## EXHIBIT C

```
Page 1
                     UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 2
                      CENTRAL DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
     MARVEL WORLDWIDE, INC., MARVEL
 6
     CHARACTERS, INC., and MVL RIGHTS, )
 7
     LLC,
 8
                            PLAINTIFFS, )
10
11
               VS.
                                         ) NO. 10 CV 141 (CM) (KNF)
12
13
     LISA A. KIRBY, BARBARA J. KIRBY, )
14
     NEAL L. KIRBY and SUSAN N. KIRBY, )
15
16
                            DEFENDANTS. )
17
18
19
               VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF MARK EVANIER
20
                       LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA
21
                           DECEMBER 6, 2010
22
23
24
     REPORTED BY: CHRISTY A. CANNARIATO, CSR #7954, RPR, CRR
25
     JOB NO.: 34168
```

	Page 2
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	December 6, 2010
8	9:35 a.m.
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	Deposition of Mark Evanier, taken on behalf of
14	Plaintiffs, held at the offices of Paul Hastings,
15	515 S. Flower Street, 25th Floor, Los Angeles,
16	California, before Christy A. Cannariato,
17	CSR #7954, RPR, CRR.
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	APPEARANCES
2	
3	REPRESENTING THE PLAINTIFFS:
4	WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES
5	BY: JAMES W. QUINN, ESQ.
6	BY: RANDI W. SINGER, ESQ.
7	767 FIFTH AVENUE
8	NEW YORK, NY 10153
9	-AND-
10	HAYNES AND BOONE
11	BY: DAVID FLEISCHER, ESQ.
12	1221 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS, 26TH FLOOR
13	NEW YORK, NY 10020
14	
15	REPRESENTING THE DEFENDANTS:
16	TOBEROFF & ASSOCIATES
17	BY: MARC TOBEROFF, ESQ.
18	2049 CENTURY PARK EAST, SUITE 2720
19	LOS ANGELES, CA 90067
20	
21	ALSO PRESENT:
22	ELI BARD, DEPUTY GENERAL COUNSEL MARVEL ENTERTAINMENT
23	CHRIS JORDAN, VIDEOGRAPHER
24	
25	

- briefly met Martin Goodman. But between '58 and '63, I
- think -- well, Stan Goldberg was partly on staff during
- $^{3}$  that time.
- Q. How about Larry Lieber?
- 5 A. Larry Lieber was freelance during that period,
- I believe. I don't believe he was on staff.
- Q. But he was working from Marvel between '58 and
- 8 '63?
- $^{9}$  A. He was in the freelance category, I believe.
- MR. QUINN: I though I said either.
- MR. TOBEROFF: You can continue with your
- answer because he asked for both freelance and at the
- office.
- A. In freelance, people who worked for Marvel --
- excuse me.
- People who did freelance work for Marvel
- during '58 and '63 would include Jack Kirby, Steve Ditko,
- Don Heck, Dick Ayers, Gene Colan, Vince Colletta, Russ
- 19 Heath, Stan Goldberg, Al Hartley. Leaving some people
- out. These are people who I spoke to.
- John Buscema did, I think, a few jobs for them
- during this period. Bill Everett did a few jobs for them
- during this period. Joe Sinott, Larry Lieber, Don Rico.
- I think George Roussos. I'm missing somebody. Paul
- 25 Reinman, Artie Simek, Sam Rosen.

- I think Marie Severin did some freelance work
- for them during this period, maybe a little later than
- <sup>3</sup> '63.
- There's probably another name or two --
- $^{5}$  Q. Okay. That's fine.
- A. -- I can't think of at the moment.
- 7 Q. That's fine.
- Now, when you were first retained by Mr.
- <sup>9</sup> Toberoff, what did he say to you about specifically about
- the opinions that he wanted you to render?
- MR. TOBEROFF: Lacks foundation. Assumes
- 12 facts.
- A. Well, I think the issue of me doing an expert
- 14 report was first mentioned by The New York Times before
- Mr. Toberoff approached me. I declined to be interviewed
- by The Times, and in an article they said Evanier would
- not -- some form of Evanier didn't speak to us because
- he'll probably be a witness in this case or an expert.
- 19 And I believe Mr. Toberoff said something like, Well, I
- guess The New York Times was ahead of us.
- Then he asked me to prepare an expert report,
- 22 and he said that he wanted me to cover -- he wanted me to
- 23 address the relationship -- the working relationship that
- Jack had with Marvel, how he worked for them, what his
- $^{25}$  relationship to the company was.

- at the bottom of page 4, and then over to page 5. And
- you're talking about the period, I think, in the 30s to
- $^3$  the 60s where you say that "the comic book industry was
- very much a fly-by-night industry." Do you see that?
- $^{5}$  A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And what did you mean by that?
- A. Comic book publishers were -- well, the
- industry was born out of leftovers from the pulp magazine
- business, and the sheet music business, and a few other
- 10 publications.
- And publishers were not very stable. They
- came and went. They were small operations. They did not
- project an air of stability to their freelancers. A lot
- $^{14}$  of people who worked for comic book companies weren't sure
- they were ever going to get paid. A lot of checks
- bounced.
- There was always -- there was often a sense
- $^{18}$  that the business was always a year from ending. During
- $^{19}$  the 1950s, in particular, publishers came and went at an
- alarming rate. Over the years I heard many, many stories
- from artists and writers that they would go to an office
- to turn in work, and the company wouldn't be there
- anymore. Or they would get there and find out that the
- books that they were submitting for had been canceled.
- They started up titles and ended them at an alarming rate.

