Eight Mile Style, LLC et al. v. Apple Computer Inc., et al. Case No. 2:07-CV-13164

EXHIBIT 2

Excerpt of transcript pages from the Deposition of Peter Paterno taken on November 20, 2008

Page 2

FAX: 310.820.7933

UNITED STATES DISTRICT

FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN

SOUTHERN DIVISION

EIGHT MILE STYLE, LLC,

ET AL.,

PLAINTIFFS,

VS.

CASE NO. 2:07-CV-13164

APPLE COMPUTER, INC.,

DEFENDANT.

DEPOSITION OF PETER PATERNO, TAKEN
ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFFS, AT
10250 CONSTELLATION BOULEVARD, 19TH
FLOOR, LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA,
COMMENCING AT 2:16 P.M., THURSDAY,
NOVEMBER 20, 2008, BEFORE SAMANTHA
AVENAIM, CSR NUMBER 10627.

		Page 9
14:18:56	1	MR. BUSCH: YOU'RE NOT SUGGESTING
14:18:57	2	THAT MY EXAMINATION, HOWEVER, IS LIMITED TO WHAT
14:18:59	3	YOU ARE GOING TO IDENTIFY.
14:19:01	4	MR. POMERANTZ: IT IS ENTIRELY
14:19:03	5	LIMITED TO THAT, BECAUSE YOU'RE ONLY ENTITLED TO
14:19:05	6	QUESTION HIM ON THINGS IN WHICH HE IS GOING TO
14:19:07	7	OFFER TESTIMONY AS AN EXPERT.
14:19:10	8	MR. BUSCH: I CAN QUESTION HIM ON
14:19:12	9	THINGS RELATED TO BIAS AND DIFFERENT THINGS THAT
14:19:13	10	WOULD COLOR HIS TESTIMONY. SO I DON'T NECESSARILY
14:19:13	11	AGREE WITH THAT.
14:19:15	12	MR. POMERANTZ: WE WILL DO IT ON A
14:19:18	13	QUESTION-BY-QUESTION BASIS. BUT LET ME PUT ON THE
14:19:20	14	RECORD WHAT HE IS GOING TO BE REBUTTING. AND
14:19:20	15	AGAIN, THIS WOULD SUBSUME ALSO THE TESTIMONY WE
14:19:23	16	ARE CURRENTLY OFFERING AS WELL.
14:19:25	17	WITH RESPECT TO THE EXPERT REPORT
14:19:28	18	OF MR. ABRAMS, HOWARD ABRAMS.
14:19:30	19	MR. BUSCH: LET ME GET IT IN FRONT
14:19:48	20	OF ME, PLEASE. OKAY. HOWARD ABRAMS.
14:19:49	21	MR. POMERANTZ: ON PAGE 3 OF THE
14:19:49	22	REPORT
14:19:50	23	MR. BUSCH: YES.
14:19:52	24	MR. POMERANTZ: AT THE TOP OF
	25	THE PAGE THERE IS A SENTENCE THAT BEGINS

		Page 10
14:19:54	1	"INITIALLY."
14:19:55	2	MR. BUSCH: YES.
14:19:57	3	MR. POMERANTZ: AND THEN IT'S
14:19:59	4	FOLLOWED BY A CLAUSE A AND A CLAUSE B.
14:19:59	5	MR. BUSCH: YES.
14:20:01	6	MR. POMERANTZ: HE IS BEING
14:20:06	7	DESIGNATED TO OFFER TESTIMONY TO REBUT THAT
14:20:07	8	PARTICULAR OPINION BY MR. ABRAMS.
14:20:08	9	MR. BUSCH: YES.
14:20:14	10	MR. POMERANTZ: THAT'S IT IN THE
14:20:15	11	ABRAMS REPORT.
14:20:16	12	MR. BUSCH: THAT IS IT IN THE
14:20:17	13	ABRAMS REPORT?
14:20:19	14	MR. POMERANTZ: THAT IS IT.
14:20:19	15	MR. BUSCH: OKAY.
14:20:21	16	MR. POMERANTZ: AND THEN WITH
14:20:22	17	RESPECT TO
14:20:23	18	MR. BUSCH: SULLIVAN?
14:20:27	19	MR. POMERANTZ: MR. SULLIVAN,
14:20:42	20	PAGE 12.
14:20:43	21	MR. BUSCH: OKAY.
14:20:45	22	MR. POMERANTZ: AT THE END OF THE
14:20:47	23	FIRST PARAGRAPH UNDER THE HEADING "CONTROL
14:20:47	24	COMPOSITION CLAUSES"
	25	MR. BUSCH: YES.

		Page 11
14:20:50	1	MR. POMERANTZ: THERE IS A
14:20:51	2	SENTENCE THAT BEGINS WITH "MOREOVER."
14:20:51	3	MR. BUSCH: YES.
14:20:52	4	MR. POMERANTZ: HE WILL BE
14:20:54	5	REBUTTING THE OPINION IN THAT SENTENCE.
14:21:02	6	MR. BUSCH: OKAY. YES.
14:21:03	7	MR. POMERANTZ: AND THEN ON THE
14:21:07	8	NEXT PAGE, PAGE 13, UNDER THE HEADING, "THIRD
14:21:09	9	PARTY LICENSES AND THE CONTROLLED COMPOSITION
14:21:09	10	CLAUSE"
14:21:10	11	MR. BUSCH: RIGHT.
14:21:12	12	MR. POMERANTZ: HE IS GOING TO
14:21:16	13	BE REBUTTING THE SECOND THE OPINION IN THE
14:21:17	14	SECOND SENTENCE.
14:21:17	15	MR. BUSCH: "HOWEVER"?
14:21:18	16	MR. POMERANTZ: BEGINNING WITH THE
14:21:21	17	WORD "HOWEVER."
14:21:25	18	AND THAT IS THE EXTENT OF HIS OF
14:21:27	19	THE OPINIONS HE'LL BE OFFERING AND REBUTTING OR
14:21:29	20	CAPTURED BY THOSE THREE SENTENCES.
14:21:31	21	WE DO NOT INTEND TO OFFER HIM AS AN
14:21:35	22	EXPERT ON COPYRIGHT LAW OR ANY OF THE OTHER
14:21:41	23	MATTERS THAT ARE SET FORTH IN THESE EXPERT
14:21:42	24	REPORTS.
	25	HIS EXPERT TESTIMONY, TO THE EXTENT

		Page 19
14:28:22	1	Q. WAS THAT THE FIRST TIME YOU LOOKED
14:28:23	2	AT THEM?
14:28:24	3	A. YES.
14:28:27	4	Q. OKAY. SO TODAY IS NOVEMBER 20TH,
14:28:30	5	SO IT WOULD BE FAIR TO SAY THAT THE FIRST TIME YOU
14:28:34	6	LOOKED AT THE EXPERT REPORTS OR ANY MATERIAL
14:28:37	7	REGARDING THIS CASE, THIS TIME OF YOUR DEPOSITION,
14:28:39	8	WOULD HAVE BEEN IN THE LAST WEEK?
14:28:40	9	A. YES. I THINK THAT'S RIGHT.
14:28:45	10	Q. OKAY. AND WHILE YOU HAD A SHORT
14:28:48	11	CONVERSATION WITH MR. POMERANTZ WHEN HE ASKED YOU
14:28:53	12	TO BE AN EXPERT, BETWEEN THAT TIME AND TODAY, THE
14:28:56	13	FIRST CONVERSATION THAT YOU CAN RECALL WHERE YOU
14:28:58	14	AND SOMEONE FROM HIS FIRM OR MR. POMERANTZ
14:29:01	15	DISCUSSED WHAT THEY WANTED YOU TO TESTIFY ABOUT
14:29:02	16	WAS THIS MORNING?
14:29:04	17	A. YES. I MEAN, YES. THAT'S RIGHT.
14:29:10	18	Q. AND TODAY IS NOVEMBER 20TH.
14:29:11	19	A. OKAY.
14:29:15	20	Q. OKAY. NOW, TELL ME ABOUT THE
14:29:20	21	CONVERSATION TODAY ON NOVEMBER 20TH WHERE
14:29:22	22	MR. POMERANTZ TOLD YOU WHAT THEY WANTED YOU TO
14:29:22	23	TESTIFY ABOUT.
14:29:23	24	MR. POMERANTZ: I WOULD ASK YOU TO
	25	LIMIT IT ONLY TO THE THREE SUBJECT MATTERS THAT I

		Page 20
14:29:28	1	IDENTIFIED EARLIER SINCE THAT'S WHAT WE'RE
14:29:29	2	DESIGNATING YOU ON.
14:29:31	3	TO THE EXTENT WE HAD CONVERSATIONS
14:29:33	4	ABOUT ANYTHING OTHER THAN THOSE THREE SUBJECT
14:29:34	5	MATTERS, I WOULD INSTRUCT YOU NOT TO ANSWER.
14:29:36	6	MR. BUSCH: ON WHAT GROUNDS?
14:29:36	7	MR. POMERANTZ: IT'S PRIVILEGED.
14:29:37	8	MR. BUSCH: IN WHAT WAY?
14:29:38	9	MR. POMERANTZ: BECAUSE WE
14:29:41	10	REPRESENT HIM AS A WITNESS IN THIS CASE, AND WE'RE
14:29:44	11	ONLY DESIGNATING HIM AS AN EXPERT ON THOSE THREE
14:29:44	12	SUBJECT MATTERS.
14:29:45	13	MR. BUSCH: I DISAGREE. I THINK
14:29:45	14	THAT AS AN EXPERT I'M ENTITLED TO KNOW
14:29:47	15	REGARDLESS OF WHAT YOUR DESIGNATION WAS, I'M
14:29:49	16	ENTITLED TO KNOW EVERYTHING THAT WAS DISCUSSED.
14:29:51	17	SO I'D ASK YOU TO WITHDRAW THAT
14:29:54	18	OBJECTION AND ALLOW ME TO QUESTION HIM ABOUT
14:29:55	19	ANYTHING THAT YOU AND HE DISCUSSED TODAY.
14:29:56	20	MR. POMERANTZ: NO, I'M NOT GOING
14:29:58	21	TO DO SO. I THINK MY INSTRUCTION IS PROPER UNDER
14:29:59	22	THE RULES.
14:30:02	23	AND I WOULD AGAIN INSTRUCT YOU TO
14:30:05	24	LIMIT YOUR ANSWER TO THE DISCUSSIONS YOU RECALL
	25	RELATING TO THE THREE SUBJECT MATTERS I

		Page 21
14:30:07	1	IDENTIFIED.
14:30:09	2	MR. BUSCH: I OBJECT, AND I'LL MOVE
14:30:13	3	TO STRIKE MR. PATERNO'S EXPERT TESTIMONY AS A
14:30:13	4	RESULT.
14:30:14	5	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:30:14	6	Q. GO AHEAD.
14:30:15	7	A. CAN I LEAVE?
14:30:18	8	Q. IF YOU DON'T WANT TO BE AN EXPERT,
14:30:18	9	YOU CAN.
14:30:23	10	A. WE GENERALLY TALKED ABOUT MY
14:30:27	11	OPINING ON THINGS THAT I KNOW ABOUT, WHICH IS
14:30:30	12	CUSTOM AND PRACTICE IN THE MUSIC INDUSTRY AS IT
14:30:42	13	RELATES TO CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSES AND
14:30:45	14	WHATEVER THOSE OTHER TWO THINGS THAT HE SAID THAT
14:30:47	15	I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT ARE.
14:30:49	16	Q. OKAY. WHAT ARE THOSE OTHER TWO
14:30:50	17	OH, WHAT ARE THOSE OTHER TWO THINGS?
14:30:53	18	A. I COULD LOOK AND I COULD REMEMBER.
14:30:54	19	I DON'T REALLY REMEMBER.
14:30:57	20	Q. CAN YOU TELL ME WHAT YOUR OTHER
14:31:00	21	THAN YOUR KNOWLEDGE AS AN ATTORNEY ABOUT CUSTOM
14:31:03	22	AND PRACTICE IN THE INDUSTRY AS IT RELATES TO
14:31:05	23	CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSES, IS THERE ANYTHING
14:31:07	24	THAT YOU CAN RECALL RIGHT NOW THAT YOU'RE AN
	25	EXPERT ON THAT WAS COVERED IN MR. ABRAMS' OR

		Page 22
14:31:13	1	MR. SULLIVAN'S EXPERT REPORTS?
14:31:16	2	A. ARE THERE OTHER THINGS IN THOSE
14:31:17	3	REPORTS THAT I KNOW ABOUT?
14:31:19	4	Q. THAT YOU ARE AN EXPERT ON, THAT YOU
14:31:20	5	CONSIDER YOURSELF AN EXPERT.
14:31:23	6	A. I'M REALLY NOT FAMILIAR WITH WHAT
14:31:26	7	IT TAKES TO BE AN EXPERT. I'VE PRACTICED MUSIC
14:31:29	8	AND COPYRIGHT LAW FOR A LONG TIME, AND I KNOW A
14:31:30	9	LOT ABOUT THOSE SUBJECTS.
14:31:32	10	SO I CONSIDER MYSELF TO BE AN
14:31:35	11	EXPERT IN THOSE AREAS, AND A LOT OF THAT IS
14:31:36	12	COVERED IN THOSE TWO REPORTS.
14:31:37	13	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHY YOU'RE ONLY BEING
14:31:40	14	DESIGNATED ON THREE SENTENCES IN THE TWO REPORTS
14:31:43	15	RATHER THAN THE REMAINDER OF THE REPORTS?
14:31:44	16	A. WELL, I DON'T REALLY KNOW. BUT,
14:31:48	17	YOU KNOW, I DON'T PRETEND TO BE AN EXPERT I
14:31:51	18	DON'T PRETEND TO BE A LEGAL SCHOLAR IN THE
14:31:51	19	COPYRIGHT ACT.
14:31:54	20	I CERTAINLY KNOW A LOT ABOUT IT,
14:31:56	21	BUT I WOULDN'T YOU KNOW, I WOULDN'T PUT MYSELF
14:32:00	22	UP WITH PROFESSOR NIMMER AS AN EXPERT IN THE
14:32:03	23	COPYRIGHT ACT. SO PROBABLY IF I WERE DESIGNATING
14:32:04	24	AN EXPERT IN THE COPYRIGHT ACT, I WOULD DESIGNATE
	25	PROFESSOR NIMMER AND NOT ME.

