

# **EXHIBIT I**

**KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**  
AND AFFILIATED PARTNERSHIPS

601 Lexington Avenue  
New York, New York 10022

Bonnie L. Jarrett  
To Call Writer Directly:  
(212) 446-4964  
bonnie.jarrett@kirkland.com

(212) 446-4800

www.kirkland.com

Facsimile:  
(212) 446-4900

December 20, 2012

**Via Electronic Mail**

David Shaiman  
Allegaert Berger & Vogel LLP  
111 Broadway, 20th Floor  
New York, NY 10006

Re: *J.T. Colby & Co., Inc., et al. v. Apple Inc.*, No. 11 cv 4060

Dear David:

I am writing in response to your December 17, 2012 letter. In this letter, you requested "the production of documents concerning the fielding dates of Dr. Nowlis' study and the name of the validating company used in connection with Dr. Nowlis' study." (Letter from Dr. Shaiman to B. Jarrett dated Dec. 17, 2012.) Dr. Nowlis does not have documents reflecting this information in his possession. He was, however, able to confirm the following:

1. His study was fielded from September 14, 2012 to September 26, 2012.
2. His study was validated by WRS, LLC, located in Chattanooga, Tennessee.

We expect this resolves the issues raised in your December 17, 2012 letter.

Also, as you know, on December 18, 2012, Apple requested documents and information related to Dr. McDonald's deposition and survey. As Defendant has complied with your request for information about Dr. Nowlis' survey, we are writing to request that you please produce the documents and requested information about Dr. McDonald's survey and Research Now immediately.

Sincerely,



Bonnie L. Jarrett

cc: All counsel of record