Snyder v. Phelps et al Doc. 243

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MARYLAND

ALBERT SNYDER,

Plaintiff,

v.

* Civil Action No. RDB-06-1389

FRED W. PHELPS, SR., et al., *

Defendants. *

* * * * * * * * * * * *

ORDER

For the reasons stated in the foregoing Memorandum Opinion, this 4th day of February 2008, it is HEREBY ORDERED that:

- 1. The Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law, Motion for Judgment Notwithstanding the Verdict, Motion for Reconsideration and Rehearing, Motion to Alter or Amend the Judgment, Motions for New Trial, Motion for Relief from Judgment, and Motion for Any Other Relief in Law and Equity Warranted under the Facts and Law filed by Defendants Shirley L. Phelps-Roper and Rebekah A. Phelps-Davis (Paper No. 211) are DENIED;
- 2. The Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law, Motion for Judgment Notwithstanding the Verdict, Motion for Reconsideration and Rehearing, Motion to Alter or Amend the Judgment, Motions for New Trial, Motion for Relief from Judgment, and Motion for Any Other Relief in Law and Equity Warranted under the Facts and Law filed by Defendants Fred W. Phelps, Sr., and Westboro Baptist Church, Inc. (Paper No. 215) are DENIED;
- 3. The Motions for *Remittitur* filed by Defendants Shirley L. Phelps-Roper and Rebekah A. Phelps-Davis (Paper No. 211) and Defendants Fred W. Phelps, Sr., and Westboro Baptist Church, Inc. (Paper No. 215) are GRANTED in part and DENIED in part, viz:

- a. The Motions are DENIED with respect to the compensatory damage award of \$2.9 million entered against all Defendants by Order of this Court of November 2, 2007. All four Defendants are jointly and severally liable for said compensatory damage award. The Motions are GRANTED in part with respect to the punitive damage award of \$8 million, which is reduced to a total of \$2.1 million and apportioned as follows:
 - i. As to Fred W. Phelps, Sr., the \$1.5 million punitive damage award against him for intrusion upon seclusion is reduced to \$150,000, and the \$500,000 punitive damage award against him for intentional infliction of emotional distress is reduced to \$150,000, for a total punitive damages award of \$300,000;
 - ii. As to Westboro Baptist Church, Inc., the \$1.5 million punitive damage award against it for intrusion upon seclusion is reduced to \$500,000, and the \$500,000 punitive damage award against it for intentional infliction of emotional distress remains the same, for a total punitive damages award of \$1 million;
 - iii. As to Shirley L. Phelps-Roper, the \$1.5 million punitive damage award against her for intrusion upon seclusion is reduced to \$300,000, and the \$500,000 punitive damage award against her for intentional infliction of emotional distress is reduced to \$300,000, for a total punitive damages award of \$600,000;
 - iv. As to Rebekah A. Phelps-Davis, the \$1.5 million punitive damages award against her for intrusion upon seclusion is reduced to \$100,000, and the

\$500,000 punitive damage award against her for intentional infliction of emotional distress is reduced to \$100,000, for a total punitive damages award of \$200,000; and

4. The Clerk of the Court transmit copies of this Order and accompanying Memorandum Opinion to counsel of record and the *pro se* Defendants.

/s/

Richard D. Bennett
United States District Judge