

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
MARSHALL DIVISION**

MINERVA INDUSTRIES, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

MOTOROLA, INC., et al.

Defendants.

**Civil Action No: 2-07 CV-229**

**The Honorable T. John Ward  
United States District Judge**

AND RELATED COUNTERCLAIMS.

**MINERVA INDUSTRIES, INC.’S REPLY**  
**TO UTSTARCOM, INC.’S AMENDED COUNTERCLAIMS**

Plaintiff Minerva Industries, Inc. files this Reply to UTStarcom, Inc.’s Amended Counterclaims as set forth in its Second Amended Answer to Complaint and alleges as follows:

1. Plaintiff Minerva Industries, Inc. (“Minerva”) admits the allegations in paragraph 1 of UTStarcom, Inc.’s (“UTStarcom”) Counterclaims (“Counterclaims”).
2. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 2 of the Counterclaims.
3. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 3 of the Counterclaims.
4. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 4 of the Counterclaims.

**FIRST CLAIM FOR RELIEF**

**(Declaratory Relief as to the ‘120 Patent)**

5. Minerva denies the allegations in paragraph 5 of the Counterclaims.
6. Minerva denies the allegations in paragraph 6 of the Counterclaims.
7. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 7 of the Counterclaims.
8. To the extent the allegation that Minerva’s foreign filings “constituted a violation of 35 U.S.C. § 184” is other than a legal conclusion (which would require no response), Minerva

denies these allegations. Minerva otherwise admits the allegations in paragraph 8 of the Counterclaims.

9. The allegations contained in this paragraph 9 are legal conclusions that do not require a response.

10. The allegations contained in this paragraph 10 are legal conclusions that do not require a response.

11. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 11 of the Counterclaims.

12. The allegations contained in this paragraph 12 are legal conclusions that do not require a response.

13. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 13 of the Counterclaims.

14. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 14 of the Counterclaims.

15. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 15 of the Counterclaims.

16. To the extent the allegation that Minerva's foreign filings "constituted a violation of 35 U.S.C. § 184" is other than a legal conclusion (which would require no response), Minerva denies these allegations. Minerva otherwise admits the allegations in paragraph 16 of the Counterclaims.

17. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 17 of the Counterclaims.

18. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 18 of the Counterclaims.

19. Minerva admits the allegations in paragraph 19 of the Counterclaims.

20. Minerva denies the allegations in paragraph 20 of the Counterclaims.

21. To the extent the allegations in paragraph 21 of the Counterclaims are other than legal conclusions (which would require no response), Minerva denies these allegations.

22. To the extent the allegations in paragraph 22 of the Counterclaims are other than legal conclusions (which would require no response), Minerva denies these allegations.

23. Minerva denies the allegations in paragraph 23 of the Counterclaims.

24. Minerva denies the allegations in paragraph 24 of the Counterclaims.

25. To the extent the allegations in paragraph 25 of the Counterclaims are other than legal conclusions (which would require no response), Minerva denies these allegations.

26. Minerva denies the allegations in paragraph 26 of the Counterclaims.

### PRAYER FOR RELIEF

Minerva denies that UTStarcom is entitled to any relief requested in the Prayer for Relief in its Counterclaims, or any other relief whatsoever.

Dated: March 19, 2008

By: /s/ Marc A. Fenster

Marc A. Fenster, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 181067  
E-mail: [mfenster@raklaw.com](mailto:mfenster@raklaw.com)  
David R. Gabor, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 145729  
E-mail: [dgabor@raklaw.com](mailto:dgabor@raklaw.com)  
Irene Y. Lee, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 213625  
E-mail: [ilee@raklaw.com](mailto:ilee@raklaw.com)  
Eric B. Carlson, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 193401  
E-mail: [ecarlson@raklaw.com](mailto:ecarlson@raklaw.com)  
Robert E. Satterthwaite, *pro hac vice*  
California State Bar No. 223767  
E-mail: [rsatterthwaite@raklaw.com](mailto:rsatterthwaite@raklaw.com)  
RUSS, AUGUST & KABAT  
12424 Wilshire Boulevard 12<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90025  
Telephone: (310) 826-7474  
Facsimile: (310) 826-6991

Otis W. Carroll, Attorney-In-Charge  
Texas State Bar No. 03895700  
E-mail: [otiscarroll@icklaw.com](mailto:otiscarroll@icklaw.com)  
Collin M. Maloney  
Texas State Bar No.00794219  
E-mail: [cmaloney@icklaw.com](mailto:cmaloney@icklaw.com)  
IRELAND CARROLL & KELLEY, P.C.  
6101 South Broadway, Suite 500

