RECEIVED
WILLIAM T. WALSH. CLERK
2007 APR -9 A 10: 58

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

BEFORE THE JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

IN RE PET FOODS PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION))	MDL Docket No. 1850	

PLAINTIFFS JAYME PITTSONBERGER, DAVID CARTER AND JIM BULLOCK'S MOTION FOR TRANSFER AND COORDINATION PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. §1407

Plaintiffs Jayme Pittsonberger, David Carter and Jim Bullock respectfully submit this joint motion before the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation for an Order, under 28 U.S.C. §1407, that (i) transfers thirteen putative class actions, currently pending in the Western District of Washington, Western District of Arkansas, Southern District of Florida, Northern District of Illinois, Eastern District of Tennessee, District of Rhode Island, District of Connecticut, and the Central District of California, as well as any

These cases include: 1) Tom Whaley v. Menu Foods, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-00411 (W.D. Wash.); 2) Stacey Heller, et al. v. Menu Foods, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-00453 (W.D. Wash.); 3) Audrey Kornelius, et al. v. Menu Foods, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-00454 (W.D. Wash.); 4) Suzanne E. Johnson, et al. v. Menu Foods, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-00455 (W.D. Wash.); 5) Michele Suggett, et al. v. Menu Foods, et al., Docket No.

States District Court for the District of New Jersey; and (ii) coordinates these actions with the fifteen similar actions that are currently pending in the District of New Jersey.² In support of this Motion for Transfer and Coordination, Plaintiffs state as follows:

1. The class actions for which transfer and coordination are proposed arise out of the same conduct and allege virtually identical claims. Each action is brought on behalf of a class of purchasers of dog or cat food manufactured by Menu Foods and sold under various labels and alleges that Menu Foods produced contaminated or tainted pet food that sickened their dogs or cats and caused the death of many of them.

07-cv-00457 (W.D. Wash.); 6) Shirley Sexton v. Menu Foods Income Fund, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-01958 (C.D. Cal.); 7) Lauri A. Osborne v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-00469 (D. Conn.); 8) Lizajean Holt v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-00094 (E.D. Tenn.); 9) Carol Brown v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-00115 (D.R.I.); 10) Dawn Majerczyk v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-01543 (N.D. Ill.); 11) Christina Troiano v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-60428 (S.D. Fla.); 12) Charles Ray Sims v. Menu Foods Income Fund, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-05053 (W.D. AK); and 13) Richard Scott Widen v. Menu Foods, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-05055 (W.D. AK) (hereafter the "13 Actions").

² These actions include: 1) Jared Workman, et al. v. Menu Foods Limited, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-01338 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 2) Suzanne Thompson, et al. v. Menu Foods Income Fund, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-01360 (D.N.J.) (Sheridan); 3) Larry Wilson v. Menu Foods Income Fund, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-01456 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 4) Paul Richard, et al. v. Menu Foods Income Fund, Docket No. 07-cv-01457 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 5) Linda Tinker v. Menu Foods, Inc., Docket No. 07-cv-01468 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 6) Janice Bonier et al. v. Menu Foods, Inc., Docket No. 07-cv-01477 (D.N.J.)(Hillman); 7) Julie Hidalgo v. Menu Foods, Inc., Docket No. 07-cv-01488 (D.N.J.)(Hillman); 8) Alexander Nunez v. Menu Foods Limited, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-01490 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 9) Mark Golding v. Menu Foods Limited, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-01521 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 10) Troy Gagliardi v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-01522 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 11) Kami Turturro v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07cv-01523 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 12) Peggy Schneider v. Menu Foods Limited, et al., Docket No. 07-cv-01533 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 13) Jayme Pittsonberger v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-01561 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 14) David Carter v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-01562 (D.N.J.) (Hillman); 15) Jim Bullock v. Menu Foods Inc., et al. Docket No. 07-cv-01579 (D.N.J.) (Hillman).