- If you go through even the major publishers in
- that period, there are all these incidences of the
- company, you know, clinging to the window ledge by its
- fingernails, just barely holding on, threatening to close
- down, closing down sometimes and reopening a couple weeks
- 6 later.
- People being paid in cash. People being paid
- under the table, kickbacks.
- It was not a mature business in the sense that
- the companies had stable foundations. There were
- 11 companies that didn't even have physical offices.
- 12 Somebody edited a line of comics out of their garage.
- Q. And how did you come -- I'm sorry. You can
- 14 finish. I'm sorry.
- A. Well, just that the first generation of comic
- book publishers, until you had corporate takeovers in the
- 17 late 60s, were small operations from -- generally owned by
- men who had stumbled into publishing. A large number of
- 19 comic book publishers were cases where someone had started
- a company, gone bankrupt, and the printer had acquired the
- assets of the company and kept it going in order to keep
- their presses rolling.
- So that never struck me as a mature way to
- have a publishing firm when you're putting out product
- just to keep the presses operative because you've got

- 1 people there, printers there to pay.
- And the companies were frequently pleading
- poverty, lowering rates. It was a very -- it was a
- 4 business that very few people bet would be there in the
- <sup>5</sup> future.
- It's amazing that it's still there. Even when
- <sup>7</sup> I got into comic books into the early 70s, there were
- <sup>8</sup> people, prominent people, in the industry predicting the
- 9 industry had less than five years to live and predicting
- demise. And then you still had -- would have frequent
- 11 cases where you came in one day and they'd canceled half
- the line or laid off half the staff. And there were
- problems meeting payroll sometimes, problems paying
- people.
- So when I say "fly-by-night," that's kind of a
- way of saying the industry was not very well grounded
- <sup>17</sup> in --
- 18 Q. How did you come to find out all these facts?
- MR. TOBEROFF: Asked and answered.
- A. All right. Well, since about 1966 or -67,
- I've been talking to people who did comics. I was
- fascinated by comic books. And I have interviewed just
- about everybody I could meet who ever worked in comic
- books, including, you know, people who ran xerox machines
- or photostat cameras.

- interest of mine. And even before I thought I might work
- in the comic book field, I was fascinated by it.
- And just, you know, when I was in high school,
- 4 I found out that one of the kids in my chemistry class had
- a father who had worked in comics. And I asked him, Could
- I meet your father? And he didn't understand why I wanted
- to, and his father didn't understand. But I went over one
- 8 day and spent the afternoon talking to his father about
- $^9$  working for publishers in the 1950s. His father had not
- drawn a comic book since, well, in at least 10 years. I
- just wanted to know what the business was like, how he was
- treated, how he did what he did, how the work was
- 13 produced.
- I don't know if I'm answering your question.
- Q. Yeah. That's fine. Okay.
- You mentioned at the top of page 5 in that
- connection that: Comic book publishers did not see any
- value in the product, in their product, beyond monthly
- sales figures.
- What's the basis for that statement?
- A. Early on, this is something that was told to
- me by the artists and the editors and people I talked to.
- Jack Kirby talked to me greatly about that. Jack was in
- $^{24}$  comics almost from the beginning. And he was by no means
- $^{25}$  the only one who told me this, but he used to say that

- these guys had no imagination; that the publishers all
- they thought about was this month's sales and that they
- didn't realize that they were -- that they had the
- underpinnings of a media conglomerate. Didn't use the
- 5 term at that time, obviously.
- But these characters that they were doing
- 7 could be exploited in other fields. You know, he would
- point to, in fact, Walt Disney was not interested in just
- 9 making Mickey Mouse cartoons. Walt Disney was interested
- in expanding Mickey Mouse into all different fields and
- doing toys and games and comic books and comic strips and
- eventually a theme park. Whereas someone like Martin
- Goodman at Marvel, who he cited frequently, was he thought
- was a man of limited vision, limited imagination.
- And he told stories about how he would go to
- Martin Goodman and tell him what Marvel could be, how it
- could expand. This is even before it was called Marvel.
- $^{18}$  And he got back very little response. It was just -- he
- $^{19}$  did not -- he always thought that Martin Goodman grossly
- undervalued Marvel when he sold it in the late 60s.
- Q. Now, your testimony is or your opinion is that
- publishers didn't see any value in the product beyond
- monthly sales figures, but you previously testified, I
- believe, and written that during this period of time the
- publishers also would not negotiate with artists with

- $^{
  m 1}$  successful or would not be successful. One of my key
- opinions about Mr. Goodman is that he was frequently wrong
- $^{3}$  about that.
- $^4$  Q. But -- I will come back to that.
- $^5$  A. All right.
- Q. You would agree, would you not, that if a book
- had to be discontinued or was discontinued, it was because
- 8 the publisher concluded, rightly or wrongly, that it
- 9 wasn't going to make money?
- 10 A. There were occasional other reasons to
- 11 discontinue a comic.
- 12 Q. Putting aside the other reasons, one of the
- reasons for sure was that the publisher made a
- determination that he couldn't make money with a
- particular comic book line; --
- MR. TOBEROFF: Vague.
- 17 O. -- correct?
- A. Hold on. Putting aside the other -- putting
- 19 aside the other issues -- I'm sorry. The question is
- 20 confusing me.
- O. You testified that --
- 22 A. It sounds like you're asking me: Aside from
- the fact that -- aside from the cases that he discontinued
- because he wasn't making money wasn't the only reason he
- discontinued wasn't that he was making money.