		Page 23
14:32:09	1	Q. WHAT ABOUT IN LICENSING FOR
14:32:14	2	PERMANENT DOWNLOADS, ARE YOU AN EXPERT IN
14:32:15	3	LICENSING, CUSTOM AND PRACTICE IN THE INDUSTRY AS
14:32:15	4	IT RELATES TO LICENSING FOR PERMANENT DOWNLOADS?
14:32:16	5	MR. POMERANTZ: WHAT DO YOU MEAN BY
14:32:17	6	LICENSING? LICENSING BETWEEN A RECORD COMPANY AND
14:32:20	7	A THIRD PARTY DIGITAL DISTRIBUTOR?
14:32:21	8	MR. BUSCH: NO. WELL, THAT'S ONE
14:32:24	9	AREA OF LICENSING. WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT IS
14:32:24	10	FOR EXAMPLE
14:32:24	11	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:32:25	12	Q. LET ME BACK UP FOR ONE SECOND.
14:32:29	13	EVEN THOUGH I WENT OVER THIS IN YOUR FACT
14:32:33	14	DEPOSITION, I JUST WANT TO GET FOR THE RECORD SOME
14:32:34	15	BACKGROUND ON YOU.
14:32:36	16	I KNOW YOU'RE AN ATTORNEY AND
14:32:38	17	YOU'RE A PARTNER IN A LAW FIRM. HOW LONG HAVE YOU
14:32:41	18	BEEN A PARTNER IN YOUR LAW FIRM?
14:32:43	19	A. IN MY CURRENT LAW FIRM?
14:32:43	20	Q. YES.
14:32:46	21	A. 12 OR 13 YEARS.
14:32:48	22	Q. OKAY. AND WHAT YEAR DID YOU
14:32:49	23	GRADUATE LAW SCHOOL?
14:32:50	24	A. 1976.
	25	Q. OKAY. AND JUST TAKE ME THROUGH,

		Page 24
14:32:57	1	JUST GENERALLY SPEAKING, YOU KNOW, NOT IN ANY
14:32:59	2	GREAT DEPTH, BUT JUST THE JOBS THAT YOU'VE HELD IN
14:33:02	3	THE MUSIC INDUSTRY OR PRACTICING ENTERTAINMENT LAW
14:33:04	4	FROM '76 TO THE PRESENT.
14:33:07	5	A. I GRADUATED FROM LAW SCHOOL IN '76.
14:33:10	6	I TOOK THE BAR. I OPENED MY OWN LAW FIRM. I DID
14:33:15	7	THAT FOR A YEAR AND A HALF. I THEN WENT TO WORK
14:33:19	8	WITH MANATT, PHELPS AT THE TIME OF MANATT, PHELPS,
14:33:20	9	ROTHENBERG & TUNNEY WHERE I STARTED CONCENTRATING
14:33:22	10	IN MUSIC LAW.
14:33:25	11	I WAS THERE FOR 12 YEARS. I LEFT
14:33:30	12	TO GO START HOLLYWOOD RECORDS FOR THE WALT DISNEY
14:33:35	13	COMPANY. I DID THAT FOR FOUR YEARS. I LEFT
14:33:38	14	BECAUSE THEY DIDN'T WANT ME THERE ANYMORE, AND I
14:33:40	15	SPENT THE YEAR TRYING TO GET A REAL JOB. IT
14:33:43	16	DIDN'T WORK. SO I WENT BACK TO BEING A LAWYER
14:33:43	17	AGAIN.
14:33:44	18	Q. AND WHAT YEAR WAS THAT?
14:33:47	19	A. '95, '96. SOMETHING LIKE THAT.
14:33:49	20	Q. AND YOU'VE BEEN IN THE PRIVATE
14:33:51	21	PRACTICE OF LAW FROM 1995 ONWARD?
14:33:51	22	A. YES.
14:33:56	23	Q. OKAY. SO IN YOUR CAPACITY AS A
14:33:59	24	PARTNER IN A LAW FIRM IN THE PRIVATE REPHRASE
	25	THAT.

		Page 36
14:46:05	1	TWO SENTENCES IDENTIFIED FOR YOU, THAT MAY BE FAIR
14:46:06	2	GAME. I'M NOT AWARE OF SUCH SENTENCES.
14:46:08	3	MR. BUSCH: IT'S EITHER "YES" OR
14:46:08	4	"NO."
14:46:09	5	MR. POMERANTZ: I GUESS THAT'S WHY
14:46:11	6	I'M CLARIFYING IT. I DON'T THINK THERE IS ANY IN
14:46:13	7	HERE THAT WOULD RELATE. BUT IF YOU HAVE
14:46:16	8	PARTICULAR ONES, I WOULD TAKE IT AT A LINE BY
14:46:16	9	LINE.
14:46:17	10	MR. BUSCH: I MEAN, I COULD GO
14:46:21	11	THROUGH EACH AND EVERY SENTENCE.
14:46:23	12	YOU'VE READ THIS REPORT, HAVEN'T
14:46:23	13	YOU, MR. POMERANTZ?
14:46:24	14	MR. POMERANTZ: I'M NOT HERE TO
14:46:26	15	ANSWER QUESTIONS. BUT YES, I'VE READ THIS REPORT.
14:46:26	16	MR. BUSCH: OKAY. AND SO HAVING
14:46:27	17	READ THE REPORT, ARE THERE ANY SENTENCES IN HERE
14:46:30	18	THAT YOU WOULD NOT INSTRUCT HIM NOT TO ANSWER?
14:46:31	19	MR. POMERANTZ: I'M NOT SURE.
14:46:32	20	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:46:35	21	Q. MR. PATERNO, TURN YOUR ATTENTION TO
14:46:37	22	THE SENTENCE THAT SAYS:
14:46:39	23	"MOREOVER, EVEN IF THE
14:46:41	24	MECHANICAL ROYALTIES PARAGRAPH
	25	CONTAIN A DIRECT MECHANICAL

		1
		Page 37
	1	LICENSE FOR PHYSICAL PRODUCTS,
	2	WHICH IT DOES NOT, IT IN NO WAY
	3	IT IN NO WAY CAN IT BE INTERPRETED
	4	TO APPLY TO D.P.D.'S."
	5	DO YOU SEE THAT?
14:47:02	6	A. YES.
14:47:02	7	Q. WHAT IS YOUR EXPERT OPINION WITH
14:47:03	8	RESPECT TO THAT SENTENCE?
14:47:04	9	MR. POMERANTZ: COULD I ASK A
14:47:05	10	FAVOR? BECAUSE THAT IS SPECIFICALLY REFERRING TO
14:47:08	11	A PARAGRAPH, WHICH I THINK WE ALL KNOW TO BE A
14:47:10	12	PARAGRAPH FROM THE AGREEMENTS AT ISSUE IN THIS
14:47:12	13	CASE, WOULD YOU MIND PUTTING THE PARAGRAPH IN
14:47:13	14	FRONT OF HIM?
14:47:27	15	MR. BUSCH: NO PROBLEM.
14:47:27	16	MR. POMERANTZ: THANK YOU.
14:47:27	17	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:47:28	18	Q. LET ME SHOW YOU WHAT HAS BEEN
14:47:32	19	PREVIOUSLY MARKED AS EXHIBIT 5, AND WE MIGHT AS
14:47:32	20	WELL SHOW YOU THIS AGREEMENT AS WELL.
14:47:41	21	(DOCUMENT REVIEWED BY DEPONENT.)
14:47:41	22	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:47:44	23	Q. DO YOU RECOGNIZE EXHIBIT 5 AND
14:47:44	24	NUMBER 10?
	25	A. YES.

_		
		Page 38
14:47:46	1	Q. WHAT ARE EXHIBITS 5 AND 10?
14:47:51	2	A. I THINK FIVE IS THE ORIGINAL DEAL
14:47:58	3	MEMO UNDER WHICH EMINEM SERVICES WERE PROVIDED BY
14:48:04	4	F.B.T. TO AFTERMATH ENTERTAINMENT AS A RECORDING
14:48:04	5	ARTIST.
14:48:10	6	AND EXHIBIT 10 IS YEAH, IT'S
14:48:13	7	SOME KIND OF MODIFICATION OF THAT. I CAN'T
14:48:13	8	REMEMBER EXACTLY.
14:48:15	9	Q. OKAY. LET'S LOOK LET'S PAY
14:48:17	10	ATTENTION TO EXHIBIT 5, IF WE COULD, PLEASE.
14:48:18	11	A. YES.
14:48:20	12	Q. AND TURN TO THE SECTION ENTITLED
14:48:25	13	"MECHANICAL ROYALTIES." AND I BELIEVE IT IS
14:48:28	14	PARAGRAPH 6 ON PAGE 8.
14:48:29	15	MR. POMERANTZ: I THINK IT'S
14:48:30	16	PAGE 7.
14:48:33	17	MR. BUSCH: I HAVE 2003, EXCUSE
14:48:52	18	ME.
14:48:53	19	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:48:54	20	Q. ALL RIGHT. NOW THAT YOU HAVE IT IN
14:48:57	21	FRONT OF YOU, AND YOU HAVE THE SENTENCE THAT YOU
14:48:59	22	HAVE BEEN DESIGNATED AS AN EXPERT ON, DO YOU HAVE
14:49:01	23	AN OPINION WITH RESPECT TO THE SENTENCE THAT
14:49:03	24	SAYS THAT BEGINS WITH "MOREOVER" THAT I JUST
	25	READ INTO THE RECORD?

		Page 39
14:49:05	1	A. IT SAYS:
14:49:07	2	"MOREOVER, EVEN IF THE
14:49:08	3	MECHANICAL ROYALTIES PARAGRAPH
14:49:10	4	CONTAINED A DIRECT MECHANICAL
14:49:12	5	LICENSE FOR PHYSICAL PRODUCTS,
14:49:15	6	WHICH IT DOES NOT, IN NO WAY
14:49:16	7	CAN IT BE INTERPRETED TO APPLY
14:49:19	8	TO D.P.D.'S."
14:49:21	9	I DON'T KNOW WHY IT DOESN'T. IT'S
14:49:23	10	NOT A DIRECT MECHANICAL LICENSE, SO I DON'T AGREE
14:49:25	11	WITH THAT.
14:49:27	12	AND I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY THIS
14:49:32	13	PERSON DOESN'T THINK IT APPLIES TO D.P.D.'S, SO I
14:49:33	14	DON'T AGREE WITH THAT EITHER.
14:49:34	15	Q. OKAY. AND WHY DO YOU DISAGREE THAT
14:49:36	16	IT DOES NOT APPLY TO D.P.D.'S?
14:49:38	17	A. IT DOESN'T SAY IT DOESN'T APPLY TO
14:49:40	18	D.P.D.'S. IT SAYS:
14:49:42	19	"ALL CONTROLLED COMPOSITIONS
14:49:44	20	WILL BE LICENSED TO AFTERMATH."
14:49:44	21	Q. WELL, WHAT IT SAYS IS:
14:49:45	22	"ALL CONTROLLED COMPOSITIONS
14:49:48	23	WILL BE LICENSED TO AFTERMATH AND ITS
14:49:50	24	DISTRIBUTOR'S LICENSEES, AND AFTERMATH
	25	AND ITS DISTRIBUTOR'S LICENSEES,

		Page 40
14:49:56	1	CANADIAN LICENSEES FOR THE U.S. AND
14:49:57	2	CANADA RESPECTIVELY AT A RATE EQUAL
14:49:59	3	TO 75 PERCENT OF THE CONTROLLED RATE."
14:50:00	4	DO YOU SEE THAT?
14:50:00	5	A. YES.
14:50:04	6	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER REDUCED RATES
14:50:07	7	LIKE THAT PROVIDED FOR IN THE MECHANICAL ROYALTY
14:50:11	8	SECTION ARE ALLOWED BY LAW TO APPLY TO D.P.D.'S?
14:50:11	9	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
14:50:14	10	EXTENT IT REQUIRES A LEGAL CONCLUSION.
14:50:15	11	HE'S NOT HERE AS A LEGAL EXPERT.
14:50:15	12	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:50:19	13	Q. GO AHEAD. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER
14:50:23	14	DO YOU KNOW WHETHER BY LAW YOU CAN HAVE A REDUCED
14:50:25	15	RATE ON A D.P.D.?
14:50:26	16	MR. POMERANTZ: SAME SAME
14:50:27	17	OBJECTION.
14:50:28	18	THE DEPONENT: I THINK YOU CAN.
14:50:28	19	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:50:30	20	Q. AND WHERE AND WHAT IS YOUR BASIS
14:50:31	21	FOR SAYING THAT?
14:50:36	22	A. BECAUSE I THINK YOU CAN. I
14:50:37	23	DON'T I'M NOT I HAVEN'T READ THE COPYRIGHT
14:50:41	24	ACT ON THIS PARTICULAR ISSUE, BUT I DON'T SEE WHY
	25	YOU CAN'T.

		Page 41
14:50:42	1	Q. OKAY. WELL, IF YOU COULDN'T, WOULD
14:50:44	2	THAT AFFECT YOUR OPINION ABOUT WHETHER THIS
14:50:46	3	APPLIED TO D.P.D.'S OR NOT?
14:50:46	4	A. NO.
14:50:47	5	Q. WHY NOT?
14:50:53	6	A. IT STILL APPLIES TO D.P.D.'S. IT
14:50:55	7	MAY IT MAY PROVIDE A RATE THAT'S NOT THAT'S
14:50:58	8	NOT ENFORCEABLE, BUT IT STILL APPLIES TO D.P.D.'S.
14:51:00	9	I DON'T SEE WHY THAT WOULD CHANGE ANYTHING.
14:51:01	10	Q. HAVE YOU EVER HAVE YOU EVER READ
14:51:07	11	THE HISTORY OF THE COPYRIGHT ACT WITH RESPECT TO
14:51:10	12	D.P.D.'S TO DETERMINE WHAT THE LEGISLATIVE INTENT
14:51:14	13	WAS AS IT RELATED TO MECHANICAL ROYALTIES SECTIONS
14:51:18	14	LIKE THIS AND ITS APPLICATION OR NONAPPLICATION TO
14:51:22	15	DIGITAL DOWNLOADS?
14:51:23	16	MR. POMERANTZ: AND JUST SO WE'RE
14:51:29	17	CLEAR, WE ARE DESIGNATING HIM AS AN EXPERT ON HOW
14:51:31	18	PARTICIPANTS IN THE MUSIC INDUSTRY UNDERSTAND
14:51:34	19	WORDS IN A CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE, AT LEAST
14:51:35	20	THE WORDS THAT ARE AT ISSUE HERE.
14:51:38	21	WE ARE NOT DESIGNATING HIM AS AN
14:51:40	22	EXPERT ON THE COPYRIGHT LAWS.
14:51:41	23	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:51:45	24	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER RECORD LABELS,
	25	DESPITE HAVING LANGUAGE LIKE THIS IN A MECHANICAL
1		l l

		Page 42
14:51:53	1	ROYALTIES CLAUSE, STILL SEEK SEPARATE DIGITAL
14:51:57	2	DOWNLOAD LICENSES FROM PUBLISHERS?
14:51:58	3	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
14:52:01	4	EXTENT OF LACK OF FOUNDATION, ALSO AN INCOMPLETE
14:52:03	5	HYPOTHETICAL AND COMPOUND.
14:52:08	6	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:52:08	7	Q. GO AHEAD.
14:52:09	8	A. DO I KNOW PERSONALLY?
14:52:10	9	Q. YES.
14:52:10	10	A. NO.
14:52:13	11	Q. LET'S ASSUME FOR A SECOND THAT EVEN
14:52:15	12	IN LIGHT OF A CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE OR A
14:52:19	13	MECHANICAL ROYALTIES CLAUSE LIKE THIS, A RECORD
14:52:23	14	LABEL STILL, AS A MATTER OF CUSTOM AND PRACTICE,
14:52:28	15	SEEK SPECIFIC PERMANENT DOWNLOAD OR DIGITAL
14:52:32	16	DOWNLOAD LICENSES FROM PUBLISHERS, DO YOU HAVE AN
14:52:34	17	EXPLANATION WHERE THEY WOULD DO THAT IN LIGHT OF
14:52:34	18	THIS LANGUAGE?
14:52:35	19	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION. IT'S AN
14:52:37	20	INCOMPLETE HYPOTHETICAL. IT ASSUMES FACTS NOT IN
14:52:39	21	EVIDENCE. LACK OF FOUNDATION AND BEYOND THE SCOPE
14:52:41	22	OF HIS EXPERT DESIGNATION.
14:52:42	23	MR. BUSCH: SO YOU'RE NOT GOING TO
14:52:43	24	ALLOW HIM TO TESTIFY?
	25	MR. POMERANTZ: NO. HE CAN ANSWER

