Exhibit 4

```
Clayton's handwriting, as best you could tell?
 1
 2
                     As best I can tell.
             Α.
 3
                     Tell me about -- to the extent you know,
             0.
     the photo arrays, how were the E and D or E and F
 4
 5
     arranged as far as who was in them and how it was set
          Is it the same as that you did on the 16th?
 6
 7
             Α.
                     It was, yes. Yes.
 8
             Ο.
                     So there was somebody in those arrays
 9
     who she had a name that she had ---
10
                          On this one, if I am remembering it
             Α.
11
     correctly I that Dan Flannery's name had come up, and
     they wanted to rule him out as a potential suspect.
12
13
     And I do not recall right offhand why the other one was
14
     done.
15
                     Okay. And Investigator Clayton, also,
             Q.
     was he an administrator of the second set of arrays?
16
                      Was he the administrator?
17
             Α.
18
             Q.
                     Yes.
19
             Α.
                     Yes.
20
                     Do you know whether the second set of
             Q.
21
     arrays included a picture of David Evans?
22
             Α.
                     Not without looking at them.
23
             Q.
                     Did she identify any ---
24
             Α.
                     I will say, and I apologize, I do know
2.5
     that in one of the arrays, whether it's A through F,
```

25

I don't recall. I know that 1 Α. Investigator Himan would have spoken to the District 2 Attorney's office prior to that because the District 3 Attorney's office is actually who takes out the Non-4 5 Testimonial. The Police Department just gives them the 6 information. We aren't the ones who would go before 7 the judge. 8 Right. Do you know whether or not Mr. Q. Nifong, as opposed to somebody else in his office, was 9 10 involved in the Non-Testimonial Order? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Somebody else. Do you know whether Mr. Q. Nifong was involved in that? 13 I believe that was -- I believe -- I 14 15 believe Investigator Himan spoke with Tracey Cline the 16 day before and then David Saacks is the one who 17 coordinated those efforts. 18 Do you know whether or not this was the Q. 19 first opportunity that either you or Investigator Himan 20 had spoken with Mr. Nifong about this case? Mr. Nifong 21 directly. 22 Α. I don't know. If you are asking me if I 23 walked down the hallway and had just a conversation, I

don't know. But official sit-down, I don't believe I

had an official sit-down conversation with him.

Okay. This meeting on March 27th, was 1 Q. 2 this an opportunity where Mr. Nifong was brought up to date as to what happened in the investigation up to 3 4 that point? 5 Α. Yes. Do you recall whether you provided him 6 Q. 7 with any documentation at that meeting, you or 8 Investigator Himan? 9 I don't recall. Well, I would have had Α. to because he would have at least seen the e-mail. 10 11 This is the e-mail involving Ryan Q. 12 McFayden that you referenced earlier? 13 Yes, sir. Α. 14 Do you know whether he would have been 0. 15 given any other documentation at that meeting about the investigation? 16 I don't recall. I would think -- and 17 18 this is only -- I would think not because we were in 19 training and we didn't have the stuff with us, as far 20 as I know, so I doubt it. 21 Q. Okay. 22 We didn't expect to be doing that on 23 that day. 24 Do you recall, did you talk to him about Q. 2.5 whether or not the players had or had not cooperated at

1 that meeting? 2 I don't know. Α. You don't believe that you -- do you 3 Q. know if he would have been given copies of the 4 statements as to the three individuals that we have 5 already looked at, their statements, do you know if he 6 would have been given those statements at that meeting? 7 I don't know. I doubt it. Like I said, 8 Α. we were at training when the people from CrimeStoppers 9 10 gave us the information from that. Anything else that you recall talking to 11 Q. 12 him about, besides the e-mail, at that meeting? 13 Α. No. sir. 14 Did you talk to him at all about what 15 the allegations were, what Ms. Mangum's allegations 16 were? 17 Of course. Α. 18 Q. Okay. 19 I mean, that's just -- if we are going Α. 20 to be getting a search warrant, we would have to tell him what the basis was for the search warrant. 21 22 Q. Let me take a step back. What was your 23 understanding about the purpose of the meeting that you 24 were having with Mr. Nifong on the 27th? Was it an 25 initial briefing to bring him up to date as to what

Α.

