IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA PITTSBURGH

MICHAEL DATA, DARLENE DATA, EXECUTRIX OF THE ESTATE OF MICHAEL DATA, DECEASED, AND DARLENE DATA IN HER OWN RIGHT;)))	2:19-CV-00879-MJH
Plaintiffs,))	
VS.	ý)	

A.O. SMITH CORPORATION, A.R. WILFLEY & SONS, INC, ABB, INC., AS SUCCESSOR TO BROWN BOVERI (INDIVIDUALLY AND AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO ITE IMPERIAL CO F/K/A ITE CIRCUIT BREAKER COMPANY); ACCO MATERIAL HANDLING SOLUTION, INC., AECOM ENERGY & CONSTRUCTION, INC., AHLSTROM PUMPS LLC, AIR & LIQUID SYSTEMS CORPORATION, SUCCESSOR-BY-MERGER TO BUFFALO PUMPS, INC.; AJAX MAGNETHERMIC CORPORATION, ALFA LAVAL, INC., ALLIED GLOVE CORPORATION, ARMSTRONG INTERNATIONAL, INC., ARMSTRONG PUMPS, INC., ATLAS INDUSTRIES, INC., ATWOOD & MORRILL CO., INC., BAKER HUGHES, A GE COMPANY, LLC; BEAZER EAST, INC., IN ITS OWN RIGHT AND AS SUCCESSOR TO KOPPERS CO., INC., AND OTHER RELATED COMPANIES. INCLUDING THIEM CORPORATION, BEAZER USA, INC., AND BEAZER, PLC; BMI REFRACTORY SERVICES, INC., BORGWARNER MORSE TEC LLC, BRAND INSULATIONS, INC., BRYAN STEAM, LLC, BURNHAM LLC, BW/IP, INC., CAMERON INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION, CAMPBELL HAUSFELD, LLC, CARRIER CORPORATION, CARVER PUMP

COMPANY, CASHCO, INC., CATERPILLAR, INC., CATERPILLAR GLOBAL MINING AMERICA, LLC, CBS CORPORATION, AS SUCCESSOR BY MERGER TO CBS CORP.: CERTAINTEED CORPORATION, CLARK EQUIPMENT COMPANY, CLARK RELIANCE CORPORATION, AND ITS DIVISION JERGUSON GAGE AND VALVE; CLEAVER-BROOKS, CLYDE UNION, INC., INDIVIDUALLY AND AS SUCCESSOR-BY-MERGER TO UNION PUMP COMPANY; COLUMBUS MCKINNON CORP., SUCCESSOR-BY-MERGER TO LIFT TECH INTERNATIONAL, INC., AND ITS SHAW-BOX HOIST DIVISION; CORNING INCORPORATED, ON BEHALF OF ITS FORMER CORHART REFRACTORIES BUSINESS DIVISION; CRANE COMPANY, INC., CROSBY VALVE, LLC, CUMMINS, INC., DANA COMPANIES, LLC, DANIELI CORPORATION, DAP, INC, DEZURIK, INC., DICK CORPORATION, DRAVO CORPORATION, EATON CORPORATION, AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO CUTLER-HAMMER, INC.: EICHLEAY CORPORATION, ELECTROLUX HOME PRODUCTS INC., ELLIOTT COMPANY, EMERSON CLIMATE TECHNOLOGIES, INC., IN ITS OWN RIGHT AND AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO ALCO VALVE COMPANY; FLOWSERVE CORPORATION, FLOWSERVE CORPORATION, FLOWSERVE US INC., SOLELY AS SUCCESSOR TO NORDSTROM AUDCO, EDWARD VALVES INC., NORDSTROM VALVES, INC., AND ROCKWELL MANUFACTURING COMPANY: FLOWSERVE US INC., SUCCESSOR TO VALTEK INTERNATIONAL: FLSMIDTH DORR-OLIVER, INC., AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO KEELER/DORR-

