

E  
X  
H  
I  
B  
I  
T  
L

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA  
ATLANTA DIVISION

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY )  
PRESS, et al., )  
 )  
Plaintiffs, )  
 )  
vs. ) Civil Action File  
 ) No. 1:08-CV-1425-ODE  
MARK P. BECKER, in his )  
official capacity as )  
Georgia State University )  
President, et al., )  
 )  
Defendants. )

- - -

Videotaped deposition of JAMES DANIEL PALMOUR,  
taken on behalf of the plaintiffs, pursuant to the  
stipulations contained herein, before Teresa Bishop,  
RPR, RMR, CCR No. B-307, at 104 Marietta Street, 6th  
floor, Room 3, Atlanta, Georgia, on Thursday, April 23,  
2009, commencing at the hour of 8:54 a.m.

---

Shugart & Bishop  
Certified Court Reporters  
Suite 140  
13 Corporate Square  
Atlanta, Georgia 30329  
(770) 955-5252

I N D E X

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Examinations

Page

EXAMINATION BY MR. LARSON

7

EXAMINATION BY MR. ASKEW

229

E X H I B I T S

No.

Description

Page

24 complaint

162

29 Document titled library support &  
technology initiatives information  
system & technology administrative  
support unit review self-study

29

30 E-mail from mailgroup to employees dated  
1/11/06 subject coursepacks

37

31 ERes request form

43

32 ERes request form

54

33 Power point document Bates number

55

GASstate0000693 through 705

1	34	e-mail chain between Palmour, Robinson and Russell dated October 9 and 10, 2008m	68
2			
3	35	Excel file Bates GAsate 0009876	71
4	36	Printout titled course reserves from university web site	87
5			
6	37	Electronic reserves request form from web site	89
7			
8	38	policy on use of copyrighted works in education and research from the web site	93
9			
10	39	e-mail from Palmour to Williams dated 1/17/06, subject ERes & coursepack totals	97
11			
12	40	e-mail from Palmour to Williams dated 8/10/07, subject annual report numbers	102
13			
14	41	e-mail from Palmour to Dimsdale dated 1/29/08, subject ERes usage last year summary report from ERes system Bates marked 0004865	105
15			
16	42	document Bates number GAsate0004537 headlined library services support, accomplishments for fiscal year 2008	108
17			
18	43	E-mail from Palmour to Burtle dated 6/11/08, subject ERes questions	113
19			
20	44	Excel document titled Usage 2008 Spring Report	115
21			
22	45		121
23			
24			
25			

1	46	coursepack production services	126
2		quarterly report from winter 1995	
3		to spring 2008 Bates number Georgia State	
4	47	e-mail exchange between Palmour and	130
5		Selwood dated 1/12/06, subject question	
6	48	e-mail exchange between Kropf and Palmour	139
7		dated 10/31/06, subject spring coursepack	
8	49	e-mail between Palmour and Frantz dated	145
9		7/6/07, subject renewal for BIOL 2500	
10	50	document titled action plan 2007	146
11		development approved by planning &	
12		development committee - January 16, 2007	
13	51	letter dated May 12, 2003 to Palmour from	153
14		Cambridge University Press	
15	52	e-mail exchange between Larsson, Delk and	158
16		Palmour dated 3/27/08, subject 0950 IEP	
17		coursepacks	
18	53	e-mail exchange chain between Palmour	160
19		and Miller dated 7/20/06, subject	
20		questions on Coursepackets	
21	54	e-mail exchange between Palmour and	164
22		Lippincott dated 4/18/06, subject ERes again	
23	55	e-mail between Palmour and group of people	169
24		dated 5/21/07, subject ERes passwords	
25			

1	56	doc hit report 8/16/ - 12/31/06 Bates	170
2		number GSU007945.012.XLS-000001	
3		through 000416	
4	57	doc hit report 1/1/07 - 5/15/07	179
5		Bates labeled GSU007945.004.XLS-000001	
6		through 00401	
7	58	Doc hit report 8/16/07 - 12/31/07 Bates	185
8		labeled GSU007945.013.XSL-000001	
9		through 437	
10	59	doc hit report 1/1/08 - 5/15/08 Bates	195
11		labeled GSU007945.005.XSL-000001	
12		through 377	
13	60	ERes search for Slave Family	204
14	61	ERes search for Slave Community	209
15	62	ERes search for leviathan	211
16	63	ERes search for Dluhy	212
17	64	ERes search for Belcher	212
18	65	ERes search for narrative inquiry	214
19	66	ERes search for Sage Handbook	216
20	67	ERes search for competition	219
21	68	ERes search for Cambridge	220
22	69	ERes search for Cambridge	221
23	70	ERes search for Oxford	223
24	71	ERes search for Cambridge UNIVERS	225
25			

1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL:

2  
3 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:

4 TODD D. LARSON  
5 ATTORNEY AT LAW  
6 WEIL GOTSHAL & MANGES  
7 767 FIFTH AVENUE  
8 NEW YORK, NY 10153-0119  
9 212.310.8238  
10 TODD.LARSON@WEIL.COM

11 JOHN H. RAINS, IV  
12 ATTORNEY AT LAW  
13 BONDURANT, MIXSON & ELMORE  
14 1201 WEST PEACHTREE  
15 SUITE 3900  
16 ATLANTA GA 30309-3417  
17 404.881.4121

18 FOR THE DEFENDANTS:

19 ANTHONY B. ASKEW  
20 KRISTEN A. SWIFT  
21 ATTORNEY AT LAW  
22 KING & SPALDING  
23 1180 PEACHTREE STREET, N.E.  
24 ATLANTA, GA 30309-3521  
25 404.572.2530  
taskew@kslaw.com

CYNTHIA V. HALL  
ATTORNEY AT LAW  
GEORGIA STATE UNIVERSITY  
OFFICE OF LEGAL AFFAIRS  
P.O. BOX 3987  
ATLANTA, GA. 30302-3987

ALSO PRESENT:

STACEY LUTZKER,  
KENNITH DRAKE, VIDEOGRAPHER

- - -

1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This will be the  
2 videotaped deposition of James Palmour,  
3 taken by the plaintiffs in the matter of  
4 Cambridge University Press versus Mark B.  
5 Becker in his official capacity as Georgia  
6 State University president et. al.

7 The date is April 23rd, 2009. We are  
8 on the record at 8:54:26.

9 - - -

10 (Disclosure was made pursuant to O.C.G.A. Annotated 9-11-28  
11 (c) and (d) and 15-14-37 (a), (b) and (c).)

12 - - -

13 JAMES DANIEL PALMOUR,  
14 having been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as  
15 follows:

16 EXAMINATION

17 BY MR. LARSON:

18 Q. Good morning, Mr. is it Palmour or Palmour?

19 A. Palmour.

20 Q. Thank you for coming in this morning. Could  
21 you just state and spell your name for the record so we  
22 have it?

23 A. James J-A-M-E-S, Daniel D-A-N-I-E-L, Palmour  
24 P-A-L-M-O-U-R.

25 Q. Mr. Palmour, my name is Todd Larson. I'm from



1 the law firm of Weil, Gotshall & Manges in New York.  
2 And we're representing Cambridge University Press and  
3 Oxford University Press and Sage Publications in this  
4 action.

5 Have you been deposed before?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Let me just give you a few ground rules. Your  
8 counsel probably told you some of these, but just so  
9 we're clear.

10 I'll be asking questions today and just would  
11 expect you answer truthfully and completely. Please  
12 answer verbally. Nods although we do have a videotape,  
13 nods don't show up in a written transcript.

14 If you don't understand a question, just ask  
15 me to clarify and I'll be happy to do so. If you need a  
16 break at any point, just let me know.

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. I would just ask you don't do that while  
19 there's a question pending. But after we've completed  
20 the question and answer.

21 If your counsel objects to my questions, you  
22 know, throughout the day, that's part of the process and  
23 you can go ahead and answer unless you are instructed  
24 not to by your counsel.

25 Let me ask you this. Did you prepare in any

1 way for the deposition?

2 A. We had a meeting yesterday.

3 Q. So you met with counsel?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. How long was that meeting?

6 A. Between three and four hours.

7 Q. Did you review documents or records as part of  
8 the preparation?

9 A. A few, yes.

10 Q. Were those provided by counsel?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Okay. Did you speak to anyone at GSU -- by  
13 GSU, I mean Georgia State University -- about the  
14 deposition?

15 A. Only told my boss that I was going to be doing  
16 this.

17 Q. Okay. And did you take a look as part of this  
18 process at the ERes system or EReserve system at GSU?

19 A. Well, I've been working and supporting the  
20 ERes system in the past.

21 Q. Did you do any review of the system  
22 specifically in preparation for the deposition?

23 A. Yesterday I did look to see some of the  
24 statistics, usage statistics, things like that.

25 Q. How did you do that?

1 A. Logged in as administrator and ran a report.

2 Q. And what time frame did you run that report  
3 for?

4 A. Around 4:30 p.m. yesterday.

5 Q. I'm sorry. Let me step back. And we'll talk  
6 about this more in depth a little bit later.

7 But the reporting function on ERes allows you  
8 to enter date parameters, that is correct?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And what date parameters did you enter  
11 yesterday when you ran a report?

12 A. I looked at the entire history and a summary  
13 of the document usage and the growth of usage of the  
14 system.

15 Q. Did you print out the results of that or save  
16 them in any way?

17 A. No. No.

18 Q. Did you search your files to produce documents  
19 for this litigation?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Who asked you to do that?

22 A. I guess Cynthia Hall and GSU legal affairs  
23 office.

24 Q. What did you search for?

25 A. All my e-mail regarding ERes and coursepacks

1 and all my computer files on disk regarding ERes and  
2 coursepacks and all my paper files regarding ERes and  
3 coursepacks.

4 Q. With your e-mail, what system do you use?

5 A. GroupWise by Novel.

6 Q. And how did you search your e-mail?

7 A. There's an option called open archives which  
8 goes back I think two or three years and I did a search  
9 on various key phrases that I was instructed to use.  
10 And I saved the results in a -- and each result was  
11 saved in a separate file.

12 Q. Those were saved in Word files, is that right?

13 A. I'm not sure what type of files, what format  
14 that was.

15 Q. Do you know whether that search pulled any  
16 attachments to your e-mails as well?

17 A. There would be attachments on some of them,  
18 yes.

19 Q. So to the extent an e-mail had an attachment,  
20 it should have been produced as part of the search you  
21 made?

22 A. Yes. Yes.

23 Q. And do you know whether those archives are two  
24 years or three years?

25 A. I don't recall. It's a running archive, so

1 the earliest date changes every day.

2 Q. Does that -- all your e-mails are saved by  
3 that program?

4 A. All of them that I don't delete, yes.

5 Q. There's no auto deletion or anything like  
6 that?

7 A. There is and some people have that turned on,  
8 but I did not have it turned on.

9 Q. Any deletion if your e-mail box grows over a  
10 certain size, anything like that?

11 A. Right. Right. If your e-mail box exceeds its  
12 limit then you have to go in and delete some yourself.

13 Q. That's the auto deletion function you mean or  
14 is that something separate?

15 A. That's something separate. I think there's a  
16 function that lets you automatically have it delete  
17 anything over a certain date.

18 Q. Let me just ask. Have your files -- are you  
19 aware of your e-mails having been deleted because you  
20 were over the size limit for your mailbox?

21 A. No, I'm not aware of that.

22 Q. And what is your practice -- you mentioned  
23 before you would have everything if you hadn't deleted  
24 it yourself. What is your practice with respect to  
25 saving and deleting e-mails?

1           A.    I will delete most of everything I think is  
2 junk e-mail, and I delete some things I don't think I'll  
3 be needing.

4           Q.    Were you asked ever to preserve files for this  
5 litigation?

6           A.    Yes, I was.

7           Q.    When was that?

8           A.    I don't recall the exact date.

9           Q.    Okay. Was that by Ms. Hall?

10          A.    Yes.

11          Q.    Okay. Was that written or --

12          A.    Yes.

13          Q.    Could you tell me your educational background?

14          A.    I have a bachelor's degree in information  
15 systems, bachelor of business associate degree from  
16 Georgia State University. And I also had a bachelor's  
17 degree from University of Georgia in international  
18 business.

19          Q.    So your training in information technology,  
20 for lack of a better word, is from this degree at GSU?

21          A.    Yes.

22          Q.    Do you have any certifications or anything  
23 like that?

24          A.    No.

25          Q.    Have you taken any law classes?

1 A. I took one business law class.

2 Q. Where was that?

3 A. At Georgia State.

4 Q. When was that?

5 A. I don't recall exactly. It's probably around  
6 1980.

7 Q. Have you had any copyright training?

8 A. Not any formal training classes. I've just  
9 read what the Board Of Regents has on their web site.

10 Q. Does that include what was on the Regents' web  
11 site, you know, prior to the new policy that was  
12 recently enacted?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Anything else that you've read or consulted  
15 with regard to copyright law?

16 A. Well, I've read some various magazine  
17 articles.

18 Q. How about any other forms of IP, you know,  
19 patent or any training on those topics?

20 A. No.

21 Q. Did you work someplace else prior to coming to  
22 Georgia State?

23 A. Last place I worked before Georgia State was  
24 the Tender Box Pipe And Tobacco store at Perimeter Mall.

25 Q. And when was that?

1           A.    Well, that was for about two or three years  
2 after I got out of University of Georgia in the last big  
3 recession.  Couldn't find much work other than retail.

4           Q.    When did you start at Georgia State?

5           A.    Full time staff was 1982, August 13th.

6           Q.    And I don't want to make this a memory test,  
7 but if you could just tell me the positions you've held  
8 at GSU as best as you can remember, that would be  
9 appreciated.

10          A.    Well, as far as titles go, I started as a  
11 programming, programmer level 1 and I moved to  
12 programmer level 3.  And then they had a position called  
13 system designer level 1 and then system designer level  
14 2.  And then I think after that I became an information  
15 systems specialist.

16          Q.    Is that your current title?

17          A.    Yes.  Information system specialist lead.

18          Q.    When did you take your current position?

19          A.    When did I get that title?

20          Q.    Yes.

21          A.    I don't recall.  It was probably late 90s, I  
22 guess.

23          Q.    Okay.  In your prior positions that you  
24 described, the programmer and systems designer, did you  
25 have opportunity in those positions to deal with



1 copyright issues at all?

2 A. Yes, I did. My initial duties were working  
3 with software that the faculty would bring in and want  
4 installed on the main frame. But after about two years  
5 I was assigned to applications dealing mostly with high  
6 volume printing mostly coming off the main frame  
7 printer. And working with applications like student  
8 rolls, registration cards, the university catalogue  
9 courses. And I got involved with using typesetting  
10 software on the main frame computer.

11 And then over time we gradually switched from  
12 main frame computers to client server environment, a  
13 network. And in general switched from printing to  
14 putting things online on the web. And one of the  
15 printing applications services we provided was a  
16 coursepack printing service. And I provided that  
17 service.

18 Q. And that service involved dealing with  
19 copyright law?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. How so?

22 A. Well, if anything was copyrighted I obtained  
23 the copyright permission and paid the royalties to the  
24 publishers and assembled the materials and arranged to  
25 have them printed out and sold through our university

1 bookstore.

2 Q. And this was in a prior position to your  
3 current one?

4 A. Well, I'm still providing that service. But  
5 it's --

6 Q. Okay.

7 A. -- become less and less over the years.

8 Q. Let me just ask. You were in the information  
9 systems and technology department, is that right?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Commonly called IS&T?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And you're in a group within that department  
14 known as LSS?

15 A. Yes, I was. But that's been disbanded.

16 Q. Tell me about that.

17 A. Well, a year ago there were five people in LSS  
18 and the two top people retired, the director and the  
19 manager.

20 Q. Just tell me who they were, if you would?

21 A. The director was Phil Williams and the  
22 manager, really wasn't my manager, was Randall Cravey.

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. And the main focus of that group was to  
25 support the state wide online library systems for the

1 Board Of Regents for all the University System.

2 So when they left the person at Board Of  
3 Regents in charge of that decided to move that service  
4 to Athens and the other two positions were transferred  
5 to Athens as of April 1st of this year. So that left  
6 me. And my focus was mainly on supporting our local  
7 library. And we got a new head librarian and she  
8 decided that she would prefer to have most of her own  
9 staff providing their own IT support. And so they've  
10 essentially done away with the LSS group.

11 Q. So are you still within IS&T?

12 A. Yes. I'm in a medium-sized group called the  
13 UATS right now.

14 Q. What does that stand for?

15 A. University academic technology support.

16 Q. And who do you report to?

17 A. For my current project I'm working with Paula  
18 Christopher who handles the WebCT system.

19 Q. So are you working with WebCT system now?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And how long have you been doing that now?

22 A. Only about a month.

23 Q. So do you report to Ms. Christopher?

24 A. On WebCT matters, yes. The head of UATS is  
25 Michael Russell.

1 Q. Michael Russell?

2 A. Yes. R-U-S-S-E-L-L.

3 Q. And who does Mr. Russell report to, do you  
4 know?

5 A. He reports directly to J. L. Albert.

6 Q. And do you have any employees or folks who  
7 report to you?

8 A. No.

9 Q. So do you still interface with the library at  
10 all?

11 A. A little bit. At the time of the lawsuit I  
12 was providing the scanning services for ERes. But they  
13 took that over in January.

14 Q. When you say they --

15 A. The library staff.

16 Q. Do you know the names of the persons who are  
17 doing that?

18 A. Denise Dimsdale and Melia Cargile. And they  
19 have a student assisting, also, or several.

20 Q. Are you still involved with the coursepack?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. So what is it with WebCT and your support of  
23 WebCT, what are you doing?

24 A. I'm helping to migrate from version 3 to  
25 version 8.

1 Q. And what's the reason for that migration?

2 A. It's -- well, as I understand it one company  
3 bought another one, I think Blackboard bought WebCT and  
4 they have a new version that's so totally different that  
5 it has to be on different servers and all of the  
6 materials have to be migrated over.

7 Q. Now, is WebCT something that's offered locally  
8 or --

9 A. It's offered state wide and the servers are in  
10 Athens and I believe controlled by the Board Of Regents.

11 Q. So to the extent Georgia State professors use  
12 WebCT to provide materials to their students, the  
13 servers that host that material are in Athens?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Okay. And so what is it that's done locally  
16 by you and Ms. Christopher?

17 A. Well, what I -- all I'm doing is just moving  
18 files from one server to the other and making sure all  
19 the materials that they had on the old server are  
20 available on the new one.

21 Q. And by files and materials, you mean course  
22 materials or do you mean the software for the --

23 A. No, course materials. Mostly Power Point  
24 files and Word documents, online tests, PDF files.

25 Q. I'm sorry if I'm missing something. I thought

1 you said those were stored on servers that were in  
2 Athens?

3 A. That's correct.

4 Q. So those are servers that you're working on?

5 A. Yes, remotely.

6 Q. Are you involved at all with the ongoing  
7 operation of the system, WebCT?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And that's also called ULearn, is that right?

10 A. I believe Georgia State has decided to call  
11 that product ULearn. I don't know if anybody else is  
12 calling it that or not.

13 Q. And is WebCT the name of the software?

14 A. WebCT, I think WebCT was the old software. I  
15 think when Blackboard bought them they -- I think they  
16 wanted to call them something else like Vista, I don't  
17 know for sure. But Georgia State is calling it ULearn.

18 Q. Is that what it's called state wide, do you  
19 know?

20 A. I'm not sure.

21 Q. You mentioned that the files include I think  
22 you said Power Points and Word documents and tests and  
23 things like that?

24 A. (Nods head affirmatively.)

25 Q. Are you aware of whether it also includes

1 reading materials for students?

2 A. I'm not sure. I haven't been examining every  
3 file for content.

4 Q. Have you examined them at all?

5 A. Some.

6 Q. And what have you found?

7 A. It's mostly Power Point and Word documents. I  
8 saw some PDF files, but I did not open them.

9 Q. Did you know whether those were reading  
10 materials?

11 A. I do not know.

12 Q. Going forward will your involvement include  
13 any ongoing monitoring of what the materials are on the  
14 system?

15 A. I haven't been instructed to do that.

16 Q. So right now you're just doing this file  
17 transfer process?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. So I just want to recap and make sure I've got  
20 it all.

21 So you currently then are working on WebCT and  
22 you currently are still working with coursepacks, hard  
23 copy coursepacks?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Other duties that you have now?

1           A.    We have another system called the electronic  
2 thesis and dissertations server or service which  
3 contains an online PDF copy of every thesis and  
4 dissertation from Georgia State. And I provide some  
5 support for that.

6           Q.    What type of support?

7           A.    I run a report each semester. I monitor the  
8 help information that comes in. I've had a couple of  
9 requests to change a couple things on the system.

10          Q.    Do you work with something called D Space?

11          A.    There is another product called D Space. And  
12 it's called an institutional repository.

13                My involvement with D Space started about a  
14 year ago when my boss retired. He turned that over to  
15 me. But the library was not very satisfied with it,  
16 with the product, and they since decided to switch to a  
17 different product.

18          Q.    When you say institutional repository, what do  
19 you mean?

20          A.    It's a way to archive anything including an  
21 entire web site and make sure that all of the URLs are  
22 permanent and persistent and all of the content material  
23 is maintained in its original form.

24          Q.    So would that -- I'm sorry.

25          A.    And it also ties in with the Voyager online



1 catalogue system that all the libraries in the state  
2 use.

3 Q. So is that used or was it used to archive web  
4 sites across the university?

5 A. It was really on a trial basis. And I only  
6 saw a few actual production type things on there.

7 Q. For example if a faculty member had a personal  
8 web site, I should say a web site on the Georgia State  
9 Internet site, would that have been archived by this  
10 product?

11 A. Probably not. No.

12 Q. Were library web sites at GSU archived?

13 A. I don't know. The only thing I recall that  
14 looked finished in production was for the Andrew Young  
15 School Policy Studies and they had a collection of  
16 newsletters on there.

17 Q. Let's talk about coursepacks a bit if we  
18 could. You said you're involved in the provision of  
19 coursepacks for students?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And how long have you been involved with that?

22 A. I guess since about '95.

23 Q. And as you said, that reaches back to a  
24 previous position to your current one?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. What is a coursepack?

2 A. A coursepack is a collection of book chapters  
3 or journal articles or instructor's notes or class  
4 materials combined together, printed together and sold  
5 as a unit through the Georgia State University  
6 Bookstore.

7 Q. Let me ask this. Do you distinguish in your  
8 work between supplemental and required reading for a  
9 course?

10 A. For the electronic reserves up until 2004 I  
11 was the main faculty interface for electronic reserves,  
12 and as such they would -- faculty would provide me with  
13 materials to put on the electronic reserves up until  
14 2004. And we had a -- a form that they had to fill out  
15 which included a checklist for determining fair use for  
16 educational purposes. And one of the questions was is  
17 the content that you're -- material that you're using of  
18 a small amount in relation to the total amount of  
19 material being used for the course.

20 So I assume that indicates that they would  
21 need to affirm that what they're using is supplemental  
22 material, I suppose you could call it that.

23 Q. Supplemental meaning supplemental to other  
24 material being used?

25 A. Yes. Yes.

1 Q. Now, do you mean supplemental to mean it  
2 wasn't required by the professor to be read?

3 A. I don't know. I did not always ask the  
4 instructors what was going to be required reading or  
5 not.

6 Q. I just want to make sure we have clear  
7 terminology. This material could have been supplemental  
8 and required in terms of the way you used those phrases?

9 A. It could have been.

10 Q. Supplemental to other reading in the course  
11 but nonetheless required?

12 A. Yes. Yes.

13 Q. And to your knowledge do coursepacks include  
14 required reading for a course?

15 A. I think some do and some don't.

16 Q. And how do you know?

17 A. Well, I can tell by sales that if I try to  
18 determine how many packets to print to sell I look at  
19 the number of students enrolled per class and if it's  
20 not required then I won't sell as many course packets  
21 for the class.

22 Q. Do you ask the professor?

23 A. I never really did --

24 Q. How do you know --

25 A. -- as a habit. I guess I've heard in response

1 from some of the professors that that was the case.  
2 Sometimes they would tell me this is not required so I  
3 won't need the full enrollment number.

4 Q. And if you were aware through some way that it  
5 was required you would order a coursepack essentially  
6 for everyone in the class?

7 A. Generally I would assume that it was required.

8 Q. Let's go back just for a second to what you  
9 were telling me about the EReserve system pre-2004.

10 You said there was a requirement that the  
11 amount put on EReserve was small, small in relation to  
12 the total amount used for the course, was that right?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. So it wasn't a small amount in relation to the  
15 work from which it was taken?

16 A. It was also stipulated that it should be a  
17 small amount in relation to the total work from which it  
18 was taken.

19 Q. And do you have an understanding with respect  
20 to the first one, the relation between the excerpt and  
21 the total used in the class, do you have an  
22 understanding that that was a requirement that is  
23 necessary to comply with copyright law?

24 A. I believe that was one of the requirements.

25 Q. Okay. Well, one of the requirements of the

1 policy makers at Georgia State or a requirement of the  
2 copyright law?

3 A. Of Georgia State and the Board Of Regents.

4 Q. Do you have a view, though, whether that's a  
5 requirement for EReserves postings to be compliant with  
6 copyright law?

7 A. I'm not sure about the specifics of the law on  
8 that.

9 Q. Is that requirement still in place?

10 A. I'm not sure for the ERes. The library staff  
11 took over the electronic reserves.

12 Q. Just recently though, correct?

13 A. Well, they took it over the first semester of  
14 2004. The library staff took over providing the faculty  
15 interface and the decision on content and the  
16 interpretation of copyright policy and dissemination of  
17 that information to the faculty.

