

1 **Marquis Aurbach Coffing**
2 CRAIG R. ANDERSON, ESQ.
3 Nevada Bar No. 6882
4 10001 Park Run Drive
5 Las Vegas, Nevada 89145
6 Telephone: (702) 382-0711
7 Facsimile: (702) 382-5816
8 canderson@maclaw.com

9 Attorneys for Defendant LVMPD

10 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

11 **DISTRICT OF NEVADA**

12 CELESTINE GIBSON,

13 Plaintiff,

14 Case No.: 2:12-cv-00900-GMN (CWH)

15 vs.

16 LAS VEGAS METROPOLITAN POLICE
17 DEPARTMENT, a political subdivision of the
18 State of Nevada; OFFICER JESUS AREVALO,
19 individually; SERGEANT MICHAEL
20 HNATUICK, individually and LIEUTENANT
21 DAVID DOCKENDORF, individually,

22 Defendants.

23 **PROTECTIVE ORDER**

24 Plaintiff seeks to obtain, inspect and copy documents and/or things which the Las Vegas
25 Metropolitan Police Department (“LVMPD”) contends contains private and sensitive
26 information, confidential information of LVMPD, its officers and employees, its internal
27 investigative and administrative actions, and other confidential information. Pursuant to an
28 agreement by the Parties, the Court hereby enters the following Order for Protection (“Protective
Order”):

29 **TERMS OF PROTECTIVE ORDER**

30 **I. DEFINITIONS**

31 The following definitions apply to the Protective Order:

32 1. Party. Any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees,
33 consultants, Experts, and Outside Counsel. Party, as used in this Protective Order, shall also
34 refer to the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department, and its officers, agents and employees.

1 2. Disclosure or Discovery Material. All items or information, regardless of the
2 medium or manner generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony,
3 transcripts, or tangible things) that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to
4 discovery in this matter.

5 3. “Confidential” Information or Items. Information (regardless of how generated,
6 stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under the law enforcement
7 investigative and/or official information privileges, or that contain Criminal History Information,
8 personal information regarding individuals including Social Security Numbers, dates of birth and
9 information which a person would have a reasonable expectation of privacy. Confidential
10 information shall also include information concerning, regarding, or as a result of covert or
11 undercover law enforcement investigation(s) technique(s), method(s) or source(s), including the
12 identity of any confidential informant, undercover officer information, or information referring
13 to any undercover or active criminal investigations. Further, Confidential information shall also
14 include any information protected from disclosure under Donrey v. Bradshaw, 106 Nev. 630
15 (1990) or an official or executive information privilege. Confidential information shall also
16 include employee information, employee medical information, and employee disciplinary action,
17 including any internal investigation concerning employee actions.

18 4. Receiving Party. A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material or
19 Confidential Information from a Producing Party.

20 5. Producing Party. A Party or third-party that produces Disclosure or Discovery
21 Material or Confidential Information in this action.

22 6. Designating Party. A Party or third-party that designates information or items
23 that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “Confidential.”

24 7. Protected Material. Any Disclosure or Discovery Material or Confidential
25 Information that is designated as “Confidential.”

26 8. Outside Counsel. Attorneys who are not employees of a Party but who are
27 retained to represent or advise a Party in this action.

28 9. House Counsel. Attorneys who are employees of a Party.

1 10. Counsel (without qualifier). Outside Counsel and House Counsel (as well as their
2 support staffs).

3 11. Expert. A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent
4 to the litigation retained by a Party or its Counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant
5 in this action. This definition includes, but is not limited to, a professional jury or trial consultant
6 retained in connection with this litigation.

7 12. Professional Vendor. Person or entity that provides litigation support services
8 (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, organizing,
9 storing, retrieving data in any form or medium; etc.) and its employees and subcontractors.

10 13. The use of the singular form of any word includes the plural, and vice versa.

11 **II. SCOPE**

12 The protection conferred by this Protective Order covers not only Protected Material, but
13 also any information copied or extracted therefrom, as well as all copies excerpts, summaries, or
14 compilations thereof, testimony, conversations, or presentations by parties or counsel to or in
15 court or in other settings that might reveal Protected Material.