OLIVER BOILER COMPANY; FLSMIDTH, INC., FMC CORPORATION, FORD MOTOR COMPANY, FOSTER WHEELER LLC, GARDNER DENVER, INC., GENERAL ELECTRIC COMPANY, GENUINE PARTS COMPANY, GOULD ELECTRONICS, INC., GREENE TWEED & COMPANY, GOULDS PUMPS, LLC, GRINNELL, LLC, GUARD LINE, INC., HONEYWELL, INC., HONEYWELL INTERNATIONAL, INC., AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO THE BENDIX CORPORATION; HONEYWELL INTERNATIONAL, INC., IN ITS OWN RIGHT AND AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO ALLIED CORPORATION (WILPUTTE COKE OVEN DIVISION), AND AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO ALLIED CHEMICAL (WILPUTTE COKE OVEN DIVISION), AND AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO WILPUTTE COKE OVEN CORPORATION: HOWDEN NORTH AMERICA, INC., HUNTER SALES CORPORATION, HYSTER-YALE GROUP, INC., I.U. NORTH AMERICA, INC., AS SUCCESSOR BY MERGER TO THE GARP COMPANY, FORMERLY KNOWN AS THE GAGE COMPANY, FORMERLY KNOWN AS THE GAGE COMPANY, FORMERLY KNOWN AS PITTSBURGH GAGE AND SUPPLY COMPANY; IMO INDUSTRIES, INC., INDUCTOTHERM INDUSTRIES, INC., INDUSTRIAL RUBBER PRODUCTS. INGERSOLL-RAND CORPORATION, ITT INDUSTRIES, INC., JOHNSON CONTROLS, INC., JOY GLOBAL SURFACE MINING, INC., JOY GLOBAL UNDERGROUND MINING, LLC, KELSEY-HAYES COMPANY, LEEDS & NORTHRUP COMPANY, LINDBERG, LINDBERG MPH, M.S. JACOBS & ASSOCIATES, INC., MACK TRUCKS, INC., MAGNETEK, INC., M.V.S. COMPANY, MALLINCKRODT US HOLDINGS, LLC, MCCARLS, INC.,

MCMASTER CARR SUPPLY, MCNALLY INDUSTRIES, LLC, IN ITS OWN RIGHT AND ITS NORTHERN PUMPS DIVISION, IN ITS OWN RIGHT; MCNEIL (OHIO) CORPORATION, MESTEK, INC., MET-PRO CORPORATION, AND ITS DEAN PUMP BRAND; MILWAUKEE VALVE COMPANY, MINE SAFETY APPLIANCE COMPANY, MINNOTTE CONTRACTING CORPORATION, MORGAN ENGINEERING SYSTEMS, INC., MOYNO, INC., MUELLER CO., LLC, MUELLER STEAM SPECIALTY, MW CUSTOM PAPERS, LLC, NAGLE PUMPS, INC., NAVISTAR, INC., NORTEK GLOBAL HVAC, LLC, AS SUCCESSOR BY MERGER TO REZNOR, LLC; NORTH AMERICAN MANUFACTURING CO., OSRAM SYLVANIA, INC., IN ITS OWN RIGHT AND AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO GTE PRODUCTS CORPORATION, THE CLARK CONTROLLER COMPANY AND A.O. SMITH CORPORATION; PECORA CORPORATION, PENNSYLVANIA POWER COMPANY, PENTAIR VALVES & CONTROLS, LLC, PNEUMO ABEX, LLC, AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO ABEX CORPORATION; POWER PIPING COMPANY, RCH NEW CO., II LLC, AN ALLEGED SUCCESSOR TO H.H. ROBERTSON COMPANY: READING CRANE AND ENGINEERING COMPANY, RESEARCH-COTTRELL, INC., REUNION INDUSTRIES, INC., RILEY POWER, INC.. ROBBINS & MYERS, INC.. ROBINSON FANS, INC., ROCKWELL AUTOMATION, INC., SUCCESSOR BY MERGER TO ALLEN BRADLEY CO; **RUST ENGINEERING &** CONSTRUCTION, INC., SAINT-GOBAIN ABRASIVES, INC., SAUER, INC., SCHNEIDER ELECTRIC USA, INC., SIEMENS INDUSTRY, INC., IN ITS OWN RIGHT, AND AS SUCCESSOR-IN-INTEREST TO I-T-E CIRCUIT BREAKER

