Dockets.Justia.com

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
2	DISTRICT OF NEVADA		
3	Anthony Ruben Aldo Barbieri,	Case No.: 2:18-cv-00355-JAD-EJY	
4	Plaintiff		
5	v.	Order Setting Aside Defaults and	
6	Timeshare Liquidators, LLC; Stan Mullis,	Directing Answer	
7	Defendant	[ECF Nos. 22, 31]	
8	Pro se plaintiff Anthony Ruben Aldo Barbieri brings this action against his former		
9	employer and manager for retaliation and hostile work environment. When the defendants failed		
10	to answer or otherwise defend this suit, the Clerk of Court entered default against them. ¹		
11	Barbieri now moves for a default judgment, ² and the defendants countermove to set aside the		
	default, explaining that they mistakenly believed that their (now-replaced) attorney was actively		
	defending on their behalf. ³ Because I find good cause to set aside the default, I grant the		
	countermotion, deny Barbieri's motion for default judgment, and permit this case to proceed on		
	its merits.		
16			
17			
	finds good cause to do so." ⁴ "The court's discretion is especially broad where, as here, it is entry		
Barbieri v. Timesh	of default that is being set aside, rather than a default judgment." ⁵ In general, "[w]here timely Doc. 32		
20			
	 21 ¹ ECF No. 15. ² ECF No. 22. ³ ECF No. 31. ⁴ Mendoza v. Wight Vineyard Mgmt., 783 F.2d 941, 945 (9th Cir. 1986). 		
23			
	⁵ O'Connor v. State of Nev., 27 F.3d 357, 364 (9t	ch Cir. 1994).	

relief is sought from a default . . . and the movant has a meritorious defense, doubt, if any, should
 be resolved in favor of the motion to set aside default so that cases may be decided on the
 merits."⁶ In determining whether to set aside a default, the "court should consider whether: (1)
 the plaintiff would be prejudiced by setting aside the default; (2) the defendant has a meritorious
 defense; and (3) the defendant's culpable conduct led to the default."⁷

The set-aside factors weigh in favor of granting Timeshare and Mullis relief from the 6 7 Clerk's entry of default. Defendants have established that no true prejudice would befall Barbieri if the default is set aside. They have also demonstrated that they have a meritorious 8 9 defense by noting that Barbieri's claims were rejected in state-court-affirmed administrative 10 proceedings before the Nevada Department of Employment Training and Rehabilitation, which found that Barbieri was terminated for misconduct or voluntarily left his position without good 11 12 cause.⁸ And I cannot conclude that defendants' culpable conduct led to the default because they reasonably believed that hired counsel was handling their defense, as she provided assurances 13 that she was doing so and was actively working on their behalf on other matters where her 14 15 efforts were successful.⁹ They replaced counsel as soon as they were alerted to her negligence 16 by receiving a copy of Barbieri's motion for default judgment. As the Ninth Circuit recognized in Community Dental Services v. Tani, granting default relief and permitting the case to proceed 17 on its merits "may often constitute the only mechanism for affording a client actual and full relief 18 19

20

21

⁶ Id.

²²⁷ *Id.* (citing *Falk v. Allen*, 739 F.2d 461, 463 (9th Cir. 1984)).

23 8 ECF No. 31 at 3, ECF No. 31-2 (referee findings).

⁹ See ECF No. 31-5 at 3 (Mullis declaration).

1	from his counsel's gross negligence" ¹⁰ In sum, I find good cause to set aside the Clerk's		
2	entry of default and permit this case to proceed on its merits.		
3	Conclusion		
4	Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the Motion for Default Judgment [ECF		
5	5 No. 22] is DENIED, and the Countermotion to Set Aside Defaults [ECF No. 31] is GRANTED.		
6	6 Defendants have until April 13, 2020, to answer or otherwise respond to the complaint.		
7	Dated: April 3, 2020		
8	U.S. District Judge Jennifer A. IDorsey		
9	0.5. District stage jeininter in ipolisey		
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23	¹⁰ Community Dental Services v. Tani, 282 F.3d 1164, 1172 (9th Cir. 2002) (setting aside a default judgment).		
	3		