

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

---

BRENDA BILLINGS-CARTER,  
as personal representative of the estate of Ann Billings,

Plaintiff,

v.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Defendant.

---

Case No. 1:10-cv-792

HONORABLE PAUL L. MALONEY

**JUDGMENT**

Final judgment is hereby entered in favor of defendant United States of America and against plaintiff Brenda Billings-Carter as personal representative of the estate of Ann Billings.

**IT IS SO ORDERED** on this 3<sup>rd</sup> day of November 2010.

/s/ Paul L. Maloney  
Honorable Paul L. Maloney  
Chief United States District Judge