- $^{1}$  self-explanatory, but --
- Q. Let me focus for a second on when you say
- 3 "co-created," what do you mean by "co-created"?
- A. Co-created would be when the creation would
- 5 probably be credited to more than one person. So each of
- 6 the creators would be a co-creator.
- $^{7}$  O. Now, focusing on this period between 1958 and
- <sup>8</sup> 1963, and the particular comic book characters that are
- <sup>9</sup> the subject matter at issue in this case, what conclusions
- did you reach with regard to whether those characters were
- created solely by Mr. Kirby or were created or co-created,
- rather, by Mr. Kirby and others, focusing specifically
- with regard to on Mr. Lee?
- MR. TOBEROFF: Vague.
- 15 A. Let me have it one more time.
- MR. QUINN: Yeah, read it back.
- 17 (The record was read.)
- 18 A. I believe that the characters -- let me put it
- this way. I believe that the properties Fantastic Four,
- The Hulk, Thor, several others here, the overall
- 21 properties were co-created by Stan Lee and Jack Kirby.
- Q. And what opinions or conclusions did you reach
- as to how that co-creation process worked?
- A. My understanding is that the two of them would
- sit down. They'd bring in rough ideas they might have had

- $^{
  m l}$  apart, throw them back and forth like any collaboration.
- Jack would offer ideas for characters. Stan would offer
- $^3$  ideas for characters. Some ideas would get discarded.
- 4 Some ideas would get expanded upon. And then they would
- <sup>5</sup> emerge with some idea of what Jack was going to go home
- 6 and draw.
- Jack would draw the story. If it was 20
- pages, he would draw 20 pages of material. He would bring
- 9 it back. Assuming that Stan didn't -- assuming that Stan
- was happy with what Jack brought in, Stan would then write
- the copy, the dialogue, the captions on the pages. And
- then the work would proceed from that through lettering,
- and inking, and coloring, and publishing.
- 14 Q. Now, do you have any evidence or did you reach
- any conclusion or have an opinion as to whether Kirby had
- created or co-created any of these characters prior to
- when he returned to Marvel in 1958? And we're focusing on
- these particular characters.
- 19 A. On which particular characters were you
- focusing on?
- Q. The ones you mentioned.
- A. The ones I mentioned? I believe Jack had
- previously done, in some cases, antecedents that were a
- starting point. He came in with ideas that were then
- later shaped with input from Stan.

- 1 0. And then he would go out and draw?
- $^2$  A. Yes.
- Q. And which ones would those be where he had a
- 4 starting point and then collaborated with Stan?
- <sup>5</sup> A. Well, I believe Jack had done several stories
- <sup>6</sup> prior to '58 about a version of Thor. And I believe he
- brought in that idea, he suggested the idea. Or at the
- very least, when the idea of doing Thor came up, he said,
- 9 Oh, I've done Thor. He had existing ideas about Thor
- prior to '58 that he brought into the mix.
- Q. Right. But he didn't actually draw the Thor
- character prior to '58; correct?
- MR. TOBEROFF: Misstates his testimony.
- A. He draw a Thor character prior to 1958. Yes.
- Q. No, let me be very precise. I didn't say a
- 16 Thor character. I said he didn't draw the Thor character,
- the character that became Thor, prior to 1958; correct?
- 18 A. To my knowledge, he did not draw the Marvel
- version of Thor prior to 1958.
- Q. Any others, other than having had ideas with
- regard to Thor-like characters?
- A. Well, Jack had been pitching an idea prior to
- coming back to Marvel that became -- that was a clear
- 24 precedent from his viewpoint for Sgt. Fury and the Howling
- <sup>25</sup> Commandos. He had an idea. He developed ideas as a

- $^{
  m 1}$  newspaper strip for a war comic, a newspaper strip with --
- about a sergeant who was very similar to the way Sgt. Fury
- $^3$  came out. So he brought that idea to some extent.
- Q. And then he sat down with Stan Lee, and they
- ultimately came up with what became Sgt. Fury?
- 6 A. Yes.
- $^{7}$  O. Then he went and drew that?
- $^8$  A. He drew the first issue. Yes.
- Q. After consulting with Mr. Lee?
- 10 A. I assume so. Yes.
- 11 Q. Other than those, can you think of anything
- 12 else?
- 13 A. Well, Jack had worked on a character called
- 14 Spiderman prior to 1958. He had worked -- there are
- antecedents in The Fantastic Four to earlier work of his,
- particularly "The Challenge of the Unknown," which he
- 17 started for DC.
- Am I answering your question?
- 19 Q. Well, he himself and others in the Kirby
- family have stated he did not create Spider-Man. You're
- $^{21}$  aware of that?
- 22 A. I am not aware of that.
- Q. In fact, his drawing for Spiderman, original
- drawing for Spiderman, was rejected by Mr. Lee, and he
- asked Mr. Ditko to actually draw Spider-Man; correct?

