UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT (ECF) SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ · - - - -: YONG KUI CHEN, ZU GUANG ZHU, : 10 Civ. 7254 (JCF) HAO CHEN, SHUI BING ZHU, GUO REN : HUANG and YOU HUANG ZHU, on behalf : OPINION of themselves and others similarly : AND ORDER situated, Plaintiffs, : : - against -: WAI? CAFÉ INC. and WAI YIN CHAN, Defendants. _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ _ JAMES C. FRANCIS IV UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

The plaintiffs in this case bring claims for unpaid wages, overtime, and spread of hours pay pursuant to the Fair Labor Standards Act (the "FLSA"), 29 U.S.C. § 201 <u>et seq.</u> and New York Labor Law against their former employer, Wai ? Café Inc. ("Wai ? Café"), and its owner, Wai Yin Chan. The parties consented to proceed before me for all purposes in accordance with 28 U.S.C. § 636(c) and agreed to try liability issues to a jury, reserving for me the calculation of damages. Shortly before trial, defendants' counsel was relieved, and Mr. Chan proceeded to trial <u>pro se</u>. Because the corporate defendant failed to appear by counsel at trial, it was held to be in default. Plaintiff Yong Kui Chen did not attend the trial, and his claims were therefore dismissed. The claims of Jian Hui Lin, who was not named in the original

Complaint, but who had submitted a form indicating his consent to sue under the FLSA, were submitted to the jury.

The trial was held on February 6 and 7, 2012. At the close of the evidence, the jury was asked to make liability determinations with respect to each of the plaintiffs' claims and to make factual findings that would serve as the basis for calculating damages. Liability

A threshold issue in any FLSA case is whether the plaintiffs are "covered" employees under the statute. "The FLSA minimum-wage and overtime provisions apply only to employees who are (1) personally engaged in interstate commerce or in the production of goods for interstate commerce (so-called 'individual coverage'), or (2) [were] employed in an enterprise engaged in interstate commerce or in the production of goods for interstate commerce (so-called 'enterprise coverage')." Garcia v. Serpe, No. 3:08cv1662, 2012 WL 380253, at *4 (D. Conn. Feb. 6, 2012) (alteration in original) (quotation marks and citations omitted). Here, the plaintiffs never contended that they personally performed work related to the production of goods transported across state lines, so individual coverage is not triggered. To establish enterprise coverage, the plaintiffs must demonstrate that the employees "engage in commerce or handle, sell, or otherwise work on goods and materials that have been moved in commerce, and [] the enterprise has at least \$500,000

in annual gross volume of sales made or business done." <u>Solis v.</u> <u>Cindy's Total Care, Inc.</u>, No. 10 Civ. 7242, 2012 WL 28141, at *15 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 5, 2012) (citing 29 U.S.C. § 203(s)(1)). At trial, the jury found that the plaintiffs had not shown that Wai ? Café's annual gross receipts exceeded \$500,000.00. The FLSA claims must therefore be dismissed.

Nevertheless, I will retain supplemental jurisdiction over the plaintiffs' claims under New York Labor Law. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1367, a federal district court that has original jurisdiction over a civil action may also exercise jurisdiction over other claims unless certain exceptions apply. Where all federal claims are dismissed prior to trial, it is generally appropriate to dismiss without prejudice any state claims. See Motorola Credit Corp. v. Uzan, 388 F.3d 39, 56 (2d Cir. 2004). However, where the parties and the court have expended substantial resources in preparation for trial, and particularly where a case has actually been tried, it is appropriate to retain jurisdiction over state claims even when the federal claims are dismissed. See id. (approving exercise of supplemental jurisdiction over state claims tried in conjunction with federal claims that were subsequently dismissed); Nowak v. Ironworkers Local 6 Pension Fund, 81 F.3d 1181, 1191-92 (2d Cir. 1996) (allowing supplemental jurisdiction where case had proceeded for more than a year and federal claims

were dismissed only nine days before scheduled trial); <u>Purgess v.</u> <u>Sharrock</u>, 33 F.3d 134, 138 (2d Cir. 1994) (where dismissal of federal claim occurs "late in the action, after there has been substantial expenditure in time, effort, and money in preparing the dependent claims, knocking them down with a belated rejection of supplemental jurisdiction may not be fair. Nor is it by any means necessary.").