18 Q. And after that point did you have any reason  
19 to do any analysis of works that were submitted for  
20 copyright compliance?

21 A. No. When I was doing scanning from 2004 up  
22 until this January I would look to see if I could tell  
23 if what I was being asked to scan was over our 20  
24 percent limit. And if I noticed that, then I would  
25 inform the library.

1 Q. Was that the only check you did?

2 A. Yes.

3 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 29  
4 was marked for identification  
5 by the reporter.)

6 BY MR. LARSON:

7 Q. Do you recognize this document?

8 A. No.

9 Q. I'll represent to you this was produced as  
10 part of the production of documents in this case.

11 A. This looks like something that my boss would  
12 have been asked to provide.

13 Q. But you don't recall seeing it?

14 A. I don't recall.

15 Q. Take your time to look at it if you need to.  
16 I want to focus you on a couple small sections.

17 If you could turn to page 3. Take a look down  
18 at the bottom of the paragraph starting for several  
19 years.

20 A. Right.

21 Q. And can you just read through that set of  
22 bullet points to yourself of tasks that are listed  
23 there?

24 A. Right, okay.

25 Q. Is that an accurate summary of your tasks with

1 respect to coursepacks?

2 A. For coursepacks, for printed coursepacks, yes.  
3 But not for electronic reserves.

4 Q. I understand that. And we'll talk about that.  
5 Is it still accurate as to your current practices?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Anything that's missing?

8 A. Well, I would -- I would assume that included  
9 in that would be in the copyright management service,  
10 would be making sure the instructors understand what  
11 they're allowed to use.

12 Q. Okay. Tell me about that. What is involved  
13 with that?

14 A. Well, I guess just making sure what is  
15 copyrighted and what isn't. But other than that, I  
16 can't think of anything else right now.

17 Q. So you assist professors in determining  
18 whether the works in the coursepacks implicate copyright  
19 in some way?

20 A. Well, I suppose one of my duties would also be  
21 to evaluate the materials for -- to determine if  
22 copyright laws are violated or not.

23 Q. And how do you do that?

24 A. By looking at it and telling -- if it looks  
25 like it's something that's been published, then I would

1 require bibliographic information to make sure what the  
2 course is.

3 Q. So if it looks like it's published, what do  
4 you do?

5 A. Then I try to get copyright permission.

6 Q. Let's just -- tell me about the process of  
7 your putting a coursepack together so we can walk  
8 through this.

9 How does it generally happen?

10 A. Well, generally the faculty member would bring  
11 the materials by and I would examine the materials and  
12 determine what needs copyright permission. And first  
13 use Copyright Clearance Center to see what is  
14 available --

15 Q. I'm going to step in if I could. I want to  
16 just ask you a couple questions about the early steps.

17 Would the faculty come to you or do they bring  
18 you books?

19 A. Sometimes.

20 Q. Do they bring you printouts of excerpts or  
21 articles?

22 A. Sometimes.

23 Q. Any other way that they bring you the  
24 materials for the coursepack?

25 A. That's about it.



1 Q. Will they give you just a name or a title and  
2 ask you to make a copy for them?

3 A. What do you mean?

4 Q. I mean, will they say I want a chapter of this  
5 particular book, can you get it from the library and  
6 make a copy for me?

7 A. I haven't been doing that for coursepacks  
8 because coursepacks are separate from what the library  
9 does really, so usually they will go to the library and  
10 get the copy and bring it to me for coursepacks.

11 Q. Okay. So do they fill out a form?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And what's on that form?

14 A. I don't recall everything in particular. For  
15 the last several years we've just been doing the same  
16 ones over and over. I haven't been requiring an E form  
17 every semester for a repeated same coursepack.

18 Q. You mean you've been providing the same  
19 coursepacks over and over?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. That's repeat instances of courses that run  
22 year after year?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. So have you done any of these forms recently  
25 then?

1 A. Not for coursepacks, no.

2 Q. When's the last time someone filled out a  
3 coursepack?

4 A. I don't recall.

5 Q. Do you know whether you produced any of those  
6 forms in response to the document requests for this  
7 litigation?

8 A. I think I probably did.

9 Q. And to the extent you did, those would have  
10 been from a few years back, am I understanding that  
11 right?

12 A. The last time it was used or modified, yes.

13 Q. Can faculty submit a coursepack request to you  
14 electronically through e-mail or on a web site?

15 A. I think we had an online form that they could  
16 fill out, submit.

17 Q. You had one when?

18 A. What was the question?

19 Q. When did you have this online form that you  
20 just mentioned?

21 A. I don't remember what year it was.

22 Q. It's been a while?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And again is that because the same faculty  
25 tend to be using the same coursepack over and over?

1 A. Yes. Yes.

2 Q. Okay. Do you have something called the book  
3 adoptions web site?

4 A. I'm not familiar with that.

5 Q. You are not familiar with that?

6 So a faculty member comes to you with copies  
7 of an article or a book from which they want something  
8 included in a coursepack. Tell me then how you -- what  
9 you do with respect to determining whether you need to  
10 get copyright permission.

11 A. If it looks like something that's been  
12 published in a book or journal then I assume that it  
13 needs copyright permission unless the instructor tells  
14 me they already have permission or can show me that they  
15 do.

16 Q. Does that happen that they'll tell you that  
17 they've got permission?

18 A. A couple of times it has.

19 Q. And did they show you something on those  
20 occasions to show that they had permission?

21 A. I have been shown things in the past.

22 Q. What would they show you?

23 A. I believe I've seen a letter from a publisher  
24 saying the faculty member had the right to use it.

25 Q. But if they don't tell you that they've got

1 permission, then your assumption is if it's published it  
2 needs to have copyright permission?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And is that independent of whether the reading  
5 excerpt is a required reading or not for the course?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Is there any page limit you apply or, you  
8 know, like the 20 percent test you mentioned for  
9 coursepack?

10 A. For coursepack printing?

11 Q. Uh-huh.

12 A. No, that's up to the publisher.

13 Q. So even if a faculty member were to come in  
14 with a two page excerpt or something, that you would  
15 still --

16 A. Yes, I would assume it would need copyright  
17 permission.

18 Q. Do you do any sort of fair use analysis of the  
19 excerpts to see whether they might not need permission?

20 A. Not for coursepack printing. There are some  
21 things that are public domain.

22 Q. Like what?

23 A. Oh, I think there's a statement of law that's  
24 used for some law coursepacks.

25 Q. Just while we're on this document, the third

1 bullet down in the section we're looking at says the  
2 invoicing of area bookstores for coursepacks sold.

3 A. Right.

4 Q. So do you sell the coursepacks to bookstores  
5 and they sell them to the students?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. So why doesn't the faculty member just go to  
8 the bookstore directly and have the bookstore to take  
9 care of that?

10 A. Some of them do and the bookstore refers them  
11 to me. The bookstore doesn't have its own printing  
12 operation.

13 Q. Who does the printing?

14 A. There's a group in IS&T that does our  
15 printing.

16 Q. And that's at your request or direction?

17 A. Yes. My request.

18 Q. Do you use other books stores besides the GSU  
19 Bookstore?

20 A. In the past we have sold to Georgia Bookstore  
21 but not in years.

22 Q. What's Georgia Bookstore?

23 A. It's a private bookstore off campus. And I  
24 think there was one or two semesters years ago that we  
25 sold some to the Park Place Bookstore, which is another

1 private bookstore off campus. But for the last several  
2 years they've only sold to Georgia State University  
3 Bookstore.

4 Q. Is there a reason for that?

5 A. It's mostly the instructors would prefer it  
6 being a Georgia State University bookstore.

7 Q. And that's a bookstore that's owned by the  
8 university?

9 A. It's not owned by the university. It's owned  
10 by a company called Follett, F-O-L-L-E-T-T. It's a  
11 private company.

12 Q. So it's the official Georgia State Bookstore  
13 but privately held?

14 A. Yes. Right.

15 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 30  
16 was marked for identification  
17 by the reporter.)

18 BY MR. LARSON:

19 Q. Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this e-mail?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Was this sent by you?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. You can put that one aside.

24 So up until a couple months ago you worked  
25 with EReserves as well?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Just tell me what EReserves is.

3 A. Electronic reserves is a more modern way of  
4 doing the old fashioned library reserves process where a  
5 book would be put on hold for a group of students in a  
6 class and they could come in and look at the book and  
7 read a chapter or take the book to the copy machine and  
8 copy it, copy a chapter.

9 And instead of doing that we scan the chapter  
10 in and put it online and make that available to the  
11 students in the class based on the password restriction.

12 Q. So it's a method of providing course reading  
13 materials to students, is that right?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Do you know, does EReserves contain required  
16 course readings?

17 A. I would assume so.

18 Q. Do you ask the faculty members whether a  
19 reading that they submit is required or not?

20 A. Well, I don't deal with the faculty any more  
21 since spring semester of 2004.

22 Q. When you say you -- I'm sorry. Go ahead.

23 A. No.

24 Q. You said you assume so. What's that  
25 assumption based on?

1           A.    Well, I would see the sibilus for the classes  
2           and I believe sometimes that would refer to some of the  
3           readings on electronic reserves as required readings.

4           Q.    And that was -- when you say you would see the  
5           sibilus, was that up until -- as part of the process up  
6           until the last couple of months when you stopped  
7           participating?

8           A.    Right. Right. Because I would scan it in and  
9           sometimes I would need to follow the sibilus to make  
10          sure I got all the copies of what they wanted scanned  
11          in.

12          Q.    So let's just walk through the process of how  
13          we work with a faculty member posting things on  
14          EReserve.

15          A.    Now or in 2004 or '5 or '6?

16          Q.    No, the process, I recognize there maybe be  
17          some changes, but the general process.

18          A.    The general process.

19          Q.    Yeah, the general process up until -- up  
20          until --

21                   MR. ASKEW: Let's let him finish his  
22                   question.

23                   THE WITNESS: Yeah, okay.

24                   MR. ASKEW: Why don't you restate the  
25                   question so it's clear for the record.



1 BY MR. LARSON:

2 Q. Walk me through the process, if you would, of  
3 how the EReserves submission by faculty worked when you  
4 were involved in it last year?

5 MR. ASKEW: Last year you say?

6 MR. LARSON: Yeah.

7 THE WITNESS: As I understand it a  
8 faculty member could submit a list of  
9 readings that they wanted online to the  
10 library staff.

11 The library staff could go to their  
12 collections and locate the books required.  
13 They could also review their collections of  
14 journal articles that are available online  
15 that they already have and see if what they  
16 want to use is in that collection already.

17 The library staff would review the  
18 materials requested to make sure that they  
19 complied with copyright restrictions. And  
20 then they would bring those materials to me  
21 for scanning.

22 And I would scan in the materials and  
23 clean them up and create a PDF file and  
24 copy that PDF file over to a staging area  
25 on the ERes server. Then the library staff

1 would then take that PDF file and make it  
2 available on the faculty member's course  
3 web site on ERes.

4 BY MR. LARSON:

5 Q. So if there was no scanning to be done for a  
6 particular course you wouldn't --

7 A. Correct, I would not be involved.

8 Q. You wouldn't get involved. And the request  
9 came to you from the library staff?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. What did you make your copies from, what did  
12 you scan?

13 A. Usually originals that the library staff would  
14 pull from their shelves. Sometimes it would be xerox  
15 copies.

16 Q. And do you know whether those xerox copies  
17 were made by the library staff or by the faculty member?

18 A. I do not know for sure.

19 Q. Okay. And then when you got the book from the  
20 library, the books, how would you know what to copy?

21 A. They would have a -- usually a -- just a  
22 post-it note attached to the book with a page range for  
23 each book.

24 Q. And you mentioned before you would see a  
25 sibilus. Would they also send you a sibilus for the

1 class?

2 A. Sometimes there would be a sibilus that would  
3 include a list of the page ranges that they wanted.

4 Q. Okay. Now, are you aware that the professor  
5 would fill out a form with the library when they  
6 submitted their request?

7 A. I'm not sure. I can't recall exactly the way  
8 that they were doing it when they took it over.

9 Q. Okay. But in any case, you weren't provided  
10 with a form by the library of the works to be scanned?

11 A. Let's see. Sometimes I would get a form.  
12 Yeah, they did have an online form for submitting the  
13 works, yes.

14 Q. Let's mark this Plaintiffs' 31.

15 A. Yes, that's an ERes form. Right, that's  
16 the --

17 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 31  
18 was marked for identification  
19 by the reporter.)

20 MR. ASKEW: This is Exhibit 31?

21 MR. LARSON: Exhibit 31.

22 BY MR. LARSON:

23 Q. Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this form?

24 A. Yes. Yes.

25 Q. And what is this?

1           A.     This is the form that the instructors would  
2     fill out, turn into the library staff.

3           Q.     Okay.  So you've seen these before?

4           A.     Yes, yes, now that I see it I remember.

5           Q.     You said the professor fills it out?

6           A.     I don't know who fills it out, to tell you the  
7     truth.  I suppose sometimes it's the professor and  
8     sometimes it may be the staff.  I don't know.

9           Q.     Okay.  This says ERes at the top.  Do you  
10    know, is this form only used for works that go up on  
11    EReserves or could it also be for hard copy reserves?

12          A.     I don't know for sure.

13          Q.     You see the status column?

14          A.     Status, yes.

15          Q.     Says J, J, J?

16          A.     Yes.

17          Q.     That's not you, is it?

18          A.     I don't know.  It may be indicating that  
19    that's one for me to scan.

20          Q.     So is it the case that sometimes when the  
21    library sent you materials to be scanned they would  
22    include a form like this?

23          A.     Yes.  Yes.  That is the case.

24          Q.     And then you would use this form to determine  
25    which page ranges to copy?

1           A.     Sometimes there would be a post-it note  
2           indicating the page range.  Sometimes there would be a  
3           discrepancy.  If the instructor wanted more than they  
4           allowed, they may fill out and ask for more than they're  
5           allowed.  But what the library would ask me to scan may  
6           be different, may be less than what they requested on  
7           the form.  So I would go by the post-it notes that they  
8           would put on the book.

9           Q.     So if the page range identified was for more  
10          than 20 percent of the book, you wouldn't scan that  
11          entire range?

12          A.     I would -- if I had the book and the page  
13          range I would try to remember and notice that that was  
14          the case.  If it was I would usually go ahead and scan  
15          it anyway and let them reduce the amount later.

16          Q.     What do you mean by reduce the amount later?

17          A.     Well, they have the Acrobat software that  
18          would be able to open that PDF file up and delete pages  
19          from that file.

20          Q.     So they could delete pages until the excerpt  
21          got down to less than 20 percent?

22          A.     They could if they wanted to.

23          Q.     Did you do this type of percentage review with  
24          every excerpt that you scanned?

25          A.     I can't guarantee that I always did it, but I

1       tried to keep it in mind.

2           Q.     So I know you can't give me with exact  
3 precision, but as a general matter you would look at the  
4 size of the excerpt and look at the length of the book  
5 and see if it was over 20 percent?

6           A.     Yes.

7           Q.     And if it was over 20 percent --

8           A.     I would let the library staff know.

9           Q.     And it was -- would they determine whether or  
10 not the excerpts could be posted?

11          A.     Yes, that was their decision.

12          Q.     And was there any sort of communication back  
13 to you or follow up as to whether they reduced the size  
14 of the articles to get below 20 percent?

15          A.     I recall a couple of occasions when they did  
16 indicate that perhaps there was a misunderstanding or a  
17 miscalculation. But maybe only once or twice a  
18 semester.

19          Q.     Take a look at -- there's a box in the middle  
20 here that starts with the phrase, the materials that I  
21 am submitting. Do you see that?

22          A.     Yes.

23          Q.     And then you see on the third line it says for  
24 book selections you may place one chapter less than 20  
25 percent of the content from the book.

1 A. Right.

2 Q. That's consistent with what we've been  
3 discussing, the 20 percent cutoff?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Says copyrighted material must have the  
6 complete bibliographic citation.

7 Did you in your scanning process check that in  
8 any way or confirm that it did indeed have the complete  
9 bibliographic citation?

10 A. It was always my practice to scan the title  
11 page and the copyright page of any book that we had.  
12 But I did not enter the bibliographic information into  
13 the system, into the ERes database.

14 Q. Okay. So in looking at this form, for  
15 example, the second line of the professor's works, it  
16 just says "The Buddha Eye", is that right? I think I'm  
17 reading that correctly.

18 A. Okay.

19 Q. There's no publisher listed or city, right?

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. If you got something like this you would have  
22 still scanned it?

23 A. If it was a book I would have scanned the  
24 title page and the copyright page of the book and  
25 included that with the excerpt.

1 Q. In the scan. Okay.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Says -- going back to the box in the middle  
4 where we left off. Says no second generation copies of  
5 copyrighted materials will be placed on physical  
6 reserve.

7 Did you deal with physical reserves at all?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Says for digitized items the original item  
10 must be owned either by the library or by the instructor  
11 placing the item on reserve.

12 Do you understand that to be a requirement of  
13 GSU's copyright policy?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Did you do any sort of check to see whether  
16 the items you were scanning were owned by the library or  
17 the professor?

18 A. I did not. I did not consider that my  
19 responsibility.

20 Q. Whose responsibility was that?

21 A. I assume it was the library staff.

22 Q. So you would check 20 percent and that was  
23 basically the check you did?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Let me ask. How did you name the files that



1 you scanned?

2 A. The naming convention I used was -- started  
3 with the class name, for instance, PHIL2010 in this  
4 case, then a dash and then the instructor's last name.  
5 And then for each different file I would have an 01, 02,  
6 03 so I did not save -- I did not try to put any more  
7 information than that in the file name.

8 MR. LARSON: We need to break to change  
9 the videotape.

10 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Off the record at  
11 9:51:31.

12 (Brief recess.)

13 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is tape two.

14 We are back on the record at 10:05:33.

15 BY MR. LARSON:

16 Q. Mr. Palmour, when we left off you were telling  
17 me about the file naming convention that you used for  
18 EReserves files. You mentioned that it includes the  
19 name of the class and the instructor's last name and  
20 then a sequential number for the excerpt.

21 Is the author's name included anywhere in the  
22 file name?

23 A. Not in what I make, no.

24 Q. Okay. Anything indicating the actual name of  
25 the underlying work?

1 A. No.

2 Q. You mentioned there's some bibliographic  
3 information that's inputted into the ERes system, is  
4 that right?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Who was it that would input that bibliographic  
7 information?

8 A. The library reserve staff.

9 Q. And do you know whether they did that working  
10 with information given to them by the faculty member?

11 A. I don't know.

12 Q. Do you know if they would look at the book  
13 itself and enter that information or just take it from  
14 the form?

15 A. I don't know how they did that.

16 Q. So when you said the PDF copies, would you  
17 check the copy that you made against the request to make  
18 sure you had the correct pages and the correct piece?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Okay. You recall any instances where you  
21 copied the wrong chapter or the wrong pages?

22 A. Oh, yes.

23 Q. Did that happen frequently?

24 A. Not very.

25 Q. Now, if a faculty member submitted -- let me

1 back up.

2 I think you said, and correct me if I'm wrong,  
3 that sometimes rather than getting a book you would get  
4 a xerox copy?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. In those situations how would you do the 20  
7 percent check?

8 A. I would not.

9 Q. Okay. You would just make a digital scan of  
10 the xerox copy and send it back to the library?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. In instances when you -- strike that.

13 Who posted the files to the EReserve server?

14 A. The library staff would make them available to  
15 the students. I would copy the file into a staging  
16 area.

17 Q. What does that mean?

18 A. Well, the way the software worked was when you  
19 add a new faculty member -- when you add an account for  
20 a new faculty member it adds a directory with that new  
21 account. And any files that are copied up to that  
22 directory are then available to an administrator who is  
23 setting up that course web page for the faculty member.

24 Q. And they're able to copy the files over  
25 into --

1           A.    Yes, they're able to make them visible to the  
2 students.

3           Q.    Okay. Can you just take a look back at the  
4 Plaintiffs' Exhibit 29, the first, and flip to page 4.  
5 And look at the top there, there's a paragraph and a  
6 series of bullets related to the electronic reserves  
7 environment at GSU.

8                   Can you tell me if those bullet points there  
9 are an accurate description of your duties with respect  
10 to EReserves?

11          A.    Yes.

12          Q.    Just tell me what primary system  
13 administration for the Docutek ERes system involved?

14          A.    Primarily is the liaison between the library  
15 staff and the vendor. When the library staff had  
16 questions about how the software worked they would ask  
17 me and if I could not resolve that I would ask the  
18 vendor. They also had software enhancement requests  
19 that they would express to me that I would pass on to  
20 the vendor. And then sometimes the vendor would have  
21 updates to the software and I would coordinate that with  
22 the library staff to get those implemented.

23          Q.    Would you actually implement them yourself?

24          A.    No, I would ask the systems programming group  
25 to do the actual upgrade.

1 Q. Who's handling that task now, do you know?  
2 And by that task, I mean the primary system  
3 administration.

4 A. I suppose that's still me. They still  
5 occasionally ask me questions.

6 Q. So you're no longer scanning, though?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. The third bullet says move the contents of the  
9 current IS&T electronic reserve system Docuweb to the  
10 new Docutek ERes system purchased and supported by IS&T  
11 to support GSU electronic reserves.

12 What are the components of the Docutek system?

13 A. Components of the Docutek system --

14 Q. Is there hardware, software, you know, a  
15 server?

16 A. There is a server and there is -- it's a  
17 server that it only has the Docutek software running on  
18 it. And there's the Docutek software and the Microsoft  
19 Windows XP operating system is what it runs on.

20 Q. Those are owned by the university?

21 A. Well, the server is owned by the university.  
22 The software is licensed by the university.

23 Q. And is that -- so the university pays a  
24 license fee to Docutek?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And is that a one time fee or an annual fee?

2 A. It's an annual fee.

3 Q. Do you know how much that is?

4 A. It's my recollection that's in the  
5 neighborhood of between 4 and \$5,000 a year.

6 Q. Are there other ongoing costs with regard to  
7 operating and maintaining the EReserve system other than  
8 that annual license fee?

9 A. There's a backup cost.

10 Q. What's the backup cost?

11 A. I do not know.

12 Q. I mean, what do you mean by that?

13 A. The systems programming group provides service  
14 where they back up all the production servers and make  
15 sure if there's a crash they can rebuild it to the point  
16 where it was before the crash.

17 Q. That bullet also says -- refers to moving the  
18 contents of the current IS&T electronic reserve system  
19 Docuweb to the new system Docutek ERes?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Docuweb was the old EReserve system?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And when ERes was put in by Docutek the  
24 contents -- tell me what happened.

25 A. The instructors that were teaching classes for

1 spring semester 2004 had their materials copied over to  
2 the new server and made available to the library's  
3 reserve staff.

4 Q. Was everything that was on the Docuweb server  
5 transferred over or just what was needed for courses  
6 going forward?

7 A. Just what was needed.

8 Q. We'll mark our next exhibit as Plaintiffs' 32.  
9 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 32  
10 was marked for identification  
11 by the reporter.)

12 BY MR. LARSON:

13 Q. Document with Bates number GSU006281.

14 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

15 A. I've never used this form, so -- but I'm aware  
16 that this form exists.

17 Q. Have you seen a form like this before?

18 A. Not filled out.

19 Q. Where have you seen it? I mean, where have  
20 you seen a not filled out version?

21 A. I believe it's accessible from the ERes main  
22 web site.

23 Q. Do you know from your experience enough to say  
24 whether this is a form that's filled out when a  
25 professor submits an electronic request rather than a

1 hard copy request for EReserves?

2 A. I'm not sure.

3 Q. So it was never the case when you were  
4 scanning materials for EReserves that a form like this  
5 was given to you?

6 A. No, I have not seen these forms.

7 Q. Put that aside.

8 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 33  
9 was marked for identification  
10 by the reporter.)

11 BY MR. LARSON:

12 Q. Mark this as Plaintiffs' 33.

13 This is a document bearing Bates number  
14 GAsate0000693 through 705.

15 Mr. Palmour, have you seen this document?

16 A. I don't recall seeing this document.

17 Q. Turn to page 2, page number 694. Just look at  
18 those bullets and tell me if that's an accurate  
19 description of the Docutek software and server?

20 A. Well, it says running Windows 2000, so I think  
21 I said Windows XP. That's the only difference.

22 Q. Okay. Says we are currently using 20 gigabits  
23 of disk space.

24 Do you know how much is currently being used  
25 for storage of ERes materials?



1 A. No, I don't.

2 Q. Can you turn to page 695, please, next page.

3 There's a line midway through that -- this is  
4 the slide entitled process. That slide at least  
5 indicates that after the library accepts a request from  
6 the instructor that it locates a copy of the item  
7 digital or print.

8 Do you have any understanding as to what it  
9 would mean for the library to locate a digital copy of  
10 an item?

11 A. The library pays a fee for online databases of  
12 journal articles. So I assume it's referring to that.

13 Q. Okay. Does the library also maintain copies  
14 of scanned items that were used in past semesters?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Those are kept on the ERes server?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. They're archived?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. So if a professor were to come in semester one  
21 and use an item and it already existed, had been scanned  
22 for a previous semester, they could just take that old  
23 version rather than rescanning?

24 A. Yes. Yes.

25 Q. Do you know what open URL works is? It's in

1 the bullet point there about halfway down.

2 A. I do not know.

3 Q. I'm sorry, I think it's open URL -- the bullet  
4 is saying open URL works but is currently not being  
5 used. You don't know what open URL is?

