Gilman v. Spitzer et al Doc. 22 Att. 15

EXHIBIT 15

Case No. 11 Civ 5843 (JPO)

DECLARATION OF JAY WARD BROWN IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS' OPPOSTION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION TO DISMISS DEFENDANTS' COUNTERCLAIM

(Conf. Tr., Dec. 2, 2011)

```
1C2JGILC
                           Conference
    UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 1
    SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
 2
     ----x
 2
 3
    WILLIAM GILMAN,
 3
 4
                   Plaintiff,
 4
 5
               v.
                                         11 Civ. 5843 JPO
 5
 6
    ELIOT SPITZER, et al.,
 6
 7
                   Defendants.
 7
 8
 8
9
10
                                          December 2, 2011
10
                                          10:54 a.m.
11
12
13
    Before:
13
14
                        HON. J. PAUL OETKEN,
14
15
                                          District Judge
15
16
17
18
                             APPEARANCES
18
19
19
     LIDDLE & ROBINSON, LLP
20
     Attorneys for plaintiff
20 BY: JEFFREY LEW LIDDLE, Esq.
         JAMES WILLIAM HALTER, Esq.
21
21
                    Of counsel
22
22 LEVINE SULLIVAN KOCH & SCHULZ, LLP
23
         Attorneys for defendants
23 BY: LEE LEVINE, Esq.
24
                     Of counsel
25
                   SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.
```

(212) 805-0300

1C2JGILC Conference

I am inclined to at least temporarily put off a discovery schedule and remaining schedule in the case and look at the motions first and try to resolve them fairly quickly, or at least get a better sense of them, an initial sense of them before starting full blown discovery in the case, mainly for the reason that obviously I think it could be much more efficient if there is a way to resolve the case without getting into discovery, which is defendant's position.

Also I think an opinion going through some of the issues raised in the motion for judgment on the pleadings could have an effect on the scope of discovery and I think getting that resolved before discovery begins, takes place, I think could be helpful to the parties in terms of the efficiency of discovery.

So I am going to hold off on setting a schedule for the case at this point and just proceed on the basis of the current briefing schedule on the two motions, and then I'll let the parties know whether I need argument on the motions and/or whether I am going to call the parties in to set a schedule as if I'm reviewing the motions, okay? I think that is all we need for today unless there is anything else that the parties want to discuss?

MR. LIDDLE: Your Honor, the only issue that I wanted to raise, and it has pretty much been preempted by everything you said, but since we were in line longer than the conference, SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C.

(212) 805-0300

2.2

2.3

1C2JGILC Conference

I might as well say it, is that we do feel fairly strongly that it would be appropriate to have at the earliest possible time the -- and this may not entail any documentary discovery -- the deposition of the defendant Spitzer and deposition of that person from Slate who is in charge of the, whatever fact-checking process did or did not occur.

THE COURT: Do you know who the person or people are or is?

MR. LIDDLE: Well, I don't know who the person is at Slate. I am of the, say, semi-educated opinion that there was no fact-checking, and that might be an answer that we get at the time that is pursued.

In other words, due to the status of the author as a former governor and attorney general himself, there was more latitude given to the facts as he would present them as opposed to what would happen if, say, I wrote a piece in which they probably have 10 people on.

THE COURT: I will keep that point in mind.

MR. LIDDLE: Thank you.

THE COURT: I still think what I've said stands particularly because if, for example, it turns out to be the case that I'm persuaded that the challenged statements were not of and concerning the plaintiff, for example, then those issues aren't relevant, the issues of fact-checking, et cetera, don't become relevant in the case.

SOUTHERN DISTRICT REPORTERS, P.C. (212) 805-0300

2.3