to KSU

REINWALD O'CONNOR & PLAYDON LLP A Limited Liability Law Partnership

DENNIS E. W. O'CONNOR JR.

(4084)

doj@roplaw.com

Pacific Guardian Center, Makai Tower 733 Bishop Street, 24th Floor Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Phone: 524-8350

Facsimile: 531-8628

Attorney for Third-Party Defendant

FRANK SMIRKE

ORIGINAL

LODGED

JAN 05 2009 300pml

CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF HAWAII

FILED IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF HAWAII

FFR 02 2009

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT at DISTRICT OF HAWAII

ESTATE OF FAITH ROGERS and MICHELLE ROGERS,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

AOAO MALUNA KAI ESTATES, a Hawaii unincorporated association, KENT D. KNOWLEY, DONALD J. ESSES, JAMES W. BOWMAN, DIANE M. BOWMAN and DOE DEFENDANTS 1-20,

Defendants.

Civil No. 07-00373 HG KSC

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION

Petition for Determination of Good

Faith Settlement:

Date:

December 11, 2008

Time:

9:15 a.m.

Judge:

Kevin S. Chang

AOAO MALUNA KAI ESTATES, KENT D. KNOWLEY, JAMES W. BOWMAN, DIANE M. BOWMAN AND DONALD J. ESSES,

Third-Party Plaintiffs,

VS.

FRANK SMIRKE, GLADYS SMIRKE, ANN WHITE, STEWART WHITE and BRYCE WHITE,

Third-Party Defendants.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION

Third Party Defendant Frank Smirke's Petition for Determination of Good Faith Settlement (for the settlement between Frank and Gladys Smirke and Plaintiffs Michelle Rogers Individually and as the personal representative of the Estate of Faith Rogers) pursuant to H.R.S. § 663-15.5(b) came for hearing before Magistrate Kevin S. C. Chang on December 11, 2008. Dennis E. W. O'Connor Jr. appeared for Petitioner, David M. Louie for AOAO Maluna Kai and its individual Defendants Kent D. Knowley and James W. Bowman, Ward F. N. Fujimoto for Third-Party Defendants Stewart White, Ann White and Bryce White and Anthony L. Ranken for Plaintiffs via telephone. The magistrate, after reviewing the moving papers, the affidavits and declarations and testimony therein, and after hearing oral

argument and for good cause shown, hereby finds pursuant to <u>Troyer v. Adams</u>, 102 Haw. 399 (2003), that under the totality of the circumstances, the settlement between Frank and Gladys Smirke and Plaintiffs was made in good faith.

IT IS HEREBY RECOMMENDED that the petition be granted and that the claims against Petitioner, including the claims of AOAO Maluna Kai and the claims of the Whites, be dismissed with prejudice. The Court also recommends that any further claim against Frank and Gladys Smirke are hereby barred. Further, the Court finds that Third-Party Defendants Frank and Gladys Smirke need not answer the cross claim of the Whites.

The issue of whether Frank Smirke will be placed on the verdict form is reserved for the trial court.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, ______JAN 0 7 2009

Judge of the above-entitled Court

Rogers v. AOAO Maluna Kai Estates, et al., Civil No. 07-00373 HG KSC; FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATION

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND CONTENT:

ANTHONY L. RANKEN, ESQ. MICHELLE L. DREWYER, ESQ.

Attorney for Plaintiffs

DAVID M. LOUIE, ESQ.
JAMES SHIN, ESQ.
Attorneys for Defendants
AOAO MALUNA KAI ESTATES, KENT
D. KNOWLEY, JAMES W. BOWMAN,
DIANE M. BOWMAN and DONALD J.
ESSES

RANDALL Y.S. CHUNG, ESQ.

WARD N. FUJIMOTO, ESQ.

Mud 2M

MICHAEL HULT, ESQ.

Attorneys for Third-Party Defendants

BRYCE WHITE, ANN WHITE and

STEWART WHITE