Snyder v. Phelps et al Doc. 177



100 East Market Street P.O. Box 15012 York, PA 17405-7012 Tel 717.846.8888 Fax 717.843.8492 www.barley.com Sean E. Summers, Esquire
Direct Dial Number: 717.852.4997
E-mail: ssummers@barley.com

October 18, 2007

## VIA ECF

The Honorable Richard D. Bennett United States District Court District of Maryland U.S. Courthouse - Chambers 5D 101 W. Lombard Street Baltimore, MD 21201

> Re: Snyder v. Phelps, et al. Civil No. RDR 06-1389

Dear Judge Bennett:

This letter is in response to this Honorable Court's request that each party submit a brief letter concerning expert witnesses remaining in the courtroom during another witnesses' testimony. Initially it is important to note that plaintiff is not sure which witnesses defendants want their experts to observe. Regardless, the rule concerning exclusion of witnesses is straightforward. Consequently, plaintiff objects to any non-party witnesses being present for the testimony of another witness.

Federal Rule of Evidence 615 states that "the Court shall order witnesses excluded so that they cannot hear the testimony of other witnesses." There are very limited exceptions to this rule but defendants have not demonstrated that any of those exceptions are applicable. Fed. R. Evid. 615 (1-4). Indeed, "[t]he rule is designed to discourage and expose fabrication, and accuracy, and collusion." Opus 3 Ltd. v. Heritage Park, Inc., 91 F.3d 625, 628 (4th Cir. 1996). "The merit of such a rule has been recognized since at least biblical times." Id. In the Fourth Circuit, "[i]t is now well-recognized that sequestering witnesses 'is (next to cross-examination) one of the greatest engines that the skill of man has ever invented for the detection of liars in a court of justice." Id. (All internal citations omitted.)

Defendants have not carried their burden concerning any of the enumerated exceptions clearly identified in Fed. R. Evid. 615. Therefore, all non-party witnesses must be sequestered during trial.

Sincerely,

Sean E. Summers

SES/eab:2078463\_1

cc: Jonathan Katz, Esq. - via ECF

Shirley L. Phelps-Roper - via e-mail Rebekah A. Phelps-Davis - via e-mail Craig T. Trebilcock, Esq. - via e-mail