# CLIFTON BUDD & DEMARIA, LLP

## ATTORNEYS AT LAW

THE EMPIRE STATE BUILDING 350 FIFTH AVENUE, 61ST FLOOR NEW YORK, NY 10118 TEL (212) 687-7410 FAX (212) 687-3285 www.cbdm.com

IAN-PAUL A. POULOS
ASSOCIATE
E-MAIL: IAPOULOS@CBDM.COM

December 7, 2020

## **VIA ECF**

Hon. Lorna G. Schofield United States District Judge United States District Court Southern District of New York 500 Pearl Street New York, NY 10007

Re: Screen v. Quality Protection Services, Inc. et al 1:20-cv-02506-LGS

Dear Judge Schofield:

This firm represents the Defendants in the above-referenced action. We write with Plaintiff's consent to request that the Court So-Order the attached subpoenas pursuant to Rule 45 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, which are directed at the New York State Department of Labor ("NY DOL") and the New York City Fire Department ("FDNY"). *See* Exhibit A & Exhibit B.

On November 23, 2020, this Court ordered that the "Defendant[s] shall produce any documents obtained through the use of the [NY DOL and FDNY] authorizations to Plaintiff, prior to Defendants' deposition of Plaintiff." *See* ECF Doc. 42. As indicated in the same Order, the Plaintiff's deposition is currently scheduled to proceed on December 15. The individual Defendants (Mirjanic and Brady) are scheduled for December 21 and 22. *See* ECF Doc. 42.

After Plaintiff provided the above-mentioned authorizations, the Defendants immediately delivered them with attorney-signed subpoenas by FedEx Priority Overnight on November 25, 2020. See Exhibit C & Exhibit D. In the days that followed, Defendants contacted both agencies repeatedly to determine a timeframe for their anticipated response. The NY DOL indicated on December 2, 2020, that "these records can take up to 2 weeks to produce." After more than ten phone calls from the undersigned's office, the FDNY answered the phone on one occasion (December 3) and indicated to this firm's paralegal that the FDNY is severely understaffed. No specific timeframe was provided for a response.

For this reason, the parties <u>request that Your Honor issue Court-ordered subpoenas</u> <u>compelling the NY DOL and FDNY to respond</u>. In the alternative, and with the understanding that this Court Ordered no further extensions will be granted absent extraordinary circumstances, the

## CLIFTON BUDD & DEMARIA, LLP

Page 2 December 7, 2020

Defendants respectfully request with Plaintiff's consent that the Court adjourn depositions pending the NY DOL and FDNY's response. Fact discovery closes on February 2, 2021. Compelling the agencies to respond will not affect other scheduled dates.

Thank you for Your Honor's time and consideration.

Respectfully submitted,

CLIFTON BUDD & DeMARIA, LLP Attorneys for the Defendants

By: /s/Ian-Paul A. Poulos
Arthur J. Robb
Ian-Paul A. Poulos

CC: All Counsel of Record

The application is **GRANTED**. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to sign the attached subpoenas and serve them on the New York City Fire Department and New York Department of Labor, respectively.

So Ordered.

Dated: December 8, 2020

New York, New York

LORNA G. SCHOFIELD

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

AO 88B (Rev. 12/13) Subpoena to Produce Documents, Information, or Objects or to Permit Inspection of Premises in a Civil Action

# United States District Court

for the

Southern District of New York

Makeba Screen	)	
Plaintiff	, )	
V.	Civil Action No. 20-CV-02506-LGS	
Quality Protection Services, Inc. et al.	)	
D.C. I.		
Defendant	)	
	UMENTS, INFORMATION, OR OBJECTS N OF PREMISES IN A CIVIL ACTION	
	k City Fire Department	
	ter, Brooklyn, New York 11201  to whom this subpoena is directed)	
	*	
documents, electronically stored information, or objects	oduce at the time, date, and place set forth below the following , and to permit inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of the applications, exam or training course results, and certifications eba Screen.	
Place: Clifton Budd & DeMaria, LLP	Date and Time:	
350 Flfth Avenue, Suite 6110	40/44/2020 40:00 am	
New York, New York 10118	12/14/2020 10:00 am	
other property possessed or controlled by you at the tim	MDED to permit entry onto the designated premises, land, or e, date, and location set forth below, so that the requesting party ele the property or any designated object or operation on it.  Date and Time:	
riace.	Date and Time.	
The following provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 45 are attached – Rule 45(c), relating to the place of compliance; Rule 45(d), relating to your protection as a person subject to a subpoena; and Rule 45(e) and (g), relating to your duty to respond to this subpoena and the potential consequences of not doing so.		
Date: 12/08/2020		
CLERK OF COURT		
CLEAR OF COOK!	OR	
Signature of Clerk or Deput	y Clerk Attorney's signature	
The name, address, e-mail address, and telephone numb	er of the attorney representing (name of party)	
	hane Brady , who issues or requests this subpoena, are:	
10118, iapoulos@cbdm com	Empire State Building, 350 Fifth Avenue, STE 6110, NY, NY	

## Notice to the person who issues or requests this subpoena

A notice and a copy of the subpoena must be served on each party in this case before it is served on the person to whom it is directed. Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(4).