Page 3 of 15

- This motion is filed on behalf of plaintiffs in the following actions: 1) 2, Jayme Pittsonberger v. Menu Foods Inc., et al, Docket No. 07-cv-01561 (D.N.J.); 2) David Carter v. Menu Foods Inc., et al. Docket No. 07-cv-01562 (D.N.J.); 3) Jim Bullock v. Menu Foods Inc., et al. Docket No. 07-cv-01579 (D.N.J.) all of which are pending in the United States District Court for the District of New Jersey.
- 3. The 13 Actions proposed for transfer herein are the only actions on file outside the District of New Jersey of which Plaintiffs are aware.
- 4. Plaintiffs propose that pretrial proceedings in the 13 Actions be transferred and coordinated in the District of New Jersey where 15 of the 28 related actions are currently pending.
- 5. The centralization of these actions in a single judicial district for coordinated pretrial proceedings will promote the just and efficient conduct of these actions, will serve the convenience of all parties and witnesses and will promote the interests of justice because all actions involve common factual and legal issues, including:
 - whether the Defendants' dog and cat food was materially defective and a. unfit for use as dog or cat food;
 - whether Defendants breached any warranties, express or implied, b. relating to the sale of the dog and cat food;
 - whether Defendants' dog and cat food caused Plaintiffs' and other C. Class members' pets to become ill and die;
 - d. whether Plaintiffs and other Class members have been damaged, and, if so, what is the proper measure thereof;

Page 4 of 15

•

- what is the appropriate form of injunctive, declaratory and other relief. e.
- 6. Coordination of the actions before a single court will conserve judicial resources, reduce litigation costs, prevent potentially inconsistent pretrial rulings, eliminate duplicative discovery and permit the cases to proceed to trial more efficiently.
- 7. All actions are in the very early stages of litigation; no responsive pleadings have been filed nor has any discovery been conducted.
- 8. The proposed transfer and coordination in the District of New Jersey will be for the convenience of parties and witnesses, and will promote the just and efficient conduct of these actions because it is expected that plaintiffs' counsel in all actions will take discovery of the same witnesses and documents.
- 9. Transfer to the District of New Jersey is appropriate because 15 of the 28 related actions were filed there; the District of New Jersey has the resources and judicial expertise to promptly and efficiently conduct this case; the District of New Jersey is more easily accessible and conveniently located than any other district proposed and, most importantly, the manufacturing facilities where much of the contaminated pet food was processed and manufactured is located in the District of New Jersey.
- 10. Plaintiffs' motion is based on the accompanying memorandum of law, the filed pleadings and papers, and other materials that may be presented to the Panel before or at the time of any hearing in this matter.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff's respectfully request that the Panel order that the 13 Actions, as well as any cases that subsequently may be filed asserting related or similar claims, be transferred to the District of New Jersey for coordinated pretrial proceedings. Dated: April 5, 2007

Respectfully submitted,

Document 3

KAPLAN FØX & KILSHEIMER LLP

ROBERT KAPLAN

LINDA NUSSBAUM CHRISTINE M. FOX

805 Third Avenue, 22nd Floor.

New York, NY 10022 Tel: (212) 687-1980

Fax: (212) 687-7714

KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP

LAURENCE D. KING

555 Montgomery Street, Suite 1501

San Francisco, CA 94111

Tel: (415) 772-4700

Fax: (415) 772-4707

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Pittsonberger,

Carter, and Bullock

KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP

WILLIAM J. PINILIS

237 South Street

Morristown, NJ 07962

Tel: (973) 656-0222

Fax: (973) 401-1114

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Carter and Bullock

SCHNEIDER & WALLACE

TODD M. SCHNEIDER

180 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000

San Francisco, CA 94104

Tel: (415) 421-7100

Fax: (415) 421-7105

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Pittsonberger,

Carter, and Bullock

THE MASON LAW FIRM, L.L.P. GARY E. MASON DONNA F. SOLEN 1225 19th Street, N.W., Suite 500 Washington, D.C. 20036 Tel: (202) 429-2290

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Pittsonberger, Carter, and Bullock

KANTROWITZ, GOLDHAMMER & GRAIFMAN GARY S. GRAIFMAN 210 Summit Avenue Montvale, NJ 07645 Tel: (201) 391-7000

Fax: (201) 307-1086

Fax: (202) 429-2294

Attorneys for Plaintiff Pittsonberger

KARP, FROSH, LAPIDUS, WIGODSKY & NORWIND, P.A. JEFFREY A. WIGODSKY 1133 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Suite 250 Washington, D.C. 20036 Tel: (202) 822-3777 Fax: (202) 822-9722

