### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

### IN RE: PROTON-PUMP INHIBITOR PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

2:17-MD-2789 (CCC)(LDW) (MDL 2789)

This Document Relates to: All cases listed in Exhibit A **OPINION AND ORDER** 

### **CECCHI**, District Judge.

### I. Introduction

This matter comes before the Court upon Case Management Order ("CMO") No. 65, ECF No. 723, entered on December 2, 2021, which identified 1,535 cases in which AstraZeneca LP ("AZLP"), AstraZeneca Pharmaceuticals LP ("AZPLP"), and Merck & Co. Inc. d/b/a Merck, Sharp & Dohme Corporation ("Merck") (collectively, the "AZ Defendants") alleged that service of the summons and complaint had not been effected and in which no proof of service appeared on the docket of the case. CMO No. 65 ordered Plaintiffs in those cases within thirty days to (1) establish that service was effected on the AZ Defendants identified in Exhibit A to CMO No. 65, as required by Rule 4(m) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure<sup>1</sup> by filing proof of service, (2) voluntarily dismiss the AZ Defendants, or (3) show cause why the AZ Defendants should not be dismissed within thirty days of entry of the Order. CMO No. 65, at 2 CMO No. 65 ordered Plaintiffs to file their responses on the dockets of the individual cases, and permitted the AZ Defendants to oppose within thirty days of each plaintiff's response.<sup>2</sup> Plaintiffs were specifically

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> All references to Rules herein are to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> At the request of the parties, the deadline for Plaintiffs to file responses to CMO No. 65 was extended to March 31, 2022, and then to June 30, 2022. *See* CMO No. 67, at § I.D, ECF No. 747; CMO No. 70, at ¶ B, ECF No. 769. The deadline for the AZ Defendants to oppose each plaintiff's

advised that "[f]ailure to comply with the terms of this Order will result in the dismissal of the case as to the identified AZ Defendants." CMO No. 65, at 2.

### II. Legal Standard

Rule 4 governs the requirements regarding serving a summons. In particular, Rule 4(m)requires that "[i]f a defendant is not served 90 days after the complaint is filed, the court – on motion or on its own after notice to plaintiff - must dismiss the action without prejudice against that defendant or order that service be made within a specified time. But if the plaintiff shows good cause for the failure, the court must extend the time for service for an appropriate period." Fed. R. Civ. P. 4(m). In the Third Circuit, establishing good cause requires a "demonstration of good faith on the part of a party seeking an enlargement and some reasonable basis for noncompliance with the time specified in the rules." MCI Telecomms. Corp., 71 F.3d at 1097.<sup>3</sup> In the absence of a showing of good cause for failure timely to effect service, the Court has discretion either to dismiss a case or permit an extension. Id. at 1098 (citing Petrucelli v. Bohringer & Ratzinger, 46 F.3d 1298, 1305 (3d Cir. 1995)). It is the plaintiff's burden to demonstrate good cause for such failure to effectuate timely service or to persuade the Court to exercise its discretion and not dismiss the AZ Defendants from their cases. Spence v. Lahood, No. 11-3972, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80015, at \*15 (D.N.J. June 8, 2012) (citing McCurdy v. Am. Bd. of Plastic Surgery, 157 F.3d 191, 196 (3d Cir. 1998)).

response was extended to May 15, 2022, then to August 16, 2022, and then to October 17, 2022. *See* CMO No. 67, at § I.D, ECF No. 747; CMO No. 70, at ¶ B, ECF No. 769; CMO No. 78, at ¶ A, ECF No. 841.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Plaintiffs note that the version of Rule 4 quoted in *MCI Telecomms* is no longer applicable after an amendment in 1993. The amendment removed "good cause" as an absolute prerequisite for an extension of service. However, as explained above, the good cause standard still exists in Rule 4(m). The amendment merely allows courts, in the absence of good cause, to exercise their discretion to allow an extension if the circumstances warrant. Notably, the Court's Opinion and Order here is based on the current version of Rule 4(m).

#### III. Discussion

As stated above, CMO No. 65 ordered the identified Plaintiffs within thirty days to either establish that service was properly effectuated pursuant to Rule 4(m), voluntarily dismiss the AZ Defendants, or show cause why the AZ Defendants should not be dismissed. CMO No. 65 did not provide Plaintiffs with an extension of time to serve the Complaint, instead, it directed Plaintiffs to prove that service had in fact been effectuated or to "show cause why the AZ Defendants should not be dismissed."

The 1,181 Plaintiffs in the cases identified on Exhibit A herein have failed to satisfy the requirements of CMO No. 65. Plaintiffs do not claim to have timely served the AZ Defendants in compliance with Rule 4(m). *See* CMO No. 7, at § II.D ("Absent agreement of the parties or subsequent Order of the Court, service of process shall be effectuated as required under Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.").<sup>4</sup> While there is disagreement between Plaintiffs and the AZ Defendants concerning the fact or date of service in some of the cases here, it is undisputed that in the cases in which the AZ Defendants were served, service was effected only after CMO No. 65 was entered. In fact, of these 1,181 cases (and utilizing the earlier purported date of service in the event that the parties did not agree on the date of service), service was made between one to two years after the ninety-day period in Rule 4(m) in 9 cases; between two to three years after the ninety-day period in 944 cases. Further, no Plaintiff here has dismissed the AZ Defendants from their case. Finally, as further elaborated below, Plaintiffs have not shown cause why the AZ Defendants should not

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Though not relevant in these cases, the Court notes that AZLP, AZPLP, and Merck agreed to accept service of a Complaint by email at PPIComplaints@icemiller.com. CMO No. 27, at § I.D, ECF No. 260

be dismissed. Accordingly, due to untimely service and lack of good cause shown, it is appropriate that the AZ Defendants be dismissed from the cases identified in Exhibit A.

# a. Plaintiffs Do Not Demonstrate Good Cause Mandating an Extension of Time to Serve

Plaintiffs' responses to CMO No. 65 do not demonstrate good cause excusing their lack of timely service pursuant to Rule 4(m). Good cause requires "a demonstration of good faith on the part of the party seeking an enlargement . . . and some reasonable basis for noncompliance with the time specified in the rules." *MCI Telecomms. Corp.*, 71 F.3d at 1097. To determine whether good cause exists, the Court considers "(1) reasonableness of plaintiff's efforts to serve (2) prejudice to the defendant by lack of timely service and (3) whether plaintiff moved for an enlargement of time to serve." *Id.* The primary focus must always be on "the plaintiff's reasons for not complying with the time limit in the first place." *Id.* Yet here, Plaintiffs have not even attempted to show good cause for their failure to timely serve or addressed the reasons for untimeliness. *See, e.g.*, Pl. Lawrence Lucerne's Resp. to Orders to Show Cause Regarding Service of Process, at 22-24, No. 2:19-cv-04209, ECF No. 8 ("Lucerne Resp."). Accordingly, as the Court further explains, Plaintiffs have failed to demonstrate good cause for failure to timely serve in compliance with Rule 4(m).

As an initial matter, the Court notes that Plaintiffs responded to CMO No. 65 by filing virtually identical responses that do not reference the AZ Defendants' specific conduct. These responses attached an exhibit with limited information about the Plaintiffs' individual cases, but did not include any documentation to support their assertions in the exhibit. The information in these exhibits filed by Plaintiffs includes such information as the date of alleged service (if any), whether a defendant had filed a notice of appearance, whether a defendant had filed a short form answer, whether a Plaintiff Fact Sheet had been uploaded to Marker Group, whether a Defense

Fact Sheet had been served, and whether a defendant had sent a deficiency letter related to the Plaintiff Fact Sheet. *See, e.g.*, Lucerne Resp.; Pl. Michael Lopez's Resp. to Order to Show Cause Regarding Service of Process, Ex. A, No. 2:18-cv-04494, ECF No. 15 ("Lopez Resp."). In addition, Plaintiffs' briefing does not address any reasons for the failure to timely serve and instead focuses on arguments concerning the AZ Defendants' purported waiver of service and the Court's authority for discretionary extensions. *See Houser v. Williams*, No. 16-9072, 2020 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 43518, at \*6 (D.N.J. Mar. 12, 2020) (finding dismissal warranted where plaintiff did not serve the complaint for months after an agreed-upon extension and then failed to detail any steps he took towards serving defendant within the extended time afforded by the court).

Turning to the factors for evaluating good cause, the first factor examines the reasonableness of the plaintiff's efforts to serve the complaint. As noted, Plaintiffs offer no explanation for the failure to timely serve, nor an adequate description of reasonable steps that Plaintiffs took to effect timely service as required by Rule 4(m). And none of the Plaintiffs at issue here were close to satisfying timely service under Rule 4(m). As previously stated, in all 1,181 cases, service was effected at least one year after the ninety-day period under Rule 4(m) had lapsed; indeed, in 944 cases, or approximately 80 percent, service was effected over three years after the ninety-day period under Rule 4(m) had lapsed. Given Plaintiffs' lack of sufficient efforts to serve the complaint, this factor weighs heavily in favor of the AZ Defendants.

Under the second factor, the Court considers prejudice to the AZ Defendants by lack of timely service. Here, Plaintiffs' failure to serve caused the AZ Defendants to expend time and resources through investigation, consultation with opposing counsel, and advocating for and responding to case management orders – all to determine whether Plaintiffs intended to pursue litigation against them. *W. Coasts Quartz Corp. v. M.E.C. Tech, Inc.*, 2017 WL 1944197, at \*2

(D.N.J. May 9, 2017). Moreover, this Court has previously determined that the AZ Defendants had been prejudiced by the delayed service or non-service. *See* Order Regarding CMO No. 65, at 7, ECF No. 890. Given the prejudice to the AZ Defendants resulting from Plaintiffs' failure to timely serve, this factor also cuts against good cause. And even if Plaintiffs had demonstrated lack of prejudice to the AZ Defendants, "absence of prejudice alone can never constitute good cause to excuse late service." *MCI Telecomms Corp.*, 71 F.3d at 1097.

Finally, under the third factor, while Plaintiffs have now requested an extension of time to serve the AZ Defendants, they did so only after CMO No. 65 was entered, which was a year or more after the time to serve the AZ Defendants in compliance with Rule 4(m) had lapsed. *See, e.g.*, Lucerne Resp.; Lopez Resp. Plaintiffs have not explained why they did not request an extension of time to serve the AZ Defendants until after CMO No. 65 was entered by this Court. Accordingly, this factor similarly weighs in favor of the AZ Defendants and against Plaintiffs' showing of good cause.

Considering the three factors used to evaluate whether good cause has been demonstrated, Plaintiffs here have not demonstrated good cause for their failure to serve the AZ Defendants in compliance with Rule 4(m).

### b. Plaintiffs Have Not Persuaded the Court that a Discretionary Extension is Warranted

In the absence of a showing of good cause mandating an extension to effectuate service, the Court nonetheless has discretion to either dismiss the case or permit extension. Because Plaintiffs have not established good cause, *see supra*, they must rely on the Court's discretionary authority to excuse failures to comply with Rule 4(m). *See Edwards v. Hillman*, 849 F. App'x. 23, 25 (3d Cir. 2021) (citing *Petrucelli*, 46 F.3d at 1305). The Court's exercise of discretion in this area is guided by various factors, including: "actual notice of the legal action; prejudice to the defendant; the statute of limitations on the underlying causes of action; the conduct of the defendant; and whether the plaintiff is represented by counsel, in addition to any other factor that may be relevant." *Chiang v. U.S. Small Bus. Admin.*, 331 Fed. App'x 113, 116 (3d Cir. 2009); *see also Spence*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80015, at \*15. Here, considering these factors, Plaintiffs have not met their burden in persuading the Court that such discretion should be exercised under these circumstances.

With respect to the first factor—actual notice of the legal action—Plaintiffs argue that the AZ Defendants were on notice of their claims through their tolling agreement, which provided Plaintiffs time to obtain information about their claims before filing a complaint.<sup>5</sup> However, the fact that a plaintiff was on the tolling agreement and may potentially bring a claim against the AZ Defendants or another defendant does not mean that the AZ Defendants had actual legal notice that a particular plaintiff would be pursuing his or her claim against the AZ Defendants in a legal action.

*In re Asbestos Prod. Liab. Litig. (No. VI),* upon which Plaintiffs rely for their argument that a court may extend the time for proper service if the defendant had "actual notice of the pending action," is instructive. 2014 WL 1903904, at \*1 (E.D. Pa., May 12, 2014); see Lucerne Resp. at 9-10 (citing *Asbestos*). The issue there concerned the appropriateness of a specific method of service by mail under Ohio law—not untimely service that occurred anywhere from one to four years past

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In June 2018, the parties entered into a tolling agreement concerning the statute of limitations. In order to obtain the benefit of tolling under the tolling agreement, a claimant had to provide the following information to all defendants: name and date of birth of the PPI user, name(s) of any derivative claimant(s), city and state of residence, date of first PPI use, date of last PPI use, alleged injury, and name of claimant's counsel. The Plaintiffs' Steering Committee was to compile this information and submit it to the defendants on an Excel spreadsheet on a monthly basis. *See* Stip. Regarding Tolling of Stats. of Lims., ECF No. 232, at 1-2. The data required to be provided to all defendants in the tolling agreement did not identify specific defendants whose product(s) were allegedly used by individual plaintiffs.

the Rule 4(m) deadline. Notably, the court found that the defendants were on "actual legal notice" of the pending action because the plaintiffs provided proof of a green card signed by the defendant, evidencing receipt of the original process papers by defendants' counsel, which the court found acceptable under Ohio state law. *Asbestos*, 2014 WL 1903904, at \*1. By contrast, Plaintiffs here have not offered any similar evidence of actual notice. Indeed, as the AZ Defendants argue, the tolling agreement "covered Plaintiffs who could not yet show proof of use as to a Defendant's product" and, moreover, did not identify a specific defendant or which PPI products were at issue as to a particular potential plaintiff. *See, e.g.*, No. 19-cv-04209, ECF No. 10 at 10 n.3. Therefore, Plaintiffs' reliance on *Asbestos* is misplaced and they have not demonstrated that the AZ Defendants had actual notice of pending litigation.

Turning to prejudice to the defendant—the second factor—the Court reiterates its analysis when discussing the same factor in the context of good cause. *See supra* III.a (noting the AZ Defendants expended time and resources through their repeated attempts to determine whether Plaintiffs intended to pursue litigation against them, including their own independent inquiries, as well as meetings with counsel and the special master). Further, this Court has previously found in this MDL (with respect to a different defendant) that "[w]asted time and resources and inconvenience standing alone may constitute sufficient prejudice to warrant dismissal." CMO No. 63 at 7 (citing *Miller v. Advocare, LLC*, No. 12-01069, 2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 71451, at \*8-9 (D.N.J. May 21, 2013). Accordingly, this factor weighs against Plaintiffs' request.