6 A. I don't know.

7 Q. And the next page, if you could just take a  
8 look.

9 Headlined electronic reserves request form.  
10 Is this something you've seen?

11 A. No.

12 Q. So I take it you don't know whether this is  
13 the interface that's currently being used?

14 A. I do not know.

15 Q. Would you turn to the page that says 698 at  
16 the bottom. It's a page headlined access to course.  
17 Says for each course a course page is created.

18 What's a course page?

19 A. A web page specific to that course.

20 Q. And this is a web page within the ERes  
21 software or site?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Is that also sometimes called a course  
24 reserves page?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Forgive me if you've answered this. But who  
2 creates those pages?

3 A. The library reserve staff.

4 Q. And who would that be, do you know the names?

5 A. Melia Cargile or Denise Dimsdale.

6 Q. Is there someone named Corey Schlotzhauer?

7 A. Yes. It's my understanding he works mainly  
8 with the hard copy reserves.

9 Q. And is there someone named Laura Burtle?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And is she involved with this process?

12 A. She is I would say the number two person in  
13 the library overall.

14 Q. So does that mean yes, she is involved in this  
15 process?

16 A. Well, I guess in a supervisory capacity.

17 Q. Can you just turn to the last page of the  
18 document which is 705. Do you know whether this is the  
19 current format of a course page?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Okay.

22 A. It is.

23 Q. So just take a look, there's the first entry  
24 under the title column says "Undernourishment Around The  
25 World". Format is PDF and the size is 478 KB. Now,

1 from what you told me before when you scan documents you  
2 named them with the professor name and the course name,  
3 correct, not with a title like this?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. So is it reasonable to assume this isn't an  
6 excerpt that you would have scanned and created?

7 A. Not necessarily.

8 Q. Okay. Why not?

9 A. It could have come from anywhere as far as I  
10 know.

11 Q. Now, that "Undernourishment Around The World"  
12 has an underline under it. Is that a link?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And what happens when the person using the  
15 system clicks on a link like that?

16 A. To the right it says the format is PDF, so  
17 that means it will open the Adobe Acrobat reader and  
18 load that file into Adobe Acrobat.

19 Q. And then the user can look at that on their  
20 computer screen?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Computer terminal.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And they can save it to their hard drive of  
25 their machine?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. They can print it?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. As a technical matter, is it your  
5 understanding that even if they just view it on their  
6 screen without printing it or saving it to their hard  
7 drive that a copy of the file is being sent over to  
8 their computer?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You can put that one away.

11 So at the end of the semester, do the files  
12 that have been loaded up to the ERes server stay on the  
13 server?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Are they -- is access to those files abated in  
16 some way?

17 A. Yes. Mainly by -- well, there's two ways.  
18 The password is changed, and also the course reserve  
19 page can be archived so that it's not visible to anybody  
20 but an administrator.

21 Q. Is that archiving process done automatically  
22 or does someone have to get in manually and do it?

23 A. I believe it's not done automatically. Well,  
24 okay, when it's set up there's a visible date range  
25 established, so at the end of that date then it's no

1 longer -- it's automatically not available. So I guess  
2 the answer would be yes.

3 Q. Let me restate that just to make sure I  
4 understand.

5 When the course page is set up, it's set up to  
6 be available during a certain date range?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. And is the end of that range generally the end  
9 of the semester?

10 A. Correct.

11 Q. Once that date occurs then that course page is  
12 no longer accessible to users?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. But it stays on the system?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. So if -- and it can later be reactivated?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. So if someone came to you, a professor or  
19 counsel, and asked if you could -- if they could see  
20 your or reactivate a course page for a class that was  
21 offered in the spring of 2005, for example, that could  
22 be done?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And it would -- the links to the readings for  
25 that class would be active?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Do you know under the -- let me step back.

3 You're aware that a new copyright policy was  
4 recently enacted by the Board Of Regents?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And that's operative now at Georgia State?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Do you know under this new policy whether any  
9 of what you just told me with respect to archiving will  
10 change?

11 A. I heard that that's under discussion.

12 Q. Without -- I don't want you to tell me  
13 anything you've been told by your counsel, but to the  
14 extent those discussions were not from counsel, what  
15 have you heard?

16 A. Well, I've heard that in general the readings  
17 should be made unavailable when they're not used by --  
18 for a particular class any more. And there's been a  
19 discussion as to how far that should go, whether we  
20 should delete the files completely or move them off the  
21 system.

22 Q. Have you been involved in those discussions?

23 A. Only briefly. I mean, I'm not -- they asked  
24 me logistically what would be involved in recopying all  
25 the files back to the server every semester. And --

1 Q. Who's they?

2 A. Denise Dimsdale asked me.

3 Q. So currently the way it did work as you just  
4 described to me before, the files were made available at  
5 the end of the semester, is that right?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. But they still sat on the server?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And the question now is whether they should be  
10 deleted completely from the server?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And that would mean they wouldn't exist, the  
13 digital copies wouldn't exist anywhere?

14 A. Well, it's -- they could be saved -- when  
15 they're scanned they're stored on a PC initially, and --

16 Q. On your PC?

17 A. No, on the PC that's set up and working with  
18 the scanning system, which is in the library's media  
19 center now.

20 Q. And do you know when they're scanned and saved  
21 there, is a copy kept there when it's moved, copied over  
22 to the ERes server?

23 A. That was the procedure last I heard. I don't  
24 know for sure that they still keep it there.

25 Q. Was that the procedure when you were?



1           A.    Yeah, when I did the scanning myself that was  
2 my procedure.

3           Q.    Do you know whether the discussions about  
4 deleting the files at the end of the semester would  
5 include deleting them from this scanning server?

6           A.    I haven't heard that discussion.  Well, I  
7 guess somebody did bring up the possibility of having to  
8 rescan everything every time.

9           Q.    Well, that's where I was going.  When you  
10 discussed this, were you -- was the question what would  
11 be involved in moving them from the scanning system over  
12 to the EReserve server again or actually rescanning them  
13 from scratch?

14          A.    Both were discussed as options.

15          Q.    And do you have any knowledge of whether a  
16 decision has been made?

17          A.    I do not.

18          Q.    Did you have a recommendation when you spoke  
19 to Denise?

20          A.    Not really other than just saying that both  
21 would be hard.

22          Q.    So let's take the first scenario which would  
23 be that if the files still remain on the scanning  
24 server, for lack of a better word, what would be hard  
25 about moving them back from that server over to the user

1 system?

2 A. Well, it would take -- you would have to copy  
3 each individual file and you would have to reenter  
4 whatever bibliographic information and title was already  
5 there. And you'd have to identify each file. Just like  
6 you said, I just had a different file naming convention.

7 Q. So when they're currently -- when you were  
8 dealing with this last year, for example, when they were  
9 archived, the bibliographic information that had been  
10 entered with respect to any file remained and was there?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Let me ask about that. That bibliographic  
13 information, was that entered into particular fields  
14 within Docutek or just in the title column, or how did  
15 that work?

16 A. Docutek has the capability of entering in a  
17 title and author and publisher field. But most of the  
18 faculty did not like the way that that presented the  
19 material so the library staff decided to enter that  
20 information as part of the title of the document.

21 It was their normal practice to enter the  
22 complete bibliographic citation as part of the title so  
23 that they could have it formatted the way that they  
24 wanted it to appear.

25 Q. Do you know what the faculty's concern was

1 or --

2 A. I think most of them wanted it to appear in  
3 standard Chicago manual style format or APA style format  
4 to match what they have on their sibilus.

5 Q. And the way Docutek was set up it wouldn't  
6 present it that way?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. And so the library staff would use the title  
9 fields and just enter the citation with all that  
10 information in there?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. Do you know if they did that as a matter of  
13 regular practice?

14 A. I believe they did.

15 Q. So are you aware of when a decision will be  
16 made on the deletion question that we were talking  
17 about --

18 A. No.

19 Q. Well, let me ask this, is the current spring  
20 semester over yet?

21 A. No. It ends in early May.

22 Q. So right now on the EReserve server all the  
23 old files are still present?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Just to go back, we talked about the new

1 policy and what changes may happen with respect to the  
2 archiving policy. Will the new policy have any impact  
3 on your coursepack operation?

4 A. I don't know.

5 Q. Are you aware of any as you sit here?

6 A. Well, I suppose it could encourage people to  
7 use coursepacks instead of electronic reserves if it  
8 became too cumbersome to use the electronic reserves.

9 Q. And by too cumbersome, what do you mean?

10 A. Well, if you require everything to be redone  
11 every semester it would put a greater work load on the  
12 staff and they may have to reduce what they can provide.

13 Q. In terms of your practices for seeking  
14 permission and that sort of thing, do you have any sense  
15 of whether that's going to change under the new policy?

16 A. I do not know.

17 Q. Okay. Haven't given it any thought?

18 A. Well, I mean, I've read the policy but as far  
19 as electronic reserves go, it's not really my  
20 responsibility right now.

21 Q. So just to be clear, sitting here you aren't  
22 aware of any specific changes you're going to be making  
23 in your coursepack operation because of the new policy?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Let me just confirm. Your ERes and Docutek

1 support you've provided in the past, was that just local  
2 to Georgia State?

3 A. There was a time early on when we provided the  
4 Docuweb electronic reserves service to a couple of other  
5 institutions, a couple other University System units.

6 Q. That changed when you switched to Docutek?

7 A. That didn't last very long. It lasted maybe  
8 two years, I guess maybe. In the late 90s.

9 Q. Will you mark Plaintiffs' 34.

10 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 34  
11 was marked for identification  
12 by the reporter.)

13 BY MR. LARSON:

14 Q. This is a document with Bates number Georgia  
15 State 0009948.

16 Mr. Palmour, take a look at this and let me  
17 know if you recognize this document.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And what is it?

20 A. This is an e-mail in response to an inquiry  
21 from Mike Russell, who is the director of UATS.

22 Q. Okay. Can you just go down to the bottom of  
23 the last page.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. So am I right this starts with an e-mail from

1 Mike -- well, there aren't any recipients indicated.  
2 But you later responded to this e-mail, correct?

3 A. Right. I got this e-mail from Mike Russell.

4 Q. He says after meeting with Nan she had some  
5 items for us to consider.

6 I take it that Nan Seamans is the new  
7 librarian?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Number two says EReserve process enhancements?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Do you know what was meant by that?

12 A. I asked Denise Dimsdale, and I think the main  
13 thing she wanted improved with the software was the way  
14 the information is displayed, bibliographic information.  
15 She wanted to be able to control that more.

16 Q. And you asked Docutek about fixing that  
17 problem at one point or another?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And what did they tell you?

20 A. I believe they said that a lot of people had  
21 asked for that and they would consider it in the future.

22 Q. Okay. And down at the bottom in the last  
23 sentence he says I understand that the library is not  
24 happy with the current EReserve and D Space solutions.

25 Is that the bibliographic information problem

1 that you're referring to?

2 A. I suppose. I mean, I asked Denise what that  
3 was referring to and that was the main thing she could  
4 come up with is the complaint about the way EReserve  
5 works.

6 Q. Number 4 on this list says coursepacks,  
7 getting rid of them?

8 A. Right.

9 Q. What does that mean?

10 A. That means that they weren't really a library  
11 function, they never were really something that the  
12 library was doing. And the assumption in this is that I  
13 was supposed to be supporting the library full time and  
14 if that was the case she didn't want me spending my time  
15 on coursepacks.

16 Q. Now, was any of your salary or the costs that  
17 you incurred paid by the library?

18 A. No.

19 Q. So it was just a matter of your spending your  
20 time on it?

21 A. Yes. Our current associate provost instituted  
22 a full cost accounting initiative to try to identify  
23 what all of our services cost. And then he presented  
24 that information to the library's clients and let them  
25 respond with what it was they wanted us to be spending

1 the money on. So this was in that context, I believe.

2 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 35  
3 was marked for identification  
4 by the reporter.)

5 BY MR. LARSON:

6 Q. Mark Plaintiffs' 35. It's a document bearing  
7 the Bates number Georgia State 009876.

8 And I will represent to you, Mr. Palmour, this  
9 was actually produced as an Excel file, so the first  
10 page is marked with a Bates stamp and the subsequent  
11 pages are a printout that we made from that native Excel  
12 file.

13 A. Okay.

14 Q. Do you recognize this document?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Is this the plan you were just discussing?

17 A. No, this is the old standard way of doing the  
18 budget. This is what we called the spin plan.

19 Q. Okay. And what was the new full cost  
20 accounting?

21 A. Yes. They refer to it as either FMM or full  
22 cost.

23 Q. So this document that we're looking at, do you  
24 know when this was created?

25 A. No.



1 Q. Did you -- have you seen it?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Did you participate in any way in putting it  
4 together?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Take a look on the first page. And the way  
7 this works, just so we're clear, the first page -- first  
8 and second page go together. In other words, the second  
9 page is a continuation of columns corresponding to the  
10 items on the first page. Does that make sense?

11 So if you go down to the bottom of the first  
12 page you'll see it says task coursepacks?

13 A. I don't see --

14 Q. See that?

15 MR. ASKEW: What page are you talking  
16 about?

17 BY MR. LARSON:

18 Q. I'm sorry. There's a page that says  
19 instruction, right?

20 A. Right.

21 Q. And the next page --

22 A. Right.

23 Q. -- there's a main column that says library  
24 services support?

25 A. Right.

1 Q. If you go down that column to four lines up  
2 from the bottom it says task coursepacks?

3 A. I see. Right. Right.

4 Q. And a couple lines down in there it says  
5 support the LSS coursepack service.

6 A. Right.

7 Q. Information support specialist lead. And then  
8 moving over to the right you'll see your name?

9 A. Right.

10 Q. And then in the column that's headlined  
11 FC10FTE says .3?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Is that a measurement of the amount of your  
14 time spent on coursepacks?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Can we move two pages later. And then if you  
17 go down about halfway down you'll see it says task  
18 Docutek ERes?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And again you'll see your name two lines down?

21 A. Right.

22 Q. Does that reflect the fact that half of your  
23 time is spent or was spent supporting the ERes system?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. There's -- if you go down a little bit lower

1 there's a category called software licenses and  
2 maintenance. You see that?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And that lists Docutek software, Xerox scanner  
5 software and Docutek ERes software. And then over in  
6 those lines over to the right there's some costs  
7 associated with those?

8 A. Right.

9 Q. To your knowledge are those accurate  
10 representations of the costs of those pieces of  
11 software?

12 A. Roughly.

13 Q. Okay. And then quite a little bit lower says  
14 scanners need to be replaced. You see that?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And there's a cost associated with that,  
17 \$52,000?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Was that done?

20 A. No.

21 Q. So the old scanners are still being used?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Is there a plan to replace them?

24 A. Not that I know of.

25 Q. All right. You can put that away.

1 Can we go back to Plaintiffs' Exhibit 34.

2 This was the e-mail exchange we were looking at a moment  
3 ago.

4 A. Okay.

5 Q. On the first page there's a note, an e-mail  
6 that you wrote back to Mike Russell, correct?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. Midway down in about the fifth line --

9 MR. ASKEW: Midway of which paragraph?

10 BY MR. LARSON:

11 Q. I'm sorry. Midway of the first paragraph of  
12 that e-mail, the paragraph starting I'd be glad to  
13 provide you background if I can.

14 You say the only outstanding problem that I'm  
15 aware of is that the e-mail feature that it uses to  
16 notify faculty quit working some time ago?

17 A. (Nods head affirmatively.)

18 Q. Do you know what that e-mail feature is that  
19 you're referring to?

20 A. Yes. Each time a new account was set up you  
21 could enter the faculty's e-mail address and then  
22 there's a feature that would let you send out a blanket  
23 e-mail to all the faculty that used Docutek.

24 Q. Just letting them know that a new account had  
25 been set up for them?

1           A.    No, to use -- to notify them of anything you  
2           want to.

3           Q.    Could you notify them of activity on the  
4           system?

5           A.    Yes.

6           Q.    So --

7           A.    If you wanted.

8           Q.    Including whether or not students had accessed  
9           files that were stored on the system?

10          A.    Well, the idea was that the e-mail would  
11          function to send whatever information you wanted to  
12          them. I think it was -- its main value was in providing  
13          a list of all of the faculty's e-mail that used EReserve  
14          so you could send like a blanket announcement of when  
15          the next deadlines are.

16          Q.    Okay.

17          A.    That was the way it was intended to be used.

18          Q.    Just give me a moment, if you would.

19                    We talked a bit before about the EReserve's  
20          process and your role in it. You explained that you did  
21          an analysis or you looked at the words to see if more  
22          than 20 percent was being used, correct?

23          A.    Yes.

24          Q.    And do you have any awareness of the process  
25          the library staff engaged in in terms of reviewing items

1 for copyright compliance?

2 A. Not really, no.

3 Q. Do you know whether they looked at the works  
4 to see if they were over 20 percent?

5 A. I assume they did. They -- I know they were  
6 supposed to.

7 Q. Okay. Incidentally, do you know the  
8 derivation of the 20 percent rule?

9 A. That's -- my best recollection is that when we  
10 first started providing the service in mid to late 90s  
11 that my boss at that time, Phil Williams, told me what  
12 that limit was. I believe he got it from looking at  
13 other university web sites doing similar things.

14 Q. Okay. So Mr. Williams was the original source  
15 of that?

16 A. Well, for me, that's who I got it from. He  
17 may have gotten it from the Board Of Regents or --

18 Q. When you said that he may have got it from  
19 looking at other web sites, do you have reason to  
20 believe that that's where he got it from? Did he tell  
21 you that?

22 A. I think he told me that when he discussed it.

23 Q. Do you know when faculty submits EReserve  
24 requests to the library that the library staff does any  
25 sort of fair use determination for a given excerpt to

1 see whether it might be fair use?

2 A. I believe that they did. I believe the new  
3 policy is to have the faculty member do that.

4 Q. And what's that understanding based on?

5 A. The recent copyright policy that's been  
6 released.

7 Q. We'll talk about that in a moment.

8 Under the previous regime, do you know, did  
9 the faculty do a fair use analysis as well or was it  
10 generally the library staff who did that?

11 A. Well, I believe the form that was submitted  
12 that required the faculty's signature required them to  
13 acknowledge that it was for fair use.

14 Q. That was the form we were looking at before?  
15 You can grab it out if you want to take a look.

16 A. Yeah. Yeah.

17 Q. I think it's at the bottom of your stack. And  
18 what's that marked, the Exhibit Number, just for the  
19 record?

20 Mr. Palmour, can you just tell us what the  
21 number is, sir?

22 A. Oh, it's Exhibit Number 31.

23 Q. Okay. So does that form indicate that either  
24 the faculty member or the library performed a fair use  
25 analysis?

1           A.    Well, I guess it doesn't now that I look at  
2           it.

3           Q.    Was there a limit in addition to the 20  
4           percent rule; are you aware of a limit of one chapter of  
5           a work?

6           A.    Only in the sense that they would use one  
7           chapter or less than 20 percent, whichever was greater.

8           Q.    Whichever was greater?

9           A.    That's the way --

10          Q.    So if a chapter was 30 percent of a work, that  
11          was okay?

12          A.    Well, I'm not sure.  You'd have to ask them.

13          Q.    Them being the library staff?

14          A.    The library staff.

15          Q.    But when you told me before about you flagging  
16          things that were over 20 percent --

17          A.    Right.

18          Q.    -- would you do that if you had a chapter, a  
19          single chapter?

20          A.    Well, I -- actually I did do that with one  
21          chapter at one -- I have one recollection of that  
22          instance when I noticed it was more than 20 percent and  
23          they said, well, it's just one chapter.

24          Q.    And you flagged that for the library?

25          A.    Yeah, I brought it to their attention.



1 Q. Do you recall who the professor was?

2 A. I think it was an African American studies  
3 professor by the name of Umoja.

4 Q. Let's talk about the new policy that's been  
5 released. You've seen the policy?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Were you involved in any way in drafting or  
8 drawing up of that policy?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Have you been involved in any training or  
11 meetings or briefings with respect to the new policy?

12 A. I have been briefed myself. I have attended a  
13 meeting where we were briefed on it.

14 Q. And who conducted that briefing?

15 A. Cynthia Hall.

16 Q. When was that meeting?

17 A. I don't recall the exact date.

18 Q. Approximately how long ago?

19 A. Within the last month or two.

20 Q. And the new policy was presented at that  
21 meeting?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And were you told at that meeting whether or  
24 not the new policy was actually formally -- had been put  
25 in place and was operative?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And is it the case that it is?

3 A. It is my belief.

4 Q. You were provided a copy at the meeting?

5 A. Well, we got an e-mail concerning the new  
6 policy that included the link to the new policy. I read  
7 it when I got the e-mail.

8 Q. When was that? Was that e-mail sent prior to  
9 this meeting?

10 A. Yes, yes, before the meeting it was sent.

11 Q. And it was sent out to the entire university  
12 community?

13 A. I believe so.

14 Q. Are you aware of any formal mechanisms that  
15 have been put in place to ensure compliance with the new  
16 policy?

17 A. I know that there's the new fair use guideline  
18 checklist, and it's my understanding that they are going  
19 to require that for anything new that's put up on the  
20 ERes system.

21 Q. Faculty will be required to fill that out?

22 A. That's my understanding.

23 Q. Any other mechanisms apart from the checklist  
24 that you're aware of that have been put in place?

25 A. I'm not sure what you mean by mechanisms.

1 Q. Let's talk about the procedures that we  
2 discussed before.

3 Do you know whether professors will still  
4 under the new policy fill out a request form like the  
5 one we looked at?

6 A. I would assume so, but I don't know for sure.

7 Q. Do you know whether the library will conduct  
8 any sort of review of the excerpts to see whether they  
9 comply with fair use or require copyright permission?

10 A. It was my understanding that that was their  
11 intention.

12 Q. What review will they do, do you know?

13 A. I believe they will review each work submitted  
14 and if they feel that it exceeds what should be allowed  
15 for fair use that they will then contact the instructor  
16 or possibly legal affairs. I don't know.

17 Q. And what's the source of this understanding?

18 A. I believe that was discussed in the meeting  
19 when we had the new policy described.

20 Q. So just so I'm clear, it's your understanding  
21 that there will be some review separate and apart from  
22 the faculty's determination of fair use?

23 A. For the electronic reserves system the library  
24 staff will still be in control of what goes on ERes, so  
25 they will, as I understand it, they will be reviewing

1 what they put up to make sure that it meets --

2 Q. And I understand that you're not the one doing  
3 this now, but --

4 A. Right.

5 Q. -- just tell me what you know and I don't want  
6 you to speculate. But are you aware that if a faculty  
7 member says I filled out my checklist and I believe this  
8 is fair use, will the library staff be able to override  
9 that decision and not post a work?

10 A. That was my understanding.

11 Q. And that would be Denise Dimsdale --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- and Melia --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- and Corey?

16 A. Possibly.

17 Q. Do you know whether the 20 percent rule that  
18 we've discussed will still be observed or applied?

19 A. It's my understanding that we're not supposed  
20 to focus on percentage.

21 Q. Do you know whether there'll be in any rule as  
22 to the number of excerpts per course that can be posted?

23 A. I have heard some discussion of possibly  
24 limiting that, but I haven't heard.

25 Q. And what's the discussion?

1           A.    Well, one discussion I had with Denise -- in  
2           that discussion she indicated that they were considering  
3           that, restricting the faculty to maybe 50 items total or  
4           some other number.

5           Q.    Are you aware if any decision has been made  
6           with respect to that?

7           A.    I'm not aware of that.

8           Q.    50 was the number that she mentioned?

9           A.    Just offhand. I think they were still just  
10          thinking about it at that point.

11          Q.    Now, you indicated earlier just a few moments  
12          ago that your understanding was that the new policy  
13          shifted responsibility for the fair use determination to  
14          faculty members?

15          A.    Yes.

16          Q.    Is that -- do you still believe that to be the  
17          case even given what you just told me about the review  
18          by the library for fair use?

19          A.    Yes.

20          Q.    So they'll both be doing it?

21                   MR. ASKEW: What was that?

22                   THE WITNESS: It's my understanding that  
23                   the library reserve staff will be double  
24                   checking what the faculty has done and to  
25                   make sure that they're not just claiming

1 fair use for something they shouldn't.

2 BY MR. LARSON:

3 Q. And do you know how the library will do that?

4 A. No.

5 Q. I guess if it's not based on page count, do  
6 you have a sense of how -- what it will be based on?

7 A. Well, no.

8 Q. Do you know whether they'll review the fair  
9 use checklist?

10 A. I assume they will.

11 Q. Under the new policy do you know whether  
12 there'll be any check on the number of chapters from a  
13 work that can be used?

14 A. I don't know.

15 Q. So you don't know if the limit of one that we  
16 discussed before will be in place?

17 A. I do not know.

18 Q. Okay. How about the requirement that either  
19 the library or the faculty member must own the work?

20 A. I would assume that will stay in place since  
21 that was a requirement before.

22 Q. Well, do you have -- is that assumption based  
23 on anything you've been told or anything you've seen?

24 A. No.

25 Q. Do you know whether legal staff at the

1 university will do any review of postings?

2 A. I do not know for sure. I do know that they  
3 offered that.

4 Q. Offered it how?

5 A. They told the library staff that if the  
6 library staff had questions about something that they  
7 could refer it to the legal affairs staff.

8 Q. Okay. And will that still be available under  
9 the new policy?

10 A. I believe so, yes.

11 MR. LARSON: We need to change our  
12 tape. Why don't we take a breather.

13 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Off the record at  
14 11:03:32.

15 (Brief recess.)