Attorneys for Plaintiff Pittsonberger

VANEK, VICKERS & MASINI P.C. JOSEPH M. VANEK 111 S. Wacker Drive, Suite 4050 Chicago, IL 60606 Tel: (312) 224-1500 Fax: (312) 224-1510

Attorneys for Plaintiff Pittsonberger

BEFORE THE JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

IN RE PET FOODS PRODUCT LIABILITY LITIGATION)))	MDL Docket No.1850	
---	-------------	--------------------	--

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

This is to certify that I have this day served upon all Parties' counsel of record, or upon the Party if no counsel of record appears, a copy of the within and foregoing "PLAINTIFFS JAYME PITTSONBERGER, DAVID CARTER AND JIM BULLOCK'S JOINT MOTION FOR TRANSFER AND COORDINATION PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C §1407" by causing a copy of same to be deposited in the United States mail, postage prepaid, and properly addressed to the person and entities listed on the attached service list.

This is also to certify that I have this day mailed to the clerk of each United States District Court in which an action is pending that will be affected by the Motion for Transfer and Coordination Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407 a copy, for purposes of filing in said Court, of the within and foregoing "PLAINTIFFS JAYME PITTSONBERGER, DAVID CARTER AND JIM BULLOCK'S JOINT MOTION FOR TRANSFER AND COORDINATION

PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C §1407" by causing a copy of same to be deposited in the United States mail, postage prepaid, and properly addressed to the courts listed on the attached service list.

Dated: April 5, 2007

Respectfully submitted,

KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP

ROBERT KAPLAN LINDA NUSSBAUM CHRISTINE M. FOX

805 Third Avenue, 22nd Floor.

New York, NY 10022 Tel: (212) 687-1980 Fax: (212) 687-7714

KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP LAURENCE D. KING 555 Montgomery Street, Suite 1501 San Francisco, CA 94111

Tel: (415) 772-4700 Fax: (415) 772-4707

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Pittsonberger, Carter, and Bullock

KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP WILLIAM J. PINILIS 237 South Street Morristown, NJ 07962

Tel: (973) 656-0222 Fax: (973) 401-1114

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Carter and Bullock

SCHNEIDER & WALLACE TODD M. SCHNEIDER 180 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000 San Francisco, CA 94104

Tel: (415) 421-7100 Fax: (415) 421-7105 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Pittsonberger, Carter, and Bullock

THE MASON LAW FIRM, L.L.P. GARY E. MASON DONNA F. SOLEN 1225 19th Street, N.W., Suitc 500 Washington, D.C. 20036 Tel: (202) 429-2290 Fax: (202) 429-2294

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Pittsonberger, Carter, and Bullock

KANTROWITZ, GOLDHAMMER & GRAIFMAN
GARY S. GRAIFMAN
210 Summit Avenue
Montvale, NJ 07645
Tel: (201) 391-7000
Fax: (201) 307-1086

Attorneys for Plaintiff Pittsonberger

KARP, FROSH, LAPIDUS, WIGODSKY & NORWIND, P.A.
JEFFREY A. WIGODSKY
1133 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Suite 250
Washington, D.C. 20036
Tel: (202) 822-3777
Fax: (202) 822-9722

Attorneys for Plaintiff Pittsonberger

VANEK, VICKERS & MASINI P.C. JOSEPH M. VANEK 111 S. Wacker Drive, Suite 4050 Chicago, IL 60606 Tel: (312) 224-1500 Fax: (312) 224-1510