16 **III. DURATION**

17 Even after the termination of this action, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this
18 Protective Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a
19 court order otherwise directs.

20 **IV. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

21 1. Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided herein, or as
22 otherwise ordered, material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly
23 designated before it is disclosed or produced. Designations in conformity with this Order
24 require:

25 a. For information in documentary form. That the Producing Party
26 shall affix the legend “Confidential” on each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
27 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also
28 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate makings in the

1 margins or redacting protected portions). A Producing Party that makes original documents or
2 materials available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting
3 Party has indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
4 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed
5 “Confidential.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and
6 produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for
7 protection under this Order, and, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party
8 must affix the appropriate legend on each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
9 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also
10 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriated markings in the
11 margins or by redacting protected portions).

1 “Confidential.” If only portions of the information or item warrant protection, the Producing
2 Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portions.

3 2. Inadvertent Failure to Designate. Inadvertent failure to identify documents or
4 things as “Confidential” pursuant to this Protective Order shall not constitute a waiver of any
5 otherwise valid claim for protection, provided that the provisions of this paragraph are satisfied.
6 If the Designating Party discovers that information should have been but was not designated
7 “Confidential” or if the Designating Party receives notice that would enable the Designating
8 Party to learn that it has disclosed such information, the Designating Party must immediately
9 notify all other parties. In such event, within thirty (30) days of notifying all other Parties, the
10 Designating Party must also provide copies of the “Confidential” information designated in
11 accordance with this Protective Order. After receipt of such re-designated information, the
12 “Confidential” information shall be treated as required by this Protective Order, and the
13 Receiving Party shall promptly, but in no event more than fourteen (14) calendar days from the
14 receipt of the re-designated information, return to the Designating Party all previously produced
15 copies of the same unlegended documents or things. The Designating Party and the Parties may
16 agree to alternative means. The Receiving Party shall receive no liability, under this Protective
17 Order or otherwise, for any disclosure of information contained in unlegended documents or
18 things occurring before the Receiving Party was placed on notice of the Designating Party’s
19 claims of confidentiality.

20 V. **CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

21 1. Meet and Confer. A Party that elects to initiate a challenge to a Designating
22 Party’s confidentiality designation must do so in good faith and must begin the process by
23 conferring with counsel for the Designating Party. The challenging Party must give the
24 Designating Party an opportunity of not less than ten (10) calendar days to review the designated
25 material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in the designations is offered, to
26 explain in writing the basis for the confidentiality designation.

27 2. Judicial Intervention. A Party that elects to press a challenge to a confidentiality
28 designation after considering the justification offered by the Designating Party may file and

1 serve a motion that identifies the challenged material and sets forth in detail the basis for the
2 challenge. Until the Court rules on the challenge, all parties shall continue to afford the material
3 in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation.

4 **VI. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

5 1. Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed
6 or produced by another Party or by a third-party in connection with this case solely for the
7 limited purposes of prosecuting, defending, attempting to settle, or settling this action. Such
8 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions
9 described in the Protective Order. Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a
10 Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the
11 persons authorized under this Protective Order.

12 2. Disclosure of "Confidential" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by
13 the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any
14 information or item designated Confidential only to:

15 a. The Parties to this action and the Receiving Party's Outside
16 Counsel of record in this action, as well as employees of said Counsel to whom it is reasonably
17 necessary to disclose the information for this litigation. Counsel of Record shall be responsible
18 for advising all of their staff of the existence of, and their confidentiality obligations under, the
19 Protective Order, and shall be responsible for any non-compliance with the Protective Order by
20 members of their staff that have not signed an agreement to be bound by the Protective Order;

21 b. The officers, directors, and employees of the Receiving Party to
22 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed or have agreed
23 under oath and on the record to be bound by the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order"
24 (Exhibit A);

25 c. Experts of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably
26 necessary for this litigation and who have signed or have agreed under oath and on the record to
27 be bound by the "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A);

28 d. The Court and its personnel;

1 e. Court reporters, their staffs, and Professional Vendors to whom
2 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation;

3 f. During their depositions or at trial, witnesses in the action to whom
4 disclosure is reasonably necessary. Witnesses will not be permitted to retain copies of Protected
5 Material unless they have signed or agreed under oath and on the record to be bound by the
6 "Agreement to Be Bound by Protective Order" (Exhibit A). Upon request of a Designating
7 Party, pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected
8 Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone
9 except as permitted under this Protective Order; and

10 g. The author of the document or the original source of the
11 information and recipients or addressees in the normal course of business.

