380 North Old Woodward Avenue Suite 300 Birmingham, Michigan 48009 Tel: (248) 642-0333 Fax: (248) 642-0856 www.wwrplaw.com Williams Williams Rattner & Plunkett, P.C.

WWRP

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

ERNEST FLAGG, as Next Friend of JONATHAN BOND, a Minor,

Case No. 05-CV-74253

District Judge Gerald E. Rosen

v.

Magistrate Judge R. Steven Whalen

CITY OF DETROIT, a municipal corporation; DETROIT POLICE CHIEF ELLA BULLY-CUMMINGS; DEPUTY DETROIT POLICE CHIEF CARA BEST; JOHN DOE POLICE OFFICERS 1-20; ASST. DEPUTY POLICE CHIEF HAROLD CURETON; COMMANDER CRAIG SCHWARTZ; POLICE LT. BILLY JACKSON; MAYOR KWAME M. KILPATRICK, CHRISTINE BEATTY, Jointly and Severally,

Plaintiffs,

Defendants.

MOTION TO AMEND ORDER

Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel ("SkyTel"), by its attorneys, hereby moves the Court to amend the September 5, 2008 Order [Docket #141] issued by Magistrate Judge Whalen regarding production of text messages by SkyTel. In support of its motion, SkyTel states as follows:

- 1. Following a status conference on September 4, 2008, Magistrate Judge Whalen issued an Order on September 5, 2008 regarding production of text messages by SkyTel (the "September 5 Order").
 - 2. The September 5 Order requires the following at pages 1-2:

On or before **September 8, 2008**, Plaintiff shall serve a Rule 34 Document Request on Defendant City of Detroit as to incoming or outgoing text messages or other communications, maintained by SkyTel on behalf of the City of Detroit, that

originated from or were received by *any* City of Detroit official or employee between 1:30 a.m. and 5:30 a.m. on the morning of April 30, 2003.

On or before **September 10, 2008**, Defendant City of Detroit shall forward the request to SkyTel, along with its written authorization to release said communications to the Court for *in camera* review.

On or before **September 20, 2008**, SkyTel shall forward three copies of said communications, in CD form, to the chambers of the Honorable Gerald E. Rosen, United States District Judge, Eastern District of Michigan, in a sealed envelope, for distribution to United States Magistrate Judge R. Steven Whalen and United States Magistrate Judge Michael J. Hluchaniuk, who will conduct an *in camera* review.

- 3. On September 9, 2008, counsel for SkyTel was informed by SkyTel that it would be overly burdensome for SkyTel to produce text messages originated from or received by text messaging devices issued to the City of Detroit between 1:30 a.m. and 5:30 a.m. on April 30, 2003, as required by the September 5 Order. The undue burden relates to limiting the production to messages sent or received between 1:30 a.m. and 5:30 a.m., which cannot be accomplished by electronic searches and sorting, but instead would require manual manipulation of hundreds of SkyTel records and would take weeks to accomplish.
- 4. It is not an undue burden for SkyTel to produce all text messages originated from or received by text messaging devices issued to the City of Detroit <u>at any time</u> on April 30, 2003.
- 5. As such, SkyTel seeks an amendment to the September 5 Order reflecting the following changes:
 - a. In the first paragraph in Section A of the September 5 Order, change the last clause from "that originated from or were received by *any* City of Detroit official or employee between 1:30 a.m. and 5:30 a.m. on the morning of April 30, 2003" to "that originated from or were received by *any* City of Detroit official or employee on April 30, 2003."

of Detroit from September 8, 2008 to September 12, 2008.

c. In the second paragraph of Section A of the September 5 Order, change the deadline for Defendant City of Detroit to forward the request and written authorization to release to SkyTel from September 10, 2008 to September 15, 2008.

6. SkyTel does <u>not</u> propose to change the deadline for its production of text messages, in CD form, to Judge Rosen's chambers, which would remain September 20, 2008, as set forth in the September 5 Order.

- 7. A proposed Order reflecting the above amendments is attached as Exhibit A.
- 8. SkyTel contacted all counsel of record by e-mail on September 10, 2008, seeking the parties' stipulation to its proposed amendments to the September 5 Order. The following parties have stipulated to the entry of the attached proposed Order: Plaintiff and Defendants City of Detroit, Bully-Cummings, Cureton, Best and Schwartz. As of the filing of this motion, SkyTel has not received stipulations or objections to the proposed Order from the remaining Defendants.

WHEREFORE, for all of the foregoing reasons, Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel respectfully requests that the Court enter the attached proposed Order amending Magistrate Whalen's September 5, 2008 Order [Docket #141].

W|W|R|P Wil

Respectfully submitted,

WILLIAMS, WILLIAMS, RATTNER & PLUNKETT, P.C.