Attorneys for Plaintiff Pittsonberger

MENU FOODS SERVICE LIST

DEFENDANTS

Menu Foods Midwest Corporation	Menu Foods Income Fund
P.O. Box 1046	8 Falconer Drive
1400 East Logan Ave.	Streetsville, ON
Emporia, KS 66801	Canada, L5N 1B1
Menu Foods, Inc.	Menu Foods Limited
9130 Griffith Mogan Lane	8 Falconer Drive
Pennsauken, NJ 08110	Streetsville, ON
Foliasauken, NJ 00110	·
Many Foods Couth Dalrata Inc	Canada, L5N 1B1
Menu Foods South Dakota, Inc.	Menu Foods Holdings, Inc.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801
Menu Foods Gen Par Limited	Menu Foods Limited Partnership
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Trust Company
Corporation Trust Center	Corporation Trust Center
1209 Orange Street	1209 Orange Street
Wilmington, DE 19801	Wilmington, DE 19801
Menu Foods Operating Partnership	Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
c/o The Corporation Trust Company	c/o The Corporation Company
Corporation Trust Center	425 W. Capitol Ave., Ste. 1700
1209 Orange Street	Little Rock, AR 72201
Wilmington, DE 19801	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
Eukanuba	The lams Company
One Proctor & Gamble Plaza C-2	One Proctor & Gamble Plaza C-2
Cincinnati, OII 45202	Cincinnati, OH 45202
Chichinati, Off 43202	Cincinnati, Ori 45202
Xuzhou Anying Biologic Technology	Suzhou Textile Import and Export Company
Development Company Ltd.	201 Zhuhui Rd.
Wangdian Industrial Pei County Jiangsu	Suzhou, Jiangsu,
P. R. China, Xuzhou, Jiangsu,	China 215006
China	

OTHER PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL IN THESE ACTIONS		
Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Sims Action:	Counsel for Plaintiffs in Scott, et al. Action:	
Jason M. Hatfield	Jeremy Young Hutchinson	
Lundy & Davis, LLP	Patton, Roberts, McWilliams & Capshaw	
300 North College Ave., Suite 309	111 Center Street, Suite 1315	
Fayetteville, AR 72701	Little Rock, AR 72201	
Tel.: 479/527-3921	Tel.: 501/372-3480	
Fax: 479/587-9196	Fax: 501/372-3488	
Email: jhatfield@lundydavis.com	Email: jhutchinson @pattonroberts.com	
Counsel for Plaintiffs in Scott, et al. Action:	Counsel For Plaintiffs In The Schneider,	
	And Workman, et al Actions:	
Richard Adams		
Patton, Roberts, McWilliams & Capshaw	Donna Siegel Moffa	
Century Bank Plaza, Suite 400	Trujillo, Rodriguez & Richards, LLP	
P.O. Box 6128	8 Kings Highway West	
Texarkana, TX 75505-6128	Haddonfield, NJ 08033	
	Tel.: 856/795-9002	
	Email: donna@trrlaw.com	
Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Workman, et al,	Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Workman, et al,	
Action:	Action:	
Sherrie R. Savett	Robert A. Rovner	
Berger & Montague, P.C.	Rovner, Allen, Rovner, Zimmerman & Nash	
1622 Locust Street	175 Bustleton Pike	
Philadelphia, PA 19103	Feasterville, PA 19053-6456	
Counsel for Plaintiff in the Troiano Action:	Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Workman, et al,	
Paul J. Geller	Action:	
Lerach Coughlin Stoia Geller Rudman	Lawrence Kopelman	
Robbins LLP	Kopelman & Blankman	
120 E. Palmetto Park Road, Suite 500	350 E. Las Olas Blvd., Suite 980	
Boca Raton, FL 33432-4809	Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33301	
Tel.: 561/750-3000	Tel.: 954/462-6899	

Counsel for Plaintiff in the Holt Action: Counsel for Plaintiff in the Holt Action: Perry A. Craft A. James Andres Craft & Sheppard Nicole Bass 214 Centerview Dr., Suite 233 905 Locust Street Brentwood, TN 37027 Knoxville, TN 37902 Tel.: 615/309-1707 Tel.: 865/660-3993 Fax: 615/309-1717 Fax: 865/523-4623 Email: perrycraft@craftsheppardlaw.com Email: andrewsesq@iex.net Counsel for Plaintiff in the Whaley, Heller, Counsel for Plaintiff in the Holt Action: et al. and Kornelius, et al. Actions: Nicole Bass Michael David Myers 905 Locust Street Myers & Company Knoxville, TN 37902 1809 7th Ave., Suite 700 Seattle, WA 98101 Tel.: 206/398-1188 Fax: 206/398-1189 Email: mmyers@myers-company.com Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Suggett, et al. Counsel for Plaintiff in the Majerczyk Action: Action: Adam P. Karp Jay Edelson Animal Law Offices Blim & Edelson, LLC 114 W. Magnolia St., Suite 425 53 West Jackson Blvd., Suite 1642 Bellingham, WA 98225 Chicago, IL 60604 Tel.: 360/392-3936 Tel.: 312/913-9400 Email: adam@animal-lawyer.com Email: jay@blimlaw.com Counsel for Plaintiff in the Johnson, et al. Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Osborne Action: Action: Bruce E. Newman Mr. Philip H. Gordon Newman, Creed & Associates Gordon Law Offices 99 North Street, Route 6 623 West Hays St. P.O. Box 575 Boisc, ID 83702 Bristol, CT 06011-0575 Tel.: 208/345-7100 Tel.: 860/583-5200 Email: pgordon@gordonlawoffices.com