		Page 43
14:52:44	1	THE QUESTION.
14:52:48	2	THE DEPONENT: WELL, I MEAN, I KNOW
14:52:51	3	THAT RECORD LABELS GET SEPARATE MECHANICAL
14:52:54	4	LICENSES EVEN THOUGH THEY DON'T HAVE TO UNDER THE
14:52:55	5	CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE.
14:52:57	6	AND SO I SURMISE THE REASONS WOULD
14:53:00	7	BE PRETTY SIMILAR, THAT THEY WOULD WANT TO HAVE A
14:53:03	8	SEPARATE FILE FOR EACH SONG. IT'S A LOT EASIER TO
14:53:05	9	ADMINISTER FOR THE LABELS. BUT I DON'T WORK THE
14:53:06	10	LABELS, SO I DON'T REALLY KNOW WHY THEY DO IT.
14:53:07	11	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:53:08	12	Q. IS IT POSSIBLE THAT THEY DO IT
14:53:11	13	BECAUSE SEEK OUT SPECIFIC PERMANENT DOWNLOAD
14:53:14	14	LICENSES BECAUSE IT'S UNCLEAR WHETHER A CLAUSE
14:53:17	15	LIKE THIS WOULD APPLY TO PERMANENT DOWNLOADS? IS
14:53:18	16	IT POSSIBLE THAT'S ONE REASON?
14:53:20	17	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION; CALLS
14:53:22	18	FOR SPECULATION. IT'S AN INCOMPLETE HYPOTHETICAL.
14:53:23	19	LACK OF FOUNDATION.
14:53:24	20	THE DEPONENT: DO YOU WANT ME TO
14:53:25	21	COMPLETELY SPECULATE?
14:53:26	22	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:53:27	23	Q. YEAH.
14:53:28	24	MR. POMERANTZ: DON'T SPECULATE.
	25	IF IT WOULD CALL FOR SPECULATION

		Page 44
14:53:31	1	MR. BUSCH: HE'S AN EXPERT.
14:53:33	2	MR. POMERANTZ: HE'S SAYING HE'S
14:53:34	3	SPECULATING AND HE CAN'T ANSWER.
14:53:36	4	THE DEPONENT: YOU'RE ASKING ME IF
14:53:37	5	IT'S POSSIBLE. IT'S POSSIBLE.
14:53:38	6	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:53:44	7	Q. OKAY. WHAT ARE CAPS IN A
14:53:46	8	MECHANICAL ROYALTY CLAUSE?
14:53:48	9	A. THEY'RE A LIMITATION ON THE AMOUNT
14:53:54	10	OF ROYALTIES THAT THE LABEL WILL PAY FOR THE RIGHT
14:54:01	11	TO MECHANICALLY REPRODUCE A COMPOSITION, THE
14:54:05	12	STATUTE PROVIDES FOR A RATE AT A CERTAIN LEVEL,
14:54:10	13	BUT THE RECORD COMPANY WILL TRY TO LIMIT THE TOTAL
14:54:14	14	AMOUNT OF MECHANICAL ROYALTIES THEY HAVE TO PAVE.
14:54:17	15	SO IF THERE IS 20 SONGS AND IT'S 9
14:54:20	16	CENTS A SONG, A LABEL ECONOMICALLY COULDN'T PAY
14:54:21	17	THAT KIND OF MONEY AND STAY IN BUSINESS, WHICH
14:54:25	18	WOULD BE A DOLLAR 80, SO THEY LIMIT THE AMOUNT OF
14:54:28	19	SONGS ON WHICH THEY WILL PAY MECHANICAL ROYALTIES.
14:54:30	20	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER CAPS ARE
14:54:33	21	APPLICABLE TO PERMANENT DOWNLOAD?
14:54:34	22	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
14:54:34	23	EXTENT IT CALLS FOR LEGAL CONCLUSION.
14:54:35	24	THE DEPONENT: I KNOW THAT THE
	25	LANGUAGE OF THE AGREEMENTS, MOST OF THE AGREEMENTS
		l l

		Page 45
14:54:37	1	THAT I READ APPLIES CAPS TO DIGITAL DOWNLOADS.
14:54:40	2	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:54:41	3	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER THERE IS ANY
14:54:44	4	RESTRICTION IN THE COPYRIGHT ACT FOR APPLICATION
14:54:47	5	OF CAPS FOR PERMANENT DOWNLOADS?
14:54:48	6	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION. AGAIN,
14:54:52	7	HE'S NOT AN EXPERT ON COPYRIGHT LAW AND WE'RE NOT
14:54:52	8	DESIGNATING HIM AS THAT, AND IT'S BEYOND THE SCOPE
14:54:54	9	OF HIS TESTIMONY. ALSO A LACK OF FOUNDATION AND
14:54:58	10	IT CALLS FOR A LEGAL CONCLUSION.
14:55:01	11	THE DEPONENT: OKAY. I HAVE READ
14:55:03	12	THINGS THAT SAY THAT. I HAVEN'T READ THE
14:55:04	13	COPYRIGHT ACT.
14:55:04	14	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:55:06	15	Q. YOU'VE READ THINGS THAT HAVE SAID
14:55:06	16	WHAT?
14:55:07	17	A. I READ YOUR EXPERT OPINION, YOUR
14:55:09	18	EXPERT'S OPINION, AND HE SAYS THAT THE COPYRIGHT
14:55:12	19	ACT PROVIDES THAT. I'M NOT SURE I AGREE WITH
14:55:16	20	THAT. BUT I HAVEN'T READ THE COPYRIGHT ACT.
14:55:18	21	Q. LET'S JUST SAY, FOR EXAMPLE, THAT
14:55:21	22	THIS MECHANICAL ROYALTY SECTION DOES HAVE A
14:55:24	23	RESTRICTION ON CAPS; RIGHT? IT SAYS "CAP
14:55:25	24	RESTRICTION"?
	25	A. IT HAS A CAP.

		1
		Page 46
14:55:28	1	Q. IT HAS A CAP.
14:55:28	2	A. YES.
14:55:31	3	Q. ASSUMING THAT CAPS ARE NOT
14:55:35	4	ALLOWABLE UNDER THE COPYRIGHT ACT FOR DIGITAL
14:55:38	5	DOWNLOADS, WOULD THAT IMPACT YOUR OPINION ABOUT
14:55:41	6	WHETHER THIS PROVISION IS APPLICABLE TO PERMANENT
14:55:42	7	DOWNLOADS OR NOT?
14:55:42	8	A. NO.
14:55:43	9	Q. WHY NOT?
14:55:47	10	A. I THINK JUST I DON'T KNOW WHY IT
14:55:52	11	WOULD. I MEAN, I THINK ANY PRACTITIONER.
14:55:53	12	I'M TELLING YOU IF THERE IS SOME
14:55:57	13	YOU'RE SAYING IF THERE IS A PROVISION IN THE
14:56:00	14	COPYRIGHT ACT THAT WOULD LIMIT IT, I DON'T KNOW
14:56:02	15	IT WOULD SEEM TO ME THE PROPER RESPONSE WOULD BE
14:56:05	16	THEN, OKAY, THE LICENSE IS AT THE FULL RATE RATHER
14:56:09	17	THAN AT A REDUCED RIGHT. THAT'S NOT SURPRISING.
14:56:24	18	Q. OKAY. WERE PERMANENT DOWNLOADS IN
14:56:28	19	GENERAL DISTRIBUTION AT THE TIME OF THIS
14:56:31	20	AGREEMENT, MARCH 9TH, 1998?
14:56:31	21	A. NO.
14:56:32	22	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION; VAGUE.
14:56:32	23	GO AHEAD.
14:56:34	24	THE DEPONENT: NO, THEY WEREN'T.
	25	///

		Page 47
14:56:35	1	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:56:39	2	Q. WERE PERMANENT DOWNLOADS
14:56:42	3	CONTEMPLATED TO BE IN THE MECHANICAL ROYALTIES
14:56:43	4	SECTION IN 1998?
14:56:46	5	A. IN THE MECHANICAL ROYALTIES SECTION
14:56:47	6	OF THE CONTRACT? YES.
14:56:49	7	Q. ON WHAT BASIS DO YOU SAY THAT?
14:56:51	8	A. BECAUSE I KNOW THAT PEOPLE COULD
14:56:54	9	SEE THINGS LIKE THAT COMING, AND EVERY CONTRACT
14:56:59	10	STARTING IN THE LATE 80'S, EARLY 90'S WOULD TRY TO
14:57:02	11	ENCOMPASS THINGS LIKE DIGITAL DOWNLOADS, SATELLITE
14:57:05	12	TRANSMISSIONS, TRANSMISSIONS OVER CABLE.
14:57:08	13	THE IDEA WAS TO PROVIDE THE CAP ON
14:57:11	14	ANY KIND OF DISTRIBUTION OF A RECORDING.
14:57:13	15	Q. CAN YOU SHOW ME WHERE IN THE
14:57:15	16	MECHANICAL ROYALTY SECTION IT SAYS THAT?
14:57:23	17	A. WELL, IT SAYS THAT ALL CONTROLLED
14:57:26	18	COMPOSITIONS WILL BE LICENSED AT A RATE EQUAL TO
14:57:29	19	75 PERCENT. SO I DON'T IS THERE SOMETHING
14:57:30	20	UNCLEAR ABOUT THAT?
14:57:33	21	Q. SO WAS THE ANSWER THAT IT NOWHERE
14:57:36	22	SAYS THAT, BUT YOU'RE READING THAT INTO IT BY THE
14:57:37	23	LANGUAGE YOU JUST READ?
14:57:37	24	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION;
	25	MISSTATES HIS TESTIMONY AND IS ARGUMENTATIVE.

		Page 48
14:57:40	1	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:57:41	2	Q. IS THERE ANY DEFINITION UNDER
14:57:46	3	MECHANICAL ROYALTIES, ANY MENTION OR REFERENCE TO
14:57:49	4	A DEFINED TERM UNDER MECHANICAL ROYALTIES THAT
14:57:52	5	WOULD SHOW THAT IT WAS MEANT TO BE APPLICABLE TO
14:57:54	6	PERMANENT DOWNLOADS?
14:57:54	7	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
14:57:56	8	EXTENT IT'S ALREADY BEEN ASKED AND ANSWERED.
14:57:59	9	THE DEPONENT: TWO ANSWERS. FIRST
14:58:01	10	OF ALL, IT DOESN'T SAY IT'S NOT. AND SECOND OF
14:58:04	11	ALL, EVERY PRACTITIONER IN THE MUSIC INDUSTRY
14:58:05	12	KNOWS THAT IT IS.
14:58:05	13	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:58:06	14	Q. YOU SAY "EVERY." HAVE YOU SPOKEN
14:58:08	15	TO EVERY PRACTITIONER IN THE MUSIC INDUSTRY ABOUT
14:58:09	16	IT?
14:58:10	17	A. NO, I HAVEN'T.
14:58:12	18	Q. HAVE YOU SPOKEN TO ANY PRACTITIONER
14:58:15	19	IN THE MUSIC BUSINESS ABOUT WHETHER THIS SPECIFIC
14:58:18	20	PROVISION, AS IT'S WORDED HERE, APPLIES TO
14:58:19	21	PERMANENT DOWNLOADS?
14:58:19	22	A. NO.
14:58:26	23	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER UNIVERSAL
14:58:29	24	INTERSCOPE SOUGHT SPECIFIC PERMANENT DOWNLOAD
	25	LICENSES FROM THE PUBLISHER OF THE COMPOSITIONS

		,
		Page 49
14:58:36	1	INVOLVED IN THIS IN THE SONGS INVOLVED IN THIS
14:58:36	2	AGREEMENT?
14:58:37	3	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION; LACK OF
14:58:39	4	FOUNDATION.
14:58:42	5	THE DEPONENT: I DON'T KNOW. AS A
14:58:46	6	PERCIPIENT WITNESS, I READ IN SOME OF THE STUFF I
14:58:51	7	READ, IT REFERS TO THE FACT THAT UNIVERSAL DID. I
14:58:53	8	HAVE NO WAY OF KNOWING WHETHER THAT'S TRUE OR NOT.
14:58:54	9	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:58:56	10	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER UNIVERSAL
14:58:59	11	ENTERED INTO A DIGITAL DOWNLOAD LICENSE WHERE IT
14:59:03	12	AGREED TO A SPECIFIC TERM OF TWO YEARS AND OTHER
14:59:08	13	LIMITATIONS ON ITS IN CONNECTION WITH LICENSING
14:59:10	14	ONE OF THE COMPOSITIONS FOR PERMANENT DOWNLOAD?
14:59:11	15	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
14:59:14	16	EXTENT IT MISSTATES EVIDENCE.
14:59:14	17	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:59:15	18	Q. GO AHEAD.
14:59:17	19	A. THE ANSWER IS NO.
14:59:20	20	Q. OKAY. IF UNIVERSAL AGREED TO A
14:59:24	21	PERMANENT DOWNLOAD LICENSE WITH THE PUBLISHER OF A
14:59:25	22	SONG THAT WOULD BE COVERED BY THIS AGREEMENT AND
14:59:27	23	AGREED TO A TWO-YEAR TERM, FOR EXAMPLE, DO YOU
14:59:29	24	HAVE ANY EXPLANATION OF WHY THEY WOULD DO SO IF
	25	THIS WAS IN FACT A SELF-EFFECTUATING CONTROLLED

		Page 50
14:59:37	1	COMPOSITION CLAUSE APPLICABLE TO D.P.D.'S?
14:59:38	2	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION; LACK OF
14:59:41	3	FOUNDATION, ARGUMENTATIVE, INCOMPLETE.
14:59:41	4	BY MR. BUSCH:
14:59:42	5	Q. GO AHEAD.
14:59:45	6	A. IT COULD BE ANY NUMBER OF REASONS.
14:59:47	7	I DON'T PEOPLE MAKE DEALS ALL THE TIME. THEY
14:59:49	8	MIGHT HAVE WANTED MIGHT HAVE WANTED EMINEM TO
14:59:51	9	DELIVER A RECORD HE WOULDN'T OTHERWISE DELIVER.
14:59:53	10	I HAVE NO IDEA. THERE IS NO WAY I
14:59:54	11	WOULD KNOW.
15:00:01	12	Q. OKAY. YOU SAY YOU DISAGREE THAT
15:00:03	13	THIS IS NOT I THINK ONE OF THE STATEMENTS YOU
15:00:06	14	MADE WHEN I READ THE SENTENCE AND ASKED YOU ABOUT
15:00:09	15	YOUR OPINIONS IN RESPONSE TO IT WAS THAT YOU
15:00:16	16	DISAGREED THAT THIS WAS NOT A SELF-EFFECTUATING
15:00:17	17	CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE; CORRECT?
15:00:18	18	MR. POMERANTZ: CAN YOU RESTATE
15:00:19	19	THAT QUESTION? I DIDN'T FOLLOW IT.
15:00:19	20	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:00:21	21	Q. OKAY. DO YOU BELIEVE THIS TO BE A
15:00:23	22	SELF-EFFECTUATING LICENSE?
15:00:24	23	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
15:00:26	24	TERM "SELF-EFFECTUATING." IT'S VAGUE AND
	25	AMBIGUOUS.

