

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ARISTA RECORDS LLC; ATLANTIC
RECORDING CORPORATION; BMG MUSIC;
CAPITOL RECORDS, INC.; ELEKTRA
ENTERTAINMENT GROUP INC.;
INTERSCOPE RECORDS; LAFACE
RECORDS LLC; MOTOWN RECORD
COMPANY, L.P.; PRIORITY RECORDS LLC;
SONY BMG MUSIC ENTERTAINMENT;
UMG RECORDINGS, INC.; VIRGIN
RECORDS AMERICA, INC.; and
WARNER BROS. RECORDS INC.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

LIME GROUP LLC; LIME WIRE LLC; MARK
GORTON; GREG BILDSON, and M.J.G. LIME
WIRE FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP

Defendants.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 06 CV. 5936
(GEL)

**MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT LIME WIRE LLC'S
MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

Of counsel:

Lauren E. Handler
SDNY (LEH 6908)
PORZIO, BROMBERG &
NEWMAN, P.C.
100 Southgate Parkway
P.O. Box 1997
Morristown, NJ 07962-1997
(973) 538-5146 (Facsimile)
(973) 889-4326 (Telephone)
lehandler@pbn.com

Charles S. Baker (CB1365)
Joseph D. Cohen (JC3017)
Susan K. Hellinger (SH8148)
PORTER & HEDGES, LLP
1000 Main Street, 36th Floor
Houston, Texas 77002
(713) 226-6000 (Telephone)
(713) 228-1331 (Facsimile)
cbaker@porterhedges.com
jcohen@porterhedges.com
shellinger@porterhedges.com

Attorneys for Defendants

REDACTED VERSION – COMPLETE VERSION FILED UNDER SEAL

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY OF THE ARGUMENT	1
FACTUAL BACKGROUND	5
A. <i>The LimeWire Software And How It Works</i>	5
B. <i>What LimeWire Is Not</i>	9
ARGUMENT	11
I. STANDARD OF REVIEW	11
II. LW IS NOT LIABLE FOR VICARIOUS AND CONTRIBUTORY COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT UNDER THE <i>SONY-BETAMAX</i> SAFE HARBOR	11
A. <i>Public Domain Works</i>	16
1. Project Guttenberg.....	16
2. Internet Archives.....	16
3. Creative Commons.....	18
B. <i>Musicians and Artists</i>	19
C. <i>LW’s Magnet Mix</i>	20
D. <i>Authorized Media</i>	21
E. <i>Permitted Distribution of Computer Software</i>	24
F. <i>Distribution Of Content By So-Called “Legitimate” P2P Companies</i>	24
G. <i>Use Of P2P By Major Labels</i>	25
H. <i>Promoting New TV Through P2P</i>	26
I. <i>Other Noninfringing Uses</i>	26
III. LW IS NOT LIABLE FOR CONTRIBUTORY COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT BECAUSE IT HAS NOT MATERIALLY CONTRIBUTED TO ANY LIMEWIRE USER’S INFRINGEMENT	30
IV. LW IS NOT VICARIOUSLY LIABLE BECAUSE IT LACKS THE RIGHT AND ABILITY TO SUPERVISE THE ACTIVITIES OF ITS END-USERS.	33
V. PLAINTIFFS’ CLAIMS FAIL BECAUSE THEY DO NOT HAVE ANY EVIDENCE OF DIRECT INFRINGEMENT BY A LIMEWIRE USER. ...	38
A. <i>Plaintiffs Cannot Show that any LimeWire User Reproduced Any Of Plaintiffs’ Copyrighted Recordings.</i>	38
B. <i>Plaintiffs Cannot Show That Any LimeWire User Distributed Any Of Plaintiffs’ Copyrighted Recordings.</i>	39
VI. PLAINTIFFS’ STATE LAW COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT AND UNFAIR COMPETITION CLAIMS ALSO FAIL.	40
CONCLUSION	40