16 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is tape three.  
17 We're back on the record at 11:12:36.

18 BY MR. LARSON:

19 Q. Mr. Palmour, just one question going back to  
20 our discussion of the budget.

21 Now that the support for ERes has moved inside  
22 the library, will the library budget now pay for the  
23 Docutek license and those other expenses?

24 A. I don't know.

25 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 36

1 was marked for identification  
2 by the reporter.)

3 BY MR. LARSON:

4 Q. Let me mark Plaintiffs' 36.

5 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this page?

6 A. Not offhand.

7 MR. ASKEW: Does this document have a  
8 Bates production number, Mr. Larson?

9 MR. LARSON: No, I'll represent this is  
10 a printout I made from the university web  
11 site yesterday.

12 MR. ASKEW: This is something we have  
13 not produced to you, is that correct?

14 MR. LARSON: That's correct. It's part  
15 of your publicly available web site. And I  
16 will also represent that it combines two or  
17 three pages of the web site.

18 MR. ASKEW: This is not a  
19 representation of the entire web site?

20 MR. LARSON: That's correct. It's --  
21 the pages are in the lower left hand corner  
22 of the printout, it provides the URL of the  
23 page that was printed. So the first two  
24 pages are -- first two printed pages  
25 represent one web page and then the second



1 group of three pages represent the second  
2 web page.

3 BY MR. LARSON:

4 Q. Have you seen this, Mr. Palmour?

5 A. No, I have not.

6 Q. If you could turn to the third page of the  
7 printout. It's a page headed guidelines for putting  
8 materials on reserve.

9 A. Right.

10 Q. There is a -- at the bottom of that first box  
11 there's a sentence that says coursepacks cannot be put  
12 on reserve, they must be purchased by students enrolled  
13 in the course.

14 Is that a rule that you're aware of that's  
15 been in place at the university?

16 A. I assume what they're saying is if we're  
17 printing out coursepacks and selling them to the  
18 bookstore, we're not going to undercut that by putting  
19 it online, also.

20 Q. Okay. So by reserve, you mean -- do you read  
21 reserve there to mean EReserves?

22 A. Yes. Well, I guess it could mean hard copy  
23 reserve, also.

24 Q. Just tell me, how would putting it online  
25 undercut the sale of the coursepack to the bookstore?

1           A.    If they could get it for free and print it out  
2 online, then they would not be as likely to pay for a  
3 printed copy at the bookstore.

4           Q.    So would that include taking, you know, if a  
5 coursepack had 10 articles, taking those 10 articles and  
6 putting them on EReserves?

7           A.    I would assume so.

8           Q.    Please flip to the next page. This is in a  
9 section headlined how to submit a request.

10           I should ask, have you seen this -- have you  
11 seen this page that we're looking at now?

12           A.    No, I have not.

13           Q.    You can put that one aside.

14           We'll mark as Plaintiffs' 37 --

15                               (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 37  
16                               was marked for identification  
17                               by the reporter.)

18 BY MR. LARSON:

19           Q.    -- another set of web pages. And these were  
20 produced as part of the litigation. Bearing Bates  
21 number Georgia State 0031377 through 87.

22           MR. ASKEW: Just a second. Those  
23 numbers have been deleted on my copy so  
24 you're going to have to give them to us  
25 again.

1 MR. LARSON: Oh, I apologize. Yeah,  
2 Georgia, GAstate 0031377.

3 MR. ASKEW: 31377?

4 MR. LARSON: Up through 31387.

5 BY MR. LARSON:

6 Q. Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

7 A. No.

8 Q. Not something you've seen?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Any awareness then of whether these pages are  
11 up and operational?

12 A. Well, if you got to them I assume they are.

13 Q. Actually these were produced in the  
14 litigation, not something that I printed.

15 A. Oh, okay. I do not know.

16 Q. Go forward two pages, if you could. You see a  
17 page that has a headline University System of Georgia  
18 copyright policy?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Have you seen that?

21 MR. ASKEW: You're on page 378, right?

22 MR. LARSON: It would be 379.

23 THE WITNESS: I have looked at the Board  
24 Of Regents University System copyright  
25 policy that they have on their web site.

1 BY MR. LARSON:

2 Q. Does this appear to be that policy?

3 A. Yes, it does.

4 Q. Okay. Take a look at the second to the last  
5 bullet on that page, if you could. It indicates that  
6 the University System of Georgia facilitates use of  
7 materials currently licensed by the University System of  
8 Georgia and provides information on licensing of third  
9 party materials by the University System.

10 Do you know how that's done?

11 A. I know that they have a large collection of  
12 journal articles in databases that they license. But I  
13 do not know about providing information on licensing of  
14 third party materials.

15 Q. Well, what do you understand that to mean?

16 A. I'm not even sure.

17 Q. You don't know if that means information about  
18 materials that have been licensed by the university  
19 versus information about how one would go out to a third  
20 party to get a license if needed?

21 A. I would assume the latter.

22 Q. The last bullet says identifies individuals at  
23 the University System and member institutions who can  
24 counsel faculty and staff regarding application of  
25 copyright law.

1 Do you know who those individuals are at GSU?

2 A. I would imagine the primary one would be the  
3 legal affairs office.

4 Q. Has that been communicated to you that that's  
5 who it is?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And what about at the University System level?

8 A. Oh, at the University System level. I do not  
9 know who at Board Of Regents is in charge of copyright  
10 policy.

11 Q. Okay. Flip forward for me to the next page,  
12 electronic reserves request form.

13 You have not seen this you said? I'm sorry,  
14 this is different than the front page. Have you seen  
15 this?

16 A. I don't recall.

17 Q. And just flip through the next pages that are  
18 part of this same site and let me know if you have seen  
19 them before?

20 A. No, I've never looked at their forms and  
21 procedures.

22 Q. Let me ask you a couple of questions anyway.

23 If you could go to the page 3 from the back,  
24 it's the Bates number 385. Headlined electronic: Book.  
25 You see that?

1 A. Yes, sir.

2 Q. There's a prompt there for library owned yes  
3 or no.

4 Do you know how a faculty member would know  
5 whether a particular work is library owned or not?

6 A. They could look it up in the online catalogue.

7 Q. So you weren't involved then in any way in  
8 putting this interface together?

9 A. No, I was not.

10 Q. And you don't know whether it's up and  
11 running?

12 A. I do not know.

13 Q. That is Plaintiffs' 38.

14 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 38  
15 was marked for identification  
16 by the reporter.)

17 BY MR. LARSON:

18 Q. This is a web page that I printed out from,  
19 again, from publicly available web site indicated on the  
20 URL in the bottom left hand corner. The date indicated  
21 in the bottom right hand corner.

22 Mr. Palmour, have you seen this?

23 MR. ASKEW: Again, this is an  
24 incomplete print of what you have -- what  
25 you were observing on the web site?

1 MR. LARSON: It's not the entire web  
2 site. It's copies of particular web pages  
3 on the web site.

4 MR. ASKEW: Were these pages in  
5 sequence on the web site that you copied?

6 MR. LARSON: They are distinct pages  
7 located at the URL that's in the lower left  
8 hand corner of the page. So the first page  
9 was the sole amount of information  
10 available at that URL. The second page was  
11 the sole information available at the URL  
12 listed there.

13 These were each a distinct page from  
14 the university web site, the USGED web  
15 site.

16 BY MR. LARSON:

17 Q. Have you seen this, Mr. Palmour?

18 A. I have looked at the Board Of Regents  
19 copyright policy on their web site and I'm assuming it  
20 hasn't changed since I looked at it a couple months ago.

21 Q. Take a look at the second page which is called  
22 additional guidelines for electronic reserves.

23 A. Okay.

24 Q. Have you seen this?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And do you understand this to be part of the  
2 new policy?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Take a look at the fourth bullet please,  
5 starts with the instructor. Says the instructor,  
6 library or other unit of the institution must possess a  
7 lawfully obtained copy of any materials submitted for  
8 electronic reserves.

9 So does that refresh your recollection that  
10 that will be a component of the new policy?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Do you understand that to be a requirement  
13 imposed by the copyright law?

14 A. I'm not sure.

15 Q. The next bullet if you could just read that  
16 involves the requirement of a password so that materials  
17 are restricted to students in class?

18 A. Right.

19 Q. Same question, do you understand that that is  
20 a requirement of the copyright law?

21 A. I believe that should be.

22 Q. You believe it should be? Do you believe it  
23 is?

24 A. I believe that access to the materials should  
25 be restricted to the students in the class for that



1 semester.

2 Q. The second to the last bullet says library  
3 reserve staff should delete materials available on the  
4 electronic reserves at the conclusion of each semester.

5 That's the discussion that you were telling me  
6 about before?

7 A. Right.

8 Q. The last bullet says institutions at the  
9 University System of Georgia will impose no charge to  
10 students for access to materials on electronic reserves.

11 Do you understand that that's a requirement of  
12 the copyright law?

13 A. I believe the copyright law indicates that  
14 fair use requires that it be nonprofit.

15 Q. So if students were charged it would not be  
16 nonprofit?

17 A. Well, I suppose one could make that argument,  
18 but you're just recovering costs I suppose.

19 Q. Just so I understand. And again, to your  
20 knowledge, is this bullet representing simply a policy  
21 choice by the university not to charge students or is it  
22 actually in place because it's required under the  
23 copyright law, do you know?

24 A. I don't know the law specifically in detail  
25 enough to be able to say.

1 Q. Have you reviewed the fair use checklist?

2 A. Yes, I have.

3 Q. You can put that one aside.

4 Mark Plaintiffs' 39.

5 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 39  
6 was marked for identification  
7 by the reporter.)

8 BY MR. LARSON:

9 Q. This is a document bearing Bates number  
10 Georgia State 0004591.

11 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Tell me what this is, please?

14 A. This is a summary of the usage information for  
15 electronic reserves and coursepacks.

16 Q. And this is for fiscal year 2005?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And fiscal year 2005 would be --

19 A. July 1 of 2004 through June 30 of 2005.

20 Q. Okay. What's the source of the numbers in  
21 this report or in this document?

22 A. Well, let's see. The electronic reserves was  
23 probably from the ERes system running a report. And the  
24 coursepacks was probably just from me totaling my  
25 numbers.

1 Q. When you say totaling your numbers --  
2 A. Totaling the invoices for each semester.  
3 Q. Those are invoices sent to the bookstore?  
4 A. Yes.  
5 Q. Okay. When you say that the source of the  
6 electronic reserves numbers is the ERes system, do you  
7 recall whether you ran a report or are you able to get  
8 in and view the data in some way?  
9 A. I ran a report.  
10 Q. Is that generally the way you would find out  
11 data as to usage of the system?  
12 A. Yes.  
13 Q. So there's a report that can be run that tells  
14 you how many courses are using EReserves in a given  
15 year?  
16 A. Yes.  
17 Q. This says 796 courses using ERes. Do you know  
18 whether that is the number of courses active during that  
19 year or the total that were resident on the system?  
20 A. Active that year. It's been averaging about  
21 400 per major semester.  
22 Q. And number of documents used was 9320. What  
23 does used mean?  
24 A. The number of documents that were put on  
25 the --

1 Q. Let me ask it this way. Does that mean works  
2 that were active and available?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Not necessarily ones that were accessed by  
5 being viewed by students?

6 A. I don't recall right now exactly how it makes  
7 that distinction.

8 Q. Okay. The number of hits is identified as  
9 213,000?

10 A. Right.

11 Q. What does that mean?

12 A. The number of times a document was viewed.

13 Q. And this would be all documents across the  
14 system?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. So whenever a student clicked on that link for  
17 the PDF and viewed the file on his or her computer it  
18 would register as a hit?

19 A. Yes. Yes.

20 Q. Okay. Does it register as a hit whether or  
21 not the student, say, downloads the file to their hard  
22 drive, saves it to their hard drive?

23 A. I think it only registers when you actually  
24 open a file, but it doesn't know what you do with it.

25 Q. As you said before when you open it and view

1 it, when the student does that on their computer, that  
2 involves transmitting a copy over to their computer?

3 A. Right. Right.

4 Q. Although they might not choose to save that  
5 copy?

6 A. Right.

7 Q. Okay. You provide -- well, scratch that.

8 To your knowledge are these numbers that you  
9 provided to your coursepacks accurate?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And to your knowledge are the numbers provided  
12 by -- that you list here for the electronic reserves  
13 accurate?

14 A. Yes, as far as I know.

15 Q. Have you had any opportunity in the past to  
16 check the accuracy of the EReserves reports?

17 A. Well, I have tried accessing the document and  
18 making sure that that increases the hit count. That  
19 seems to be what it's doing. There is some small  
20 question in my mind about the number of courses active.  
21 When it gets into the area of archiving classes, I'm not  
22 sure if it's counting those or not. So I don't do the  
23 archiving process and I can't really check that for  
24 sure.

25 Q. I mean, are you saying then that the number of

1 courses, 796 number there might include some archived  
2 classes?

3 A. I'm saying it may be missing some that were  
4 archived later. I looked at and got a report of how  
5 many were -- that it knew of for a particular semester  
6 after the fact and it may have been that some of those  
7 were archived or made unavailable somehow.

8 Q. I want to make sure I understand what you're  
9 saying. Is it if you were to run a report for the  
10 number of courses that were offered, you know, say a  
11 year ago --

12 A. Right.

13 Q. -- that it might give you a different number  
14 than had you run the report at that time?

15 A. Exactly.

16 Q. So the number -- number reported if I ran the  
17 report now might be lower than what was reported at the  
18 time?

19 A. Correct. It's a suspicion I have. I'm not  
20 totally 100 percent sure.

21 Q. And what gave rise to that suspicion?

22 A. Noticing that the number changed over time, it  
23 went down.

24 Q. Did you ever talk to Docutek about that?

25 A. No, I did not.

1 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 40  
2 was marked for identification  
3 by the reporter.)

4 BY MR. LARSON:

5 Q. We'll mark as Plaintiffs' Exhibit 40, document  
6 bearing the Bates stamp Georgia State 0004542.

7 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And what is this?

10 A. It's information provided for the annual  
11 report on totals for electronic reserves and  
12 coursepacks.

13 Q. Okay. And this is for fiscal year '07?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. So fiscal year '07 would be July of 2006  
16 through June of '07?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Okay. Now, you say here -- well, let me ask  
19 you again.

20 What's the source of this, the statistics in  
21 this e-mail?

22 A. The same as before, electronic reserves is  
23 from running a report, and coursepacks is totaling up  
24 the number from the invoices.

25 Q. So to your knowledge the numbers provided in

1 this document are accurate?

2 A. As far as I know.

3 Q. And then with respect to the number of classes  
4 and the number of course reserves pages -- strike that.

5 The number of classes is listed as over 1,000.  
6 Again, that's active classes during that time period?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And this says that 4620 new documents were  
9 added to the collections. Is added -- strike that.

10 Does that mean that these were 4620 documents  
11 added on top of the numbers we saw in the previous  
12 e-mail?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Again, so it's not -- documents added during  
15 this fiscal year doesn't mean the total number of works  
16 resident on the system?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. That would be some larger number?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. Okay. So just to -- it says here that there  
21 were 494 new course reserve pages set up and 4620 new  
22 documents added. Can we conclude from that there were  
23 about 10 works per course on average for the new courses  
24 added that year?

25 A. Yeah, you could.



1 Q. You say they were 267,723 document downloads?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What do you mean by the word downloads?

4 A. Well, I suppose I should have used their  
5 phrasing, document hits, that number of times somebody  
6 clicked on one of the document links on the course  
7 reserve page. And those aren't all PDF files. Those  
8 could be references to hard copy or just references to a  
9 catalogue listing in the online catalogue.

10 Q. Okay. The coursepacks numbers that are  
11 provided here, are those accurate to the best of your  
12 knowledge?

13 A. I believe so.

14 Q. And the source of that would be again your  
15 invoicing records to the bookstore?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And so it's the case, if you want to look back  
18 at Exhibit 39 for confirmation, it appears to me that  
19 there was a drop in the number of courses using  
20 coursepacks from 125 to 56?

21 A. Well, I rephrased it. I said number of  
22 classes using coursepacks. And I think I was including  
23 class sections, every different class section as opposed  
24 to titles. And the other one, 56 titles.

25 At this time one of the biggest numerically

1 ones we were doing was two biology lab guides and it was  
2 the same title but it was used for every introductory  
3 biology class. So there were several hundred copies  
4 used for maybe 20 different sections.

5 Q. Do you have any sense then that, going back to  
6 Exhibit 39, the number of courses using -- what the  
7 number of courses would have been in that year?

8 A. It was probably about the same. The total  
9 number of coursepacks sold is about the same. It was  
10 probably about the same for total number of classes and  
11 titles.

12 Q. Mark Plaintiff's 41, an e-mail bearing a Bates  
13 stamp Georgia State 0004600.

14 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 41  
15 was marked for identification  
16 by the reporter.)

17 BY MR. LARSON:

18 Q. And do you recognize this, Mr. Palmour?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And just tell me what that is.

21 A. It's an e-mail I sent to Denise Dimsdale when  
22 she asked about usage of ERes.

23 Q. And this was written or sent in January 2008?

24 A. Yes, it looks like it.

25 Q. And you were providing numbers at least at the

1 beginning here for fiscal year 2007 again?

2 A. Yes, it looks like the same number.

3 Q. Right, the number of new documents added  
4 there --

5 A. Right. Right.

6 Q. -- the same as the last?

7 A. Right.

8 Q. Okay. And the number of new course reserve  
9 pages is also the same as we saw in the last e-mail?

10 A. Right.

11 Q. Now take a look at the next paragraph. You  
12 say there are actually only a couple of months last fall  
13 that were more than the previous year. The final  
14 semester year totals were down slightly from the  
15 previous year but not by near as much. And you provide  
16 some numbers, 4,608 documents for calendar year 2007  
17 versus 5,034 for 2006. 7,661 for 2005 and 9,646 for  
18 2004 our first full year.

19 So just to be clear, we're talking about  
20 calendar years here now as opposed to fiscal years?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And these are -- the totals you're giving here  
23 are documents added in each of those years?

24 A. Let's see. In the first paragraph, yes.

25 Q. And so could you add those numbers together to

1 get the total number of works resident on the system  
2 either archived or active?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And is it the case that the number drops year  
5 to year because in subsequent years professors are using  
6 files that were already posted in previous years?

7 A. That's correct.

8 Q. You also provide some numbers on document  
9 downloads in the next paragraph. You say that's grown  
10 steadily each year with 260,000 in the last calendar  
11 year. And that would be 2007?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. 253,000 in 2006, 248,000 in 2005, 215,000 in  
14 2004. Did those numbers come from an EReserves report?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And those are accurate to the best of your  
17 knowledge?

18 A. As far as I know.

19 Q. Mark as Plaintiffs' 42 a document bearing the  
20 Bates number Georgia State 0004865. And you might want  
21 to keep the last document handy to compare.

22 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 42

23 was marked for identification

24 by the reporter.)

25 BY MR. LARSON:

1 Q. Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

2 A. It looks like a summary report from the ERes  
3 system.

4 Q. So the ERes system will --

5 A. Broken down by calendar year.

6 Q. Does it create a report that looks like this  
7 or would you have taken information from some other  
8 report and created this?

9 A. I don't recall. It looks like -- it looks  
10 like the output from the ERes report. It looks like it  
11 may have been cut and paste from that.

12 Q. And do you know what accounts means?

13 A. An account is set up for each instructor.

14 Q. And go down to the section of the report that  
15 says documents and you'll see there it provides some  
16 numbers in the column number of items created --

17 A. Okay. This is -- I think this is what they  
18 call the system growth report. And it lists by each  
19 year in this case how much -- how many new items were  
20 added.

21 Q. And is the system growth report sort of a  
22 standard report that can be generated by the ERes  
23 system?

24 A. Yes, it is.

25 Q. Now, if you take a look at the documents

1 section --

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. -- for 2004 and 2005.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. You'll see two numbers, 9646 and 7661 --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. -- for those two years?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Those are the same as reported in the  
10 previous -- in Plaintiffs' Exhibit 41, correct?

11 A. Okay.

12 Q. Can you just confirm that for me?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Now, in Plaintiffs' Exhibit 41 -- sorry?

15 A. Except for 2006, that's partial I guess or  
16 something.

17 Q. That was my question. Does it appear that  
18 this was perhaps run in the middle of 2006?

19 A. Yeah, I would guess that's why it's so low.

20 Q. And again, the numbers then provided in each  
21 year are additions to the system, not total numbers for  
22 the system, correct?

23 A. Correct.

24 Q. Course reserves pages, does that show the  
25 number of new course reserves pages created in each of

1 these years?

2 A. I believe so, yes.

3 Q. And departments, what does the departments  
4 item indicate?

5 A. Department is used in forming the course name,  
6 like biology. You lump every course within a  
7 department.

8 Q. So again, when we see the change from 92 to 2  
9 from 2004 to 2005, does that reflect the fact by 2005  
10 basically every department had been added already?

11 A. Right. Only two new ones were added.

12 Q. What's the publishers item?

13 A. There's a record, a place for entering  
14 publishers information. And I think that was filled out  
15 initially, but apparently maybe not used much  
16 afterwards.

17 Q. Well, did you indicate before that at a  
18 certain point the library staff started entering  
19 publisher information just in the title fields?

20 A. That's correct.

21 Q. Rather than -- but there is a publisher field  
22 that could be used?

23 A. That's correct. Right.

24 Q. And so is it your understanding that when they  
25 would enter the publisher information in the title field

1 they didn't bother putting it in the publisher field?

2 A. Correct. I believe at some point they quit  
3 entering information into that.

4 Q. What are library research guides?

5 A. You would have to ask them. They have some  
6 online help for each different department for doing  
7 research for each area of study.

8 Q. Okay. And these are items that are posted to  
9 ERes?

10 A. It's more like links.

11 Q. And what's permission request, what's that  
12 indicate?

13 A. That's if we were doing copyright permission  
14 for electronic reserves that would be entered there.

15 Q. So this shows none were requested through the  
16 date of this report?

17 A. That's correct.

18 Q. Is there any possibility that permissions --  
19 let me ask it this way. This just shows permission  
20 requests that would have been entered into the system?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. So if someone had requested permission outside  
23 of the EReserve system, that wouldn't show up here?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. And does this show -- EReserves has -- the



1 EReserve software had the capability built into it that  
2 allows for an interface with Copyright clearance Center,  
3 correct?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. So when a work is posted a permission request  
6 can be generated?

7 A. It can be.

8 Q. Is that what this would measure here?

9 A. Probably is.

10 Q. Do you know?

11 A. Well, it's not just Copyright Clearance  
12 Center, so I guess you can put in other publishers also.

13 Q. I guess -- I'm not asking this well. Let me  
14 see if I can try again.

15 Is this showing actual -- a request activity  
16 in the system or is this showing simply whether a field  
17 was entered saying yes or no, there's been permission  
18 obtained for this particular work?

19 A. The former.

20 Q. Former. Okay.

21 So if a professor had, as you said before  
22 happened on occasion, a professor had gone directly to a  
23 publisher and gotten permission to put something on  
24 EReserves, that would not register in this metric here?

25 A. It would not because we would not use this

1 mechanism to do that.

2 MR. LARSON: Mark Plaintiffs' 43.

3 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 43

4 was marked for identification

5 by the reporter.)

6 BY MR. LARSON:

7 Q. -- a document bearing Bates number Georgia  
8 State 0004537 headlined library services support,  
9 accomplishments for fiscal year 2008.

10 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Did you create it?

13 A. Yes, I did.

14 Q. If you can look down I say about 10 bullet  
15 points, there's an electronic reserves entry. You see  
16 that?

17 A. Right. Right.

18 Q. It says upgraded ERes version 5.3.03 and added  
19 approximately 4700 documents to the system?

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. What was the upgrade?

22 A. It's just a new version of the software they  
23 got, some bug fixes in it.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. It's not very major.

1 Q. And added approximately 4700 documents to the  
2 system. What's the source of that number?

3 A. Probably the ERes reporting system.

4 Q. Same as we saw before on the previous  
5 exhibits?

6 A. Yes. Yes.

7 Q. And again, that's additions and not a  
8 measurement of the total number?

9 A. Correct.

10 Q. The next bullet says produced and sold  
11 approximately 1700 coursepacks through the bookstore?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. GSU Bookstore, right?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Would there have been coursepacks sold through  
16 any other outlets?

17 A. I don't think in that fiscal year there were.

18 Q. Do you know how many classes or courses were  
19 represented by that number?

20 A. Not right offhand.

21 Q. Any ballpark?

22 A. Probably what was listed before. I mean,  
23 there's -- let's see. This is fiscal year 2008.  
24 Probably in the neighborhood of 50 or so classes or  
25 courses.

1 Q. Is it correct then that there was a drop from  
2 2007 to 2008 from about 2400 to about 1700 coursepacks  
3 sold?

4 A. Yes. Yes. The biggest drop was that biology  
5 lab guy that quit doing it, which impacted the --

6 Q. They quit using a coursepack?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Do you know whether they moved to distributing  
9 that material through some other mechanism?

10 A. I think they put it online.

11 Q. Put it online where?

12 A. I'm not sure. I think on their own  
13 departmental web site, but I'm not sure. It was just a  
14 lab guide with no copyrighted information in it.

15 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 44  
16 was marked for identification  
17 by the reporter.)

18 BY MR. LARSON:

19 Q. Let me mark as Plaintiffs' 44 a document  
20 bearing Bates number Georgia State 0000916.

21 Do you recognize this document?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And what is this?

24 A. This was a response by e-mail to Laura Burtle  
25 inquiring about usage on the ERes server.

1 Q. And this was from June of 2008?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. And am I correct that in the middle of  
4 it where it says Jim Palmour 6/10/2008 12:53, this is an  
5 e-mail from you to Laura?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Okay. You say currently there are 229,504  
8 documents and 1,791 course pages listed in the system.  
9 What's the source of those numbers?