Regarding the statute of limitations, the third factor, Plaintiffs argue that the applicable statute of limitations in most, if not all, of the actions subject to CMO No. 65 has expired. *See, e.g.,* Lucerne Resp. at 21. However, "the expiration of the statute of limitations does not require the court to extend the time for service, as the court has discretion to dismiss the case even if the

refiling of the action is barred." *MCI Telecomms. Corp.*, 71 F.3d at 1098. Given the length of time between filing and service in the cases of these Plaintiffs—in some cases over four years— Plaintiffs' argument that the potential lapse of the statute of limitations warrants extension is not compelling. Relatedly, Plaintiffs have not alleged that the AZ Defendants engaged in any conduct to impede or frustrate timely service. *See Spence*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80015, at \*15 (fourth factor). These factors thus militate against a discretionary extension as well.

The final factor guiding the Court's discretion examines whether the plaintiff is represented by counsel. *See Spence*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 80015, at \*15. Plaintiffs here are all represented by counsel. And, in this context, "[e]ven when delay [in service] results from inadvertence of counsel, it need not be excused." *Petrucelli*, 46 F.3d at 1307. This factor thus also weighs against a discretionary extension.

Weighing all of the above factors, the Court is not persuaded that exercising its discretion to grant an extension to effectuate service on the AZ Defendants is warranted. Moreover, in addition to the factors counseling against an extension, the Court's conclusion is further supported by Plaintiffs' failure to provide an explanation as to why they did not timely serve the AZ Defendants.<sup>6</sup>

# c. Plaintiffs Have Not Shown that the AZ Defendants Waived their Defense to Untimely Service

Plaintiffs generally assert that the AZ Defendants waived any defense related to untimely service by virtue of their conduct in this MDL litigation. Plaintiffs argue that dismissal of their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The AZ Defendants also argue that because Plaintiffs did not address their reasons for untimely service (and instead relied chiefly on arguments concerning waiver), Plaintiffs' reply to CMO 65 failed to comply with a court order, requiring dismissal of their cases on that independent basis. *See, e.g.,* No. 19-cv-04209, ECF No. 10 at 6. The AZ Defendants cite certain *Poulis* factors to support this argument. *Id.* at 10. As explained above, the Court has considered Plaintiffs' lack of an explanation in its discussion of Rule 4(m) and discretionary extensions.

claims against the AZ Defendants is inappropriate in those cases where (1) the AZ Defendants filed a motion to dismiss without raising service; (2) the AZ Defendants either filed an answer without raising service or answered before service; or (3) the AZ Defendants manifested some intention to defend the case through the AZ Defendants' conduct. *See, e.g.*, Lucerne Resp. at § IV.B; Lopez Resp. at § IV.B. For the below reasons, the Court finds that the AZ Defendants have not waived their defense to untimely service.

The Court first turns to Plaintiffs' argument that the AZ Defendants waived their defense to lack of service in those cases where the AZ Defendants filed a motion to dismiss for purported failure to comply with the tolling agreement without specifically raising the defense. However, the AZ Defendants did not raise service in their motions to dismiss because an alternate procedure, proposed and agreed upon by the parties, was set forth in a stipulated court order, with their defenses expressly preserved by CMO No. 7. See CMO No. 7, ECF No. 112, at 7 ("Defendants also reserve all rights to move to dismiss . . . under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure Rule[] 12. Defendants shall only be permitted to file said motions to dismiss subject to leave of this Court."). CMO No. 7 thus expressly restricted defendants from moving to dismiss individual plaintiffs under Rule 12 absent leave of this Court. Indeed, the federal rules bar a defendant from later moving to dismiss for insufficient service of process only when the party "could have raised these objections in their [earlier] motion to dismiss the complaint." Denkins v. William Penn Sch. Dist., No. 20-02228, 2020 WL 5880132, at \*3 (E.D. Pa. Oct. 2, 2020); accord Wright & Miller, 5C Fed. Prac. & Proc. Civ. § 1391 ("If one or more of these defenses are omitted from the initial motion but were 'then available' to the movant, they are permanently lost."). In filing their authorized dismissal motions pursuant to the tolling agreement and CMO No. 7, the AZ Defendants did not have leave to raise any other defense, including insufficient service as to a particular case. Having understood and agreed that such motions were to be deferred to a later date and with leave of the Court, it is not correct that the AZ Defendants, or any other defendant, waived their defense of service by failing to argue it in their motions to dismiss related to purported violations of the tolling agreement.

Plaintiffs' next argument—that the AZ Defendants waived service either by filing an answer without raising service or by answering before service—is similarly unavailing. Plaintiffs assert that, as a general matter, waiver of service may occur where a defendant files an answer as its first responsive pleading and the answer fails to plead the defense. See, e.g., Lucerne Resp. at 7, 13. Accordingly, Plaintiffs argue that there are three potential scenarios where service has been waived by answer. First, Plaintiffs claim that in any case where the AZ Defendants filed a short form answer, service was waived because the short form answer simply incorporated the AZ Defendants' initial long form answer. This, Plaintiffs maintain, is because the long form answer did not assert the defense of lack of service. See, e.g., id. at 14. Second, since a defendant's notice of appearance in a specific case may serve as a short form answer, see Case Management Order No. 27 (ECF No. 265), Plaintiffs contend that a notice of appearance after service is functionally the same as a short form answer-it incorporates the long form answer, which does not assert the defense of lack of service. Finally, Plaintiffs argue that a notice of appearance before service waives this defense under the terms of Case Management Order No. 27 for cases filed after September 24, 2018. See, e.g., Lucerne Resp. at 8; see also CMO No. 27, at § 1.A.

As an initial matter, Plaintiffs' individual submissions here do not assert that the AZ Defendants filed a short form answer in any of their cases, and the dockets confirm no such short form answers exist. *See, e.g.*, Lucerne Resp., Ex. A; Lopez Resp., Ex. A; *see generally* No. 2:19-cv-04209; No. 2:18-cv-04494. Plaintiffs' first argument is thus inapplicable to the cases listed in

Exhibit A. Similarly, for the cases which are subject to CMO No. 27's provision that a notice of appearance *before* service waives the defense (i.e., cases filed on or after September 24, 2018), the dockets clearly reflect that, to the extent the AZ Defendants filed a Notice of Appearance, it was not until *after* service was (untimely) effected on them and after the entry of CMO 65. This leaves the Plaintiffs whose individual submissions assert the AZ Defendants filed a notice of appearance after service, which, they argue, waived the AZ Defendants' untimely service defense because those notices incorporated the long form answer without further raising such a defense. However, as discussed above, at that point, the AZ Defendants had specifically "reserve[d] all rights to move to dismiss ... under Federal Rules of Civil Procedure Rule[] 12" when they (and Plaintiffs) agreed to CMO No. 7. CMO No. 7 at § G. Accordingly, the Court concludes that by filing a notice of appearance in a case in which the AZ Defendants had plainly reserved their right to challenge service, that notice of appearance did not negate the prior reservation and thereby waive the defense.<sup>7</sup>

Plaintiffs' final argument on waiver is that the AZ Defendants waived their defense of service through their conduct in the PPI litigation either as a whole or in individual cases. In support of their argument as to the AZ Defendants' conduct in the litigation as a whole, Plaintiffs rely on *In re Cathode Ray Tube (CRT) Antitrust Litigation*, No. 07-5944, 2014 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 78902 (N.D. Cal. June 9, 2014). In that case, certain defendants raised their Rule 12(b)(5) defense to service in a consolidated motion to dismiss, but subsequently abandoned that 12(b)(5) motion in a later filing and then continued to participate in litigation for four years. The court found that under these circumstances those defendants had waived their defense of lack of service. *Id.* at \*84-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The Court also notes that even if, contrary to the record, the AZ Defendants had filed a short form answer in any of the cases at issue here, the AZ Defendants' reservation of rights from CMO No. 7 would mean that service was not waived.

88. The case is inapposite, however, as the AZ Defendants never previously raised-and subsequently abandoned-the defense of service in any of the cases identified here, and indeed was unable to without leave of the Court under CMO No. 7, as agreed to by the parties. Similarly, Plaintiffs' reliance on In re Methyl Tertiary Butyl Ether ("MTBE") Prods. Liab. Litig., 162 F. Supp. 3d 247 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 21, 2016), is misplaced. There, the plaintiff's timely but defective service on the defendant's prior (and thus incorrect) address combined with the defendant's actions in participating in the litigation (including attending MDL status conferences in which the particular case was discussed and waiting until after the statute of limitations had expired before moving to dismiss the complaint for lack of service) contributed to the plaintiff being "lulled into believing it had effectively served" the defendant. Id. at 250. The court thus found that the defendant's conduct justified the court's exercising its discretion to extend the time for service, but, importantly, the court did not find that the defendant had waived its defense. Id. at 48-50. Plaintiffs here have not asserted that they timely served the AZ Defendants at the wrong address or were otherwise lulled into thinking that they had in fact properly served the AZ Defendants before CMO No. 65 was entered. Therefore, neither In re CRT nor In re MTBE justifies Plaintiffs' argument.

Additionally, Plaintiffs' general response argues that the AZ Defendants waived their defense of service by participating in the litigation of individual cases, citing *In re: Ethicon, Inc.*, No. 2:13-cv-00758, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 148765 (S.D.W.V. Oct. 27, 2016). But there, the defendants acknowledged receipt of a plaintiff profile form, requested additional information from the plaintiffs regarding their claims, and threatened to pursue a remedy in court if the plaintiff did not comply with their request. *Id.* at \*6. By contrast, none of the Plaintiffs in the 1,181 cases herein claim that they received a deficiency letter related to their Plaintiff Fact Sheet, or that the AZ

Defendants threatened to pursue a judicial remedy if the plaintiff did not cure the deficiency. In short, unlike in the *Ethicon* case, none of these Plaintiffs has demonstrated that the AZ Defendants have meaningfully participated in the litigation in their particular case. Further, the Court rejects Plaintiffs' suggestion to impute the AZ Defendants' conduct in defending themselves in cases not subject to CMO No. 65 to suggest that the AZ Defendants waived their defense of service of process in the specific cases identified in Exhibit A hereto.

Plaintiffs also assert that the AZ Defendants have waited too long to assert their defense of service. Plaintiffs rely on the Sixth Circuit's decision in *King v. Taylor*; however, in that case, unlike here, the defendant actively litigated the case by, among other things, filing a joint Rule 26(f) report, participating in depositions, seeking to extend discovery deadlines, and joining in a status report in that particular case, and only moved to dismiss for lack of service at the summary judgment stage. *King v. Taylor*, 694 F.3d 650, 659-61 (6th Cir. 2012). Here, however, none of the 1,181 cases identified in Exhibit A is a Bellwether case or a Wave case and thus the AZ Defendants have not participated in discovery in the individual cases like the defendant in *Taylor* did. Further, as noted previously, stipulated CMO No. 7 precluded the AZ Defendants from filing a motion to dismiss for lack of service without leave of the Court.

#### IV. Conclusion

CMO No. 65 required Plaintiffs to (1) show they timely served the AZ Defendants pursuant to Rule 4(m), (2) dismiss the AZ Defendants from their case, or (3) show cause why this Court should not dismiss the AZ Defendants from their cases. Plaintiffs whose cases are on Exhibit A have failed to meet their burden of demonstrating good cause for failure to comply with CMO No. 65 and effectuate timely service, and have failed to persuade the Court to exercise its discretion not to dismiss the AZ Defendants from their cases. Accordingly, this Court denies Plaintiffs' requests for extensions and orders the AZ Defendants to be dismissed without prejudice from the cases identified in Exhibit A.<sup>8</sup>

Accordingly, **IT IS** on this <u>24</u> day of April, 2023;

**ORDERED** that the AZ Defendants shall be **DISMISSED** without prejudice from the cases identified in Exhibit A hereto.

SO ORDERED.

CLAIRE C. CECCHI, U.S.D.J.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> To the extent Plaintiffs in the cases identified in Exhibit A hereto have raised in their briefing any arguments not expressly addressed herein, the Court has considered and rejected them.

|    | Plaintiff Name   | Case No.                       |
|----|--|--------------------------------|
| 1  | Ronald Trent   | 2:18-cv-03769                  |
| 2  | Sunny Nielson  | 2:18-cv-03770                  |
| 3  | Valerie D. Bell  | 2:18-cv-03774                  |
| 4  | Antonio D. Davis   | 2:18-cv-03775                  |
| 5  | Misty Ashley   | 2:18-cv-03851                  |
|    | Carolyn Ellis  | 2:18-cv-03855                  |
| 7  | Fred Foscalina, As Proposed Administrator of the Estate of Betty Foscalina,<br>Deceased    | 2:18-cv-03856                  |
| 8  | Ronald Gardea  | 2:18-cv-03858                  |
|    | Paul Gann and Candance Gann  | 2:18-cv-03878                  |
|    | Alva Stewart   | 2:18-cv-03879                  |
|    | Shawney Tackett, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of David L.<br>Francis, Deceased | 2:18-cv-03880                  |
| 12 | Nancy M. Crockett  | 2:18-cv-03883                  |
|    | Lynda D. McKibben  | 2:18-cv-03885                  |
|    | Leonore L. Sosa  | 2:18-cv-03886                  |
| 15 | Nathaniel McDaniel   | 2:18-cv-03888                  |
| 16 | Susan Cobb   | 2:18-cv-03889                  |
|    | Mary E. Berry  | 2:18-cv-03898                  |
|    | Kerrie Griffin   | 2:18-cv-04021                  |
|    | Charlene Coffey  | 2:18-cv-04024                  |
|    | Janet Gills  | 2:18-cv-04028                  |
|    | Debra Grigsby  | 2:18 cv 04028                  |
|    | Barbara Gibson   | 2:18 cv 04031<br>2:18-cv-04033 |
|    | Steven Knox  | 2:18 cv 04035                  |
|    | Iva Good   | 2:18-cv-04038                  |
|    | Larry Rutheford and Diane E. Rutheford   | 2:18-cv-04039                  |
|    | Cynthia Gordon   | 2:18-cv-04042                  |
|    | Doris Cook   | 2:18-cv-04042                  |
|    | Alvin Cooper, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Peggy Cooper,<br>Deceased        | 2:18-cv-04045                  |
| 20 |  | 2:18-cv-04047                  |
|    | Ricky L. Graham<br>Norman Kydd   | 2:18-cv-04047<br>2:18-cv-04048 |
|    |  |                                |
|    | Jeanette Gillespie   | 2:18-cv-04049                  |
|    | Joyce Gettys   | 2:18-cv-04052                  |
|    | Joyce Covington  | 2:18-cv-04053                  |
|    | Della I. Gregg   | 2:18-cv-04054                  |
|    | Theresa Landingham   | 2:18-cv-04057                  |
|    | Connie L. Croy   | 2:18-cv-04058                  |
|    | Christopher Cracolice and Martha Ann Cracolice   | 2:18-cv-04064                  |
|    | Terrisina Lawrence-Mason   | 2:18-cv-04065                  |
|    | Dianne Webber  | 2:18-cv-04069                  |
| 40 | Deborah Kirby and Thomas Kirby   | 2:18-cv-04073                  |
| 41 | Gaye Riggle, As Proposed Administrator of the Estate of Thomas Riggle,<br>Deceased         | 2:18-cv-04076                  |
| 42 | Ethelyn Ruddell  | 2:18-cv-04077                  |