## 

AO 88B (Rev. 12/13) Subpoena to Produce Documents, Information, or Objects or to Permit Inspection of Premises in a Civil Action (Page 2)

Civil Action No. 20-CV-02506-LGS

## PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 45.)

I received this sub	opoena for (name of individual and title, if a	ny)	
date)	·		
☐ I served the su	bpoena by delivering a copy to the na	med person as follows:	
		on (date) ;	or
☐ I returned the s	subpoena unexecuted because:		
		States, or one of its officers or agents, I e, and the mileage allowed by law, in the	
	<u> </u>		
fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
I 11 1	14 - C 4 - 4 d C		
i deciare under pe	enalty of perjury that this information	is true.	
:			
		Server's signature	
		Printed name and title	
		Server's address	

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc.:

AO 88B (Rev. 12/13) Subpoena to Produce Documents, Information, or Objects or to Permit Inspection of Premises in a Civil Action(Page 3)

### Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 45 (c), (d), (e), and (g) (Effective 12/1/13)

#### (c) Place of Compliance.

- (1) For a Trial, Hearing, or Deposition. A subpoena may command a person to attend a trial, hearing, or deposition only as follows:
- (A) within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; or
- **(B)** within the state where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person, if the person
  - (i) is a party or a party's officer; or
- (ii) is commanded to attend a trial and would not incur substantial expense.

#### (2) For Other Discovery. A subpoena may command:

- (A) production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things at a place within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; and
  - **(B)** inspection of premises at the premises to be inspected.

#### (d) Protecting a Person Subject to a Subpoena; Enforcement.

(1) Avoiding Undue Burden or Expense; Sanctions. A party or attorney responsible for issuing and serving a subpoena must take reasonable steps to avoid imposing undue burden or expense on a person subject to the subpoena. The court for the district where compliance is required must enforce this duty and impose an appropriate sanction—which may include lost earnings and reasonable attorney's fees—on a party or attorney who fails to comply.

#### (2) Command to Produce Materials or Permit Inspection.

- (A) Appearance Not Required. A person commanded to produce documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things, or to permit the inspection of premises, need not appear in person at the place of production or inspection unless also commanded to appear for a deposition, hearing, or trial.
- **(B)** Objections. A person commanded to produce documents or tangible things or to permit inspection may serve on the party or attorney designated in the subpoena a written objection to inspecting, copying, testing, or sampling any or all of the materials or to inspecting the premises—or to producing electronically stored information in the form or forms requested. The objection must be served before the earlier of the time specified for compliance or 14 days after the subpoena is served. If an objection is made, the following rules apply:
- (i) At any time, on notice to the commanded person, the serving party may move the court for the district where compliance is required for an order compelling production or inspection.
- (ii) These acts may be required only as directed in the order, and the order must protect a person who is neither a party nor a party's officer from significant expense resulting from compliance.

## (3) Quashing or Modifying a Subpoena.

- (A) When Required. On timely motion, the court for the district where compliance is required must quash or modify a subpoena that:
  - (i) fails to allow a reasonable time to comply;
- (ii) requires a person to comply beyond the geographical limits specified in Rule 45(c);
- (iii) requires disclosure of privileged or other protected matter, if no exception or waiver applies; or
  - (iv) subjects a person to undue burden.
- **(B)** When Permitted. To protect a person subject to or affected by a subpoena, the court for the district where compliance is required may, on motion, quash or modify the subpoena if it requires:
- (i) disclosing a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information; or

- (ii) disclosing an unretained expert's opinion or information that does not describe specific occurrences in dispute and results from the expert's study that was not requested by a party.
- (C) Specifying Conditions as an Alternative. In the circumstances described in Rule 45(d)(3)(B), the court may, instead of quashing or modifying a subpoena, order appearance or production under specified conditions if the serving party:
- (i) shows a substantial need for the testimony or material that cannot be otherwise met without undue hardship; and
  - (ii) ensures that the subpoenaed person will be reasonably compensated.