This is such a case. The parties completed discovery, submitted the pretrial order, and tried a case in which the federal and state claims were based on the same constellation of facts. In such circumstances, the exercise of supplemental jurisdiction over the remaining state claims is warranted.

With respect to the remaining liability issues, the jury concluded that each plaintiff had been denied the appropriate minimum wage, overtime, and spread of hours pay. The jury also found, however, that Mr. Chan had not acted willfully, thus precluding the plaintiffs from an award of liquidated damages. N.Y. Labor Law § 663(1).

<u>Damages</u>

Following trial, the parties were invited to submit proposed damages calculations based on the jury's findings as to the periods of time each plaintiff worked, the hours that plaintiff worked each week, and the amount he was actually paid. The plaintiffs made

such a submission, and also indicated that they were waiving any claim for attorneys' fees. (Letter of C.K. Lee dated Feb. 14, 2012 ("Pl. Damages Statement")). Mr. Chan did not file a response. The following determinations constitute my findings of fact and conclusions of law pursuant to Rule 52(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

The formulas used to calculate damages are the same for each The unpaid minimum wage ("MW") is equal to the plaintiff. difference between the prevailing minimum wage minus the plaintiff's actual rate of pay (the "paid rate") multiplied by the number of hours worked in a week up to forty hours multiplied by the number of weeks worked in the relevant period. The overtime ("OT") owed is the difference between one and one-half times the minimum wage and the paid rate multiplied by the number of hours over forty multiplied by the number of weeks worked. Finally, the unpaid spread of hours ("SH") equals the number of days worked over ten hours multiplied by the minimum wage multiplied by the number of weeks. Based on this framework, the damages for each plaintiff are as follows:

A. <u>Zu Ghang Zhu</u>

	1.	September	2004	_	December	2004
--	----	-----------	------	---	----------	------

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	17.2 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.	
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 1.77) x (40) x (17) = \$2,325.44</pre>) x (Number of weeks) .2)	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 1.77) x (39) x (17 = \$3,997.97	5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) .73 - 1.77) x (39) x (17.2) 997.97	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (17.2) = \$575.77</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)	
Total	= \$6,899.18		
2. <u>J</u> a	anuary 2005 - December 2005		
	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	52 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.	
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$6.00 - 1.77) x (40) x (52) = \$8,798.40</pre>) x (Number of weeks))	
Unpaid OT	<pre>= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) = (\$9.00 - 1.77) x (39) x (52) = \$14,662.44</pre>		
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6.5) x (\$6.00) x (52) = \$2,028.00</pre>	days worked over 10 hrs.) x (MW) x (# weeks) 6.5) x (\$6.00) x (52) 52,028.00	
Total	= \$25,488.84		

		3.	<u> January 2006 - December 2006</u>	
			Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	52 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.
Unpaid	MW		= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hou = (\$6.75 - 1.77) x (40) x (= \$10,358.40	urs) x (Number of weeks) 52)
Unpaid	ОТ		= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (How = (\$10.13 - 1.77) x (39) x = \$16,954.08	urs over 40) x (# weeks) (52)
Unpaid	SH		= (days worked over 10 hrs. = (6.5) x (\$6.75) x (52) = \$2,281.50) x (MW) x (# weeks)
Total			= \$29,593.98	
		4.	<u> February 2007 - April 2007</u>	
		4.	<u>February 2007 - April 2007</u> Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	13 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.
Unpaid	MW	4.	<pre>February 2007 - April 2007 Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate = (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hou = (\$7.15 - 1.77) x (40) x (= \$2,797.60</pre>	13 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr. urs) x (Number of weeks) 13)
Unpaid Unpaid	MW OT	4.	<pre>February 2007 - April 2007 Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate = (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hou = (\$7.15 - 1.77) x (40) x (= \$2,797.60 = (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hou = (\$10.73 - 1.77) x (39) x = \$4,542.72</pre>	13 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr. urs) x (Number of weeks) 13) urs over 40) x (# weeks) (13)
Unpaid Unpaid Unpaid	MW OT SH	4.	<pre>February 2007 - April 2007 Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate = (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hou = (\$7.15 - 1.77) x (40) x (= \$2,797.60 = (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hou = (\$10.73 - 1.77) x (39) x = \$4,542.72 = (days worked over 10 hrs. = (6.5) x (\$7.15) x (13) = \$604.18</pre>	<pre>13 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr. urs) x (Number of weeks) 13) urs over 40) x (# weeks) (13)) x (MW) x (# weeks)</pre>