		Page 51
15:00:27	1	THE DEPONENT: YEAH, I AGREE WITH
15:00:29	2	THAT. I AGREE THAT IT'S VAGUE AND AMBIGUOUS.
15:00:31	3	BUT I KNOW WHAT YOU'RE GETTING AT,
15:00:33	4	AND WHAT YOU'RE GETTING AT IS YOU'RE ASKING
15:00:37	5	WHETHER OR NOT THIS OPERATES AS A MECHANICAL
15:00:38	6	LICENSE.
15:00:38	7	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:00:39	8	Q. FAIR ENOUGH.
15:00:39	9	A. I BELIEVE IT DOES.
15:00:41	10	Q. CAN YOU TELL ME WHY YOU BELIEVE IT
15:00:41	11	DOES?
15:00:45	12	A. I BELIEVE IT DOES BECAUSE I'VE BEEN
15:00:48	13	PRACTICING IN THIS AREA FOR A LONG TIME WITH A LOT
15:00:53	14	OF DIFFERENT ATTORNEYS, AND CONTROLLED COMPOSITION
15:00:57	15	CLAUSES ARE ALL THAT WAY.
15:01:03	16	THEY'RE ALL THE INTENT OF THIS
15:01:06	17	THING IS TO PROVIDE A LICENSE AT WHATEVER RATE
15:01:09	18	THAT'S SET FORTH IN THE CONTROLLED COMPOSITION,
15:01:14	19	AND THE CUSTOM AND PRACTICE OF PEOPLE THAT WORK IN
15:01:16	20	THIS INDUSTRY KNOW THAT THAT'S WHAT THIS IS
15:01:17	21	SUPPOSED TO BE.
15:01:18	22	Q. WHO HAVE YOU SPOKEN TO ABOUT THAT?
15:01:19	23	A. NOBODY.
15:01:26	24	Q. HAVE YOU EVER SPOKEN TO ANYBODY
	25	ABOUT THE USE OF THE PHRASE "ALL CONTROLLED

		,
		Page 52
15:01:34	1	COMPOSITIONS WILL BE LICENSED" AS OPPOSED TO "IS
15:01:37	2	HEREBY LICENSED" AND THE IMPACT THAT HAS ON
15:01:41	3	WHETHER IT'S A WHETHER IT, IN AND OF ITSELF, IS
15:01:42	4	A MECHANICAL LICENSE?
15:01:46	5	A. HAVE I SPOKEN TO ANY WHEN YOU
15:01:47	6	SAY "ANYBODY," WHAT DO YOU MEAN?
15:01:49	7	Q. WHAT I'M ASKING IS: HAVE YOU EVER
15:01:51	8	HAD ANY DISCUSSION WITH PEOPLE IN THE MUSIC
15:01:54	9	BUSINESS OR MUSIC INDUSTRY ABOUT WHAT EFFECT, IF
15:01:59	10	ANY, THERE IS WHEN A MECHANICAL ROYALTY SAYS THAT
15:02:02	11	ALL CONTROLLED COMPOSITIONS WILL BE LICENSED AS
15:02:04	12	OPPOSED TO IS HEREBY LICENSED?
15:02:06	13	A. I WAS GOING TO SAY NO, BUT NOW I
15:02:11	14	RECALL THAT AFTER MY LAST AND I KNOW YOU'RE
15:02:14	15	GOING TO ASK ME WHO THEY ARE, AND I HAVE NO IDEA.
15:02:15	16	SO I'LL SAVE YOU THE TROUBLE ASKING.
15:02:17	17	BUT I WAS HAVING CONVERSATIONS WITH
15:02:20	18	SEVERAL MUSIC ATTORNEYS ABOUT HOW ABSURD THE
15:02:21	19	POSITION WAS THAT THERE WAS ANY DIFFERENCE BETWEEN
15:02:24	20	THE TWO THE TWO LANGUAGE POINTS. NO IDEA WHO
15:02:24	21	IT WAS.
15:02:45	22	Q. OKAY. WHERE IT SAYS THAT ALL
15:02:47	23	CONTROLLED COMPOSITIONS WILL BE LICENSED TO
15:02:49	24	AFTERMATH AND ITS DISTRIBUTOR'S LICENSEES.
	25	DO YOU SEE THAT?

		Page 53
15:02:50	1	A. YES.
15:02:53	2	Q. ARE DISTRIBUTOR'S LICENSEES
15:02:53	3	AFFILIATED OR UNAFFILIATED DISTRIBUTORS OR
15:02:57	4	LICENSEES?
15:02:57	5	MR. POMERANTZ: I'M GOING TO
15:02:59	6	INSTRUCT HIM NOT TO ANSWER.
15:02:59	7	YOU HAVE A SEPARATE PROVISION, A
15:03:00	8	SEPARATE PORTION OF YOUR REPORT THAT ADDRESSES
15:03:04	9	THAT ISSUE, AND WE HAVE CHOSEN NOT TO DESIGNATE
15:03:07	10	MR. PATERNO AS AN EXPERT TO REBUT THAT POINT, SO I
15:03:08	11	WILL INSTRUCT HIM NOT TO ANSWER.
15:03:10	12	AND BY THE WAY, YOU DID ASK HIM
15:03:13	13	THAT QUESTION AS A FACT WITNESS, SO YOU ALREADY
15:03:15	14	HAVE THAT IN THE DEPOSITION.
15:03:17	15	MR. BUSCH: I REMEMBER ASKING A
15:03:20	16	COUPLE PEOPLE, BUT I WASN'T SURE IF I ASKED
15:03:20	17	MR. PATERNO.
15:03:27	18	MR. POMERANTZ: YOU DID.
15:03:28	19	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: OFF THE RECORD
15:10:28	20	AT 3:03 P.M.
15:10:30	21	(WHEREUPON, A RECESS WAS HELD
15:10:30	22	FROM 3:03 P.M. TO 3:10 P.M.)
15:10:31	23	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: BACK ON THE
15:10:32	24	RECORD AT 3:10 P.M.
	25	///

		Page 54
15:10:33	1	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:10:36	2	Q. MR. PATERNO, I DIDN'T ASK YOU THIS,
15:10:38	3	BUT ARE YOU BEING COMPENSATED BY YOUR TIME AS AN
15:10:39	4	EXPERT WITNESS?
15:10:39	5	A. YES.
15:10:40	6	Q. AT WHAT RATE?
15:10:42	7	A. 600 DOLLARS AN HOUR.
15:10:44	8	Q. WHAT HAVE YOU CHARGED THE
15:10:46	9	DEFENDANTS SO FAR?
15:10:48	10	A. WHAT HAVE I CHARGED?
15:10:49	11	Q. YEAH. HAVE YOU CHARGED ANYTHING
15:10:51	12	FOR YOUR STUDY OR FOR ANYTHING THAT YOU'VE DONE UP
15:10:51	13	UNTIL TODAY?
15:10:54	14	A. I WROTE IT ON MY TIME SHEET. I
15:10:56	15	DON'T REALLY KNOW. I WOULD SEND A BILL.
15:10:59	16	Q. DO YOU RECALL HOW MANY HOURS YOU'VE
15:11:00	17	SPENT UP UNTIL NOW?
15:11:02	18	A. PROBABLY FIVE OR SIX. SOMETHING
15:11:06	19	LIKE THAT. I DON'T KNOW.
15:11:08	20	MR. BUSCH: WE FORGOT TO DON'T
15:11:13	21	WALK OUT OF HERE BEFORE I MARK THOSE LETTERS AS AN
15:11:16	22	EXHIBIT. I FORGOT TO DO IT AT THE BREAK.
15:11:17	23	MR. POMERANTZ: SHE WASN'T THERE.
15:11:20	24	MR. BUSCH: TRUE. I COULD HAVE HAD
	25	THEM READY TO GO, THOUGH.

		Page 55
15:11:23	1	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:11:25	2	Q. WOULD IT BE FAIR TO SAY THAT THE
15:11:27	3	PURPOSE OF A OF A MECHANICAL ROYALTY CLAUSE
15:11:30	4	LIKE THE ONE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IS REALLY TO GET
15:11:33	5	THE REDUCED RATE FOR THE RECORD LABEL?
15:11:34	6	MR. POMERANTZ: AS THE ONLY PURPOSE
15:11:35	7	OR A PURPOSE?
15:11:37	8	MR. BUSCH: PRIMARY PURPOSE.
15:11:38	9	THE DEPONENT: NO, I DON'T THINK
15:11:42	10	SO. THERE WERE MECHANICAL ROYALTY CLAUSES BEFORE
15:11:47	11	PEOPLE SOUGHT REDUCED RATES. REDUCED RATES ARE
15:11:50	12	NOT THEY'VE ONLY WHEN I STARTED PRACTICING
15:11:54	13	LAW, THERE WEREN'T REDUCED RATES. THERE WERE
15:11:55	14	CAPS, BUT THERE WEREN'T REDUCED RATES.
15:11:55	15	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:11:59	16	Q. IS A CAP THE PRIMARY REASON FOR
15:12:01	17	HAVING A MECHANICAL ROYALTIES CLAUSE?
15:12:02	18	A. I DON'T THINK SO. I THINK THE
15:12:05	19	LABELS WANT TO KNOW THAT THEY CAN LICENSE THE
15:12:06	20	COMPOSITIONS, AND THAT'S THE PRIMARY REASON FOR
15:12:06	21	HAVING IT.
15:12:08	22	Q. HOW MANY CONTROLLED COMPOSITION
15:12:09	23	CLAUSES HAVE YOU YOURSELF DRAFTED?
15:12:13	24	A. WELL, I DON'T KNOW WHAT YOU MEAN BY
	25	"DRAFTED." THEY'RE GENERALLY IN A FORM, AND I
1		I

		Page 56
15:12:19	1	YOU KNOW, THE FORM COMES OFF THE SHELF.
15:12:21	2	HAVE I ACTUALLY WRITTEN? THEY'RE
15:12:23	3	ALL PRETTY SIMILAR. I'VE PROBABLY PERSONALLY
15:12:25	4	WRITTEN, YOU KNOW, FOUR OR FIVE OR SOMETHING LIKE
15:12:27	5	THAT OVER THE YEARS.
15:12:30	6	Q. OKAY. YOU HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING OF
15:12:33	7	WHAT A PUBLISHER IS IN THE MUSIC INDUSTRY;
15:12:34	8	CORRECT?
15:12:34	9	A. YES.
15:12:36	10	Q. AND HAVE YOU EVER REPRESENTED A
15:12:36	11	PUBLISHER?
15:12:37	12	A. YES.
15:12:38	13	Q. IN WHAT CONTEXT?
15:12:42	14	A. WELL, A LOT OF MY CLIENTS
15:12:46	15	SELF-PUBLISH, SO WE REPRESENT THEIR PUBLISHING
15:12:49	16	INTERESTS AND THEIR CATALOGUES. I REPRESENTED
15:12:53	17	PUBLISHERS IN SALES, ACQUISITIONS, ACQUIRING
15:12:57	18	TALENT, WRITERS, AND PRETTY MUCH EVERYTHING THE
15:12:58	19	PUBLISHERS DO.
15:13:00	20	Q. IN YOUR EXPERIENCE, DO ARTISTS
15:13:03	21	FREQUENTLY ASSIGN THEIR PUBLISHING RIGHTS TO A
15:13:05	22	SEPARATE ENTITY, A PUBLISHER?
15:13:07	23	A. A SEPARATE THIRD-PARTY ENTITY?
15:13:08	24	Q. YES.
	25	A. IN MY EXPERIENCE, NO, BECAUSE MY

		7
		Page 57
15:13:14	1	CLIENTS GENERALLY DON'T DO IT. IN GENERAL, I
15:13:16	2	DON'T KNOW WHAT THE PERCENTAGE IS. I'M GUESSING
15:13:17	3	IT'S PROBABLY ABOUT MORE THAN HALF THE TIME THEY
15:13:17	4	DO.
15:13:21	5	Q. OKAY. DO ARTISTS HAVE GENERALLY
15:13:26	6	WHEN THEY ENTER INTO CO-PUBLISHING AGREEMENTS WITH
15:13:28	7	RECORD LABELS OR WITH THIRD PARTIES, DO THEY MAKE
15:13:32	8	SUCH ASSIGNMENTS ON AN AD HOC BASIS OR DO THEY
15:13:32	9	HAVE A STANDING AGREEMENT WITH THE PUBLISHERS THAT
15:13:32	10	ALL THEIR PUBLISHING RIGHTS ARE AUTOMATICALLY
15:13:32	11	ASSIGNED TO THE PUBLISHER?
15:13:32	12	MR. POMERANTZ: I'M SORRY. I
15:13:32	13	DIDN'T FOLLOW THE QUESTION. CAN YOU EITHER
15:13:38	14	RESTATE IT OR READ IT BACK?
15:13:38	15	MR. BUSCH: I'LL RESTATE IT.
15:13:39	16	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:13:42	17	Q. WHERE AN ARTIST/SONGWRITER ASSIGNS
15:13:45	18	RIGHTS TO A PUBLISHER, LIKE A UNIVERSAL MUSIC
15:13:48	19	PUBLISHING, FOR EXAMPLE, IS IT GENERALLY DONE ON
15:13:51	20	AN AD HOC BASIS PER SONG OR IS THERE GENERALLY AN
15:13:53	21	AGREEMENT WHERE ALL SONGS WRITTEN DURING A TERM
15:13:55	22	ARE ASSIGNED TO A PUBLISHER?
15:13:56	23	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION; LACK OF
15:13:57	24	FOUNDATION, INCOMPLETE HYPOTHETICAL.
	25	THE DEPONENT: GENERALLY, IT'S THE