10 A. Probably the ERes reporting system.

11 Q. Did you say probably or it is, that is the  
12 source?

13 A. That is where I got those numbers from.

14 Q. And are those numbers total numbers for the  
15 entire system?

16 A. Yes, I believe so.

17 Q. So these would include documents that were  
18 archived?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And course pages that were archived?

21 A. I guess so. I think so. I'm pretty sure.

22 Q. And what leads you to believe that?

23 A. Let's see. Course pages -- well, to tell you  
24 the truth I haven't compared those numbers with the  
25 other numbers to make sure that they total up. That

1 seems about right, anyway, should be about right.

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. Just with the caveat of as I discussed before  
4 about archived, some archived courses seemed --

5 Q. You described that there in the middle of that  
6 paragraph?

7 A. Oh, okay. Right, okay.

8 Q. You say we have 89 course pages listed as  
9 permanent.

10 A. Right.

11 Q. What does that mean?

12 A. There's some that don't have any copyright  
13 material in them that just stay up and are available all  
14 the time.

15 Q. Okay. And are those for classes that are  
16 offered semester after semester or --

17 A. I couldn't answer that.

18 Q. And who has access to those?

19 A. You'd have to ask Denise on that. I'm not  
20 sure.

21 Q. Okay. Says the reports do not show exactly  
22 how many documents that is, but you could figure an  
23 average of 15 to 20 documents per course based on the  
24 totals.

25 Do you mean to say that if you averaged out

1 the total number of documents and the total number of  
2 course pages resident on the system, the average is in  
3 the range of 15 to 20?

4 A. Yes, roughly.

5 Q. What's the highest you've seen?

6 A. The highest I've had experience dealing with  
7 was one history professor who had well over 100.

8 Q. Who was the professor?

9 A. I can't remember his name now.

10 Q. This next section here you say as far as  
11 faculty using the system, the best it gives us is the  
12 summary of the system growth in terms of number of  
13 accounts added. Just --

14 The numbers sort of run together here, but is  
15 what this is showing for 2004 to 2008 the number of new  
16 faculty accounts that got added in each of those years?

17 A. Yes. Except 2008 is probably partial.

18 Q. Right. Because this was run in June of 2008,  
19 is that correct?

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. Okay. Up at the top of this e-mail you refer  
22 to -- you say you ran some more reports and made the  
23 attached Excel files which have details on the number of  
24 downloads of each file and which course page it was in.

25 A. Right.

1 Q. What are these reports you're talking about?

2 A. There's a document, I forget the name of the  
3 report, document usage report I believe, something like  
4 that.

5 Q. You see the attachment line at the top?

6 A. Right.

7 Q. Does that refresh your recollection as to what  
8 these reports were?

9 A. Yeah, they were -- I know what they are. I'm  
10 just not sure what they are referred to in the ERes  
11 system as. But they're basically listings of each  
12 document that was used and how many times it was  
13 accessed.

14 Q. Okay. And then when you say has details to  
15 number of downloads --

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. -- again, is that the hits that we were  
18 talking about?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And are these ERes reports the same reports  
21 that we've been talking about on the last several  
22 exhibits that you ran to provide numbers for those  
23 previous years?

24 A. The one that created the Excel spread sheet  
25 was different. It had a line for every document in the



1 system.

2 Q. Okay. So in the previous exhibits the reports  
3 that you've told me that were generated by the system,  
4 those were more in the nature of summary reports?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And the reports you mention here are line by  
7 line?

8 A. Very detailed, yes.

9 MR. LARSON: Let me -- I need to get up  
10 here for a moment and grab something from  
11 the box.

12 How much time do we have on the tape?

13 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: About 10 minutes.

14 MR. LARSON: Perfect. Then we'll do  
15 this and then break.

16 Let's mark this as Plaintiffs' Exhibit  
17 45.

18 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 45  
19 was marked for identification  
20 by the reporter.)

21 BY MR. LARSON:

22 Q. So Mr. Palmour, is this -- I'll represent to  
23 you that this was a document that was produced to us  
24 yesterday by your counsel in response to our request for  
25 the attachments listed on this e-mail.

1 Do you recognize this as the document usage  
2 2008 spring XLS report listed here?

3 A. Yes. Yes.

4 Q. And this was created by the EReserve system?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. So tell me -- let's just walk through what we  
7 have here. What does this report show?

8 A. Well, on the left hand column under the  
9 heading document, that's the title of the document as  
10 the library staff entered it.

11 Q. And they do that based on information given to  
12 them from the professor?

13 A. In part, yes.

14 Q. What other sources?

15 A. They may add more information if they need to.

16 Q. And where would that information come from?

17 A. Well, from the book or --

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. -- the journal.

20 Q. Just take a look down eight lines down, you'll  
21 see there's an entry with a call number there?

22 A. Correct.

23 Q. What does that indicate?

24 A. That's a link to a record in the online  
25 catalogue system.

1 MR. ASKEW: Which one are you looking  
2 at?

3 MR. LARSON: I apologize. It's one  
4 Franklin is the -- Franklin, Mackay.

5 BY MR. LARSON:

6 Q. So that's a reference to something in the hard  
7 copy reserves as opposed to PDF on the system?

8 A. I'm not sure if it's hard copy reserves or  
9 just a book in the stacks in the library that's -- and  
10 that's the call number for it.

11 Q. Okay. What's the next column of course  
12 reserves page?

13 A. That's the name of the course reserve page  
14 that that document is in.

15 Q. So just taking the first one as an example,  
16 then that means that there was a course reserves page  
17 created by library staff for the course ALE 320?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And that course was called "Sound System Of  
20 English"?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. And it was offered in the spring of 2008?

23 A. Correct.

24 Q. And Grant Murphy was the professor?

25 A. I believe that's two different instructors.

1 Q. One named Grant and one named Murphy?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And one of the readings made available on that  
4 course reserves page was the C.M. Mackey work that we  
5 see in the document category?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. What's the date range column?

8 A. The date range is entered by the person  
9 running the report, in this case it was me. You can set  
10 that date range to whatever you want to see what  
11 documents were accessed during that date range.

12 Q. Okay. Up at the top it says document usage  
13 spring 2008. Is that a title that you gave this?

14 A. I don't recall. I think so.

15 Q. What's the hit count category or column?

16 A. That's the number of times that that document  
17 was -- that the link to that document was clicked on.

18 Q. And that would correspond again to the user  
19 viewing the file in the case of a PDF, viewing the file  
20 on their computer?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Okay. And what's the percentage of the total?

23 A. If you total up all the numbers in the hit  
24 count, that's what percentage that number is.

25 Q. That's the percentage of the total hits

1 overall in the entire system?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Represented by hits on this particular work  
4 that's listed here?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Okay. So is it your experience that these  
7 reports are generally accurate?

8 A. I would assume so, yes. It's my assumption  
9 that that's the case.

10 Q. Okay. And so just taking an example of this  
11 article here by Suzanne Firth about six lines down.

12 A. Right.

13 Q. Any reason to believe that that particular  
14 excerpt indicated there in the document column wasn't  
15 present on the system?

16 A. What was the question again?

17 Q. I pointed you to the entry for Suzanne  
18 Firth --

19 A. Right.

20 Q. -- for 1992.

21 A. Right.

22 Q. My question is just a simple one. Is there  
23 any reason to believe that that document indicated here  
24 on this report wasn't on the ERes system?

25 A. No, I would assume it is on the system if it's

1 in the report.

2 Q. Any reason to believe it wasn't viewed 12  
3 times as indicated in the hit column?

4 A. Well, that could be staff clicking on  
5 something or faculty. But that's just 12 times somebody  
6 clicked on that link.

7 Q. Okay. Do you run reports like this on any  
8 sort of regular basis?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Just turn to the last page, if you could.  
11 There are totals.

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. So does this indicate that during this time  
14 period that the works on the EReserve system were  
15 reviewed 98,605 times?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Have you run totals for the 2008 year overall?

18 A. Like this?

19 Q. Or just -- no, totals like this or the  
20 previous documents we looked at.

21 A. Fiscal year 2008 or calendar year 2008?

22 Q. Either.

23 A. I probably have done -- I probably have done  
24 summary reports for both.

25 Q. And do you have a sense of whether the hit,

1 the trend in hits is increasing as we saw in previous  
2 e-mails has continued in 2008?

3 A. I can't recall clearly right now.

4 Q. Do you recall whether it dropped?

5 A. I don't recall. Clearly the general trend has  
6 been increasing slightly.

7 MR. LARSON: Why don't we break here  
8 for lunch.

9 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Off the record at  
10 12:10:27.

11 (Lunch recess.)

12 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is tape four.

13 We are back on the record at 1:13:36.

14 BY MR. LARSON:

15 Q. We're marking as Plaintiffs' 46 --

16 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 46  
17 was marked for identification  
18 by the reporter.)

19 BY MR. LARSON:

20 Q. -- document bearing the Bates number Georgia  
21 State 0038782 running up through 38808.

22 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. What is this?

25 A. These are some spread sheets that I made

1 summarizing the coursepack business over the years.

2 Q. When did you make these?

3 A. Each year.

4 Q. So you keep this on an ongoing basis?

5 A. Normally. I used to, I quit after a while.

6 Q. Now, if you flip -- actually if you flip from  
7 the back is probably the easier way to do it. It  
8 appears that there is a page for spring semester 2008?

9 MR. ASKEW: What page number is that?

10 MR. LARSON: 807. Two from the back.

11 THE WITNESS: Right.

12 BY MR. LARSON:

13 Q. Is that right, is that -- and I think it  
14 carries over on to the next page, the spread sheet is  
15 just split off --

16 A. The last two pages.

17 Q. -- by the printing.

18 Am I right that that indicates that there were  
19 coursepacks for 23 courses offered in the spring of  
20 2008? And that's a number in the sort of bottom left  
21 hand corner of the chart there.

22 A. Yes. Well, that's different titles. Some of  
23 those were for the same course. There's a reading and a  
24 study guide for some of those.

25 Q. Right. I see. So that's the total number of



1 coursepacks. But the number of courses is somewhat  
2 smaller?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And if you work backwards, the next one we  
5 come to is summer semester 2001. And it's two pages  
6 earlier, page 805.

7 A. Right.

8 Q. My question is, did you keep similar numbers  
9 for the period between summer semester of 2001 and  
10 spring semester of 2008?

11 A. No, I did not.

12 Q. You did not. Okay.

13 So to the extent you have numbers there, those  
14 would be available from your invoices to the bookstore?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. As a general matter has the coursepack  
17 business -- or how would you characterize the trend over  
18 the last several years in the coursepack business?

19 A. It's been gradually declining.

20 Q. And would you know in the current semester  
21 we're in now how many coursepacks are being offered, how  
22 many titles?

23 A. I think it's about 15 titles.

24 Q. To what do you attribute the drop?

25 A. Well, one last summer was a coursepack that

1 was four chapters from a psychology textbook and the  
2 publisher wanted to go up to 25 cents per page for the  
3 copyright royalties on that one. So I informed the  
4 instructor how much it would cost and she decided she  
5 would do something else.

6 Q. And what did she do?

7 A. She reduced the amount of it and put it on the  
8 electronic reserves.

9 Q. Do you know by how much she reduced the  
10 amount?

11 A. She reduced it to under 20 percent of the  
12 book.

13 Q. What professor was that?

14 A. Well, it was for the IEP department, intensive  
15 English program. The head of that department is Sheryl  
16 Delk but I don't know which individual instructor taught  
17 that class.

18 Q. Okay. And when -- so when she was using the  
19 coursepack she was -- you were paying permission fees to  
20 the publisher for that?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And when some portion of the amount that was  
23 in the coursepack was put on EReserves, were there  
24 permissions payments made for the use on EReserves?

25 A. No.

1 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 47  
2 was marked for identification  
3 by the reporter.)

4 BY MR. LARSON:

5 Q. Let me mark as Plaintiffs' 47 a document that  
6 has the Bates number 000 -- Georgia State 0004778.

7 Mr. Palmour, please take a look at this and  
8 let me know if you recognize it?

9 A. Yes, I do.

10 Q. And what is it?

11 A. It's an e-mail exchange between me and a  
12 professor named Jacob Selwood concerning coursepacks and  
13 electronic reserves.

14 Q. And Mr. Selwood is in the history department,  
15 is that right?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Okay. And if you look at the bottom e-mail on  
18 the first page, that's an e-mail from Professor Selwood  
19 to you, correct?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. It's from early '06. He indicates in the  
22 second and third lines, I've so far been using  
23 electronic reserves but had significant complaints from  
24 students about the cost of printing.

25 Did you hear complaints like that when you

1 were dealing with this?

2 A. I've heard students complain about having to  
3 pay I guess a nickel a page they charge them for  
4 printing in the labs.

5 Q. Were those -- was that a common complaint?

6 A. I imagine students are always complaining  
7 about having to pay for anything.

8 Q. He goes on to say, I would probably use the  
9 coursepack of about 14 articles/chapters of about 30  
10 pages each under copyright.

11 Do you know what is meant there by the phrase  
12 under copyright?

13 A. I would assume he's meaning that those are  
14 published works that are subject to copyright.

15 Q. I see. So are these works that at the time  
16 were currently on EReserves?

17 A. I'm not sure.

18 Q. Well, let's look up at your response to him.

19 I guess the question I'm trying to understand  
20 is whether he's asking you what would be involved with  
21 switching his works from the EReserves over to  
22 coursepack. If you take a look at your e-mail back to  
23 him, does that give any indication as to whether that's  
24 what was happening?

25 A. Yes, that would be the indication from his

1 original e-mail. He's been using electronic reserves.

2 Q. So you respond by giving some costs here for  
3 coursepacks, correct?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And I think you indicate that the printing  
6 cost is 8 cents per page, right?

7 A. That's correct.

8 Q. And is that still the case today?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Okay. And that's a charge that comes from  
11 where?

12 A. I charge the bookstore 6 cents per page and  
13 they have a one third markup which makes it 8 cents per  
14 page.

15 Q. Does that markup apply to all the costs of the  
16 coursepack or just the printing cost?

17 A. The entire cost including copyrights.

18 Q. Okay. And the 6 cents that you charge, how do  
19 you devise that charge? You know, where did you come up  
20 with 6 cents?

21 A. That was -- original price that the printing  
22 group in our IS&T charges was I think 4 cents. And I  
23 guess my boss decided to add on an extra margin to  
24 account for my time and effort.

25 Q. You say there's 1.50 per booklet charge for

1 covers, binding and packaging. Is that still the case?

2 A. I charge the bookstore a dollar and then they  
3 mark that up. So I guess probably be more like 1.33.

4 Q. And then it says the copyright royalty cost  
5 per page averages 10 to 20 cents per page. Continuing a  
6 little bit lower -- well, let me ask that.

7 Are the royalty costs per page averaging 10 to  
8 20 cents per page, is that still an accurate statement?

9 A. They may be even higher than that now.  
10 Probably more like 20 cents and more.

11 Q. Okay. And then you say the royalty fee would  
12 have to be increased by a third for the GSU bookstore  
13 profit margin and markup.

14 Explain how that markup works for me, if you  
15 would?

16 A. That's their standard markup, anything that  
17 they buy from I guess the wholesaler, then they turn  
18 around and sell to the students they mark it up by one  
19 third is my understanding.

20 Q. And that's -- again they're a commercial  
21 operation?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. So the cost that you charge to the bookstore  
24 for these coursepacks, are you basically just passing  
25 through your costs or is there some margin or markup in

1 there for you as well?

2 A. We're trying to recover costs. I don't think  
3 that we're making money. We're probably losing money on  
4 it if you include my time.

5 Q. Do you cover your printing and binding costs?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. So just so I'm clear here. So your conclusion  
8 here is, if you read a little bit lower, that whereas  
9 the coursepack -- well, strike that.

10 So you could tell your students that it would  
11 probably cost them at least 25 cents per page and maybe  
12 more for the coursepack, is that right?

13 A. Right.

14 Q. And that's as compared to five cents per page  
15 to print?

16 A. Right.

17 Q. You go on to say I guess that's why we have  
18 about 400 classes using ERes each semester and only 15  
19 using coursepacks. What did you mean by that?

20 A. Well, that's the decision of the faculty  
21 whether they want to use electronic reserves or  
22 coursepacks. And most of them choose to use the  
23 electronic reserves probably in large part from the  
24 input from the students saying it's so much easier and  
25 cheaper, more convenient.

1 Q. And so if the professor opts to use a  
2 coursepack, a printed coursepack, they have to pay  
3 permission fees under your system?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And if they put the same material on  
6 EReserves, it's just the printing cost, is that right?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You say when we started doing -- this is  
9 continuing in the same paragraph.

10 When we started doing electronic reserves more  
11 and more students were asking their teachers to use it  
12 as opposed to coursepacks mainly for the cost.

13 That reflects what we were just discussing?

14 A. (Nods head affirmatively.)

15 Q. Let me ask you this. If the students are  
16 paying ultimately for the coursepack at the bookstore as  
17 opposed to you, do you have a preference as to which  
18 they use?

19 A. You mean do I prefer that they use coursepacks  
20 or electronic reserves?

21 Q. Right.

22 A. No.

23 Q. You are indifferent as to which form the  
24 professor uses?

25 A. I leave it up to them. I try to make both of



1           them equally available.

2           Q.     Look a bit up in that paragraph.  You say  
3           about four lines down, I looked up the readings on ERes  
4           for your history 1112 class and the "Guns, Germs And  
5           Steel" is going for 15 cents per page.  The "Sweetness  
6           In Power" is going for 11 per page.  And then on and on.

7                     Where did you look those up?

8           A.     Probably Copyright Clearance Center.

9           Q.     And you were looking them up, again, to see  
10          what the cost would be to put them in coursepacks,  
11          correct?

12          A.     Correct.

13          Q.     So if you -- putting aside the obvious  
14          difference between a digital copy and a paper copy,  
15          would there be anything different between Professor  
16          Selwood putting these readings on EReserves versus using  
17          a coursepack?

18          A.     Well, he would have to make the fair use  
19          assessment.  That would have to be done.

20          Q.     He'd have to do that to put them on EReserves,  
21          correct?

22          A.     Yes.

23          Q.     You mentioned one example before of I think  
24          you said an IEP professor.  Have you seen other examples  
25          of professors making the opposite switch from what we

1 see here, that is offering a coursepack and then  
2 deciding to put the materials in that coursepack on  
3 EReserves instead?

4 A. There's been a few that -- the biology lab guy  
5 I talked about, I think they put it on their own  
6 departmental web site.

7 Q. And do you see instances where a professor is  
8 deciding, trying to decide between a coursepack and  
9 EReserves and chooses EReserves?

10 A. I've seen that a couple times.

11 Q. Let's just go back to the document I'm looking  
12 for Bates numbered 9948, but I have to find the exhibit  
13 number.

14 Take a look at Plaintiffs' Exhibit 34. Can  
15 you grab out Exhibit Number 34, please. If you look  
16 down at the bottom in the coursepacks paragraph. And  
17 then look at towards the end of that paragraph, you say  
18 if it is preferred that I not do them -- I take it  
19 meaning referring to coursepacks? I would suggest they  
20 be taken over by Donya in Jerry's printing services  
21 operation. She's the only one with the incentive to  
22 grow the business whereas I have been competing against  
23 myself by giving away the same thing for free in  
24 EReserves.

25 Let me ask first, what would Donya's incentive

1 be to grow the business?

2 A. Donya's sole function is running the printing  
3 operation within IS&T. And she's mainly concerned with  
4 it, increasing the volume of business that they do.

5 Q. So do they run that as a profit center, for  
6 lack of a better word?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You say I've been competing against myself by  
9 giving the same thing away for free in EReserves. What  
10 did you mean about that?

11 A. Well, if someone wanted me to grow the  
12 coursepack business and also provide the electronic  
13 reserves service, it's kind of contradictory to me to  
14 have the same person doing both the coursepacks were  
15 something that somebody wanted to increase the business  
16 for and make more money for them.

17 Q. What you're saying here is that the materials  
18 that would be put on EReserves are the same materials  
19 that would be put in a coursepack?

20 A. It's possible.

21 Q. And the difference being, though, that  
22 EReserves are free to students whereas coursepacks carry  
23 a charge?

24 A. Plus there's more of the fair use requirements  
25 for what goes on the electronic reserves.

1 Q. But the EReserves, it's correct that the  
2 EReserves are free apart from --

3 A. That's correct. That's correct.

4 Q. Apart from the nickel a page printing cost?

5 A. That's correct.

6 Q. So they compete with coursepacks because they  
7 are free as opposed to something you have to pay for,  
8 right?

9 A. That's correct.

10 Q. Okay. Put that aside.

11 Mark as Plaintiffs' 48 a document that has the  
12 Bates number Georgia State 0004844.

13 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 48  
14 was marked for identification  
15 by the reporter.)

16 BY MR. LARSON:

17 Q. Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this e-mail?

18 A. Yes, I do.

19 Q. And just tell me what it is.

20 A. It's an e-mail exchange with a Professor Nancy  
21 Kript.

22 Q. And who is Ms. Kript?

23 A. It says here she's a professor in the school  
24 of social work.

25 Q. Okay. You see at the bottom the e-mail from

1 her, this carries over to the second page, she says  
2 while I have a plan to use several articles/chapters as  
3 required readings.

4 A. What was the question?

5 Q. I just wanted to point you -- you see where  
6 she says that?

7 A. Oh, as required readings, yes.

8 Q. And then she goes on to ask about using the  
9 coursepack, correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And I think you said before that it was not  
12 uncommon for coursepacks to include required readings,  
13 correct?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You respond in the e-mail on page 1, we still  
16 do offer the service but most faculty have been moving  
17 to using electronic reserves which is similar but  
18 involves putting the articles online for students to  
19 download instead of buying them printed at the  
20 bookstore.

21 Again by similar in this sentence, you mean  
22 essentially that it's the same articles that a professor  
23 might put in a coursepack but instead they've being  
24 putting them on electronic reserves instead?

25 A. Correct.

1 Q. Now, again she is, as I said before, she was  
2 discussing required readings here in her e-mail. That  
3 didn't stop you from providing her with information  
4 about electronic reserves, right?

5 A. It's never been my understanding that required  
6 readings were not to be allowed on electronic reserves.

7 Q. Okay. You go on to say in that paragraph, the  
8 administration has been encouraging the use of  
9 electronic reserves lately.

10 How did they encourage the use of electronic  
11 reserves?

12 A. Well, I recall an e-mail that went out from  
13 some vice president several years ago, I couldn't find  
14 the exact one in my archives, but he was encouraging the  
15 faculty to switch from printed coursepacks to using  
16 EReserves where possible.

17 Q. Who was this vice president?

18 A. I do not remember the name.

19 Q. Do you recall, where he was encouraging that  
20 switch?

21 A. The main subject of the e-mail --

22 Q. I'm sorry, I shouldn't say switch, but why he  
23 was encouraging use of electronic reserves?

24 A. The main subject of the e-mail concerned a  
25 company, a private company called The Print Shop, which

1 was doing a large portion of the coursepack business for  
2 Georgia State. And they were billing themselves as the  
3 official coursepack producer for Georgia State  
4 University. And the e-mail was informing the faculty  
5 that that was not the case. And included in the e-mail  
6 were suggestions that instead of using The Print Shop  
7 for coursepacks they could use the local real GSU  
8 official service or use electronic reserves.

9 Q. And do you recall was there any noticeable  
10 faculty response to that e-mail?

11 A. Not really, not that I could tell.

12 Q. You say in the next paragraph of this e-mail  
13 in the middle, another problem with the coursepacks has  
14 been that the publishers have been going up on what they  
15 charge for copyright royalties in the last few years.

16 Why is the royalty payment a problem?

17 A. Because it makes the coursepack too expensive  
18 for the students.

19 Q. And why is that a problem?

20 A. Why is that a problem, they complain too much  
21 I guess to the professor and the professor changes their  
22 mind, I guess.

23 Q. You go to say there's no charge -- well, you  
24 provide some costs again for the coursepack. You say  
25 here the basic cost is 6 cents per page.

1 Did it drop from the 8 we saw in the previous?

2 A. That's what I charge the bookstore. I'm  
3 referring to -- I think I include later the one third  
4 markup.

5 Q. So these are the pre-markup costs?

6 A. Right.

7 Q. Did you believe it was preferable for  
8 Professor Kript to use electronic reserves rather than  
9 the coursepack?

10 A. Well, I felt that as a new instructor I should  
11 make her aware of the electronic reserves service. I  
12 guess at this time I was thinking I should encourage her  
13 to use that, but mainly wanted her to know we had both  
14 services available.

15 Q. But you believed, didn't you, that electronic  
16 reserves was preferable because it was cheaper?

17 A. Well, just -- if that's the only  
18 consideration, yes. If that's the main consideration,  
19 yes.

20 Q. Well, was that -- what other consideration was  
21 there?

22 A. Some instructors still prefer to have the  
23 coursepacks printed and have their students not have to  
24 go through getting online and downloading the file and  
25 printing it out themselves.



1 Q. Let me ask this again. Just looking at the  
2 e-mail overall and not any particular line. But you  
3 essentially say here that a coursepack could cost --  
4 will cost you 15 to 20 cents a page, could cost \$100 a  
5 copy and you say there's no charge for electronic  
6 reserves other than five cents of page printed and the  
7 first 100 pages are free.