| 43 D              | Denver Kennett and Delores Kennett                                   | 2:18-cv-04078                  |
|-------------------|--|--------------------------------|
|                   | lancy Ritterbush   | 2:18-cv-04084                  |
|                   | aren Reese   | 2:18-cv-04086                  |
|                   | Villa Roberts  | 2:18-cv-04087                  |
| -                 | yrone Robinson   | 2:18-cv-04088                  |
|                   | ohn Van Ness   | 2:18-cv-04090                  |
|                   | larry Hortsch  | 2:18-cv-04093                  |
|                   | ohn Ortiz  | 2:18 cv 01095                  |
|                   | /ike Moffat  | 2:18 cv 04033                  |
|                   | ristine S. Murff   | 2:18-cv-04145                  |
|                   | eff Vider and Peggy Vider  | 2:18 cv 04143                  |
| 1                 | aurie T. Lum   | 2:18-cv-04159                  |
|                   | atrick Kirk and Rena Kirk  | 2:18-cv-04163                  |
|                   | arbara Corley  | 2:18-cv-04164                  |
|                   | Danny Kinser   | 2:18-cv-04104<br>2:18-cv-04167 |
|                   |  | 2:18-cv-04167<br>2:18-cv-04169 |
|                   | etty L. Sanner<br>/alerie Taylor                                     | 2:18-cv-04169<br>2:18-cv-04173 |
|                   | charles Ketcherside  |                                |
|                   |  | 2:18-cv-04178                  |
|                   | ia Hartmann  | 2:18-cv-04180                  |
|                   | Brady Harris   | 2:18-cv-04181                  |
|                   | ue Ann Sanford   | 2:18-cv-04182                  |
|                   | Daniel Sharp   | 2:18-cv-04184                  |
|                   | athleen Johnson  | 2:18-cv-04190                  |
|                   | achel Hogg   | 2:18-cv-04192                  |
|                   | arry Turner  | 2:18-cv-04193                  |
|                   | anice Givins   | 2:18-cv-04197                  |
|                   | ilda Saunders  | 2:18-cv-04198                  |
| 70 Is             | saac S. Reid   | 2:18-cv-04200                  |
| 71 F              | roncell Shannon  | 2:18-cv-04207                  |
| 72 N              | /lary A. Williams  | 2:18-cv-04208                  |
| 73 S <sup>-</sup> | tephanie James and Bernard James                                     | 2:18-cv-04209                  |
| 74 R              | ayshell Robinson   | 2:18-cv-04215                  |
| 75 V              | Villiam Gilmore  | 2:18-cv-04216                  |
| 76 L              | orraine Smith  | 2:18-cv-04217                  |
| 77 D              | eborah Harling   | 2:18-cv-04218                  |
| 78 S              | amantha Hawksorth, As Proposed Representative of the Estate of David | 2:18-cv-04220                  |
| / <sup>8</sup> L  | . Hawksworth, Deceased   | 2.10-00-04220                  |
| 79 R              | ichard Hobbs   | 2:18-cv-04222                  |
| 80 N              | /ichael Arnold   | 2:18-cv-04454                  |
| 81 L              | inda Atkinson and Tommy Atkinson                                     | 2:18-cv-04459                  |
| 82 L              | arry Brewer, Sr.   | 2:18-cv-04461                  |
| 83 S              | ylvia Brooks   | 2:18-cv-04462                  |
| 84 H              | Ierbert Banks and Myra Banks   | 2:18-cv-04463                  |
|                   | Villien Holmes   | 2:18-cv-04464                  |
|                   | Geneva Corbitt   | 2:18-cv-04465                  |
|                   | erry Cameron   | 2:18-cv-04467                  |
|                   | imberly A. Clark   | 2:18-cv-04469                  |

|           | Fitzsimmons   | 2:18-cv-04472 |
|-----------|---|---------------|
|           | / Campbell  | 2:18-cv-04473 |
| 91 Wen    | •   | 2:18-cv-04474 |
| 92 Thel   | ma Hampton  | 2:18-cv-04476 |
|           | ald Coble   | 2:18-cv-04478 |
| 94 Norr   | nan Holloway  | 2:18-cv-04481 |
| 95 Roze   | Il Collins  | 2:18-cv-04482 |
| 96 Cass   | andra Howard  | 2:18-cv-04484 |
| 97 Kent   | Davis   | 2:18-cv-04486 |
| 98 Kath   | y Cook  | 2:18-cv-04487 |
| 99 Dou    | glas lvey   | 2:18-cv-04488 |
| 100 Shar  | ren Crowell   | 2:18-cv-04489 |
| 101 Mich  | nael Lopez  | 2:18-cv-04494 |
| 102 Sand  | Ira Davis   | 2:18-cv-04496 |
| 103 Robe  | ert Parham, Jr.   | 2:18-cv-04497 |
| 104 Junio | or McDaniel   | 2:18-cv-04498 |
| 105 Clim  | mie Gibbons   | 2:18-cv-04499 |
| 1061      | sa Harlen, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Jack R. Harlen,<br>eased | 2:18-cv-04500 |
|           | chel Merriett   | 2:18-cv-04503 |
|           | nia Rackins   | 2:18-cv-04504 |
| 109 Otis  |   | 2:18-cv-04507 |
|           | ry Hess, Sr.  | 2:18-cv-04509 |
|           | les Graham  | 2:18-cv-04510 |
| 112 Gail  | Semler  | 2:18-cv-04513 |
|           | anda Riggins  | 2:18-cv-04514 |
|           | icia Simmons  | 2:18-cv-04515 |
| 115 Anto  | nia Simmons   | 2:18-cv-04517 |
| 116 Jessi | e Martin  | 2:18-cv-04519 |
| 117 Mary  | y Hankamer and Ed Hankamer  | 2:18-cv-04520 |
| 118 Chris | stina Shubrick  | 2:18-cv-04521 |
|           | nael Morelock   | 2:18-cv-04522 |
| 120 Corli | ss Royal  | 2:18-cv-04523 |
| 121 Yvon  | ine Sheers  | 2:18-cv-04524 |
| 122 Adea  | ana Hardin  | 2:18-cv-04525 |
| 123 Bren  | da Dale   | 2:18-cv-04526 |
| 124 Bren  | da Smith-Capps  | 2:18-cv-04527 |
| 125 Kelly |   | 2:18-cv-04529 |
| 126 Fran  | ces Hardins   | 2:18-cv-04530 |
| 127 Rona  | ald White   | 2:18-cv-04531 |
| 128 Delm  | na Comer  | 2:18-cv-04532 |
| 129 Barb  | ara Sapp-Greene   | 2:18-cv-04533 |
| 130 Mary  | y Haynes  | 2:18-cv-04535 |
| 131 Sand  | Ira Young   | 2:18-cv-04536 |
|           | E. Wheeler  | 2:18-cv-04537 |
| 133 Betty | y Head  | 2:18-cv-04538 |
| 134 Kath  | y Shegda  | 2:18-cv-04542 |

| 135 Kathleen Hughes   | 2:18-cv-04543                  |
|---|--------------------------------|
| 136 Terria Wallace-Terrell  | 2:18-cv-04544                  |
| 137 Philip Sawyer   | 2:18-cv-04545                  |
| 138 Gary Nunez  | 2:18-cv-04614                  |
| 139 Rhea Smith  | 2:18-cv-04615                  |
| 140 Dwayne Fails  | 2:18 cv 0 1015                 |
| 141 Daniel Opp  | 2:18-cv-04622                  |
| 142 Tina Bowman   | 2:18-cv-04623                  |
| 143 Ted Smith   | 2:18 cv 0 1025                 |
| 144 Betty Brumfield   | 2:18-cv-04626                  |
| 145 Walter Hammond and Adah Kennon  | 2:18-cv-04628                  |
| 146 Alvin Stafford  | 2:18 cv 01028                  |
| 147 Edward Chicarelli, Sr.  | 2:18 cv 04023                  |
| 148 Gregory Chicarelli  | 2:18 cv 01031                  |
| 149 Valerie Jones   | 2:18 cv 04636                  |
| 150 John Sydnor   | 2:18-cv-04637                  |
| 151 Jacqueline Blake  | 2:18-cv-04638                  |
| 152 Jason Kellems   | 2:18-cv-04639                  |
| 153 Barbara Johnson   | 2:18-cv-04640                  |
| 153 Barbara Johnson<br>154 William E. Taulbee   | 2:18-cv-04646                  |
| 155 James Thornhill   | 2:18-cv-04651                  |
| 156 Keith Likes   | 2:18-cv-04652                  |
| 157 Mark Pickens  | 2:18-cv-04657                  |
| 158 Peggy Waldron   | 2:18-cv-04658                  |
| 159 Dawn Lockett  | 2:18-cv-04659                  |
| 160 Carolyn Polly   | 2:18-cv-04660                  |
| 161 Jerry Queen   | 2:18-cv-04660<br>2:18-cv-04661 |
| 162 Bobbie Walker   | 2:18-cv-04663                  |
| 163 Eugenia Long  | 2:18-cv-04664                  |
| 164 Joaquin Ramos and Linda Ramos   | 2:18-cv-04665                  |
| 165 Margaret Manly  | 2:18-cv-04663                  |
|   | 2:18-cv-04667                  |
| 166 Janie Washington<br>167 Dena Sinnett  | 2:18-cv-04669                  |
|   | 2:18-cv-04671<br>2:18-cv-04672 |
| 168 Brian Boyd  | 2:18-07-04072                  |
| 169 Rachedia Ross, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Kelli Prevo,<br>Deceased | 2:18-cv-04681                  |
| 170 Thelma Mason  | 2:10 === 04604                 |
| 170 Inelma Mason<br>171 Brenda Read   | 2:18-cv-04684<br>2:18-cv-04687 |
|   |                                |
| 172 Julie Redderson   | 2:18-cv-04690                  |
| 173 Harvey Chavez   | 2:18-cv-04695                  |
| 174 Patricia J Smith  | 2:18-cv-04696                  |
| 175 Judith Turner   | 2:18-cv-04697                  |
| 176 Irma Santana  | 2:18-cv-04698                  |
| 177 Michael Chivers   | 2:18-cv-04699                  |
| 178 Sharon Turner   | 2:18-cv-04700                  |
| 179 Paula Saul  | 2:18-cv-04703                  |
| 180 Paula Sue Schilling   | 2:18-cv-04706                  |

| 181 Milton Sidwell                        | 2:18-cv-04708                  |
|---|--------------------------------|
| 182 Wilma Wilson                          | 2:18-cv-04710                  |
| 183 Amoikon Ngouan                        | 2:18-cv-05032                  |
| 184 Roger Phillips and Margaret Phillips  | 2:18-cv-05034                  |
| 185 Erika Short                           | 2:18-cv-05035                  |
| 186 Joseph Stephenson                     | 2:18-cv-05036                  |
| 187 Linda Swinford-Cooksey                | 2:18-cv-05037                  |
| 188 Elizabeth Talton                      | 2:18-cv-05039                  |
| 189 Wanda Thomas                          | 2:18-cv-05040                  |
| 190 Guy Thomas                            | 2:18-cv-05043                  |
| 191 Sharon Thornhill                      | 2:18-cv-05044                  |
| 192 Isaiah Thomas                         | 2:18-cv-05045                  |
| 193 Patricia Vineyard                     | 2:18-cv-05046                  |
| 194 Donna Wicker                          | 2:18-cv-05048                  |
| 195 Michael Yardrough                     | 2:18-cv-05050                  |
| 196 Perry Trowbridge                      | 2:18-cv-05051                  |
| 197 Kathy Baumgartner                     | 2:18-cv-05052                  |
| 198 Keith Turner                          | 2:18-cv-05053                  |
| 199 Betty Dodd                            | 2:18-cv-05054                  |
| 200 Lorenzo Valenzuela                    | 2:18 cv 05051                  |
| 201 Maria Valenzuela                      | 2:18-cv-05057                  |
| 202 Patrika Vestal                        | 2:18-cv-05059                  |
| 203 Crystal Cartier                       | 2:18-cv-05063                  |
| 204 Jerry Messer                          | 2:18-cv-05067                  |
| 205 John Muncy                            | 2:18-cv-05071                  |
| 206 Linda Williams                        | 2:18-cv-05075                  |
| 207 Patricia Younger                      | 2:18-cv-05078                  |
| 208 Michael Worthen                       | 2:18-cv-05079                  |
| 209 Robert Dryden                         | 2:18-cv-05081                  |
| 210 Ricky Thomas                          | 2:18 CV 05081<br>2:18-cv-05082 |
| 211 Christina Ward                        | 2:18-CV-05082<br>2:18-CV-05083 |
| 212 Charla Mogg                           | 2:18-cv-05083                  |
| 213 Tommy Huff, Sr.                       | 2:18-cv-05084<br>2:18-cv-05086 |
| 214 Renee Martinez                        | 2:18-CV-05080<br>2:18-CV-05128 |
| 215 Ramon Barrios                         | 2:18-CV-05128<br>2:18-CV-05129 |
| 216 Stephen Mitchell                      | 2:18-CV-05129<br>2:18-cv-05130 |
| 210 Stephen Mitchell<br>217 Allen Murrow  | 2:18-CV-05130<br>2:18-cv-05132 |
| 217 Allen Murrow<br>218 Jerry Franklin    | 2:18-cv-05132<br>2:18-cv-05133 |
| 218 Jerry Franklin<br>219 Myra McAllister |                                |
|   | 2:18-cv-05134                  |
| 220 Marilyn McCallister                   | 2:18-cv-05136                  |
| 221 Anthony Taormina                      | 2:18-cv-05137                  |
| 222 Charles Smith                         | 2:18-cv-05138                  |
| 223 Donnie Mink                           | 2:18-cv-05140                  |
| 224 Melody Nequette                       | 2:18-cv-05141                  |
| 225 Darlene Farr                          | 2:18-cv-05143                  |
| 226 Catherine Morton-Davis                | 2:18-cv-05144                  |
| 227 Bonnie Goodchild                      | 2:18-cv-05146                  |

| 228 Dana Butler  | 2:18-cv-05148 |
|--|---------------|
| 229 Phillip Harris and Denise Harris                               | 2:18-cv-05150 |
| Hermon McNac, as Pronosed Representative of the Estate of Lillie M |               |
| 230 Butler, Deceased   | 2:18-cv-05152 |
| 231 Glenda Mays  | 2:18-cv-05153 |
| 232 Kathryn Caban  | 2:18-cv-05155 |
| 233 Christine Scott  | 2:18-cv-05158 |
| 234 Crystal Henson   | 2:18-cv-05160 |
| 235 David McMillen   | 2:18-cv-05161 |
| 236 Clara Singleton  | 2:18-cv-05162 |
| 237 Timothy Carter   | 2:18-cv-05163 |
| 238 Barbara Lambert and Paul Lambert                               | 2:18-cv-05164 |
| 239 Phillip Tavegia  | 2:18-cv-05165 |
| 240 Sarah Mitchell   | 2:18-cv-05166 |
| 241 Charlotte Means  | 2:18-cv-05167 |
| 242 Richard Moran  | 2:18-cv-05170 |
| 243 Frederick Nickerson  | 2:18-cv-05171 |
| 244 Diane Murphy   | 2:18-cv-05174 |
| 245 Glenn Nemecek  | 2:18-cv-05177 |
| 246 Margorie Walker  | 2:18-cv-05178 |
| 247 Ruth Williamson  | 2:18-cv-05179 |
| 248 Harold E. Rakestraw  | 2:18-cv-05183 |
| 249 Linda Smith  | 2:18-cv-05186 |
| 250 Caroline Weatherton  | 2:18-cv-05189 |
| 251 Janie Wright   | 2:18-cv-05190 |
| 252 Marisha Miller   | 2:18-cv-05191 |
| 253 Melinda McMillen and Lawrence R. McMillen                      | 2:18-cv-05194 |
| 254 Louanna Dunlap   | 2:18-cv-05195 |
| 255 Nancy Miller   | 2:18-cv-05197 |
| 256 George Hansen  | 2:18-cv-05198 |
| 257 Dwight Smith   | 2:18-cv-05202 |
| 258 Freddie Johnson  | 2:18-cv-05205 |
| 259 Rebecca Johnston   | 2:18-cv-05206 |
| 260 Alfred Vargas  | 2:18-cv-05207 |
| 261 Deanna Lacy  | 2:18-cv-05208 |
| 262 Terry Rasmussen  | 2:18-cv-05209 |
| 263 Barbara Manuel   | 2:18-cv-05212 |
| 264 Norma Williams   | 2:18-cv-05213 |
| 265 Teresa Byers   | 2:18-cv-05431 |
| 266 Adrian Nagy  | 2:18-cv-05432 |
| 267 Anthony Richardson   | 2:18-cv-05434 |
| 268 Rosemary Lehr  | 2:18-cv-05437 |
| 269 Donald Gibson  | 2:18-cv-05438 |
| 270 Lindell Shelby   | 2:18-cv-05439 |
| 271 Susan Miller   | 2:18-cv-05441 |
| 272 William Wade   | 2:18-cv-05449 |
| 273 Larry Huffman  | 2:18-cv-05451 |

|      | William Wegis   | 2:18-cv-05453                  |
|------|---|--------------------------------|
| 275  | Darrell Craw  | 2:18-cv-05454                  |
| 276  | Gerald Whatley  | 2:18-cv-05455                  |
| 277  | Joseph Cervantes  | 2:18-cv-05456                  |
| 278  | Sherry Hunt   | 2:18-cv-05457                  |
| 279  | Kit Middleton   | 2:18-cv-05461                  |
| 280  | Sandra Garrett  | 2:18-cv-05463                  |
| 281  | Hilda Johnson   | 2:18-cv-05464                  |
| 282  | Tony Hernandez  | 2:18-cv-05472                  |
| 283  | Bryan Swanson   | 2:18-cv-05476                  |
| 284  | Pamela Clark  | 2:18-cv-05478                  |
| 285  | Melvin Stubbs   | 2:18-cv-05479                  |
|      | Brett Timothy   | 2:18-cv-05481                  |
|      | Linda M. Williams   | 2:18-cv-05482                  |
|      | Cecelia Clipper   | 2:18-cv-05483                  |
|      | Jennifer Wolfe  | 2:18-cv-05485                  |
|      | Catherine Farrell   | 2:18-cv-05487                  |
|      | Sharon Powers   | 2:18 cv 05487                  |
|      | Arthur Warshawsky   | 2:18 cv 05480                  |
|      | Martha Burns  | 2:18-cv-05495                  |
|      | Gary Robertson  | 2:18-cv-05499                  |
|      | Kyle Rose   | 2:18-cv-05500                  |
|      |   |                                |
|      | Margie Jennings   | 2:18-cv-05501                  |
| /4/  | Rickey Crihfield, As Proposed Representative of the Estate of Miki L.               | 2:18-cv-05502                  |
|      | Crihfield, deceased   | 2.40 05504                     |
|      | Jeffrey Jones   | 2:18-cv-05504                  |
|      | Deborah Lee   | 2:18-cv-05507                  |
|      | Ellen Moritt  | 2:18-cv-05509                  |
|      | Burma Sizemore  | 2:18-cv-05511                  |
|      | Bob Hoover  | 2:18-cv-05513                  |
| î    | Carmen Stevens  | 2:18-cv-05516                  |
|      | Samantha Lawson   | 2:18-cv-05520                  |
| 3051 | Shirley Teel, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Ezra C. Teel,<br>Deceased | 2:18-cv-05521                  |
| 306  | Margie Delauder   | 2:18-cv-05526                  |
|      | Brenda Bunch  | 2:18-cv-05942                  |
|      | Richard Cannon  | 2:18-cv-05947                  |
|      | Melissa Curry   | 2:18-cv-05952                  |
|      | Brenda Dye  | 2:18-cv-05956                  |
|      | Sheryl Gerald   | 2:18-cv-05959                  |
|      | Cedric Florence   | 2:18-cv-05960                  |
|      | Dennis Lane   | 2:18-cv-05962                  |
|      | Marsha Layman   | 2:18-cv-05964                  |
|      | Joyce Noble   | 2:18-cv-05968                  |
|      | Samantha Riddle   | 2:18-cv-05971                  |
|      | Richard Slate   | 2:18-cv-05973                  |
|      | Gwenda Steele   | 2:18-cv-05973<br>2:18-cv-05975 |
| 210  |   | 2.10-00-0000/0                 |

| 319 | Barbara Gibson, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Alta Gibson, Deceased | 2:18-cv-05976                  |
|-----|---|--------------------------------|
| 320 | William Taylor  | 2:18-cv-05977                  |
| 321 | Janet Washington  | 2:18-cv-05978                  |
| 322 | George Hawkins  | 2:18-cv-05980                  |
| 323 | Dana Wilson   | 2:18-cv-05982                  |
| 324 | Michael Longacre  | 2:18-cv-05988                  |
| 325 | Linda Martin  | 2:18-cv-05989                  |
| 326 | Debra O'Neal  | 2:18-cv-05993                  |
|     | Elnora Pope   | 2:18-cv-05995                  |
|     | Susan Reedy   | 2:18-cv-05996                  |
|     | Debbie Reynolds   | 2:18-cv-05997                  |
|     | Lacy Skinner  | 2:18-cv-06000                  |
|     | Linda Wilson  | 2:18-cv-06002                  |
|     | Brenda Young  | 2:18-cv-06003                  |
|     | Kathryn Anderson  | 2:18-cv-06134                  |
|     | Larry Basham and Linda Basham   | 2:18-cv-06138                  |
|     | Mary Hollander  | 2:18-cv-06148                  |
|     | Lance Faulkner  | 2:18-cv-06154                  |
|     | Christina Ford  | 2:18-cv-06157                  |
|     | Ruby Brake  | 2:18-cv-06161                  |
|     | Sharon Reid   | 2:18-cv-06164                  |
|     | Jimmy Brown   | 2:18-cv-06165                  |
|     | Bartholomew Gaiera and Karen Gaiera   | 2:18-cv-06166                  |
|     | Gregry Russell  | 2:18-cv-06169                  |
|     | Kathlene Brown  | 2:18-cv-06171                  |
|     | Sarah Brown   | 2:18-cv-06175                  |
|     | Sonjia Short<br>Donald Silas  | 2:18-cv-06177                  |
|     |   | 2:18-cv-06180<br>2:18-cv-06184 |
|     | Rita Bentley  | 2:18-cv-06184<br>2:18-cv-06196 |
|     | Rebecca Harrington<br>Linda Buie  | 2:18-cv-06198                  |
|     | Patricia Hasty  | 2:18-cv-06202                  |
|     | John Copp   | 2:18-cv-06202<br>2:18-cv-06204 |
|     | Sherry Davis  | 2:18-cv-06204                  |
|     | Garry Jackson   | 2:18-cv-06207                  |
|     | Richard Jackson and Judy Fontenot   | 2:18-cv-06214                  |
|     | John Whatley  | 2:18-cv-06216                  |
|     | Eugene Johnson  | 2:18-cv-06222                  |
|     | Beverly Elgan   | 2:18-cv-06223                  |
|     | Susan Downs   | 2:18-cv-06224                  |
|     | Cardell Woodard   | 2:18-cv-06225                  |
|     | Sharon Farris   | 2:18-cv-06227                  |
|     | Junita Horn   | 2:18-cv-06231                  |
|     | Bonnie Mize   | 2:18-cv-06232                  |
| 363 | Jackie Knight   | 2:18-cv-06233                  |
|     | Sarah Landry  | 2:18-cv-06239                  |

| 365  | Richard Guiterrez   | 2:18-cv-06240                  |
|------|---|--------------------------------|
|      | Richard Leonard   | 2:18 cv 00240<br>2:18-cv-06244 |
|      | Karla Lee   | 2:18 cv 00244<br>2:18-cv-06245 |
|      | Theodore Logan, Jr.   | 2:18 cv 00249                  |
|      | Sonja Prince  | 2:18-cv-06251                  |
|      | Belinda Holland   | 2:18-cv-06253                  |
|      |   | 2:18-cv-06256                  |
|      | Tunya Lowe  |                                |
|      | Steve Thompson  | 2:18-cv-06260                  |
|      | Dorothy Van Horn  | 2:18-cv-06264                  |
|      | Sandra Walling  | 2:18-cv-06268                  |
|      | Marlene McIntyre  | 2:18-cv-06270                  |
|      | Michael Wetselline  | 2:18-cv-06271                  |
|      | Patina Johnson  | 2:18-cv-06274                  |
|      | Billy Largen and Donna Brown  | 2:18-cv-06278                  |
|      | Lillian Paxton  | 2:18-cv-06284                  |
|      | Bob Russom  | 2:18-cv-06288                  |
| 3811 | Susan White, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Eugene             | 2:18-cv-06432                  |
|      | Kujawski, Deceased  | 2120 07 00 102                 |
|      | Johnny Daniels  | 2:18-cv-06440                  |
|      | Emilee Palmer and Michael D. Palmer   | 2:18-cv-06449                  |
| 384  | Mary Nordby, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Joan Jackson,      | 2:18-cv-06450                  |
| 504  | Deceased  | 2.10-00-00430                  |
| 385  | Tina Thornburg  | 2:18-cv-06456                  |
| 386  | Ennis Dunning   | 2:18-cv-06460                  |
| 387  | Marsha Graham, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Gary             | 2.10 00 00 407                 |
| 387  | Graham, Deceased  | 2:18-cv-06467                  |
| 388  | Kevin Harper  | 2:18-cv-06473                  |
| 389  | Travis Charlton, As Proposed Representative of the Estate of Cynthia        | 2.10                           |
| 389  | Halbert, Deceased   | 2:18-cv-06476                  |
| 390  | Ima Young and Hollis Young-Wheely   | 2:18-cv-06480                  |
|      | Lesa Honn, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate of     |                                |
| 3911 | Leonard Honn, Deceased  | 2:18-cv-06481                  |
|      | Teresa Alvarez, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate   |                                |
| 392  | of Thomas Alvarez, Deceased   | 2:18-cv-06484                  |
|      | Rosie Alvarez, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate of |                                |
| 393  | Urbano Alvarez, Deceased  | 2:18-cv-06488                  |
|      | Nina Fernandez, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Sanra Nobil,    |                                |
| 394  | Deceased  | 2:18-cv-06497                  |
| 395  | Bradley Olson and Shirley Olson   | 2:18-cv-06498                  |
|      | Bernice Haley, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate    | 2.10 00 00 00 00               |
| 396  | of Dennis Ray Haley, Deceased   | 2:18-cv-06504                  |
|      | Jerry Blosser, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate of |                                |
| 397  |   | 2:18-cv-06515                  |
| 200  | Wanda Blosser, Deceased   |                                |
| 398  | Norma Stillwagoner  | 2:18-cv-06520                  |
| 2991 | Debbie Edgell, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate    | 2:18-cv-06521                  |
|      | of Jackie Edgell, Deceased  |                                |

| Exhi | bit A |
|------|-------|
|------|-------|

| 4001  | Caren Keenan, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate                                       | 2:18-cv-06522 |
|-------|---|---------------|
| 0     | of Larry Keenan, Deceased   |               |
| 4011  | hirley Morton, Individually and as Proposed Representative of the Estate<br>of Delbert P Morton Sr., Deceased | 2:18-cv-06527 |
| 407   | ames McDade, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Laverne<br>AcDade, Deceased                          | 2:18-cv-06528 |
| 4031  | Gina Zerby, Individually and as the Proposed Representative of Michael<br>Zerby, Deceased                     | 2:18-cv-06532 |
| 404 L | illian Paxton, Individually and as Proposed Representatie of the Estate of ohn Paxton, Deceased               | 2:18-cv-06533 |
|       | Aichelle Wilson   | 2:18-cv-06540 |
| 406   | Rita Johnson, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Lessie Tharpe,                                      | 2:18-cv-06549 |
| 407   | mily Knotts, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Cheryl Stefenel,<br>Deceased                         | 2:18-cv-06552 |
| 408 V | Villiam Cavanaugh and Margaret Cavanaugh  | 2:18-cv-06791 |
|       | ulie Cross  | 2:18-cv-06800 |
| 410 J | acquelyn Booker   | 2:18-cv-06834 |
| 411 C | Dianne Caldwell   | 2:18-cv-06846 |
| 412 B | Brenda Cameron  | 2:18-cv-06854 |
| 4131  | eona Collins, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Deniese Collins, Deceased               | 2:18-cv-06869 |
|       | Patrick Connors   | 2:18-cv-06876 |
|       | arry Ludwick  | 2:18-cv-06937 |
|       | Gladys Maddox   | 2:18-cv-06939 |
|       | rank Rendon   | 2:18-cv-06940 |
|       | ohnnie Oliver   | 2:18-cv-06947 |
| 419 C | Charles Jones, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Victoria Jones,                                    | 2:18-cv-06952 |
|       | ohn Cole  | 2:18-cv-06962 |
|       | Ielen Robinson  | 2:18-cv-06963 |
| 422 C | Dorothy Alegria, As the Representative of the Estate of Edwin Alegria,  | 2:18-cv-06966 |
|       | Charles Howard  | 2:18-cv-06986 |
|       | uvern Purnell   | 2:18-cv-06997 |
|       | Amy Qualles   | 2:18-cv-07001 |
|       | eresa Hill-Ibrahim  | 2:18-cv-07005 |
|       | Barbara Burger  | 2:18-cv-07027 |
|       | Cathy Lockhart  | 2:18-cv-07032 |
|       | Dionna McGairk  | 2:18-cv-07043 |
|       | /ertis Kellam   | 2:18-cv-07043 |
| 431 J | udy Bradshaw, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of   | 2:18-cv-07048 |
| 432 R | immy Bradshaw, Deceased<br>Richard Oyerbides, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of         | 2:18-cv-07052 |
| R     | Rebecca Mobley, Deceased  |               |
|       | hane Kilgore  | 2:18-cv-07057 |
| 434 J | udy Wolford   | 2:18-cv-07079 |

| 435  | Aquinda Woodrum  | 2:18-cv-07084                  |
|------|--|--------------------------------|
|      | Virginia Boyd  | 2:18 cv 07001<br>2:18-cv-07090 |
|      | Carl Evans Jr. and Carolyn Evans   | 2:18-cv-07106                  |
|      | Herman Firmin  | 2:18 cv 07100<br>2:18-cv-07110 |
|      | Cornelius Bentley Sr.  | 2:18-cv-07112                  |
|      | Herbert Johnson  | 2:18-cv-07130                  |
|      |  | 2.10-07130                     |
| 441  | Joan Stoveken, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Gay Stoveken, Deceased          | 2:18-cv-07137                  |
| 447  | Angela Spicer, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of James Spicer, Deceased          | 2:18-cv-07148                  |
| 443  | Amanda Turner, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Ronald Turner, Deceased         | 2:18-cv-07153                  |
|      | Christopher Crittenden   | 2:18-cv-07154                  |
|      | Jessie Darby, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of<br>Donnie Darby, Deceased        | 2:18 cv 07151                  |
| 446  | Malissa Wilson   | 2:18-cv-07170                  |
|      | Erick Barnes   | 2:18 cv 07178<br>2:18-cv-07187 |
|      | John Norton  | 2:18-cv-07192                  |
|      | Tammy Perry  | 2:18-cv-07192<br>2:18-cv-07194 |
|      | Brenda Fletcher  | 2:18-cv-07194<br>2:18-cv-07203 |
|      |  |                                |
|      | Nancy Esque  | 2:18-cv-07208                  |
|      | Kathleen King  | 2:18-cv-07228                  |
|      | Robert Brown   | 2:18-cv-07234                  |
| 454  | Diane McGee, individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Kevin<br>McGee, Deceased          | 2:18-cv-07239                  |
| 455  | Mary Laffoon   | 2:18-cv-07243                  |
|      | George Gale  | 2:18-cv-07267                  |
|      | Clarence Abrams  | 2:18-cv-07270                  |
|      | Bonnie Apple   | 2:18-cv-07287                  |
|      | Helen Cannon   | 2:18-cv-07302                  |
|      | Sharon Ayers-Johnson   | 2:18 cv 07302<br>2:18-cv-07313 |
| 461  | Olivia Hogan, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of                                  | 2:18-cv-07319                  |
|      | Maggie Harrison, Deceased  | 2.4.0 07222                    |
|      | Brenda Bell  | 2:18-cv-07333                  |
|      | Thomas Russo   | 2:18-cv-07340                  |
| 464  | Forest Moore   | 2:18-cv-07351                  |
| 465  | Paul Lue, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Hyacinth Johnson, Deceased           | 2:18-cv-07352                  |
| 466  | Ernestine Mays-Mitchell, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Ernest Mays, Deceased | 2:18-cv-07365                  |
| 467  | Clarence Rich  | 2:18-cv-07373                  |
|      | Cynthia Stapleton  | 2:18-cv-07381                  |
|      | Alice Williams   | 2:18 cv 07390                  |
|      | Birdie Woods   | 2:18-cv-07330<br>2:18-cv-07438 |
|      | Lynette Tucker   | 2:18-cv-07441                  |
|      | Mary Murphy, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of                                   | 2:18-cv-07450                  |
| ., 2 | Garland Murphy, Deceased   |                                |

| 472 | Ronald Chasteen  | 2,12 07474                     |
|-----|--|--------------------------------|
|     |  | 2:18-cv-07474<br>2:18-cv-07488 |
|     | Douglas Dennison   |                                |
|     | Kathleen White   | 2:18-cv-07501                  |
|     | Shirley Newsome  | 2:18-cv-07503                  |
| 477 | Lloyd Fleenor  | 2:18-cv-07515                  |
| 478 | Jamie Morgan, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of<br>Bernard Morgan, Deceased                                  | 2:18-cv-07526                  |
| 479 | Cecelia Roberts  | 2:18-cv-07534                  |
| 480 | Tammy Taylor   | 2:18-cv-07538                  |
|     | Bessie Madden  | 2:18-cv-07541                  |
| 482 | Frank Tropier, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Irene Tropier, Deceased                                     | 2:18-cv-07544                  |
| 483 | Deborah King, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Eva<br>Manley, Deceased                                      | 2:18-cv-07550                  |
| 484 | Curtis Blankenship   | 2:18-cv-07553                  |
|     | Betty Apellido   | 2:18-cv-07557                  |
|     | Ora Groves   | 2:18-cv-07590                  |
|     | Gloria Dietrich  | 2:18 cv 07590<br>2:18-cv-07592 |
| -   | Robin Eden   | 2:18-cv-07532<br>2:18-cv-07613 |
|     | Walker Howell  | 2:18-cv-07615<br>2:18-cv-07616 |
|     | Stephanie Ralston-Bailey   | 2:18-cv-07617                  |
|     |  |                                |
|     | Laura Richie   | 2:18-cv-07622                  |
|     | Regina Salisbury   | 2:18-cv-07632                  |
|     | Marlene Hatfield   | 2:18-cv-07639                  |
|     | Caren Singer   | 2:18-cv-07640                  |
|     | Randall Morton   | 2:18-cv-07662                  |
|     | Sharon Nali  | 2:18-cv-07667                  |
| 497 | Irvin Albright   | 2:18-cv-07669                  |
| 498 | Mary Ann Negrete, individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Hiram Negrete, Deceased                                  | 2:18-cv-07671                  |
| 499 | William Solis, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Aura<br>Burgos, Deceased                                    | 2:18-cv-07688                  |
| 500 | Ronald Klinenberg  | 2:18-cv-07706                  |
| 501 | Linda Weller, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of<br>Marjorie Beecher, Deceased                                | 2:18-cv-07707                  |
|     | Luis Nesta   | 2:18-cv-07708                  |
|     | Lorraine Turco   | 2:18-cv-07713                  |
|     |  |                                |
|     | Delorise Marks   | 2:18-cv-07716                  |
| 505 | Mildred Hernandez, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Charles Varela, Deceased                                | 2:18-cv-07724                  |
| 506 | Hazel Phillips   | 2:18-cv-07748                  |
|     | Elvia Quiroga, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of   | 2:18-cv-07751                  |
| 507 | Pedro Quiroga, Deceased  |                                |
| 507 |  | 2:18-cv-07756                  |
| 507 | Pedro Quiroga, Deceased Tracie Powers Mary Rivali, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Robert Rivali, Deceased | 2:18-cv-07756<br>2:18-cv-07760 |

| Exh | ibit | А |
|-----|------|---|
|-----|------|---|

| 5111            | Illivan, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of livan, Deceased  | 2:18-cv-07781 |
|-----------------|---|---------------|
| 512 Bernadine   | · · ·   | 2:18-cv-07795 |
| 513 Peter Gue   | rrero   | 2:18-cv-07796 |
| 514 Delisha Th  |   | 2:18-cv-07801 |
| 515 Joel Neidl  |   | 2:18-cv-07833 |
| 516 Deanna Sł   |   | 2:18-cv-07851 |
| 517 Michael B   | arnett  | 2:19-cv-01055 |
| 5181 ~          | eman, As Proposed Representative of the Estate of Jack<br>Deceased                | 2:19-cv-01584 |
| 519 Dennis Ke   | ndall   | 2:19-cv-01668 |
| 520 Quintin De  | ennis   | 2:19-cv-01813 |
| 521 Ruth Dobs   |   | 2:19-cv-01849 |
| 522 Martha G    | iffith  | 2:19-cv-01853 |
| 523 William H   |   | 2:19-cv-01859 |
| 524 Gloria Hay  | wood  | 2:19-cv-01881 |
| 525 James Am    |   | 2:19-cv-01883 |
| 526 Ruth Hurd   |   | 2:19-cv-01887 |
| 527 Eric Hurwi  | tz  | 2:19-cv-01889 |
| 528 Patricia Jo | ppien   | 2:19-cv-01897 |
| 529 Paul Jozwi  |   | 2:19-cv-01902 |
| 530 Ethel Bircl | 1   | 2:19-cv-01914 |
| 531 Michele B   |   | 2:19-cv-01923 |
| 532 George Bo   | onis  | 2:19-cv-01931 |
| 533 Raymond     |   | 2:19-cv-01939 |
| 534 John Botte  | •   | 2:19-cv-01945 |
| 535 Cindy Carr  | pbell   | 2:19-cv-01948 |
| 536 Colleen Ca  |   | 2:19-cv-01965 |
| 5371            | on, Individually and as the Representative fo the Estate of<br>Iton Jr., Deceased | 2:19-cv-01976 |
| 538 Gladys Ca   |   | 2:19-cv-01981 |
| 539 Pete Caud   |   | 2:19-cv-01990 |
| 540 Brandon C   | Cole  | 2:19-cv-02004 |
| 541 Robert Cro  | enshaw  | 2:19-cv-02011 |
| 542 Wanda Cr    | ager  | 2:19-cv-02012 |
| 543 Jason Dan   | iels  | 2:19-cv-02015 |
| 544 Linda McN   | Aillen  | 2:19-cv-02035 |
| 545 Odessa M    | itchell   | 2:19-cv-02040 |
| 546 Patricia M  | itchell   | 2:19-cv-02048 |
| 547 Charles Ne  | ewsom   | 2:19-cv-02050 |
| 548 Orestes D   | az  | 2:19-cv-02059 |
| 549 Helmut Of   | to  | 2:19-cv-02061 |
| 550 Charlotte   | Edgar   | 2:19-cv-02074 |
|                 | vie, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Henry                | 2:19-cv-02086 |
| 552 William El  |   | 2:19-cv-02089 |
|                 | etchmore  | 2:19-cv-02102 |

## Exhibit A

| 55/11 | Juan Cantu, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of<br>Margarita Cantu, Deceased   | 2:19-cv-02104                  |
|-------|--|--------------------------------|
| 555.  | Juanita Landers  | 2:19-cv-02127                  |
| 556   | Johnny Fritts  | 2:19-cv-02128                  |
| 557   | Karen Gaines   | 2:19-cv-02136                  |
| 5581  | Brenda McCurdy, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Rickey McCurdy, Deceased   | 2:19-cv-02143                  |
|       | Gloria Hernandez   | 2:19-cv-02147                  |
| 560   | Cynthia McDonald, As the representative of the Estate of Helen<br>McDonald, deceased               | 2:19-cv-02157                  |
|       | Bridgette Long   | 2:19-cv-02159                  |
| 5671  | Nettie Overton, individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Charlie Overton, Deceased  | 2:19-cv-02174                  |
|       | Glenda Long  | 2:19-cv-02175                  |
|       | Melissa Olson  | 2:19-cv-02204                  |
| 565   | Sandra Pannell   | 2:19-cv-02246                  |
| 566   | Priscille Parent   | 2:19-cv-02261                  |
| 567   | Lucretia Peavy   | 2:19-cv-02275                  |
| 568   | Mabel Perry  | 2:19-cv-02318                  |
| 569   | Glenna Pool  | 2:19-cv-02335                  |
| 570   | Debra Primrose   | 2:19-cv-02356                  |
| 5711  | Margaret Pryor, As the Representative of the Estate of Keith Pryor, deceased                       | 2:19-cv-02367                  |
|       | loyce Sheffield  | 2:19-cv-02377                  |
|       | Terry Sheffield  | 2:19-cv-02386                  |
| 574   | Esther Rangel, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Armando Rangel, Deceased    | 2:19-cv-02404                  |
|       | Henry Shuster  | 2:19-cv-02445                  |
|       | John Silva   | 2:19-cv-02454                  |
|       | Lionel Smith   | 2:19-cv-02464                  |
|       | Linda Stockwell  | 2:19-cv-02475                  |
|       | Diane Watkins  | 2:19-cv-02484                  |
|       | James Williams   | 2:19-cv-02487                  |
|       | Charles Wiley  | 2:19-cv-02493                  |
|       | Darwin Valentine   | 2:19-cv-02547                  |
|       | Linda Wood   | 2:19-cv-02562                  |
| 58/   | Susan Lynn Wright, Individually and as the Representatie of the Estate of Tabitha Wright, Deceased | 2:19-cv-02577                  |
|       | Denise Brown   | 2:19-cv-02581                  |
|       | Donna Wooten   | 2:19-cv-02586                  |
|       | Andra Henderson  | 2:19-cv-02580                  |
|       | Darryl Herod   | 2:19-cv-02748                  |
|       | Michael Prilla   | 2:19-cv-02748<br>2:19-cv-02955 |
|       | John Choyce  | 2:19-cv-02933                  |
| 591   | Cheryl Adams, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Belle Collins,                           | 2:19-cv-02988<br>2:19-cv-02996 |
|       | Deceased   | 2,10 02000                     |
| 592   | Elia Carrillo  | 2:19-cv-03068                  |

| 593 Jeffrey Carter, Sr.  | 2:19-cv-03069                  |
|--|--------------------------------|
| 594 Carla Comer  | 2:19-cv-03073                  |
| 595 Leota Conrad   | 2:19-cv-03075                  |
| 596 John Covell  | 2:19-cv-03078                  |
| 597 Cynthia Etheridge  | 2:19-cv-03118                  |
| 598 Nancy Fennell  | 2:19-cv-03132                  |
| 599 Nellie Ferguson  | 2:19-cv-03137                  |
| 600 Treva Graves   | 2:19-cv-03142                  |
| 601 Terry Haynes   | 2:19-cv-03163                  |
| 602 Bertha Gable   | 2:19-cv-03165                  |
| 603 Georgia Jackson-Wade   | 2:19-cv-03193                  |
| 604 Rhonda Gomez   | 2:19-cv-03217                  |
| 605 Kevin Goss   | 2:19-cv-03252                  |
| 606 Paula Jones  | 2:19-cv-03256                  |
| 607 Merle Kirkland   | 2:19-cv-03272                  |
| 608 Mark Lacombe   | 2:19-cv-03277                  |
| 609 Dennis Lacy  | 2:19-cv-03284                  |
| 610 Lisa Peters  | 2:19-cv-03312                  |
| 611 Shelia Holmes  | 2:19-cv-03327                  |
| 612 Edward Miller  | 2:19-cv-03340                  |
| 613 Brandon Hugghins   | 2:19 cv 03340                  |
| 614 Sylvia Perez   | 2:19-cv-03368                  |
| 615 Linda Phillips   | 2:19-cv-03308<br>2:19-cv-03376 |
| 616 Michelle Inman   | 2:19-cv-03376<br>2:19-cv-03391 |
| 617 Charlene Jackson   |                                |
|  | 2:19-cv-03415                  |
| 618 Brenda Ridyolph  | 2:19-cv-03419                  |
| 619 Paula Jackson  | 2:19-cv-03433                  |
| 620 Sandi Robinson   | 2:19-cv-03435                  |
| 621 Wanda Rogers   | 2:19-cv-03445                  |
| 622 Barbara Steele   | 2:19-cv-03458                  |
| 623 Bettye Stockton  | 2:19-cv-03467                  |
| 624 Erick Joe  | 2:19-cv-03476                  |
| 625 Nancy Sullivan   | 2:19-cv-03477                  |
| 626 Shirley Swope  | 2:19-cv-03480                  |
| 627 Cynthia Tucker   | 2:19-cv-03489                  |
| 628 Shirlie Johnson  | 2:19-cv-03494                  |
| 629 Dante Wilder   | 2:19-cv-03508                  |
| 630 Moses Willmore   | 2:19-cv-03520                  |
| 631 Lidia Yanez  | 2:19-cv-03524                  |
| 632 Ronald E. Ker  | 2:19-cv-03528                  |
| 633 Karen Collins, As proposed representative of the Estate of Charles Collins, deceased | 2:19-cv-03537                  |
| 634 Carolyn Coule and Jerome Coule   | 2:19-cv-03544                  |
| 635 Joel Kight   | 2:19-cv-03545                  |
| 636 Rosetta Cunningham   | 2:19 cv 03543                  |
| 637 Helen Davis  | 2:19 cv 03555                  |
| 638 Paul E. Dilocker   | 2:19-cv-03589                  |

| 639  | Ruth Edwards  | 2:19-cv-03595 |
|------|---|---------------|
|      | Rickie Swonger, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Joyce Boyer,                      | 2.15 00 05555 |
| 6401 | Deceased  | 2:19-cv-03596 |
| 641  | Carl Brewer, Jr.  | 2:19-cv-03605 |
| 642  | Lowanda Ford, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of William Ford, Deceased              | 2:19-cv-03612 |
| 643  | Phillip Cottle  | 2:19-cv-03618 |
|      | Linda Fresquez  | 2:19-cv-03624 |
| 645  | Timothy Buzard  | 2:19-cv-03626 |
| 646  | Diana Greathouse  | 2:19-cv-03633 |
| 647  | Lena Turknett, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Cecilia Gaines, Deceased           | 2:19-cv-03636 |
| 648  | Suzanne Coleman-Cunningham  | 2:19-cv-03638 |
| 649  | Maria Garcia  | 2:19-cv-03644 |
| 6501 | Betty Hunter, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Thomas Hunter, Deceased | 2:19-cv-03645 |
| 651  | Noreen Davis-Xanthis  | 2:19-cv-03646 |
| 652  | Harrison Gift, III  | 2:19-cv-03651 |
| 653  | Juanita Mekwuye   | 2:19-cv-03652 |
| 654  | Lucille Dunson  | 2:19-cv-03661 |
| 655  | Bernadette Green  | 2:19-cv-03662 |
| 656  | Barbara Zajack  | 2:19-cv-03663 |
| 657  | Ruthie Griffin  | 2:19-cv-03670 |
| 658  | Melba Fabel   | 2:19-cv-03671 |
| 659  | Jennifer Collins  | 2:19-cv-03679 |
| 660  | Cecile Fichtner   | 2:19-cv-03681 |
| 661  | Melissa Harris  | 2:19-cv-03684 |
| 662  | Tracy Henderson   | 2:19-cv-03685 |
| 663  | Linwood Flemister   | 2:19-cv-03686 |
| 664  | Kathlene Henson and Ernest Henson   | 2:19-cv-03687 |
| 665  | Elizabeth Flournoy  | 2:19-cv-03697 |
| 666  | Cathleen James  | 2:19-cv-03707 |
| 667  | James Franklin, Sr.   | 2:19-cv-03711 |
| 668  | Cyndi Mazza, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Josephine<br>Kempf, Deceased         | 2:19-cv-03716 |
|      | Cynthia Lawhorn   | 2:19-cv-03739 |
|      | Adeline Henderson   | 2:19-cv-03769 |
| 671  | Linda Martinez  | 2:19-cv-03777 |
| 672  | Lynell Johnson  | 2:19-cv-03784 |
| 673  | Michael Jones   | 2:19-cv-03806 |
| 674  | Cara Kreider  | 2:19-cv-03817 |
| 675  | Stephen McNeill   | 2:19-cv-03823 |
|      | Richard Lombardo  | 2:19-cv-03826 |
| 677  | Linda Metcalf   | 2:19-cv-03836 |
| 678  | Matilde Lopez   | 2:19-cv-03839 |
|      | Kathleen Mirarchi   | 2:19-cv-03841 |
|      | Wilma Miller  | 2:19-cv-03849 |

| 681 | Tammy Phipps   | 2:19-cv-03863 |
|-----|--|---------------|
|     | Melissa Konarski, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of  | 2.15-00-05005 |
| 687 | Pamela Zaccardi, Deceased  | 2:19-cv-03869 |
|     | Patty Anderson   | 2:19-cv-03889 |
| 684 | Kevin Takacs   | 2:19-cv-03921 |
| 685 | Patricia E. Thomas   | 2:19-cv-03980 |
| 686 | Brandon Ward   | 2:19-cv-03987 |
| 687 | Darren Williams  | 2:19-cv-04012 |
| 688 | Belinda Laird  | 2:19-cv-04031 |
| 689 | Robert Williams  | 2:19-cv-04036 |
| 690 | Gaye Young   | 2:19-cv-04050 |
| 691 | Julie Long   | 2:19-cv-04094 |
|     | Fidencio Lopez   | 2:19-cv-04111 |
|     | Anita Loudy  | 2:19-cv-04113 |
| 694 | Harold Martin  | 2:19-cv-04125 |
| 695 | Fernando Martinez, Jr.   | 2:19-cv-04130 |
|     | Sandra Detherage   | 2:19-cv-04133 |
|     | Carol Rosenblum  | 2:19-cv-04146 |
| 698 | Linda Barnett  | 2:19-cv-04152 |
|     | Bernice Elkins, As the Representative of the Estate of Chilles Elkins,     |               |
| 699 | Deceased   | 2:19-cv-04161 |
| 700 | Susan Payne  | 2:19-cv-04162 |
| 701 | Keith Ellery   | 2:19-cv-04166 |
| 702 | Kerry Bland  | 2:19-cv-04178 |
| 703 | Denise Garrette  | 2:19-cv-04188 |
| 704 | Josette Schaffer   | 2:19-cv-04192 |
| 705 | Barbara Grant  | 2:19-cv-04197 |
| 706 | Lynn Seabrook  | 2:19-cv-04198 |
| 707 | Mary C. Smith  | 2:19-cv-04202 |
| 708 | John Danso, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate of Vickie | 2:19-cv-04204 |
| 700 | Danso, Deceased  | 2.15 00 04204 |
| 709 | Rachel Smith   | 2:19-cv-04207 |
|     | Lawrence Lucerne   | 2:19-cv-04209 |
|     | Rickey E. Vice   | 2:19-cv-04211 |
|     | Sandra Mason   | 2:19-cv-04218 |
|     | Cheryl Woody   | 2:19-cv-04223 |
| 714 | Beverly McCaleb  | 2:19-cv-04224 |
| 715 | Veda McDonald-Rhodes, Individually and as the Representative of the        | 2:19-cv-04228 |
|     | Estate of Andre McDonald, Deceased   |               |
|     | Joanne Smith   | 2:19-cv-04234 |
|     | Lee Spaulding  | 2:19-cv-04238 |
|     | Diane Wood   | 2:19-cv-04242 |
|     | Marvin Edwards   | 2:19-cv-04248 |
|     | John Mangum  | 2:19-cv-04263 |
|     | Robert McKim   | 2:19-cv-04266 |
| 722 | Paul Shrode  | 2:19-cv-04267 |

| A term Mich - Learn - an Duran and Departmentative of the Estate of Winnie L                     | 1                              |
|--|--------------------------------|
| 723 Mary Nicholson, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Winnie L.<br>Nicholson, Deceased | 2:19-cv-04276                  |
| 724 Robert C. Lopez  | 2:19-cv-04342                  |
| 725 Mary Burchett  | 2:19-cv-04470                  |
| 726 Greg Cadjew  | 2:19-cv-04473                  |
| 727 Anabel Campbell  | 2:19-cv-04473                  |
| 728 Clarice Boutin   | 2:19-cv-04485                  |
| 729 Joanna E. Campbell   | 2:19-cv-04488<br>2:19-cv-04492 |
| 730 Quinten W. Bowen   | 2:19-cv-04492<br>2:19-cv-04497 |
| 731 Michael Bowen  | 2:19-cv-04497<br>2:19-cv-04503 |
|  |                                |
| 732 Cathleen A. Brooks   | 2:19-cv-04504                  |
| 733 Don Burleson-Castillo  | 2:19-cv-04505                  |
| 734 Terri L. Banfield  | 2:19-cv-04506                  |
| 735 Lisa Brookshire  | 2:19-cv-04510                  |
| 736 Melinda J. Burns   | 2:19-cv-04515                  |
| 737 Catherine Antwine  | 2:19-cv-04516                  |
| 738 Roy D. Burress   | 2:19-cv-04517                  |
| 739 Jackie L. Brown  | 2:19-cv-04518                  |
| 740 Joseph A. Archer   | 2:19-cv-04519                  |
| 741 Margie T. Bannister  | 2:19-cv-04528                  |
| 742 Danny Asti   | 2:19-cv-04534                  |
| 743 Leta Bannon  | 2:19-cv-04535                  |
| 744 Janice Weibley, on behalf of Elizabeth L. Boyd   | 2:19-cv-04537                  |
| 745 Cassandra Bell   | 2:19-cv-04548                  |
| 746 Debra Bramblett  | 2:19-cv-04561                  |
| 747 Douglas Ball   | 2:19-cv-04572                  |
| 748 Laquiche L. Benjamin   | 2:19-cv-04573                  |
| 749 Brent Bregan   | 2:19-cv-04574                  |
| 750 Sharon L. Bennett  | 2:19-cv-04580                  |
| 751 Charita R. Brown   | 2:19-cv-04586                  |
| 752 Johnny Brown   | 2:19-cv-04592                  |
| 753 Todd Brown   | 2:19-cv-04595                  |
| 754 Yvonne Abrams  | 2:19-cv-04617                  |
| 755 Lisa D. Binder   | 2:19-cv-04628                  |
| 756 Ricky W. Barley  | 2:19-cv-04629                  |
| 757 Candy J. Bryant  | 2:19-cv-04630                  |
| 758 Tammie Y. Cheatham   | 2:19-cv-04634                  |
| 759 Charles A. Biondillo   | 2:19-cv-04643                  |
| 760 Dennis Bunch   | 2:19-cv-04650                  |
| 761 Sherman Bunnell  | 2:19-cv-04653                  |
| 762 Ruth Cassidy   | 2:19-cv-04664                  |
| 763 Lisa Jo Albright   | 2:19-cv-04674                  |
| 764 Brian D. Alexander   | 2:19-cv-04680                  |
| 765 Josephine Basey  | 2:19-cv-04681                  |
| 766 Damisha L. Bishop  | 2:19-cv-04681<br>2:19-cv-04684 |
| 766 Joe Alfieri  |                                |
|  | 2:19-cv-04690                  |

