## Exhibit A

Doc. 105 Att. 3

CENTER FOR SCIENCE IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST v. THE COCA-COLA COMPANY et al

### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY CAMDEN VICINAGE

LINDA FRANULOVIC, individually and on behalf of a class of persons,	)	CIVIL NO. 1:07-cv-00539-RMB-JS
Plaintiff,	)	CLASS ACTION
v.	)	Decoment Electronically Filed
THE COCA-COLA COMPANY,	)	Document Electronically Filed
Defendant.	)	

#### **DECLARATION OF JOSHUA L. BECKER**

I, Joshua L. Becker, declare and say that I am counsel for The Coca-Cola Company in the above-referenced litigation. I make this declaration based on my personal knowledge.

The attached pages are a true and correct copy of the deposition testimony of Linda Franulovic that is cited in the Brief in Support of The Coca-Cola Company's Motion for Summary Judgment

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on this 28th day of January, 2009 in Atlanta, Georgia.

Jospua L. Becker

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY CAMDEN VICINAGE

LINDA FRANULOVIC, individually and on behalf of a class of persons,

CIVIL NO.:

Plaintiff,

1:07-cv-00539-RMB-JS

v.

CLASS ACTION

THE COCA-COLA COMPANY,

Defendant.

DEPOSITION OF

LINDA FRANULOVIC

TAKEN ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANT

September 30, 2008

9:05 a.m.

