaining		77:6 79:3
00.7,203.13,	83:7,15	41:10	requested	respond
	ı	ı	ı	ı

7:25	19:14 60:18	29:6	68:6	signing
responded	rights	scheduled	seminal	81:11
8:17 24:12	7:15,22	6:21 7:5	13:25	similar
64:9	Risa	scholar	seminar	15:21 24:22
response	22:18	54:1	11:25 63:18	61:15
8:20 25:24	Room	scholars	74:17	simply
30:12 67:5	1:21	52:14	senior	30:6 47:23
responses	Rose	scholarship	22:19	48:9,1251:25
14:2,3	35:13 36:22	45:12	sense	52:8
rest	39:251:9,14	scholarship-	52:17,25	Singer
17:20	53:1	_	sent	9:15
restate	rows	related	70:12	sir
22:8	19:14		September	22:9
restricted	Rule	<b>scope</b> 64:1,2,8	38:5,6	Sitting
19:6	81:7		sequentially	39:4,18 45:21
result	Rules	second 7:25 10:22	30:23	64:10
82:16	5:57:20,21,	17:25 10:22	serve	six
retain	22 81:8 83:3	29:5,853:9	79:23	34:10
31:4,12,24	s	73:18	services	size
reveal		see	83:5,11,14	24:25 25:1
27:19	S   1:24 82:20	18:5 28:16	set	74:21,22
review	83:21	29:2,3 31:16,	24:24	small
71:21 78:17	SAGE	19 38:9,10		11:25 12:22
81:10	1:5	42:23,24	setting 43:20	17:24 64:19,
reviewed		61:13 62:7,8		25 65:4,6,14,
16:9	<b>satisfied</b> 26:1 35:8	67:8 72:15,	shall	22 74:17
reviewing		21,2278:18,	83:4,8	social
72:5	<pre>satisfy 60:25</pre>	20	shoes	51:15
Rhetoric		seeing	41:20	soldier
10:13	<b>saying</b> 8:17 53:4	71:5	short	8:2
right	76:9	seen	73:21	Solutions
7:16 9:5,21		73:8	show	83:11,12,14,
12:25 17:21	<b>says</b> 18:4 28:22	selection	16:12 50:17	16
26:3 46:13	31:11 35:1	19:9 38:17	significance	somewhat
47:12 48:9		39:10,22	15:22 53:5	55:12
52:17,25	<b>scan</b> 37:5	47:3,5,6,8, 15	significant	soon
54:21 60:9,			48:19 49:13	55:20,23
11,18 63:24	<b>scenarios</b> 44:20 45:18	selections 17:20 47:5	53:2	56:12
64:8 66:1			significantl	sorry
76:7 77:5 81:10	Schaetzel 7:8 9:16	<b>semester</b> 32:23 55:21	У	31:959:6
		62:14 67:25	47:20 48:3	62:22 73:22
right-hand	schedule	1 02.14 07.23	I	l

sort	23:5,17 24:5,	83:5	3:24 4:4	23 58:24 59:1
43:8,9,10,11	20 35:15 36:9	Steve	51:1,12,22	system
45:1 47:20	80:9,14	7:8 9:16	53:21 66:19	22:25 23:14
57:16 62:4	stand	Stewart	submission	25:16 29:18
63:21 70:16	7:23		38:12	30:24 34:22
		2:18 5:16		43:15 46:3
sought 24:21	standard	stimulate	<pre>submitting 25:13</pre>	68:18 73:10,
24.21	73:12,15	18:3		11 74:11
source	start	stimulates	subpoena	80:7,18
83:7	54:25 55:14	18:2,567:7	6:10,14 79:24	
SPALDING	started	stops	subsequent	T
2:12 5:12,22	10:1	55:16	36:8	T
7:9	starting		substantive	82:1
speaking	10:20,25	stored	13:13	Table
61:25 63:10	72:17	17:14		3:17
		straightforw	Suite	tailored
special	starts	ard	2:4	
62:4	55:17	60:22	summarize	66:18
specialized	State	Street	10:8 11:12	take
26:17	1:9 6:6 10:3,	1:21 2:4,13	summer	8:1,15,18
specific	15,19 11:3,24	5:12 58:5	57:12,16	27:5 29:10
46:8 49:6	12:12 22:1,		supposedly	31:23 35:3
62:10 63:8	17,25 23:14	strong	7:19	39:17 53:19
75:4,6,10,15	25:9,17 27:17	59:1	-	57:23 60:9,19
specifically	43:15,17,22	student	sure	63:19 73:21
51:4 63:16	44:7,11,15	10:10 18:15	52:19 57:20	80:12
67:25 80:17	46:1 54:17,	67:17,19	64:7 65:11	taken
	19,2255:1,3,	68:1,3,7 73:9	73:19	7:4 9:2 26:25
specifics 65:19	23,2456:15,	students	surrounding	27:2 66:17
	22,23,24	11:24 12:2,4	35:9	82:7
specified	57:1,8,9,11,	18:10 19:11	sworn	taking
23:15	13 58:23 64:3	29:17,22,25	5:20 6:3	71:6 83:5,12
speculate	65:16 69:1,16	30:1,536:16	syllabi	talk
77:18,24	70:19 77:4,12	43:13,14	64:3	17:22
speculation	79:20 82:3	44:23 45:8		
50:1 65:9	stated	46:2,5 48:6	<b>Syllabus</b> 3:11 11:9,10	talking
Speech	45:15 62:11	61:7 62:13	21:2 28:12	76:3,5
3:18 14:9	63:6 76:1	63:18,22	29:6	talks
15:2,4,5	82:7	67:12,22		49:6
	STATES	68:18 74:10	Symposium	Tape
spirit	1:16:1083:4	75:21 76:4,	3:19 14:1,2,	5:8
52:21	State's	15,23	23,25	taught
spoke	11:22 29:18	subfactor	Syracuse	10:14 12:5,12
68:7	43:14 46:2	66:20	10:20,24,25	25:22 27:14
staff		Subject	55:2,13,18,	44:7 66:19
	stating			