5. <u>May 2008 - July 23, 2009</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	59.6 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$900/month \$2.91/hr.	
Unpaid MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.15 - 2.91) x (40) x (59 = \$10,108.16) x (Number of weeks) .6)	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.73 - 2.91) x (32) x (59 = \$14,914.30	5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) .0.73 - 2.91) x (32) x (59.6) .,914.30	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) 2 = (6) x (\$7.15) x (59.6) = \$2,556.84</pre>	ys worked over 10 hrs.) x (MW) x (# weeks) x (\$7.15) x (59.6) 556.84	
Total	= \$27,579.30		
6. <u>J</u>	uly 24, 2009 - December 2009		
	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	23.8 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$900/month \$2.91/hr.	
Unpaid MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.25 - 2.91) x (40) x (23 = \$4,131.68) x (Number of weeks) .8)	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.88 - 2.91) x (32) x (23 = \$6,069.95	1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) \$10.88 - 2.91) x (32) x (23.8) \$6,069.95	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6) x (\$7.25) x (23.8) = \$1,035.30</pre>	s worked over 10 hrs.) x (MW) x (# weeks) x (\$7.25) x (23.8) 35.30	
Total	= \$11,236.93		

7. <u>January 2010 - August 2010</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	34.4 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$1,000/month \$3.23/hr.
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.25 - 3.23) x (40) x (34. = \$5,531.52</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 4)
Unpaid OT	<pre>= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.88 - 3.23) x (32) x (34 = \$8,421.12</pre>	over 40) x (# weeks) 4.4)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6) x (\$7.25) x (34.4) = \$1,496.40</pre>	x (MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$15,449.04	

Zu Ghang Zhu Total = \$124,191.77

- B. <u>Hao Chen</u>
 - 1. <u>December 2003</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 1.77) x (40) x (4.3 = \$581.36</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 3)
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 1.77) x (39) x (4.3 = \$999.49	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$1,724.79	

2. <u>January 2004</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$650/month \$1.91/hr.	
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 1.91) x (40) x (4.3 = \$557.28</pre>) x (Number of weeks) })	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 1.91) x (39) x (4.3 = \$976.01	1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) (\$7.73 - 1.91) x (39) x (4.3) \$976.01	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	x (MW) x (# weeks)	
Total	= \$1,677.23		
3. <u>F</u> é	ebruary 2004		
	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$700/month \$2.06/hr.	
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 2.06) x (40) x (4.3 = \$531.48</pre>) x (Number of weeks) })	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 2.06) x (39) x (4.3 = \$950.86	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)	
Total	= \$1,626.28		

4. <u>March 2004</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$750/month \$2.21/hr.
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 2.21) x (40) x (4.3 = \$505.68</pre>) x (Number of weeks) })
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 2.21) x (39) x (4.3 = \$925.70	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	x (MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$1,575.32	
5. <u>Ar</u>	oril 2004	
	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$800/month \$2.36/hr. ¹
Unpaid MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 2.36) x (40) x (4.3 = \$479.88) x (Number of weeks) })
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 2.34) x (39) x (4.3 = \$900.55	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	x (MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$1,524.37	

 $^{^{\}scriptscriptstyle 1}$ The plaintiffs incorrectly calculated the hourly rate at \$2.34.