- Q. He initially he had assigned Jack to do the --
- $^2$  this is your understanding -- initially assigned Jack to
- do the Spider-Man drawings, looked at them, for whatever
- 4 reason didn't want to use them, and then assigned Ditko,
- 5 Steve Ditko, to actually do the drawings that were used.
- A. Yes. And I believe that, for example, is not
- <sup>7</sup> in dispute.
- 8 O. You mentioned that Jack had some idea for
- 9 Spiderman prior to or something like Spider-Man. Is that
- based on, what, The Fly?
- 11 A. No. There was a character when Simon and
- 12 Kirby were working together in the 50s, they sold -- they
- did a lot of presentations and pitches and characters they
- took around to different publishers, and one of them was a
- character called Spiderman or The Silver Spider. They
- tried to sell it under both names.
- And Jack had a title logo, a big piece of art
- board on which was lettered "Spiderman by Joe Simon," the
- logo that might be on the cover of the comic. And that
- logo easily predated the Marvel Spider-Man. And Jack
- would show that logo around and say: I brought this in and
- showed this to Stan. I had this in my closet. And when
- we were looking for new characters, I brought that in.
- Where there was a piece of physical evidence
- there that at least proves that Jack was talking about a

- $^{1}$  words, before you answer any of his questions.
- THE WITNESS: All right.
- Q. Looking at page 98, line --
- A. We're on Exhibit 5, page 98.
- $^{5}$  Q. Page 98, lines 15 through 18.
- <sup>6</sup> A. Okay.
- 7 Q. And you were asked the question this time not
- by Mr. Fleischer but by somebody else that:
- 9 (Reading:) Now, Mr. Evanier, you consider
- yourself an advocate for comic creators' rights;
- isn't that correct?
- You answer: I would say so. Yes.
- 13 A. Yes, I guess I did use the word "advocate"
- $^{14}$  there. Yes.
- 15 Q. It refreshes your recollection; correct?
- MR. TOBEROFF: He used the word "advocate."
- A. I agreed with Mr. Perkins' word.
- Q. And you agree with that today.
- <sup>19</sup> A. Yes.
- O. You remain an advocate --
- <sup>21</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. -- for comic creators' rights; right?
- A. Yeah. Not exclusively, but yes.
- Q. And fair enough. And you have taken it upon
- yourself from time to time to right wrongs that you

- perceive to have taken place in the comic book community;
- <sup>2</sup> correct?
- $^3$  A. I believe we had an exchange about that.
- $^4$  Q. The very next page.
- $^{5}$  A. Yeah. The question was whether in the
- 6 question on line 18 -- I was confused as to whether in the
- question on line 18 where Mr. Perkins -- I think it was
- 8 Mr. Perkins -- asked me, "And on occasion you've taken
- 9 yourself -- upon yourself to right perceived wrongs that
- have taken place in the comic book --
- THE REPORTER: I'm sorry, you're going to have
- to slow down when you read.
- THE WITNESS: I'm sorry.
- 14 THE REPORTER: That's okay.
- THE WITNESS: Let me start over here. Let me
- get a drink of water and start over.
- A. All right. Starting over. In the question
- Mr. Perkins asked me that commences at line 18, he said,
- 19 "And on occasion you've taken it upon yourself to right
- perceived wrongs that have taken place in the comic book
- community; is that right?"
- I did not understand was he saying on behalf
- of comic creators or rights -- wrongs of any kind.
- 24 Because I believe that I have at times been involved in
- righting wrongs that have not been done to comic book

- unless it was approved either by Mr. Lee or by Mr. Goodman
- or both of them.
- A. As with any publisher, yes, the publisher and
- 4 editor have the final say whether they're going to publish
- 5 something or not.
- Q. And you testified previously that from time to
- time Mr. Lee, when he received materials from Mr. Kirby,
- would comment on them, and he would make changes in them;
- 9 correct?
- A. He would of course comment on them. As an
- editor, his job is to comment on them. To make changes in
- them? If he had purchased the pages from Mr. Kirby, he
- would make -- he could do whatever he wanted with them
- once he bought them.
- Q. Didn't he, from time to time, we'd agree, he
- was being paid -- Kirby was being paid on a per page rate?
- 17 A. Yes.
- Q. And did Mr. Lee from time to time ask Mr.
- 19 Kirby to make changes or suggest changes in material that
- 20 he submitted?
- A. There were times when Stan would say, I need
- something else here. I can't take this story as it is.
- You've got to fix this before we can buy it. Yes.
- Q. And Mr. Kirby would, in fact, make those
- changes and resubmit; correct?

- get a distributor to give you an advance, and you can keep
- the costs of production of the item down, the risk in
- publishing comic books at times can be very minor. There
- is a risk certainly, but --
- <sup>5</sup> Q. So sometimes it's minor; sometimes it's major?
- A. Yes. Yes.
- 7 Q. You stated in your report on page 5, I believe
- it's page 5, in the middle of the paragraph that, "Writers
- 9 and artists were only paid if their work was accepted."
- Do you see that?
- 11 A. Yes.
- Q. What is the basis for that statement? Who
- 13 told you that?
- A. Everybody. That was just the way people
- understood it was done. That's the way when I got into
- $^{16}$  the business it was done. And when I asked about that,
- $^{17}$  they said that's how we do business.
- Q. Would you dispute the testimony of Mr. Lee and
- 19 Mr. Romita and Mr. Thomas who all testified that in this
- case that, in fact, writers and artists were paid for
- whatever page they produced, whether or not it was
- 22 published?
- MR. TOBEROFF: Objection. I'm not sure they
- 24 all said that.
- A. Well, if the work was accepted and paid for,