68:5         text-based         three         49:9         82:9           teach         72:18         13:1 23:24         Tragedy         U           55:19 77:25         13:25         59:11 64:22         78:6,9         26:21 70:14,         Un-huh           10:18 42:21         43:6,18,21,         24:44:3,10,         15:20 45:2,7,1         17:12 80:21         Transcendence         59:9 72:4           55:14 56:24         55:15         time         transcendence         59:9 72:4         59:9 72:4           57:2 67:24         50:25         69:20 70:22         71         79:19         37:25 44:5           57:14 56:24         55:15         time         transcendence         59:9 72:4           51:15         theclogy         5:13 83:11         transcript         4:11 82:7,11         25:16,18,19           46:10         therefore         times         47:11,14 48:1         25:16,18,19           57:14         think         8:2 13:8,16         3:24 13:4,10         49:15,24         true           40:13,16,19         45:13,16,19         47:13,16,19         47:23,39:3,18         79:24           57:14         41:3,16,18         3:24 13:4,10         23:24,13         47:13,16         33:17,17         39:10,22,24					100
Transcript   Tra	68:5	text-based	three	49:9	82:9
11:4 45:4	teach	72:18	13:1 23:24	Tragedy	U
55:19 77:25         Cacked thank         59:11 64:22         Training         13:24 16:22         21:6,15 34:14         21:6,15 34:14         48:6,9         26:21 70:14         31:10,21         21:7,17 30:9         31:10,21         21:7,17 30:9         31:10,21         21:7,17 30:9         31:10,21 <td>11:4 45:4</td> <td>L L</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	11:4 45:4	L L			
teaching 10:18 42:21 43:6,18,21, 24 44:3,10, 15,20 45:2,7, 15,18,25 46:7,14,19 55:14 56:24 57:2 67:24 teach in g- related 46:10 tell tell tell tell teln-month 57:14 ten-month 57:15 term 13 52:21 deil 62:2.56 d4:11 deil 62:1, 2 term 13 52:21 deil 62:2.56 d4:11 deil 67:2.1 76:3 terms thinking 76:4 tenstified 6:3 23:11 third fer: 21 70:14, 17 79:19 31:10,21 37:2544:5  time transcript 4:11 82:7,11 83:8 Transformati ve 47:11,14 48:1 49:15,24 trial fr: 21,7,17 30:9 37:25 44:5  time transcript 4:11 82:7,11 83:8 33:8 Transformati ve 47:11,14 48:1 49:15,24 trial deil ve 47:11,14 48:1 times 6:8,15,18 79:24 trial fr: 2,3 9:3,18 79:24 trial fr: 2,3 9:3,18 79:1 true 47:11,14 48:1 tole 47:11,14 48:1 tole 47:11,14 48:1 tole 47:11,22 78:8 83:4 trial 6:8,15,18 79:1 unclear 6:8,15,18 79:24 trial 6:8,15,18 79:24 deil 349:12, deil 349:12			· ·		
Thank   17		13:25			13:24 16:22
43:6,18,21, 24 44:3,10, 15,20 45:2,7, 15,18,25,46:7,14,19 55:14 56:24 57:2 67:24  teaching related 46:10  tell 10:5 15:8  therefore tell 10:5 15:8  therefore tell 26:1		Thank			21:7,17 30:9
43:6,18,21,   24 44:3,10,   15,20 45:2,7,   15,18,25	10:18 42:21	21:6,15 34:14	threshold	17 79:19	31:10,21
24 44:3,10,   71:12 80:21	43:6,18,21,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	48:3 65:13	Transcendenc	37:25 44:5
15,20 45:2,7,   Thanks   35:15   time   51:3 38:11   25:16,18,19   55:14 56:24   50:25   69:20 70:22   71:22 78:8   83:4   therefore   26:1   times   42:15   time   times   42:15   time   times   42:15   time   time   times   42:15   time   time   times   42:15   time   ti	24 44:3,10,		tied		59:9 72:4
15,18,25	15,20 45:2,7,			_	
46:7,14,19       35:14 56:24       Theology       5:13 38:11       4:11 82:7,11       20:6,8,10,11       25:16,18,19       uncertain       45:2       20:6,8,10,11       25:16,18,19       uncertain       45:2       47:11,14 48:1       46:12       47:11,14 48:1       46:12       47:11,14 48:1       46:12       47:11,14 48:1	15,18,25			51:8	
55:14 56:24         Theology         5:13 38:11         4:11 82:7,11         25:16,8,10,11           50:25         69:20 70:22         Transformati         25:16,18,19           re l a t e d         theorist         1:22 78:8         Transformati         45:2           d6:10         therefore         times         47:11,14 48:1         45:2           tell         10:5 15:8         thereto         23:16,22,24         trial         46:15,24           tender         82:8         42:15         47:21,14 48:1         46:19           tender         82:8         42:15         7:2,39:3,18         38:7,17           33:4         think         3:24 13:4,10         16:8,15,18         16:9 19:13           57:14         44:13,16,18         35:12,18         79:24         42:19 46:23           tenure         44:13,16,18         35:12,18         23:8 82:11         42:19 46:23           47:13,16,19         46:13,49:12,         11:5         72:10         63:2,464:19,           42:17,6:3         45:16         47:21,76:3         46:19         39:11,71:24           62:2,7         62:25 56:11         67:21,76:3         46:10         47:13         47:14         42:25 66:6,25           testified	· ·	35:15		transcript	