6. <u>May 2004</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$850/month \$2.50/hr.	
Unpaid MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 2.50) x (40) x (4.3 = \$455.80) x (Number of weeks) 3)	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 2.50) x (39) x (4.3 = \$877.07	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)	
Total	= \$1,476.81		
7. <u>J</u>	<u>une 2004</u>		
	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$900/month \$2.65/hr.	
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 2.65) x (40) x (4.3 = \$430.00</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 3)	
Unpaid OT	: (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) : (\$7.73 - 2.65) x (39) x (4.3) : \$851.92		
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	days worked over 10 hrs.) x (MW) x (# weeks) 5.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) 143.94	
Total	= \$1,425.86		

8. <u>July 2004</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$950/month \$2.80/hr.	
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 2.80) x (40) x (4.3 = \$404.20</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 3)	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 2.80) x (39) x (4.3 = \$826.76	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) 2 = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)	
Total	= \$1,374.90		
9. <u>A</u> 1	ugust 2004		
	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$1,000/month \$2.94/hr.	
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 2.94) x (40) x (4.3 = \$380.12</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 3)	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 2.94) x (39) x (4.3 = \$803.28	1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) \$7.73 - 2.94) x (39) x (4.3) \$803.28	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	s worked over 10 hrs.) x (MW) x (# weeks)) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) .94	
Total	= \$1,327.34		

10. <u>September 2004</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$1.050/month \$3.09/hr.	
Unpaid MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 3.09) x (40) x (4.3 = \$354.32) x (Number of weeks) 3)	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 3.09) x (39) x (4.3 = \$778.13	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)	
Total	= \$1,276.39		
11.	October 2004		
	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$1,100/month \$3.24/hr.	
Unpaid MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 3.24) x (40) x (4.3 = \$328.52) x (Number of weeks) 3)	
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 3.24) x (39) x (4.3 = \$752.97	5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) .73 - 3.24) x (39) x (4.3) 2.97	
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	worked over 10 hrs.) x (MW) x (# weeks) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) 94	
Total	= \$1,225.43		

12. November 2004

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$1,150/month \$3.39/hr.
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 3.39) x (40) x (4.3 = \$302.72</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 3)
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 3.39) x (39) x (4.3 = \$727.82	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$1,174.48	
13. <u>I</u>	December 2004	
	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	4.3 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$3.53/hr.
Unpaid MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$5.15 - 3.53) x (40) x (4.3 = \$278.64) x (Number of weeks) 3)
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$7.73 - 3.53) x (39) x (4.3 = \$704.34	over 40) x (# weeks) 3)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6.5) x (\$5.15) x (4.3) = \$143.94</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$1,126.92	

		14.	<u>January 2005 - December 2005</u>	
			Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	52 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$3.53/hr.
Unpaid 1	MW		= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$6.00 - 3.53) x (40) x (52) = \$5,137.60) x (Number of weeks))
Unpaid	ОТ		= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$9.00 - 3.53) x (39) x (52) = \$11,093.16	over 40) x (# weeks))
Unpaid	SH		= (days worked over 10 hrs.) z = (6.5) x (\$6.00) x (52) = \$2,028.00	k (MW) x (# weeks)
Total			= \$18,258.76	
		15.	<u> January 2006 - December 2006</u>	
			Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	52 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$3.53/hr.
Unpaid 1	MW		= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$6.75 - 3.53) x (40) x (52) = \$6,697.60) x (Number of weeks))
Unpaid	ОТ		= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.13 - 3.53) x (39) x (52 = \$13,384.80	over 40) x (# weeks) 2)
Unpaid	SH		= (days worked over 10 hrs.) z = (6.5) x (\$6.75) x (52) = \$2,281.50	k (MW) x (# weeks)
Total			= \$22,363.90	