8 It's fair to say that you were providing her  
9 these numbers because you thought electronic reserves  
10 was a good option for her to consider?

11 A. Well, I wanted her to be aware of the option  
12 if she wanted to consider that.

13 Q. Putting your own view aside, are you aware of  
14 whether there's a preference among GSU administrators as  
15 to whether professors should use a coursepack or  
16 electronic reserves?

17 A. Only in the general sense that there's been a  
18 long standing trend to try to move things away from  
19 printing to online, and that includes like the catalogue  
20 and schedule of classes and registration appointment  
21 cards.

22 In general it's part of the trend of going  
23 green and green, less paper. And also cutting costs  
24 because we're in pretty tight budget times now.

25 Q. Do you have a sense of whether it's important

1 to GSU to provide services that, you know, students are  
2 happy with and don't complain about?

3 A. I think that is important.

4 Q. And why so?

5 A. Well, they're our customers.

6 Q. I'm going to mark as Plaintiffs' 49 document  
7 bearing the Bates number Georgia State 0038623.

8 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 49  
9 was marked for identification  
10 by the reporter.)

11 BY MR. LARSON:

12 Q. Do you recognize this document?

13 A. I have a vague memory of it.

14 Q. Okay. This is an e-mail between you and a  
15 Professor Frantz, is that right?

16 A. Well, it's from Professor Frantz to library  
17 reserve staff.

18 Q. And then forwarded to you?

19 A. And they asked me about it.

20 Q. Just turn to page 2, if you would. There's  
21 a -- in the middle of the page an e-mail from Professor  
22 Frantz to EReserves on 7/6/2007.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Thank you very much for providing a great  
25 electronic reserves program. My students and I like the

1 convenience and the cost.

2 Did you hear that sentiment from others?

3 A. Yes, I did.

4 Q. Did you hear it commonly?

5 A. Yes, I did.

6 Q. Do you agree?

7 A. Yes, I do.

8 Q. Mark as Plaintiffs' 50 a document that begins  
9 with Bates number Georgia State 0023163 and runs through  
10 23179.

11 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 50  
12 was marked for identification  
13 by the reporter.)

14 BY MR. LARSON:

15 Q. This is headed action plan 2007 development  
16 approved by the planning development committee.

17 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

18 A. No, I do not.

19 Q. Just have you look at one piece to see if you  
20 have any independent knowledge of it.

21 Would you look at page 10 of this document,  
22 which is Bates number 172. There's a paragraph three or  
23 four paragraphs down, it starts the university library.

24 Says -- it describes a major physical  
25 transformation, and then the last sentence of that

1 paragraph says the transformation project will address  
2 the increasing role of technology in providing library  
3 services. This shift was reflected in a 30 percent  
4 decline in use of print reserves while electronic  
5 reserves increased 18 percent and a decrease of six  
6 percent in regular circulation while media circulation  
7 increased 16 percent.

8 Are these statistics that you've seen before?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Do you have any independent knowledge of  
11 whether they're accurate?

12 A. No.

13 Q. Do you have any independent knowledge of --  
14 well, strike that. We'll move on. Give me just one  
15 moment.

16 You have an account with the Copyright  
17 Clearance Center, is that correct?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Why do you have that account?

20 A. We get copyright permissions through them for  
21 some of the coursepacks that we print.

22 Q. Any other activities other than coursepacks?

23 A. No.

24 Q. How do you access or deal with Copyright  
25 Clearance Center?

1           A.    Get online over the web and access our  
2           account.

3           Q.    Okay.  Do you ever talk to them by phone or  
4           deal with an account rep or anything like that?

5           A.    Only once in the last year or two when I was  
6           getting the name changed and the e-mail address changed  
7           from Phil Williams to me.

8           Q.    Are you familiar with something that they have  
9           called the academic permission service?

10          A.    A little bit.

11          Q.    Tell me what you know about that.

12          A.    Well, like -- I guess I don't really know a  
13          whole lot about it.  Just basically --

14          Q.    Do you use it?

15          A.    Well, I'm not sure which part of their service  
16          you're talking about.

17          Q.    Well, tell me how you use the CCC services.

18          A.    We enter the information for a course and the  
19          coursepack that we're making and including the  
20          instructor, the estimated number of students and then we  
21          enter an item for each copyrighted work that we would  
22          like to include.  And then it comes back and gives the  
23          price that would be charged for that.

24          Q.    Okay.  And you do this for every entry in a  
25          given coursepack, every work that's to be included?

1           A.     Not through the Copyright Clearance Center.  
2           They only handle a few of them.

3           Q.     So do you look up to see if it's a work that  
4           they cover?

5           A.     Yes.   If I were to get a new coursepack I  
6           would first go to Copyright Clearance Center to see what  
7           they could provide permission for.

8           Q.     Because you're repeating coursepacks you know  
9           that they only handle certain of the works in those  
10          coursepacks?

11          A.     Correct.

12          Q.     Just give me a sense of your experience using  
13          Copyright Clearance Center in terms of ease of use?

14          A.     It's fairly easy to use, but they don't cover  
15          nearly enough that we need.  They don't cover even a  
16          third or a half of what we use.

17                   And they're a little bit more expensive, too,  
18          than going directly to the publisher.

19          Q.     What is the -- if you had to put a ballpark  
20          percentage on it, what that percentage in terms of --  
21          strike that.

22                   You said that they don't cover a third to a  
23          half of what you need?

24          A.     (Nods head affirmatively.)

25          Q.     How much of what you need do they cover

1 roughly?

2 A. Probably maybe a third.

3 Q. So two thirds they don't cover?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. And for those you go directly to the  
6 publisher?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. How long does it take when you seek permission  
9 from the Copyright Clearance Center to get an answer?

10 A. Some of them can be automatic. And then some  
11 of them require you to wait while they contact the  
12 publisher.

13 Q. And how long does that take?

14 A. It can vary in time from days to a week or two  
15 or more.

16 Q. Are your requests for permission ever  
17 rejected?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And in what sort of situation would that  
20 occur?

21 A. Sometimes the instructor may want to use more  
22 than the publisher would want to allow or through  
23 Copyright Clearance Center they may just not have that  
24 on file.

25 Q. So there's limits to how much they are able to

1 license, how many pages or what amount of a book or  
2 something like that?

3 A. It depends on the publisher.

4 Q. Are you familiar with Copyright Clearance  
5 Center's blanket license that they offer?

6 A. A little bit. I read something about how you  
7 could pay a certain fixed fee and get all the approval  
8 you need.

9 Q. Is that anything you've ever considered?

10 A. I haven't looked into it.

11 Q. Has anyone at Georgia State, to your  
12 knowledge?

13 A. Not to my knowledge.

14 Q. So for those, recognizing that there are works  
15 that CCC doesn't license or aren't available through  
16 them, for those works that are available, are there any  
17 problems that you have encountered or encounter on a  
18 regular basis licensing?

19 A. With the Copyright Clearance Center?

20 Q. Yeah.

21 A. They have changed their policy to where they  
22 automatically bill you at a certain point in time. And  
23 that point can be before you even know how much you're  
24 going to sell. So that could be a problem.

25 Q. You mean after you've placed an order?



1           A.    Yes.  You have to -- when you place the order  
2 you have to indicate the number of copies you think you  
3 will sell.

4           Q.    I see.  And then is there a rebate or some  
5 money back if you sell less?

6           A.    No.

7           Q.    So you pay for your order?

8           A.    Yeah.

9           Q.    You mentioned that you get permission for  
10 coursepacks also directly from publishers?

11          A.    Yes.

12          Q.    And is that generally something you do just  
13 when it's not available through CCC?

14          A.    CCC is usually my first choice because they're  
15 quicker usually and easier.

16          Q.    Okay.  If you need to go to the publisher, how  
17 do you do that?

18          A.    Well, I look up the publisher contact  
19 information and create a fax form letter with the  
20 pertinent information and fax that to the publisher's  
21 fax number.

22          Q.    And where do you find the information?

23          A.    There's a publisher's directory catalogue in  
24 the library.  I can also find it online.

25          Q.    Mark Plaintiffs' 51.

1 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 51  
2 was marked for identification  
3 by the reporter.)

4 BY MR. LARSON:

5 Q. So Plaintiff's 51 is a document that was  
6 actually produced in this litigation by plaintiffs to  
7 Georgia State. It bears Bates number CUP0000326. If  
8 you could look at page 2 of this.

9 Let me know if you recognize this document  
10 that's page 2?

11 A. Yes. This is on my standard permission form  
12 letters.

13 Q. So this was a situation where you sought  
14 permission directly from the publisher rather than  
15 through CCC?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And that was for a book titled "Materials  
18 Development And Language Teaching" by Brian Tomlinson?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And you say in the first sentence of the  
21 letter, I'd like to request permission to place the  
22 following materials for one term use in educational  
23 online electronic reserves.

24 Do you see that?

25 A. Yes, I do.

1 Q. So this is a situation where you  
2 sought permission for EReserves, right?

3 A. Yes, because it was such a large percentage of  
4 the work. I had forgotten about that.

5 Q. Do you recall other instances where you did  
6 that?

7 A. No, I don't.

8 Q. Now, if -- generally if an excerpt was this  
9 large, over 20 percent say, would it be the case that  
10 you would go to CCC or the publisher and get permission  
11 or just not put it on electronic reserves?

12 A. Normally we would tell the instructor that we  
13 would just not be able to put it on electronic reserves.

14 Q. Would you recommend the coursepack at that  
15 point?

16 A. I would offer that as an option.

17 Q. If you go back to the first page, you see this  
18 is a return letter from Cambridge to you, correct --

19 A. Right.

20 Q. -- granting permission?

21 A. Right.

22 Q. And charging you -- well, they tally up the  
23 pages as being 242 total pages that were used?

24 A. Right.

25 Q. And the charge for that is \$4.84 per copy?

1 A. Right.

2 Q. So that's two cents per page, right?

3 A. Yes. Usually when I requested an entire book  
4 before usually it ends up being cheaper actually for  
5 some reason.

6 Q. And it ends up -- more you use the less per  
7 page?

8 A. Yeah. A couple times I've gotten permission  
9 to do an entire book and they would say, okay, for \$5  
10 per copy.

11 Q. Are you talking about coursepacks or  
12 EReserves?

13 A. Coursepacks.

14 Q. So let me just ask, in the examples we talked  
15 about before with Professor Selwood and Kript where you  
16 were comparing the cost of coursepacks to the cost of  
17 EReserves, why didn't you factor in a royalty cost for  
18 the EReserves use?

19 A. Because we normally don't make copyright  
20 permission and pay royalty fees for electronic reserves  
21 that are under the 20 percent guideline.

22 Q. So is it the position that if the excerpt is  
23 exactly the same but under 20 percent then in a  
24 coursepack you pay a permission but on EReserves you  
25 don't pay a permission, is that right?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Even though the excerpt is the same exact  
3 excerpt?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And is that going to change under the new  
6 policy, do you know?

7 A. Well, under the new policy -- well, in this  
8 case if someone wanted more than the library reserves  
9 thought was meeting the fair use guideline, I assume  
10 that they would also try to get permission from the  
11 publisher. That would be one option.

12 Q. But going forward for work under -- well, for  
13 the work that the professor believes is fair use --

14 A. Right.

15 Q. -- it will be posted on EReserves without a  
16 permission fee, correct?

17 A. Right.

18 Q. And if the same excerpt is put in a coursepack  
19 you'll continue to pay a permissions fee, correct?

20 A. Right.

21 Q. If you were to pay permissions fees for  
22 EReserves listings, do you have a budget for that?

23 A. No.

24 Q. Any way to recoup that fee from students?

25 A. There's no structure in place right now.

1 Q. Can you imagine a structure that could be  
2 used, student fees?

3 A. Yes, I could imagine you could make the  
4 student pay either with their Panther card or credit  
5 card before they have access to download a particular --

6 Q. Students already pay, they're paying to print,  
7 correct?

8 A. They pay five cents a page.

9 Q. Theoretically they could pay 10 cents or 15  
10 cents if there was a royalty charge as well?

11 A. It's theoretically possible.

12 Q. When they print, how does that get charged to  
13 them, do you know?

14 A. They have to use their Panther card, their GSU  
15 card.

16 Q. And then it gets charged back to their  
17 account, student account?

18 A. Right.

19 Q. We'll mark as Plaintiffs' 52 a document that  
20 begins with Bates number Georgia State 0069500 to  
21 000695.

22 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 52  
23 was marked for identification  
24 by the reporter.)

25 BY MR. LARSON:

1 Q. Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

2 A. Yes, I do.

3 Q. What is it?

4 A. It's an e-mail exchange from me and Margareta  
5 Larsson who is one of the IEP instructors. Coursepack  
6 customer.

7 Q. Okay. Look at, if you would, the e-mail that  
8 starts at the bottom of page 1 and carries over to page  
9 2.

10 This is an e-mail from you to Ms. Larsson,  
11 correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And you say in the second to the last  
14 sentence, probably the sooner the better since it will  
15 be good to know how much of the text they will allow  
16 under the 20 percent limit and if that will be  
17 acceptable to you. If not then we need to print it and  
18 I will need to know that fairly soon, like next week.

19 You see that?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. What did you mean that?

22 A. Well, I meant that if the electronic reserves  
23 staff felt that the amount that she wanted to use from  
24 that book was too much, then we would then need to treat  
25 it as a coursepack and get permission and print it and

1 sell it through the bookstore.

2 Q. And so that means you would present it and pay  
3 permissions fees?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Why didn't you consider just allowing her to  
6 put it up on EReserves at the size it was and seeking  
7 permission for that use?

8 A. Well, because if they wanted us to pay it  
9 would be hard to set up something where we could collect  
10 that money. We don't have anything in place right now.

11 Q. So it was the lack of a mechanism for payment?

12 A. Right.

13 Q. Are you aware of any excerpts up on the  
14 EReserves systems that are over 20 percent?

15 A. Not -- not that I'm aware of.

16 MR. LARSON: Let me mark as Plaintiffs'

17 53 --

18 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 53  
19 was marked for identification  
20 by the reporter.)

21 BY MR. LARSON:

22 Q. -- a document bearing Bates number Georgia  
23 State 00038699.

24 Do you recognize this, Mr. Palmour?

25 A. Yes, I do.



1 Q. This is an e-mail chain between you and  
2 Professor Miller?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Just take a look -- reading up from the bottom  
5 on page 1, there's an e-mail in the middle from July  
6 17th, 2006 from him to you. You see that?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Towards the end of that he says the book is  
9 168 pages long which I believe makes the selection too  
10 long for EReserves?

11 A. Right.

12 Q. Is that because that 186 pages would be over  
13 the 20 percent rule?

14 A. The selection he wanted was 1 through 45,  
15 which would have been over the 20 percent of 168.

16 Q. I see. Right.

17 And then you say, your response to him in the  
18 e-mail of 9:08 a.m., that one is available through the  
19 Copyright Clearance Center but only through special  
20 order. I would have to order it before I know how much  
21 it would cost.

22 Are you talking about a coursepack there?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You say would it be better if you have one in  
25 an anthology that we could put on electronic reserves.



1 MR. ASKEW: I'll object to that  
2 question. It's an awfully, awfully broad  
3 question and I think it's calling for him  
4 to reach legal conclusions. He's obviously  
5 not a lawyer and there's an awful lot of  
6 legal allegations made in this complaint.

7 MR. LARSON: Fair enough. Let me be  
8 more specific.

9 BY MR. LARSON:

10 Q. Have you formed an opinion as to whether --  
11 let me have you refer to Exhibit 1, which is -- I'm  
12 sorry, you have to flip. It's in the middle two thirds  
13 of the way through the pack or so. See it?

14 A. I've got it.

15 Q. Have you looked at Exhibit 1 to the complaint?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And did you have occasion to look to see  
18 whether any of the works on Exhibit 1 were present on  
19 the EReserve system?

20 A. I did not go and double check myself.

21 Q. Have you formed any opinion as to whether the  
22 works alleged to have been on EReserves as spelled out  
23 on Exhibit 1 were in fact on the EReserve system?

24 A. I have not made a detailed study to ascertain  
25 whether that's definite or not.

1 Q. Do you know whether anyone else has?

2 A. I do not know.

3 Q. Okay. I'll have you turn to Exhibit 3 if you  
4 could. Do you recognize this page?

5 A. It looks like a course reserves page listing  
6 of documents from electronic reserves.

7 Q. Okay. And is this what the course reserves  
8 page currently looks like?

9 A. I do not know.

10 Q. Okay. But this was the form in place at one  
11 time?

12 A. Yes. You mean in general the layout?

13 Q. Yeah.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Take a look, if you would, just at the second  
16 listing there under the title column. You see where it  
17 says Anna Maria Alonzo?

18 A. Right.

19 Q. Is that a link to the left of the words there  
20 to a PDF file?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. If you click that you would see that article  
23 that's listed there?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Any reason to think that if you clicked that

1 link you wouldn't get that article?

2 A. It should bring that article up, it should  
3 have when this was available.

4 MR. LARSON: Why don't we stop here.

5 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Off the record at  
6 2:12:36.

7 (Brief recess.)

8 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is tape five.

9 We're back on the record at 2:22:24.

10 BY MR. LARSON:

11 Q. Going to mark as Plaintiffs' 54 a document  
12 bearing Bates number Georgia State 0038664.

13 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 54  
14 was marked for identification  
15 by the reporter.)

16 BY MR. LARSON:

17 Q. Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this document?

18 A. Yes, I do.

19 Q. And what is this?

20 A. This is an e-mail exchange between me and Kate  
21 Lippincott.

22 Q. Who's Kate Lippincott?

23 A. Kate Lippincott used to work in my group and  
24 work with me on producing coursepacks. And she went to  
25 another university to work and they were considering

1 getting an electronic reserve system and were  
2 considering ERes and she was asking me questions about  
3 our usage of it.

4 Q. So let me direct you to the middle paragraph  
5 of your response, or I guess it's the second paragraph  
6 of your response starting with the number 1 there. You  
7 say how many times a copyrighted item has been on ERes.  
8 I'm assuming you are trying to comply with the rule that  
9 prevents the same copyrighted work from being used twice  
10 in a row in succeeding semesters.

11 What rule is that you're referring to there?

12 A. Well, I have heard that some people feel that  
13 that's necessary, that they can't use the same item more  
14 than one semester in a row or ever.

15 Q. And was that a rule that was ever in place at  
16 GSU?

17 A. No.

18 Q. I take it that's not a rule that's going to be  
19 in place with the new policy?

20 A. That's something that's going to be looked at  
21 with the new policy. There is a discussion on how long  
22 to leave something up.

23 Q. That was the deletion --

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. -- discussion you were telling me about?

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. But tell me if I'm wrong, but even if  
3 everything was deleted it could be rescanned for use in  
4 the following semester, correct?

5 A. That would be up to them to decide what their  
6 policy is going to be.

7 Q. And you're not aware of whether that's an  
8 issue that has been decided as of now?

9 A. I'm not aware that it has been decided.

10 Q. Okay.

11 A. It was my understanding -- it was my feeling  
12 that changing the password made the item unavailable to  
13 the group of people that had it for that period of time  
14 and that that was sufficient, according to the old Board  
15 Of Regents policy.

16 Q. So even if -- the class in the following  
17 semester it would be a new group of students accessing  
18 it in that semester?

19 A. Yes. And the old group would not have access  
20 any more.

21 Q. You say -- there's a sentence about eight  
22 lines down that says also there is a reporting feature  
23 that lists all the copyrights system wide.

24 You're referring there to a feature of the  
25 ERes software, is that right?

1           A.    Yes, if you enter in all that information into  
2 the -- into that system.

3           Q.    There's a place where you can put in  
4 information related to copyright permission, is that  
5 what this is getting at?

6           A.    I guess that's what I was saying. I don't  
7 recall --

8           Q.    Well, let me ask you, what does Docutek do in  
9 terms of tracking copyright permission information?

10          A.    It's my understanding that it allows you to  
11 enter the publisher information and it will generate a  
12 copyright permission request.

13          Q.    Okay.

14          A.    I think it will let you track whether that's  
15 been responded to or not and what the cost associated  
16 with it is.

17          Q.    And that goes to CCC?

18          A.    Well, I believe that's the default, yes. I'm  
19 getting the two confused with -- the older Docuweb  
20 version had a separate system that would let you enter  
21 information about every publisher and generate a  
22 permission request for you. We didn't really look into  
23 this feature of Docutek's ERes all that much.

24          Q.    Now, as you say down two sentences from the  
25 bottom, we restrict the total amount to 20 percent,



1 total amount allowed to 20 percent but we never ask  
2 publisher's permission or pay royalty fees since we have  
3 no way to recoup costs.

4 Because you never asked permission there was  
5 nothing to track using these features?

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. Okay. You can put that one aside.

8 Now, there came a time when the EReserve  
9 system was open to the public or available to people  
10 beyond those who had the password for a class.

11 A. There was a bug in the software that allowed  
12 access without a password if you clicked on a certain  
13 spot on a certain web page and if you were using the  
14 Internet Explorer browser.

15 Q. When was that, that window of availability?

16 A. I think it began in the spring of 2006 when we  
17 installed the new version of WebCT that had a linkage  
18 feature to ERes that would keep the WebCT students who  
19 had already logged into WebCT and entered the user ID  
20 and password from having to enter another user ID and  
21 password to get into ERes. And when we installed that  
22 new version of WebCT that no longer worked, so we set up  
23 a work around in ERes that would allow that to work.

24 And it's the technical staff that Docutek felt  
25 that that was what allowed -- created the bug that

1 allowed someone to get in without a password.

2 Q. I think we can do this probably more quickly  
3 this way.

4 Can we mark this as 55, Plaintiffs' 55. This  
5 is document bearing the Bates number Georgia State  
6 0009694.

7 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 55  
8 was marked for identification  
9 by the reporter.)

10 BY MR. LARSON:

11 Q. Why don't you just quickly scan through this  
12 e-mail and let me just ask you this. Tell me if there's  
13 anything in this e-mail that's incorrect or that  
14 accurately describes the situation with the password  
15 issue, after you've had a chance to read it.

16 A. Right, I remember writing this. And I believe  
17 it to be correct.

18 Q. And just for the record, just tell me what  
19 this document is.

20 A. This is an e-mail from me to the library staff  
21 and Paula Christopher summarizing the problem with that  
22 bug.

23 Q. And was it eventually rectified?

24 A. Yes, it was.

25 Q. Do you know when it was rectified?



1 were provided?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. And does this appear to be a sample of  
4 one of those reports?

5 A. I believe so. Or -- it would look the same  
6 whether I did it or someone else did it.

7 Q. Okay. So let's just take a look at this.

8 A. It may have been somebody else that ran it.

9 Q. Does this appear to you to be a report  
10 describing activity on the system between 8/16/2006 and  
11 December 31st of 2006?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And that's indicated in the date range column  
14 there, correct?

15 A. Yes.

16 MR. ASKEW: What was the date range  
17 again?

18 MR. LARSON: It's August 16th of '06 to  
19 12/31/06.

20 BY MR. LARSON:

21 Q. And that appears in the header as well,  
22 correct?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And I think you said before you're not sure if  
25 that heading is something that's inputted by the user or

1 generated by the system?

2 A. That looks like a file name or an Excel spread  
3 sheet file name or title name.

4 Q. Got it.

5 A. And I don't believe it's one that I typed in.

6 Q. Yeah, I'll again represent to you the  
7 documents were produced to us as Excel files with that  
8 title.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. So this is a report as you said from late --  
11 fall of '06 basically.

12 Take a look six lines down. There's an entry  
13 for G. L. Berry. Do you see that?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And then there's an entry for -- in the course  
16 reserves page column of that row, says Com 3070  
17 introduction to theories of mass communications, paren,  
18 spring 2009 Hoffner.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Can you tell me how it is for a report  
21 detailing activity from the second half of 2006 there's  
22 a course page identified as spring 2009?

23 A. No, I can't. I don't know why it would do  
24 that unless they copied the same course reserve page  
25 that was used in the fall of 2006 to use again in the

1 spring of 2009 and somehow the system still had it  
2 registered as --

3 Q. If they unarchive the old course page and  
4 update it and say spring 2009, that course page, that  
5 data would be reflected here?

6 A. I'm not sure. That's something I haven't  
7 really looked into the detail. But that could be the  
8 reason why it doesn't have the correct -- well, it  
9 doesn't say fall 2006 there. There's another one too,  
10 below that one.

11 Q. Just staying in that line for purposes of the  
12 question, the hit count, does that hit count reflect the  
13 hits that were recorded by the system during the date  
14 range?

15 A. I'm pretty sure that is the case. The hit  
16 count is restricted to that date range and not a  
17 previous semester that used earlier or currently.

18 Q. It's not a cumulative total of --

19 A. I do not believe so. I think it's just for  
20 the date range.

21 Q. Again, any reason you have to doubt the  
22 accuracy of these reports?

23 A. I wouldn't bet 100 percent that it's, you  
24 know, guaranteed absolutely correct. It may be that  
25 their software is in error on some of this reporting. I

1 mean, I have no way of knowing that for sure.

2 Q. But is there any reason that you think it  
3 would be?

4 A. Well, they had bugs in their software before,  
5 so I mean --

6 Q. And you've used these reports to provide  
7 people in the library and your superiors with --

8 A. Yes. Yes.

9 Q. -- data and various activity on the system?

10 A. Yes. Yes. As far as I know, it should be  
11 accurate.

12 Q. Okay. Flip if you could, I want to point out  
13 a few entries to you. Turn to page -- let's see. Turn  
14 to page 64.