57:2 67:24         50:25         43:3,4 64:3 69:20 70:22 71:22 78:8 71:22 78:8 83:4         46:10         theorist 51:15         47:22 78:8 83:4 77:22 78:8 71:22 78:8 83:4 77:22 78:8 83:4 77:22 78:8 71:22 78:2 78:8 71:22 78:2 78:8 71:22 78:2 78:8 71:22 78:2 78:8 71:22 78:2 78:8 71:24 78:2 79:24 78:2 79:24 79:23 60:23, 79:14 79:21 79:24		Theology		4:11 82:7,11	
teaching-related         theorist         69:20 70:22 71:22 78:8         Transformati         uncertain 45:2           tell 4:10         therefore 26:1         times 18:22,24         47:11,14 48:1         tolear           tell 10:5 15:8         thereto 82:1         23:16,22,24         trial 6:8,15,18         moder 16:9 19:13           tender 83:4         think ten-month 57:14         title 7:2,39:3,18         79:24         42:19 46:23           tenure 54:13,16,19         46:13,49:12, 16:3         35:12,18         35:12,18         23:8 82:11         24:29:46:27,19           term 47:13,52:16         62:25 64:11         62:25 64:11         62:25 64:11         62:25 64:11         62:25 64:11         63:2,3,5,8         66:3 23:11         66:3 23:11         53:9         83:12         14:42:0 82:9         83:12           testified 6:3 23:11         46:13 49:12, 27         53:2         75:15         7wo         12:13 21:3		50:25	43:3,464:3	83:8	25:16,18,19
teal ated         therefore         71:22 78:8         174:11,14 48:1         45:2         45:2           tell         therefore         times         47:11,14 48:1         49:15,24         under           tender         82:8         42:15         trial         6:8,15,18         71:22,39:3,18         79:24         42:19 46:23         38:7,17           83:4         think         title         3:24 13:4,10         true         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,24           57:14         think         3:24 13:4,10         true         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,22           tenure         46:13,16,18         45:16,17,22         36:23 37:8,16         true         49:23 60:23,22         44:2:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,22         42:7,9,11,12         23:8 82:11         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,22         42:7,9,11,12         39:11 71:24         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,22         42:7,9,11,12         39:11 71:24         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,22         42:7,9,11,12         39:11 71:24         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,22         42:7,9,11,12         42:7,9,11,12         42:7,9,11,12         42:7,9,11,12         42:18         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,22         42:7,9,11,12         42:18         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23         42:19 46:23 <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>69:20 70:22</td><td></td><td>uncertain</td></t<>			69:20 70:22		uncertain
related         46:10         therefore         times         47:11,14 48:1         unclear           tell         10:5 15:8         thereto         23:16,22,24         trial         49:15,24         under           tender         82:8         42:15         trial         6:8,15,18         79:24         38:7,17           tenmonth         55:5,6 23:15         title         3:24 13:4,10         79:24         42:19 46:23           tenure         45:16,17,22         44:13,16,18         36:23 37:8,16         true         49:23 60:23,           57:14         45:16,17,22         46:13 49:12,         titled         39:11 71:24         49:23 60:23,           term         13 52:21         titled         39:11 71:24         72:10         67:47 44:19,           40:13 52:16         67:21 76:3         today         39:4,18 45:21         Turning         78:14,20 82:9           testified         68:13         68:13         75:15         Two         undergo           67:21 78:2         third         10:16 45:11         22:7 70:11         22:37:14         44:4 50:23         69:81:21 9:8           testify         48:4 49:10         49:12         48:4 49:10         59:18,23 60:7         69:9 8:21 9:8           49:23	teaching-		71:22 78:8	Transformati	