1100 Southeast 17th Street

Room 1120

Fort Lauderdale, Florida

Terri J. Flicek, Shorthand Reporter

```
2
1
                       APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL
 2
     On behalf of the Plaintiff:
3
          CENTER FOR SCIENCE IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST
4
          STEPHEN GARDNER, ESQ.
          5646 Milton Street, Suite 211
5
          Dallas, Texas 75206
          214-827-2774
6
          214-827-2787
          cspinet.org
 7
     On behalf of the Defendant:
8
          ALSTON & BIRD, LLP
 9
          SCOTT A. ELDER, ESQ.
          1201 West Peachtree Street
10
          Atlanta, Georgia 30309
          404-881-7000
11
          404-881-7777
          scott.elder@alston.com
12
13
14
     Also Present:
15
          SHANI C. THOME, The Coca-Cola Company
          NABINA J. SINHA, Nestle, U.S.A.
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

Α.

Q.

Α.

of '07?

22

23

24

25

32 Α. No. 1 In February of 2007 how often did you exercise? 2 Q. Four times a week. Α. 3 And what did you do for exercise? Q. 4 Α. Tae Bo and running. 5 Q. Were you a member of a gym? 6 No. Α. 7 Q. So in February of 2007 these habits that we've 8 talked about, your eating and your exercise, were those 9 new habits for you or things that you had been doing for 10 awhile? 11 Things that I had been doing for awhile. Α. 1.2 Okay. And how much did you weigh in February of 13 2007? 14 I don't know, approximately, I don't weigh Α. 15 myself. 16 17 And between November of 2006 and May of 2007 how did your weight change, if at all? 18 I gained five pounds. 19 Is there a particular reason that you remember 20 that? 21

Because I was trying to lose five pounds.

No, I just know my clothes were tight.

But you don't know what you weighed in February

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

18

20

21

22

23

24

Q. You talked about Mike and Ike's candy, did you eat any other candy, anything else, anything like that, this is in February of 2007?

MR. GARDNER: Object to the form of the question, can you get a little more descriptive on anything like that? I think you're saying junk food, will you do that?

- Q. Junk food is a good description, we'll go with junk food.
- A. No junk food. For some reason I only eat candy at night right before I go to bed.
  - Q. Don't eat ice cream?
- 12 A. No.
  - Q. Chocolate chip cookies?
  - A. No.
    - Q. Snack Wells, anything like that?
- A. Maybe something homemade if my mom and grandma
  made it, maybe.
  - Q. How often did you eat out in February of 2007?
- 19 A. Once a month.
  - Q. Ms. Franulovic, would you agree that in February of 2007 you were aware that whether you gain or lose weight is a function of how many calories you take in versus how many calories you expend or use up?
    - A. Is a function? Can you rephrase that?
- Q. Okay. Would you agree that in February of 2007

you understood, you knew, that whether or not your weight went up or down, you gained or lost weight, was a function of how many calories you took in versus how many calories you used up?

#### A. Yes?

MR. GARDNER: Object to the form of the question, could you define function?

MR. ELDER: The question has been asked and answered, Steve.

 $$\operatorname{MR}.$$  GARDNER: I have objected to it, I gave you the opportunity to fix it.

MR. ELDER: You can object to form, it's a proper question.

- Q. (By Mr. Elder) Is it fair to say that while you were drinking Inviga you don't know how many calories you were taking in on a daily basis?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Tell me about the first time you purchased a can of Inviga.
  - A. What led up to it?
  - Q. Yes, just tell me about buying it.
- A. I went into the Wa Wa and I saw it in the aisle, and I picked it up and took it to the counter and paid for it.
  - Q. Did you see any, when you say you saw it in the

- A. I don't know.
- Q. When you say you don't know, do you mean that while you were drinking Inviga in 2007 you didn't know how many calories you thought that it would burn?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. You said that eventually you started drinking it every day, so I want to piece in between buying that first can and drinking in every day. Give me an idea of the time frame there, and you know, did you, after that first can did you buy more cans immediately, you know, was it a little while later? Do you understand what I'm asking? I'm just trying to understand how your purchases developed over time. So after that first can, tell me in as much detail what you remember happened next.
- MR. GARDNER: Object to form. For form reasons, do you mind a brief statement, just object, form?
  - MR. ELDER: I think the rules require it.
- MR. GARDNER: Instead of object to the form of the question, can I say object, form?
  - MR. ELDER: I got you
  - MR. GARDNER: I need a yes.
  - MR. ELDER: Yes.
  - Q. (By Mr. Elder) You can answer.
- A. I bought one can and I continued to buy one can every day.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

22

23

24

42

- Q. Is there any particular amount of weight that you believed you were going to lose by drinking Inviga?
  - A. No.
- Q. Did you know, you commented earlier about, I think you said it was 3,200 calories, the number of calories that make up a pound, do you recall that earlier?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Were you aware in 2007 when you were drinking Inviga how many calories you have to take out of your diet, eliminate, in order to lose one pound?
  - A. No.
- Q. Ms. Franulovic, I have marked as Exhibit 1 to your deposition a copy of the second amended class action complaint in this case, have you seen that document before today?
- (Defendant's Exhibit 1 was marked for identification.)
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. When did you see it first?
- 20 A. I don't remember, I don't remember which one this 21 is.
  - Q. Have you seen several of these over --
  - A. Yes.
    - Q. -- since you've been involved in this litigation?
- 25 A. Yes.

caloric consumption results in losing weight, do you believe that to be true?

- A. Yes.
- Q. To your understanding, you know, in your mind, to your knowledge, is there a difference between burning calories and reducing caloric consumption?
  - A. Yes.
  - Q. What's the difference?
- A. When you burn calories, when I burn calories I should say, I'm working out, and if you're working out, specifically weight training, it helps you to burn calories even while standing still, so that Inviga was supposed to increase that, if you're just reducing calories you could put yourself in a state of starvation, which actually reduces your metabolism, which you could gain weight and not lose weight at all.
- Q. Do you believe that reducing caloric consumption can result in losing weight?
  - A. It can, yes.
  - Q. And that's commonly referred to as dieting?
- A. Yes.
- Q. You understand and understood in February of 2007 that one thing people do to lose weight is reduce caloric consumption?
- 25 A. Yes.

45 And have you ever done that yourself? 1 Α. Yes. 2 Were you doing that in February of 2007? Q. 3 Yes. Α. 4 And how were you trying to reduce your caloric 5 consumption? 6 Cutting out the Mike and Ike's. Α. 7 Anything else? 8 Q, Α. No. 9 Your diet generally that you've described for me, 10 do you consider that a way of reducing caloric 11 consumption? 12 Yes. Wait, I'm sorry, say that again. Α. 13 Your diet that you generally described for me is 14 -- Let me put this way. In February of 2007 were you 15 trying to eat healthy? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Were you trying to eat foods that you believed 18 had a lower caloric content than alternative foods, than 19 foods you weren't eating? 20 Α. No. It --21 Q. Go ahead. 22 I don't care about calories, I care more about 23 fat and protein. 24

So in your personal diet, the way you believe you