happened or was it related more specifically to this 1 2 one e-mail and the search warrant? 3 The reason we went there was to get Α. direction on how to proceed with the e-mail and the 4 5 search warrant. Okay. Once you got there, was there a 6 Q. different -- did Mr. Nifong ask questions related more 7 8 generally to the investigation as opposed to just this 9 specific e-mail? 10 I don't recall the conversation, per se. Α. 11 It was giving him the information. I am sure we had 12 general conversation on the case. There is no way I 13 would make a decision without having general information. 14 15 But to sit down and tell you what that 16 conversation was, no, I couldn't tell you. 17 Q. Did you participate in a meeting with 18 Mr. Nifong, other than on March 27th, where he was 19 briefed on the investigation that had happened up to 20 date? 21 I'm sorry. Repeat that. Α. 22 Did you participate in any meetings with Q. 23 Mr. Nifong where he was brought up to date on the 24 status and the information in the investigation? 25 Yes.

subpoena.

```
1
                     Okay.
             Q.
                     And I apologize. I thought I'd been
 2
             Α.
 3
     saying that.
 4
                     Okay.
             Q.
                     That's where I'm lost.
 5
             Α.
                     Well, since you don't recall
 6
             Ο.
 7
     specifically whether it was the 27th or some other time
 8
     period, let's talk about what you would have brought
 9
     him up to speed on.
10
                     The allegations.
             Α.
11
             Q.
                     Okay.
                     The victim statements, the statements of
12
13
     the people who were spoken with, to include witnesses
14
     for three team captains, the search warrant, the Non-
     Testimonials.
15
16
             0.
                     Okay.
17
                     I'm just trying to think if there was
18
     anything else prior to that point.
19
             Q.
                     All right.
20
                     What date was that? When we got the
             0.
     subpoena, March 20th? Well, I know we would have had
21
     -- we actually would have had a meeting with him before
22
23
     within before 3/20, I would think, because I know we
24
     spoke with him about the case prior to getting the
```

1 clarify that if you're asking me for exact dates that 2 he got these things, I have no idea. Okay. Do you know who within the Ο. Department would be in a better position to answer when 4 5 he got these particular documents? 6 You can ask Investigator Himan. Α. 7 Do you remember being present at Q. 8 meetings where those documents were actually given to 9 him? 10 MR. WITT: Object to the form of 11 the question as to which documents? It sounds like 1.2 there's a multitude of documents. 13 MR. BROCKER: I'll rephrase it. 14 Α. (No response.) 15 Do you recall being in a meeting where Q. 16 Mr. Nifong was provided a copy of Exhibit 11, which is 17 the report from Duke, a medical report? 18 Do I recall that exact one? Α. Okay. You said that you discussed with 19 ο. 20 Mr. Nifong the victim's statements about what she'd 21 alleged had happened? 22 Α. Yes. 23 Q. Other than the interview that you and 24 Investigator Himan did on the 16th, did you discuss

other reports of allegations that she had made about

We were seeking any information that was out there. 1 Okay. So this would have been part of 2 Q. 3 the documentation you collected as the investigative file. 4 As part of the case file. 5 Α. All right. And that appears to be from 6 Q. 7 an Officer Day at the Duke University Police Department, is that right? I am just trying to read 8 9 the form here. 10 I'm trying to see where they have that. Α. It's box number 2 at the top. 11 Q. 12 Α. Yes. Christopher H. Day. 13 And in that report he notes that Ms. Q. Mangum claimed that she was raped by approximately 20 14 15 white males at 610 North Buchanan? 16 That's correct. It's also my Α. 17 understanding that he never spoke with her. 18 When did you come to that understanding Q. that he didn't spoke with? Did you speak with Officer 19 20 Day directly about it? 21 My understanding is that that was a conversation that was overheard. I don't remember when 22 23 that was. 24 Which conversation are you referring to 0. 25 that was overheard?