- it might not be published. So the publication -- rarely,
- and I'm not saying this never happened, rarely did
- publishers keyed payment to the publication. What they
- 4 keyed it to, what they based it on, was the acceptance of
- 5 the work.
- So if Romita, and Stan Lee, and the other
- 7 gentleman Roy Thomas, said that artists -- that they
- 8 always got paid for their work even if it wasn't
- $^9$  published, well, they didn't always pay for the work.
- 10 They rejected scripts. They rejected artwork. They made
- 11 -- they told artists to redo things if they accepted it,
- $^{12}$  but the fact they did not publish it did not cause them to
- $^{13}$  ask the artist to give the money back.
- Q. So when -- is it your view that if an artist
- $^{15}$  is asked to redo a page or a panel or make a change that
- that's a rejection?
- 17 A. It's a rejection of the work as it stands
- unrevised.
- 19 Q. Is it fair to say that --
- A. If they -- excuse me. I'm sorry. Go ahead.
- Q. Is it fair to say -- is it your view that if,
- in fact, they redo the work and submit it, and they're
- paid for it, then that work would not have been rejected?
- I'm trying to understand what you mean by "rejected."
- A. Well, I don't know if I introduced that word

- into this discussion. But you submit work to -- let me
- 2 give you an example.
- I submitted scripts to DC Comics in 1968. The
- 4 editors -- to Charlton. And the editors there said --
- 5 sometimes sent them back and said we don't want this. It
- 6 was rejected. I was not paid for it.
- Once or twice the editor said: If you can
- 8 come up with a better ending for this, I might buy it. So
- <sup>9</sup> I did a -- rewrote the ending and submitted the work
- again.
- Now, the first version that I submitted was
- rejected, rejected being the opposite of accepted here.
- 13 The fact that some of the work didn't change doesn't
- $^{14}$  change the fact that the first version in totality was
- 15 rejected.
- 16 Q. So that's your understanding of "they were
- only paid if the work was accepted"?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. But would you agree with me that the practice
- was if the work was accepted, the artist or writer was
- paid, whether or not it was published?
- A. That I would agree with. Yes.
- Q. Now, you mention that there were times that
- you brought things to DC Comics, I believe you said, and
- $^{25}$  some of the work was not accepted. Was that work that

- did as well, not just Marvel?
- A. Yes.
- Q. So they would be buying stories, artwork, et
- detera, to possibly use in the future, or not, based on
- 5 their own decision?
- A. They would be buying material that they
- expected to use, and it was -- I don't think they bought
- anything without a very reasonable expectation that they
- 9 would print it soon. But what frequently happened was
- that books would be canceled, and there would be stories
- and work left over.
- There were a number of instances in the case
- of Marvel where a comic would be canceled, and there would
- be two or three issues which had not been printed yet.
- 15 And Mr. Goodman would decide if they were not worth
- publishing, then the stories would go on the shelf. And
- $^{17}$  then at some time later they might be taken off and
- $^{18}$  published. He found a place to use them.
- 19 Q. Are you aware as you sit here today of any
- specific pages that Jack Kirby worked on back during this
- '58 to '63 period that were not accepted?
- A. The five pages or six he did of the first
- 23 Spider-Man story were not accepted.
- Q. And was it your testimony that he was not paid
- $^{25}$  for that?

- A. He told me he was not paid for it. He asked
- repeatedly for the pages to be returned, and they never
- were.
- Q. Other than Mr. Kirby telling you that, do you
- 5 have any basis one way or the other as to whether or not
- he was, in fact, paid for it, those pages?
- A. I think Sol Brodsky told me Jack was not paid
- 8 for them.
- 9 Q. And if Stan Lee testified under oath that he
- was paid for them, you would just choose to believe Kirby?
- A. Well, I would tend to believe that Stan didn't
- know what frequently people were being paid for.
- O. And what's the basis of that?
- 14 A. Stan.
- 0. -- statement?
- A. Stan inoculated himself frequently from that
- end of the business.
- Q. How do you know?
- A. Sol Brodsky was the guy who usually would take
- care of making out the checks, or making out the check
- request forms, and such. But you're dealing here with
- something quite some time ago that people at the time
- didn't pay much attention to.
- Q. When you say "quite some time ago people
- didn't pay much attention to," what do you mean? What did

- they not pay much attention to?
- A. Stan would not have paid much attention to
- whether or not Jack was paid for the story at the time.
- 4 Q. And is that statement by you or that's an
- <sup>5</sup> opinion? What is that based on?
- A. My understanding of how Marvel was set up is
- 7 that Stan would try to distance himself from the actual
- page rates and the checks. One of the things Sol Brodsky
- 9 complained to me about good naturedly and jokingly how
- $^{10}$  often he got stuck with being the bad guy for Stan and
- telling people they weren't going to get paid for things,
- or their rate was being cut, or their check was going to
- be late. But he handled that type of thing.
- And Stan was -- Stan was not in the office
- very often, was not in the office every day. Other people
- would handle the bookkeeping. He was not -- Stan was not
- $^{17}$  a bookkeeper. He was not a guy who spent a lot of time
- $^{18}$  filling out the forms.
- And frequently, when I asked Stan questions
- about the financial end of Marvel, he would just shrug and
- say, "That's not my job. I didn't do that."
- Q. He was in the creative end?
- A. He was in the editorial end, creative end,
- $^{24}$  yeah. He was in charge of the stories and artworks areas,
- $^{25}$  not in charge of the bookkeeping department.

