

## CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN &amp; HAMILTON LLP

One Liberty Plaza  
New York, NY 10006-1470

T: +1 212 225 2000

F: +1 212 225 3999

clearygottlieb.com

WASHINGTON, D.C. • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON • MOSCOW  
FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN • HONG KONG  
BEIJING • BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO • ABU DHABI • SEOUL

D: +1 212 225 2086  
jrosenthal@cgsh.com

STEVEN M. LOEB  
CRAIG B. BROD  
NICOLAS GRABAR  
DAVID E. BRODSKY  
RICHARD J. COOPER  
JEFFREY S. LEWIS  
PAUL J. SHIM  
STEVEN L. WILNER  
ANDRES DE LA CRUZ  
DAVID C. LOPEZ  
MICHAEL A. GERSTENZANG  
LEV L. DASSIN  
JORGE U. JUANTORENA  
MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER  
DAVID LEINWAND  
DIANA L. WOLLMAN  
JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL  
MICHAEL D. DAYAN  
CARMINE D. BOCCUZZI, JR.  
JEFFREY D. KARPF  
KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW  
ROBERT J. RAYMOND  
FRANCISCO L. CESTERO  
FRANCESCA L. ODELL  
WILLIAM L. MCRAE  
JASON FACTOR  
JOON H. KIM  
MARGARET S. PEPONIS  
LISA M. SCHWEITZER  
JUAN G. GIRÁLDEZ  
DUANE MCLAUGHLIN  
BREON S. PEACE  
CHANTAL E. KORDULA

BENET J. O'REILLY  
ADAM E. FLEISHER  
SEAN A. O'NEAL  
GLENN P. MCGRORY  
MATTHEW P. SALERNO  
MICHAEL J. ALBANO  
VICTOR L. HOU  
ROGER A. COOPER  
AMY R. SHAPIRO  
JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK  
ELIZABETH LENAS  
LUKE A. BAREFOOT  
JONATHAN S. KOLODNER  
DANIEL LAN  
MEYER H. FEDIDA  
ADRIAN R. LEIPSCIC  
ELIZABETH VICENS  
ADAM J. BRENNEMAN  
ARI D. MACKINNON  
JAMES E. LANGSTON  
JARED GERBER  
COLIN D. LLOYD  
COREY M. GOODMAN  
RISHI ZUTSHI  
JANE VANLARE  
DAVID H. HERRINGTON  
KIMBERLY R. SPOERRI  
AARON J. MEYERS  
DANIEL C. REYNOLDS  
AUDRY X. CASUSOL  
ABENA A. MAINOO  
HUGH G. CONROY, JR.  
JOSEPH LANZKRON

MAURICE R. GINDI  
KATHERINE R. REAVES  
RAHUL MUKHI  
ELANA S. BRONSON  
MANUEL SILVA  
KYLE A. HARRIS  
LINA BENSMAN  
ARON M. ZUCKERMAN  
KENNETH S. BLAZEJEWSKI  
MARK E. MCDONALD  
F. JAMAL FULTON  
RESIDENT PARTNERS  
SANDRA M. ROCKS  
JUDITH KASSEL  
PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOROU  
BOAZ S. MORAG  
MARY E. ALCOCK  
HEIDE H. ILGENFRITZ  
ANDREW WEAVER  
HELENA K. GRANNIS  
JOHN V. HARRISON  
NEIL R. MARKEL  
LAURA BAGARELLA  
JONATHAN D.W. GIFFORD  
SUSANNA E. PARKER  
DAVID W.S. YUDIN  
RESIDENT COUNSEL  
LOUISE M. PARENT  
OF COUNSEL

July 29, 2021

VIA ECF

The Honorable Ona T. Wang  
United States Magistrate Judge  
United States District Court for the Southern District of New York  
Daniel Patrick Moynihan Courthouse  
500 Pearl Street  
New York, NY 10007