By: /s/ David E. Plunkett

Thomas G. Plunkett (P18957)
David E. Plunkett (P66696)
Attorneys for Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel 380 N. Old Woodward Avenue, Suite 300 Birmingham, Michigan 48009 (248) 642-0333

Dated: September 11, 2008

Birmingham, Michigan 48009 Tel: (248) 642-0333 Fax: (248) 642-0856 www.wwrplaw.com 380 North Old Woodward Avenue Suite 300 Williams Williams

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

ERNEST FLAGG, as Next Friend of JONATHAN BOND, a Minor,

Case No. 05-CV-74253

Plaintiffs,

District Judge Gerald E. Rosen

v.

Magistrate Judge R. Steven Whalen

CITY OF DETROIT, a municipal corporation; DETROIT POLICE CHIEF ELLA BULLY-CUMMINGS; DEPUTY DETROIT POLICE CHIEF CARA BEST; JOHN DOE POLICE OFFICERS 1-20; ASST. DEPUTY POLICE CHIEF HAROLD CURETON; COMMANDER CRAIG SCHWARTZ; POLICE LT. BILLY JACKSON; MAYOR KWAME M. KILPATRICK, CHRISTINE BEATTY, Jointly and Severally,

Defendants.

BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO AMEND ORDER

Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel ("SkyTel"), by its attorneys, relies on the facts set for in their Motion to Amend Order.

Respectfully submitted,

WILLIAMS, WILLIAMS, RATTNER & PLUNKETT, P.C.

By:<u>/s/ David E. Plunkett</u>

Thomas G. Plunkett (P18957)
David E. Plunkett (P66696)
Attorneys for Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel 380 N. Old Woodward Avenue, Suite 300 Birmingham, Michigan 48009 (248) 642-0333

Dated: September 11, 2008

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

David E. Plunkett hereby certifies that on September 11, 2008 he served Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel's Motion to Amend Order, Brief in Support of Motion to Amend Order and this Certificate of Service on behalf of Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel using the ECF system which will send notification to counsel of record.

Respectfully submitted,

WILLIAMS, WILLIAMS, RATTNER & PLUNKETT, P.C.

By: /s/ David E. Plunkett

Thomas G. Plunkett (P18957)
David E. Plunkett (P66696)
Attorneys for Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel 380 N. Old Woodward Avenue, Suite 300 Birmingham, Michigan 48009 (248) 642-0333
tgp@wwrplaw.com
dep@wwrplaw.com

Dated: September 11, 2008

EXHIBIT A

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

ERNEST FLAGG, as Next Friend of JONATHAN BOND, a Minor,

(

Case No. 05-CV-74253

Plaintiffs,

District Judge Gerald E. Rosen

v.

Magistrate Judge R. Steven Whalen

CITY OF DETROIT, a municipal corporation;
DETROIT POLICE CHIEF ELLA BULLYCUMMINGS; DEPUTY DETROIT POLICE
CHIEF CARA BEST; JOHN DOE POLICE
OFFICERS 1-20; ASST. DEPUTY POLICE
CHIEF HAROLD CURETON; COMMANDER
CRAIG SCHWARTZ; POLICE LT. BILLY
JACKSON; MAYOR KWAME M. KILPATRICK,
CHRISTINE BEATTY, Jointly and Severally,

Defendants.

ORDER

Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel ("SkyTel") having filed a Motion to Amend Order and the Court being otherwise fully advised in the premises, it is hereby

ORDERED that the September 5, 2008 Order [Docket #141] by Magistrate Whalen regarding the procedure for production of text messages by Non-Party Velocita Wireless, LLC f/k/a Bell Industries, Inc. d/b/a SkyTel ("SkyTel") is hereby amended; and it is further

ORDERED that section A of the September 5 Order [Docket #141] shall be replaced by the following:

"On or before **September 12, 2008**, Plaintiff shall serve a Rule 34 Document Request on Defendant City of Detroit as to incoming or outgoing text messages or other communications,

Williams Williams Rattner & Plunkett, P.C. 380 North Old Woodward Avenue Suite 300 Birmingham, Michigan 48009 Tel: (248) 642-0333 Fax: (248) 642-0856 www.wwrplaw.com

WWRP

Williams Williams Rattner & Plunkett, P.C. 380 North Old Woodward Avenue Suite 300 Birmingham, Michigan 48009 Tel: (248) 642-0333 Fax: (248) 642-0856 www.wwrplaw.com WWRP

maintained by SkyTel on behalf of the City of Detroit, that originated from or were received by *any* City of Detroit official or employee on April 30, 2003.

On or before **September 15, 2008**, Defendant City of Detroit shall forward the request to SkyTel, along with its written authorization to release said communications to the Court for *in camera* review.

On or before **September 20, 2008**, SkyTel shall forward three copies of said communications, in CD form, to the chambers of the Honorable Gerald E. Rosen, United States District Judge, Eastern District of Michigan, in a sealed envelope, for distribution to United States Magistrate Judge R. Steven Whalen and United States Magistrate Judge Michael J. Hluchaniuk, who will conduct an *in camera* review."

	Honorable Gerald E. Rosen	_
	United States District Judge	
Date:	C	