

# **EXHIBIT G**

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS  
EASTERN DIVISION

MIKE HARRIS and JEFF DUNSTAN, )  
individually and on behalf of a )  
class of similarly situated )  
individuals, )  
                                )  
Plaintiffs, )  
                                )  
-vs-                         ) No. 1:11-cv-5807  
                                )  
COMSCORE, INC., a Delaware ) Judge Holderman  
corporation, )  
                                ) Magistrate Judge  
                                ) Kim  
Defendant. )  
\_\_\_\_\_)

The deposition of ROBERTO TAMASSIA, Ph.D.,  
called by the Plaintiffs for examination, pursuant to  
notice and pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil  
Procedure for the United States District Courts  
pertaining to the taking of depositions, taken before  
Emily R. Pellegrino, Certified Shorthand Reporter and  
Notary Public within and for the County of Cook and  
State of Illinois, at 350 North LaSalle Street, 13th  
Floor, Chicago, Illinois, commencing at the hour of  
9:29 a.m. on the 14th day of December, A.D., 2012.

1 A P P E A R A N C E S:  
 2 EDELSON MCGUIRE, LLC, By  
 3 MR. CHANDLER GIVENS and  
 4 MR. BEN THOMASSEN  
 5 350 North LaSalle Street, 13th Floor  
 6 (312) 589-6370  
 7 (312) 589-6378 (Facsimile)  
 8 cgivens@edelson.com  
 9 bthomassen@edelson.com

10 On behalf of the Plaintiffs;

11 QUINN, EMANUEL, URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP, By  
 12 MR. STEPHEN A. SWEDLOW and  
 13 MS. ROBYN M. BOWLAND  
 14 500 West Madison Street, Suite 2450  
 15 Chicago, Illinois 60661  
 16 (312) 705-7400  
 17 (312) 705-7401 (Facsimile)  
 18 stephenswedlow@quinnmanuel.com  
 19 robynbowland@quinnmanuel.com

20 and

21 STACK & O'CONNOR, Chtd., By  
 22 MR. PAUL F. STACK  
 23 140 South Dearborn Street, Suite 411  
 24 Chicago, Illinois 60603  
 25 (312) 782-0690  
 26 (312) 782-0936 (Facsimile)  
 27 pstack@stacklaw.com

28 and

29 MR. THOMAS S. CUSHING, III  
 30 11950 Democracy Drive, Suite 600  
 31 Reston, Virginia, 20190  
 32 (703) 438-2392  
 33 (703) 438-2350 (Facsimile)  
 34 tcushing@comscore.com  
 35 On behalf of the Defendant.

36 ALSO PRESENT:  
 37 Mr. Amir Missaghi

## 1 I N D E X

### 2 WITNESS EXAMINATION

3 ROBERTO TAMASSIA, Ph.D.

4 By Mr. Givens 4

## 5 E X H I B I T S

### 6 TAMASSIA

### 7 DEPOSITION EXHIBIT

### 8 MARKED FOR ID

No. 1	4
No. 2	76
No. 3	79
No. 4	81
No. 5	83

1 at me, she's not going to be able to pick this up.

2 A. Okay.

3 Q. So that's one. The second thing is if you  
 4 don't understand one of the questions that I'm asking  
 5 you, just ask for a clarification, that's fine. But  
 6 if you don't, then I'm going to assume you understand  
 7 the question. Your counsel Stephen might object, but  
 8 you are required to answer unless he instructs you  
 9 otherwise.

10 Are you on any medications, substances, or  
 11 do you have any health issues that might prevent you  
 12 from understanding the questions that I'm going to  
 13 ask you today and responding?

14 A. No.

15 (Whereupon, Tamassia Deposition  
 16 Exhibit No. 1 was marked for  
 17 identification, ERP.)

18 BY MR. GIVENS:

19 Q. Let's begin here. I'm handing you what has  
 20 been marked as Tamassia Exhibit 1 which is your  
 21 expert report. You'll be familiar with it.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Do you recognize this document?

