

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
MARSHALL DIVISION**

MINERVA INDUSTRIES, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

MOTOROLA, INC., et al.

Defendants.

**Civil Action No: 2-07 CV-229**

**The Honorable T. John Ward  
United States District Judge**

AND RELATED COUNTERCLAIMS.

**MINERVA INDUSTRIES, INC.'S REPLY  
TO PALM, INC.'S COUNTERCLAIMS**

Plaintiff Minerva Industries, Inc. files this Reply to Palm, Inc.'s Counterclaims and alleges as follows:

**PARTIES**

1. Plaintiff Minerva Industries, Inc. ("Minerva") admits the allegations in paragraph 1 of Palm, Inc.'s ("Palm") Counterclaims ("Counterclaims").
2. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 2 of the Counterclaims.

**JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

3. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 3 of the Counterclaims.
4. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 4 of the Counterclaims.
5. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 5 of the Counterclaims.

**FACTS**

6. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 6 of the Counterclaims.
7. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 7 of the Counterclaims.
8. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 8 of the Counterclaims.



David R. Gabor, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 145729  
E-mail: [dgabor@raklaw.com](mailto:dgabor@raklaw.com)  
Irene Y. Lee, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 213625  
E-mail: [ilee@raklaw.com](mailto:ilee@raklaw.com)  
Eric B. Carlson, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 193401  
E-mail: [ecarlson@raklaw.com](mailto:ecarlson@raklaw.com)  
Robert E. Satterthwaite, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 223767  
E-mail: [rsatterthwaite@raklaw.com](mailto:rsatterthwaite@raklaw.com)  
RUSS, AUGUST & KABAT  
12424 Wilshire Boulevard 12<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90025  
Telephone: (310) 826-7474  
Facsimile: (310) 826-6991

Otis W. Carroll, Attorney-In-Charge  
Texas State Bar No. 03895700  
E-mail: [otiscarroll@icklawn.com](mailto:otiscarroll@icklawn.com)  
Collin M. Maloney  
Texas State Bar No.00794219  
E-mail: [cmaloney@icklawn.com](mailto:cmaloney@icklawn.com)  
IRELAND CARROLL & KELLEY, P.C.  
6101 South Broadway, Suite 500  
P.O. Box 7879  
Tyler, Texas 75711  
Telephone: (903) 561-1600  
Facsimile: (903) 581-1071

S. Calvin Capshaw  
Texas State Bar # 0378390  
[ccapshaw@mailbmc.com](mailto:ccapshaw@mailbmc.com)  
Elizabeth L. DeRieux, Esq.  
Texas State Bar # 05770585  
[ederieux@mailbmc.com](mailto:ederieux@mailbmc.com)  
BROWN MCCARROLL LLP  
1127 Judson Road, Suite 220  
P.O. Box 3999  
Longview, Texas 75601-5157  
903/236-9800  
903/236-8787 – fax

Franklin Jones Jr.  
Texas State Bar # 00000055  
[maizieh@millerfirm.com](mailto:maizieh@millerfirm.com)  
JONES & JONES, INC., P.C.  
201 West Houston Street  
P.O. Drawer 1249  
Marshall, Texas 65671-1249  
903/938-4395  
903/938-3360 – fax

Attorneys for Plaintiff Minerva Industries, Inc.

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that all counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service are being served with a copy of this document via the Court's CM/ECF system per Local Rule CV-5(a)(3) on January 25, 2008. Any other counsel of record will be served via First Class U.S. Mail on this same date.

By: /s/ Marc A. Fenster