

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
WESTERN DIVISION**

ELIZABETH GRACE,	)	CASE NO. 2:17-cv-00522
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	JUDGE SMITH
	)	
v.	)	MAGISTRATE JUDGE JOLSON
	)	
CITY OF LANCASTER DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION, et al.,	)	<b><u>STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER</u></b>
	)	
Defendants.	)	
	)	

Pursuant to Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Plaintiff Elizabeth Grace (“Grace”) and Defendants City of Lancaster, Joe Azbell, and Greg Hintz (collectively, “Defendants”), subject to approval by the Court, have agreed to the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order. Accordingly, it is ORDERED:

**1. Scope.** All documents produced in the course of discovery, including initial disclosures, all responses to discovery requests, all deposition testimony and exhibits, other materials which may be subject to restrictions on disclosure for good cause and information derived directly therefrom (hereinafter collectively “documents”), shall be subject to this Order concerning confidential information as set forth below. As there is a presumption in favor of open and public judicial proceedings in the federal courts, this Order shall be strictly construed in favor of public disclosure and open proceedings wherever possible. The Order is also subject to the Local Rules of this District and the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure on matters of procedure and calculation of time periods.

**2. Form and Timing of Designation.** A party may designate documents as confidential and restricted in disclosure under this Order by placing or affixing the words “CONFIDENTIAL

- SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” on the document in a manner that will not interfere with the legibility of the document and that will permit complete removal of the CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER designation. Documents shall be designated CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER prior to or at the time of the production or disclosure of the documents. The designation “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” does not mean that the document has any status or protection by statute or otherwise except to the extent and for the purposes of this Order.

**3. Documents Which May be Designated CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER.** Any party may designate documents as CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER upon making a good faith determination that the documents contain information protected from disclosure by statute or that should be protected from disclosure as confidential personal information, medical or psychiatric information, trade secrets, personnel records, or such other sensitive commercial information that is not publicly available. Public records and other information or documents that are publicly available may not be designated as CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER.

**4. Depositions.** Deposition testimony shall be deemed CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER only if designated as such. Such designation shall be specific as to the portions of the transcript or any exhibit to be designated as CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER. Thereafter, the deposition transcripts and any those portions so designated shall be protected as CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER, pending objection, under the terms of this Order.

## **5. Protection of Confidential Material.**

**(a) General Protections.** Documents designated CONFIDENTIAL -SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER under this Order shall not be used or disclosed by the parties, counsel for the parties or any other persons identified in ¶ 5(b) for any purpose whatsoever other than to prepare for and to conduct discovery and trial in this action, including any appeal thereof.

**(b) Limited Third-Party Disclosures.** The parties and counsel for the parties shall not disclose or permit the disclosure of any CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER documents to any third person or entity except as set forth in subparagraphs (1)-(5). Subject to these requirements, the following categories of persons may be allowed to review documents that have been designated CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER:

**(1) Counsel.** Counsel for the parties and employees and agents of counsel who have responsibility for the preparation and trial of the action;

**(2) Parties.** Parties and employees of a party to this Order.

**(3) Court Reporters and Recordors.** Court reporters and recorders engaged for depositions;

**(4) Consultants, Investigators and Experts.** Consultants, investigators, or experts (hereinafter referred to collectively as “experts”) employed by the parties or counsel for the parties to assist in the preparation and trial of this action or proceeding, but only after such persons have completed the certification contained in Attachment A, Acknowledgment of Understanding and Agreement to Be Bound; and

**(5) Others by Consent.** Other persons only by written consent of the producing party or upon order of the Court and on such conditions as may be agreed or ordered. All such persons shall execute the certification contained in Attachment A, Acknowledgment of Understanding and Agreement to Be Bound.

**(c) Control of Documents.** Counsel for the parties shall take reasonable and appropriate measures to prevent unauthorized disclosure of documents designated as CONFIDENTIAL pursuant to the terms of this Order. Counsel shall maintain the originals of the forms signed by persons acknowledging their obligations under this Order for a period of one year after dismissal of the action, the entry of final judgment and/or the conclusion of any appeals arising therefrom.

**(d) Copies.** Prior to production to another party, all copies, electronic images, duplicates, extracts, summaries or descriptions (hereinafter referred to collectively as “copies”) of documents designated as CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER under this Order, or any individual portion of such a document, shall be affixed with the designation “CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” if the word does not already appear on the copy. All such copies shall thereafter be entitled to the protection of this Order. The term “copies” shall not include indices, electronic databases or lists of documents provided these indices, electronic databases or lists do not contain substantial portions or images of the text of confidential documents or otherwise disclose the substance of the confidential information contained in those documents.

**(e) Inadvertent Production.** Inadvertent production of any document or information without a designation of “CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” shall be governed by Fed. R. Evid. 502. information without a designation of

“CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER” shall also be governed by Fed. R. Evid. 502.

**6. Filing of CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER Documents**

**Under Seal.** Pursuant to S.D. Ohio Civ. R. 5.2.1, unless permitted by statute, the parties cannot file documents under seal without leave of Court. Upon obtaining leave of the Court, the parties must file the documents electronically using the ECF system as provided in S.D. Ohio Civ. R. 5.1. The Court may strike any document filed under seal if the filing party failed to obtain leave of Court.

