UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA DURHAM DIVISION

File No. 1:07-CV-00953

| RYAN MCFADYEN, MATTHEW WILSON, |) | | |
|--------------------------------|---|---------------------|--|
| and BRECK ARCHER, |) | | |
| |) | | |
| Plaintiffs, |) | DEFENDANT BENJAMIN | |
| |) | HIMAN'S MOTION TO | |
| VS. |) | DISMISS PLAINTIFFS' | |
| |) | SECOND AMENDED | |
| DUKE UNIVERSITY, et al., |) | COMPLAINT | |
| |) | | |
| Defendants. |) | | |
| | | | |

Defendant Benjamin Himan ("Investigator Himan"), through his undersigned attorneys, moves pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) for an order dismissing this action in its entirety as to this Defendant upon the grounds that the Second Amended Complaint fails to state a claim upon which relief may be granted and, in the alternative, that all claims asserted against Investigator Himan are barred by the doctrines of qualified and public officer immunity.

In support of this motion and pursuant to this Court's February 16, 2010 Order, document #135, Investigator Himan hereby incorporates by reference the following previous arguments and authorities in this case:

Defendant Benjamin Himan's Motion to Dismiss, filed July 2, 2008, document #51;

Defendant Benjamin Himan's Brief in Support of Motion to Dismiss, filed July 2, 2008, document #52;

Defendants Benjamin Himan and Mark Gottlieb's Joint Reply in support of Motion to Dismiss, dated November 26, 2008, document #106;

Supplemental Brief in Support of Motions to Dismiss of Defendants Gottlieb, Himan and The City of Durham, North Carolina, filed June 24, 2009; document #123; and

Suggestion of Subsequently Decided Authority, filed January 7, 2010, document #134.

WHEREFORE, Defendant Benjamin Himan respectfully prays the Court that:

- 1. The Action against him be dismissed;
- 2. Judgment be entered for Defendant Benjamin Himan on all claims against him;
- 3. Plaintiffs have and recover nothing from Defendant Benjamin Himan; and
- 4. Defendant Benjamin Himan have such other and further relief as the Court shall deem just and proper.

This the 11th day of March, 2010.

KENNON, CRAVER, BELO, CRAIG & MCKEE, PLLC

By: <u>/s/ Joel M. Craig</u>

North Carolina State Bar No. 9179

By: /s/ Henry W. Sappenfield

North Carolina State Bar No. 37419

Attorneys for Defendant Benjamin Himan 4011 University Drive, Suite 300 P.O. Box 51579 Durham, NC 27717-1579 (919) 490-0500

E-mail: jcraig@kennoncraver.com

E-mail:hsappenfield@kennoncraver.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned attorney hereby certifies that I electronically filed the foregoing Defendant Benjamin Himan's Renewed Motion to Dismiss with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following:

Robert C. Ekstrand Ekstrand & Ekstrand, LLP 811 Ninth St., Ste. 260 Durham, NC 27705 Attorney for Plaintiffs Breck Archer, Matthew Wilson and Ryan McFadyen

Reginald B. Gillespie, Jr.
Faison & Gillespie
P.O. Box 51729
Durham, NC 27717-1729
Attorneys for Defendant City of Durham, North Carolina and Edward Sarvis

James B. Maxwell
Maxwell, Freeman & Bowman, P.A.
P.O. Box 52396
Durham, NC 27717-2396
Attorney for Defendants David W. Addison, James T. Soukup, Kammie Michael and Richard D. Clayton

Edwin M. Speas, Jr.
Eric P. Stevens
Poyner & Spruill LLP
P.O. Box 1801
Raleigh, NC 27602-1801
Attorneys for Defendant Mark Gottlieb

Patricia P. Kerner

D. Martin Warf

Hannah G. Styron

Troutman Sanders LLP

434 Fayetteville Street, Suite 1900

Raleigh, NC 27601

Attorneys for Defendants Patrick Baker, Steven Chalmers, Ronald Hodge, Lee Russ, Stephen Mihaich, Beverly Council, Jeff Lamb, Michael Ripberger and Laird Evans

Dan J. McLamb

Shirley M. Pruitt

T. Carlton Younger, III

Yates, McLamb & Weyher, L.L.P.

P.O. Box 2889

Raleigh, NC 27602

Attorneys for Defendants Duke University Health Systems, Inc., Private Diagnostic Clinic, PLLC, Julie Manly, M.D., Theresa Arico, R.N. and Tara Levicy, R.N.

J. Donald Cowan, Jr.

Dixie T. Wells

Ellis & Winters LLP

333 N. Greene Street, Suite200

Greensboro, NC 27401

William F. Lee

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP

60 State Street

Boston, MA 02109

Jamie Gorelick
Jennifer M. O'Connor
Paul R.Q. Wolfson
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20006
Attorneys for Defendants Duke University, Duke University Police
Department, Aaron Graves, Robert Dean, Leila Humphries, Phyllic

Attorneys for Defendants Duke University, Duke University Police
Department, Aaron Graves, Robert Dean, Leila Humphries, Phyllis
Cooper, William F. Garber, II, James Schwab, Joseph Fleming, Jeffrey O.
Best, Gary N. Smith, Greg Stotsenberg, Robert K. Steel, Richard H.
Brodhead, Ph.D., Peter Lange, Ph.D., Tallman Trask, III, Ph.D., John
Burness, Larry Moneta, Ed.D., Victor J. Dzau, M.D., Allison Halton, Kemel
Dawkins, Suzanne Wasiolek, Stephen Bryan and Matthew Drummond

Robert J. King, III
Kearns Davis
Brooks, Pierce, McLendon, Humphrey & Leonard, L.L.P.
P.O. Box 26000
Greensboro, NC 27420
Attorneys for Defendants DNA Security and Richard Clark

Linwood Wilson Bahama, NC *Pro Se*

This the 11th day of March, 2010.

KENNON, CRAVER, BELO, CRAIG & MCKEE, PLLC

By: /s/ Henry W. Sappenfield

North Carolina State Bar No. 37419 Attorneys for Defendant Benjamin Himan 4011 University Drive, Suite 300 P.O. Box 51579 Durham, NC 27717-1579 (919) 490-0500 E-mail:hsappenfield@kennoncraver.com