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	<u>Page</u>
<u>Cases</u>	
<i>ALS Scan, Inc. v. RemarQ Communities, Inc.</i> , 239 F.3d 619 (4th Cir. 2001)	1
<i>A&M Records, Inc. v. Napster, Inc.</i> 239 F.3d 1004 (9th Cir. 2001)	14, <i>passim</i>
<i>A&M Records, Inc. v. Napster</i> , 284 F.3d 1091 (9th Cir. 2002).....	1
<i>Arista Records, Inc. v. Mp3Board, Inc.</i> , No. 00 CIV 4660(SHS), 2002 WL 1997918 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 29, 2002).....	40
<i>Ashcroft v. ACLU</i> , 535 U.S. 564 (2002).....	29
<i>Banff Ltd. v. Limited, Inc.</i> , 869 F. Supp. 1103 (S.D.N.Y. 1994)	34
<i>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</i> , 477 U.S. 317 (1986).....	11
<i>Davis v. Blige</i> , 505 F.3d 90 (2d Cir. 2007).....	39
<i>Demetriades v. Kaufmann</i> , 690 F. Supp. 289 (S.D.N.Y. 1988).....	30, 33, 34
<i>DVD Copy Control Ass'n v. Bunner</i> , 113 Cal. Rptr. 2d 338 (Ct. App. 2001), <i>rev'd</i> 75 P.3d 1 (Cal. 2003).....	1
<i>Ellison v. Robertson</i> , 189 F. Supp. 2d 1051 (C.D. Cal. 2002).....	1
<i>Faulkner v. National Geographic Soc.</i> , 211 F. Supp. 2d 450, <i>modified</i> , 220 F. Supp. 2d 237 (S.D.N.Y. 2002), <i>aff'd</i> , 409 F.3d 26 (2d Cir. 2005)	34
<i>Gershwin Publ'g Corp. v. Columbia Artists Mgmt., Inc.</i> , 443 F.2d 1159 (2d Cir. 1971)	30, 31, 33
<i>In re Aimster Copyright Litig.</i> , 334 F.3d 643 (7th Cir. 2003).....	12, 35
<i>In re Napster, Inc. Copyright Litig.</i> , 377 F. Supp. 2d 796 (N.D. Cal. 2005).....	39
<i>Kelly v. Arriba Soft, Corp.</i> , 280 F.3d 934 (9th Cir. 2002).....	1
<i>Livnat v. Lavi</i> , 46 U.S.P.Q.2d 1300 (S.D.N.Y. 1998).....	31, 33
<i>London-Sire Records, Inc. v. Doe 1</i> , 542 F. Supp. 2d 153 (D. Mass. 2008)	40
<i>Mathieson v. Associated Press</i> , 23 U.S.P.Q.2d 1685 (S.D.N.Y. 1992).....	16
<i>Matthew Bender & Co. v. West Publ'g Co.</i> , 158 F.3d 693 (2d Cir. 1998).....	15, 16, 30, 33
<i>Matsushita Elec. Indus. Co. v. Zenith Radio Corp.</i> , 475 U.S. 574 (1986).....	11
<i>Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer Studios, Inc. v. Grokster, Ltd.</i> , 259 F. Supp. 2d 1029 (C.D. Cal. 2003), <i>aff'd</i> , 380 F.3d 1154 (9th Cir. 2004), <i>rev'd on other grounds</i> , 545 U.S. 913 (2005).....	31, 32
<i>Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer Studios, Inc. v. Grokster, Ltd.</i> , 380 F.3d 1154 (9th Cir. 2004).....	32, 33, 36

<i>Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer Studios, Inc. v. Grokster, Ltd.</i> , 545 U.S. 913 (2005).....	3, <i>passim</i>
<i>Monroe v. Janes</i> , No. 9:06-CV-0859 (FJS/DEP), 2008 WL 508905 (N.D.N.Y. Feb. 21, 2008).....	39
<i>mp3.com v. Cooley, Godward, LLP</i> , No. 1-02-cv-806837, California County Superior Court, Santa Clara County	1
<i>National Car Rental Sys., Inc. v. Computer Assocs. Int'l, Inc.</i> , 991 F.2d 426 (8th Cir. 1993).....	39
<i>Perfect 10 v. Amazon.com, Inc.</i> , 508 F.3d 1146 (9th Cir. 2007)	36, 39
<i>Religious Technology Center v. Netcom On-Line Communications Services, Inc.</i> , 907 F. Supp. 1361 (N.D. Cal. 1995)	1
<i>RIAA v. Diamond Multimedia Systems, Inc.</i> 180 F.3d 1072 (9th Cir. 1999).....	1
<i>Shapiro, Bernstein & Co. v. H.L. Green Co.</i> , 316 F.2d 304 (2d Cir. 1963).....	33, 34, 35
<i>Sony Corp. of Am. v. Universal City Studios, Inc.</i> , 464 U.S. 417 (1984)	3, <i>passim</i>
<i>Sygma Photo News, Inc. v. High Soc. Magazine, Inc.</i> , 778 F.2d 89 (2d Cir. 1985).....	34
<i>Vault Corp. v. Quaid Software, Ltd.</i> , 847 F.2d 255 (5th Cir. 1988).	12
<i>Universal City Studios v. Corley</i> , 273 F.3d 429 (2d Cir. 2001).....	1

Statutes and Rules

17 U.S.C. § 106(1).....	38
17 U.S.C. § 106(3).....	39
FED. R. CIV. P. 56(c)	11
FED. R. CIV. P. 56(e)(2).....	11

Miscellaneous

2 Goldstein on Copyright § 7.5.1 (3d ed. 2007).....	39
2 M. Nimmer & D. Nimmer, <i>Nimmer on Copyright</i> § 8.11[A], at 8-124.1 n.2 (2007)....	39
3 M. Nimmer & D. Nimmer, <i>Nimmer on Copyright</i> , §12.04[A][2][a] at 12-75 (1996)...	31