### (e) Duties in Responding to a Subpoena.

- (1) Producing Documents or Electronically Stored Information. These procedures apply to producing documents or electronically stored information:
- (A) Documents. A person responding to a subpoena to produce documents must produce them as they are kept in the ordinary course of business or must organize and label them to correspond to the categories in the demand.
- **(B)** Form for Producing Electronically Stored Information Not Specified. If a subpoena does not specify a form for producing electronically stored information, the person responding must produce it in a form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a reasonably usable form or forms.
- (C) Electronically Stored Information Produced in Only One Form. The person responding need not produce the same electronically stored information in more than one form.
- **(D)** Inaccessible Electronically Stored Information. The person responding need not provide discovery of electronically stored information from sources that the person identifies as not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. On motion to compel discovery or for a protective order, the person responding must show that the information is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. If that showing is made, the court may nonetheless order discovery from such sources if the requesting party shows good cause, considering the limitations of Rule 26(b)(2)(C). The court may specify conditions for the discovery.

#### (2) Claiming Privilege or Protection.

- (A) Information Withheld. A person withholding subpoenaed information under a claim that it is privileged or subject to protection as trial-preparation material must:
  - (i) expressly make the claim; and
- (ii) describe the nature of the withheld documents, communications, or tangible things in a manner that, without revealing information itself privileged or protected, will enable the parties to assess the claim.
- **(B)** Information Produced. If information produced in response to a subpoena is subject to a claim of privilege or of protection as trial-preparation material, the person making the claim may notify any party that received the information of the claim and the basis for it. After being notified, a party must promptly return, sequester, or destroy the specified information and any copies it has; must not use or disclose the information until the claim is resolved; must take reasonable steps to retrieve the information if the party disclosed it before being notified; and may promptly present the information under seal to the court for the district where compliance is required for a determination of the claim. The person who produced the information must preserve the information until the claim is resolved.

#### (g) Contempt.

The court for the district where compliance is required—and also, after a motion is transferred, the issuing court—may hold in contempt a person who, having been served, fails without adequate excuse to obey the subpoena or an order related to it.

AO 88B (Rev. 12/13) Subpoena to Produce Documents, Information, or Objects or to Permit Inspection of Premises in a Civil Action

# United States District Court

for the

Southern District of New York

Makeba Screen	
Plaintiff	)
V.	Civil Action No. 20-CV-02506-LGS
Quality Protection Services, Inc. et al.	
Defendant	)
	ENTS, INFORMATION, OR OBJECTS OF PREMISES IN A CIVIL ACTION
	e Department of Labor Campus, Albany, New York 12240
(Name of person to v	vhom this subpoena is directed)
	nd to permit inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of the onging to Makeba Screen from September 30, 2019 through
Place: Clifton Budd & DeMaria, LLP	Date and Time:
350 Flfth Avenue, Suite 6110 New York, New York 10118	12/14/2020 10:00 am
other property possessed or controlled by you at the time, d may inspect, measure, survey, photograph, test, or sample t Place:	late, and location set forth below, so that the requesting party he property or any designated object or operation on it.  Date and Time:
	attached – Rule 45(c), relating to the place of compliance; o a subpoena; and Rule 45(e) and (g), relating to your duty to not doing so.
CLERK OF COURT	OR
Signature of Clerk or Deputy Cl	erk Attorney's signature
The name, address, e-mail address, and telephone number of	of the attorney representing (name of party)
Quality Protection Services, Inc., Mirjana Mirjanic, and Shar	ne Brady , who issues or requests this subpoena, are:
lan-Paul A. Poulos, Clifton Budd & DeMaria, LLP, The Empton 10118, iapoulos@cbdm.com	pire State Building, 350 Fifth Avenue, STE 6110, NY, NY

Notice to the person who issues or requests this subpoena

A notice and a copy of the subpoena must be served on each party in this case before it is served on the person to whom it is directed. Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(4).

## 

AO 88B (Rev. 12/13) Subpoena to Produce Documents, Information, or Objects or to Permit Inspection of Premises in a Civil Action (Page 2)

Civil Action No. 20-CV-02506-LGS

## PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 45.)

I received this sub	opoena for (name of individual and title, if a	ny)	
date)	·		
☐ I served the su	bpoena by delivering a copy to the na	med person as follows:	
		on (date) ;	or
☐ I returned the s	subpoena unexecuted because:		
		States, or one of its officers or agents, I e, and the mileage allowed by law, in the	
	<u> </u>		
fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
I 11 1	14 - C 4 - 4 d C		
i deciare under pe	enalty of perjury that this information	is true.	
:			
		Server's signature	
		Printed name and title	
		Server's address	

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc.:

AO 88B (Rev. 12/13) Subpoena to Produce Documents, Information, or Objects or to Permit Inspection of Premises in a Civil Action(Page 3)

### Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 45 (c), (d), (e), and (g) (Effective 12/1/13)

#### (c) Place of Compliance.

- (1) For a Trial, Hearing, or Deposition. A subpoena may command a person to attend a trial, hearing, or deposition only as follows:
- (A) within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; or
- **(B)** within the state where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person, if the person
  - (i) is a party or a party's officer; or
- (ii) is commanded to attend a trial and would not incur substantial expense.