15 MR. ASKEW: 64?

16 MR. LARSON: Yeah.

17 BY MR. LARSON:

18 Q. You there?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Okay. Take a look at the last entry, the R.  
21 Bishop entry?

22 A. Right.

23 Q. So does this entry here reflect the fact that  
24 an article by R. Bishop from the Sage "Handbook Of  
25 Qualitative Research" comprising pages 109 to 138 was

1 provided to students in EPS 9280 in the fall of 2006?

2 A. Yes. Yes.

3 Q. And it was hit 32 times?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Okay. Flip to page 89, please. Just tell me  
6 when you're there.

7 A. Okay.

8 Q. There's an entry about six up from the bottom  
9 called "Changing The System".

10 A. Okay.

11 Q. You see that?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. So does this reflect the fact that Chapter 2  
14 and 7 of "Changing The System", Sage Publications book,  
15 were on the system, on the EReserve system during the  
16 time period reflected on this report?

17 A. Yes, if the title is correct.

18 Q. And by that what do you mean if the title is  
19 correct?

20 A. Well, it's possible that whoever entered this  
21 in may have copied that file incorrectly or something  
22 or --

23 Q. Any reason to believe that that happened with  
24 any regularity?

25 A. No, not really.



1 Q. And it's the case, isn't it, if that had  
2 happened that someone most likely would have alerted the  
3 professor that --

4 A. Yeah, yeah, and the professor would have  
5 alerted the library staff that it was incorrect,  
6 possibly.

7 Q. And this report reflects that that excerpt was  
8 hit 24 times during the time period of this report?

9 A. That's correct.

10 Q. Turn to page 93, please. Okay. And then look  
11 in the middle, there's a Chapter 25 "Rethinking  
12 Observation For Method Context". Do you see that?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. So does this reflect the fact that that was,  
15 that a chapter of that name from the Sage "Handbook Of  
16 Qualitative Research" was available on the system during  
17 the time period of this report?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And it was hit 52 times?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Okay. And again, this -- it was offered to  
22 students in a class called sociology 8342?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Now, again you have no way to know whether --  
25 it says fall 2008 here for that course reserves page,

1 right?

2 A. Right.

3 Q. But the hit as you said before would be hits  
4 from the 2006 period?

5 A. From that date range.

6 Q. Okay. And is it possible that that's because  
7 sociology 8342, the same course page was offered in the  
8 fall 2006 as well?

9 A. That may be the case.

10 Q. Turn to page 98, if you would. Look at the  
11 first entry. Does this reflect the fact that an article  
12 by an S. Chase called "Narrative Inquiry" in the Sage  
13 "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" was provided to  
14 students in EPS 9280 in the fall of 2006?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And it is hit 57 times?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Okay. And go to page 102. And look at the  
19 second entry when you get there.

20 A. Okay.

21 Q. Does this entry here reflect the fact that an  
22 excerpt called "Defining Psychological War And World War  
23 And Early Modern Communication Research" by Christopher  
24 Simpson were made available to students in Com 8100 in  
25 the fall of 2006?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And hit 71 times by students in that class?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And if you could turn to page 149.

5 MR. ASKEW: 149?

6 MR. LARSON: Yeah.

7 BY MR. LARSON:

8 Q. And look at the fourth entry.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. You see an entry that starts with Ethan  
11 Scheiner, S-C-H-E-I-N-E-R?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Does this reflect the fact that Chapter 2 of  
14 Ethan Scheiner's "Democracy Without Competition" were  
15 made available in the time period covered by this  
16 report?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And hit eight times?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Turn to the last page, please. You see the  
21 totals at the end?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And does this reflect the fact that the works  
24 listed in this report were hit 125,531 times during the  
25 date range on this report?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Put that aside.

3 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 57  
4 was marked for identification  
5 by the reporter.)

6 BY MR. LARSON:

7 Q. Let's mark this as Plaintiffs' 57. This is a  
8 document Bates labeled GSU007945.004.XLS-00001 and  
9 running through 00401.

10 Mr. Palmour do you recognize this as another  
11 one of the reports that was generated by the EReserve  
12 system for use in the litigation?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And I'll represent to you this was like the  
15 one we just looked at produced by your counsel. And  
16 this one reports activity from January 1st of 2007 to  
17 May 15th, 2007 on the EReserve system, correct?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Incidentally while I have you here, I don't  
20 have an example in front of me, but are you aware that  
21 occasionally in the course reserves page your name will  
22 appear?

23 A. Where did you see it?

24 Q. I've seen it in reports. I don't have an  
25 example here, I apologize. Is that something that

1 you're aware of that Palmour will appear with a listing  
2 in the course reserves page?

3 A. I set up a test class that has my name  
4 associated with it. That's probably where it's coming  
5 from.

6 Q. When did you do that?

7 A. Well, last November I set up -- I tried to set  
8 up a test course reserves page that would have all  
9 documents in it. I tried to add every document in the  
10 system into that course reserves page. I thought it  
11 would be easier.

12 Q. For purposes of the litigation?

13 A. For creating reports. But it turned out that  
14 you could not access that page once you put everything  
15 in it. Lock up the system when you tried to get to it.

16 Q. Just given the size?

17 A. Yeah. Yeah. So I guess I should have just  
18 deleted it, but I was under orders not to delete  
19 anything so I just left it up there.

20 And we made it -- for a while it was  
21 accessible and it may have shown up in some reports, but  
22 we made it inaccessible so it shouldn't be interfering  
23 with the reports now.

24 Q. So that was done in an effort to provide  
25 reports --

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. -- on activity on the system?

3 A. Yes. A failed attempt.

4 Q. Can you turn to page 89 of this report.

5 A. Okay.

6 Q. Look three up from the bottom, there's an  
7 entry in the document column for Susan Chase?

8 A. Right.

9 Q. Does this reflect the fact a chapter called  
10 "Narrative Inquiry" by Susan Chase from the Sage  
11 "Handbook Of Quantitative Research" was provided to  
12 students during the time period covered by this report?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And it was hit 13 times?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Okay. If you can turn to 151.

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. And take a look at the first entry, first two.  
19 Do those reflect the fact that Chapters 9 and 10 of  
20 Allwright and Bailey's "Focus On The Language Classroom"  
21 were provided to students in AL 8900 during the date  
22 range of this report?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And hit 13 and 15 times respectively?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Okay. And does it also reflect the fact,  
2 looking to the fifth entry, that a chapter called "The  
3 Interview", Chapter 24 by Fontana and Frey from the  
4 "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" was provided to  
5 students in AL 8961 in the spring of '07?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And hit 19 times?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Turn to 153.

10 A. Okay.

11 Q. And if you look at the entry in the middle for  
12 Fredrickson. Do you see that?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Does this reflect that pages 3 to 53 of George  
15 Fredrickson's "White Supremacy" was provided to students  
16 in history 1112 during the time period of this report?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And hit eight times?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Turn to 231, please.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. And look at the fourth line down.

23 A. Okay.

24 Q. Does this reflect the fact that a Chapter 6  
25 called "Paradynamic Controversies" by Lincoln and Guba

1 from the "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" was provided  
2 to students in AL 8961 during the time period of this  
3 report?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And hit four times?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Not too many of these left.

8 Look at page 342.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. Look at the first two entries if you could.

11 A. Okay.

12 Q. Does this reflect the fact that a chapter  
13 called "Qualitative Case Studies" by an R. Stack from  
14 the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" was provided  
15 to students in EPS 8900 during the time period of this  
16 report?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Hit 89 times?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And a chapter also by -- well, a chapter by  
21 Robert E. Stack, Chapter 16 from the "Handbook Of  
22 Qualitative Research" called "Case Studies" was provided  
23 to students in AL 8961 during the period covered by this  
24 report?

25 A. Yes.



1 Q. Hit 17 times?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. And one more here.

4 Page 353.

5 A. Okay.

6 Q. See there's an entry 7 down by Tedlock.

7 A. Okay.

8 Q. Does this reflect the fact that Chapter 17 by  
9 Barbara Tedlock called "Ethnography And Ethnographic  
10 Representation" from the "Handbook Of Qualitative  
11 Research" was provided to students in AL 89611 during  
12 the period covered by this report?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And it was hit five times?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And let's go to the last page. And see the  
17 totals line there?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Does this reflect the fact that during the  
20 time period covered by this report the works detailed in  
21 this report were hit collectively 111,314 times?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Let's mark this as 58.

24 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 58

25 was marked for identification

1 by the reporter.)

2 BY MR. LARSON:

3 Q. All right. Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this  
4 as another report similar to those we were just looking  
5 at?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And this is for the time period August 16th,  
8 2007 to December 31st, 2007?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Okay. I'll represent to you that this was  
11 produced to us by your counsel during discovery. Starts  
12 with Bates number GSU007945.013.XSL-000001 through 437.

13 If you turn to page 26. Look at the first two  
14 entries.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. You there?

17 A. Yep.

18 Q. Does this reflect the fact that Chapter 6 from  
19 L. E. Berk's "Awakening Children's Minds" was provided  
20 to students during the time period represented by this  
21 report?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And it was hit 35 times?

24 A. 35 for the first half and 23 for the second  
25 half for some reason.

1 Q. And I should clarify my question. Together  
2 there's -- the two excerpts are pages 181 to 199 of  
3 Chapter 6 and then pages 200 to 219?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Okay. Can you turn to page 67.

6 A. 67?

7 Q. Yeah.

8 A. Okay.

9 Q. Look at the fourth entry.

10 A. Okay.

11 Q. And does this show that J. Beverley's  
12 "Testimonio Subalternity, And Narrative Authority" in  
13 the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" was offered  
14 to students during the time period covered by this  
15 report?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And it was hit 68 times?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And go to page 69.

20 MR. ASKEW: Page what?

21 MR. LARSON: 69.

22 THE WITNESS: Okay.

23 BY MR. LARSON:

24 Q. The first entry, does this reflect the fact  
25 that R. Bishop's chapter "Freeing Ourselves From

1 Neocolonial Domination And Research" from the Sage  
2 "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" pages 109 to 138 were  
3 offered to students during the time period covered by  
4 this report?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. It was hit 89 times during that time period?

7 A. Yes. Yes.

8 Q. Look at 97, please.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. Look down about six lines, there's an entry  
11 for "Changing The System".

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. Does this entry reflect that "Changing The  
14 System" Chapters 2 and 7 Sage Publications book was  
15 offered to students during the time period covered by  
16 this report?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And it was hit 10 times during that time  
19 period?

20 A. Yes.

21 MR. ASKEW: Where was that?

22 MR. LARSON: I'm sorry. It was six  
23 entries down.

24 BY MR. LARSON:

25 Q. Okay. Turn to page 100, please.

1 A. Okay.

2 Q. First entry.

3 A. Okay.

4 Q. Does this reflect that Chapter 25 from the

5 Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" called

6 "Rethinking Observation For Methods Context" by

7 Angrosino and Mays de Perez was offered to students in

8 sociology 8342 during the date range displayed on this

9 report?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. It was hit nine times?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Okay. Turn to page 102, please. Look at the  
14 bottom entry.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. Does this reveal the fact that a chapter by S.  
17 Chase called "Narrative Inquiry" from the Sage "Handbook  
18 Of Qualitative Research" pages 651 to 679 was offered to  
19 students during the time period covered by this report?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And it was hit 133 times?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Actually stay on that page for a second. Go  
24 up to there's an entry for Charmez five lines up, six  
25 lines up, you see that?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Talking about the first of the two Charmez  
3 entries.

4 Does that reflect the fact that Chapter 3, a  
5 chapter called "Coding And Grounded Theory Practice" was  
6 presented to students during the time period of this  
7 report?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Hit 30 times?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And it was for students in EPRS 3020?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Go to 156, please.

14 A. 156?

15 Q. Uh-huh.

16 A. Okay.

17 Q. See two entries about six or seven lines up  
18 for Ethan Scheiner?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Does this reflect the fact that pages 31 to 63  
21 or Chapter 2 of Ethan Scheiner's "Democracy Without  
22 Competition" were provided to students in POLS 4255  
23 during the fall 2007 semester?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Hit six times?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And that the same excerpt was also hit once in  
3 connection with POLS 4256?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Can you go to page 167, please. Look at the  
6 third and fourth lines.

7 A. Okay.

8 Q. Does this reflect the fact that Chapters 9 and  
9 10 from "Focus On The Language Classroom" by Allwright  
10 and Bailey was provided to students in AL 8900 during  
11 the time period covered by this report?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And hit 14 and 19 times respectively?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Can you go to 169, please.

16 A. Okay.

17 Q. Can you look at the first entry.

18 A. Okay.

19 Q. Does this reflect the fact that a chapter by  
20 G. Fox called "Using Corpus Data In The Classroom" from  
21 a book called "Materials Development And Language  
22 Teaching" pages 25 to 43 was offered to students in AL  
23 8660 during the fall 2007 semester?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And hit 46 times?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Okay. 229, please.

3 A. 229?

4 Q. Uh-huh.

5 A. Okay.

6 Q. Go down five entries, there's one that starts  
7 with Jolly.

8 A. Okay.

9 Q. Does this entry reflect the fact that a  
10 chapter by D. Jolly and R. Bolitho called "A Framework  
11 For Materials Writing" from the book "Materials  
12 Development And Language Teaching" pages 90 to 115 was  
13 offered to students in AL 8660 in the fall 2007  
14 semester?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And hit eight times?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. 324, please.

19 A. Okay.

20 Q. And look at the second entry.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. Kay Plummer. Does this represent the fact  
23 that a chapter by Kay Plummer called "Critical Humanism  
24 And Queer Theory, Living With The Tensions" from the  
25 Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" pages 357 to 373



1 was provided to students in EPS 8500 during the time  
2 period covered by this report?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. It was hit 36 times?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And that it was -- that the same excerpt, if  
7 you look at number 3, was hit 69 times also in  
8 connection with EPS 8900?

9 A. Well, let's see. Is it the same?

10 Q. The second one indicates pages 357 to 375.

11 A. Yeah, the second one is two pages longer for  
12 some reason. But yes, I see what you're saying.

13 Q. So both of those would have been posted?

14 A. It looks like it, yeah.

15 Q. Okay. One hit 36 times and one hit 69?

16 A. Yeah. A mistake there.

17 Q. Turn to 331, please.

18 A. Okay.

19 Q. And look five lines up.

20 A. Okay.

21 Q. Does this reflect that a chapter by P. Prowse  
22 called "How Writers Write, Testimony From Authors" in  
23 the book "Materials Development And Language Teaching"  
24 pages 116 to 129 was provided to students in AL 8660  
25 during the time period covered by this report?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And it was hit 12 times during that time  
3 period?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Turn to 371, please. First two entries.

6 A. Okay.

7 Q. Do those two entries reflect the fact that  
8 Chapters 4 and 7 of "Slave Community" -- I'm sorry, "The  
9 Slave Community" by John Blassingame were provided to  
10 students in AAS 3000 during the time period covered by  
11 this report?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Chapter 7 was hit 67 times during that period?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Chapter 4 was hit eight times?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Page 378, please.

18 A. Okay.

19 Q. Four lines up from the bottom you see an entry  
20 by R. Stack?

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. Does this reflect the fact that a chapter  
23 called "Qualitative Case Studies" from the Sage  
24 "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" pages 443 to 465 by  
25 R. Stack were presented to students in EPS 8500 during

1 the time period covered by this report?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And hit 49 times?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. One more here. Page 401, please. Do you see  
6 the third and fourth entry?

7 A. Okay.

8 Q. Does this reflect the fact that Chapters 1 and  
9 2, these two entries combined, Chapters 1 and 2 of  
10 "States And Social Revolutions" by Theda Skocpol were  
11 provided to students in POLS 8200 during the time period  
12 covered by this report?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And Chapter 1 was hit three times and Chapter  
15 2 was hit twice?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Go to the last page, please.

18 A. Okay.

19 Q. You see the totals line at the bottom?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Does this reflect the fact that the excerpts  
22 in this report were hit a combined total of 124,244  
23 times during the date range covered by this report?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Okay. Got one more of these. Do you want to

1 take a breather?

2 A. It doesn't matter to me.

3 Q. Or work through one more?

4 A. Go ahead and finish the next one.

5 Q. Okay.

6 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 59  
7 was marked for identification  
8 by the reporter.)

9 BY MR. LARSON:

10 Q. We'll mark this as Plaintiffs' Exhibit 59.  
11 And this is Bates numbered GSU007945.005.XSL-000001  
12 through 377.

13 Mr. Palmour, this is another report like the  
14 last few that were provided to us by your counsel. And  
15 do you recognize this as a report of the EReserve  
16 system?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And this is providing details of activity  
19 between 1/1/2008 and 5/15/2008?

20 A. Okay.

21 Q. Is that right?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Okay. Take a look, if you would, at page 44.

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. Six lines down.

1 A. Okay.

2 Q. See Beverley? Does this reflect the fact that  
3 J. Beverley's chapter called "Testimonio Subalternity  
4 And Narrative Authority" from the Sage "Handbook Of  
5 Qualitative Research" pages 547 to 557 was offered to  
6 students in EPS 8500 during the time period covered by  
7 this report?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And it was hit 16 times?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. If you turn to page 46.

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. The second line down, does that reflect the  
14 fact that a chapter by R. Bishop called "Freeing  
15 Yourselves From Neocolonial Domination And Research"  
16 from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" pages  
17 109 to 138 was provided to students in EPS 8500 during  
18 the time period covered by this report?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. It was hit 20 times during that time period?

21 A. Yes. Yes.

22 Q. If you could turn to page 77, please.

23 A. Okay.

24 Q. Does this reflect the fact that -- I'm sorry,  
25 look two lines up from the bottom.

1 A. Okay.

2 Q. Does this reflect the fact that a chapter  
3 called "Narrative Inquiry" by S. Chase from the Sage  
4 "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" pages 651 to 679 was  
5 offered to students in EPS 8500 during the time period  
6 covered by this report?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And it was hit 10 times?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And does this reflect the fact, in going down  
11 one line --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- that a chapter by Susan Chase of the same  
14 name, same book was hit 58 times during this time  
15 period?

16 A. Yes. That's a different class, though. One  
17 was by Kaufmann and the other one was Esposito.

18 Q. You're right. In the first class one is EPS  
19 8500 and one is EPRS 8500?

20 A. Yes. Yes.

21 Q. Can you go to page 93, please.

22 A. All right.

23 Q. You'll see three entries by Cox and McCubbins.

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. Do those three entries, they're the second,

1 third and fourth up from the bottom, reflect the fact  
2 that Chapters 5, 7 and 8 of Cox and McCubbins  
3 "Legislative Leviathan" were provided to students in  
4 POLS 8170 during the time frame covered by this report?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Chapter 5 was hit three times and Chapter 7  
7 once and Chapter 8 once?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. If you could look at 129, please.

10 MR. ASKEW: On the last one you're  
11 looking at Cox, Cox and Cox or were you  
12 looking at Cover and Cox, Cox and Cox?

13 BY MR. LARSON:

14 Q. Let's just clarify. I was looking at the  
15 three entries, the second from the bottom, third from  
16 the bottom and fourth from the bottom. Is that what you  
17 understood me to be referring to?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. If you could look at page 129.

20 A. Okay.

21 Q. Again, second, third -- actually the four  
22 lines counting up from the bottom.

23 A. Okay.

24 Q. Do those lines reveal that the introduction  
25 and Chapters 2, 3 and 4 of "Feminist Media Studies" by

1 Liesbet -- either Zoonen van Liesbet or Liesbet van  
2 Zoonen, I'm not sure which, were provided to students in  
3 JOU 4780 during the time frame covered by this report?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And Chapter 2 of the book was hit 78 times?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And Chapters 3 and 4 were hit two and one  
8 times respectively?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And the introduction was hit 37 times?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And that's a book by Sage Publications?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Can you turn to 270.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. And see there's two entries for Plummer in the  
17 middle of the page?

18 A. Okay.

19 Q. Does the first reflect the fact that a chapter  
20 called "Critical Humanism And Queer Theory, Living With  
21 The Tensions" from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative  
22 Research" pages 357 to 373 by Kay Plummer provided to  
23 students in EPS 8500 during the time period covered by  
24 this report?

25 A. Yes.



1 Q. And that excerpt was hit seven times?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And that a chapter by Kay Plummer from "The  
4 Handbook Of Ethnography" called "The Call Of Life  
5 Stories And Ethnographic Research" was provided to  
6 students in EPRS 8500 during the time period covered by  
7 this report?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And hit 71 times?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Page 287, please.

12 A. Okay.

13 Q. First entry.

14 A. Okay.

15 Q. Does this reflect the fact that a chapter by  
16 L. Richardson called "Writing Is A Method Of Inquiry"  
17 from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" pages  
18 959 to 978 was provided to students in EPRS 8510 during  
19 the date range specified in this report?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And it was hit 73 times?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Page 311, please.

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. You will see two entries for "Slave Community"

1 in the middle of the page?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Those entries reflect the fact that Chapters 4  
4 and 7 of John Blassingame's "The Slave Family" -- I'm  
5 sorry, strike that.

6 These entries reflect the fact that Chapters 4  
7 and 7 of John Blassingame's "Slave Community" were  
8 offered to students in AAS 3,000 during the time frame  
9 covered by this report?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Chapter 7 was hit 83 times, Chapter 4 was hit  
12 14 times?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Page 313, please.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. If you could look at the first entry.

17 A. Okay.

18 Q. Does that entry reflect that a chapter called  
19 "Relativism Criteria And Politics" by J. Smith and P.  
20 Hodgkinson from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative  
21 Research" pages 915 to 932 was offered to students in  
22 EPS 8500 during the time frame covered by this report?

23 MR. ASKEW: What page are you on?

24 MR. LARSON: 313.

25 MR. ASKEW: I thought you said 315.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

You're on 313?

THE WITNESS: Yes.

BY MR. LARSON:

Q. Let me ask the question again. That first entry on page 313, does that reflect the fact that a chapter called "Relativism Criteria And Politics" by J. Smith and P Hodkinson from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research" pages 915 to 932 was offered to students in EPS 8500 during the date range covered by this report?

A. Yes.

Q. And that chapter was hit four times?

A. Yes.

Q. And page 337.

A. Okay.

Q. Two up from the bottom, second and third up from the bottom.

A. Okay.

Q. Do those two entries reflect the fact that Chapters 4 and 7 from John Blassingame's "The Slave Community" were offered to students in AAS 4030 during the time frame reflected by this report?

A. Yes.

Q. Chapter 7 was hit twice and Chapter 4 was hit five times?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Could you turn to the end, please.

3 A. Okay.

4 Q. And do the totals at the end reflect the fact  
5 that works in this report were hit cumulatively 100,514  
6 times during the time frame of this report?

7 A. Yes.

8 MR. LARSON: Okay. This would be a  
9 good time to take a break and I think I  
10 can -- we won't have much left.

11 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Off the record at  
12 3:16:09.

13 (Brief recess.)

14 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Back on the record  
15 at 3:30:52.

16 BY MR. LARSON:

17 Q. Mr. Palmour, just one question. We just went  
18 through a number of EReserves reports and looked at some  
19 works posted on the system.

20 What would be involved in actually trying to,  
21 you know, get ahold of the PDF files of the examples  
22 that we just walked through?

23 A. What do you mean?

24 Q. Are they available?

25 A. The PDF files are still somewhere on the ERes

1 server, yes.

2 Q. So they could be identified and gathered if  
3 need be?

4 A. Yes, they could be.

5 Q. Okay.

6 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 60  
7 was marked for identification  
8 by the reporter.)

9 BY MR. LARSON:

10 Q. Mark Plaintiffs' 60.

11 So what you're looking at, Mr. Palmour, I will  
12 represent to you that yesterday, which I believe was the  
13 22nd, you see down there in right hand corner, I went on  
14 the publicly available GSU ERes web site, at least the  
15 portions of it that are publicly available, and entered  
16 some search terms, in this case "slave family" and this  
17 is what was produced.

18 Do you recognize this interface revealed in  
19 this document?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Tell me what this is?

22 A. This is the results of a search on the ERes  
23 system.

24 Q. That's a functionality offered by the system,  
25 a search functionality?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And it's the case you can search in different  
3 ways, is that right?

4 A. That's correct.

5 Q. And those ways that you can search are  
6 indicated by the four tabs that we see here in the  
7 middle of the page?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. You can search for course reserves page?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. You can search by department, correct?

12 A. Correct.

13 Q. You can search by instructor?

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. And you can search by title or author?

16 A. Correct.

17 Q. Okay. And you enter search criteria in the  
18 field in the middle next to the search button, is that  
19 right?

20 A. That's correct.

21 Q. So this particular search that was entered  
22 here would call up where instances when the word "slave  
23 family" appeared in any of the fields?

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. Is that correct?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Okay. And then what do we see in the lines of  
3 the report, for lack of a better word, what do those  
4 reveal?

5 A. Those show the course numbers and course names  
6 that used those documents.

7 Q. Okay. So the first entry, for example, here  
8 shows that Professor Dixon is teaching a course called  
9 African American Family and providing students with  
10 Chapter 4 of John Blassingame's "The Slave Community"?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And the next page reveals that -- I'm sorry,  
13 the next entry reveals the same chapter being provided  
14 by Professor Dixon in AAS 4030?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Does this show -- are the results that are  
17 returned here for the current semester?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And would the results of a search like this  
20 basically show anything that's currently accessible to  
21 students?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And in this case that's all spring 2009  
24 classes?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. So on the second page do those two entries  
2 show that Professor Dixon is offering Chapters 4 and 7  
3 of "The Slave Community" to students in -- I'm sorry,  
4 strike that.

