

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
MARSHALL DIVISION

BENEFICIAL INNOVATIONS, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

CAREERBUILDER, LLC, ET AL.

Defendants.

§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§  
§

CASE NO. 2:09-CV-175-TJW  
Jury Trial Demanded

**JOINT MOTION FOR FURTHER EXTENSION OF TIME TO SUBMIT  
PROPOSED DOCKET CONTROL AND DISCOVERY ORDERS**

Plaintiff Beneficial Innovations, Inc. and Defendants Comcast Corporation, Disney Online, Google Inc., IAC Search & Media, Inc., Morris Communications Company, LLC, NBC Universal, Inc., The New York Times Company, and YouTube, LLC and hereby file and present this Joint Motion for Further Extension of Time to Submit Proposed Docket Control and Discovery Orders.

On July 21, 2010, the Court entered an Order [Dkt. No. 123], directing the parties to submit their proposed docket control and discovery orders on September 13, 2010, and setting a status conference on August 30, 2010. At the status conference, the Court set the claim construction hearing for September 27, 2011, and the trial for September 4, 2012. The Court also reaffirmed that the parties should submit their proposed docket control and discovery orders by September 13, 2010. In response to several joint motions seeking extensions of time to submit proposed docket control and discovery orders, on September 15, 2010, the Court entered an order granting an extension of time up to submit these orders up to and including September

22, 2010, and on October 13, 2010, the court entered an order granting another extension of time up to and including October 15, 2010.

The parties continue to meet and confer regarding the proposed docket control and discovery orders, and are close to finalizing their submission. However, the parties respectfully request another short extension of time up to and including October 22, 2010, to submit their proposed docket control and discovery orders. The parties agree that this extension will not affect any other deadlines in the present action.

WHEREFORE, the parties respectfully request that the Court grant this Motion.

Date: October 15, 2010

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Violetta G. Watson

Melissa Richards Smith  
Gillam & Smith, LLP  
303 South Washington Avenue  
Marshall, TX 75670  
Telephone: (903) 934-9257  
E-mail: melissa@gillamsmithlaw.com

Mark G. Matuschak  
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP  
60 State Street  
Boston, MA 02109  
Telephone: (617) 526-6000  
E-mail: mark.matuschak@wilmerhale.com

Kate Hutchins  
Violetta G. Watson  
Cosmin Maier  
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP  
399 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
Telephone: (212) 230-8800

E-mail: kate.hutchins@wilmerhale.com  
E-mail: violetta.watson@wilmerhale.com  
E-mail: cosmin.maier@wilmerhale.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS  
GOOGLE INC., NBC UNIVERSAL, INC., AND  
YOUTUBE, LLC**

/s/ Michael James Guthrie (with permission)

Gregory Loren Maag  
Conley Rose  
600 Travis St Suite 7100  
Houston, TX 77002  
Telephone: (713) 238-8040  
E-mail: gmaag@conleyrose.com

Michael James Guthrie  
Conley Rose  
5700 Granite Parkway  
Suite 330  
Plano, TX 75024-6616  
Telephone: (713) 238-8000  
E-mail: mguthrie@conleyrose.com

Michael E. Jones  
Potter Minton PC  
110 N College  
Suite 500  
PO Box 359  
Tyler, TX 75710-0359  
Telephone: (930) 597-8311  
E-mail: mikejones@potterminton.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT MORRIS  
COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY, LLC**

/s/ Brian S. Rosenbloom (with permission)

Samuel Franklin Baxter  
McKool Smith  
P.O. Box O  
104 East Houston St., Suite 300  
Marshall, TX 75670  
Telephone: (903) 923-9000  
E-mail: sbaxter@mckoolsmith.com

Ada Elene Brown  
McKool Smith  
300 Crescent Court  
Suite 1500  
Dallas, TX 75201  
Telephone: (214) 978-4088  
E-mail: aebrown@mckoolsmith.com  
Brian S. Rosenbloom  
Oliver Edwards  
Rothwell, Figg, Ernst & Manbeck  
1425 K Street, N.W.  
Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20005  
Telephone: (202) 783-6040  
E-mail: brosenbloom@rfem.com  
E-mail: oedwards@rfem.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT  
THE NEW YORK TIMES COMPANY**

/s/ David J. Silbert (with permission)

Daniel K. Nazer  
David J. Silbert  
Keker & Van Nest  
710 Sansome St.  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 391-5400  
E-mail: dnazer@kvn.com  
E-mail: DSilbert@kvn.com

Deron R. Dacus  
Ramey & Flock  
100 East Ferguson  
Suite 500  
Tyler, TX 75702  
Telephone: (903) 597-3301  
E-mail: ddacus@rameyflock.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT  
COMCAST CORPORATION**

/s/ Kevin A. Smith (with permission)

Charles K. Verhoeven  
Howard Y. Chen  
Jennifer A. Kash  
Kevin A. Smith

Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP  
50 California Street  
22nd Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 875-6600  
E-mail: charlesverhoeven@quinnemanuel.com  
E-mail: howardchen@quinnemanuel.com  
E-mail: jenniferkash@quinnemanuel.com  
E-mail: kevinsmith@quinnemanuel.com

J. Thad Heartfield  
M. Dru Montgomery  
The Heartfield Law Firm  
2195 Dowlen Rd.  
Beaumont, TX 77706  
Telephone: (409) 866-3318  
E-mail: thad@jth-law.com  
E-mail: dru@jth-law.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DISNEY ONLINE AND  
IAC SEARCH & MEDIA, INC.**

/s/ Julien Adams (with permission)

---

S. Calvin Capshaw  
State Bar No. 03783900  
Elizabeth L. DeRieux  
State Bar No. 05770585  
Brown McCarroll, L.L.P.  
1127 Judson Road, Suite 220  
Longview, TX 75601  
Telephone: (903) 236-9800  
Facsimile: (903) 236-8787  
E-mail: capshaw@mailbmc.com  
E-mail: ederieux@mailbmc.com

Gregory Scott Dovel  
CA State Bar No. 135387  
Julien Adams  
CA State Bar No. 156135  
Dovel & Luner, LLP  
201 Santa Monica Blvd., Suite 600  
Santa Monica, CA 90401  
Phone: (310) 656-7066  
Fax: (310) 656-7069  
E-mail: greg@dovellaw.com

E-mail: julien@dovellaw.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF  
BENEFICIAL INNOVATIONS, INC.**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that all counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service are being served with a copy of this document via the Court's CM/ECF system per Local Rule CV-5(a)(3) on October 15, 2010.

/s/ Violetta G. Watson  
Melissa Richards Smith