- Q. You state in the paragraph that starts
- <sup>2</sup> "Goodman meanwhile" about a few lines down. "But until
- $^3$  the debut of Fantastic Four in 1961, few comics seemed to
- be permanent fixtures."
- What's the basis for that statement?
- A. Looking at the history of publishing at
- Marvel, they tended to cancel books very fast. The ones
- 8 that -- the ones that kept going for quite some time were
- 9 flukes.
- And, you know, I have talked to an awful lot
- of people about Martin Goodman, and there is a unanimity
- of opinion about him from people who worked in that time
- period. And Stan Lee has said this on many occasions, and
- 14 Sol Brodsky said it, and Jack said it. It's a consistent
- $^{15}$  portrait of a man who was always trigger happy, ready to
- 16 cancel a comic when he got one bad sales report. Sales
- were down, he would cancel a book.
- Sol Brodsky told me that frequently, very
- often, in fact, what would happen would be that they would
- get the sales figures in on, let's say, you know, Issue 22
- of a comic. And Martin would go, oh-oh, it's down. Let's
- cancel it. Then someone would tell him, well, we've got
- Issues 22, 23. We've got the next three issues sitting on
- the shelf. And he would decide, well, it would be cheaper
- $^{25}$  to publish them than to write that material off. So

- they'd publish those issues. And by the time they could
- 2 cancel the book and not have inventory left over, they
- would get some encouraging sales figures, so he would
- uncancel the book.
- 5 And so very few comics at Marvel were ever
- done with the expectation, well, this comic will be done a
- year from now or two years from now, which was different
- from quite a few of the other publishers. Most of the
- 9 major publishers had a few titles that were solidly
- 10 ensconced. And DC Comics was never worried they would
- 11 have to cancel Superman soon. Dell Comics was never
- worried they would have to cancel Donald Duck soon.
- But Martin ran his company with the idea that,
- well, we may have to cancel all war comics and replace
- them with Westerns, or replace all our love comics and
- 16 replace them with comic books about funny rabbits or
- something.
- Q. You're familiar with Marvel's horror titles?
- $^{19}$  A. The ones in the 50s?
- 20 Q. Yes.
- A. Yes, I am.
- Q. Amazing Fantasy and Journey into Mystery?
- A. Amazing Fantasy was in the late 50s, early
- <sup>24</sup> 60s. Yes.
- Q. Those, that group of titles, in fact, did last

- for a long period of time, didn't they?
- A. Amazing Fantasy was canceled after No. 15.
- Q. Journey into Mystery?
- A. Journey into Mystery changed into Thor. The
- 5 comic -- that comic did last for a long time. That was a
- 6 book that -- let me speak to a larger issue here.
- During the 50s, they published dozens and
- dozens of what they called Weird Comics. They were ghost
- 9 stories, horror stories.
- Q. Right.
- A. And they had a huge inventory of them. And
- they would change titles and cancel them. In those
- particular books, they could cancel one title and stick
- the material in another comic because there were no
- 15 continuing characters. So the material done for Marvel
- 16 Tales could be used in Uncanny Tales or could be used in
- 17 Adventures of the Weird World or whatever.
- Those comics as a bulk went on for a long
- $^{19}$  time. Then they all got canceled because of the
- negativism in the country about horror comics. And they
- brought some of them back in a different format. They
- used the same name during the -- the content of Journey
- into Mystery changed. They just used that as a blanket
- title. Originally it was a horror comic. Later it was a
- science fiction comic. Later it was the comic starring

- 1 Thor.
- Then they turned the title Journey into
- 3 Mystery into the comic called Thor. The numbering of
- Journey into Mystery blend into the numbering of Thor.
- 5 And then later still, they brought back another comic
- 6 called Journey into Mystery, which reprinted old stories
- from before Thor was in the comics. So it was not a
- 8 consistent ongoing title.
- 9 But they did have books that lasted awhile.
- 10 They just did not have comics that ever looked like they
- would last for a while.
- 12 Q. You also say in your report that one of the
- many casualties, referring to one of the publishing
- companies that didn't make it in the 50s, was Mainline
- Publications, which was a relatively new company, I guess,
- that Simon and Kirby had put together in the mid 50s?
- $^{17}$  A. Yes.
- Q. What did Mainline Publications actually
- 19 publish?
- A. They published four titles. And I will tell
- you the titles in a minute here. Police Trap, In Love,
- Fox Hole. And there was a war comic called Fox Hole,
- Police Trap, Bullseye, and In Love were the four titles.
- And they were about to launch two new ones at the time
- $^{25}$  that --