or should not be told about the identity of the people 1 in the photographs when she was shown the presentation? 2 Just that these were people who we would 3 Α. have reason to believe attended the party and tell us 4 5 if you recognize them and tell us if you don't recognize them and be truthful. That's all. And as to 6 7 what they were or were not doing. 8 Any discussions in that meeting with Mr. 0. 9 Nifong as to who would actually show the photographic 10 presentation? 11 Α. No. Did you discuss during that meeting any 12 0. additional evidence or information relating to this 13 14 case, other than how to conduct this photographic 15 presentation? 16 I don't recall that. Α. 17 Q. Do you know whether there was any 18 discussion about evidence or information that had been 19 received from the SBI lab about the testing of the items that had been seized from the house and from Ms. 20 21 Mangum during that meeting? 22 During that meeting, I don't recall. Α. I am going to mark this as Deposition 23 Q. 24 Exhibit Number 7, a document, and ask you to take a 25 look at it and see if you recognize it? Do you

```
But didn't sit through the meeting.
1
             Α.
     don't remember. Just kind of in and out.
 2
 3
                     And approximately how long did that
             Q.
 4
     meeting last?
                     About the same amount of time.
 5
             Α.
                     What was discussed during that meeting?
 6
             Q.
 7
             Α.
                     They had a potential match for DNA
     underneath a fingernail, it was a mixture, and more
 8
9
     testing needed to be done.
10
                     On what?
             Q.
11
                     On the DNA.
             Α.
12
             Q.
                    On the fingernail DNA or on all the DNA?
13
                     No. The fingernail DNA.
             Α.
14
                     Okav.
             Q.
15
                     But normally, as far as what was
     discussed, Dr. Meehan would talk about stuff, going on
16
     and on and on about what has been done, again, in
17
18
     scientific terms that when you sit there long enough
19
     and you're just lost, you're just -- Okay.
20
                     Did he do the same thing as he did in
             Q.
21
     the prior meetings, go through the documentation and
22
     the printouts?
23
                     I believe so.
             Α.
24
                     And at that meeting did he discuss the
             Q.
25
     absence of any DNA matching any of the lacrosse players
```

```
1
     on any of the rape kit items?
                     I believe so because -- well, let me
 2
 3
     back that up. The only thing I know he said was a
     potential match was the fingernail.
 4
                     Did he discuss results other than the
 5
             0.
 6
     fingernail during the meeting?
 7
                     He talked about everything he did.
             Α.
 8
                     All the things that had been done up to
             0.
 9
     that point?
10
             Α.
                     Yes.
11
             Q.
                     And do you recall whether he discussed
12
     other DNA that was found on the rape kit items at that
13
     meeting?
                     I can't remember if we talked about the
14
     boyfriend and if the boyfriend had been -- it was found
15
16
     to be the boyfriend at that point or not, which would
     have been in the rape kit. Because you have to
17
     remember that the fingernails and the other stuff were
18
19
     aside from the rape kit.
20
                     I understand. So you don't recall
             Q.
     whether that was discussed?
21
22
                     I don't recall.
             Α.
23
             Q.
                    Was there any discussion about the
24
     presence or absence ---
25
                     Is there any chance I could take a two-
             Α.
```

```
minute break?
1
 2
                          MR. BROCKER: Sure.
                     (Recess - 1:54 PM to 2:01 PM.)
 3
                     (BY MR. BROCKER) Let me take a step
 4
             Q.
 5
     back, Sergeant Gottlieb, I want to finish off the
     discussion of the meeting with Dr. Meehan on the 20th
 6
 7
     or the 21st of April.
 8
                     Was there any discussion during that
 9
     meeting about what Dr. Meehan would put in the written
10
     report that would be provided?
11
                     Just the facts, no, just the facts of
             Α.
     what he did.
12
13
                    You don't recall any other -- do you
             Ο.
     recall a discussion about what would be in the report
14
15
     at that meeting?
16
             Α.
                     No.
17
                     Do you recall any discussion about
     concerns about any privacy issues about information
18
     that would show up in the report?
19
20
             Α.
                     No.
21
                     Do you recall in any of those
             Ο.
22
     discussions occurring at the initial meeting on April
23
     10th about what would be in the report or any privacy
24
     concerns?
25
                     Say that again.
```

```
1
                     Do you recall in the initial meeting,
             Ο.
 2
     going back to the first meeting on April 10th ---
 3
             Α.
                     Okav.
                     --- do you recall any discussions about
 4
             Ο.
 5
     what would be in the report?
 6
             Α.
                     No.
 7
                    And do you recall any discussions about
             Ο.
 8
     privacy issues and concerns relating to what would
 9
     appear in the report?
10
             Α.
                     No.
11
                     Do you have any knowledge about
12
     discussions on those issues that occurred outside of
13
     the meetings on April 10th and April 20th or 21st?
14
             Α.
                     No.
15
                    After the April 20th or 21st meeting,
16
     you traveled back in the car with Investigator Himan
17
     and Mr. Nifong?
18
             Α.
                     Yes.
19
                     Was there discussion about what had been
             Q.
20
     discussed or results that had been provided at that
21
     meeting?
22
                     I'm sure there was, that's kind of
23
     natural. I have no idea -- it definitely was not the
24
     big thing. I was just driving. I just ---
25
                    You don't recall any specific
             Q.
```

```
discussions about it?
1
 2
                    No.
             Α.
 3
                    Same question with respect to the car
             Q.
     ride, all three of you were riding in the car together.
 4
 5
             Α.
                    Right.
 6