12 Notwithstanding the preceding of this paragraph VI(2), a Party that has produced its, his
13 or her own Protected Material may disclose such Protected Material to any persons, with or
14 without any conditions placed upon such disclosure, as the Party deems appropriate.

15 3. Trial and Dispositive Motion Disclosure: For the purpose of trial and/or
16 dispositive motions, the parties acknowledge that a “strong presumption in favor of access”
17 exists. A party seeking to seal a judicial record at trial and/or the dispositive motions stage bears
18 the burden of establishing “compelling reasons” by “articulating compelling reasons supported
19 by specific factual findings,” that outweigh the public policies favoring disclosure.¹

20 4. Disclosure of Possession of Confidential Information. All persons described in
21 paragraph VI above shall not under any circumstances sell, offer for sale, advertise, or publicize
22 either the Confidential Information or the fact that such persons have obtained Confidential
23 Information.

24 **VII. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN**
25 **OTHER LITIGATION**

26 If a Receiving Party is served with a subpoena or an order issued in other litigation that

¹ See Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1178-79 (9th Cir. 2006).

1 would compel disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "Confidential"
2 the Receiving Party must so notify the Designating Party, in writing (by fax or email if possible)
3 immediately and in no event more than seven (7) calendar days after receiving the subpoena or
4 order. Such notification must include a copy of the subpoena or court order. The Receiving
5 Party also must within ten (10) calendar days inform in writing the party who caused the
6 subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all the material covered by the
7 subpoena or order is the subject of this Protective Order and deliver to such party a copy of this
8 Protective Order. The Designating Party shall bear the burdens and the expenses of seeking
9 protection in that court of its Confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be
10 construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to disobey a lawful
11 directive from another court. Once notice is given, and five business days have elapsed, the
12 receiving party shall have no further liability for disclosure pursuant to a subpoena or its
13 equivalent.

14 **VIII. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

15 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected
16 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Protective Order, the
17 Receiving Party must immediately and within not more than seven (7) calendar days: (a) notify
18 in writing (using best efforts to use email or fax) the Designating Party of the unauthorized
19 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the
20 person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of the Protective
21 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement
22 to Be Bound" (Exhibit A). The Receiving Party shall promptly notify the Designating Party of
23 the results of its efforts with regards to (b), (c), and (d) herein. After a good faith meet and
24 confer effort to resolve and remaining disputes concerning compliance with this paragraph, and
25 Party, Receiving Party or Designating Party may seek relief from this Court for non-compliance
26 with this provision. Said relief may include, but is not limited to, preclusion of the Receiving
27 Party's use in this litigation of the Protected Material that was disclosed contrary to this
28 Protective Order, or any other sanction deemed appropriate by the Court.

IX. PUBLICLY AVAILABLE OR PREVIOUSLY POSSESSED INFORMATION

The restrictions in the preceding paragraphs regarding disclosure or Protected Material do not and shall not apply to information or material that: was, is, or becomes public knowledge in a manner other than by violation of the Protective Order, is acquired by the non-designating party from a third-party having the right to disclose such information or material; or was lawfully possessed by the non-designating party before the date of this Protective Order. The Designating Party shall act in good faith to notify the Receiving Party of any change in circumstances that renders Confidential Information or Items no longer Confidential within a reasonable time period after the change becomes known to the Designating Party.