		Page 58
15:14:01	1	LATTER. GENERALLY.
15:14:01	2	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:14:04	3	Q. IF AN ARTIST HAS ASSIGNED HIS
15:14:04	4	RIGHTS IN A COMPOSITION TO A PUBLISHER, CAN THE
15:14:04	5	ARTIST, WITHOUT THE EXPRESSED PERMISSION OF THE
15:14:10	6	PUBLISHER, GRANT A MECHANICAL LICENSE FOR THE
15:14:11	7	COMPOSITION TO A THIRD PARTY?
15:14:12	8	MR. POMERANTZ: I'M GOING TO OBJECT
15:14:16	9	AND INSTRUCT THE WITNESS NOT TO ANSWER. THIS IS
15:14:18	10	IN A PORTION OF THE REPORT THAT WE HAVE CHOSEN NOT
15:14:23	11	TO DESIGNATE HIM TO REBUT AS AN EXPERT WITNESS, SO
15:14:23	12	I'M GOING TO INSTRUCT HIM NOT TO ANSWER.
15:14:25	13	MR. BUSCH: AND I'LL OBJECT AND
15:14:27	14	MOVE TO STRIKE HIS EXPERT TESTIMONY.
15:14:32	15	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:14:34	16	Q. IF AN ARTIST HAS AN AGREEMENT THAT
15:14:37	17	HIS INTEREST IN COMPOSITIONS HE AUTHORS IS
15:14:39	18	AUTOMATICALLY GRANTED TO A PUBLISHER, CAN THE
15:14:42	19	ARTIST, AFTER ENTERING INTO THAT AGREEMENT, ENTER
15:14:44	20	INTO A SUBSEQUENT AGREEMENT CONTAINING A
15:14:46	21	CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE THAT GRANTS
15:14:49	22	MECHANICAL LICENSES TO THOSE COMPOSITIONS?
15:14:50	23	MR. POMERANTZ: SAME INSTRUCTION.
15:14:51	24	MR. BUSCH: AND SAME OBJECTION.
	25	///

		Page 59
15:14:52	1	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:14:55	2	Q. YOU SAID, MR. PATERNO, YOU HAVE NOT
15:14:58	3	READ THE DIGITAL PERFORMANCE RIGHT AND SOUND
15:14:59	4	RECORDING ACT OF 1995?
15:15:05	5	A. I DON'T KNOW THAT THAT'S TRUE. I
15:15:06	6	PROBABLY HAVE READ IT.
15:15:09	7	Q. YOU HAVEN'T READ THE LEGISLATIVE
15:15:09	8	HISTORY?
15:15:10	9	A. I HAVEN'T READ THAT.
15:15:11	10	Q. HAVE YOU READ IT HAVE YOU READ
15:15:14	11	IT IN THE CONTEXT OF THE ISSUES INVOLVED IN THIS
15:15:14	12	CASE?
15:15:43	13	A. NO.
15:15:43	14	MR. BUSCH: OKAY. I'M GOING TO
15:15:49	15	SHOW HIM THAT LEGISLATURE HISTORY. WILL YOU ALLOW
15:15:51	16	ME TO ASK HIM QUESTION ABOUT THAT? YOU KNOW WHICH
15:15:51	17	ONE I'M GOING TO ASK HIM ABOUT, I WOULD ASSUME,
15:15:53	18	SINCE IT'S THE ONE THAT HAS COME UP IN THE
15:15:53	19	DEPOSITION.
15:15:55	20	MR. POMERANTZ: I'M NOT I MEAN,
15:15:58	21	I'M NOT I THINK PROBABLY NOT. BUT IF YOU WANT
15:16:01	22	TO TRY IT, I'LL LOOK AT IT AND SEE IF IT RELATES
15:16:02	23	TO HIS THREE OPINIONS.
15:16:02	24	BY MR. BUSCH:
	25	Q. TAKE A LOOK AT WHAT I MARKED AS
Ī		

15.16.00	_	Page 60
15:16:08	1	EXHIBIT 249, WHICH IS THE LEGISLATIVE HISTORY OF
15:16:08	2	THE ACT.
15:16:12	3	(DOCUMENT REVIEWED BY DEPONENT.)
15:16:16	4	THE DEPONENT: WOW.
15:16:17	5	MR. BUSCH: I DON'T WANT HIM TO SIT
15:16:17	6	HERE AND READ THE WHOLE THING.
15:16:18	7	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:16:31	8	Q. TURN, IF YOU WOULD, TO PAGE 41.
15:16:35	9	TOP MIDDLE 41, NOT 41 OF.
15:16:36	10	A. UH-HUH.
15:16:45	11	Q. AND I WANT TO DIRECT YOUR ATTENTION
15:16:51	12	TO THE LANGUAGE AT THE VERY BOTTOM WHERE IT SAYS,
15:16:53	13	BEGINS WITH, "SUBJECT TO THE EXCEPTIONS."
15:16:55	14	"SUBJECT TO THE EXCEPTIONS SET FORTH
15:16:58	15	IN SUBPARAGRAPH (E)(II)
15:16:59	16	A. WHERE ARE YOU AT?
15:17:01	17	Q. LAST SENTENCE OF PAGE 41.
15:17:01	18	A. OKAY.
15:17:03	19	Q. "SUBJECT TO THE EXCEPTION
15:17:05	20	SET FORTH IN PARAGRAPH (E)(II,)
15:17:07	21	THE SECOND SENTENCE OF SUBPARAGRAPH
15:17:09	22	(E)(I) IS INTENDED TO MAKE THESE
15:17:12	23	CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSES
15:17:15	24	INAPPLICABLE TO DIGITAL FORMER
	25	RECORD DELIVERIES."

		Page 61
15:17:17	1	DO YOU SEE THAT?
15:17:17	2	A. YES.
15:17:19	3	Q. DID YOU EVER STUDY THAT OR LOOKED
15:17:21	4	AT THAT IN CONNECTION WITH THIS LAWSUIT TO SEE
15:17:25	5	WHETHER THIS LANGUAGE WOULD MAKE CONTROLLED
15:17:27	6	COMPOSITION CLAUSES INAPPLICABLE TO D.P.D.'S BY
15:17:30	7	VIRTUE OF THE OF THE ACT?
15:17:30	8	A. NO.
15:17:44	9	Q. AND HAVE YOU EVER READ THE
15:17:46	10	PARAGRAPH THAT FOLLOWS ON PAGE 42?
15:17:46	11	A. NO.
15:17:49	12	Q. OKAY. DO YOU KNOW WHAT IMPACT THIS
15:17:53	13	HAS ON WHETHER DIGITAL DOWNLOADS ARE ARE
15:17:55	14	APPLICABLE TO CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSES?
15:17:56	15	MR. POMERANTZ: INSTRUCTION NOT TO
15:17:59	16	ANSWER. GOES BEYOND WHAT WE'RE DESIGNATING HIM
15:18:21	17	ABOUT.
15:18:22	18	MR. BUSCH: I HAVE A SECTION HERE
15:18:28	19	IN MY EXAMINATION THAT DEALS WITH THE QUESTIONS
15:18:36	20	REGARDING THE REQUIREMENT TO GET LICENSES WHEN A
15:18:39	21	MASTER RECORDING IS LICENSED TO A THIRD PARTY
15:18:43	22	COMPILATION AND HOW THAT IMPACTS WOULDN'T THE
15:18:47	23	SAME ANALYSIS APPLY WITH RESPECT TO DIGITAL
15:18:48	24	DOWNLOAD PROVIDERS.
	25	AND I ASSUME THAT YOU'RE NOT GOING

		Page 62
15:18:51	1	TO LET ME ASK THOSE QUESTIONS?
15:18:52	2	MR. POMERANTZ: CORRECT. WE'RE NOT
15:18:55	3	DESIGNATING HIM AS AN EXPERT WITNESS ON THAT
15:18:55	4	SUBJECT MATTER.
15:18:56	5	MR. BUSCH: SO ANY QUESTIONS THAT I
15:18:58	6	WOULD HAVE THAT RELATED TO AFFILIATED OR
15:19:01	7	UNAFFILIATED LICENSEES AND ANY COMPARISON BETWEEN
15:19:07	8	AN ITUNES TO A, FOR EXAMPLE, THIRD-PARTY LICENSEE
15:19:11	9	OF A MASTER RECORDING FOR PURPOSES OF RELEASING
15:19:14	10	COMPILATION ALBUMS, HE'S NOT BEING DESIGNATED AND
15:19:15	11	YOU WOULD INSTRUCT HIM NOT TO ANSWER?
15:19:17	12	MR. POMERANTZ: CORRECT.
15:19:22	13	MR. BUSCH: OKAY.
15:19:22	14	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:19:24	15	Q. HAVE YOU EVER REPRESENTED A MUSIC
15:19:27	16	PUBLISHER IN THE NEGOTIATION OF A LICENSE WITH A
15:19:30	17	COMPANY RELEASING A COMPILATION ALBUM?
15:19:36	18	A. WELL, I REPRESENT THE PUBLISHING
15:19:42	19	COMPANY AFFILIATES OF A NUMBER OF ARTISTS,
15:19:47	20	"OFFSPRING," "METALLICA," THEY OWN THEIR OWN
15:19:51	21	PUBLISHING. SO OUR FIRM DEFINITELY HAS DONE THAT.
15:19:53	22	AND I PROBABLY HAVE, TOO, BUT NOT RECENTLY.
15:19:55	23	Q. OKAY. AND DO YOU KNOW WHETHER
15:19:58	24	THOSE ARTISTS WERE SUBJECT TO A CONTROLLED
	25	COMPOSITION CLAUSE WITH ANOTHER RECORD LABEL BUT

		1
		Page 63
15:20:04	1	NONETHELESS WERE CONTACTED BY THE THIRD PARTY
15:20:07	2	RELEASING A COMPILATION ALBUM TO GET A MECHANICAL
15:20:08	3	LICENSE FROM YOU OR FROM YOUR ARTIST?
15:20:10	4	A. THAT HAPPENS SOMETIMES.
15:20:21	5	Q. DO YOU HAVE AN OPINION ON WHETHER
15:20:24	6	THE ON WHETHER THE CONTROLLED COMPOSITION
15:20:28	7	CLAUSE APPLIES TO SUCH RELEASES BY UNAFFILIATED
15:20:31	8	THIRD PARTIES LIKE A LICENSEE WHO IS RELEASING A
15:20:34	9	COMPILATION ALBUM WHERE THEY'VE LICENSED THE
15:20:35	10	MASTER FROM THE RECORD LABEL?
15:20:38	11	A. THIS CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE
15:20:39	12	OR IN GENERAL?
15:20:41	13	Q. IN GENERAL.
15:20:48	14	A. IN GENERAL, MOST CONTROLLED
15:20:50	15	COMPOSITION CLAUSES PURPORT TO ACQUIRE THOSE
15:20:54	16	RIGHTS. THEY MOST OF THEM ATTEMPT TO ACQUIRE
15:20:57	17	THE RIGHTS TO BE ABLE TO SUBLICENSE TO THIRD
15:20:58	18	PARTIES.
15:20:59	19	Q. DOES THIS ONE?
15:21:01	20	A. I THINK SO, YES.
15:21:04	21	Q. SO YOUR TESTIMONY IS THAT SO HE
15:21:06	22	IS GOING TO TESTIFY ABOUT THE AFFILIATED LICENSEE?
15:21:07	23	MR. POMERANTZ: NO, I DON'T. I WAS
15:21:10	24	WONDERING WHERE YOU WERE GOING, BUT THAT IS NOT A
	25	SUBJECT WE WOULD INTEND TO HAVE HIM OFFER EXPERT

		Page 64
15:21:14	1	TESTIMONY IN. AND SO, NO.
15:21:16	2	I REALIZE YOU DON'T LIKE HIS
15:21:20	3	OPINION, BUT THAT'S NOT A SUBJECT THAT WE ARE
15:21:23	4	INTENDING TO OFFER EXPERT TESTIMONY FROM
15:21:23	5	MR. PATERNO.
15:21:24	6	MR. BUSCH: BECAUSE YOU HAD
15:21:25	7	INSTRUCTED HIM NOT TO
15:21:26	8	MR. POMERANTZ: I WAS TRYING TO
15:21:28	9	LISTEN TO YOUR QUESTIONS AND SEE IF IT WAS GOING
15:21:29	10	TO ONE OF THE THREE SUBJECT MATTERS THAT WE HAD
15:21:32	11	DESIGNATED HIM ON, AND I DON'T SEE THAT.
15:21:35	12	SO NO, I DON'T THINK WE WOULD
15:21:38	13	INTEND TO OFFER HIM AS AN EXPERT ON THOSE
15:21:47	14	SUBJECTS.
15:21:47	15	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:21:48	16	Q. OKAY. WELL, NOW THAT YOU'VE
15:21:50	17	ANSWERED THE QUESTION, DO YOU KNOW WHY THE THIRD
15:21:52	18	PARTY RECORD LABELS, THIRD-PARTY LICENSEES WHO
15:21:55	19	WERE RELEASING COMPILATION ALBUMS WOULD HAVE
15:21:59	20	CONTACTED YOU OR YOUR ARTIST FOR A MECHANICAL
15:22:03	21	LICENSE IF THE COMPOSITION WAS COVERED BY THE
15:22:06	22	CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE FOR WHICH THEY
15:22:06	23	RECEIVED THE LICENSE?
15:22:07	24	MR. POMERANTZ: I'M GOING TO
	25	INSTRUCT HIM NOT TO ANSWER.

		7
		Page 65
15:22:14	1	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:22:17	2	Q. ALL RIGHT. LET'S GO TO THE OTHER
15:22:21	3	SENTENCE IN OR TWO SENTENCES IN THE SULLIVAN
15:22:23	4	REPORT THAT YOU HAVE BEEN DESIGNATED AS AN EXPERT
15:22:25	5	ON.
15:22:28	6	AND I'LL READ IT FOR THE RECORD.
15:22:30	7	IT'S PAGE 13 OF THE SULLIVAN REPORT.
15:22:39	8	A. OKAY. I SPLIT IT UP SOMEWHERE.
15:22:40	9	HERE. OKAY. GOT IT.
15:22:42	10	Q. THE SENTENCE BEGINS:
15:22:43	11	"HOWEVER, AS NOTED ABOVE,
15:22:46	12	THE POSITION TAKEN BY DEFENDANTS FOR
15:22:48	13	PURPOSES OF THIS LITIGATION IS AT
15:22:50	14	ODDS WITH WILDLY ACCEPTED INDUSTRY
15:22:54	15	PRACTICE BETWEEN PUBLISHERS INCLUDING
15:22:55	16	H.F.A. AND INDEPENDENT PUBLISHERS AND
15:22:57	17	RECORD LABELS INCLUDING DEFENDANTS
15:22:59	18	AFTERMATH AND U.M.G. TO SEPARATELY
15:23:02	19	LICENSE FROM PUBLISHERS REPRESENTING
15:23:02	20	SOLELY THEIR RESPECTED PERCENTAGE
15:23:04	21	SHARES OF THE COPYRIGHT AND THE
15:23:06	22	COMPOSITION, AND IN EACH INSTANCE
15:23:09	23	PURSUANT TO SEPARATE LICENSES FOR
15:23:12	24	MECHANICAL, PHYSICAL AND D.P.D.
	25	DIGITAL REPRODUCTION AND