             0.
                    Coming back from Dr. Meehan's office on
7
     April 10th?
8
                    I think the big discussion on that one
9
     was I was telling Ben or asking Ben, you know, if all
10
     the evidence was supposed to be sent over and he
11
     thought that. And I told him he just needed to get up
12
     with ID and make sure it all got delivered.
13
                     I didn't think it was any big deal when
14
     you think about, you know, half the evidence hasn't
15
     been looked at, half the evidence hasn't been looked
16
     at.
17
             Q.
                    Was it your understanding at that April
18
     10th meeting that all the rape kit items had been
19
     produced and analyzed at that point?
20
             Α.
                    Yeah. Yes, sir.
21
                    And was there any discussion among the
             Ο.
22
     three of you on the way back about the fact that, after
23
     analyzing that, they hadn't been able to find any DNA
24
     that matched any of the lacrosse players?
25
                    Not that I recall. My big thing was
             Α.
```

```
would like to have a person, you know, someone say he's
 1
     there, other than the victim. And we didn't have that.
 2
                    I don't know if -- let me rephrase that.
 3
     I don't recall, because you know that photo
 4
 5
     presentation I was talking to you about ---
                    Uh-huh (yes).
 6
 7
                    --- we did the exact same thing with
 8
     Kim, not asking for a suspect, "Do you remember these
     people?" Showed it to her. I don't call if she said
 9
     he was there or not.
10
11
                    When did you do that photographic
             Q.
     presentation for Ms. Pittman?
12
                    Investigator Himan did that.
13
             Α.
14
                    And would that be in his -- presumably,
             Q.
15
     that would be in his notes?
16
             Α.
                    Absolutely, yes.
                    Did Investigator Himan, when he came to
17
             0.
     you on the 14th of April, was there any discussion
18
     about the fact that Ms. Mangum had previously been
19
20
     shown a different picture of Mr. Seligmann on one of
21
     those prior photographic arrays and had not identified
22
     him as an attacker?
23
                    Not that she did not identify him as an
             Α.
     attacker, but she identified him -- not identified him.
24
25
     She recognized him. So twice. One time she recognized
```

```
Was that discussed in the meeting with
 1
             Q.
     Investigator Himan that there are no forensic DNA to
 2
     tie him in as well?
 3
 4
             Α.
                     At that point, yes.
                     That's all you would know, obviously, at
 5
             Q.
     that point?
 6
 7
                     Right.
             Α.
                     And which of your supervisors did you
 8
             Q.
 9
     relay on Investigator Himan's concerns?
10
                     Both.
             Α.
11
             Q.
                     Who?
                     Lieutenant Ripberger and Captain Lamb.
12
             Α.
13
             Q.
                     And then you personally participated in
14
     the -- was it a phone call with Mr. Nifong?
15
             Α.
                     Yes.
                     Who else was present?
16
             Q.
17
                     Lieutenant Ripberger and Captain Lamb.
             Α.
                     Investigator Himan was not involved in
18
             Q.
19
     that phone call with Mr. Nifong?
                     He did not speak. He might have been in
20
             Α.
21
     the room, I just don't recall that. But I know that I
     made sure that my command staff was in the room.
22
23
     don't remember if Ben was there or not.
24
             Q.
                     And did you rely on the concerns that
2.5
     Investigator Himan had?
```

```
School was about to end.
 1
             Α.
                     You don't recall whether Mr. Nifong
 2
             Q.
     had ---
 3
                     I don't recall if it was that meeting or
 4
             Α.
 5
     another meeting.
                     But at some meeting Mr. Nifong -- was it
 6
             Q.
     Mr. Nifong who expressed a concern that it needed to be
 7
     done because school was getting ready to end?
 8
 9
                     Right. People were going to be going
             Α.
10
     across the country.
11
             Q.
                     The call with Mr. Nifong that you were
12
     describing, did that occur on the same day, the Friday,
     April 14th?
13
14
                     As in my conversation with them?
             Α.
15
             0.
                     Yes.
16
             Α.
                     With Investigator Himan?
17
             Q.
                     Yes.
                           Right after that, right after I
18
                     Yes.
             Α.
     briefed my command staff.
19
20
                     Was there any discussion during that
             Q.
21
     conversation about letting the Department have some
22
     more time to develop additional facts before going
     forward with the indictment?
23
24
                     Well, I told him our concerns and
25
     basically he made the decision. I don't remember the
```

```
not in the written report, any of the testing that had
1
 2
     been done that did not appear in the report, any
 3
     discussion at that meeting about whether or not this
     was the final report?
 4
                    Yes, it was my impression that what we
 5
 6
     got was the final report.
 7
                    Do you recall any discussion at any of
             Ο.
8
     these meetings where Mr. Nifong indicated that he
 9
     needed a written report for some upcoming event, either
10
     a Grand Jury or a hearing or anything of that nature?
11
                    No, because he gave us a report.
             Α.
12
             0.
                    Okay. Did Mr. Nifong ask any questions
13
     during any of these meetings with Dr. Meehan about the
14
     results?
15
                    Not that I recall. It is always
16
     possible, but I just don't recall.
17
                    Did Mr. Nifong take notes of any of the
             0.
18
     meetings or during any of the meetings with Dr. Meehan?
19
             Α.
                    I don't know. I'm sorry, I don't know.
20
                    And in your other meetings, not the ones
             0.
21
     with Dr. Meehan, but the other meetings that you would
22
     have with Mr. Nifong, would it be his practice to take
23
     notes if you were sitting down and having conversation
24
     with him?
```

