## **EXHIBIT B**

#### **DECLARATION OF JUDITH BRONSTHER**

I, Judith Bronsther, hereby declare:

- I am an attorney admitted to practice law in New York (since 1980) and I am the president of Accountability Services, Inc ("ASI"). Attached as Exhibit A is my resume.
- 2. In the last four (4) years, I have testified in the following cases:

NL Industries, Inc. vs. OneBeacon America Insurance Company Supreme Court of the State of New York County of New York (Index No. 108881/09)

CDS Holdings I, Inc. vs. Shutts & Bowen, L.L.P. Circuit Court of the 11<sup>th</sup> Judicial Circuit Miami-Dade County, Florida Case No. 08-38518 (Ca-09)

- I make this declaration in support of the Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Attorney's Fees and Costs Award dated December 16, 2015 and in Opposition to the Motion for Attorney Fees for Levine & Gilbert and Peter J. Gleason, Esq.
- Since 1992, as President of Accountability Services, I have devoted all of my time to issues surrounding reasonable attorneys' fees. I have personally reviewed or overseen the review of close to a billion dollars of legal fees.
- 5. I have reviewed, among other things, the documents listed in Exhibit B.
- 6. Based upon a review of the documents, relevant case law and my over twenty (20) years of experience reviewing and evaluating legal fees, I have reached the conclusion that the hours claimed to be expended are unreasonable and Plaintiff's legal teams billing practices deviated from acceptable billing patterns and practices. As detailed in my report attached hereto as Exhibit C, in my opinion, the maximum reasonable hours are as follows:

	Reasonable Hours
Norinsberg Group	
Cohen	311.79
Fitch	295.46
Norisberg	557.75
Meeham	58.23
Burzstyn	22.69
	1245.92
Smith Group	
Smith	764.05
Lenoir	424.03
Suckle	38.07
McCucheon	9.31
Buaza	377.2
J.Lenoir	4.8
L. Smejila	1.2
J. Smith	17.29
	1635.95
Gleason Group	
Levine	3.88
Gleason	95.85
Gilbert	20.1
	119.83

7. Based upon a review of the documents, relevant case law and my over twenty (20) years of experience reviewing and evaluating legal fees, I have reached the conclusion that the expenses are unreasonable. As detailed in my report attached hereto as Exhibit C, in my opinion, the maximum reasonable expenses are as follows:

8.

	Reasonable Expenses
Norinsberg Group	\$0
Smith Group	\$55,779.84
Gleason Group	\$3,581.25

9. I make this declaration based on my personal knowledge.

I declare under penalty of perjury, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, that the foregoing is true and correct and that if called to do so, I could competently so testify.

Executed this April, 2015, at New York, New York.

Judith Bronsther, Declarant

#### Judith A. Bronsther

#### **Education:**

New York University School of Law, J.D. 1979 University of Rochester, BA., *magna cum laude*, 1976

#### **Work Experience:**

1992-Present President of Accountability Services Inc.

Accountability Services is a legal cost control specialist that has performed legal audit and consulting services to "Fortune 500" companies, international organizations, governmental institutions as well as individuals.

1989-1992	Attorney at Kaye Scholer Fierman Hayes & Handler
1984-1989	Executive Vice President of Empire Securities
1979-1983	Attorney at Finley, Kumble, Wagner, Heine, Manley & Underberg

#### **Publications:**

"Ten Ways to Effectively Manage Outside Counsel Spending" Hg.org, 2014

"In-House Counsel Seek Fee Accountability"

<u>Ohio Lawyers Weekly,</u> September 3, 2001

"Watching the Clock"

<u>Los Angeles Daily Journal</u>, May 4, 1999

"Determining the Most Cost-Effective Legal Service Providers"

<u>U.S. Business Litigation</u>, January 1997

"Alternative Billing Methods: Proceed With Caution"

The Revolutionizing Litigation Management Report, May 1995

"Take the Lead in the Management of Your Outside Counsel...Implement and Monitor a Billing and Case Management Policy"

Revolutionizing Litigation Management Report, March 1995

"Law Firms Won't Reduce Bills Without Pressure From You... Audits Aren't A Cure All"

<u>Corporate Legal Times,</u> April 1993

#### **Speaking Engagements:**

"The Ethical and Practical Implications of Legal Billing"

Sponsor: Clecenter.com

"Thinking and Acting Like a Seller of Legal Services"

March 2000 (Overlooking, Boston)

Sponsor: Partners in Professional Development, Inc.