		Page 66
15:23:14	1	DISTRIBUTION."
15:23:15	2	DO YOU SEE THAT?
15:23:15	3	A. YES.
15:23:17	4	Q. WHAT IS YOUR OPINION IN RESPONSE TO
15:23:17	5	THAT SENTENCE?
15:23:20	6	A. LET ME READ IT AGAIN, BECAUSE I GOT
15:23:20	7	LOST BECAUSE I WAS LOOKING AT THE WRONG ONE.
15:23:22	8	Q. THAT'S FINE. READ IT TO YOURSELF.
15:23:24	9	AND WHEN YOU'RE READY, ANSWER.
15:23:45	10	(DOCUMENT REVIEWED BY DEPONENT.)
15:23:46	11	THE DEPONENT: OKAY. SO, YEAH,
15:23:46	12	WHAT'S THE QUESTION?
15:23:47	13	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:23:49	14	Q. THE QUESTION IS: TELL ME WHAT YOUR
15:23:50	15	OPINION IS IN RESPONSE TO THAT SENTENCE WHICH YOU
15:24:03	16	HAVE BEEN DESIGNATED AS AN EXPERT.
15:24:15	17	A. WELL, MY RESPONSE IS THAT RECORD
15:24:25	18	LABELS LET ME READ THIS AGAIN, SIR.
15:24:27	19	SO WHAT THE THING IS SAYING, WHAT
15:24:30	20	THE SENTENCE IS SAYING IS THAT THAT IT'S
15:24:34	21	CUSTOMARY THAT THAT LICENSORS SEEK OUT SEPARATE
15:24:39	22	LICENSES FOR EACH INDIVIDUAL SHARE OF THE
15:24:42	23	COPYRIGHT FROM THE COPYRIGHT HOLDER OF THAT SHARE
15:24:47	24	OF THE COMPOSITION. THAT'S CUSTOMARY, YES.
	25	HOWEVER, THEY DON'T HAVE TO. IT'S

		Page 67
15:24:49	1	JUST WHAT THEY DO.
15:24:50	2	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:24:51	3	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER IT'S REQUIRED
15:24:53	4	OR NOT?
15:24:57	5	A. IT'S WELL, IT DEPENDS ON THE
15:25:00	6	CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE. MOST CONTROLLED
15:25:05	7	COMPOSITION CLAUSES SAY TO THE PERSON, YOU KNOW,
15:25:07	8	AGREEING TO THE CLAUSE, IT SAYS THAT ANY
15:25:10	9	COMPOSITION WRITTEN IN WHOLE OR IN PART BY YOU OR
15:25:13	10	ANYBODY OWNED OR CONTROLLED, OR WHATEVER, BY YOU
15:25:16	11	IS HEREBY LICENSED OR WILL BE LICENSED OR LICENSED
15:25:18	12	TO US FOR THE FOLLOWING RATES.
15:25:23	13	SO THE ARTIST, WHO IS GENERALLY THE
15:25:25	14	SIGNATORY OF THAT AGREEMENT, IS REQUIRED TO
15:25:28	15	DELIVER NOT ONLY HIS SHARE BUT THE SHARES OF OTHER
15:25:28	16	WRITERS TOO.
15:25:31	17	Q. THAT THEY CONTROL OR ARE AFFILIATED
15:25:31	18	WITH?
15:25:32	19	A. NO, NO. IT SAYS IN WHOLE OR IN
15:25:36	20	PART. MOST CONTROLLED COMPOSITIONS SAY IN WHOLE
15:25:40	21	OR IN PART. SO ANY COMPOSITION, WRITTEN IN WHOLE
15:25:42	22	OR IN PART, IS A CONTROLLED COMPOSITION, AND THE
15:25:44	23	ARTIST IS REQUIRED TO DELIVER THE RIGHTS TO THAT
15:25:45	24	COMPOSITION.
	25	Q. LET'S BACK UP SO I UNDERSTAND WHAT

		Page 68
15:25:48	1	YOU SAID, AND I WANT TO UNDERSTAND THIS.
15:25:51	2	WELL, FIRST YOU SAID IT IS TRUE
15:25:54	3	THAT A CUSTOM AND PRACTICE IS THAT A PUBLISHER
15:25:56	4	ONLY LICENSES THEIR SHARE; CORRECT?
15:25:58	5	MR. POMERANTZ: NO, THAT'S NOT WHAT
15:25:59	6	HE SAID.
15:26:00	7	MR. BUSCH: LET HIM ANSWER THE
15:26:00	8	QUESTION.
15:26:02	9	MR. POMERANTZ: BUT YOU MISSTATED
15:26:02	10	HIS TESTIMONY.
15:26:04	11	MR. BUSCH: I DON'T BELIEVE I DID.
15:26:05	12	THE DEPONENT: IT'S FAIRLY
15:26:06	13	CUSTOMARY THAT THAT THE LABEL WILL SEEK OUT
15:26:09	14	LICENSES FROM EACH INDIVIDUAL PUBLISHER FOR A
15:26:11	15	NUMBER OF REASONS, ONE OF WHICH MAKES IT EASIER
15:26:13	16	FOR THEM TO KNOW WHO TO ACCOUNT TO.
15:26:13	17	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:26:15	18	Q. SO IT IS FAIR TO SAY THAT, FOR
15:26:17	19	EXAMPLE, HARRY FOX WILL JUST LICENSE THE SHARE OF
15:26:21	20	THOSE WRITERS OR PUBLISHERS THAT ARE CONTROLLED BY
15:26:22	21	HARRY FOX?
15:26:23	22	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
15:26:24	23	EXTENT IT MISSTATES HIS TESTIMONY.
15:26:25	24	BY MR. BUSCH:
	25	Q. IS THAT RIGHT?

		Page 69
15:26:27	1	A. NO, IT'S NOT RIGHT. HARRY FOX WILL
15:26:30	2	LICENSE WHAT THEY'RE ASKED TO LICENSE, AND
15:26:32	3	GENERALLY THEY'RE JUST ASKED TO LICENSE THEIR
15:26:32	4	SHARE.
15:26:34	5	Q. OKAY. NOW, YOU SAID THAT
15:26:36	6	A. THEY MAY OR MAY NOT LICENSE THE
15:26:39	7	OTHER PERSON'S SHARE, BUT NEVER NOT NEVER, BUT
15:26:41	8	CUSTOMARILY THEY'RE NOT ASKED TO LICENSE THE OTHER
15:26:41	9	PERSON'S SHARE.
15:26:44	10	Q. NOW AND THEN THERE WAS A SECOND
15:26:48	11	PART WHERE YOU SAID REQUIRED, NOT REQUIRED. AND
15:26:51	12	YOU SAID THAT THE LICENSING OF THE TOTAL SHARE IS
15:26:52	13	NOT REQUIRED.
15:26:53	14	DO YOU KNOW WHETHER IF, FOR
15:26:57	15	EXAMPLE, YOU HAD THREE PUBLISHERS, TWO OF WHICH
15:27:03	16	WERE TWO OF WHICH WERE LICENSED THEIR SHARE,
15:27:10	17	BUT THE THIRD PUBLISHER WAS CONTACTED REFUSED TO
15:27:13	18	LICENSE THE SHARE AND OBJECTED TO THE USE, DOES
15:27:15	19	THE LABEL, UNDER THOSE CIRCUMSTANCES, HAVE THE
15:27:16	20	RIGHT TO EXPLOIT THE COMPOSITION?
15:27:17	21	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
15:27:20	22	EXTENT IT'S ASKING FOR A LEGAL CONCLUSION.
15:27:22	23	YOU CAN ANSWER TO THE EXTENT THAT
15:27:23	24	YOU KNOW.
	25	THE DEPONENT: YEAH. I CAN'T

		ı
		Page 70
15:27:31	1	REMEMBER WHAT THE ANSWER IS. I THINK THE ANSWER
15:27:31	2	IS GOING TO BE ABSOLUTELY. BUT I CAN'T REMEMBER
15:27:32	3	WHAT THE ANSWER IS ANYMORE.
15:27:32	4	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:27:34	5	Q. MY QUESTION IS: IF YOU HAVE THREE
15:27:38	6	PUBLISHERS, AND THE RECORD LABEL GETS A MECHANICAL
15:27:41	7	LICENSE FROM TWO OF THE PUBLISHERS, THE THIRD
15:27:44	8	PUBLISHER OBJECTS TO GIVING A LICENSE AND IN FACT
15:27:47	9	OBJECTS TO THE USE AND SAYS, "I DO NOT WANT YOU
15:27:49	10	USING MY COMPOSITION FOR THIS PURPOSE."
15:27:49	11	A. RIGHT.
15:27:50	12	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER THE RECORD
15:27:53	13	LABEL HAS THE RIGHT TO EXPLOIT THAT COMPOSITION
15:27:55	14	FOR THAT PURPOSE THAT THE PUBLISHER OBJECTS TO?
15:27:56	15	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
15:27:58	16	EXTENT IT CALLS FOR A LEGAL CONCLUSION. IT'S ALSO
15:27:59	17	AN INCOMPLETE HYPOTHETICAL.
15:28:02	18	THE DEPONENT: UNDER A TYPICAL
15:28:03	19	CONTROLLED COMPOSITION CLAUSE, THE ANSWER IS THAT
15:28:06	20	THE RECORD LABEL CAN RELY ON THE GRANT FROM THE
15:28:11	21	WRITER. IF IT'S AN OUTSIDE SONG, A LABEL CAN RELY
15:28:14	22	ON A NONEXCLUSIVE LICENSE PROVIDED BY ANY OF THE
15:28:14	23	COPYRIGHT HOLDERS.
15:28:16	24	BY MR. BUSCH:
	25	Q. EVEN IF THERE IS AN OBJECTION BY

		Page 71
15:28:19	1	ONE OF THE PUBLISHERS?
15:28:20	2	A. YES.
15:28:21	3	Q. AND WHAT IS YOUR BASIS FOR SAYING
15:28:21	4	THAT?
15:28:22	5	A. THE AREA THAT I'M NOT DESIGNATED TO
15:28:24	6	BE AN EXPERT ON.
15:28:26	7	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER NIMMER TAKES
15:28:27	8	THAT SAME POSITION?
15:28:29	9	A. I'M PRETTY CONFIDENT THAT HE DOES.
15:28:29	10	AGAIN
15:28:31	11	Q. WOULD IT SURPRISE YOU IF HE DIDN'T?
15:28:32	12	A. WELL, IT DEPENDS. IT DEPENDS ON
15:28:33	13	THE TERRITORY. FOR THE UNITED STATES, I WOULD BE
15:28:34	14	SHOCKED IF HE DIDN'T.
15:28:38	15	Q. OKAY. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER THAT
15:28:41	16	DO YOU KNOW WHETHER THAT POINT OF LAW THAT
15:28:44	17	POINT HAS EVER BEEN LITIGATED?
15:28:46	18	MR. POMERANTZ: YOU KNOW, HE'S NOT
15:28:48	19	HERE AS A LEGAL EXPERT. HE'S HERE TO OFFER
15:28:54	20	OPINIONS ON VARIOUS CUSTOMARY USAGES IN THE MUSIC
15:28:56	21	INDUSTRY WITH RESPECT TO CONTROLLED COMPOSITION
15:28:56	22	CLAUSES.
15:28:56	23	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:28:58	24	Q. SO IS IT FAIR TO SAY THAT WITH
	25	RESPECT TO THE SENTENCE THAT YOU'VE BEEN

		Page 72
15:29:03	1	DESIGNATED AS AN EXPERT ON, MR. PATERNO, THAT YOU
15:29:09	2	DON'T DISAGREE WITH THE STATEMENT THAT IS MADE
15:29:10	3	WITHIN THAT SENTENCE?
15:29:10	4	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION;
15:29:12	5	MISSTATES HIS TESTIMONY.
15:29:12	6	THE DEPONENT: I DON'T DISAGREE
15:29:15	7	WITH SOME OF THE STATEMENTS. I MEAN, PARTS OF IT
15:29:16	8	I DO DISAGREE WITH.
15:29:16	9	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:29:17	10	Q. OKAY. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW IN THIS
15:29:20	11	SENTENCE WHAT PART OF IT WHAT PART OF IT DO YOU
15:29:20	12	AGREE WITH?
15:29:26	13	A. WELL, THE POSITION TAKEN ABOVE
15:29:43	14	TAKEN BY WELL, I GUESS THE POSITION TAKEN BY
15:29:47	15	DEFENDANTS FOR PURPOSES OF THIS LITIGATION IS AT
15:29:50	16	ODDS WITH WIDELY ACCEPTED INDUSTRY PRACTICE
15:29:52	17	BETWEEN PUBLISHERS AND RECORD LABELS.
15:29:55	18	IT'S NOT AT ODDS WITH IT. IT'S
15:29:59	19	JUST NOT IT'S JUST NOT CUSTOMARY. I MEAN, IT'S
15:30:01	20	NOT CUSTOMARY AS I TESTIFIED BEFORE, IT'S NOT
15:30:02	21	CUSTOMARILY DONE THAT WAY.
15:30:03	22	Q. IN WHAT WAY?
15:30:07	23	A. THAT THAT ONE PUBLISHER WILL
15:30:10	24	GRANT A LICENSE ON BEHALF OF OTHER COPUBLISHERS.
	25	BUT THAT'S JUST BECAUSE MOST PEOPLE COOPERATE, AND

		Page 73
15:30:17	1	SO IT NEVER COMES TO THIS.
15:30:28	2	Q. OKAY.
15:30:30	3	A. AND AGAIN, I DON'T WANT TO GET TOO
15:30:33	4	FAR AFIELD, BUT I CERTAINLY HAVE TAKEN THE
15:30:35	5	POSITION THAT THIS PERSON CLAIMS IS AT ODDS WITH
15:30:39	6	INDUSTRY PRACTICE ON, YOU KNOW, NOT EVERY DAY, BUT
15:30:40	7	IT COMES UP.
15:30:42	8	AND WE HAVE, ON BEHALF OF OTHER
15:30:46	9	HOLDERS OF COPYRIGHTS, LICENSED THEIR INTERESTS IN
15:30:49	10	THE COPYRIGHT WHEN THEY WEREN'T BEING COOPERATIVE.
15:30:51	11	Q. WHO?
15:30:54	12	A. I DON'T YOU KNOW, AGAIN, I DON'T
15:30:56	13	REMEMBER. IT CAME UP LAST WEEK, AND I CAN'T FOR
15:30:58	14	THE LIFE OF ME TELL YOU WHO IT WAS.
15:31:15	15	Q. IS IT FAIR TO SAY THAT LICENSES ARE
15:31:19	16	NARROWLY CONSTRUED TO CONFORM TO THE LANGUAGE IN
15:31:19	17	THE LICENSE?
15:31:20	18	MR. POMERANTZ: WHAT ARE YOU
15:31:22	19	TALKING ABOUT? WHAT KIND OF LICENSE? WHAT
15:31:24	20	CONTEXT? HOW DOES IT RELATE TO HIS OPINIONS?
15:31:25	21	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:31:26	22	Q. WOULD IT BE FAIR TO SAY THAT A
15:31:29	23	LICENSE TO USE A COMPOSITION FOR A CERTAIN PURPOSE
15:31:33	24	IS NARROWLY CONSTRUED TO ONLY GRANT A LICENSE FOR
	25	THAT PURPOSE IDENTIFIED WITHIN THE LICENSE?