- when it's placed, so we have to keep that area clean.
- <sup>2</sup> So --
- Q. Oh, that's the top one. I see.
- A. -- let's put Oden in the bottom.
- 5 Q. So he's essentially telling him to move some
- of the stuff on the drawing?
- $^{7}$  A. Yes.
- Q. Is that something that he typically did after
- 9 seeing some of the drawings?
- 10 A. This is very rare. I think I say on the next
- 11 page that they almost never even worked this way. This is
- 12 a very rare artifact. It's one of the few times Jack ever
- did a cover sketch like this.
- Q. But this is an example of Jack actually giving
- some pretty specific directions -- of Stan giving Jack
- some pretty specific directions with regard to at least
- this particular drawing; right?
- 18 A. I don't know they're that specific. "Can this
- be the Rainbow Bridge?" Leaving it up to Jack to decide.
- "Put Oden here somehow if you can." That's
- leaving it up to Jack to decide.
- Usually a cover usually when an editor goes
- over a cover sketch -- and Jack didn't do very many cover
- sketches in his career -- usually the editor does a much
- more detailed composition. They would have something done

- in the office. They do an overlay and have another artist
- <sup>2</sup> maybe move things around and show where to put them.
- This is very undetailed, a very undetailed set
- 4 of suggestions.
- $^{5}$  Q. It's fair to say that it's an example, at
- least, of Mr. Lee giving at least some direction to Mr.
- Kirby about how he should do this drawing. Isn't that
- 8 fair?
- <sup>9</sup> A. Very little direction. I'm not sure what
- you're trying to get me to say here.
- 11 Q. I'm not trying to get you to say anything.
- 12 I'm trying to get some testimony here. That's all. Say
- whatever you want.
- A. As we've established before, there were times
- when Stan sent things back to Jack and said, This has to
- be -- you know, I can't use this in the form it's in.
- 17 Let's do something different. This is an example of that,
- 18 I would suppose.
- Are we done with this book?
- Q. Yeah. Don't let it go too far away. But
- $^{21}$  yeah.
- A. All right. Okay. Can I get a glass of water
- at some point here?
- MR. QUINN: Why don't you get it now.
- MR. TOBEROFF: I will get it.

- A. Yes.
- Q. And you are aware that Mr. Kirby, in signing
- that, received monies as part of that deal; correct?
- A. I'm aware that he received part of the money
- $^{5}$  he was promised.
- 6 Q. He received monies as a result of that?
- A. I answered your question.
- Q. Well, I'm going to say it really simply, Mr.
- 9 Evanier.
- A. All right.
- 11 Q. He received money in connection with the
- 12 Captain America settlement, didn't he?
- A. He received some money.
- Q. Right. And you say on page 14 at the top of
- $^{15}$  the page you conclude that.
- (Reading:) It is extremely doubtful that
- either Marvel or freelance artists such as Jack
- Kirby, particularly between 1958 and 1963, had
- any understanding or intent that their freelance
- material created at home on their own steam, on
- their own dime, and later purchased on a per page
- basis after it was completed and approved for
- publication, was somehow work made for hire.
- What is the basis of that statement as to what is
- 25 Kirby's or other freelance artists' understanding or

- 1 intent was back in 1958 to 1963?
- A. Well, in 1978, around 1978, when both DC and
- Marvel began to put the words "work for hire" into their
- 4 contracts and releases and paperwork, there was an outcry
- $^{5}$  in the comic book business about it because no one really
- 6 knew -- had seen that term before.
- I was on a panel at a convention called "What
- 8 the Hell is Work for Hire?" Artists and writers did not
- 9 -- had not been confronted with that language before, did
- 10 not know what it meant. There was a lot of protest.
- 11 There were people circulating petitions refusing to sign
- 12 those documents.
- DC Comics, at least, and maybe Marvel,
- modified their original agreements because there was so
- much protest from freelancers that they would not sign the
- 16 contracts as they were initially worded.
- So the words "work for hire" suddenly came
- into the comic book community, and people just were
- baffled by them. They didn't know what it meant.
- And so I am concluding that when the work was
- done in '58 and '63, nobody thought the words "work for
- hire" would ever apply to their work because they didn't
- know those words.
- Q. You do understand that the work for hire
- concept was in the 1909 Copyright Act? Been around

- 1 old picture of me.
- MR. TOBEROFF: Very cherubic.
- What number are we up to?
- Q. 14. Can you just identify this document for
- <sup>5</sup> us, please.
- A. This is a scan or xerox of my column that
- appeared in Jack Kirby Collector No. Thirty-Eight
- Q. And just a couple of questions on this. You
- <sup>9</sup> were being asked, I guess, a series of This is Jack FAQs.
- $^{10}$  A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Frequently Asked Questions. And one of them
- is: Jack Kirby designed Spider-Man's custom.
- And you answer: False. Steve Ditko designed
- the distinctive costume we all know and love. Jack did
- claim to have presented the idea to Stan of doing a hero
- named Spiderman, no hyphen, who walked on walls and other
- 17 Spiderman themed powers, a claim which Stan formally
- <sup>18</sup> denies.
- 19 A. I think I said vociferously denies.
- Q. Oh, I'm sorry. You're right. Vociferously
- denies.
- Tell me which version do you believe with
- regard to Jack's supposedly bringing the idea of Superman
- 24 -- Spider-Man to Stan Lee? Do you believe Jack's version
- or Stan's vociferous denial?