**MEMO ENDORSED**

Re: *In re Application of Vale S.A. et al., No. 20-mc-199-JGK-OTW*

Dear Judge Wang:

We write on behalf of Vale S.A., Vale Holdings B.V., and Vale International S.A. (collectively, "Vale") to respectfully request that the Court, pursuant to Rule 37(a) and Rule 45(d)(2)(B)(i) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, compel respondent Nir Meir ("Meir") to complete production of responsive documents by no later than August 6, 2021, more than one year after the Court granted Vale's application to obtain this discovery, ECF No. 45 at 9, and six months after the Court denied the motion to quash filed by Meir and HFZ Capital Group LLC ("HFZ")<sup>1</sup> and ordered Meir and all other respondents to respond to the subpoenas by February 5, 2021. ECF No. 76 at 9.

On January 28, 2021, shortly after Meir departed HFZ, Meir's counsel appeared in this case and indicated that Meir would produce documents responsive to Vale's subpoena separately from HFZ. *See* ECF No. 75 (Richard Wolter, David Hutcher & Citron LLP Notice of Appearance). *See also* Ex. A (Email from R. Wolter to A. Saenz *et al.* dated Mar. 12, 2021). Despite numerous meet and confers and repeated assurances by Meir's counsel that a production of documents was imminent, Meir has yet to produce a single document. Meir's counsel first indicated that a

<sup>1</sup> HFZ's motion to quash was filed on behalf of over 25 entities and individuals, including Meir, HFZ's former Managing Principal. *See* ECF No. 63.

The Honorable Ona T. Wang, p. 2

production would be made by April 30, 2021. *See id.* (Email from R. Wolter to A. Saenz dated April 22, 2021). Most recently, Meir's counsel informed Vale's counsel that a complete production would be made by July 14, 2021. *Id.* (Email from R. Wolter to A. Saenz dated July 9, 2021 identifying complete production by Wednesday, July 14). All of these dates have come and gone without Meir complying with his Court-ordered obligations.

It has become clear from the months of delay that Meir does not in fact intend to comply with the subpoena without yet another order from the Court. *See Anhui Konka Green Lighting Co. v. Green Logic Led Elec. Supply, Inc.*, No. 18CV12255MKVKHP, 2020 WL 5743518, at \*3 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 25, 2020) (granting motion to compel discovery where defendants were "late to respond" and "provided a host of excuses" for delay, and ordering defendants to provide a written filing within six days detailing the location and status of documents requested); *Ambac Assurance Corp. v. U.S. Bank Nat'l Ass'n*, No. 117CV2614WHPKHP, 2020 WL 526404, at \*2 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 3, 2020) (granting motion to compel discovery where counsel for non-party subpoena recipient repeatedly failed to reply to party's counsel, and failed to meet two agreed-upon production dates, and ordering that documents be produced within a month or "face sanctions").

Vale thus respectfully requests that the Court set a deadline for Meir to complete production of documents responsive to Vale's subpoena by August 6, 2021 or, to the extent the Court does not enter an order by such date, within one week after the Court's order. As Meir has been promising document production to Vale for months, and his most recent communication to us on July 9 stated that he needed only three more business days to comply, a short deadline is both reasonable and warranted here.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey A. Rosenthal

Jeffrey A. Rosenthal

jrosenthal@cgsh.com

Lisa M. Schweitzer

lschweitzer@cgsh.com

Lisa Vicens

evicens@cgsh.com

CLEARY GOTTLIEB STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

One Liberty Plaza

New York, New York 10006

T: 212-225-2000

F: 212-225-3999

*Counsel for Vale S.A., Vale Holdings B.V., and Vale International S.A.*

cc: Counsel of Record via ECF

Application **GRANTED**. Nir Meir shall complete production of responsive documents by **August 12, 2021**. Failure to timely comply with this Order may result in the Court imposing sanctions pursuant to applicable law.

**SO ORDERED.**



Ona T. Wang                      8/4/21  
U.S.M.J.