		Page 74
15:31:36	1	MR. POMERANTZ: I'M GOING TO
15:31:39	2	INSTRUCT HIM NOT TO ANSWER UNLESS YOU CAN EXPLAIN
15:31:42	3	TO ME HOW THAT RELATES TO ONE OF THE THREE
15:31:51	4	OPINIONS THAT WE ARE INTENDING TO OFFER HIM ON.
15:31:58	5	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:32:02	6	Q. LET'S GET MR. ABRAMS' REPORT IN
15:32:15	7	FRONT OF YOU. AND AM I RIGHT, THERE IS ONLY ONE?
15:32:17	8	MR. POMERANTZ: YEAH. IT'S THE
15:32:19	9	SENTENCE THAT BEGINS ON THE TOP OF PAGE 3 THAT
15:32:21	10	STARTS WITH THE WORD "INITIALLY." I THINK IT'S
15:32:27	11	ACTUALLY TWO SENTENCES, BUT IT'S CLAUSES A AND B.
15:32:29	12	I DON'T KNOW IF YOU'VE GIVEN US
15:32:29	13	THIS REPORT YET.
15:32:33	14	MR. BUSCH: I DID. DID I GIVE YOU
15:32:34	15	ABRAMS?
15:32:35	16	THE DEPONENT: I DON'T THINK I HAVE
15:32:35	17	IT.
15:32:37	18	MR. BUSCH: LET ME GIVE IT TO YOU,
15:32:55	19	THEN.
15:32:57	20	MR. POMERANTZ: I'LL GIVE HIM MY
15:32:58	21	COPY.
15:33:01	22	MR. BUSCH: AND SAME POINT HERE,
15:33:02	23	WHICH IS THAT YOU'RE ONLY GOING TO LET HIM ANSWER
15:33:04	24	QUESTIONS THAT RELATE TO THIS WITH RESPECT TO
	25	THIS PARTICULAR?

		7
		Page 75
15:33:06	1	MR. POMERANTZ: CORRECT. THAT'S
15:33:08	2	THE SUBJECT MATTER THAT HE'S GOING TO BE
15:33:11	3	TESTIFYING ABOUT AS AN EXPERT AND REBUTTING.
15:33:12	4	MR. BUSCH: OKAY. AND I HAVE THE
15:33:14	5	SAME RESERVATION OF RIGHTS.
15:33:14	6	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:33:17	7	Q. MR. PATERNO, MR. POMERANTZ HAS SAID
15:33:18	8	THAT YOU'RE ONLY GOING TO BE TESTIFYING ABOUT
15:33:22	9	THIS THESE TWO CLAUSES WITHIN OR THESE TWO
15:33:25	10	SENTENCES WITHIN MR. ABRAMS' REPORT.
15:33:27	11	MR. POMERANTZ: LET ME JUST I'M
15:33:29	12	SORRY TO INTERRUPT. WE'RE ON PAGE 3.
15:33:30	13	THE DEPONENT: I WAS WAITING FOR
15:33:31	14	HIM TO TELL ME.
15:33:32	15	MR. POMERANTZ: WE'RE ON PAGE 3 AT
15:33:34	16	THE TOP BEGINNING WITH THE SENTENCE, WITH THE WORD
15:33:37	17	"INITIALLY" IN THE FIRST LINE.
15:33:38	18	CAN YOU JUST GIVE HIM ONE MOMENT TO
15:33:38	19	READ THE SENTENCE.
15:33:39	20	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:33:40	21	Q. "INITIALLY, THEREFORE, THERE
15:33:41	22	ARE TWO THINGS TO NOTE. THIS IS NOT
15:33:44	23	A SELF-EFFECTUATING CONTROLLED
15:33:45	24	COMPOSITION CLAUSE AS THAT TERM IS
	25	KNOWN AND UNDERSTOOD WITHIN THE MUSIC

		Page 76
15:33:50	1	INDUSTRY AND UNDER COPYRIGHT.
15:33:52	2	SELF-EFFECTUATING CONTROLLED
15:33:53	3	COMPOSITION CLAUSES WILL SAY THE
15:33:55	4	CONTROLLED COMPOSITIONS ARE HEREBY
15:33:55	5	LICENSED.
15:33:57	6	"AND B, AS A RESULT, THIS
15:33:59	7	LANGUAGE CLEARLY CONTEMPLATES THE
15:34:01	8	SIGNING OF A SEPARATE LICENSE THAT
15:34:03	9	WOULD PRESUMABLY CONTAIN THE TERMS
15:34:05	10	GENERALLY FOUND WITHIN THE
15:34:06	11	MECHANICAL LICENSES."
15:34:11	12	OKAY. AS TO POINT A, WOULD YOU
15:34:14	13	HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD BEYOND WHAT YOU TESTIFIED TO
15:34:18	14	ON THE SAME SUBJECT MATTER AS IT RELATED TO
15:34:20	15	MR. SULLIVAN'S REPORT AS TO WHY MR. ABRAMS IS
15:34:21	16	WRONG IN YOUR VIEW?
15:34:26	17	A. I CAN'T REMEMBER WHAT I TESTIFIED,
15:34:38	18	BUT I COULD JUST RESPOND BY SAYING THAT THERE
15:34:43	19	IS NO MAGIC WORDS THAT TO EFFECTUATE THE
15:34:44	20	COPYRIGHT.
15:34:47	21	THERE IT'S SO UNLIKELY THAT
15:34:50	22	THE IF THIS CONTRACT THAT WE'RE SPEAKING ABOUT
15:34:55	23	HAD SAID THE MECHANICAL THE CONTROLLED
15:34:57	24	COMPOSITIONS ARE HEREBY LICENSED, NO ATTORNEY ON
	25	THE OTHER SIDE WOULD SAY, "NO. CHANGE IT TO

		Page 77
15:35:02	1	'WILL.' I NEED TO RESERVE THE RIGHT TO BE ABLE TO
15:35:04	2	ISSUE A SEPARATE LICENSE."
15:35:07	3	IT'S PATENTLY RIDICULOUS. THERE IS
15:35:07	4	NOBODY PRACTICING LAW IN THE MUSIC THAT THINKS
15:35:12	5	THAT THE CONTROLLED COMPOSITION, WHETHER WELL
15:35:15	6	DRAFTED, POORLY DRAFTED, MEANS ANYTHING OTHER THAN
15:35:18	7	WHAT IT MEANS EVERY TIME THAT WE DO THIS, WHICH IS
15:35:23	8	THAT THAT THE COMPOSITION WILL BE LICENSED AT
15:35:25	9	THE RATES AND ON THE TERMS SET FORTH IN THE
15:35:26	10	RECORDING AGREEMENT.
15:35:28	11	Q. AREN'T THERE OTHER TERMS THAT
15:35:31	12	AREN'T GENERALLY FOUND WITHIN LICENSES THAT ARE
15:35:33	13	NOT INCLUDED WITHIN THE MECHANICAL ROYALTY SECTION
15:35:37	14	OF IN THE 1998 OR 2003 AGREEMENT?
15:35:40	15	A. THESE AGREEMENTS ARE SHORT FORM.
15:35:45	16	SO YES, GENERALLY, YES, THERE ARE THINGS MISSING.
15:35:45	17	NONE OF WHICH ANYBODY THINKS IS IMPORTANT.
15:35:48	18	Q. AUDIT RIGHTS? ACCOUNTING RIGHTS?
15:35:49	19	A. YES, THOSE.
15:35:51	20	Q. THOSE ARE NOT IMPORTANT?
15:35:52	21	A. THEY'RE NOT.
15:35:53	22	Q. WHAT OTHER THINGS THAT ARE FOUND
15:35:56	23	WITHIN LICENSES ARE NOT FOUND WITHIN THE SHORT
15:35:58	24	FORM AGREEMENTS THAT YOU HAVE IN FRONT OF YOU?
	25	A. I DON'T KNOW.

		1
		Page 78
15:36:02	1	Q. I MEAN, YOU SAID THERE ARE TERMS,
15:36:05	2	CONDITIONS THAT ARE NOT FOUND WITHIN THIS
15:36:09	3	WITHIN THE SHORT-FORM AGREEMENT THAT ARE GENERALLY
15:36:10	4	FOUND IN LICENSES.
15:36:12	5	I IDENTIFIED TWO, AUDIT RIGHTS AND
15:36:14	6	ACCOUNTING RIGHTS. ARE THERE ANY OTHER RIGHTS
15:36:15	7	THAT YOU CAN THINK OF?
15:36:18	8	A. TIME OF PAYMENT, FREQUENCY OF
15:36:24	9	PAYMENT, OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD. I MEAN, I COULD
15:36:28	10	LOOK AT A LICENSE AND TELL YOU WHAT'S NOT IN HERE
15:36:29	11	THAT'S IN A LICENSE. THEY'RE ALL PRETTY MUCH
15:36:30	12	IMMATERIAL.
15:36:31	13	Q. ANYTHING DO YOU KNOW WHETHER
15:36:34	14	IT'S IMMATERIAL TO EVERYONE HAVING AUDIT RIGHTS OR
15:36:36	15	ACCOUNTING RIGHTS OR WHEN THEY'RE BEING PAID AND
15:36:37	16	HOW THEY'RE BEING PAID?
15:36:40	17	A. IT'S IMMATERIAL TO RATIONAL PEOPLE.
15:36:43	18	THEY'RE ALL PAID WITHIN 90 DAYS. THERE IS TYPICAL
15:36:45	19	ACCOUNTING RIGHTS. IT'S NOT THESE ARE NOT BIG
15:36:46	20	ISSUES.
15:36:55	21	Q. DO YOU KNOW WHETHER THERE ARE
15:36:57	22	SPECIFIC TERMS FOUND IN DIGITAL DOWNLOAD LICENSES
15:37:02	23	THAT ARE NOT FOUND WITHIN THE MECHANICAL ROYALTY
15:37:02	24	SECTION?
	25	A. SEPARATE DIGITAL DOWNLOAD LICENSES?
1		

		Page 79
15:37:08	1	Q. YES, SIR.
15:37:09	2	A. I DON'T KNOW. I HAVE NEVER LOOKED
15:37:11	3	AT A SEPARATE DIGITAL DOWNLOAD LICENSE.
15:37:26	4	Q. OKAY. DO YOU KNOW PERSONALLY THE
15:37:28	5	NAME OF LEO FERANTE?
15:37:28	6	A. NO.
15:37:30	7	Q. OKAY. DO YOU KNOW DO YOU KNOW
15:37:34	8	WHETHER WHAT MR WHETHER WHAT IS REPRESENTED
15:37:38	9	HERE AS BEING THE TESTIMONY OF LEO FERANTE IS
15:37:38	10	CORRECT?
15:37:40	11	A. HOW WOULD I KNOW THAT?
15:37:44	12	Q. IN OTHER WORDS, YOU DON'T KNOW
15:37:48	13	WHETHER UNIVERSAL HAS A HAS A PRACTICE OF
15:37:51	14	SENDING SEPARATE LICENSE AND LICENSE REQUEST
15:37:59	15	LETTERS INSTEAD OF ADVICE LETTERS WHEN CONTROLLED
15:38:01	16	COMPOSITION LANGUAGE IS AMBIGUOUS?
15:38:04	17	A. THAT'S NOT WHAT YOU ASKED. YOU
15:38:06	18	ASKED ME IF THIS WAS THE TESTIMONY OF LEO
15:38:07	19	FERRANTE.
15:38:08	20	Q. NO, NO. WHAT I ASKED YOU WAS
15:38:09	21	DOESN'T MATTER.
15:38:10	22	WHAT I MEANT TO ASK YOU, BUT I
15:38:12	23	DIDN'T ASK IT CLEARLY ENOUGH WAS: DO YOU KNOW
15:38:15	24	WHETHER IT WAS REPRESENTED TO BE THE TESTIMONY OF
	25	MR. FERANTE?

		Page 80
15:38:16	1	A. IS THERE A PRACTICE?
15:38:17	2	Q. IS THERE A PRACTICE.
15:38:19	3	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION; LACK OF
15:38:19	4	FOUNDATION.
15:38:20	5	THE DEPONENT: I BELIEVE THAT TO BE
15:38:21	6	THEIR PRACTICE.
15:38:21	7	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:38:22	8	Q. OKAY. AND HOW DO YOU KNOW THAT?
15:38:24	9	A. I DON'T KNOW FOR CERTAIN.
15:38:26	10	Q. WHAT IS YOUR BELIEF BASED UPON?
15:38:29	11	A. I'VE BEEN DOING THIS A LONG TIME,
15:38:32	12	AND IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT'S HOW IT WORKS. I
15:38:36	13	HAVEN'T ISSUED, RECEIVED, REVIEWED OR LOOKED AT A
15:38:38	14	MECHANICAL LICENSE IN A REALLY LONG TIME.
15:38:41	15	Q. OKAY. AND YOU WORK WITH UNIVERSAL;
15:38:43	16	IS THAT CORRECT?
15:38:44	17	MR. POMERANTZ: WHAT DO YOU MEAN
15:38:44	18	"WORK WITH"?
15:38:45	19	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:38:48	20	Q. YOU HAVE CAUSE TO WORK WITH
15:38:51	21	UNIVERSAL LAWYERS AND ATTORNEYS IN THE UNIVERSAL
15:38:52	22	MUSIC DEPARTMENT?
15:38:55	23	A. GENERALLY, YES, ON THE OPPOSITE
15:38:57	24	SIDE OF THEM, YES. WE NEGOTIATE WITH THEM.
	25	Q. YOU'RE ALSO ON THEIR SIDE IN

		Page 81
15:39:01	1	CONNECTION WITH AFTERMATH; IS THAT RIGHT?
15:39:04	2	A. THAT'S THE ONLY TIME WHEN WE'RE
15:39:09	3	WHEN WE'RE INDEMNITY COUNSEL OR SOMEHOW IT'S
15:39:11	4	REALLY THE ONLY TIME IS ON BEHALF OF AFTERMATH
15:39:12	5	BECAUSE WE'RE PARTNERS.
15:39:14	6	Q. AND YOU SAY THAT YOU ARE GENERALLY
15:39:18	7	NEGOTIATING WITH OR REPRESENTING ARTISTS IN
15:39:20	8	CONNECTION WITH THEIR RELATIONSHIP WITH UNIVERSAL?
15:39:23	9	A. YES, THAT'S MY PRIMARY INTERACTION
15:39:24	10	WITH UNIVERSAL.
15:39:27	11	Q. OKAY.
15:39:29	12	A. AND IN TERMS OF LICENSING
15:39:33	13	COMPOSITIONS, THAT'S WE DO THAT ALSO. I DON'T
15:39:35	14	DO IT. PARALEGALS IN THE FIRM DO IT.
15:40:03	15	Q. OKAY. THAT WAS THE ONLY THING YOU
15:40:13	16	WERE UP TO.
15:40:13	17	MR. BUSCH: ALL RIGHT. LET ME SEE.
15:40:19	18	I MAY BE FINISHED.
15:40:20	19	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: OFF THE RECORD
15:43:19	20	AT 3:40 P.M.
15:43:24	21	(WHEREUPON, A RECESS WAS HELD
15:43:25	22	FROM 3:40 P.M. TO 3:43 P.M.)
15:43:32	23	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: ALL RIGHT. BACK
15:43:34	24	ON THE RECORD AT 3:43 P.M.
	25	///

