

# Exhibit 3

1  
2 HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL-ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY  
3 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
4 FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS  
5 Civil Action No: 1:14-cv-14176-ADB

-----X

6  
7 STUDENTS FOR FAIR ADMISSIONS,  
8 INC.,

Plaintiff,

9 v.

10 PRESIDENT AND FELLOWS OF  
11 HARVARD COLLEGE

(HARVARD CORPORATION),

12 Defendant.

13 -----X

14 VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF

15 DAVID CARD, Ph.D.

16 Washington, DC

17 April 27, 2018

18 9:07 AM  
19  
20

21 Reported by:

22 Karen Brynteson, RMR, CRR, FAPR

23 Job No. 139809  
24  
25

1 D. Card

2 those other components, you would have  
3 considered it appropriate to exclude them  
4 from the model?

5 MS. ELLSWORTH: Object to the  
6 form.

7 THE WITNESS: Well, Dean  
8 Fitzsimmons stated very clearly  
9 that race was used in part to  
10 determine the overall rating, but  
11 that that was not the case with the  
12 other pro -- profile ratings.

13 And several other of the  
14 admissions officers concurred with  
15 that very strongly on direct  
16 question.

17 BY MR. STRAWBRIDGE:

18 Q. And you believed them?

19 MS. ELLSWORTH: Object to the  
20 form.

21 THE WITNESS: I had no reason  
22 not to believe them.

23 BY MR. STRAWBRIDGE:

24 Q. You didn't see any other  
25 evidence that made you think that you

1 D. Card

2 should exclude any other variables based  
3 on the potential that race was affecting  
4 them?

5 A. I -- when I was finishing my  
6 -- in the process of trying to finish my  
7 rebuttal report, it was very clear that  
8 there were a number of disagreements  
9 between Professor Arcidiacono and me on a  
10 couple of issues.

11 And so I -- I was able to ask  
12 Dean Fitzsimmons directly in a telephone  
13 conversation if race was involved in the  
14 personal rating, for example, and he said  
15 no.

16 Q. Did you do anything to verify  
17 his testimony?

18 MS. ELLSWORTH: Object to the  
19 form.

20 THE WITNESS: No.

21 BY MR. STRAWBRIDGE:

22 Q. You're familiar with what it  
23 means to interact a variable in the  
24 multivariate logit model?

25 A. In general terms, yes.

1 D. Card

2 Q. Would you agree that an  
3 interaction simply multiplies one  
4 variable by another variable to show how  
5 the presence or absence of the second  
6 variable modifies the effect of the  
7 first?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. If that sounds familiar, in  
10 fact, that's language from your report,  
11 is it not?

12 A. I believe it is, yes.

13 Q. And in modeling the effect of  
14 race on admissions outcomes, for example,  
15 you would agree that one should include  
16 an interaction between race and  
17 disadvantaged status if the effect of  
18 race is different for disadvantaged and  
19 non-disadvantaged applicants?

20 A. One could do that. There's  
21 advantages and disadvantages to that but,  
22 yeah, you could do that.

23 Q. I mean, let's look at page --  
24 let's look at paragraph 100 of your  
25 report on page 49.

1  
2 DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, to wit:  
3

4 I, Karen K. Brynteson, the  
5 officer before whom the foregoing  
6 deposition was taken, do hereby certify  
7 that the within-named witness  
8 personally appeared before me at the  
9 time and place herein set out, and  
10 after having been duly sworn by me,  
11 according to law, was examined by  
12 counsel.  
13

14 I further certify that the  
15 examination was recorded  
16 stenographically by me and this  
17 transcript is a true record of the  
18 proceedings.  
19

20 I further certify that I am  
21 not of counsel to any of the parties,  
22 nor an employee of counsel, nor related  
23 to any of the parties, nor in any way  
24 interested in the outcome of this  
25 action.

As witness my hand and  
notarial seal this 9th day of May,  
2018.

22 \_\_\_\_\_  
23 KAREN K. BRYNTESON  
24 Notary Public  
25

MY COMMISSION EXPIRES: 10-30-22