

1 GREENSPOON MARDER, P.A.
 2 RICHARD EPSTEIN (*admitted pro hac vice*)
 3 Richard.Epstein@gmlaw.com
 4 JEFFREY BACKMAN (*admitted pro hac vice*)
 5 Jeffrey.Backman@gmlaw.com
 6 ROY TAUB (*admitted pro hac vice*)
 7 Roy.Taub@gmlaw.com
 8 200 East Broward Blvd., Suite 1800
 9 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301
 10 Telephone: (954) 491-1120
 11 Facsimile: (954) 333-4211

12 MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP
 13 CHRISTINE M. REILLY (SBN 226388)
 14 11355 W. Olympic Boulevard
 15 Los Angeles, CA 90064
 16 Tel: (310) 312-4237
 17 Fax: (310) 996-7037
 18 E-mail: creilly@manatt.com

19 *Attorneys for Defendant*
 20 *Consolidated World Travel, Inc.*

21 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 22 EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

23 KINAYA HEWLETT, on Behalf of Herself
 24 and all Others Similarly Situated,
 25
 26 Plaintiff,
 27
 28 v.
 29
 30 CONSOLIDATED WORLD TRAVEL, INC.
 31 d/b/a HOLIDAY CRUISE LINE,
 32
 33 Defendant.

Case No. 2:16-cv-00713-WBS-AC

**STIPULATION AND ORDER
 TRANSFERRING ACTION TO THE
 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF
 ILLINOIS**

1 Plaintiff Kinaya Hewlett and Defendant Consolidated World Travel, Inc. (“CWT”), by and
2 through their undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate and agree as follows:

3 WHEREAS, on April 6, 2016, Plaintiff filed her initial Complaint asserting class action
4 allegations against CWT for damages and injunctive relief pursuant to the Telephone Consumer
5 Protection Act, 47 U.S.C. § 227, *et seq.* in the United States District Court, Eastern District of
6 California.

7 WHEREAS, on June 10, 2016, Plaintiff filed a First Amended Class Action Complaint.

8 WHEREAS, as CWT advised the Court in the Joint Status Report filed on August 5, 2016,
9 (Dkt. No. 20), CWT believed, based on the similarity of Plaintiff’s allegations and the allegations
10 asserted against CWT in another putative class action, *Bakov v. Consolidated World Travel, Inc. d/b/a*
11 *Holiday Cruise Line, et. al*, No. 1:15-cv-02980 (N.D. Ill.), that this case and *Bakov* are related.

12 WHEREAS, the *Bakov* case was initially filed a year earlier, on April 3, 2015. On May 6,
13 2015, nearly one year before Plaintiff filed this action, a third plaintiff filed a putative class action
14 asserting similar allegations against CWT, this time again in the Northern District of Illinois. *See*
15 *Herrera v. Consolidated World Travel, Inc., d/b/a Holiday Cruise Line*, No. 1:15-cv-0430, at D.E. 1
16 (N.D. Ill.).

17 WHEREAS, the *Herrera* case was consolidated into the *Bakov* case before Judge
18 Leinenweber, and the Consolidated Class Action Complaint was filed on September 17, 2015 (more
19 than six months before Plaintiff filed her initial complaint in this action).

20 WHEREAS, in the course of meeting and conferring over discovery issues, the parties in this
21 action have conferred and have agreed that a transfer of Plaintiff’s action to the Northern District of
22 Illinois, so that it can be consolidated for all purposes into the *Bakov* action, is appropriate to avoid
23 duplicative litigation and potentially inconsistent determinations involving seemingly overlapping class
24 memberships, to further the convenience of the parties and witnesses, and to best serve the interests of
25 justice.

26 WHEREAS, Plaintiff’s counsel has also conferred with counsel for plaintiffs in *Bakov*
27 regarding the issues of transfer and consolidation.

1 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED THAT, given the alleged similarities between the two cases
2 and that it appears the same underlying conduct is being challenged, the Parties jointly request that the
3 Court transfer this case to the Northern District of Illinois, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1404(a), so that it
4 may ultimately be consolidated with the *Bakov* action before Judge Leinenweber. The parties agree
5 that all outstanding discovery shall remain in effect.

6 Dated: February 3, 2017

7 BURSOR & FISHER, P.A

GREENSPOON MARDER, P.A.

8
9 By: /s/ L. Timothy Fisher
L. Timothy Fisher

/s/ Jeffrey A. Backman

Richard W. Epstein
(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

Richard.Epstein@gmlaw.com

Jeffrey A. Backman
(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

Jeffrey.Backman@gmlaw.com

Roy Taub
(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)

Roy.Taub@gmlaw.com

200 East Broward Blvd., Suite 1800
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301

Tel: (954) 491-1120

Fax: (954) 333-4211

10 L. Timothy Fisher
11 Annick M. Persinger
12 Yeremy O. Krivoshey
13 1990 North California Blvd., Suite 940
14 Walnut Creek, CA 94596
15 Telephone: (925) 300-4455
Facsimile: (925) 407-2700
E-Mail: ltfisher@bursor.com
apersinger@bursor.com
ykrivoshey@bursor.com

16 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

17
18 MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP
19 Christine M. Reilly (SBN 226388)
20 11355 W. Olympic Boulevard
21 Los Angeles, CA 90064
22 Tel: (310) 312-4237
23 Fax: (310) 996-7037
24 E-mail: creilly@manatt.com

Attorneys for Defendant
Consolidated World Travel, Inc.

24 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

25 Dated: February 3, 2017

26 

27 WILLIAM B. SHUBB

28 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE