

**FILED**  
IN CLERK'S OFFICE  
U S DISTRICT COURT E.D.N.Y  
★ JUN 27 2011 ★

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----x  
ARETHA WILLIAMS,

Plaintiff,

- v -

CITY OF NEW YORK, et al.,

Defendants.  
-----x

BROOKLYN OFFICE

**REPORT AND  
RECOMMENDATION**

CV-09-4167 (JB)(VVP)

*No objection to the  
report is approved,  
the Clerk of the  
Court shall  
provide  
a final  
judgment  
and  
close the  
case  
So advised  
JL  
6/23/11*

Judge Weinstein has referred this matter to me for a report and recommendation concerning the fees to be awarded, if any, to The Law Office of Jeffrey L. Goldberg P.C. (the "Goldberg Firm") pursuant to a charging lien asserted by that firm under section 475 of the New York Judiciary Law. The Goldberg Firm represented the plaintiff in this action from the commencement of the lawsuit until December 2010 when they were replaced by The Sanders Firm, P.C. The Sanders Firm has served as counsel since that time and negotiated a settlement of this action with the defendants. The Goldberg Firm seeks a portion of the attorneys' fees that have resulted from the settlement.

The Goldberg Firm and the Sanders Firm have each submitted letter briefs in support of their respective positions and the court held an evidentiary hearing on May 4, 2011 at which Jeffrey L. Goldberg and Eric Sanders each offered testimony and other evidence concerning the services that were rendered by each of the firms during the course of their respective representations of the plaintiff. On the basis of the submissions and the evidence, I make the findings and recommendation below.

Many of the facts are undisputed. The plaintiff Aretha Williams signed a retainer agreement engaging the Goldberg Firm as her attorneys for this matter on or about October

*gl*