24 A. Yes. Right.

1           MR. SWEDLOW: Objection, vague.  
 2           You can answer.  
 3           THE WITNESS: I would like to speak about  
 4           the computer user that is identified in the ULA.  
 5           Installation process requires the users to be an  
 6           administrator of the ULA. Administrator with  
 7           computer has knowledge about installation of programs  
 8           and installation of program settings. I believe that  
 9           a user who's an administrator of a computer should be  
 10          able to understand exactly what is the meaning of, so  
 11          what is the operation of the software.

12          BY MR. GIVENS:

13           Q. So a general user then?  
 14           A. A general user who is an administrator.  
 15           Q. What do you mean by administrator?  
 16           A. Administrator is a user who has certain  
 17          privilege rights with respect to installing programs,  
 18          reviewing programs, and viewing and modifying  
 19          settings on a computer.  
 20           Q. Give me an example of an administrator.  
 21           A. I'm not sure I understand the question when  
 22          you say example of administrator. I am an example of  
 23          an administrator, for example. I don't know if that  
 24          is your question.

1           Q. Can any consumer be an administrator on  
 2           their computer?  
 3           A. Are you asking whether any person or -- what  
 4           do you mean by consumer here?  
 5           Q. Any person, yes.  
 6           A. Okay. So not every person on this planet  
 7          will have the basic understanding of how a computer  
 8          works to be an administrator. So there is some basic  
 9          computer skills that are needed in order to be an  
 10         administrator. Do you want me to elaborate more on  
 11         this?  
 12           Q. I'd love for you to elaborate a little bit.  
 13           A. Well, what I can say is that computer  
 14          literacy is growing worldwide, especially in the  
 15          United States, and so a good fraction of the  
 16          population is likely to have skills of computer  
 17          administrator.  
 18           Q. Is every user who installs comScore software  
 19          an administrator?  
 20           A. Yes. The software is set up so that if the  
 21          user logged into the machine is not an administrator,  
 22          then the installation will not proceed.  
 23           Q. What happened during the demonstration when  
 24          Yvonne clicked no when she was showing you how the

1           software was installed?  
 2           MR. SWEDLOW: Can you read that question  
 3          back because I wasn't paying attention?  
 4           (Whereupon, the record was  
 5           read as requested.)  
 6           MR. SWEDLOW: I'll object as vague. There  
 7          is no "no." Do you want to rephrase that question?  
 8           MR. GIVENS: I don't want to rephrase the  
 9          question.  
 10          MR. SWEDLOW: It doesn't make any sense  
 11          then.  
 12          THE WITNESS: Can I ask clarification of the  
 13          meaning by what happens? What do you mean by what  
 14          happens?  
 15          BY MR. GIVENS:  
 16           Q. In your report you write, if a user selects  
 17          "no" when presented with a dialog box requesting  
 18          acceptance of the disclosures and ULA, the comScore  
 19          installation process does not run. During the  
 20          demonstration, did Yvonne Bigbee click no?  
 21           A. Now I can answer your question? Okay. I  
 22          asked to see both what happens when the user agrees  
 23          and accepts and when the user disagrees and does not  
 24          accept, and I saw in the administration that when the

1           user does not accept does not agree, the comScore  
 2          portion of the software is not installed but the user  
 3          will still be able to install the other software that  
 4          was bundled together with the comScore software which  
 5          was the original software that the user attempted to  
 6          download.  
 7           Q. During the demonstration, was there only one  
 8          type of bundled software used?  
 9           A. Yes. In the demonstration, there was only  
 10         one type of bundled software.  
 11           Q. Let's move to the operation section of your  
 12         report.  
 13           A. Yes.  
 14           Q. The basis for this whole section is the  
 15          demonstration that was given to you at Reston,  
 16          Virginia; is that correct?  
 17           A. Yes.  
 18           Q. Can you explain a few ways that a panelist  
 19          will be able to determine that comScore software is  
 20          running on their computer?  
 21           A. Are you referring with the word "panelist"  
 22          to a user who has installed the comScore software?  
 23           Q. Yes.  
 24           A. There are various reasons, multiple reasons

