

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA
DURHAM DIVISION

File No. 1:08-CV-119

EDWARD CARRINGTON, et al.,)	
)	
Plaintiffs,)	DEFENDANT BENJAMIN HIMAN’S
)	MOTION TO DISMISS
vs.)	PLAINTIFFS’ FIRST AMENDED
)	COMPLAINT
DUKE UNIVERSITY, et al.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	

Defendant Benjamin Himan (“Investigator Himan”), through his undersigned attorneys, moves pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) for an order dismissing this action in its entirety as to this Defendant upon the grounds that the Amended Complaint fails to state a claim upon which relief may be granted and, in the alternative, that all claims asserted against Investigator Himan are barred by the doctrines of qualified and public officer immunity.

In support of this motion and pursuant to this Court’s February 16, 2010 Order, document #144, Investigator Himan hereby incorporates by reference the following previous arguments and authorities in this case:

Defendant Benjamin Himan’s Motion to Dismiss, filed May 30, 2008, document #66;

Defendant Benjamin Himan’s Brief in Support of Motion to Dismiss, filed May 30, 2008, document #67;

Defendants Mark Gottlieb and Benjamin Himan's Joint Reply in support of their motions to dismiss, filed September 29, 2008, document #107;

Supplemental Brief in Support of Motions to Dismiss of Defendants The City of Durham, North Carolina, Mark Gottlieb and Benjamin Himan, filed June 24, 2009, document #135; and

Suggestion of Subsequently Decided Authority, filed January 7, 2010, document #143.

WHEREFORE, Defendant Benjamin Himan respectfully prays the Court that:

1. The Action against him be dismissed;
2. Judgment be entered for Defendant Benjamin Himan on all claims against him;
3. Plaintiffs have and recover nothing from Defendant Benjamin Himan; and
4. Defendant Benjamin Himan have such other and further relief as the Court shall deem just and proper.

This the 11th day of March, 2010.

KENNON, CRAVER, BELO,
CRAIG & MCKEE, PLLC

By: /s/ Joel M. Craig
North Carolina State Bar No. 9179

By: /s/ Henry W. Sappenfield
North Carolina State Bar No. 37419

Attorneys for Defendant Benjamin
Himan
4011 University Drive, Suite 300
P.O. Box 51579
Durham, NC 27717-1579
(919) 490-0500
E-mail: jcraig@kennoncraver.com
E-mail: hsappenfield@kennoncraver.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned attorney hereby certifies that I electronically filed the foregoing Defendant Benjamin Himan's Renewed Motion to Dismiss with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following:

Charles J. Cooper
David H. Thompson
Brian S. Koukoutchos
Nicole Jo Moss
Cooper & Kirk, PLLC
1523 New Hampshire Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20036

William J. Thomas, II
Thomas, Ferguson & Mullins, L.L.P.
119 East Main Street
Durham, NC 27701
Attorneys for Plaintiffs

Dan J. McLamb
Shirley M. Pruitt
T. Carlton Younger, III
Yates, McLamb & Weyher, L.L.P.
P.O. Box 2889
Raleigh, NC 27602
*Attorneys for Defendants Duke University Health System, Inc., Theresa Arico, R.N.
and Tara Levicy, R.N.*

J. Donald Cowan, Jr.
Dixie T. Wells
Ellis & Winters LLP
333 N. Greene Street, Suite 200
Greensboro, NC 27401

William F. Lee
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP
60 State Street
Boston, MA 02109

Jamie Gorelick
Jennifer M. O'Connor
Paul R.Q. Wolfson
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20006
*Attorneys for Defendants Duke University, Richard H. Brodhead, Peter Lange,
Larry Moneta, John Burness, Tallman Trask, Suzanne Wasiolek, Matthew
Drummond, Aaron Graves, Robert Dean, Kate Hendricks and Victor J. Dzau*

Reginald B. Gillespie, Jr.
Faison & Gillespie
P.O. Box 51729
Durham, NC 27717-1729
Attorneys for Defendant City of Durham, North Carolina

James B. Maxwell
Maxwell, Freeman & Bowman, P.A.
P.O. Box 52396
Durham, NC 27717-2396
Attorneys for Defendant David Addison

Edwin M. Speas, Jr.
Eric P. Stevens
Poyner & Spruill LLP
P.O. Box 1801
Raleigh, NC 27602-1801
Attorneys for Defendant Mark Gottlieb

Patricia P. Kerner
D. Martin Warf
Hannah G. Styron
Troutman Sanders LLP
434 Fayetteville Street, Suite 1900
Raleigh, NC 27601
*Attorneys for Defendants Patrick Baker, Steven Chalmers, Ronald Hodge, Lee
Russ, Stephen Mihaich, Beverly Council, Jeff Lamb and Michael Ripberger*

Paul D. Coates
Kenneth Kyre, Jr.
Pinto Coates Kyre & Brown, PLLC
P.O. Box 4848
Greensboro, NC 27404
Attorneys for Defendant J. Wesley Covington

Linwood Wilson
Bahama, NC
Pro Se

This the 11th day of March, 2010.

KENNON, CRAVER, BELO,
CRAIG & MCKEE, PLLC

By: */s/ Henry W. Sappenfield*
North Carolina State Bar No. 37419
Attorneys for Defendant Benjamin Himan
4011 University Drive, Suite 300
P.O. Box 51579
Durham, NC 27717-1579
(919) 490-0500
E-mail: hsappenfield@kennoncraver.com