either lose weight or don't gain weight is to control the amount of fat and protein you're taking in?

- A. Yes.
- Q. The end of this sentence where it says, Or at least offsetting weight gain from other calories, what does that mean?
- A. Offsetting weight gain, it means to tip the scales.
  - Q. I'm sorry?
- A. To tip the scales, to work in the opposite direction. You're asking me to define a portion of a sentence?
- Q. I'm asking you what that means to you in terms of this, this is an allegation in your complaint, in terms of this lawsuit.
- A. I don't understand how else it can be explained except the way it's written.
- Q. Okay. Was it your interpretation of the Inviga advertising that you could eat or drink whatever you wanted and as long as you were also drinking Inviga you would lose weight?
  - A. No.
  - Q. Why not?
- A. Because that doesn't make sense. You're saying I can drink a milkshake and Inviga and still lose weight,

right, that's what you're trying to say?

- Q. Right.
- A. That's wrong.
- Q. And you understood that that was wrong --
- A. Yes.
- Q. Let me finish my question.

You understood that was wrong the entire time you were drinking Inviga?

- A. Yes.
- Q. And the reason that's wrong is because you understood that even while you were drinking Inviga, if the other calories you were taking in put you in this state of taking in too many calories over the whole day, you would still gain weight?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. From your description of your diet, to me it sounds to me like you pay a fair amount of attention to what you eight, would that be a fair characterization?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Let me turn with you to Paragraph 19, Paragraph 19, the part I want to ask you about is in the second sentence there, I'm not going to read the whole thing, but it says, basically it says drinking three cans of Inviga every day over a lengthy period of time. And it's the over a lengthy period of time that I want to ask you

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

12

13

20

23

A. I don't think so.

(Defendant's Exhibit 12 was marked for

3 identification.)

- Q. And the last one here is Exhibit 12, do you know whether or not you've seen Exhibit 12 before?
  - A. I don't know.
- Q. For how long did you drink three cans of Inviga per day?
  - A. Maybe two and-a-half months.
- Q. How many times did you weigh yourself during that time period?
  - A. Zero.
    - Q. Do you ever drink diet soda?
- 14 A. No.
- Q. Bottled water?
- 16 A. Yes.
- Q. And do you ever drink bottled water instead of drinking other things that have calories in it like juice or tea or soda?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Will drinking bottled water make you lose weight?
  - A. No.
- Q. Why not?
- A. Because your body needs water, you have to drink

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

19

22

23

24

water, it's not designed to make you lose weight, there's nothing in it.

- Q. If you drank bottled water instead of drinking orange juice, do you believe it would make you lose weight?
- A. If you drank orange juice all the time, your entire life, and then stopped drinking it and then drank water? Yes.
  - Q. Because water has fewer calories?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Would making that change in your diet, do you believe, be a guarantee of weight loss?
  - A. No. Oh, yes, I'm sorry.
- 14 Q. You believe that would be a guarantee of weight loss?
- 16 A. Is that the one thing you're going to change?
- 17 Q. If you change that one thing, do you believe it would be a guarantee of weight loss?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. No matter what else you did?
- 21 A. No.
  - Q. So it would depend on what else you were eating and drinking?
  - A. Yes.
- 25 Q. By the same token, you would agree that you never

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

16

17

18

20

21

22

23

86

thought that drinking Inviga was a guarantee of weight loss; is that fair?

- A. Yes.
- Q. I'm going to mark as a composite exhibit a printout, and some of this is hard to read so I apologize for that, but a printout of the Inviga website as Exhibit 13.

(Defendant's Exhibit 13 was marked for identification.)

- Q. Have you ever been to the Inviga website?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. You've never logged on to Inviga.com?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Ever?
- 15 A. No.
  - Q. Let me ask you to flip to what's marked, you see the little numbers at the bottom of the page, those are called Bates Numbers, it's Bates Number 1740.
- 19 A. I'm there.
  - Q. This is just a picture of the back of the can that happens to come from the website, but you have seen the back of the can before, correct?
    - A. Yes.
- Q. The top line there begins, Inviga is a delicious and refreshing sparkling green tea that invigorates your

Individual results may vary. Below that it says, Drinking more than three cans per day will not have an additional effect.

All of that that I just read, beginning with three cans and ending with additional effect, you read at some point while you were drinking Inviga, correct?

- A. Uh-huh, yes.
- Q. Was it your understanding that the calorie burning effect of drinking Inviga would be in the range of 60 to 100 calories while you were drinking Inviga in 2007?
  - A. Yes.
- Q. Do you know whether or not on any given day in 2007 that you drank Inviga you, in fact, reduced your total caloric intake for that day by 100 calories?
  - A. No.
- Q. And I believe you told me earlier that you don't know, and again we're talking about in 2007, you don't know how many calories you were taking in or trying to take in on a daily basis, right?
  - A. Right.
- Q. Without counting your calories how would you know whether or not Inviga was burning calories?
- A. Well, I was looking to increase my metabolism, so I was just going by that, and I know I wanted to lose a few pounds, five pounds, whatever, and it was right after

anything?

MR. ELDER: I mean eating anything.

MR. GARDNER: So if she had something that day that wasn't Inviga --

- A. -- that also contained calorie burning qualities? No.
  - Q. No.
  - A. Say it again.
- Q. On any given day that you drank Inviga, how would you know that you didn't eat or drink something that otherwise put you, for the day, for the total day, in a situation where you weren't reducing your overall calories?
  - A. I don't know.
- Q. If you could turn with me to Page 1745, and this is in very small print, a picture of the Inviga website as of April 4, 2007, and under, Another simple positive choice, and you've never read this before because you never went to the website, right?
  - A. Right.
- Q. And that sentence says, It's a fact that incorporating balanced nutrition and more activity into your lifestyle is the best way to stay healthy and much smarter than following fads, quick fixes and crash diets. Do you agree with that sentence?

- A. Yes.
- Q. Do you find it misleading in any way?
- A. No.
- Q. It goes on to say, That's why Inviga isn't designed to be a magic bullet. What does that mean to you?
- A. Exactly what it says, that you can't just drink Inviga and drop weight.
- Q. If you could flip with me to Page 1762, this is the section under frequently asked questions, and one of the questions says, Is Inviga recommended as part of a diet or weight loss program? Inviga is one of many helpful things that can be incorporated into an overall balanced lifestyle. Inviga is designed to compliment not replace regular exercise, a good diet and other healthy choices you make throughout the day --

(Discussion off the record.)

- Q. The question and answer that I just read to you, do you believe that that question and answer is misleading in any way?
  - A. No.
- Q. You mentioned in your interrogatory responses that you, let me turn to the response, Paragraph 9, if you'll flip back --
  - A. Which one, 1, 2?