1 that will make such -- panelist as copious user to be  
 2 fully aware that the software is fine. So first of  
 3 all, this panelist has explicitly accepted the  
 4 installation such that manner is occurring. Second,  
 5 the panelist should notice that the tray area of the  
 6 task bar in the Windows operating system contains an  
 7 icon associated with the comScore software. This  
 8 provides an explicit and continuous and persistent  
 9 indication that the software is running. In  
 10 addition, whenever the user -- this panelist, this  
 11 user will look at the list of programs installed,  
 12 that the software will appear.

13 And then even more, if you look at what is  
 14 called the task manager, which is a display of the  
 15 so-called processes, programs running, the comScore  
 16 software is there. And if one will inspect some  
 17 settings of the machine or the so called registry,  
 18 one will see registry keys associated with the  
 19 software. The primary visual indication is in the  
 20 system, is in the tray.

21 Q. In the second sentence of the last full  
 22 paragraph on page four "Uninstallation" you write,  
 23 based upon my observations of the demonstration and  
 24 the documentation I reviewed, comScore software can

1 additionally through the start menu.

2 Q. What methods do you use to verify that all  
 3 components of the comScore software have been removed  
 4 from the machine?

5 A. I asked to show me the locations within the  
 6 file system and within the registry where traces of  
 7 the installation would have been present if it were  
 8 not complete. And through the inspection, so I asked  
 9 Yvonne who showed me the registry to show me certain  
 10 folders on the computer, and there were no files that  
 11 indicated that the program still existed.

12 In addition, I asked about various details  
 13 of the operation of the software. And based on what  
 14 I was told, it is my opinion that no files associated  
 15 with the tracking were left in the file system.  
 16 There was a portion of my report where I mentioned  
 17 that the filtering and trackings performed in  
 18 internal memory, so there is kind of no log files, no  
 19 log files that will be part of the file system.

20 Q. But you never personally checked the  
 21 computer; you relied upon Yvonne Bigbee's  
 22 demonstration?

23 A. The screen of the computer was projected in  
 24 front of me and Yvonne did exactly what I asked her

1 be uninstalled in manner consistent with other  
 2 Windows based software, and you go on to write,  
 3 through the add/remove function provided as a part of  
 4 the Windows operating system.

5 Can you explain your basis for writing in a  
 6 manner consistent with other Windows based software?

7 A. The Windows operating system includes  
 8 specifications for developers of applications on how  
 9 uninstallation should be performed. All applications  
 10 for the Windows operating system are expected to  
 11 provide an uninstallation program. And this  
 12 uninstallation program is the one that will be  
 13 launched when the user goes to this app within the  
 14 settings of the computer, called in operation Windows  
 15 add/remove programs and enter other things. So it is  
 16 the standard expected way. All applications are  
 17 expected to provide this functionality.

18 Q. In your experience, have you seen consumer  
 19 software that adds an item to a user start menu that  
 20 is an icon to uninstall software; are you familiar  
 21 with that?

22 A. I am perfectly familiar with what you're  
 23 saying and, yes, I have seen some software  
 24 applications that provide the uninstall functionality

1 to do. So I considered this equivalent to myself  
 2 having inspected the files. Unless, of course, some  
 3 trick was set up to show me something else.

4 Q. What tool did you use to use the registry?

5 A. I asked Yvonne to show me the registry and  
 6 she used a standard tool called reg edit.

7 MR. SWEDLOW: A what?

8 THE WITNESS: Reg edit, R-e-g, e-d-i-t.

9 BY MR. GIVENS:

10 Q. Backing up for just a second on the same  
 11 page the third full paragraph from the bottom last  
 12 sentence you write, moreover, every user who provides  
 13 his or her e-mail address during installation of  
 14 comScore software, it sends an e-mail that includes  
 15 the ULA. What's your basis for that sentence?