**7. Challenges by a Party to Designation as Confidential.** Any CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER designation is subject to challenge by any party or nonparty with standing to object (hereafter “party”). Before filing any motions or objections to a confidentiality designation with the Court, the objecting party shall have an obligation to meet and confer in a good faith effort to resolve the objection by agreement. If agreement is reached confirming or waiving the CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER designation as to any documents subject to the objection, the designating party shall serve on all parties a notice specifying the documents and the nature of the agreement.

**8. Action by the Court.** Applications to the Court for an order relating to any documents designated CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER shall be by motion under the Local Rules and any other procedures set forth in the presiding judge’s standing orders or other relevant orders. Nothing in this Order or any action or agreement of a party under this Order limits the Court’s power to make any orders that may be appropriate with respect to the use and disclosure of any documents produced or use in discovery or at trial.

**9. Use of Confidential Documents or Information at Trial.** All trials are open to the public. Absent order of the Court, there will be no restrictions on the use of any document that may be introduced by any party during the trial. If a party intends to present at trial CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER documents or information derived therefrom, such party shall provide advance notice to the other party at least five days before the commencement of trial by identifying the documents or information at issue as specifically as possible (i.e., by Bates number, page range, deposition transcript lines, etc.) without divulging the actual CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER documents or information. The Court may thereafter make such orders as are necessary to govern the use of such documents or information at trial.

**10. Obligations on Conclusion of Litigation.**

**(a) Order Remains in Effect.** Unless otherwise agreed or ordered, this Order shall remain in force after dismissal or entry of final judgment not subject to further appeal.

**(b) Return of CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER Documents.** Within thirty days after dismissal or entry of final judgment not subject to further appeal, all documents treated as CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER under this Order, including copies as defined in ¶ 5(d), shall be returned to the producing party unless: (1) the document has been offered into evidence or filed without restriction as to disclosure; (2) the parties agree to destruction in lieu of return; or (3) as to documents bearing the notations, summations, or other mental impressions of the receiving party, that party elects to destroy the documents and certifies to the producing party that it has done so. Notwithstanding the above requirements to

return or destroy documents, counsel may retain attorney work product, including an index which index which refers or relates to information designated CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER, so long as that work product does not duplicate verbatim substantial portions of the text or images of confidential documents. This work product shall continue to be CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER under this Order. An attorney may use his or her work product in a subsequent litigation provided that its use does not disclose or use CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER documents.

**(c) Return of Documents Filed under Seal.** After dismissal or entry of final judgment not subject to further appeal, the Clerk may elect to return to counsel for the parties or, after notice, destroy documents filed or offered at trial under seal or otherwise restricted by the Court as to disclosure.

**11. Order Subject to Modification.** This Order shall be subject to modification by the Court on its own motion or on motion of a party or any other person with standing concerning the subject matter. Motions to modify this Order shall be served and filed under Local Rule 7.1 and the presiding judge's standing orders or other relevant orders.

**12. No Prior Judicial Determination.** This Order is entered based on the representations and agreements of the parties and for the purpose of facilitating discovery. Nothing herein shall be construed or presented as a judicial determination that any documents or information designated CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER by counsel or the parties is subject to protection under Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure or otherwise until such time as the Court may rule on a specific document or issue.

**13. Persons Bound.** This Order shall take effect when entered and shall be binding upon all counsel and their law firms, the parties, and persons made subject to this Order by its terms.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Date: November 13, 2017

/s/ Kimberly A. Jolson  
KIMBERLY A. JOLSON  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

WE SO STIPULATE and agreed to abide by the terms of this Order:

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Braden A. Blumenstiel, per consent  
BRADEN A. BLUMENSTIEL (0078254)  
DuPont and Blumenstiel, LLC  
655 Metro Pl. S.  
Suite 440  
Dublin, Ohio 44017  
Telephone: (614) 408-0529  
Facsimile: (866) 465-1924  
Email: [braden@dandblaw.com](mailto:braden@dandblaw.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiff  
Elizabeth Grace*

/s/ Karina R. Kendrick  
WILLIAM J. O'NEILL (0029936)  
(Trial Attorney)  
KARINA R. KENDRICK (0093906)  
McDonald Hopkins LLC  
600 Superior Avenue, East, Suite 2100  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114  
Telephone: (216) 348-5400  
Facsimile: (216) 348-5474  
Email: [woneill@mcdonaldhopkins.com](mailto:woneill@mcdonaldhopkins.com)  
[kkendrick@mcdonaldhopkins.com](mailto:kkendrick@mcdonaldhopkins.com)

RANDALL T. ULLOM (0072561)  
Law Director & City Prosecutor  
City of Lancaster, Ohio  
136 West Main Street  
P.O. Box 1008  
Lancaster, Ohio 43130  
Telephone: (740) 687-6616 ext. 3010  
Facsimile: (740) 681-5024  
Email: [rullom@ci.lancaster.oh.us](mailto:rullom@ci.lancaster.oh.us)

*Attorneys for Defendants City of Lancaster,  
Joe Azbell and Greg Hintz*

**Certificate of Service**

The undersigned hereby certifies that on November 10, 2017, a true and accurate copy of the foregoing *Stipulated Protective Order* was filed electronically. Notice of this filing will be sent to all parties by operation of the Court's electronic filing system. Parties may access this filing through the Court's system.

/s/ Karina R. Kendrick  
KARINA R. KENDRICK (0093906)

*Counsel for Defendants City of  
Lancaster Department of Transportation,  
Joe Azbell and Greg Hintz*