COMPANY; SIMAKAS COMPANY, INC., SPIRAX SARCO, INC., SPX COOLING TECHNOLOGIES, INC., STERLING FLUID SYSTEMS (USA), LLC, SUNBEAM PRODUCTS, INC., AS SUCCESS-IN-INTEREST TO SUNBEAM CORPORATION; SUNDYNE, LLC, SURFACE COMBUSTION, SWINDELL-DRESSLER INTERNATIONAL COMPANY, THE GOODYEAR TIRE & RUBBER COMPANY, THE GORMAN-RUPP COMPANY, THE NASH ENGINEERING COMPANY, THE WILLIAM POWELL COMPANY, TRANE U.S. INC., IN ITS OWN RIGHT AND AS SUCCESSOR TO WESTINGHOUSE AIRBRAKE AND/OR WABCO; TRUMBELL INDUSTRIES, INC., TUTHILL CORPORATION, UB WEST VIRGINIA, INC., UNION CARBIDE CORPORATION, UNITED CONVEYOR CORPORATION, VELAN VALVE CORPORATION, VIKING PUMP, INC., W.W. GRAINGER, INC., WARREN PUMPS, LLC, WASHINGTON GROUP INTERNATIONAL, AND ALL ITS DOMESTIC SUBSIDIARIES INCLUDING THE BADGER COMPANY, INC.; WATSON MCDANIEL COMPANY, WATTS REGULATOR CO., WEIL-MCLAIN COMPANY, WHEELABRATOR AIR POLLUTION CONTROL, INC., WT/HRC CORPORATION, WTI RUST HOLDINGS, INC., YORK INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION, YUBA HEAT TRANSFER LLC. ZURN INDUSTRIES, INDUSTRIAL HOLDINGS CORPORATION, SURFACE COMBUSTION, LINDBERG, DICK CORPORATION, NORTEK GLOBAL HVAC, LLC, FLSMIDTH, INC., MARLEY-WYLAIN COMPANY, INCORRECTLY DESIGNATED AS WEIL-MCLAIN COMPANY: SIMAKAS COMPANY, INC., TRUMBULL INDUSTRIES, INC., UB WEST

VIRGINIA, INC., F/K/A/ UNION BOILER COMPANY; MW CUSTOM PAPERS, LLC, WT/HRC CORPORATION, WHEELABRATOR AIR POLLUTION CONTROL, INC., MVS COMPANY, SULZER PUMPS (US), INC., MESTEK, INC., MESTEK, INC., SULZER PUMPS (US), INC., GOULD ELECTRONICS, INC., MESTEK, INC., SULZER PUMPS SOLUTIONS, INC.,

Defendants,

Memorandum Opinion

This case was referred to United States Magistrate Judge Cynthia Reed Eddy for pretrial proceedings in accordance with the Magistrate Judges Act, 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(A) and (B), and Rule 72 of the Local Rules for Magistrate Judges. On November 9, 2021, Judge Eddy issued a Report and Recommendation (ECF No. 1187) recommending that the Court dispose of Defendants' Motions for Summary Judgment as follows:

Motion for Summary Judgment filed by:	Motion ECF	Recommendation
incu sy.	No.:	
M.S. JACOBS & ASSOCIATES,	983 and	Granted
INC.	1010	
FLOWSERVE US INC., SOLELY	985	Granted
AS SUCCESSOR		
TO NORDSTROM AUDCO INC.,		
EDWARD VALVES, INC.,		
NORDSTROM VALVES, INC.		
AND ROCKWELL		
MANUFACTURING		
ARMSTRONG	1015	Granted
INTERNATIONAL, INC.		
THE NASH ENGINEERING	1024	Denied without prejudice due to bankruptcy
COMPANY		stay
HONEYWELL, INC.	1025	Denied
THE WILLIAM POWELL	1027	Granted
COMPANY		
CLYDE UNION, INC.	1030	Granted
AIR & LIQUID SYSTEMS	1044	Denied
CORPORATION		