tell         times	related	51:15	83:4	ve	
tell         26:1         thick         49:15,24         56:18           tender         82:8         42:15         trial         16:919:13         38:7,17           83:4         think         42:15         79:24         42:19 46:23         49:10,22,24           ten-month         15:5,6 23:15         24:7,9,11,12         42:19 46:23         49:23 60:23,24           tenure         45:16,17,22         35:12,18         36:23 37:8,16         true         49:23 60:23,24           term         45:16,17,22         46:13 49:12,         titled         39:11 71:24         21,25 66:6,25           47:13 52:16         62:25 64:11         62:25 64:11         62:25 64:11         62:27 76:3         today         39:11 71:24         78:14,20 82:9           terms         thinking         11:14 42:5         together         75:25         70:14         undergo           testified         68:13         75:15         Two         10:6 73:8         undergraduat           6:3 23:11         54:18 65:21         53:2         70:14         undergraduat           testify         54:18 65:21         53:2         70:14         undergraduat           testimonial         6:3 7:14         42:2 7:24         70:11         70:65:56:25	46:10	therefore	Limas	47:11,14 48:1	
tender         82:8         42:15         trial         16:9 19:13           83:4         think         title         7:2,3 9:3,18         38:7,17           57:14         44:13,16,18         3:24 13:4,10         79:24         42:19 46:23           tenure         44:13,16,18         35:12,18         36:23 37:8,16         turu         49:23 60:23, 49:23 60:23, 49:23 60:23, 24 62:7,19           term         45:16,17,22         46:13 49:12, 18         46:13 49:12, 18         46:23 37:8,16         turn         63:2,4 64:19, 21,25 66:6,25           terms         67:21 76:3         today         79:11 71:24         21,25 66:6,25           testified         68:13         68:13         64:10         twentieth         78:14,20 82:9           testify         54:18 65:21         told         12:13 21:3         e           testify         54:18 65:21         top         44:4 45:23         44:4 50:23           testimonial         18:10 47:2         48:4 49:10         59:18,23 60:7         65:5 66:25         67:1 72:10         67:3 8           testimony         6:8,15 7:18         thousand         75:8         topic         67:1 72:10         67:1 72:10         69:22 44:13           test         10:24         46:23         47:22		26:1		49:15,24	56:18
tender         82:8         42:15         42:15         6:8,15,18         16:9 19:13         38:7,17         38:10,22,24         42:15         42:15         79:24         42:19 46:23         38:7,17         39:10,22,24         42:19 46:23         42:15 46:21         42:19 46:23         42:15 46:21         42:15 46:21         42:15 46:21         42:15 46:21         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:21         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23         42:15 46:23		thereto	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	  trial	under
## think	10:5 15:8				16:9 19:13
83:4       think       s: 2 13:8,16       s: 24 13:4,10       79: 24       39: 10,22,24         57: 14       44: 13,16,18       45: 16,17,22       44: 13,16,18       45: 16,17,22       45: 16,17,22       46: 13 49: 12,       titled       23: 8 82: 11       24 62: 7,19         54: 13, 16, 19       46: 13 49: 12,       titled       39: 11 71: 24       21, 25: 66: 6, 25         47: 13 52: 16       62: 25 64: 11       today       39: 11 71: 24       72: 10       67: 474: 3         42: 1, 2       49: 2, 3, 5, 8       today       39: 10, 22, 24       42: 19 46: 23       49: 23 60: 23,       24: 62: 7, 19       63: 2, 4 64: 19,       21, 25: 66: 6, 25       67: 47: 43       72: 10       63: 2, 4 64: 19,       21, 25: 66: 6, 25       67: 47: 43       72: 10       67: 47: 43       78: 14, 20 82: 9       83: 12       78: 14, 20 82: 9       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       83: 12       12       13: 14       12: 13 21: 3       13: 12       13: 12       14: 14       15: 15       15: 15       15: 15       15: 15: 15       15: 15: 15: 15       15: 15: 15: 15: 15: 15       15: 15: 15: 15: 15: 15: 15: 15: 15: 15:	tender	04.0	42:15		38:7,17
