

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA
COLUMBIA DIVISION

Ronnie Portee,

Plaintiff,

Civil Action No.: 3:18-cv-02106-JMC

v.

Apple Incorporated;
Asurion Protection Services, LLC;
4L Technologies, Inc.;
Clover Technologies Group, LLC;
Clover Wireless, LLC;
Sprint Corporation;
Sprint Solutions, Inc.;
Valutech Outsourcing, S.A. De C.V.;
Valu Tech Outsourcing, LLC; and
John Does 1-10,

Defendants.

**ORDER GRANTING DEFENDANTS’
4L TECHNOLOGIES, INC. AND
CLOVER TECHNOLOGIES GROUP,
LLC’S MOTION TO DISMISS**

This matter is before the court on Defendants 4L Technologies, Inc., Clover Technologies Group, LLC, and Clover Wireless, LLC’s (the “Moving Defendants”) Motion to Dismiss the Plaintiff’s Complaint for lack of personal jurisdiction. (ECF No. 57.) For the reasons that follow, and with the consent of the parties, the court **GRANTS** the Motion to Dismiss as to only two of the Moving Defendants, Defendants 4L Technologies, Inc. and Clover Technologies Group, LLC, only and the motion is **WITHDRAWN** as to Clover Wireless, LLC.

1. The Moving Defendants filed their Motion to Dismiss pursuant to Rule 12(b)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure on August 8, 2019. (ECF No. 57.)

2. Thereafter, the Parties agreed to engage in jurisdictional discovery. However, prior to completion of said discovery, certain Defendants, to include the Moving Defendants, filed voluntary petitions for relief under Chapter 11 of the United States Code, 11 U.S.C. §§ 101–1532 (ECF No. 80). As a result, on January 6, 2020, after the filing of a Suggestion of Bankruptcy, the Clerk entered an automatic stay and statistically closed the action. (See ECF

Nos. 80, 81.)

3. On January 22, 2021, the Parties filed a Consent Motion to lift the automatic stay and resume litigation in this matter. (ECF No. 83.) The court granted the Parties' Consent Motion to Lift the Stay and this matter was reopened on January 22, 2021. (ECF No. 84.)

4. Now, Plaintiff, through its undersigned counsel, has consented to the dismissal of Defendants 4L Technologies, Inc. and Clover Technologies Group, LLC, only, for lack of personal jurisdiction. Defendant Clover Wireless, LLC, has agreed to withdraw its Motion to Dismiss.

5. As a result, it has been made to appear to this court that the Parties consent to the dismissal of Defendants 4L Technologies, Inc. and Clover Technologies Group, LLC, only, and that Defendant Clover Wireless, LLC will remain a party to this matter.¹

Upon its consideration, the court **INSTRUCTS** the Clerk to reopen the Motion to Dismiss (ECF No. 57) and **HEREBY GRANTS** Defendants 4L Technologies, Inc. and Clover Technologies Group, LLC's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint. Therefore, Defendants 4L Technologies, Inc. and Clover Technologies Group, LLC are hereby **DISMISSED** from this action.

IT IS SO ORDERED.



United States District Judge

March 24, 2021
Columbia, South Carolina

[MOVANT AND CONSENT SIGNATURES ON FOLLOWING PAGES]

¹ The parties informed the court by letter that Defendant Apple Incorporated neither consents, nor objects, to the entry of this Order.

WE SO MOVE:
MURPHY & GRANTLAND, P.A.

s/ E. Raymond Moore, III

E. Raymond Moore, III (Fed ID 6797)
P.O. Box 6648
Columbia, SC 29260
Phone: 803-782-4100
Fax: 803-782-4140
Email: ermooore@murphygrantland.com
*Attorneys for Defendants 4L Technologies, Inc.;
Clover Technologies Group, LLC;
Clover Wireless, LLC; Valutech Outsourcing, S.A. De
C.V.; and Valu Tech Outsourcing, LLC*

WE SO CONSENT:
MOTLEY RICE LLC

s/ John David O'Neill

Attorneys for Plaintiff

Kevin R. Dean, Esquire (Fed ID 8046)
Patrick Graham Maiden (Fed ID 12271)
John David O'Neill, Esquire (Fed ID 12472)
Motley Rice LLC
28 Bridgeside Blvd.
Mt. Pleasant, SC 29465
Email: kdean@motleyrice.com
-and-
George T. Sink, Jr. (SC Bar #102829)
George Sink II Law Firm, LLC
4000 Faber Place Dr., Ste. 300
North Charleston, SC 29405
(843) 970-0529
Email: georgesink@gmail.com

WE SO CONSENT:
GALLIVAN, WHITE & BOYD, PA

s/ Gray Culbreath

**Attorneys for Asurion Protection Services, LLC; and
Sprint Corp., Sprint Solutions, Inc.**

Gray Culbreath, Esquire (FED ID 5647)
Gallivan, White & Boyd, PA
P.O. Box 7368
Columbia, SC 29202
gculbreath@gwblawfirm.com

WE SO CONSENT:

HEDRICK GARDNER KINCHELOE AND GAROFALO LLP

Apple neither consents nor objects to the proposed order

Attorneys for Apple Inc.

Jonathan G. Roquemoire (Fed ID 9160)
Hedrick Gardner Kincheloe and Garofalo LLP
PO Box 11267
Columbia, SC 29211
Email: jroquemoire@hedrickgardner.com