



Consented to:

Attorneys for Plaintiff

s/ Ann-Patton Hornthal  
Ann-Patton Hornthal  
Roberts & Stevens, P.A.  
P.O. Box 7647  
Asheville, NC 28802  
(818) 253-7200  
aphornthal@roberts-stevens.com

Lawrence J. Murphy  
Brett A. Rendeiro  
Varnum LLP  
333 Bridge Street NW  
Grand Rapids, Michigan 49501  
(616) 336-6000  
ljmurphy@varnumlaw.com  
barendeiro@varnumlaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant

s/ Elizabeth Venum  
Elizabeth Venum  
SeiferFlatow, PLLC  
2319 Crescent Avenue  
Charlotte, North Carolina 28207  
(704) 512-0606  
liz@seiferflatow.com