art C. Talley shaw, Cutter & Ratnoff, LLP 9th Street, 19th Floor ramento, CA 95814 unsel for Plaintiffs in the Tinker Action:
9th Street, 19th Floor ramento, CA 95814
ramento, CA 95814
unsel for Plaintiffs in the <i>Tinker</i> Action:
n E. Sash
aughlin & Stern, LLP.
Madison Avenue
v York, NY 10016
-448-1100
-448-0066 (fax)
insel for Plaintiffs in the <i>Bonier, et al</i>
ion:
chael A. Ferrara, Jr.
Ferrara Law Firm
Longwood Avenue
erry Hill, Nj 08002
6) 779-9500
errara@Ferraralawfirm.Com
insel for Plaintiffs in the Pittsonberg, and
ter, et al Action:
y E. Mason
ına F. Solen
Mason Law Firm, L.L.P.
5 19th Street, Nw
te 500
shington, D.C. 20036
2) 429-2290
2) 429-2294 (fax)
v 11 : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : :

Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Brown Action: Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Brown Action: Andre S. Kierstead Peter N. Wasylyk Law Offices Of Peter N Wasylyk Law Offices Of Andrew S. Kierstead 1307 Chalkstone Avc. 1001 Sw Fifth Ave., Suite 1100 Portland, Or 97204 1307 Chalkstone Ave. (508) 224-6246 Providence, Ri 02908 (508) 224-4356 (fax) (401) 831-7730 (401) 861-6064 (fax) Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Brown Action: Counsel for Plaintiffs in the Heller, et al, and Johnson, et al, and Kornelius, et al Actions: Marc Stanley Stanley, Mandel, & Iola, Llp Steve W. Berman Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro Llp 3100 Monticello Avenue, Suite 750 Dallas, Texas 75205 1301 5th Ave (214) 443-4300 Stc 2900 Seattle, Wa 98101 (214) 443-0358 (fax) 206-623-7292 Steve@Hbsslaw.Com

COURTS		
Clerk of Court U.S. District Court, Western District of Washington 700 Stewart Street Scattle, WA 98101	Clerk of Court U.S. District Court, Western District of Arkansas 35 E. Mountain Street, Suite 510 Fayetteville, AR 72701-5354	
Clerk of Court U.S. District Court, District of New Jersey 4th & Cooper Streets, Suite 1050 Camden, NJ 08101	Clerk of Court U.S. District Court Southern District of Florida 299 E. Broward Blvd., Suite 108 Fort, Lauderdale, FL 33301	
Clerk of Court U.S. District Court, District of New Jersey Martin Luther King Building & U.S. Courthouse 50 Walnut Street Room 4015 Newark, NJ 07101	Clerk of Court U.S. District Court, District of Connecticut 450 Main Hartford, CT 06103	
Clerk of Court U.S. District Court, Central District of California 312 N. Spring St., Rm G-8 Los Angeles, CA 90012	Clerk of Court U.S. District Court, Northern District of Illinois 209 S. Dearborn Street Chicago, IL 60604	
Clerk of the Court c/o Lynn Kamke, Divisional Manager U.S. District Court, Eastern District of Tennessee 800 Market Street, Suite 130 Knoxville, TN 37902	Clerk of Court U.S. District Court, District of Rhode Island Federal Building and Courthouse One Exchange Terrace Providence, RI 02903	