IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA ERIE DIVISION

| LARRY ALLEN SLEDGE, | |
|---|--|
| Plaintiff, |) 1:21-CV-00348-RAL) |
| VS. |) RICHARD A. LANZILLO UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE |
| COUNSELOR HEATHER MARTIN, CORRECTIONAL OFFICER RYAN TARASOVICH, LT. BEGANICS, |) ORDER DENYING MOTION TO DISMISS) (ECF NO. 22) AS MOOT |
| Defendants, |)) |

Plaintiff Larry Allen Sledge ("Sledge"), representing himself, filed this civil rights action alleging that the Defendants violated his rights under the Fifth and Eighth Amendments to the Constitution. *See* ECF No. 8. Originally named as Defendants were several employees of the Erie County Prison: Shawn Bolt, Heather Martin, Ryan Tarasovich, as well as numerous "unknown correctional officers." *See id.*, ¶¶ 4-7. The Defendants filed a motion to dismiss. ECF No. 22. In response, Sledge filed the following documents: a response in opposition to the motion to dismiss (ECF No. 28); an Amended Complaint (ECF No. 29); a brief in support of the response in opposition (ECF No. 30); and a "supplement" to his response in opposition (ECF No. 31).

Sledge's multiple filings have muddied the procedural waters. Owing to his pro se status, the Court offers the following clarification. Upon the filing of a motion to dismiss, a plaintiff typically has two choices: file a response in opposition or file an amended complaint in an attempt to cure any defects or deficiencies the Defendants called into question in their motion.

See, e.g., Williams v. Nyberg, 2021 WL 7501828, p. 1, n.1 (W.D. Pa. Oct. 19, 2021). A plaintiff should not do what Sledge has done here and file both. This creates confusion as to whether a plaintiff wishes to oppose the motion to dismiss (and stand by his previously filed complaint) or desires to proceed under the Amended Complaint.

Here, the Court will resolve the uncertainty in favor of Sledge's Amended Complaint. Federal Rule of Civil Procedure permits the filing of an Amended Complaint in response to a motion to dismiss without leave of Court. See Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a)(1)(B) ("A party may amend its pleading once as a matter of course within ... (B) 21 days after the service of a motion under Rule 12(b) ..."). In general, an amended complaint supersedes the original complaint, rendering the previously-filed pleading a nullity; the amended complaint becomes the operative pleading. See Garrett v. Wexford Health, 938 F.3d 69, 82 (3d Cir. 2019). Thus, Sledge's Amended Complaint (ECF No. 29) is now the operative pleading in this case. The Court notes that Sledge has eliminated Defendant Bolt and the unknown officer defendants and has named a new defendant (Defendant Lt. Beganics) in the Amended Complaint. See ECF No. 29, ¶ 4. Sledge contends that Beganics sprayed him with OC spray on January 4, 2020, "during a verbal dispute without any verbal warning from the Defendant (Beganics)." Id. Thus, Sledge is hereby ordered to provide the Court with a completed United States Marshal's USM 285 form for Defendant Beganics so that the Complaint may be served on him. The appropriate forms are provided together with this order and should be returned to the Clerk of Court within fourteen (14) days.

¹ This Rule embodies the federal court's policy of liberal pleading amendment by ensuring that an inadvertent error in, or omission from, an original pleading will not preclude a party from security relief on the merits of this claim. *See Arthur v. Maersk, Inc.*, 434 F.3d 196, 202 (3d Cir. 2006).

Given that the Defendants' motion to dismiss challenged the previous (and now inoperative) complaint, that motion is denied as moot. In light of that denial, the Defendants have several options. After reviewing the Amended Complaint, they may file a new motion to dismiss within thirty days of the date of this order or an Answer to the Amended Complaint within fourteen days. In the alternative, the Defendants may notify the Court of their intention to stand on their previous motion in its entirety. The Court would then reactivate the motion (ECF No. 22) and accompanying documents (ECF No. 23). Also, they may stand on their prior motion and file a supplementary memorandum addressing any new allegations brought in the Amended Complaint. Sledge would then be afforded thirty days to file a response. Further amendment of pleadings would not be permitted without leave of court. *See* Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a)(3).

DATED this 19th day of May, 2022.

BY THE COURT:

RICHARD A. LANZILLO

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

Teazier

Case 1:21-cv-00348-RAL Document 32 Filed 05/19/22 Page 4 of 6 PROCESS RECEIPT AND RETURN

U.S. Department of Justice United States Marshals Service

REMARKS

See "Instructions for Service of Process by U.S. Marshal"