ten-month       8:213:8,16       3:2413:4,10       42:1946:23         57:14       44:13,16,18       44:13,16,18       45:16,17,22       46:1349:12,       23:882:11       24 62:7,19         54:13,16,19       46:1349:12,       titled       39:1171:24       21,25 66:6,25       21,25 66:6,25         47:1352:16       62:25 64:11       62:27 76:3       today       78:14,20 82:9       78:14,20 82:9         terms       thinking       11:14 42:5       49:2,3,5,8       together       53:2       10:16 45:11       70:14         25:24 41:5       third       told       12:13 21:3       23:24 30:17,       22:7 70:11       23:24 30:17,       22:37:1 43:1       10:6 73:8         testify       39:5       thought       top       51:10 54:24       59:18,23 60:7       42:25 47:13       50:9 60:16       61:13 62:13         6:23 7:14       testimonial       66:22,24       59:18,23 60:7       50:9 60:16       61:13 62:13       50:9 60:16       61:13 62:13         6:8,15 7:18       75:8       topics       topics       type       74:20 77:5         text       thousands       15:20 46:8       27:2       79:5	83:4		title		· ·
57:14         15:5,623:15         24:7,9,11,12         true         49:23 60:23           57:14         44:13,16,18         35:12,18         35:12,18         23:8 82:11         24 62:7,19           54:13,16,19         46:13 49:12,         titled         39:11 71:24         21,25 66:6,25           47:13 52:16         62:25 64:11         today         Turning         78:14,20 82:9           47:13 52:16         62:25 64:11         today         Turning         78:14,20 82:9           47:13 52:16         67:21 76:3         today         Turning         78:14,20 82:9           40:21,2         67:21 76:3         today         Turning         78:14,20 82:9           40:21,2         64:10         twentieth         53:2         70:14         undergo           40:3 23:11         68:13         75:15         Two         undergraduat           67:21 78:2         third         8:21 20:20         23:24 30:17,         10:6 73:8           48:18 65:21         22:77 70:11         22:37:14 43:1         44:4 50:23         6:9 8:21 9:8           48:21 20:20         23:24 30:17,         22:23 7:14 3:1         22:20 23:3         23:21 20:23         6:9 8:21 9:8           48:30 47:2         48:4 49:10         52:11         48:4 49	ton-month	8:213:8,16	3:24 13:4,10	79:24	
tenure 54:13,16,19 44:13,16,18 45:16,17,22 46:13 49:12, 13 52:21 47:13 52:16 62:1,2 67:21 76:3  terms 76:4 testified 6:3 23:11 25:24 41:5 67:21 78:2 10:16 45:11 25:24 41:5 67:21 78:2 10:16 45:11 25:24 41:5 67:21 78:2 10:16 45:11 25:24 41:5 67:21 78:2 10:16 45:11 25:24 41:5 67:21 78:2 10:16 45:11 25:24 72:10  10:16 45:11 25:24 41:5 67:21 78:2 10:16 45:11 25:24 41:5 67:21 78:2 10:16 45:11 25:24 41:5 4:18 65:21 22:7 70:11 44:4 50:23 51:10 54:24 59:18,23 60:7 78:14,20 82:9 83:12  10:16 45:11 22:13 21:3 23:24 30:17, 22:37:1 43:1 44:4 50:23 51:10 54:24 59:18,23 60:7 48:4 49:10 52:11 59:18,23 60:7 66:22,24 59:18,23 60:7 66:22,24 59:18,23 60:7 66:22,24 59:18,23 60:7 66:25 67:1 72:10 61:13 62:13 65:15 66:20 74:20 77:5 79:5		15:5,623:15		true	
tenure       45:16,17,22       36:23 37:8,16       turn       24 62:7,19         54:13,16,19       46:13 49:12, 13 52:21       titled       39:11 71:24       21,25 66:6,25         47:13 52:16       62:25 64:11       62:25 64:11       72:10       78:14,20 82:9         62:1,2       67:21 76:3       today       Turning       78:14,20 82:9         83:12       terms       thinking       11:14 42:5       together       53:2       undergo         76:4       11:14 42:5       together       53:2       vundergo         6:3 23:11       68:13       together       53:2       undergo         67:21 78:2       third       10:16 45:11       12:13 21:3       e         67:21 78:2       third       10:16 45:11       22:7 70:11       22 37:1 43:1       undergraduat         testify       54:18 65:21       22:7 70:11       44:4 50:23       51:10 54:24       10:6 73:8         testimonial       18:10 47:2       34:7 35:1       59:18,23 60:7       65:5 66:25       67:1 72:10       50:9 60:16         6:8,15 7:18       52:11       topic       67:1 72:10       65:15 66:20       74:20 77:5         testimony       6:8,15 7:18       75:8       topics       15:20 46:8       27:	57:14	44:13,16,18		23:8 82:11	· ·