		Page 82
15:43:35	1	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:43:37	2	Q. MR. POMERANTZ
15:43:38	3	MR. POMERANTZ: NO. START OVER
15:43:39	4	AGAIN.
15:43:39	5	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:43:40	6	Q. I'M SORRY. MR. PATERNO?
15:43:40	7	A. OKAY.
15:43:42	8	Q. YOU.
15:43:43	9	A. THANK YOU.
15:43:46	10	Q. MR. PATERNO, HAVE YOU REVIEWED OR
15:43:52	11	DO YOU INTEND TO SUPPLEMENT YOUR TESTIMONY WITH
15:43:58	12	ANY MATERIALS, TREATISES, EDUCATIONAL MATERIAL,
15:44:01	13	ANYTHING BEYOND JUST WHAT YOUR EXPERIENCE HAS BEEN
15:44:03	14	AS A PRACTICING LAWYER IN THE MUSIC INDUSTRY?
15:44:07	15	A. I HADN'T PLANNED ON IT, NO.
15:44:09	16	Q. OKAY. AND I TAKE IT, YOU HAVE NOT
15:44:12	17	REVIEWED ANY SUCH MATERIAL IN PREPARATION FOR YOUR
15:44:12	18	TESTIMONY TODAY?
15:44:12	19	A. NO.
15:44:17	20	Q. AND YOU HAD NOT REVIEWED ANY SUCH
15:44:20	21	MATERIAL IN CONNECTION WITH YOUR ENGAGEMENT AS AN
15:44:21	22	EXPERT WITNESS IN THIS CASE?
15:44:22	23	A. NO.
15:44:30	24	Q. OKAY. DO YOU INTEND TO OFFER ANY
	25	OPINIONS OR TESTIMONY ON THE SENTENCES THAT WE'VE

		Page 83
15:44:35	1	GONE OVER TODAY BEYOND WHAT YOU TESTIFIED TO?
15:44:38	2	A. WELL, I DON'T KNOW. IT DEPENDS ON
15:44:39	3	WHAT PEOPLE ASK ME.
15:44:41	4	Q. WELL, IS THERE ANYTHING BEYOND WHAT
15:44:43	5	YOU'VE BEEN ASKED TODAY WITH RESPECT TO THESE
15:44:46	6	SPECIFIC PARAGRAPHS THAT WE'VE GONE OVER THAT YOU
15:44:48	7	WOULD OFFER BEYOND WHAT YOU'VE SAID?
15:44:49	8	A. WELL, I RESPONDED TO YOUR QUESTIONS
15:44:51	9	THAT IF THERE IS DIFFERENT QUESTIONS AT TRIAL OR
15:44:53	10	SOME OTHER TIME, I'LL RESPOND TO THOSE.
15:44:55	11	Q. WELL, GET THE DOCUMENTS IN FRONT OF
15:44:58	12	YOU, PLEASE. GET ALL THREE SENTENCES IN FRONT OF
15:45:01	13	YOU, AND I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WITH RESPECT TO EACH
15:45:03	14	PARTICULAR ONE WHETHER YOUR EXPLANATION OR
15:45:05	15	TESTIMONY REGARDING THOSE SENTENCES ARE IF YOU
15:45:08	16	HAVE ANYTHING ELSE TO OFFER WHETHER YOU AGREE OR
15:45:10	17	DISAGREE BEYOND WHAT YOU'VE SAID HERE TODAY?
15:45:11	18	A. I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE QUESTIONS ARE
15:45:12	19	GOING TO BE.
15:45:15	20	Q. WELL, GET THEM IN FRONT YOU.
15:45:17	21	A. I'M NOT GOING TO FORMULATE YOUR
15:45:17	22	QUESTIONS FOR YOU.
15:45:18	23	Q. I'VE JUST FORMULATED THE QUESTION.
15:45:20	24	MY QUESTION IS: DO YOU HAVE ANY OTHER BASES FOR
	25	AGREEING OR DISAGREEING WITH ANY OF THOSE

		Page 84
15:45:25	1	SENTENCES BEYOND WHAT YOU'VE TESTIFIED TO HERE
15:45:25	2	TODAY?
15:45:28	3	A. I DON'T KNOW.
15:45:35	4	Q. OKAY. WELL, LET'S GET MR. ABRAMS'
15:45:37	5	REPORT IN FRONT OF YOU, PLEASE.
15:45:38	6	A. SURE. DO YOU HAVE A SPECIFIC
15:45:39	7	QUESTION?
15:45:44	8	Q. PAGE 3. THE PARAGRAPH THAT
15:45:46	9	MR. POMERANTZ SAID THAT YOU WILL BE TESTIFYING
15:45:53	10	ABOUT ON PAGE 3 THAT BEGINS WITH "INITIALLY" THAT
15:45:53	11	HAS TO DO WITH MECHANICAL LICENSES.
15:45:54	12	A. YES.
15:45:58	13	Q. AS TO A OR B, WHICH IS THAT CLAUSE
15:46:00	14	IS NOT SELF-EFFECTUATING BECAUSE OF THE DIFFERENCE
15:46:05	15	IN THE LANGUAGE AND THAT IT CLEARLY CONTEMPLATES
15:46:07	16	THE SIGNING OF A SEPARATE LICENSE, DO YOU HAVE ANY
15:46:10	17	OTHER BASIS TO DISAGREE WITH THAT, OTHER THAN TO
15:46:12	18	SAY THAT I THINK YOU SAID NO RATIONAL PERSON
15:46:16	19	WOULD SUGGEST THAT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE "IS
15:46:19	20	HEREBY" VERSUS "WILL BE" IS A BASIS TO CONCLUDE
15:46:22	21	ONE WAY OR THE OTHER?
15:46:23	22	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION;
15:46:25	23	MISSTATES HIS TESTIMONY, AND OBJECTION TO THE FORM
15:46:27	24	OF THE QUESTION.
	25	THE DEPONENT: WELL, YOU DIDN'T ASK

		Page 85
15:46:32	1	ME ANYTHING ABOUT B. YOU JUST ASKED ME TO READ A.
15:46:34	2	DO YOU WANT ME TO READ B AND DO YOU
15:46:35	3	HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT B?
15:46:35	4	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:46:35	5	Q. I SURE DO.
15:46:36	6	IT SAYS:
15:46:36	7	"AS A RESULT, THIS LANGUAGE
15:46:38	8	CLEARLY CONTEMPLATES THE SIGNING OF
15:46:39	9	A SEPARATE LICENSE THAT PRESUMABLY
15:46:41	10	CONTAINS THE TERMS GENERALLY FOUND
15:46:43	11	WITHIN MECHANICAL LICENSES."
15:46:44	12	WHAT IS YOUR BASIS FOR EITHER
15:46:46	13	AGREEING OR DISAGREEING WITH THAT?
15:46:47	14	A. I DON'T THINK IT CLEARLY
15:46:49	15	CONTEMPLATES ANYTHING OF THE SORT.
15:46:51	16	Q. YOU DON'T THINK THE LANGUAGE WILL
15:46:53	17	BE CONTEMPLATES THE SIGNING OF A FUTURE
15:46:53	18	LICENSE?
15:46:55	19	A. NOT IN THE CONTEXT OF NOT IN THE
15:46:58	20	CONTEXT OF WHERE I PRACTICE AND THE OTHER
15:46:59	21	PRACTITIONERS IN MY AREA.
15:47:01	22	Q. AND YOU'VE TESTIFIED THAT YOU'VE
15:47:04	23	NEVER DISCUSSED THE ISSUE OF THE "WILL BE" VERSUS
15:47:06	24	"HEREBY" WITH ANYONE, OTHER THAN YOU SAID YOU
	25	SPOKE TO SOMEONE THE OTHER DAY WHO YOU CAN'T

		Page 86
15:47:11	1	REMEMBER WHO IT WAS WHO SAID IT WAS RIDICULOUS?
15:47:14	2	A. I SPOKE TO SOMEBODY AROUND THE TIME
15:47:18	3	OF MY LAST DEPOSITION, AND WE WERE DISCUSSING IT.
15:47:23	4	AND WE AGREED THAT THE POSITION IS, AGAIN, ABSURD
15:47:26	5	GIVEN WHAT WE DO IN OUR DAILY BUSINESS LIVES.
15:47:28	6	Q. AND YOU DON'T REMEMBER WHO THAT IS?
15:47:28	7	A. NO.
15:47:30	8	Q. AND THAT WAS THE ONLY TIME YOU
15:47:33	9	RECALL DISCUSSING THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN "WILL BE"
15:47:36	10	VERSUS "IS HEREBY" AND ANY EFFECT THAT MIGHT HAVE?
15:47:37	11	A. WELL, I TOLD YOU I DISCUSSED IT
15:47:38	12	WITH THESE PEOPLE.
15:47:39	13	Q. MR. POMERANTZ?
15:47:39	14	A. YES.
15:47:41	15	Q. OKAY. OTHER THAN MR. POMERANTZ IN
15:47:43	16	CONNECTION WITH THIS CASE, YOU DON'T RECALL EVER
15:47:45	17	DISCUSSING IT JUST IN A NORMAL COURSE OF YOUR
15:47:46	18	PRACTICE?
15:47:48	19	A. YEAH. I TOLD YOU, AT THE TIME
15:47:49	20	AROUND THE LAST DEPOSITION.
15:47:51	21	Q. WITH THAT OTHER THAN THAT.
15:47:53	22	A. IT MIGHT HAVE BEEN TWO TIMES AROUND
15:47:55	23	THE LAST DEPOSITION WITH OTHER LAWYERS. BUT, NO.
15:47:58	24	OTHER THAN THAT, I DON'T SPEND A LOT OF TIME
	25	DIFFERENTIATING BETWEEN "WILL," "IS" AND "HEREBY."

		Page 87
15:48:05	1	Q. SO AS TO A AND B, DO YOU HAVE ANY
15:48:07	2	OTHER BASES FOR DISAGREEING WITH THOSE SENTENCES
15:48:09	3	OTHER THAN WHAT WE'VE TALKED ABOUT?
15:48:23	4	A. NO. I THINK I TESTIFIED THAT THIS
15:48:28	5	IS NOT THAT THIS PART OF THE REPORT DOES NOT
15:48:31	6	REFLECT THE CUSTOM AND PRACTICE IN THE MUSIC
15:48:33	7	INDUSTRY WHICH IS THE BASIS ON WHICH I OBJECT TO
15:48:33	8	WHAT HE SAYS.
15:48:35	9	Q. HOW MANY OTHER CONTROLLED
15:48:37	10	COMPOSITION CLAUSES OR MECHANICAL ROYALTIES
15:48:41	11	PROVISIONS HAVE YOU SEEN THAT HAS THE "WILL"
15:48:43	12	LICENSE VERSUS "IS HEREBY" OTHER THAN THIS
15:48:44	13	AGREEMENT?
15:48:44	14	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION TO THE
15:48:47	15	FORM OF THE QUESTION. MISSTATES THE DOCUMENT.
15:48:48	16	MR. BUSCH: GO AHEAD.
15:48:49	17	THE DEPONENT: I STILL HAVE NO
15:48:49	18	IDEA.
15:48:50	19	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:48:51	20	Q. HAVE YOU EVER SEEN ONE THAT SAID,
15:48:54	21	"WILL BE LICENSED" VERSUS "IS HEREBY" OTHER THAN
15:48:54	22	THIS AGREEMENT?
15:48:57	23	A. I'M SURE I HAVE, BUT I COULDN'T
15:49:00	24	TELL YOU WHERE OR WHEN OR HOW.
	25	Q. OKAY. ALL RIGHT. DO YOU HAVE ANY

		Page 88
15:49:09	1	OTHER OPINIONS CONCERNING A AND B OTHER THAN WHAT
15:49:11	2	YOU TESTIFIED TO?
15:49:12	3	MR. POMERANTZ: OBJECTION; ASKED
15:49:13	4	AND ANSWERED.
15:49:14	5	BY MR. BUSCH:
15:49:14	6	Q. "NO"?
15:49:15	7	A. NO.
15:49:17	8	Q. ALL RIGHT. AS TO THE SULLIVAN
15:49:32	9	REPORT, LET'S GET THAT ONE IN FRONT OF YOU NOW.
15:49:37	10	AS TO THE FIRST SENTENCE THAT YOU
15:49:40	11	WERE BEING DESIGNATED ON, WHICH IS ON PAGE 12, DO
15:49:43	12	YOU HAVE ANY OTHER OPINIONS ABOUT THAT OTHER THAN
15:49:46	13	WHAT YOU'VE TESTIFIED TO OR ANY BASES FOR YOUR
15:49:47	14	OPINIONS OTHER THAN WHAT YOU TESTIFIED TO?
15:49:48	15	A. WHICH SENTENCE?
15:49:49	16	Q. "MOREOVER, EVEN IF THE
15:49:51	17	MECHANICAL ROYALTIES PARAGRAPH
15:49:53	18	CONTAIN A DIRECT MECHANICAL
15:49:54	19	LICENSE FOR PHYSICAL PRODUCTS,
15:49:56	20	WHICH IT DOES NOT, IT IN NO WAY
15:49:57	21	CAN BE INTERPRETED TO APPLY TO
15:49:58	22	D.P.D.'S."
15:49:59	23	DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING ELSE TO OFFER
15:50:01	24	BEYOND WHAT I ASKED YOU ABOUT INITIALLY?
	25	A. I THINK GENERALLY I DESCRIBED MY

	Page 91
1	2
2)SS COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES)
3	
4	
5	
6	DEPONENT'S DECLARATION
7	
8	
9	
10	I CERTIFY UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY THAT THE
11	FOREGOING IS TRUE AND CORRECT.
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	EXECUTED AT ON
17	
18	
19	
20	(SIGNATURE OF DEPONENT)
21	(BIONATORE OF BELONENT)
22	
23	
24	
25	

	Page 92
1	STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
2)SS COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES)
3	
4	I, SAMANTHA MARGARET AVENAIM, CERTIFIED
5	SHORTHAND REPORTER, CERTIFICATE NUMBER 10627, FOR
6	THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, HEREBY CERTIFY:
7	THE FOREGOING PROCEEDINGS WERE TAKEN BEFORE
8	ME AT THE TIME AND PLACE THEREIN SET FORTH, AT
9	WHICH TIME THE DEPONENT WAS PLACED UNDER OATH BY
10	ME;
11	THE TESTIMONY OF THE DEPONENT AND ALL
12	OBJECTIONS MADE AT THE TIME OF THE EXAMINATION
13	WERE RECORDED STENOGRAPHICALLY BY ME AND WERE
14	THEREAFTER TRANSCRIBED;
15	THE FOREGOING TRANSCRIPT IS A TRUE AND
16	CORRECT TRANSCRIPT OF MY SHORTHAND NOTES SO TAKEN;
17	I FURTHER CERTIFY THAT I AM NEITHER COUNSEL
18	FOR NOR RELATED TO ANY PARTY TO SAID ACTION, NOR
19	IN ANY WAY INTERESTED IN THE OUTCOME THEREOF.
20	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I HAVE HEREUNTO
21	SUBSCRIBED MY NAME THIS 24TH DAY OF NOVEMBER,
22	2008.
23	
24	
25	