2:19-cv-04700

768 Christine S. Basile

| 760 Shirlow Doce   | 2,10 - 04702                   |
|--|--------------------------------|
| 769 Shirley Bass<br>770 Sylvia J. Cotton   | 2:19-cv-04703<br>2:19-cv-04709 |
| 770 Sylvia J. Cotton<br>771 Gerald E. Coyle  | 2:19-cv-04709<br>2:19-cv-04719 |
|  |                                |
| 772 Alice Baxter   | 2:19-cv-04722                  |
| 773 Joe Bean   | 2:19-cv-04730                  |
| 774 Jackie Crawford  | 2:19-cv-04734                  |
| 775 Ruth V. Cleveland  | 2:19-cv-04735                  |
| 776 Anna Gonzalez, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Beatrice Ceja<br>Deceased | , 2:19-cv-04750                |
| 777 Derrick A. Cloud   | 2:19-cv-04756                  |
| 778 Sharon Brewer  | 2:19-cv-04761                  |
| 779 Etta M. Brewer   | 2:19-cv-04762                  |
| 780 Tiena Britt  | 2:19-cv-04773                  |
| 781 Joe Dehart   | 2:19-cv-04776                  |
| 782 Jose Deleon  | 2:19-cv-04781                  |
| 783 Twila M. Dillon  | 2:19-cv-04790                  |
| 784 Richard Dismuke  | 2:19-cv-04792                  |
| 785 Larry Cole   | 2:19-cv-04798                  |
| 786 Joel Chapa   | 2:19-cv-04810                  |
| 787 Leif E. Anderson   | 2:19-cv-04821                  |
| 788 Mary Eddy  | 2:19-cv-04825                  |
| 789 Dora Chatman   | 2:19-cv-04826                  |
| 790 Stephen Eaton  | 2:19-cv-04829                  |
| 791 David A. Ealy  | 2:19-cv-04837                  |
| 792 Jack Cunningham  | 2:19-cv-04844                  |
| 793 Clara C. Dacko   | 2:19-cv-04848                  |
| 794 Linda Duffy  | 2:19-cv-04862                  |
| 795 Jean C. Darby  | 2:19-cv-04878                  |
| 796 Tina Dasher  | 2:19-cv-04882                  |
| 797 Mark A. Anderson   | 2:19-cv-04883                  |
| 798 Arnada F. Davis  | 2:19-cv-04906                  |
| 799 Jamie Davis  | 2:19-cv-04907                  |
| 800 Augusta L. Colson  | 2:19-cv-04909                  |
| 801 John Elliott   | 2:19-cv-04913                  |
| 802 David Andrews  | 2:19-cv-04913                  |
| 803 Deborah K. Elmer   | 2:19-cv-04914<br>2:19-cv-04918 |
| 804 Lori A. Enos   | 2:19-cv-04918                  |
| 805 Adela Anguiano   | 2:19-cv-04923                  |
| 806 Troy Ersch   | 2:19-cv-04927<br>2:19-cv-04932 |
| 807 Theresa Cooper   | 2:19-cv-04932<br>2:19-cv-04939 |
| 808 Doris Crutchfield  | 2:19-cv-04939<br>2:19-cv-04944 |
|  | 2:19-cv-04944<br>2:19-cv-04950 |
| 809 Kevin Carr   |                                |
| 810 Letrell Cuff   | 2:19-cv-04951                  |
| 811 Robbin Carridine   | 2:19-cv-04952                  |
| 812 Catherine Carroll  | 2:19-cv-04960                  |
| 813 Lula M. Day  | 2:19-cv-04961                  |
| 814 James F. Dean  | 2:19-cv-04967                  |

| 815 Pamela Fix                            | 2:19-cv-04972                  |
|---|--------------------------------|
| 816 John Fry                              | 2:19-cv-04976                  |
| 817 Angela Clinton                        | 2:19-cv-04981                  |
| 818 Pat J. Evans                          | 2:19-cv-04986                  |
| 819 Cynthia Bonacci                       | 2:19-cv-04994                  |
| 820 Robin Fizhugh                         | 2:19-cv-05006                  |
| 821 Joyce Carvalho                        | 2:19-cv-05016                  |
| 822 Calvin Carver                         | 2:19-cv-05022                  |
| 823 Sherley L. Booker                     | 2:19-cv-05027                  |
| 824 Lee Booth                             | 2:19-cv-05052                  |
| 825 Albert V. Borboa                      | 2:19-cv-05053                  |
| 826 Evelyn W. Frey                        | 2:19-cv-05069                  |
| 827 Mary Duncan                           | 2:19-cv-05072                  |
| 828 Mary Jane Franklin                    | 2:19-cv-05073                  |
| 829 Gerardo Gallaga                       | 2:19-cv-05089                  |
| 830 Libia Felix                           | 2:19-cv-05094                  |
| 831 Charlotte Edwards                     | 2:19-cv-05097                  |
| 832 Amber N. Felthauser                   | 2:19-cv-05098                  |
| 833 Dorthy Edwards                        | 2:19-cv-05099                  |
| 834 Jacqualine Ferera                     | 2:19-cv-05102                  |
| 835 Beverly Ficklin                       | 2:19-cv-05111                  |
| 836 Keith Franklin                        | 2:19-cv-05112                  |
| 837 Walter Gaddis                         | 2:19-cv-05115                  |
| 838 Matilda Gagliardi                     | 2:19-cv-05119                  |
| 839 Barbara S. Foutty                     | 2:19-cv-05132                  |
| 840 Debbie A. Garcia                      | 2:19-cv-05135                  |
| 841 Sue A. Fink                           | 2:19 cv 05135                  |
| 842 Susan K. Kellar                       | 2:19-cv-05166                  |
| 843 Robert L. Johnson, Jr.                | 2:19:00 05100                  |
| 844 Susan K. Kelley                       | 2:19-cv-05174<br>2:19-cv-05174 |
| 845 Timothy Henry                         | 2:19-cv-05177                  |
| 846 Angela K. Henry                       | 2:19-cv-05185                  |
| 847 David M. Huddleston                   | 2:19-cv-05186                  |
| 848 Glenda Jackson                        | 2:19-cv-05188<br>2:19-cv-05193 |
| 849 Bobby G Jones                         | 2:19-cv-05196                  |
|   | 2:19-cv-05196<br>2:19-cv-05197 |
| 850 Darlene Huettenberger                 |                                |
| 851 Gary D. Johnson<br>852 Vivian Knudsen | 2:19-cv-05199<br>2:19-cv-05209 |
|   |                                |
| 853 Annie M Jones<br>854 Gordon Hills     | 2:19-cv-05217                  |
|   | 2:19-cv-05220                  |
| 855 Barbara A. Jones                      | 2:19-cv-05230                  |
| 856 Vickie L. Jones                       | 2:19-cv-05242                  |
| 857 Ronnie W. Johnson                     | 2:19-cv-05247                  |
| 858 Vickie Kemp                           | 2:19-cv-05249                  |
| 859 Kathleen F. Kimble                    | 2:19-cv-05263                  |
| 860 Michael Hurley                        | 2:19-cv-05267                  |
| 861 Wesley Hurt                           | 2:19-cv-05271                  |

|   | Ι                 |
|---|-------------------|
| 862 Billy R. Johns                              | 2:19-cv-05273     |
| 863 Donna Hines                                 | 2:19-cv-05275     |
| 864 Virginia Johnson Gruver                     | 2:19-cv-05281     |
| 865 Margaret Jordan                             | 2:19-cv-05295     |
| 866 Williard I. Justice                         | 2:19-cv-05304     |
| 867 Jane Krause                                 | 2:19-cv-05312     |
| 868 Carol M. Kristian                           | 2:19-cv-05315     |
| 869 Tammy Jobe                                  | 2:19-cv-05319     |
| 870 Connie Ivory                                | 2:19-cv-05324     |
| 871 Karen C. King                               | 2:19-cv-05327     |
| 872 Jerry R. Kingery                            | 2:19-cv-05328     |
| 873 Constance Gary                              | 2:19-cv-05335     |
| 874 Henry H. Hessen                             | 2:19-cv-05341     |
| 875 Patrick W. Lacke                            | 2:19-cv-05349     |
| 876 Barton S. Hickey                            | 2:19-cv-05353     |
| 877 Cinda Geerlings                             | 2:19-cv-05359     |
| 878 Pamela Kazak                                | 2:19-cv-05369     |
| 879 David Gilbert                               | 2:19-cv-05370     |
| 880 Romona Kea                                  | 2:19-cv-05375     |
| 881 Phyllis j. Kinsey                           | 2:19-cv-05376     |
| 882 Edward W. Gildner                           | 2:19-cv-05379     |
| 883 Lisa Keith                                  | 2:19-cv-05385     |
| 884 Deborah Gilstrap                            | 2:19-cv-05387     |
| 885 Marion Francis Keith                        | 2:19-cv-05391     |
| 886 Sue Langham                                 | 2:19-cv-05401     |
| 887 William D. Hinshaw                          | 2:19-cv-05415     |
| 888 Mark D. Hochul                              | 2:19-cv-05428     |
| 889 Kathleen Lalor                              | 2:19-cv-05507     |
| 890 Nancy K. Garza                              | 2:19-cv-05528     |
| 891 Richard Graham                              | 2:19-cv-05544     |
| 892 Louise Jones                                | 2:19-cv-05548     |
| 893 June S. Grumbein                            | 2:19-cv-05558     |
| 894 Sarah Holland                               | 2:19-cv-05563     |
| 895 Ronald W. Grissom                           | 2:19-cv-05600     |
| 896 Darren Gines                                | 2:19-cv-05608     |
| 897 Milton E. Hansen, Jr.                       | 2:19-cv-05610     |
| 898 Loyce A. Hampson                            | 2:19-cv-05623     |
| 899 Teresa Haney                                | 2:19-cv-05636     |
| Linda Guzman, as Proposed Representative of the | Estate of Barbara |
| 900<br>Guzman, Deceased                         | 2:19-cv-05649     |
| 901 Connie Gamez                                | 2:19-cv-05652     |
| 902 Jesse Hales                                 | 2:19-cv-05697     |
| 903 Paul Glasper                                | 2:19-cv-05699     |
| 904 Shelley M. Harder                           | 2:19-cv-05703     |
| 905 Anne A. Headrick                            | 2:19-cv-05728     |
| 906 Sandra S. Hart                              | 2:19-cv-05731     |
| 907 John D. Harrison                            | 2:19 cv 05734     |

| 908  | Melvin W. Hendryx   | 2:19-cv-05745                  |
|------|---|--------------------------------|
|      | Verna Heideman  | 2:19-cv-05750                  |
|      | Derric R. Henderson   | 2:19-cv-05773                  |
|      | Jason A. Head   | 2:19-cv-05847                  |
|      | Vanessa Harper  | 2:19-cv-05850                  |
|      | Jeffrey A Heaps   | 2:19-cv-05853                  |
|      | Barbara A. Harper   | 2:19-cv-05864                  |
|      | Rhonda Leopold  | 2:19-cv-06011                  |
|      | Carol A. Lentz  | 2:19-cv-06012                  |
|      | Terica Lemon  | 2:19-cv-06012                  |
|      | Alberta Lee   | 2:19-cv-06017                  |
|      | Jerry Lawley, Jr.   | 2:19 cv 06017<br>2:19-cv-06026 |
|      | Delois Miller   | 2:19-cv-06069                  |
|      | Gail H. Mills   | 2:19-cv-06072                  |
|      | Joseph Mirabile   | 2:19-cv-06072                  |
|      | Barbara Mire  | 2:19-cv-06078<br>2:19-cv-06079 |
|      | Barbara Mire<br>Berchia M. Mitchell   | 2:19-cv-06079<br>2:19-cv-06106 |
|      | Jason R. Mitchell   | 2:19-cv-06106<br>2:19-cv-06110 |
|      |   |                                |
|      | Alice Moore   | 2:19-cv-06123                  |
|      | Linda L. Hopkins  | 2:19-cv-06152                  |
|      | Kimberly A. Horn  | 2:19-cv-06160                  |
|      | Veronica C. Williams  | 2:19-cv-06193                  |
| 930  | Zane Libert, as the Proposed Administrator of the Estate of Julianna Libert, deceased           | 2:19-cv-06198                  |
| 931  | Jerry Winthrop  | 2:19-cv-06213                  |
| 932  | Joe N. Little   | 2:19-cv-06225                  |
| 933  | Betty J. Withrow  | 2:19-cv-06226                  |
| 934  | Teena Williams  | 2:19-cv-06236                  |
| 935  | Kevin Wilson  | 2:19-cv-06305                  |
| 936  | Desiree Lovins  | 2:19-cv-06323                  |
| 937  | Robert R. Houser  | 2:19-cv-06349                  |
| 938  | Judith Lambert  | 2:19-cv-06352                  |
| 939  | Anthony Lanas   | 2:19-cv-06354                  |
| 940  | Juliana Wimberly  | 2:19-cv-06370                  |
| 941  | Betty Lowther   | 2:19-cv-06374                  |
| 942  | Joseph W. Lucas   | 2:19-cv-06376                  |
| 943  | Candace M. Malin  | 2:19-cv-06392                  |
| 944  | Helen M. Martinez   | 2:19-cv-06426                  |
| 945  | Raul Martinez   | 2:19-cv-06429                  |
| 946  | Rebecca Meader  | 2:19-cv-06437                  |
| 947  | Shekina D. Mason  | 2:19-cv-06439                  |
| 948  | Jacobus Mekes   | 2:19-cv-06443                  |
| 9491 | Sharon W. Mellott, as the Proposed Administrator of the Estate of Jerry<br>W. Mellott, deceased | 2:19-cv-06445                  |
|      | Deborah Mercer  | 2:19-cv-06452                  |
|      | Kym Matthews  | 2:19-cv-06452<br>2:19-cv-06455 |
|      | •   |                                |
| 952  | Lynda Mercer  | 2:19-cv-06456                  |

| 953 Lena Woolfolk                      | 2:19-cv-06457                                |
|--|--|
| 954 Jessie M. Merriweather             | 2:19-cv-06460                                |
| 955 Oliver T. Mihm                     | 2:19-cv-06482                                |
| 956 Henry G. Miles                     | 2:19-cv-06486                                |
| 957 Lora Wilson                        | 2:19-cv-06490                                |
| 958 Alexander J. Mayfield              | 2:19-cv-06491                                |
| 959 Teresa Mayo                        | 2:19-cv-06495                                |
| 960 Arlene Miller                      | 2:19-cv-06496                                |
| 961 Thelma McClellen                   | 2:19-cv-06520                                |
| 962 Brenda McConnachie                 | 2:19-cv-06522                                |
| 963 Dee A. Mankins                     | 2:19-cv-06533                                |
| 964 Iris L. Manning                    | 2:19-cv-06534                                |
| 965 Grachell L. Manuel                 | 2:19-cv-06537                                |
| 966 Janet S. Markello                  | 2:19-cv-06540                                |
| 967 Douglas Worden                     | 2:19-cv-06542                                |
| 968 Joann C. Worden                    | 2:19-cv-06550                                |
| 969 Marilyn Young                      | 2:19-cv-06599                                |
| 970 Missouri McCann                    | 2:19-cv-06555<br>2:19-cv-06614               |
| 971 Hollis Q. Moore                    | 2:19-cv-06637                                |
| 972 Antonio Morales                    | 2:19-cv-06641                                |
| 973 Anna M. Morales                    | 2:19-cv-06642                                |
| 974 August Morella                     | 2:19-cv-06644<br>2:19-cv-06644               |
| 975 Jessie Noiel                       | 2:19-cv-06649                                |
| 976 Jeffrey A. Oakley                  | 2:19-cv-06656                                |
| 977 Norma J. Ochoa                     | 2:19-cv-06657                                |
| 978 Marilyn D. Ojeda                   | 2:19-cv-06660<br>2:19-cv-06660               |
| 979 Mindy Oosting                      | 2:19-cv-06660                                |
| 980 William H. Morgan                  | 2:19-cv-06677                                |
| 981 Marilyn A. Palma                   | 2:19-cv-06690<br>2:19-cv-06690               |
| 982 Darrell M. Papaleo                 | 2:19-cv-06693<br>2:19-cv-06693               |
|  |  |
| 983 Betty A. Parks                     | 2:19-cv-06696                                |
| 984 Kay Parks                          | 2:19-cv-06697                                |
| 985 Maria D. Parovel                   | 2:19-cv-06699                                |
| 986 Deborah L Patterson                | 2:19-cv-06706                                |
| 987 Lisa York-Williams                 | 2:19-cv-06712                                |
| 988 Shirley Murray                     | 2:19-cv-06713                                |
| 989 Sandy Myers                        | 2:19-cv-06721                                |
| 990 Renato Natal                       | 2:19-cv-06730                                |
| 991 Andrenette Marshall                | 2:19-cv-06748                                |
| 992 Daniel Peters                      | 2:19-cv-06823                                |
| 993 David Peterson, Sr.                | 2:19-cv-06827                                |
| 994 Leonard Nesbitt                    | 2:19-cv-06828                                |
| 995 Cherri D. Young                    | 2:19-cv-06837                                |
| Rachel Martinez, as Proposed Represent | ative of the Estate of Richard 2:19-cv-06845 |
| Martinez, Deceased                     |  |
| 997 Annette K. Morris                  | 2:19-cv-06862                                |
| 998 Neal H. Pleasant                   | 2:19-cv-06883                                |