#### (2) For Other Discovery. A subpoena may command:

- (A) production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things at a place within 100 miles of where the person resides, is employed, or regularly transacts business in person; and
  - **(B)** inspection of premises at the premises to be inspected.

#### (d) Protecting a Person Subject to a Subpoena; Enforcement.

(1) Avoiding Undue Burden or Expense; Sanctions. A party or attorney responsible for issuing and serving a subpoena must take reasonable steps to avoid imposing undue burden or expense on a person subject to the subpoena. The court for the district where compliance is required must enforce this duty and impose an appropriate sanction—which may include lost earnings and reasonable attorney's fees—on a party or attorney who fails to comply.

#### (2) Command to Produce Materials or Permit Inspection.

- (A) Appearance Not Required. A person commanded to produce documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things, or to permit the inspection of premises, need not appear in person at the place of production or inspection unless also commanded to appear for a deposition, hearing, or trial.
- (B) Objections. A person commanded to produce documents or tangible things or to permit inspection may serve on the party or attorney designated in the subpoena a written objection to inspecting, copying, testing, or sampling any or all of the materials or to inspecting the premises—or to producing electronically stored information in the form or forms requested. The objection must be served before the earlier of the time specified for compliance or 14 days after the subpoena is served. If an objection is made, the following rules apply:
- (i) At any time, on notice to the commanded person, the serving party may move the court for the district where compliance is required for an order compelling production or inspection.
- (ii) These acts may be required only as directed in the order, and the order must protect a person who is neither a party nor a party's officer from significant expense resulting from compliance.

## (3) Quashing or Modifying a Subpoena.

- (A) When Required. On timely motion, the court for the district where compliance is required must quash or modify a subpoena that:
  - (i) fails to allow a reasonable time to comply;
- (ii) requires a person to comply beyond the geographical limits specified in Rule 45(c);
- (iii) requires disclosure of privileged or other protected matter, if no exception or waiver applies; or
  - (iv) subjects a person to undue burden.
- **(B)** When Permitted. To protect a person subject to or affected by a subpoena, the court for the district where compliance is required may, on motion, quash or modify the subpoena if it requires:
- (i) disclosing a trade secret or other confidential research, development, or commercial information; or

- (ii) disclosing an unretained expert's opinion or information that does not describe specific occurrences in dispute and results from the expert's study that was not requested by a party.
- (C) Specifying Conditions as an Alternative. In the circumstances described in Rule 45(d)(3)(B), the court may, instead of quashing or modifying a subpoena, order appearance or production under specified conditions if the serving party:
- (i) shows a substantial need for the testimony or material that cannot be otherwise met without undue hardship; and
  - (ii) ensures that the subpoenaed person will be reasonably compensated.

#### (e) Duties in Responding to a Subpoena.

- (1) Producing Documents or Electronically Stored Information. These procedures apply to producing documents or electronically stored information:
- (A) Documents. A person responding to a subpoena to produce documents must produce them as they are kept in the ordinary course of business or must organize and label them to correspond to the categories in the demand.
- **(B)** Form for Producing Electronically Stored Information Not Specified. If a subpoena does not specify a form for producing electronically stored information, the person responding must produce it in a form or forms in which it is ordinarily maintained or in a reasonably usable form or forms.
- (C) Electronically Stored Information Produced in Only One Form. The person responding need not produce the same electronically stored information in more than one form.
- **(D)** Inaccessible Electronically Stored Information. The person responding need not provide discovery of electronically stored information from sources that the person identifies as not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. On motion to compel discovery or for a protective order, the person responding must show that the information is not reasonably accessible because of undue burden or cost. If that showing is made, the court may nonetheless order discovery from such sources if the requesting party shows good cause, considering the limitations of Rule 26(b)(2)(C). The court may specify conditions for the discovery.

#### (2) Claiming Privilege or Protection.

- (A) Information Withheld. A person withholding subpoenaed information under a claim that it is privileged or subject to protection as trial-preparation material must:
  - (i) expressly make the claim; and
- (ii) describe the nature of the withheld documents, communications, or tangible things in a manner that, without revealing information itself privileged or protected, will enable the parties to assess the claim.
- **(B)** *Information Produced.* If information produced in response to a subpoena is subject to a claim of privilege or of protection as trial-preparation material, the person making the claim may notify any party that received the information of the claim and the basis for it. After being notified, a party must promptly return, sequester, or destroy the specified information and any copies it has; must not use or disclose the information until the claim is resolved; must take reasonable steps to retrieve the information if the party disclosed it before being notified; and may promptly present the information under seal to the court for the district where compliance is required for a determination of the claim. The person who produced the information must preserve the information until the claim is resolved.

#### (g) Contempt.

The court for the district where compliance is required—and also, after a motion is transferred, the issuing court—may hold in contempt a person who, having been served, fails without adequate excuse to obey the subpoena or an order related to it.