54:13,16,19       46:13 49:12, 13 52:21       titled 11:5       39:11 71:24       21,25 66:6,25 67:4 74:3         47:13 52:16       62:25 64:11 62:1,2       67:21 76:3       today 39:4,18 45:21       78:14,20 82:9 83:12         terms       thinking 76:4       11:14 42:5 49:2,3,5,8 68:13       together 75:15       Two 144       undergo 70:14         66:3 23:11       third 68:13       10:16 45:11 54:18 65:21       22:7 70:11       22 37:1 43:1 44:15 44:4 50:23       10:6 73:8         67:21 78:2       thought 18:10 47:2 48:4 49:10       34:7 35:1 71:24 59:18,23 60:7 66:25 40:16 45:13 50:9 60:16 66:22,24       59:18,23 60:7 66:25 67:1 72:10 66:22 33:3 42:25 47:13 50:9 60:16 61:13 62:13 65:15 66:20 78:3       40:25 47:13 50:9 60:16 61:13 62:13 65:15 66:20 74:20 77:5 79:5         text       thousands       75:8       topics 74:20 77:5 79:5       79:5	tenure	45:16,17,22	· ·	+	
term         13 52:21         titled         35:17,71.24         21,25 68:6,25         47:13 52:16         62:25 64:11         72:10         67:4 74:3         67:4 74:3         78:14,20 82:9         83:12         78:14,20 82:9         83:12	54:13,16,19				
47:13 52:16       62:25 64:11       62:25 64:11       62:25 64:11       67:21 76:3       78:14,20 82:9       78:14,20 82:9       83:12         terms       thinking       11:14 42:5       49:2,3,5,8       together       53:2       70:14       undergo       70:14       10:6 73:8       undergo       70:14       10:6 73:8       undergo       70:14       10:6 73:8       understand       6:9 8:21 9:8       11:20 23:3       11:20 23:3       11:20 23:3       12:20 23:3       12:20 23:3       12:20 23:3       12:20 23:3	term				
62:1,2       67:21 76:3       today       39:4,18 45:21       78:14,20 82:9         76:4       11:14 42:5       64:10       twentieth       mdergo         76:4       49:2,3,5,8       53:2       70:14         6:3 23:11       68:13       together       75:15       two         25:24 41:5       third       10:16 45:11       12:13 21:3       e         67:21 78:2       10:16 45:11       8:21 20:20       23:24 30:17,       10:6 73:8         4:44 50:23       52:7 70:11       44:4 50:23       10:6 73:8         testify       34:7 35:1       59:18,23 60:7       6:9 8:21 9:8         52:21       48:4 49:10       59:18,23 60:7       65:5 66:25         68:3 7:14       52:11       50:9 60:16       66:22,24         58:15 7:18       50:9 60:16       61:13 62:13         66:22,24       78:3       65:15 66:20         74:20 77:5       79:5			11:5	/2:10	
terms         thinking         39:4,18 45:21         53:9         83:12           76:4         11:14 42:5         49:2,3,5,8         68:13         together         70:14           25:24 41:5         68:13         told         12:13 21:3         undergraduat           67:21 78:2         third         8:21 20:20         23:24 30:17,         10:6 73:8           testify         54:18 65:21         22:7 70:11         44:4 50:23         understand           39:5         thought         18:10 47:2         34:7 35:1         59:18,23 60:7         21:20 23:3           48:4 49:10         52:11         topic         67:1 72:10         65:5 66:25         50:9 60:16           68:22,24         75:8         topics         78:3         65:15 66:20           74:20 77:5         79:5			today	Turning	
terms       thinking       64:10       twentieth       undergo         76:4       49:2,3,5,8       53:2       70:14         68:13       49:2,3,5,8       68:15       together       70:14         25:24 41:5       third       12:13 21:3       e         67:21 78:2       10:16 45:11       8:21 20:20       23:24 30:17,       10:6 73:8         testify       54:18 65:21       22:7 70:11       44:4 50:23       understand         6:23 7:14       18:10 47:2       34:7 35:1       51:10 54:24       21:20 23:3         testimonial       48:4 49:10       52:11       52:11       56:5 66:25       50:9 60:16         testimony       68:8,15 7:18       75:8       topic       66:22,24       78:3       55:15 66:20         75:8       topics       15:20 46:8       27:2       79:5			_	53:9	83:12