5 The second page, does the second page shows  
6 Professor Dixon is offering Chapter 7 of "The Slave  
7 Community" to students in AAS 2000 and AAS 4030?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Now, the third page -- I will represent to you  
10 I put together the pages here from several searches that  
11 I ran. Third page is a different search from the one  
12 represented on the first two pages.

13 You see here this was a search for Liesbet  
14 van, L-I-E-S-B-E-T space van?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And did the two entries that you see here  
17 reveal that Professor Meyers is providing students in  
18 JOU 4780 with Chapters 3 and 4 of "Feminist Media  
19 Studies"?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. A Sage Publications book?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And if you flip to the next page those entries  
24 show that she's providing Chapter 2 and the introduction  
25 to that same book --



1 A. Yes.

2 Q. -- to students in JOU 4780?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And then I'll represent to you that the next  
5 two -- next three pages -- I'm sorry. Next single page  
6 is the results of another search that I ran yesterday  
7 searching on Susan Chase.

8 Does the line in the report indicate that  
9 Professor Esposito is providing students in PRS 8500  
10 with a chapter by Susan Chase called "Narrative Inquiry"  
11 from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research"?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Go to the next page. This is another search  
14 that we ran yesterday. Again, I'll represent that this  
15 is a printout of the search results when I searched on  
16 the term Kincheoloe. K-I-N-C-H-E-L-O-E.

17 Does the entry on this search return indicate  
18 that Professor Esposito is providing students in EPRS  
19 8500 with a chapter by J. L. Kincheoloe and P. McLaren  
20 called "Rethinking Critical Theory And Qualitative  
21 Research" from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative  
22 Research"?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And finally the last page, this was a  
25 search -- I'll represent to you this was a printout of

1 search results using the same functionality using the  
2 search terms "method of inquiry".

3 Does the entry in the search results there  
4 indicate that Professor Kaufmann is providing students  
5 in EPRS 8510 with a chapter by L. Richardson called  
6 "Writing Is A Method Of Inquiry" from the Sage "Handbook  
7 Of Qualitative Research"?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. We'll mark Plaintiffs' 61.

10 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 61  
11 was marked for identification  
12 by the reporter.)

13 BY MR. LARSON:

14 Q. This is a document that was produced in  
15 discovery and for some reason when it was printed the  
16 Bates number didn't show up, but I have the Bates  
17 number. It is OUP 0011.

18 MR. ASKEW: OUP what was it?

19 MR. LARSON: OUP 0011928 to 929. Two  
20 pages.

21 BY MR. LARSON:

22 Q. And these were produced by plaintiffs in  
23 discovery, Mr. Palmour. Again, printouts from the GSU  
24 EReserves system displaying the results of searches that  
25 were done by the plaintiffs on the system.

1 Do you recognize this as the same search  
2 interface as we were looking at on the previous page?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And this appears to be a search for the term  
5 "slave community", is that right?

6 A. Right.

7 Q. And does this indicate that Professor Dixon in  
8 the spring of 2008 provided students in AAS 3000 with  
9 Chapters 4 and 7 of John Blassingame's "The Slave  
10 Community"?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And does it reveal that she provided students  
13 in AAS 4030 with those same two chapters --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- in the spring of 2008?

16 A. Yes.

17 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 62  
18 was marked for identification  
19 by the reporter.)

20 BY MR. LARSON:

21 Q. Plaintiffs' 62. And the Bates number on  
22 this -- I'll represent that was a document produced by  
23 plaintiffs in litigation with Bates number CUP 0015758  
24 to 0015759.

25 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this as being

1 the same search interface from previous exhibits?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And that it's showing the results of a search  
4 for "Leviathan"?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And does this indicate that Professor  
7 Merritt -- I'm sorry, looking at the second line,  
8 indicate that Professor Lazarus was providing students  
9 in poly sci 870 with Chapter 8 of Cox and McCubbins  
10 "Legislative Leviathan"?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And if you look at the second page, that  
13 Professor Lazarus in the spring of 2008 was providing  
14 those students in that same class with Chapters 5 and 7  
15 of "Legislative Leviathan"?

16 A. Yes.

17 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 63  
18 was marked for identification  
19 by the reporter.)

20 BY MR. LARSON:

21 Q. Mark this as Plaintiffs' 63. This is a  
22 document that was produced by plaintiffs in discovery  
23 with the Bates numbers Sage, S-A-G-E, 0011029.

24 MR. ASKEW: What was that again?

25 MR. LARSON: Sage 0011029 to 30.

1 BY MR. LARSON:

2 Q. Mr. Palmour, again, do you recognize this as  
3 the printout of the same search screen that we saw in  
4 previous e-mails?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. I'm sorry, in previous documents. And this is  
7 a search for the word Dluhy, D-L-U-H-Y?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Does this indicate that Professor Emshoff was  
10 providing students in psyc 8200 in the fall of 2007 with  
11 Chapters 2 and 7 of "Changing The System" by M. Dluhy --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- by Sage Publications. I think we actually  
14 have just -- I think it's another copy of the same page.  
15 Okay.

16 Mark 64.

17 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 64  
18 was marked for identification  
19 by the reporter.)

20 BY MR. LARSON:

21 Q. Again I'll represent that this was a document  
22 produced by plaintiffs in the litigation Bates number  
23 Sage, S-A-G-E, 0011031 to 34. And again this was  
24 printout that plaintiffs created from the Georgia State  
25 EReserves web site.

1           Can you tell me what is represented on this  
2 document, Mr. Palmour?

3           A.     This is a list of the documents in the class  
4 AL 8961 for spring of 2007 for Professor Belcher.

5           Q.     And can you just confirm for me Professor  
6 Belcher provided students, if you look at the first  
7 entry, with a PDF of Chapter 6 from the "Handbook Of  
8 Qualitative Research", chapter by Lincoln and Guba  
9 called "Paradynamic Controversies"?

10          A.     Yes.

11          Q.     And looking down three entries below that,  
12 Chapter 17 from the same handbook by Barbara Tedlock  
13 called "Ethnographic and Representation"?

14          A.     Yes.

15          Q.     Turning to -- looking at the bottom entry  
16 which carries over to the next page of the printout,  
17 that students were also provided with Robert E. Stake's  
18 "Case Studies" from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative  
19 Research"?

20          A.     Yes.

21          Q.     And going down to week five that they were  
22 provided with Chapter 24 called "The Interview" --

23          A.     Yes.

24          Q.     -- from the "Handbook Of Qualitative Research"  
25 by Fontana and Frey?

1 A. Right.

2 Q. If you could just wait until I have it all  
3 spit out before you respond, that would be helpful.

4 A. Okay.

5 Q. Thank you.

6 If you go down to week 12 on page 3. Does  
7 this reflect that Professor Belcher provided students in  
8 the class with a PDF of a chapter called "Grounded  
9 Theory Objective As To Constructive Methods" from the  
10 "Handbook Of Qualitative Research"?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And going down to week 14, she provided them  
13 with a chapter called "Data Management And Analysis  
14 Methods" from the "Handbook Of Qualitative Research"?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. All right. You can put that one aside.

17 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 65  
18 was marked for identification  
19 by the reporter.)

20 BY MR. LARSON:

21 Q. I'll represent to you this is another document  
22 produced by plaintiffs in the litigation created by  
23 printing out a web site from the GSU EReserve system,  
24 Bates number on this is Sage 0011035 to 38.

25 Mr. Palmour, do you recognize this as the

1 result of a search for the term "Narrative Inquiry"?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Does this reveal that Professor Esposito  
4 provided students in EPRS 8500 in the fall of 2007 with  
5 chapter by Susan Chase called "Narrative Inquiry" from  
6 the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research"?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And going to the next page that Professor  
9 Kaufmann provided students with a chapter, same chapter,  
10 pages 651 for 679 to students in EPS 8500?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. If you go to the third page I will represent  
13 that this is the result of a separate search entered  
14 into the system by the plaintiffs for the term "freeing  
15 ourselves". You see that?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Does the entry at the bottom of the page  
18 indicate that Professor Kaufmann provided students in  
19 EPS 8500 with a chapter from R. Bishop called "Freeing  
20 Ourselves From Neocolonial Domination And Research" from  
21 the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research"?

22 A. Yes.

23 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 66  
24 was marked for identification  
25 by the reporter.)



1 BY MR. LARSON:

2 Q. And this is a similar document produced by  
3 plaintiffs in the litigation. Bates number on this is  
4 Sage 0011039 to 148.

5 My apologies if there's some duplication here.  
6 But it might be easier to just read through rather than  
7 trying to pick out the nonrepeats.

8 Do you recognize this as search results for  
9 the phrase "Sage handbook"?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And does this reflect the fact, looking at the  
12 first entry, that Professor Esposito provided students  
13 in EPRS 8500 with Susan Chase's chapter "Narrative  
14 Inquiry" from the Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative  
15 Research"?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And if you flip to page 3, Professor Kaufmann  
18 provided the same Chase chapter to students in EPS 8500?

19 A. Yes. And.

20 Q. And does it reflect that Professor Esposito  
21 provided students in EPS 8500 with a chapter by  
22 Kincheoloe and McLaren entitled "Rethinking Critical  
23 Theory And Qualitative Research" in the Sage handbook?

24 A. What page are you on?

25 Q. I'm sorry. I'm looking at the entry that

1 starts on page 1 and carries over to page 2.

2 A. Yes, it does.

3 Q. Does it reflect the fact on page 2 looking at  
4 the middle entry that Professor Kaufmann provided  
5 students in EPRS 8510 with Richardsons' "Writing Is A  
6 Method Of Inquiry" from the Sage handbook?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And that Professor Kaufmann provided that same  
9 chapter in the bottom entry to students in EPS 8500?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. All right. If you go to next page.

12 MR. ASKEW: Let's wait just a second.  
13 8510 is talking about pages 959 through 978  
14 and page -- and 8500 looks like it's  
15 referring to pages 9523 through 9548. Is  
16 that right? Am I reading this correctly?  
17 This is for Kaufmann on the second page.

18 MR. LARSON: Yeah, yeah, it does appear  
19 the page range -- let me limit my question  
20 to the middle entry.

21 BY MR. LARSON:

22 Q. Well, actually I'll just strike the last  
23 question I asked with respect to the lower entry.

24 Just recognizing that the page range is  
25 different than the one above, does this indicate,

1 Mr. Palmour, that Professor Kaufmann provided students  
2 in EPS 8500 with a document identified at least here as  
3 "Writing Is A Method Of Inquiry" by Richardson from the  
4 Sage "Handbook Of Qualitative Research"?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Looking at the next page, that Professor  
7 Kaufmann from that same course, EPS 8500, provided  
8 students with Smith and Hodkinson relative -- chapter  
9 called "Relativism, Criteria In Politics" from the Sage  
10 handbook?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And skipping down to the bottom entry starting  
13 at the bottom of that page that Professor Kaufmann  
14 provided students with J. Beverley's chapter called  
15 "Testimonio Subalternity, and Narrative Authority" to  
16 students in EPS 8500?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And the chapter, looking at the next entry, a  
19 chapter by R. Stack "Qualitative Case Studies" from the  
20 Sage handbook?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And again that's the students in EPS 8500 in  
23 the fall of 2007?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And looking at the next entry, a chapter by

1 Kay Plummer called "Critical Humanism And Queer Theory,  
2 Living With The Tensions" from the Sage handbook?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Okay. And looking at the next page, the last  
5 entry does this reveal that Professor Kaufmann provided  
6 students in EPS 8500 with R. Bishop's chapter called  
7 "Freeing Ourselves from Neocolonial Domination And  
8 Research" from the Sage handbook?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Put that one aside. Let's mark Plaintiffs'  
11 67.

12 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 67  
13 was marked for identification  
14 by the reporter.)

15 BY MR. LARSON:

16 Q. Mr. Palmour, this is another printout of some  
17 search results run by the plaintiffs on the GSU EReserve  
18 system and produced in this litigation. Bates number  
19 for this one is CUP --

20 MR. ASKEW: OUP?

21 MR. LARSON: CUP0015760 to 64.

22 BY MR. LARSON:

23 Q. And I'll represent to you that this was a  
24 printout of search results for the term "competition".

25 If you could turn to in the third page of the

1 printout, look at the second entry. Does this entry --  
2 do you see where it says Professor Reimann?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Does this entry reflect that Professor Reimann  
5 in the fall of 2007 provided students in poly sci 4255  
6 with pages 31 to 63 of Ethan Scheiner's "Democracy  
7 Without Competition"?

8 A. Yes.

9 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 68  
10 was marked for identification  
11 by the reporter.)

12 BY MR. LARSON:

13 Q. This is Plaintiffs' 68.

14 This is a printout from the GSU EReserve  
15 system provided by plaintiffs in this litigation Bates  
16 number CUP 0015765 through 68. It's a printout of the  
17 search results from the system when "Cambridge" was  
18 entered.

19 If you look at page two of this printout,  
20 please.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. Okay. You see the two lines for Professor  
23 Downs?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Do those reveal that Professor Downs provided

1 students in poly sci 8200 with Chapter 2 and Chapter 1  
2 of Theda Skocpol's "States And Social Revolutions"?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Skocpol, that's S-K-O-C-P-O-L.

5 You can put that one aside.

6 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 69  
7 was marked for identification  
8 by the reporter.)

9 BY MR. LARSON:

10 Q. Plaintiffs' 69. This is a printout from the  
11 GSU EReserve system produced by plaintiffs in the  
12 litigation, Bates number CUP0015792 to 95. Reveals the  
13 results of the search term "Cambridge" being entered  
14 into the EReserve system.

15 And again, Mr. Palmour, you recognize this as  
16 the same search interface as the previous e-mails,  
17 correct?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. You see the entry in the first page for  
20 Professor Belcher?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Does that reflect the fact that Professor  
23 Belcher provided students in AL 8900 in the fall of 2007  
24 with Chapter 10 of "Focus On The Language Classroom" by  
25 Allwright and Bailey?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And if you turn to the last page of the  
3 printout, second to the last entry, does it reveal that  
4 she provided students in that same class with Chapter 9  
5 of the same book?

6 A. Yes. Yes.

7 Q. Okay. And does this reveal -- quickly. If  
8 you look at the report in total that Professor Murphy  
9 and Professor Moran and Professor Snell -- I'm sorry,  
10 strike that.

11 Does it reveal that Professors Murphy and  
12 Moran provided students in AL 900 with those same two  
13 chapters?

14 A. I see one of them but I don't see where it's  
15 called Chapter 9.

16 Q. That's what I get for trying to do it quickly.  
17 So the -- let's do it this way.

18 The second entry on the page shows that  
19 Professor Murphy provided students with Chapter 9 of  
20 "Focus On The Language Classroom"?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Correct?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And the second entry on the second page shows  
25 that Professor Moran provided students in AL 8900 with

1 Chapter 10, correct?

2 A. Yes.

3 (Plaintiffs' Exhibit No. 70  
4 was marked for identification  
5 by the reporter.)

6 BY MR. LARSON:

7 Q. So Mr. Palmour, do you recognize -- this is  
8 another printout produced by plaintiffs in this  
9 litigation printed out from the GSU EReserve system  
10 after entering search terms into the search interface.  
11 This document is Bates numbered OUP0011930 to 51.

12 You see that this is the results of a search  
13 for the terms "Oxford"?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. If you turn to the third page. Do you see  
16 here that this -- last two entries reveal Professors  
17 Gray and Kruger provided students in EPY 7090 during the  
18 fall 2007 semester with pages 181 to 199 of "Awakening  
19 Children's Minds" by L. E. Berk?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. The last entry on the next page reveals that  
22 Professor Lederberg provided students with the same  
23 chapter or same portion in EPY 7090?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And if you turn the page you see there are --



1 this is the results of a separate search completed by  
2 plaintiffs or a printout of a separate search also  
3 searching on the term "Oxford".

4 To clarify the record, this was -- it was a  
5 single search but this is the next set of documents that  
6 were returned, the next set of 10 hits.

7 Do you see the first entry there for Professor  
8 Dixon?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Does that show that Professor Dixon was  
11 providing students in AAS 4030 with Chapter 4 from  
12 Blassingame's "Slave Family" during the fall 2007  
13 semester?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Skip to -- skip forward to the ninth page of  
16 the printout. The first entry on the page is for  
17 Instructor Lederberg.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. You see that?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Does that entry show that Professor -- that  
22 and the following entry show Professors Lederberg and  
23 Kruger provided students in EPY 7090 with pages 200 and  
24 219 to the book "Awakening Children's Minds" by L. E.  
25 Berk?



1 and pages 25 to 43?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. If you go down to the next page down at --

4 MR. ASKEW: Wait just a second. Wait  
5 just a second. These aren't the same.

6 We're trying to sort this out. I don't  
7 have the one you're looking at.

8 MR. LARSON: Does the one you have --  
9 now, let's confirm start with A Rains on  
10 the first page and then on the second page  
11 the top heading is for J. Richards?

12 MR. ASKEW: No. This one starts with  
13 Pickering, second page is Pickering. Oh,  
14 the title is Rains, yes. The second  
15 page -- title of the work. Okay.

16 BY MR. LARSON:

17 Q. I think we're set then. So just let me start  
18 the question over.

19 Look at page 2, there's an entry for Bunting  
20 in the middle. Does that reveal, Mr. Palmour, that  
21 Professor Bunting was providing students in AL 8660 in  
22 the fall 2007 with a chapter by Jolly and Bolitho called  
23 "The Framework For Materials Writing"?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And that's in a book called "Materials

1 Development And Language Teaching"?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Pages 90 to 115?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And the next entry Professor Bunting was also  
6 providing those students with a chapter from the same  
7 book called "Using Corpus Data In The Classroom" by G.  
8 Fox?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Turn to the next page and go to the last line.  
11 Does that reveal that Professor Bunting was also  
12 providing students in that same class with a chapter  
13 from the same book by P. Prowse called "How Writers  
14 Write, Testimony From Authors"?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Go to the next page. Does this reveal that --  
17 looking at the last two entries -- one second.

18 Looking at the last entry on the page, does it  
19 reveal that Professor Murphy provided students with  
20 Chapter 9 from Allwright and Bailey's "Focus On The  
21 Language Classroom" in the fall 2007 version of AL 8900?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Okay. And if you go to two pages along where  
24 there's -- the first entry is for an Instructor Snell?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Does that show the Professor Snell also  
2 provided Chapter 9 to students in AL 8900 during the  
3 fall 2007?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And going forward two more pages, that  
6 Professor --

7 Going forward two pages it begins with an  
8 entry by Professor Snell. Does it show Professor Snell  
9 provided students the same class 8900 with the Chapter  
10 10 of the Allwright and Bailey book?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Skip down two lines. Does that show Professor  
13 Moran provided students in AL 8900 in fall 2007 with  
14 Chapter 9 of the Allwright and Bailey book?

15 A. Yes.

16 MR. LARSON: You can put that away.

17 That's all I have.

18 MR. ASKEW: What's that?

19 MR. LARSON: I said that's all I have.

20 MR. ASKEW: Okay. Let us take a break  
21 for a second.

22 MR. LARSON: Sure.

23 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Off the record at  
24 4:15:09.

25 (Brief recess.)

1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Back on the record  
2 at 4:32:18.

3 EXAMINATION

4 BY MR. ASKEW:

5 Q. Mr. Palmour, Mr. Larson has shown you a series  
6 of printouts from the EReserve system that have been  
7 marked as Exhibit 60 through Exhibit 71 that he's  
8 reported that his clients printed by accessing the  
9 EReserve system.

10 My question to you is that other than for that  
11 period of time in which there was a bug in the  
12 software -- other than for that time in which there was  
13 a bug in the software system, were there any instances  
14 in which the public could access this EReserve report or  
15 these EReserve reports such as shown in Exhibits 60  
16 through 71 and be able to further enter the system and  
17 have access to these PDF materials that are shown as  
18 having been selected by the professors for scanning and  
19 being made available to the students in the educational  
20 environment?

21 A. No. The public would not have access to those  
22 PDF files.

23 Q. Those files are simply reported and identified  
24 in this report. And what you were doing for Mr. Larson  
25 was simply reading the report and indicating to him as

1 to what this report reflected as being listed as an item  
2 that a professor had selected for being made available  
3 to the students in the educational environment, but that  
4 material would not be available to the public?

5 A. That's correct.

6 Q. The public would be able to see what was being  
7 made available, but they wouldn't have access to the  
8 material itself?

9 A. That's correct.

10 MR. ASKEW: I have no further questions  
11 of the witness.

12 MR. LARSON: Nothing further for me,  
13 either.

14 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Off the record at  
15 4:34:35

16 (Deposition concluded at 4:34 p.m.)  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25





C E R T I F I C A T E

G E O R G I A:

FULTON COUNTY:

I hereby certify that the foregoing deposition was taken down, as stated in the caption, and the questions and the answers thereto were reduced to printing under my direction; that the preceding pages represent a true and correct transcript, to the best of my ability, of the evidence given by said witness upon said hearing. And I further certify that I am not of kin or counsel to the parties to the case; am not in the regular employ of counsel for any of said parties; nor am I in anywise interested in the result of said case.

This, the 28th day of April, 2009.

-----  
Teresa Bishop, RPR, RMR  
CCR No. B-307  
My commission expires 11-21-11.

1 DISCLOSURE

2  
3 STATE OF GEORGIA

4 COUNTY OF DEKALB

5  
6 Deposition of James Palmour

7 Pursuant to Article 10.B of the Rules and Regulations of  
8 the Board of court Reporting of the Judicial Council of  
9 Georgia, I make the following disclosure:

10 I am a Georgia Certified Court Reporter. I am here as a  
11 representative of Shugart & Bishop.

12 I am not disqualified for a relationship of interest  
13 under the provisions of O.C.G.A. 9-11-28.

14 Shugart & Bishop was contacted by the offices of Weil  
15 Gotshall & Manges to provide court reporting services for  
16 this deposition.

17 Shugart & Bishop will not be taking this deposition  
18 under any contract that is prohibited by O.C.G.A. 15-14-37  
19 (a) and (b).

20 Shugart & Bishop has no exclusive contract to provide  
21 reporting services with any party to the case, any counsel  
22 in the case, or any reporter or reporting agency from whom  
23 a referral might have been made to cover this deposition.

24 Shugart & Bishop will charge its usual and customary  
25 rates to all parties in the case, and a financial discount  
will not be given to any party to this litigation.

26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
560  
561  
562  
563  
564  
565  
566  
567  
568  
569  
570  
571  
572  
573  
574  
575  
576  
577  
578  
579  
580  
581  
582  
583  
584  
585  
586  
587  
588  
589  
590  
591  
592  
593  
594  
595  
596  
597  
598  
599  
600  
601  
602  
603  
604  
605  
606  
607  
608  
609  
610  
611  
612  
613  
614  
615  
616  
617  
618  
619  
620  
621  
622  
623  
624  
625  
626  
627  
628  
629  
630  
631  
632  
633  
634  
635  
636  
637  
638  
639  
640  
641  
642  
643  
644  
645  
646  
647  
648  
649  
650  
651  
652  
653  
654  
655  
656  
657  
658  
659  
660  
661  
662  
663  
664  
665  
666  
667  
668  
669  
670  
671  
672  
673  
674  
675  
676  
677  
678  
679  
680  
681  
682  
683  
684  
685  
686  
687  
688  
689  
690  
691  
692  
693  
694  
695  
696  
697  
698  
699  
700  
701  
702  
703  
704  
705  
706  
707  
708  
709  
710  
711  
712  
713  
714  
715  
716  
717  
718  
719  
720  
721  
722  
723  
724  
725  
726  
727  
728  
729  
730  
731  
732  
733  
734  
735  
736  
737  
738  
739  
740  
741  
742  
743  
744  
745  
746  
747  
748  
749  
750  
751  
752  
753  
754  
755  
756  
757  
758  
759  
760  
761  
762  
763  
764  
765  
766  
767  
768  
769  
770  
771  
772  
773  
774  
775  
776  
777  
778  
779  
780  
781  
782  
783  
784  
785  
786  
787  
788  
789  
790  
791  
792  
793  
794  
795  
796  
797  
798  
799  
800  
801  
802  
803  
804  
805  
806  
807  
808  
809  
810  
811  
812  
813  
814  
815  
816  
817  
818  
819  
820  
821  
822  
823  
824  
825  
826  
827  
828  
829  
830  
831  
832  
833  
834  
835  
836  
837  
838  
839  
840  
841  
842  
843  
844  
845  
846  
847  
848  
849  
850  
851  
852  
853  
854  
855  
856  
857  
858  
859  
860  
861  
862  
863  
864  
865  
866  
867  
868  
869  
870  
871  
872  
873  
874  
875  
876  
877  
878  
879  
880  
881  
882  
883  
884  
885  
886  
887  
888  
889  
890  
891  
892  
893  
894  
895  
896  
897  
898  
899  
900  
901  
902  
903  
904  
905  
906  
907  
908  
909  
910  
911  
912  
913  
914  
915  
916  
917  
918  
919  
920  
921  
922  
923  
924  
925  
926  
927  
928  
929  
930  
931  
932  
933  
934  
935  
936  
937  
938  
939  
940  
941  
942  
943  
944  
945  
946  
947  
948  
949  
950  
951  
952  
953  
954  
955  
956  
957  
958  
959  
960  
961  
962  
963  
964  
965  
966  
967  
968  
969  
970  
971  
972  
973  
974  
975  
976  
977  
978  
979  
980  
981  
982  
983  
984  
985  
986  
987  
988  
989  
990  
991  
992  
993  
994  
995  
996  
997  
998  
999  
1000

SHUGART & BISHOP