| PLAINTIFF | | | | | | COURT CASE NUMBER | | |
|---|---------------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---|-------------------|--------|--|
| DEFENDANT | | | | | | TYPE OF PROCESS | | |
| NAME OF INDIVIDUAL, COMPANY, CORPORATION, ETC. TO SERVE OR DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY TO SEIZE OR CONDEMN SERVE | | | | | | | NDEMN | |
| AT ADDRESS (Street or RFD, Apartment No., City, State and ZIP Code) | | | | | | | | |
| SEND NOTICE OF SERVICE COPY TO REQUESTER AT NAME AND ADDRESS BELOW | | | | | Number of process to be served with this Form 285 | | | |
| | | | | | Number of parties to be served in this case | | | |
| | | | | *************************************** | Check for service on U.S.A. | | | |
| SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS OR OTHER INFORMATION THAT WILL ASSIST IN EXPEDITING SERVICE (Include Business and Alternate Addresses, All Telephone Numbers, and Estimated Times Available for Service): | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| Signature of Attorney other Originator requesting service on behalf of: PLAINTIFF TELEPHON | | | TELEPHONE | NUMBER | DATE | | | |
| ☐ DEFENDANT | | | | | | | | |
| SPACE BI | ELOW FOR | USE OF U.S | . MARSHAI | ONLY - DO | NOT WRIT | TE BELOW THI | S LINE | |
| I acknowledge receipt for the total number of process indicated. (Sign only for USM 285 if more | Total Process | District of Origin | District to Serve | Signature of Authorized USMS Deputy or Clerk Date | | | | |
| than one USM 285 is submitted) | | No | No | | | | | |
| I hereby certify and return that I \square have personally served, \square have legal evidence of service, \square have executed as shown in "Remarks", the process described on the individual, company, corporation, etc., at the address shown above on the on the individual, company, corporation, etc. shown at the address inserted below. | | | | | | | | |
| ☐ I hereby certify and return that I am unable to locate the individual, company, corporation, etc. named above (See remarks below) | | | | | | | | |
| Name and title of individual served (if not shown above) | | | | | Date | Time | am pm | |
| Address (complete only different than shown above) | | | Signature of U.S. Marshal or Deputy | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| Costs shown on <u>attached USMS Cost Sheet</u> >> | | | | | | | | |

Form USM-285 Rev. 03/21

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the Western District of Pennsylvania

| Western District of Pennsylvania | | | | |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| Plaintiff v. Defendant) Civil A | Action No. | | | |
| NOTICE OF A LAWSUIT AND REQUEST TO WAIVE SERVICE OF A SUMMONS | | | | |
| To: | | | | |
| (Name of the defendant or - if the defendant is a corporation, partnership, or associa | tion - an officer or agent authorized to receive service) | | | |
| Why are you getting this? | | | | |
| A lawsuit has been filed against you, or the entity you represent, A copy of the complaint is attached. | in this court under the number shown above. | | | |
| This is not a summons, or an official notice from the court. It is a service of a summons by signing and returning the enclosed waiver. To a waiver within days (give at least 30 days, or at least 60 days if the defendant from the date shown below, which is the date this notice was sent. Two coa stamped, self-addressed envelope or other prepaid means for returning the service of a stamped self-addressed envelope or other prepaid means for returning the service of a summons. | avoid these expenses, you must return the signed to is outside any judicial district of the United States) opies of the waiver form are enclosed, along with | | | |
| What happens next? | | | | |
| If you return the signed waiver, I will file it with the court. The acon the date the waiver is filed, but no summons will be served on you and is sent (see the date below) to answer the complaint (or 90 days if this no the United States). | l you will have 60 days from the date this notice | | | |
| If you do not return the signed waiver within the time indicated, I served on you. And I will ask the court to require you, or the entity you r | | | | |
| Please read the enclosed statement about the duty to avoid unnec | essary expenses. | | | |
| I certify that this request is being sent to you on the date below. | | | | |
| | | | | |
| Date: | Signature of the attorney or unrepresented party | | | |
| | | | | |
| | Printed name | | | |
| | | | | |
| | Address | | | |
| | | | | |
| | E-mail address | | | |
| | Telephone number | | | |

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

Western District of Pennsylvania

| Western District of I emisyrvania | | | | | |
|--|---|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | |
| Plaintiff |) | | | | |
| V. |) Civil Action No. | | | | |
| |) | | | | |
| Defendant |) | | | | |
| WAIVER OF THE SERVICE OF SUMMONS | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| To: | ff) | | | | |
| , | | | | | |
| I have received your request to waive service of a two copies of this waiver form, and a prepaid means of re | a summons in this action along with a copy of the complaint, sturning one signed copy of the form to you. | | | | |
| I, or the entity I represent, agree to save the exper | nse of serving a summons and complaint in this case. | | | | |
| I understand that I, or the entity I represent, we jurisdiction, and the venue of the action, but that I waive | rill keep all defenses or objections to the lawsuit, the court's any objections to the absence of a summons or of service. | | | | |
| | must file and serve an answer or a motion under Rule 12 within when this request was sent (or 90 days if it was sent outside the pe entered against me or the entity I represent. | | | | |
| Date: | | | | | |
| Date. | Signature of the attorney or unrepresented party | | | | |
| Printed name of party waiving service of summons | Printed name | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | Address | | | | |
| | E-mail address | | | | |
| | Telephone number | | | | |
| | Totephone number | | | | |
| T | T | | | | |

Duty to Avoid Unnecessary Expenses of Serving a Summons

Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure requires certain defendants to cooperate in saving unnecessary expenses of serving a summons and complaint. A defendant who is located in the United States and who fails to return a signed waiver of service requested by a plaintiff located in the United States will be required to pay the expenses of service, unless the defendant shows good cause for the failure.

"Good cause" does *not* include a belief that the lawsuit is groundless, or that it has been brought in an improper venue, or that the court has no jurisdiction over this matter or over the defendant or the defendant's property.

If the waiver is signed and returned, you can still make these and all other defenses and objections, but you cannot object to the absence of a summons or of service.

If you waive service, then you must, within the time specified on the waiver form, serve an answer or a motion under Rule 12 on the plaintiff and file a copy with the court. By signing and returning the waiver form, you are allowed more time to respond than if a summons had been served.