X. FILING PROTECTED MATERIAL

With respect to non-dispositive motions and pleadings, Protected Material or information derived therefrom is included with, or the contents of such a document are disclosed in, any documents filed with the Clerk or this Court or any other court, the filing Party shall file said document under seal. Unless otherwise agreed by the Parties to permit service by some other means such as by email or facsimile, copies of any pleading, brief or other document containing Protected Material that is served on opposing counsel shall be delivered in a sealed envelope stamped:

CONFIDENTIAL PURSUANT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER

and shall be treated in accordance with the provisions of this Protective Order. Subject to the Court's convenience and needs, all material files in this fashion will be kept under seal by the Clerk until further order from the Court.

XI. FINAL DISPOSITION

Unless otherwise ordered or agreed in writing by the Producing Party, within sixty (60) calendar days of a written request, after the final termination of this action, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other form of reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. With permission in writing from the Designating Party, the Receiving Party may destroy some or all of the Protected Material instead

1 of returning it. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party
2 must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity,
3 to the Designating Party) by the thirty (30) calendar day deadline that identifies (by category,
4 where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and that affirms that
5 the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or other
6 forms of reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision,
7 Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, transcripts, legal
8 memoranda, correspondence or attorney work product, even if such materials contain Protected
9 Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject
10 to this Protective Order as set forth herein. In the event of an appeal, "Final Disposition" shall
11 not occur until the conclusion of all appeals.

12 **XII. ADDITIONAL PROVISIONS**

13 1. Modification. The Parties may modify this Protective Order by written
14 agreement, subject to approval by the Court. The Court may modify this Protective Order.

15 2. Right to Assert Other Objections. This Protective Order does not affect or waive
16 any right that any Party otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any
17 information or item on any ground not addressed in this Protective Order. Similarly, this
18 Protective Order does not affect or waive any Party's right to object on any ground to use in
19 evidence any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

20 3. Privileges Not Waived. This Protective Order does not affect or waive any
21 applicable privilege or work product protection, or affect the ability of a Producing Party to seek
22 relief for an inadvertent disclosure of material protected by privilege or work product protection.

23 4. Third Party Protections. Any witness or other person, firm, or entity from which
24 discovery is sought may be informed of and may obtain the protection of this Protective Order by
25 written notice to the Parties' respective counsel or by oral notice at the time of any deposition or
26 similar proceeding.

27 5. Obligations to Third Parties. Nothing herein shall operate to relieve any Party or
28 non-party from any pre-existing confidentiality obligations currently owed by any Party or non-

1 party to any other Party or non-party.

2 6. Retention of Completed “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” Forms
3 (Exhibit A). Completed “Acknowledgement and Agreement to Be Bound” Forms (Exhibit A)
4 (“form”) shall be maintained by the Party that obtained the completed form pursuant to this
5 Protective Order. The Party retaining the completed form shall produce the form to resolve any
6 good faith challenge by a Party or Designating Party or dispute concerning whether a person who
7 is obligated under this Protective Order to complete the form did so properly and complied with
8 the representations in the form and this Protective Order. If the parties are unable to resolve any
9 such disputes or challenges through a good faith meet and confer process, the challenging Party
10 or Designating Party may seek appropriate relief from this Court.

11 IT IS SO ORDERED THIS 3rd day of October, 2012.

Chris H.

1

EXHIBIT A

2

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3 I, _____, have read in its entirety and understand the Protective Order that was
4 issued by the United States District Court, for the District of Nevada on _____, 2012,
5 in the case of *Gibson v. LVMPD, et al.*, Case No. 2:12-cv-00900-GMN (CWH). I agree to
6 comply with and to be bound by all terms of this Protective Order and I understand and
7 acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the
8 nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or
9 item that is subject to this Protective Order that any person entity except in strict compliance
10 with the provisions of this Order. Further, I solemnly promise that I will not offer to sell,
11 advertise or publicize that I have obtained any Protected Material subject to this Protective
12 Order.

13

At the conclusion of this matter, I will return all Protected Material which came into my
possession to counsel for the party from whom I received the Protected Material, or I will
destroy those materials. I understand that any Confidential Information contained within any
summaries of Protected Material shall remain protected pursuant to the terms of this Order.

17

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court, for the
District of Nevada for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Protective Order, even if such
enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

20

I certify under the penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

21

Date: _____

22

City and State where signed: _____

23

Printed name: _____

24

Address: _____

25

Signature: _____

26

27

28