"Developing the Trial Budget-Proven Techniques for Controlling Costs"

September 1999 (New York, NY)

Sponsor: Fulcrum Information Services

"Legal Fees in Indiana: The Legal, Ethical and Practical Issues"

November 1998 (Indianapolis, IN)

Sponsor: National Business Institute

"Making Your Lawyers Accountable: How Internal Auditors Can Manage Legal

Costs for Value and Efficiency"

November 1998 (Philadelphia, PA)

Sponsor: MIS Training Institute

"Tools and Techniques to Manage the Caseload and Minimize Costs"

March 1997 (New York, NY)

Sponsor: Practicing Law Institute-Civil Litigation Institute

"The Customer is Always Right... Surviving the Legal Audit"

November 1996 (Washington, DC)

Sponsor: The Law Firm Governance Institute

"Auditing Your Legal Fees- A Useful Hammer in the Law Management Toolbox"

June 1996 (Stamford, CT)

Sponsor: Westchester Bar Association

"Cost-Effectively Managing Your Outside Counsel"

December 1995 (Washington, DC)

Sponsor: The National Forum for Women Corporate Counsel

#### Resume of Judith Bronsther

"For Services Rendered: Thinking and Acting Like a Seller of Legal

Services When Compiling Your Client's Bills"

November 1995 (New York, NY)

Sponsor: Law Firm Profitability Forum

"Budgets and Billing"

November 1995 (Washington DC)

Sponsor: National Association of Attorneys General

"Managing Your Outside Counsel" September 1995 (New York, NY)

Sponsor: Greater New York Hospital Association

"The Customer is Always Right-Surviving the Audit"

May 1995 (Chicago, IL)

Sponsor: Defense Research Institute

"Legal Practice-How to Maximize the Inside-Outside Counsel Relationship to Optimize Cost Effective Legal Representation" September 1994 (Hershey, PA)

Sponsor: Pennsylvania Bankers Association

"Bold Initiatives or Micro Management With Your Outside Counsel" March 1994 (Chicago, IL)

Sponsor: Corporate Counsel Institute

#### **Expert Testimony (Written and Oral):**

### Communities for Equity, et al. v. Michigan High School Athletic Association

United States District Court for the Western District of Michigan

Case No: 1:98-CV-479

Allison Palmer v. Colin Powell; Marguerite Cooper v. Condoleza Rice United States District Court for the District of Columbia Civil Action No. 76-1439 (HHK/JMF); Civil Action No 77-2006 (HHK/JMK)

Symbol Technologies, Inc. v. Intersil Corporation and Choice-Intersil

Microsystems

Supreme Court of the State of New York

County of Suffolk

Commercial Division

Index No. 03-18971

## Alan W Alexander et al. v. State of Texas dba Department of Public Safety District Court of Travis County, Texas 200<sup>th</sup> District (Statistics submitted to Leonard Bucklin, Esq.)

# NOOB LP et al. v. Corporate Realty Corp et. al. District of Harris County 190<sup>th</sup> District (Statistics submitted to Leonard Bucklin, Esq.)

## In the Matter of Walton Construction Co, and FGI Glass (Privately Administered Arbitration in Missouri)

# HMC Capital Resources LLC v. Seas Inc d/b/a Flower World Civil Court of the City of New York County of New York: Part 65 Index No.: L&T 60119/05

# Allen, Dryer, Doppelt, Milbrath & Gilchrist, P.A., v. Smartweb Technology Inc. et. al. Ninth Judicial Circuit in and for Orange County, Florida

Civil Division: 35

Case No.: 06-CA-2485

#### Greenbaum Rowe Smith & Davis v. Bassily, et al Superior Court Law Division Middlesex County Docket No.:MID-L-4621-07