| 999 Adrienne Newton   | 2:19-cv-06885                  |
|---|--------------------------------|
| 1000 John Nicastro  | 2:19-cv-06889                  |
| 1001 Eddie Nicholson  | 2:19-cv-06897                  |
| 1002 Joyce Niemi  | 2:19-cv-06899                  |
| 1003 Luis Nieves  | 2:19-cv-06900                  |
| 1004 Barbara Noble  | 2:19-cv-06911                  |
| 1005 Norma Wright   | 2:19-cv-06918                  |
| 1006 Norman Reynolds  | 2:19-cv-06938                  |
| 1007 Luis Rodriguez-Charriez  | 2:19-cv-06947                  |
| 1008 Walter R. Roger  | 2:19-cv-06950                  |
| 1009 James Potter   | 2:19-cv-06962                  |
| 1010 Misty C. Powell  | 2:19-cv-06966                  |
| 1011 Leon Rhodes and Veronica Rhodes                                    | 2:19-cv-06967                  |
| 1012 Carolyn Powers   | 2:19-cv-06974                  |
| 1013 Francis Presto   | 2:19-cv-06981                  |
| 1014 Deborah A. Richard   | 2:19-cv-06989                  |
| 1015 Daniel Paul  | 2:19-cv-07003                  |
| 1016 Louise C. Peaco  | 2:19-cv-07010                  |
| 1017 Pamela M. Pruitt   | 2:19-cv-07022                  |
| 1018 Kathy Ridgeway   | 2:19-cv-07034                  |
| 1019 Esteban Rojo   | 2:19-cv-07039                  |
| 1020 Anthony Riley  | 2:19-cv-07045                  |
| 1021 Ricky L. Wilson  | 2:19-cv-07047                  |
| 1022 Annette H. Ringley   | 2:19-cv-07049                  |
| 1023 Linda Roach  | 2:19-cv-07057                  |
| 1024 Leona Quinn  | 2:19-cv-07059                  |
| 1025 Frank Quinones   | 2:19-cv-07065                  |
| 1026 Sharon Raabe   | 2:19-cv-07069                  |
| 1027 Judith Robertson   | 2:19-cv-07082                  |
| 1028 Martina Ramirez  | 2:19-cv-07083                  |
| 1029 James Randolph   | 2:19-cv-07104                  |
| 1030 Debbie M. Rankin   | 2:19-cv-07111                  |
| 1031 April Rondeau  | 2:19-cv-07119                  |
| 1032 Ruth Roozing-Grimsrud  | 2:19-cv-07126                  |
| 1033 Manuel G. Rodriguez  | 2:19-cv-07137                  |
| 1034 David B. Zarosky   | 2:19 cv 07137<br>2:19-cv-07139 |
| 1035 Brandi Peebles   | 2:19-cv-07166                  |
| David Pennypacker, as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Cynthia  | 2.15-07100                     |
| 1036 Pennypacker, Deceased  | 2:19-cv-07175                  |
| 1037 Eric D. Perkins  | 2:19-cv-07188                  |
| 1037 Enc D. Perkins<br>1038 Michael Scadden                             | 2:19-CV-07191                  |
| Claudia Ortega, as the Proposed Administrator of the Estate of Josefina | 2.13-04-07131                  |
| 1039<br>Silva, deceased   | 2:19-cv-07201                  |
|   | 2,10 ~ 07202                   |
| 1040 William Schiffert  | 2:19-cv-07203<br>2:19-cv-07206 |
| 1041 Sydney B. Silver   |                                |
| 1042 Darlet A. Simile   | 2:19-cv-07208                  |
| 1043 Bruce E. Simmons   | 2:19-cv-07210                  |

|            |  | I             |
|------------|--|---------------|
|            | y M. Simmons   | 2:19-cv-07214 |
|            | ald A. Simmons   | 2:19-cv-07216 |
|            | yl D. Simpson  | 2:19-cv-07218 |
| 1047 Ther  | •  | 2:19-cv-07222 |
| 1048 Ben   |  | 2:19-cv-07238 |
| 1049 Robe  |  | 2:19-cv-07247 |
| 10501      | Scott, As Proposed Representative of the Estate of Melvern Scott,<br>eased | 2:19-cv-07250 |
| 1051 Nano  | cy Rouseau   | 2:19-cv-07267 |
| 1052 Lisa  | C. Rowlette  | 2:19-cv-07272 |
| 1053 Ama   | nda Scrimpsher   | 2:19-cv-07300 |
| 1054 Roge  | er Zickefoose  | 2:19-cv-07306 |
| 1055 Scot  | t E. Shaner  | 2:19-cv-07348 |
| 1056 Rayr  | nond L. Shaner   | 2:19-cv-07349 |
| 1057 Anita | a L. Shank   | 2:19-cv-07352 |
| 1058 Carla | a A. Smith   | 2:19-cv-07358 |
| 1059 Debi  | ra Sheffey   | 2:19-cv-07372 |
| 1060 Glor  | ia Sheppard  | 2:19-cv-07382 |
| 1061 Patri | icia A. Smith  | 2:19-cv-07383 |
| 1062 Andı  | rew Sherrod  | 2:19-cv-07388 |
| 1063 Shar  | on Smith   | 2:19-cv-07389 |
| 1064 Valo  | rie Sherrod  | 2:19-cv-07390 |
| 1065 Anne  | ette H. Shook  | 2:19-cv-07400 |
| 1066 Yslet | a Smith  | 2:19-cv-07403 |
| 1067 Arle  | ne Sidenstick  | 2:19-cv-07425 |
| 1068 Davi  | d A. Soliz   | 2:19-cv-07493 |
| 1069 Gilbe | ert J. Sosa  | 2:19-cv-07500 |
| 1070 Chris | stina Spaulding  | 2:19-cv-07509 |
| 1071 Heid  | i McGee  | 2:19-cv-07516 |
| 1072 Troy  | McKelvy  | 2:19-cv-07521 |
|            | nda M. Meacacke  | 2:19-cv-07543 |
| Î          | R. Sussman   | 2:19-cv-07552 |
| 1075 Wen   | dy Swartz  | 2:19-cv-07555 |
| 1076 Bren  | ida Swift  | 2:19-cv-07558 |
| 1077 Daw   | n Takacs   | 2:19-cv-07560 |
| 1078 Kern  | nit E. Tate  | 2:19-cv-07563 |
| 1079 Tony  | / E. Taylor  | 2:19-cv-07569 |
| 1080 Rona  | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                                      | 2:19-cv-07572 |
| 1081 Barb  | ara A. Rauenzahn   | 2:19-cv-07574 |
| 1082 Jane  | t Reardon  | 2:19-cv-07580 |
| 1083 Elspe | eth A. Teed  | 2:19-cv-07584 |
|            | nael B. Tenore   | 2:19-cv-07587 |
| 1085 Ruby  | / M. Terrasas  | 2:19-cv-07589 |
|            | ela D. Terry   | 2:19-cv-07590 |
|            | am Thomas  | 2:19-cv-07597 |
| 1088 Willi |  | 2:19-cv-07600 |
|            | nthony M. Thomas   | 2:19-cv-07601 |

| 1090 Kim Sposato   | 2:19-cv-07621                         |
|--|---------------------------------------|
| 1091 Dean St. John   | 2:19-cv-07624                         |
| Diane Robinson, As Proposed Representative                               | of the Estate of James                |
| 1092 Stacker, Deceased   | 2:19-cv-07627                         |
| 1093 Daniel M. Russell   | 2:19-cv-07633                         |
| 1094 Carrie L. Stark   | 2:19-cv-07634                         |
| 1095 Courtney Stark  | 2:19-cv-07636                         |
| 1096 Rose Starr  | 2:19-cv-07639                         |
| 1097 Sally D. Reed   | 2:19-cv-07642                         |
| 1098 Gail E. Sachs   | 2:19-cv-07653                         |
| 1099 Sandra Steen  | 2:19-cv-07658                         |
| 1100 Sheila K. Sain  | 2:19-cv-07661                         |
| 1101 Yvette Sanders  | 2:19-cv-07673                         |
| 1102 Vashon Stephens   | 2:19-cv-07676                         |
| 1103 Sonja F. Anthony  | 2:19-cv-07681                         |
| 1104 Madge E. Reed   | 2:19-cv-07701                         |
| 1105 Dea Reed  | 2:19-cv-07707                         |
| 1106 Linda K. Reed   | 2:19-cv-07717                         |
| 1107 Shasta Cook   | 2:19-cv-07725                         |
| 1108 Norma Fuentes   | 2:19-cv-07739                         |
| 1109 Donna J. Renard   | 2:19-cv-07763                         |
| 1110 Mark E. Lynch   | 2:19-cv-07771                         |
| 1111 Tammy Sateriale   | 2:19-cv-07793                         |
| 1112 Arnoldo Sauceda   | 2:19-cv-07799                         |
| 1113 Rodney Stewart  | 2:19-cv-07800                         |
| 1114 Ricky Stewart   | 2:19-cv-07804                         |
| 1115 Nicholas Savini   | 2:19-cv-07825                         |
| 1116 Lennie Stowes   | 2:19-cv-07851                         |
| 1117 Joan V. Streek  | 2:19-cv-07857                         |
| 1118 Fred Stuhlemmer, As Proposed Representative<br>Stuhlemmer, Deceased | e of the Estate of Leah 2:19-cv-07864 |
| 1119 Eric T. Whitfield   | 2:19-cv-07871                         |
| 1120 Susan Reitz   | 2:19-cv-07879                         |
| 1121 Nowell E. Renth   | 2:19-cv-07884                         |
| 1122 Silvia Retana   | 2:19-cv-07886                         |
| 1123 Kevin Wiggs   | 2:19-cv-07893                         |
| 1124 Sylvia Thrower  | 2:19-cv-07898                         |
| 1125 Mona L. Timms   | 2:19-cv-07901                         |
| 1126 Robert W. Tonini  | 2:19-cv-07908                         |
| 1127 Jeffrey L. Montgomery   | 2:19-cv-07929                         |
| 1128 Linda Palafox   | 2:19-cv-07955                         |
| 1129 Mary N. Vieyra  | 2:19-cv-07990                         |
| 1130 Mary Vincent  | 2:19-cv-08003                         |
| 1131 Geraldine Virges  | 2:19-cv-08004                         |
| 1132 Carmen Vitello  | 2:19-cv-08007                         |
| 1133 Lois Torres   | 2:19-cv-08013                         |
| 1134 Randy E. Totenhagen   | 2:19-cv-08017                         |

| 1135 Kimberly Wilfong   | 2:19-cv-08028                  |
|---|--------------------------------|
| 1136 Michael Waddy  | 2:19-cv-08035                  |
| 1137 Kimberly A. Willhite   | 2:19-cv-08043                  |
| 1138 Jeanette R. Wadholm-Williams                                   | 2:19-cv-08045                  |
| 1139 Brycelynn Wakkukait  | 2:19-cv-08095                  |
| 1140 Bonnie S. Walburn  | 2:19-cv-08097                  |
| 1141 Dee N. Trejo   | 2:19-cv-08141                  |
| 1142 Donna M. Tritto  | 2:19-cv-08150                  |
| 1143 Arthur L. Waller   | 2:19-cv-08151                  |
| 1144 Joseph Walsh   | 2:19-cv-08155                  |
| 1145 Wanda J. Turnage   | 2:19-cv-08200                  |
| 1146 Donald Turnbow   | 2:19-cv-08202                  |
| 1147 Donald W. Vanadore Jr.   | 2:19-cv-08253                  |
| 1148 Roberta L. Vankuren  | 2:19-cv-08259                  |
| 1149 Linda I. Ruffin  | 2:19 cv 00233                  |
| 1150 Jerome G. Washington   | 2:19-cv-08291                  |
| Cherry Watson as Proposed Representative of the Estate of Gary E    | 2.15 CV 00251                  |
| 1151 Watson, Deceased   |                                |
| 1152 Betty Webb   | 2:19-cv-08430                  |
| 1152 Peggy Wehr   | 2:19-cv-08436                  |
| 1154 Daniel E. Varner   | 2:19-cv-08449                  |
| 1155 Maria Welch  | 2:19-cv-08503                  |
| 1156 Jimmy Welch  | 2:19-cv-08505                  |
| 1150 Shiring Welch<br>1157 Cody Weldon                              | 2:19-cv-08506                  |
| 1158 Cornelius Westbrook  | 2:19-cv-08509                  |
|   | 2:19-cv-08547                  |
| 1159 Audrey M. Werner<br>1160 Kathleen West                         | 2:19-cv-08562                  |
|   | 2:19-cv-08573                  |
| 1161 Joseph White Sr.<br>1162 Sandra E. White                       | 2:19-cv-08573<br>2:19-cv-08601 |
|   |                                |
| 1163 Robert Acosta  | 2:19-cv-08709                  |
| 1164 Eugene Fisher  | 2:19-cv-08838                  |
| Mary Bellmore, Individually and as the Representative of the Estate | e of 2:19-cv-10047             |
| Donn Bellmore, Deceased   | 2.40 - 40144                   |
| 1166 Katie Ware   | 2:19-cv-10141                  |
| 1167 Michael Davis  | 2:19-cv-11777                  |
| 1168 Dennis Thompson  | 2:19-cv-12040                  |
| 1169 Janet Burau  | 2:19-cv-12611                  |
| 1170 Rose Campbell  | 2:19-cv-12613                  |
| 1171 Betty Jessie   | 2:19-cv-12618                  |
| 1172 William Sayles   | 2:19-cv-12628                  |
| 1173 Robert Brantley  | 2:19-cv-20086                  |
| 1174 Brenda Kellam  | 2:20-cv-07294                  |
| 1175 Kathleen Anderson  | 2:20-cv-07343                  |
| 1176 Sandra Loesche   | 2:20-cv-07344                  |
| 1177 Alex Montiel   | 2:20-cv-07345                  |
| 1178 Dolores Payne  | 2:20-cv-07348                  |
| 1179 Glenda Kelsey  | 2:20-cv-20741                  |

Exhibit A

| 1180 Sheila Kindoll    | 2:20-cv-20742 |
|------------------------|---------------|
| 1181 Linda K Shierling | 2:20-cv-20743 |