

**KNIGHT  
FIRST AMENDMENT  
INSTITUTE**

at Columbia University

March 16, 2018

**Via ECF and by Fax**

The Honorable Naomi Reice Buchwald  
United States District Court for the  
Southern District of New York  
500 Pearl Street, Room 2270  
New York, NY 10007-1312

**Re: *Knight First Amendment Institute, et al. v. Trump,  
et al., Case No. 17-CV-5205 (NRB)***

Dear Judge Buchwald,

Because of an exchange between the Court and counsel for the Government during last Thursday's oral argument in the above-captioned matter, counsel for Plaintiffs revisited the D.C. Circuit's decision in *Swan v. Clinton*, 100 F.3d 973 (D.C. Cir. 1996), and their characterization of that decision in Plaintiffs' summary judgment briefing. In at least two instances, Plaintiffs stated that the court in *Swan* had ordered injunctive relief against the President's subordinates in lieu of the President. Pls.' Cross-Mot. & Opp'n Br. at 31 n.13, ECF No. 43; Pls.' Reply Br. at 14, ECF No. 56. In fact, although the court held that it had jurisdiction to grant such relief, *Swan*, 100 F.3d at 979–81, it ultimately ruled against the plaintiff on the merits, *id.* at 988.

As counsel for Plaintiffs stated at oral argument, *Swan* is relevant here because it makes clear that the Court has authority to order subordinate officials to remedy injuries stemming from the President's actions. The other cases counsel cited during argument further clarify that, for purposes of standing to obtain injunctive relief against individuals sued in their official capacities, the relevant question is whether those individuals are in a position to carry out the ordered relief. *See Parkell v. Danberg*, 833 F.3d 313, 332 (3d Cir. 2016); *Hartmann v. Cal. Dep't of Corr. & Rehab.*, 707 F.3d 1114, 1127 (9th Cir. 2013); *Luckey v. Harris*, 860 F.2d 1012, 1015 (11th Cir. 1988).

Respectfully,

*/s/ Jameel Jaffer*

---

Jameel Jaffer (JJ-4653)  
Katherine Fallow (KF-2535)  
Carrie DeCell (CD-0731)  
Alex Abdo (AA-0527)  
Knight First Amendment Institute  
at Columbia University  
475 Riverside Drive, Suite 302  
New York, NY 10115  
(646) 745-8500  
Jameel.Jaffer@knightcolumbia.org

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

Jessica Ring Amunson (*pro hac  
vice*)  
Tassity S. Johnson (*pro hac vice*)  
Jenner & Block LLP  
1099 New York Avenue, NW,  
Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20001