Just very casual. No, not that I

1 recall. 2 I take it from your previous answer that Q. 3 you didn't take any handwritten notes of the meetings 4 that you had with Dr. Meehan? 5 Oh, no, not with Dr. Meehan. 6 Q. And did you ---7 I really didn't take notes like that. 8 would get information and put it in later. 9 And did Investigator Himan, do you 0. recall if he took notes at the meetings? 10 11 Α. I don't recall. Investigator Himan was 12 very -- I was very impressed with him. He was very 13 meticulous in what he did, and that's all I can 14 remember. 15 There's a few other things I wanted to 16 ask you about, Sergeant Gottlieb. You were involved in 17 a meeting that took place between Ms. Mangum and Mr. 18 Nifong on April 11, 2006? 19 Yes, sir. Α. 20 Tell me what you recall about that 0. 21 meeting. 22 Investigator Himan was supposed to meet 23 with Coach Pressler, so he asked me if I would pick her 24 up from basically a safe house location where she was

staying. So I went out to Colonial Apartments. It's

notes, Page 27?

```
actually changed names now, I don't remember what the
 1
     name of the apartments are. I picked her up and
 2
     brought her to the courthouse. Lieutenant Ripberger
 3
     met me there. Investigator Himan showed up shortly
 4
 5
     there after, he was only going to be able to stay for a
     portion of the meeting.
 6
 7
                    Mr. Nifong introduced himself.
     Mangum was what I would consider very reserved and very
 8
 9
     cautious around him. He explained basically how the
10
     procedures went for a court case. He explained to her
11
     that at some point he and Tracey Cline would meet with
12
     her and get more information and basically asked if she
13
     had any questions that he could, you know, tell her
14
     about.
15
                    But he basically explained the
16
     procedures of what would happen throughout a court case
     if a court case came up.
17
18
                    Okay. Do you know who would have
             Q.
19
     initiated the meeting between Mr. Nifong and Ms.
20
     Mangum?
21
             Α.
                    I can only assume it was Mr. Nifong.
                                                           Ιt
22
     wasn't me, and I don't believe it was Investigator
23
     Himan. You would have to ask him.
24
                    If you would look at Exhibit 204, your
             Q.
```

```
Security on April 10th?
 1
                    I don't recall that.
 2
                    Any discussion about her identification
 3
             0.
     of the individuals from the April 4th photos ---
 4
                    He didn't talk about the case. He
 5
     strictly went over how the court procedures would work.
 6
 7
                    All right. Besides that meeting, are
     you aware of any other meetings that Mr. Nifong had
 8
 9
     with Ms. Mangum directly?
                    Not directly, no. I believe there were
10
             Α.
     some. I was actually out of work for quite awhile at
11
12
     one point.
13
                    How did you come to an understanding
             Q.
     that they had had other meetings?
14
1.5
                    I don't know if they did. I'm assuming
16
     that at some point they had talked about something.
17
     know that Investigator -- this is way later on.
                    I believe Investigator Himan transported
18
     her to the District Attorney's office at one point and
19
20
     there was one meeting. Beyond that, I don't know.
21
                    All right. You mentioned a couple of
             Q.
22
     places towards the end of your notes that there was,
     and I think you had referenced in the handwritten notes
23
24
     here, that you are pursuing possible hair analysis for
25
     Ms. Mangum?
```