- A. As I stated earlier, I believe -- well, I
- believe that Jack did bring in the idea of doing Spiderman
- $^{3}$  to Marvel.
- Q. So you believe Jack's version?
- $^5$  A. I believe that part of Jack's version.
- $^6$  Q. That's the part I'm asking you about.
- A. Okay. I believe that Jack did come in and
- 8 present that to Marvel.
- 9 Q. Okay. And that's based on your discussions
- <sup>10</sup> with Jack?
- 11 A. Based on my discussions with Jack, based on
- the fact that he had this piece of artwork that said
- 13 Spiderman done by Joe Simon earlier.
- 14 Q. That's the one that you don't have any idea
- where it is today; right?
- A. I don't know where it is today, no, but
- <sup>17</sup> it's --
- Q. Did you ever see the piece of work?
- 19 A. I held it in my hands.
- Q. You did. And what happened to it? Do you
- have any idea?
- A. Jack kept it for many years, and at one point
- when he was talking to Joe Simon, Joe said, "Hey, I'd like
- that back." And he sent it back to Joe Simon. I think I
- answered this question earlier. And the last I saw of it

- Silver Spider pages or printed the title logo.
- Q. The title logo you're referring to?
- A. The title logo that's the Spiderman that has
- been printed a couple of times in different magazines.
- Do you have any idea which magazines when?
- A. There was a magazine called Pure Imagination
- <sup>7</sup> that I know printed it. I'm not sure which issue. I
- 8 think it's probably been in some issue of the Jack Kirby
- 9 Collector, but I don't know specifically.
- Q. You're familiar with the Iron Man; right?
- $^{11}$  A. Yes.
- 12 O. And who is the artist on the first issue of
- 13 Tron Man?
- 14 A. Jack drew the cover, and Don Heck drew the
- 15 insides.
- Q. And am I right that Lee was the one who came
- up -- Stan Lee came up with the plot outline for the Iron
- <sup>18</sup> Man?
- A. Stan says he did. Jack says he did.
- Q. And you are at least aware -- by the way, who
- did you decide to believe there, Stan or Jack?
- 22 A. Neither. I choose -- this is one of those
- <sup>23</sup> cases --
- THE REPORTER: I'm sorry, I didn't hear what
- you said, Mr. Quinn.

- 1 Q. They're both lying, with a question mark.
- A. I would not use the term "lying." I think they
- $^3$  both have their versions. And when I report the history,
- <sup>4</sup> I will report both of them and let the reader decide.
- $^{5}$  Q. You are aware that Larry Lieber was -- did --
- was assigned to write the full script; correct?
- <sup>7</sup> A. Larry Lieber wrote a script. Yes.
- <sup>8</sup> Q. And he wrote the script before Heck drew the
- 9 -- before he drew the comic?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 O. And what role does Kirby say he played in the
- 12 first issue of Iron Man?
- 13 A. Jack says he came up with the concept,
- 14 presented it to Stan as an idea that they would do
- together. They talked it out. The idea was put on hold
- because there was no place to do it at that moment. And
- then subsequently Stan did it with Don Heck or put it into
- 18 Tales of Suspense and had Don Heck draw the first one. He
- wasn't happy with what Heck did, so Jack came in and
- started drawing it after that.
- Let me finish. Jack also --
- Q. Please. By all means finish.
- A. And Jack also drew the cover of the first
- issue, and on that cover he designed the look of Iron Man
- and the idea of the character putting on this iron which

- is depicted in three small panels that appear on that
- <sup>2</sup> cover.
- Q. This is what Kirby told you?
- <sup>4</sup> A. This is what Kirby told me and what Heck told
- $^{5}$  me.
- 6 Q. And it's your understanding that Kirby did the
- 7 cover before Heck drew the panels?
- $^8$  A. That's what Kirby told me, and that's what
- 9 Heck told me.
- Q. And is it also your understanding with regard
- to the script that Lieber Larry was working from a plot
- that Stan had given him?
- 13 A. Larry says he got the plot from Stan.
- Q. Do you have any reason to disbelieve Larry
- 15 about that?
- A. No. I just don't know how much of the plot
- that Stan gave him came from Jack.
- 18 Q. You don't know one way or the other; right?
- 19 A. I don't know. I assume that some of it came
- from Jack because Jack had already drawn the cover by that
- point.
- 22 O. You assume that because he drew the cover.
- But other than, because he drew the cover, do you have any
- other basis to believe that he contributed to the plot?
- MR. TOBEROFF: Asked and answered.

- 1 A. Don Heck believed Jack had contributed to the
- <sup>2</sup> plot.
- Q. And that was based on discussions you had with
- 4 Don Heck?
- <sup>5</sup> A. Yes.
- 6 O. Is Don Heck alive?
- 7 A. No, he's not.
- Q. You did write in the King of Comics, page 273,
- <sup>9</sup> Iron Man written at first by Larry Lieber and drawn
- initially by Don Heck. However, Lieber was working from a
- 11 plot Stan had given him, and Heck was drawing from a cover
- and some concept sketches by Kirby.
- When you wrote that Lieber was working from a
- 14 plot Stan had given him, you didn't mention that Kirby had
- anything to do with the plot there when you wrote it, did
- <sup>16</sup> you?
- 17 A. No, not in the way I phrased it there.
- Q. And then it goes on to say, "Stan wasn't happy
- with the first story, so he immediately turned the art
- chores over to Kirby, and Jack was the answer to all
- 21 problems."
- <sup>22</sup> A. Yes.
- Q. Right. So that was another instance where
- Stan decided to reassign work because he was unhappy?
- A. Yeah.