DCo LLC (f/k/a Dana Companies	1046	Granted in part and denied in part
LLC)		
I.U. NORTH AMERICA, INC	1049	Granted
ATWOOD & MORRILL CO., INC.	1051	Granted
VIKING PUMP, INC.	1052	Granted
GENERAL ELECTRIC	1063	Granted in part and denied in part
COMPANY		
DEZURIK, INC.	1067	Granted
ALFA LAVAL, INC.	1073	Granted
FMC CORPORATION	1074	Granted in part and denied in part
GARDNER DENVER, INC.	1076	Granted ¹
HYSTER-YALE GROUP, INC.	1079	Granted
BW/IP, INC.	1084	Granted
CLARK EQUIPMENT	1085	Granted
COMPANY		

The parties were informed that written objections to the Report and Recommendation were due by November 23, 2021. No parties filed objections. Following *de novo* review of the pleadings and documents in the case, together with the Report and Recommendation, the following order will be entered:

Judge Eddy's Report and Recommendation (ECF No. 1187) will be adopted as the Opinion of the Court.

Defendants' Motions for Summary Judgment will be disposed as follows:

Motion for Summary Judgment	Motion	Disposition
filed by:	ECF	
	No.:	
M.S. JACOBS & ASSOCIATES,	983 and	Granted
INC.	1010	
FLOWSERVE US INC., SOLELY	985	Granted
AS SUCCESSOR		
TO NORDSTROM AUDCO INC.,		
EDWARD VALVES, INC.,		
NORDSTROM VALVES, INC.		
AND ROCKWELL		
MANUFACTURING		
ARMSTRONG	1015	Granted
INTERNATIONAL, INC.		
THE NASH ENGINEERING	1024	Denied without prejudice due to bankruptcy

¹ Clarified by Court Order Dated November 10, 2021. (ECF No. 1188).

COMPANY		stay	
HONEYWELL, INC.	1025	Denied	
THE WILLIAM POWELL	1027	Granted	
COMPANY			
CLYDE UNION, INC.	1030	Granted	
AIR & LIQUID SYSTEMS	1044	Denied	
CORPORATION			
DCo LLC (f/k/a Dana Companies	1046	Granted in part and denied in part	
LLC)			
I.U. NORTH AMERICA, INC	1049	Granted	
ATWOOD & MORRILL CO., INC.	1051	Granted	
VIKING PUMP, INC.	1052	Granted	
GENERAL ELECTRIC	1063	Granted in part and denied in part	
COMPANY			
DEZURIK, INC.	1067	Granted	
ALFA LAVAL, INC.	1073	Granted	
FMC CORPORATION	1074	Granted in part and denied in part	
GARDNER DENVER, INC.	1076	Granted	
HYSTER-YALE GROUP, INC.	1079	Granted	
BW/IP, INC.	1084	Granted	
CLARK EQUIPMENT	1085	Granted	
COMPANY			

Judgment will be entered in favor of the following Defendants: M.S. JACOBS & ASSOCIATES, INC.; FLOWSERVE US INC., SOLELY AS SUCCESSOR TO NORDSTROM AUDCO INC., EDWARD VALVES, INC., NORDSTROM VALVES, INC. AND ROCKWELL MANUFACTURING; ARMSTRONG INTERNATIONAL, INC.; THE WILLIAM POWELL COMPANY; CLYDE UNION, INC.; I.U. NORTH AMERICA, INC; ATWOOD & MORRILL CO., INC.; VIKING PUMP, INC.; DEZURIK, INC. ALFA LAVAL, INC.; GARDNER DENVER, INC.; HYSTER-YALE GROUP, INC.; BW/IP, INC.; and CLARK EQUIPMENT COMPANY.

This case will be referred to Chief Magistrate Judge Eddy with regard to the remaining defendants and remaining claims. As separate order will follow.

DATED this _____ day of December, 2021.

BY THE COURT:

MARILYN J. HORAN United States District Judge