

## **EXHIBIT 14**

### **Discovery Responses Excerpt**

- Excerpt of Valero Defendants' Responses to Plaintiff City of Fresno's First Set of Interrogatories to Defendants, served on all counsel of record November 5, 2008.



Nov 5 2008  
5:47PM

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT )  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK )

Master File No. 1:00-1898  
MDL No. 1358 (SAS)  
M21-88

\_\_\_\_\_  
In re Methyl Tertiary Butyl Ether )  
("MTBE") Products Liability Litigation )

\_\_\_\_\_  
This document relates to: )

*City of Fresno v. Chevron U.S.A., Inc., et )  
al., No. 04 Civ. 4973* )

VALERO DEFENDANTS'  
OBJECTIONS AND RESPONSES  
TO PLAINTIFF CITY OF  
FRESNO'S FIRST SET OF  
INTERROGATORIES TO  
DEFENDANTS

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 33 and Local Rule 26.3, Ultramar Inc., Valero Marketing and Supply Company, and Valero Refining Company—California (collectively "Valero Defendants") answer and object to Plaintiff City of Fresno's ("Plaintiff" or "City of Fresno") First Set of Interrogatories served on September 2, 2008 as follows.

Dated: November 5, 2008.

\_\_\_\_\_  
J. Clifford Gunter III  
M. Coy Connelly  
Amy E. Parker  
BRACEWELL & GIULIANI LLP  
711 Louisiana St., Suite 2300  
Houston, Texas 77002-2770  
Telephone: (713) 221-1335  
Telecopier: (713) 221-1212

Attorneys for Defendants  
ULTRAMAR INC., VALERO MARKETING AND  
SUPPLY COMPANY, AND VALERO REFINING  
COMPANY-CALIFORNIA

Valero Defendants refer Plaintiff to their responses to Interrogatory Nos. 1 and 3 for information responsive to this request.

**INTERROGATORY NO. 3:**

IDENTIFY the address of all gasoline stations that YOU lease or have leased within the RELEVANT GEOGRAPHIC AREA since 1979.

- a. State the lease dates for each station YOU identified.

**RESPONSE:**

Valero Defendants object to this Interrogatory on the grounds that it is overbroad, unduly burdensome and not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. This Interrogatory is specifically overbroad both with respect to time, as explained in General Objections Nos. 6 and 7, and to the extent it calls for the identification of all gasoline stations owned by Valero Defendants in the RGA without regard to whether any of those stations is in the vicinity of any drinking water production well or whether any of those stations has ever been identified as the source of a release of gasoline containing MTBE. Subject to, and without waiving, the foregoing objections and the General Objections and Limitations set forth above, Valero Defendants answer as follows:

1. #3481: 6390 N. Blackstone, Fresno, CA 93710 (04/11/66—present)
2. #3615: 1625 N. Chestnut Ave., Fresno CA 93703 (07/24/98—present)
3. #3616: 4001 N. Marks Ave., Fresno, CA 93722 (01/22/85—present)
4. #3659: 4514 W. Shaw Ave., Fresno, CA 93722 (08/05/88—present)
5. #3519: 4591 E. Belmont, Fresno, CA 93702 (03/01/71—10/20/99)

In addition to the foregoing, Ultramar PLC acquired some retail stations leases when it purchased Beacon Oil Company through a stock purchase transaction in November, 1981.<sup>1</sup> To the best of Valero Defendants' current knowledge, most, if not all, of the acquired stations were leased and then sub-leased to third parties who actually operated the station in question. However, given the dates of the transactions at issue, the documentation necessary to confirm Valero Defendants' precise relationship with these stations as well as the dates of the leases is no longer available. Approximate dates have been provided where known.

Several of these leaseholds were terminated prior to 1995 when Ultramar Inc. merged with Diamond Shamrock Corporation. Most, if not all, of the leaseholds were terminated prior to the December 31, 2001 merger of Ultramar Diamond Shamrock Corporation with and into Valero Energy Corporation. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the following is the list of all such stations located within the RGA which may have been leased during the relevant time frame:

1. Beacon #77: B Street, Fresno CA (1935—Lease Termination Date Unknown)

---

<sup>1</sup> Beacon Oil Company changed its name to Ultramar Inc., effective September 18, 1989.

2. Beacon #78: Belmont at 12<sup>th</sup> Street, Fresno CA (1935—Closure Date Unknown)
3. Beacon #80: Tulare & Chestnut, Fresno CA (Dates of Leasehold Unknown)
4. Beacon #496: 4809 E. Kings Canyon, Fresno CA (Dates of Leasehold Unknown)
5. Beacon #595: 3768 S. Highway 99, Fresno CA (09/01/83—03/27/96)
6. Beacon #620: 4594 E. Tulare, Fresno CA (01/22/85—08/28/95)
7. Beacon #658: 1334 N. First St., Fresno CA (Lease terminated 11/01/96)
8. Beacon #257: 9<sup>th</sup> & McKenzie, Fresno CA (Site leased 10/46. Lease Termination Date Unknown)
9. Beacon #432: 2950 E. Ventura, Fresno CA (Dates of Leasehold Unknown)
10. Beacon #433: 1372 N. First St., Fresno CA (Dates of Leasehold Unknown)
11. Beacon #437: 4652 Belmont, Fresno CA (Dates of Leasehold Unknown)
12. Beacon #438: 4005 E. Jensen, Fresno CA (Dates of Leasehold Unknown)
13. Beacon #460: 603 G. Street, Fresno CA (04/28/75—04/30/90)
14. Beacon #472: 2295 S. Elm Ave., Fresno CA (Dates of Leasehold Unknown)
15. Beacon #516: 2430 E. Olive St., Fresno CA (07/15/85—10/31/91)
16. Beacon #538: 2139 S. Elm, Fresno CA (Lease terminated 11/01/91)
17. Beacon #579: 5190 E. Olive, Fresno CA (Lease terminated 11/01/91)
18. Beacon #619: 3076 E. Gettysburg, Fresno CA (01/22/85—08/03/89)
19. Beacon #9-1: 6900 N. Motel Dr., Fresno CA (Dates of Leasehold Unknown)

**INTERROGATORY NO. 4:**

IDENTIFY the address of all gasoline stations with which YOU have or have had a retail supply contract within the RELEVANT GEOGRAPHIC AREA since 1979.

- a. State the retail supply contract dates for each station YOU identified.

**RESPONSE:**

Valero Defendants object to this Interrogatory on the grounds that it is overbroad, unduly burdensome and not reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. This Interrogatory is specifically overbroad both with respect to time, as explained in General Objections Nos. 6 and 7, and to the extent it calls for the identification of all gasoline stations owned by Valero Defendants in the RGA without regard to whether any of those stations is in the vicinity of any drinking water production well or whether any of those stations has ever been identified as the source of a release of gasoline containing MTBE. Valero Defendants further object to the extent this Interrogatory seeks information outside of Valero Defendants' possession, custody and control. Valero Defendants are not in possession of information pertaining to the operation, maintenance or environmental remediation which may be associated with any of the following stations. Notwithstanding the foregoing or the General Objections set forth above, Valero Defendants respond as follows:

1. #2339: 1919 W. Clinton Ave., Fresno, CA 93705 (06/13/03—present)
2. #2365: 603 G. Street, Fresno, CA 93722 (05/01/93—present)
3. #2516: 2837 N. Parkway Drive, Fresno, CA 93722 (07/18/03—present)