16 A. The question I asked and the answer I  
 17 obtained.

18 Q. Okay. Let's move to the obfuscation  
 19 section. Can you explain to me what regular  
 20 expressions are?

21 A. Regular expression is a standard mechanism  
 22 for describing in a succinct way a collection of text  
 23 strings. Text string is a sequence of characters.  
 24 Regular expression can be informally viewed as text

1 pattern. For example, a regular expression will  
 2 describe succinctly the form of a Social Security  
 3 number, of a phone number, of a ZIP code, of a  
 4 two-digit abbreviation of a state. That's it.

5 Q. When you write that the software uses a  
 6 computational technique called regular expressions to  
 7 check for the presence of text patterns associated  
 8 with sensitive data, who determines what those text  
 9 patterns are?

10 MR. SWEDLOW: In the report? Objection,  
 11 vague.

12 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I actually do not  
 13 understand your question about who determines.

14 BY MR. GIVENS:

15 Q. Let me ask generally. If you're using  
 16 regular expressions to detect the presence of text  
 17 pattern, who is that determines the text pattern; is  
 18 it the programmer?

19 A. The process for creating the regular  
 20 expression should be based on domain knowledge about  
 21 how the text patterns look like and then the  
 22 programmer will now implement this domain knowledge  
 23 in the specific program language for the regular  
 24 expressions. So someone, for example, who knows

1 about the form of the Social Security numbers will  
 2 determine how the pattern looks like. And then the  
 3 programmer will have to create what is the actual  
 4 programming specification of the regular expression.

5 Q. So at comScore, who is the person who  
 6 determines that?

7 A. I did not ask who is the person. I assumed  
 8 that they have domain experts who have this knowledge  
 9 and I know that it is the software developers under  
 10 the leadership of the CDO and the director of  
 11 technology and video technology who implement in this  
 12 programming language of regular expressions what is  
 13 this domain knowledge.

14 Q. When you write in your report that sensitive  
 15 data is transformed through the obfuscation process,  
 16 what do you mean by transformed?

17 A. What I mean is that there is a matter that  
 18 takes as input data and could use as output some  
 19 other data; that is the transformation process.

20 Q. So is the comScore software actively seeking  
 21 Social Security numbers, credit card numbers?

22 A. Yes. The software tries to identify the  
 23 presence of various types of sensitive data including  
 24 Social Security numbers and credit card numbers. And

1 once they are discovered, the software either removes  
 2 completely the data or transforms it so that the new  
 3 output data cannot be used to reconstruct the  
 4 original data.

5 Q. When you say removes completely, what do you  
 6 mean?

7 A. Removes completely means that the output of  
 8 the transformation is the empty data set.

9 Q. Is the empty data set then sent to  
 10 comScore's servers?

11 A. There is no such concept of submitting an  
 12 empty set. The data is suppressed, is not uploaded.

13 Q. Once that type of sensitive information is  
 14 detected, a credit card number, a Social Security  
 15 number, a bank number, would it be technically  
 16 feasible to simply excise that information or not  
 17 collect it at all?

18 MR. SWEDLOW: I'll object as vague and  
 19 compound, but you can answer.

20 THE WITNESS: Your question, it is  
 21 hypothetical about -- so can you rephrase it again?  
 22 Can you say it to me again so I can understand?

23 BY MR. GIVENS:

24 Q. My understanding of the way the comScore

1 software works is that it uses regular expressions to  
 2 detect some certain information like a credit card or  
 3 Social Security number?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Then it collects that information and  
 6 transforms it; those are your words?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Would it be technically feasible to rather  
 9 than collect it and transform it, to detect it, and  
 10 not collect it at all?

11 A. Of course it is technically feasible to do  
 12 nothing about the information that is collected, but  
 13 comScore is in the business of actually acquiring  
 14 some type of information.

15 Q. Why do you think comScore transforms credit  
 16 card numbers and collects that information?

17 A. You're asking two questions. Can you ask  
 18 them separately?

19 Q. Why do you think that comScore actively  
 20 seeks credit card numbers to collect?

21 A. Yes. My understanding of the comScore  
 22 business is that they're the one to provide aggregate  
 23 statistical data to their customers about, for  
 24 example, the use of certain credit cards for

1 transactions. So that's one of the reasons that they  
 2 will track credit card usage across the economy,  
 3 across the users of the software.