	10. <u>Ua</u>	<u>inuary 2007 - April 2007</u>	
	N H M F	Number of weeks worked Nours worked/week Nonthly salary Paid rate	17.2 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$3.53/hr.
Unpaid MW	= = =	: (MW – Paid Rate) x (40 hours) : (\$7.15 – 3.53) x (40) x (17. : \$2,490.56) x (Number of weeks) 2)
Unpaid OT	= = =	: (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours : (\$10.73 - 3.53) x (39) x (17 : \$4,829.76	over 40) x (# weeks) .2)
Unpaid SH	= = =	: (days worked over 10 hrs.) x : (6.5) x (\$7.15) x (17.2) : \$799.37	x (MW) x (# weeks)
Total	=	\$8,119.69	
	17. <u>Ma</u>	ay 2008 - December 2008	
	N H	Jumber of weeks worked Jours worked/week Monthly salary	34.4 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$1 400/month
	M F	aid rate	\$4.52/hr.
Unpaid MW	M F = = =	Paid rate : (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours) : (\$7.15 - 4.52) x (40) x (34. : \$3,618.88	\$4.52/hr.) x (Number of weeks) 4)
Unpaid MW Unpaid OT	M = = = = = = =	Paid rate = (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours) = (\$7.15 - 4.52) x (40) x (34. = \$3,618.88 = (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.73 - 4.52) x (32) ² x (34) = \$6,635.97	<pre>\$4.52/hr. \$4.52/hr.) x (Number of weeks) 4) over 40) x (# weeks) 4.4)</pre>
Unpaid MW Unpaid OT Unpaid SH	M = = = = = = = = = = = =	Paid rate = (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours) = (\$7.15 - 4.52) x (40) x (34. = \$3,618.88 = (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.73 - 4.52) x (32) ² x (34 = \$6,635.97 = (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6) x (\$7.15) x (34.4) = \$1,475.76	<pre>\$4.52/hr. \$4.52/hr.) x (Number of weeks) 4) over 40) x (# weeks) 4.4) c (MW) x (# weeks)</pre>

 $^{^{\}rm 2}$ The plaintiffs incorrectly state this figure as 39 hours here and also for the next two periods.

	18	<u>January 2009 - July 23, 2009</u>		
		Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	29 weeks 60 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$4.65/hr.	
Unpaid	MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 h = (\$7.15 - 4.65) x (40) x = \$2,900.00	ours) x (Number of weeks) (29)	
Unpaid	OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (H = (\$10.73 - 4.65) x (20) z = \$3,526.40	lours over 40) x (# weeks) x (29)	
Unpaid	SH	= (days worked over 10 hr; = (6) x (\$7.15) x (29) = \$1,244.10	s.) x (MW) x (# weeks)	
Total		= \$7,670.50		
	19	. <u>July 24, 2009 - August 201</u>	<u>0</u>	
	19	. July 24, 2009 - August 2010 Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	0 53 weeks 60 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$4.65/hr.	
Unpaid	19 MW	<pre>. July 24, 2009 - August 2010 Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate = (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 h = (\$7.25 - 4.65) x (40) x = \$5,512.00</pre>	0 53 weeks 60 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$4.65/hr. Ours) x (Number of weeks) (53)	
Unpaid Unpaid	19 MW OT	<pre>. July 24, 2009 - August 2010 Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate = (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 h = (\$7.25 - 4.65) x (40) x = \$5,512.00 = (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (H = (\$10.88 - 4.65) x (20) x = \$6,603.80</pre>	0 53 weeks 60 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$4.65/hr. Cours) x (Number of weeks) (53) fours over 40) x (# weeks) x (53)	
Unpaid Unpaid Unpaid	19 MW OT SH	<pre>. July 24, 2009 - August 2010 Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate = (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 h = (\$7.25 - 4.65) x (40) x = \$5,512.00 = (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (40 = (\$10.88 - 4.65) x (20) x = \$6,603.80 = (days worked over 10 hrs = (6) x (\$7.25) x (53) = \$2,305.50</pre>	0 53 weeks 60 hrs./wk. \$1,200/month \$4.65/hr. Nours) x (Number of weeks) (53) Sours over 40) x (# weeks) x (53) s.) x (MW) x (# weeks)	

