

1 GREENSPOON MARDER, P.A.  
2 RICHARD EPSTEIN (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
3 Richard.Epstein@gmlaw.com  
4 JEFFREY BACKMAN (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
5 Jeffrey.Backman@gmlaw.com  
6 ROY TAUB (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
7 Roy.Taub@gmlaw.com  
200 East Broward Blvd., Suite 1800  
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301  
Telephone: (954) 491-1120  
Facsimile: (954) 333-4211

8 MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP  
9 CHRISTINE M. REILLY (SBN 226388)  
10 11355 W. Olympic Boulevard  
11 Los Angeles, CA 90064  
12 Tel: (310) 312-4237  
13 Fax: (310) 996-7037  
14 E-mail: creilly@manatt.com

15 *Attorneys for Defendant*  
16 *Consolidated World Travel, Inc.*

17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
18 EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

19 KINAYA HEWLETT, on Behalf of Herself  
20 and all Others Similarly Situated,

21 Plaintiff,

22 v.

23 CONSOLIDATED WORLD TRAVEL, INC.  
24 d/b/a HOLIDAY CRUISE LINE,

25 Defendant.

26 Case No. 2:16-cv-00713-WBS-AC

27 **STIPULATION AND ORDER  
28 TRANSFERRING ACTION TO THE  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF  
ILLINOIS**

1 Plaintiff Kinaya Hewlett and Defendant Consolidated World Travel, Inc. (“CWT”), by and  
2 through their undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate and agree as follows:

3 WHEREAS, on April 6, 2016, Plaintiff filed her initial Complaint asserting class action  
4 allegations against CWT for damages and injunctive relief pursuant to the Telephone Consumer  
5 Protection Act, 47 U.S.C. § 227, *et seq.* in the United States District Court, Eastern District of  
6 California.

7 WHEREAS, on June 10, 2016, Plaintiff filed a First Amended Class Action Complaint.

8 WHEREAS, as CWT advised the Court in the Joint Status Report filed on August 5, 2016,  
9 (Dkt. No. 20), CWT believed, based on the similarity of Plaintiff’s allegations and the allegations  
10 asserted against CWT in another putative class action, *Bakov v. Consolidated World Travel, Inc. d/b/a*  
11 *Holiday Cruise Line, et. al.*, No. 1:15-cv-02980 (N.D. Ill.), that this case and *Bakov* are related.

12 WHEREAS, the *Bakov* case was initially filed a year earlier, on April 3, 2015. On May 6,  
13 2015, nearly one year before Plaintiff filed this action, a third plaintiff filed a putative class action  
14 asserting similar allegations against CWT, this time again in the Northern District of Illinois. *See*  
15 *Herrera v. Consolidated World Travel, Inc., d/b/a Holiday Cruise Line*, No. 1:15-cv-0430, at D.E. 1  
16 (N.D. Ill.).

17 WHEREAS, the *Herrera* case was consolidated into the *Bakov* case before Judge  
18 Leinenweber, and the Consolidated Class Action Complaint was filed on September 17, 2015 (more  
19 than six months before Plaintiff filed her initial complaint in this action).

20 WHEREAS, in the course of meeting and conferring over discovery issues, the parties in this  
21 action have conferred and have agreed that a transfer of Plaintiff’s action to the Northern District of  
22 Illinois, so that it can be consolidated for all purposes into the *Bakov* action, is appropriate to avoid  
23 duplicative litigation and potentially inconsistent determinations involving seemingly overlapping class  
24 memberships, to further the convenience of the parties and witnesses, and to best serve the interests of  
25 justice.

26 WHEREAS, Plaintiff’s counsel has also conferred with counsel for plaintiffs in *Bakov*  
27 regarding the issues of transfer and consolidation.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED THAT, given the alleged similarities between the two cases and that it appears the same underlying conduct is being challenged, the Parties jointly request that the Court transfer this case to the Northern District of Illinois, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1404(a), so that it may ultimately be consolidated with the *Bakov* action before Judge Leinenweber. The parties agree that all outstanding discovery shall remain in effect.

Dated: February 3, 2017

BURSOR & FISHER, P.A.

By: /s/ L. Timothy Fisher  
L. Timothy Fisher

L. Timothy Fisher  
Annick M. Persinger  
Yeremy O. Krivoshey  
1990 North California Blvd., Suite 940  
Walnut Creek, CA 94596  
Telephone: (925) 300-4455  
Facsimile: (925) 407-2700  
E-Mail: ltfisher@bursor.com  
apersinger@bursor.com  
ykrivoshey@bursor.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff

GREENSPOON MARDER, P.A.

/s/ Jeffrey A. Backman  
Richard W. Epstein  
(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
[Richard.Epstein@gmlaw.com](mailto:Richard.Epstein@gmlaw.com)  
Jeffrey A. Backman  
(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
[Jeffrey.Backman@gmlaw.com](mailto:Jeffrey.Backman@gmlaw.com)  
Roy Taub  
(Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
[Roy.Taub@gmlaw.com](mailto:Roy.Taub@gmlaw.com)  
200 East Broward Blvd., Suite 1800  
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301  
Tel: (954) 491-1120  
Fax: (954) 333-4211

MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP  
Christine M. Reilly (SBN 226388)  
11355 W. Olympic Boulevard  
Los Angeles, CA 90064  
Tel: (310) 312-4237  
Fax: (310) 996-7037  
E-mail: [creilly@manatt.com](mailto:creilly@manatt.com)

Attorneys for Defendant  
Consolidated World Travel, Inc.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: February 3, 2017

  
WILLIAM B. SHUBB  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

STIPULATION AND ORDER TRANSFERRING ACTION TO THE  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS

CASE No. 2:16-cv-00713-WBS-AC