# Collier, Halpern, Newberg, Nolleti & Block v. Andrew Carothers et al. Supreme Court of the State of New York County of Westchester Index No.: 25754/07

# Allegaert Berger & Vogel LLP v. Jane A. Halbritter Supreme Court of the State of New York County of New York Index No.: 102292/09

Port Authority Police Asian Jade Society of New York & New Jersey et al. vs. The Port Authority of New York & New Jersey
United States District Court
Southern District of New York
05 CV 3838 (MGC)

## <u>Lipper & Company, L.P. et al. v. Richard Williamson, as Successor Liquidating TTEE of Lipper Convertibles</u>

FINRA Dispute Resolution Arbitration No. 07-03139

#### Prospect Capital Corporation, et. al. v Michael Enmon

United States District Court Southern District of New York 08 Civ. 03721 (LBS)

#### Kaygreen Realty Co. v IG Second Generation Partners, L.P. and I BLDG

CO, INC

Supreme Court of the State of New York County of Queens: Civil Term: Part 17 (Index No.13633-03)

#### Tenore vs. Tenore

Supreme Court, County of Rockland State of New York (Index No. 4324/2005)

### <u>Guillermo Rueles, Oscar Miranda, Alejandro Espinoza et. al. vs. The State of</u> California

Superior Court of the State of California County of San Bernardino Case No. RCV 083017 Case No. RCV 085421

#### Tennessee Gas Pipeline Company vs. Delta Gulf Corporation et.al.

In the 215<sup>th</sup> Judicial District Court Harris County, Texas Case No. 2009-55773

#### Carlos Castro vs. Cal Terhune, et al

United States District Court Northern District of California NO. C 98-04877 WHA

#### R. Parke Collins II. vs. Varnum LLP

American Arbitration Association Grand Rapids Michigan File No. 54 51600024 11 NL Industries, Inc. vs. OneBeacon America Insurance Company Supreme Court of the State of New York County of New York (Index No. 108881/09)

CDS Holdings I, Inc. vs. Shutts & Bowen, L.L.P. Circuit Court of the 11<sup>th</sup> Judicial Circuit Miami-Dade County, Florida Case No. 08-38518 (Ca-09)

Osram GmbH, Osram Opto Semiconductors GmbH, Osram Sylvania Inc., and Osram Opto Semiconductors Inc. vs. Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd and LG Electronics Inc.

(Arbitration before U.S. International Trade Commission)

American Infoage, LLC and Sago Networks, LLC vs. Regions Bank. U.S. District Court Middle District of Florida (Tampa) CASE #: 8:13cv01533SDMJSS.

Craig Arthur Humphries et al. v. County of Los Angeles, et al.

The United States District Court for the Central District of California Santa Ana Division

Case No SA CV 03-0697-JVS (MANx)

Ambac Assurance Corporation v Adelanto Public Utility Authority United States District Court Southern District of New York Civil Action No. 09-cv-05087 (JFK)

#### **Professional Admissions and Memberships:**

New York Bar March 1980

#### **Documents Reviewed**

- 1) The Docket for Adrian Schoolcraft v City of New York, et. al.
- 2) Plaintiff's Motion for Attorney Fees, Costs and Disbursements.
- 3) Declaration of Joshua P. Fitch in Support of Motion for Attorney Fees.
- Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion for Attorney Fees , Costs and Disbursements.
- 5) Motion for Attorney Fees for Levine & Gilbert and Peter J. Gleason, Esq.
- 6) Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment
- 7) Plaintiff's Rule 56.1 Statement
- 8) Consolidated Rule 56.1 Statement
- 9) Plaintiff's Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment
- 10) Plaintiff's Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion for Summary Judgment
- 11) Opinion entered May 5, 2015 regarding Summary Judgment Motions (Dkt. # 436)
- 12) Deposition Transcripts of Adrian Schoolcraft
- 13) Compliant filed August 10, 2010
- 14) Second Amended Compliant
- 15) Third Amended Complaint
- 16) Opinion entered June 14, 2012 regarding Motion to Amend (Dkt. #83)
- 17) Joint Proposed Pretrial Order
- 18) Opinion entered May 6, 2011 regarding Defendant's Motion to Dismiss (Dkt. #59)