Hao Chen Total = \$101,100.88

C. You Huang Zhu

1.	December	2008	_	Julv	23.	2009
<u> </u>	DCCCMCCT	2000				

		Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	33.4 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$700/month \$2.26/hr.
Unpaid	MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.15 - 2.26) x (40) x (33. = \$6,533.04) x (Number of weeks) .4)
Unpaid	OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.73 - 2.26) x (32) x (33 = \$9,052.74	over 40) x (# weeks) 3.4)
Unpaid	SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6) x (\$7.15) x (33.4) = \$1,432.86</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total		= \$17,018.64	
	2. <u>J</u> ı	uly 24, 2009 - December 2009	
		Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	22.5 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$700/month \$2.26/hr.
Unpaid	MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.25 - 2.26) x (40) x (22. = \$4,491.00</pre>) x (Number of weeks) .5)
Unpaid	OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.88 - 2.26) x (32) x (22 = \$6,206.40	over 40) x (# weeks) 2.5)
Unpaid	SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) > = (6) x (\$7.25) x (22.5) = \$978.75</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total		= \$11,676.15	

3. January 2010 - August 2	010
----------------------------	-----

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	34.4 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$900/month \$2.91/hr.
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.25 - 2.91) x (40) x (34. = \$5,971.84</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 4)
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.88 - 2.91) x (32) x (34 = \$8,773.38	over 40) x (# weeks) 4.4)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6) x (\$7.25) x (34.4) = \$1,496.40</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$16,241.62	

You Huang Zhu Total = \$44,936.41

D. <u>Shui Bing Zhu</u>

1. <u>January 2006 - December 2006</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	52 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$6.75 - 1.77) x (40) x (52) = \$10,358.40</pre>) x (Number of weeks)
Unpaid OT	<pre>= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.13 - 1.77) x (39) x (52 = \$16,954.08</pre>	over 40) x (# weeks) ?)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$6.75) x (52) = \$2,281.50</pre>	x (MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$29,593.98	

	2. <u>J</u> a	anuary 2007 - February 2008	
		Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	60.6 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.
Unpaid MW		<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.15 - 1.77) x (40) x (60. = \$13,041.12</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 6)
Unpaid OT		= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.73 - 1.77) x (39) x (60 = \$21,176.06	over 40) x (# weeks) 0.6)
Unpaid SH		<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$7.15) x (60.6) = \$2,816.39</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total		= \$37,033.57	
	3. <u>Ma</u>	ay 2008 - July 23, 2009	
		Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	64 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$700/month \$2.26/hr.
Unpaid MW		<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.15 - 2.26) x (40) x (64) = \$12,518.40</pre>) x (Number of weeks)
Unpaid OT			
		= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.73 - 2.26) x (32) x (64 = \$17,346.56	over 40) x (# weeks)
Unpaid SH		<pre>= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.73 - 2.26) x (32) x (64 = \$17,346.56 = (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6) x (\$7.15) x (64) = \$2,745.60</pre>	over 40) x (# weeks) }) x (MW) x (# weeks)

4. July 24, 2009 - March 2010

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	35.4 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$700/month \$2.26/hr.
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$7.25 - 2.26) x (40) x (35. = \$7,065.84</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 4)
Unpaid OT	<pre>= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.88 - 2.26) x (32) x (35 = \$9,764.74</pre>	over 40) x (# weeks) 5.4)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6) x (\$7.25) x (35.4) = \$1,539.90</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$18,370.38	

Shui Bing Zhu Total = \$117,608.49

E. <u>Guo Ren Huang</u>

1. <u>May 2008 - August 2008</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	17.2 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$700/month \$2.26/hr.
Unpaid MW	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 ho = (\$7.15 - 2.26) x (40) x = \$3,364.32	ours) x (Number of weeks) (17.2)
Unpaid OT	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Ho = (\$10.73 - 2.26) x (32) x = \$4,661.89	ours over 40) x (# weeks) (17.2)
Unpaid SH	= (days worked over 10 hrs = (6) x (\$7.15) x (17.2) = \$737.88	.) x (MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$8,764.09	

	2. <u>Se</u> r	<u> ptember 2009 - August 2010</u>	
	1 1 1 1	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	52 weeks 72 hrs./wk. \$900/month \$2.91/hr.
Unpaid MW	=	= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours) = (\$7.25 - 2.91) x (40) x (52) = \$9,027.20) x (Number of weeks)
Unpaid OT	=	= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$10.88 - 2.91) x (32) x (52 = \$13,262.08	over 40) x (# weeks) 2)
Unpaid SH	=	= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6) x (\$7.25) x (52) = \$2,262.00	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total	=	= 24,551.28	
Guo Ren H	uang To	otal = \$33,315.37	