1 did not want anyone else charged. 2 So the possibility of offering immunity 3 was there, but at that point the investigation warrant any charges. But that was kind of the only leverage 4 5 that we would have if no one wanted to give us 6 information to help or to support the accusations, 7 Who were those other players? Q. 8 Ryan McFayden. And the only reason I Α. 9 remember him as he is a unique individual. And I 10 forget the name of the other guy. Investigator Himan 11 can tell you. 12 Q. In October, in that meeting that you had 13 in October of 2006, did Investigator Himan express any concerns about the lack of evidence or what evidence 14 15 that you had with respect to the people who had been 16 indicted? 17 Α. No. Any other conversations or 18 Q. 19 communications that you recall having about Duke 20 lacrosse cases with Mr. Nifong after that? 21 I had too many things going on Α. No. 22 right there that -- I mean, like I said, I came back in 23 October, and I left at the very end of October, and the 24 three weeks that I was there, roughly, there was three 25 months' work checking reports, doing all this stuff

```
Police Department, City Manager and Police Legal
1
     Adviser. And what I'm trying to find out is, was Mr.
2
     Nifong involved in those or were the meetings that
 3
     those individuals had, were having, separate and apart
 4
     from Mr. Nifong, if you remember?
 5
                    I know Mr. Nifong came to one, I'm
 6
     positive of that. I don't know, I don't recall about
7
     the others.
8
9
                    Did anybody ever tell you why those
             Q.
     people felt it was important to have those meetings
10
     related to this case?
11
12
                    Why they felt it was important.
             Α.
                         MR. HILL: The question was did
13
14
     anybody tell you why it was important?
15
             Α.
                    No. no one told me.
                    Okay. And was there more than one of
16
17
     those meetings that you would have attended with, you
18
     know, some influential people in the community, and you
     used some term like that in your deposition?
19
                    Police Command Staff. I don't remember
20
             Α.
21
     how many meetings Duke Police came to. City Manager,
22
     legal advisers, yes, there were several.
23
                     Okay. And some of your notes have
             Q.
24
     references that you were being requested to provide
```

certain information to the County Manager to be

```
so that they can be provided to the City Manager to
 1
     review and be provided to City Council?
 2
                          MR. HILL: Objection. You can
 3
 4
     answer.
                    I am trying to think of one big case I
 5
             Α.
     had and did that. I don't recall, but I don't believe
 6
 7
     so.
                          MR. WITT: Okay. I don't have any
 8
 9
     further questions.
                          MR. HILL: I've got just two.
10
11
     CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR. HILL:
                    You were asked by Mr. Brocker with
12
             Q.
13
     respect to the requirements to a Non-Testimonial Order.
14
     Remember that?
15
             Α.
                    Yes.
16
                    Okay. Clarify for me how one obtains
             0.
     such an Order?
17
18
             Α.
                    The only thing the Police Department
     does is provides an affidavit to the District
19
20
     Attorney's office and the District Attorney's office
21
     decides whether or not they want to take it before a
22
     judge, and then the District Attorney's office applies
23
     for a non-testimonial before a judge.
24
                    And does a judge sign that Order?
             Q.
25
                    Yes.
             Α.
```