76:4       11:14 42:5       49:2,3,5,8       53:2       70:14         6:3 23:11       68:13       told       12:13 21:3       e         25:24 41:5       10:16 45:11       23:24 30:17,       10:6 73:8         testify       54:18 65:21       22:7 70:11       44:4 50:23       tole 6:9 8:21 9:8         39:5       thought       34:7 35:1       59:18,23 60:7       6:9 8:21 9:8         testimonial       18:10 47:2       48:4 49:10       59:18,23 60:7       42:25 47:13         52:11       topic       66:22,24       59:18,23 60:7       50:9 60:16         testimony       66:22,24       78:3       50:9 60:16         61:13 62:13       65:15 66:20       74:20 77:5         text       thousands       15:20 46:8       27:2       79:5		_	1	twentieth	undergo
testified       49:2,3,5,8       together       75:15       Two       undergraduat         6:3 23:11       25:24 41:5       third       12:13 21:3       e         67:21 78:2       10:16 45:11       8:21 20:20       23:24 30:17,       10:6 73:8         testify       54:18 65:21       22:7 70:11       44:4 50:23       understand         6:9 8:21 9:8       51:10 54:24       6:9 8:21 9:8       21:20 23:3         testimonial       48:4 49:10       52:11       55:5 66:25       50:9 60:16         testimony       66:22,24       66:22,24       78:3       50:9 60:16         61:13 62:13       65:15 66:20       74:20 77:5         text       thousands       15:20 46:8       27:2       79:5	76:4				_
68:13  third 10:16 45:11 54:18 65:21  testify 39:5  thought 18:10 47:2 48:4 49:10 52:11  testimony 6:8,15 7:18 9:2  text  thousand 75:15  Two 12:13 21:3 23:24 30:17, 22 37:1 43:1 44:4 50:23 51:10 54:24 59:18,23 60:7 65:5 66:25 67:1 72:10 78:3  topic 66:22,24  topic 66:22,24  topics 15:20 46:8  topics 15:20 46:8  12:13 21:3 23:24 30:17, 22 37:1 43:1 44:4 50:23 51:10 54:24 59:18,23 60:7 65:5 66:25 67:1 72:10 78:3 65:15 66:20 74:20 77:5 79:5	testified				
25:24 41:5       third       10:16 45:11       8:21 20:20       23:24 30:17,       10:6 73:8         testify       39:5       thought       top       34:7 35:1       51:10 54:24       6:9 8:21 9:8         testimonial       18:10 47:2       48:4 49:10       52:11       52:11       50:5 66:25       67:1 72:10       61:13 62:13         testimony       6:8,15 7:18       52:8       topics       66:22,24       78:3       65:15 66:20       74:20 77:5         text       thousands       15:20 46:8       27:2       79:5		68:13	/5:15		undergraduat
67:21 78:2       10:16 45:11       8:21 20:20       23:24 30:17,       10:6 73:8         testify       39:5       thought       top       34:7 35:1       44:4 50:23       51:10 54:24       6:9 8:21 9:8         testimonial       18:10 47:2       48:4 49:10       52:11       59:18,23 60:7       65:5 66:25       67:1 72:10       50:9 60:16         testimony       66:22,24       78:3       50:9 60:16       61:13 62:13         65:15 66:20       74:20 77:5       79:5		third	told		е
testify       54:18 65:21       22:7 70:11       22 37:1 43:1       understand         44:4 50:23       51:10 54:24       6:9 8:21 9:8         54:18 65:21       54:18 65:21       51:10 54:24       51:10 54:24         54:18 65:21       50:9 60:16       50:9 60:16         65:25 66:25       66:22,24       66:22,24       78:3         50:9 60:16       61:13 62:13         65:15 66:20       74:20 77:5         79:5       79:5		-	8:21 20:20	23:24 30:17,	10:6 73:8
testify     39:5     thought     44:4 50:23     6:9 8:21 9:8       testimonial     18:10 47:2     34:7 35:1     59:18,23 60:7     42:25 47:13       6:23 7:14     52:11     topic     66:22,24     67:1 72:10     50:9 60:16       testimony     66:22,24     78:3     65:15 66:20       52:1     topics     78:3     65:15 66:20       52:1     topics     79:5			22:7 70:11	22 37:1 43:1	understand
testimonial 6:23 7:14 testimony 6:8,15 7:18 9:2 text  thousand 75:8 thousands  thousands  thousands  18:10 47:2 48:4 49:10 52:11 topic 66:22,24 topics 15:20 46:8 15:20 46:8  21:20 23:3 42:25 47:13 50:9 60:16 61:13 62:13 65:15 66:20 74:20 77:5 79:5	_			44:4 50:23	