4 Q. Once the comScore software is installed on  
 5 the user's machine, is it constantly listening for  
 6 web traffic?

7 A. My understanding is that yes, this is the  
 8 case.

9 Q. When the comScore software detects  
 10 information to be collected, how much time elapses  
 11 between collection and transmission to comScore  
 12 servers?

13 A. I did not run timing experiments, so I  
 14 cannot answer this question.

15 Q. When you write in your expert report --

16 MR. SWEDLOW: Are we on page five?

17 BY MR. GIVENS:

18 Q. Page five second full paragraph, once it is  
 19 identified sensitive data is transformed by an  
 20 obfuscation process, it aims to remove detailed  
 21 information while preserving more general information  
 22 of statistical significance. What do you mean by  
 23 general information of statistical significance?

24 A. General information means that this

1 information about class of objects, a class of items.  
 2 For example, the class of days of birth that have the  
 3 same year or the class of credit card numbers that  
 4 start with the same seven digits. This is not  
 5 information about a specific credit card of the user.  
 6 It is a class of credit cards that include the credit  
 7 card of the user. That's the meaning of general  
 8 information.

9 The meaning of statistical significance  
 10 means that it is relevant to the type of statistical  
 11 summaries that are provided by the comScore to their  
 12 customers; for example, demographic information as  
 13 related to certain types of internet shopping habits  
 14 or user job certain brands of credit cards for  
 15 certain types of internet transactions.

16 Q. When you write since the data's transformed  
 17 by an obfuscation process that aims to remove  
 18 detailed information, why did you write aims to  
 19 remove rather than remove? Let me rephrase that.

20 Are you aware of any instances where the  
 21 software doesn't remove the detailed information?

22 A. The reason why I wrote the sentence with the  
 23 term aims is because it is the clear intent of the  
 24 code. And as in any programming endeavors, it is

1 difficult to have absolute certainty of the success  
 2 of a certain program. In particular, it is  
 3 unfeasible to try the program on all possible inputs.  
 4 However, my reading of the software, the description  
 5 I was given of the techniques and methods indicates  
 6 that the obfuscation process is based on technically  
 7 sound principals and was implemented with the  
 8 appropriate tools.

9 Q. Look with me now at the last sentence of the  
 10 second full paragraph --

11 A. Uh-huh.

12 Q. -- where you write, in addition, the  
 13 technique of cryptographic hashing is used to map  
 14 other sensitive data items to numeric values called  
 15 digests that have the following properties: (1) with  
 16 very high probability, the digests are uniquely  
 17 associated with the items; (2) it is computationally  
 18 infeasible to reconstruct the items form the digest.

19 What do you mean when you write it is  
 20 computationally infeasible to reconstruct the items  
 21 from the digest?

22 A. The meaning is that reversing the  
 23 transformation is practically impossible to do given  
 24 current computer technology.

1 Q. Would it be computationally feasible to  
 2 reconstruct the items from the digest if you were  
 3 aware of what the values associated with the digest  
 4 were?

5 A. The question you are asking seems to be of  
 6 the type if you already know what the value is, can  
 7 you reconstruct the value from the digest. There is  
 8 no point in reconstructing something that you already  
 9 know.

10 Q. Are you familiar with the concept of rainbow  
 11 tables?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. So here you write, it's computationally  
 14 infeasible to reconstruct the items from the digest.  
 15 But comScore not only has the digest; they also have  
 16 the associated value, i.e., this is a Social Security  
 17 number; is that correct?

18 A. ComScore detects -- attempts to detect the  
 19 presence of Social Security numbers through regular  
 20 expressions, then Social Security numbers are  
 21 suppressed, so the transformation actually produces  
 22 no output value; it produces the empty data set. For  
 23 Social Security numbers, they do not use the  
 24 technique of cryptographic hashing.