- F. <u>Jian Hui Lin</u>
 - 1. <u>April 2005 December 2005</u>

	Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	38.7 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.
Unpaid MW	<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours) = (\$6.00 - 1.77) x (40) x (38. = \$6,548.04</pre>) x (Number of weeks) 7)
Unpaid OT	<pre>= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours = (\$9.00 - 1.77) x (39) x (38. = \$10,912.24</pre>	over 40) x (# weeks) 7)
Unpaid SH	<pre>= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$6.00) x (38.7) = \$1,509.30</pre>	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total	= \$18,969.58	

		2. <u>Ja</u>	<u>nuary 2006 - December 2006</u>	
			Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	52 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.
Unpaid	MW		= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours = (\$6.75 - 1.77) x (40) x (52) = \$10,358.40) x (Number of weeks)
Unpaid	ОТ		= (1.5MW - Paid Rate) x (Hours over 40) x (# weeks) = (\$10.13 - 1.77) x (39) x (52) = \$16,954.08	
Unpaid	SH		= (days worked over 10 hrs.) x = (6.5) x (\$6.75) x (52) = \$2,281.50	(MW) x (# weeks)
Total			= \$29,593.98	
		3. <u>Ja</u>	<u>nuary 2007 - April 2007</u>	
			Number of weeks worked Hours worked/week Monthly salary Paid rate	17.2 weeks 79 hrs./wk. \$600/month \$1.77/hr.
Unpaid	MW		<pre>= (MW - Paid Rate) x (40 hours) x (Number of weeks) = (\$7.15 - 1.77) x (40) x (17.2) = \$3,701.44</pre>	
			$= (\$7.15 - 1.77) \times (40) \times (17.)$ = (\$3,701.44	2)
Unpaid	ОТ		= $(\$7.15 - 1.77) \times (40) \times (17)$ = $(\$7.15 - 1.77) \times (40) \times (17)$ = $(\$3,701.44)$ = $(\$1.5MW - Paid Rate) \times (Hours)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \times (39) \times (17)$ = $\$6,010.37$	2) over 40) x (# weeks) '.2)
Unpaid Unpaid	OT SH		= $(\$i \\ m)$ full $(10 \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$3,701.44$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(39) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(39) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(39) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(39) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(39) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(39) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(39) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$ $(17 \\ m)$ = $(\$10.73 - 1.77) \\ m)$	2) over 40) x (# weeks) 2) 2) 2) 2)

Jian Hui Lin Total = \$59,074.74

Conclusion

Judgment shall be entered in favor of the plaintiffs and against the defendants Wai ? Café Inc. and Wai Yin Chan, jointly and severally, on the plaintiffs' New York Labor Law claims as set forth below:

<u>Plaintiff</u>	Amount
Zu Ghang Zhu	\$124,191.77
Hao Chen	\$101,100.88
You Huang Zhu	\$44,936.41
Shui Bing Zhu	\$117,608.49
Guo Ren Huang	\$33,315.37
Jian Hui Lin	\$59,074.74

The plaintiffs' claims under the FLSA are dismissed. The Clerk of Court shall enter judgment accordingly and close this case.³

SO ORDERED.

JAMES C. FRANCIS IV

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

Dated: New York, New York March 26, 2012

³ The plaintiffs request that I "reapportion" the costs of the interpreter who translated for both the plaintiffs and Mr. Chan at trial. (Pl. Damages Statement). This application is moot; as the prevailing parties, the plaintiffs are entitled to costs, and interpreter expenses are included among taxable costs. 28 U.S.C. § 1920(6).

Copies mailed this date to: C.K. Lee, Esq. Robert L. Kraselnik, Esq. Kraselnik & Lee, PLLC 30 East 39th Street, 2nd Floor New York, New York 10016

Wai Yin Chan 54 Lyman Ave. Staten Island, New York 10305