testimonial       18.10.47.2       71:24       59:18,23.60:7       42:25.47:13         6:23.7:14       testimony       52:11       topic       67:1.72:10       50:9.60:16         6:8,15.7:18       thousand       75:8       topics       type       74:20.77:5         text       thousands       15:20.46:8       27:2       79:5	39:5	_	_	51:10 54:24	
6:23 7:14 testimony 6:8,15 7:18 9:2 text  48:4 49:10 52:11 topic 66:22,24 topics 15:20 46:8  165:5 66:25 67:1 72:10 78:3  type 27:2  79:5	testimonial			59:18,23 60:7	
testimony       52:11       topic       67:1 72:10       50:9 60:16         6:8,15 7:18       66:22,24       78:3       65:15 66:20         9:2       thousands       15:20 46:8       27:2       79:5	6:23 7:14				
thousand 75:8 thousands thousands 75:8 thousands  thousands 78:3 topics 15:20 46:8 27:2 78:3 78:3 78:3 78:3 78:3 78:3 78:3 78:3		52:11	topic		
9:2 text topics type 75:8 topics 15:20 46:8 27:2 79:5	_	thousand	66:22,24		
text thousands 15:20 46:8 27:2 79:5	· ·		topics		
text Chousehus 27.2 79.5	9:2		_		
14:20,22 15:6   72:19   tradition   typewriting	text			27:2	79:5
	14:20,22 15:6	72:19	tradition	typewriting	

understandin	11	18:25	8:12	71:6
g	unpublished	usual	vs	week
8:13,24 19:8	60:10	83:16	1:7	7:4,510:23
21:10 32:4	uploaded	utility	W	12:10 29:7,23
35:17 60:23	80:17	47:11		56:8,10,13
66:5,8,16			W	weeks
69:9,14 74:24	Use	utilize	2:13 4:5	29:1
75:2,376:23	3:14 4:7	45:8	waive	
77:6,14 80:13	12:15 13:20	utilizing	7:16	weigh
	16:4,6,9,10,	59:24	waived	79:2
understood	25 17:19	v	81:12	weighed
8:611:17	18:2,419:15,			66:12 78:10
59:25 60:1	23,24,25	variety	waiver	weighing
62:14 73:16	20:1,3,6,8,	15:20 29:7	28:6	67:1
undertake	10,13,14,22	version	want	Weighs
68:14 72:23	21:11 26:1,8,	20:24,25	6:68:15	19:15
undertaken	17 27:22	versus	27:18 33:17	
52:9	30:16 31:2,4,	5:10 64:8	46:5 55:22	weighty
undertook	11,15,25	vice	77:18	65:3
68:23 79:19	32:22 38:7,8,	22:19	wanted	WEIL
	12,15,17,19		9:10 17:9,21	2:7 5:25
underwent	39:6,10,22	Videographer	37:7 43:12,13	welcome
16:24	40:4,13,16,	2:18 5:8,16	46:1 62:12	71:13
Unfinished	18,21,22,24	73:22,25 81:1	78:18	We're
51:8	41:13,16	VIDEOTAPE	wants	5:15 8:21
unilaterally	42:19,20,22 43:7,846:16,	1:14 5:1,9	52:17 53:3	35:11 54:23
7:10		81:2	55:13,14,18	81:3
UNITED	17,20,23	view		
1:16:10	47:11,15,25 49:18 59:8,	15:11,16	war	West
		17:23 18:3	8:2	2:4
universities	11,23,24 61:4	80:10	wasn't	western
73:14	62:18,23 63:3,11	viewed	73:14	11:16 13:25
UNIVERSITY	64:12,13,23	15:9	water	49:10
1:4,910:7,	65:13,15		7:24	Whatever
11,15,20	66:7,8,12,13	views	  way	78:13
11:24 16:5	67:1,669:23	49:20	32:19 39:17	whatsoever
20:2,4,5	71:16 77:6,9,	VINCENT	44:9 47:20	49:14
21:11 22:1,	16 78:6,10,	1:15 3:2 4:5	48:12,19,22	
17,20 23:9	21,2279:3,5,	5:1,96:2	52:10 64:18	whereas
39:23 40:2	10,11,12,15	10:4 81:2	77:14	63:10
43:23 50:7	80:11,15	violate		Whereupon
54:14 55:2	,	22:13	ways 15:23,25 30:4	81:5
57:3 58:9,10	use'	Vitae	64:22	whether
63:20,23	31:13	4:5		15:9 16:24
71:17 73:10,	user		website	19:23 23:25
	I	voluntarily	I	I

1h87wekeF	20th	32:25 48:5	780	
36:14	5:13 81:3	67:4 74:4	5:12	
1st	21	78:4	8	
58:20,21	3:5	404.572.2595		
		2:14	8	
2	212.310.8007	404.572.5100	4:7,11 71:10,	
2	2:10	2:15	16	
3:14 16:13	212.310.8775	404.881.4111	80	
26:7 27:6,9	2:9	2:6	3:7	
29:11 30:17	215-A		81	
31:1,8,9	58:5	404.881-4106	82:10	
37:24 41:15	23rd	2:5	9	
42:18 53:13	38:5	421		
59:4,6,14	25th	13:14	9	
60:18 62:7	82:18	5	3:4 58:5	
63:2 64:22	3	5	910	
69:18 78:11		3:23 4:11	1:18 5:14	
79:2	3	34:3,4,11,19	9-11-28c	
20	3:15 12:20		83:13	
1:17 5:2	64:19,25	50	9-11-30e	
2009	66:25 78:11	4:5	81:9	
3:11 11:5	79:2	536		
12:3,6,9,12,	30303	13:9	<del></del>	
14 16:6 17:3,	58:6	6	'cause	
14,15 19:24	30309-3417	6	42:9	
20:10,17,20	2:5	3:18 4:3	'fair	
23:17 24:4	30309-3521	14:9,11 20:21	31:12	
25:10 27:15	2:14	34:11 36:2,8	'reasonable.	
28:11 30:14,		37:20 38:1		
16 31:2,6	30e	39:12 40:12	good 31:14	
32:23 35:2	81:7	7	1 21.14	
36:12 37:15	30th			
41:21 42:13	38:6	7		
62:18 68:6 69:15 71:19	34	4:5 50:11,14		
	3:23	53:14		
2010	36	71		
16:16,19 17:8	4:3	4:7		
26:8 27:9,13	3900	7-15-08		
42:2,462:21,	2:4	3:23		
22	4	7-17-09		
2011	<del></del>	4:3		
1:17 5:2,13	4			
55:21 79:25	3:18 4:10	767		
81:3 82:18	14:13 19:13	2:8	1	