

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
MARSHALL DIVISION

BENEFICIAL INNOVATIONS, INC.,	§	
	§	
Plaintiff,	§	
	§	
v.	§	CASE NO. 2:09-CV-175-TJW
	§	
	§	
CAREERBUILDER, LLC, ET AL.	§	
	§	
Defendants.	§	Jury Trial Demanded
	§	

**JOINT MOTION FOR FURTHER EXTENSION OF TIME TO SUBMIT
PROPOSED DISCOVERY ORDER**

Plaintiff Beneficial Innovations, Inc. and Defendants Comcast Corporation, Disney Online, Google Inc., IAC Search & Media, Inc., Morris Communications Company, LLC, NBC Universal, Inc., The New York Times Company, and YouTube, LLC hereby file and present this Joint Motion for Further Extension of Time to Submit Proposed Discovery Order.

On July 21, 2010, the Court entered an Order [Dkt. No. 123], directing the parties to submit their proposed docket control and discovery orders on September 13, 2010, and setting a status conference on August 30, 2010. At the status conference, the Court set the claim construction hearing for September 27, 2011, and the trial for September 4, 2012. The Court also reaffirmed that the parties should submit their proposed docket control and discovery orders by September 13, 2010. In response to several joint motions seeking extensions of time to submit proposed docket control and discovery orders, on September 15, 2010, the Court entered an order granting an extension of time to submit these orders up to and including September 22, 2010, and on October 13, 2010, the Court entered an order granting an extension of time up to

and including October 15, 2010, and on October 18, 2010, the Court entered an order granting another extension of time up to and including October 22, 2010.

The parties have submitted their Docket Control Order. Further, the parties have come to agreement with regard to most issues in their proposed discovery order. However, they respectfully request one more week, up to and including October 29, 2010, to resolve a few outstanding issues with regard to the discovery order and to submit their proposed discovery order. The parties agree that this extension will not affect any other deadlines in the present action.

WHEREFORE, the parties respectfully request that the Court grant this Motion.

Date: October 22, 2010

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Melissa Richards Smith

Melissa Richards Smith
Texas State Bar No. 24001351
Gillam & Smith, LLP
303 South Washington Avenue
Marshall, TX 75670
Telephone: (903) 934-8450
Facsimile: (903) 934-9257
E-mail: melissa@gillamsmithlaw.com

Mark G. Matuschak
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP
60 State Street
Boston, MA 02109
Telephone: (617) 526-6000
E-mail: mark.matuschak@wilmerhale.com

Kate Hutchins

Violetta G. Watson
Cosmin Maier
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP
399 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10022
Telephone: (212) 230-8800
E-mail: kate.hutchins@wilmerhale.com
E-mail: violetta.watson@wilmerhale.com
E-mail: cosmin.maier@wilmerhale.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS
GOOGLE INC., NBC UNIVERSAL, INC., AND
YOUTUBE, LLC**

/s/ Michael James Guthrie (with permission)

Gregory Loren Maag
Conley Rose
600 Travis St Suite 7100
Houston, TX 77002
Telephone: (713) 238-8040
E-mail: gmaag@conleyrose.com

Michael James Guthrie
Conley Rose
5700 Granite Parkway
Suite 330
Plano, TX 75024-6616
Telephone: (713) 238-8000
E-mail: mguthrie@conleyrose.com

Michael E. Jones
Potter Minton PC
110 N College
Suite 500
PO Box 359
Tyler, TX 75710-0359
Telephone: (930) 597-8311
E-mail: mikejones@potterminton.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT MORRIS
COMMUNICATIONS COMPANY, LLC**

/s/ Brian S. Rosenbloom (with permission)

Samuel Franklin Baxter
McKool Smith
P.O. Box O
104 East Houston St., Suite 300
Marshall, TX 75670
Telephone: (903) 923-9000
E-mail: sbaxter@mckoolsmith.com

Ada Elene Brown
McKool Smith
300 Crescent Court
Suite 1500
Dallas, TX 75201
Telephone: (214) 978-4088
E-mail: aebrown@mckoolsmith.com

Brian S. Rosenbloom
Oliver Edwards
Rothwell, Figg, Ernst & Manbeck
1425 K Street, N.W.
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
Telephone: (202) 783-6040
E-mail: brosenbloom@rfem.com
E-mail: oedwards@rfem.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT
THE NEW YORK TIMES COMPANY**

/s/ David J. Silbert (with permission)

Daniel K. Nazer
David J. Silbert
Keker & Van Nest
710 Sansome St.
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 391-5400
E-mail: dnazer@kvn.com
E-mail: DSilbert@kvn.com

Deron R. Dacus
Ramey & Flock
100 East Ferguson
Suite 500
Tyler, TX 75702
Telephone: (903) 597-3301
E-mail: ddacus@rameyflock.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT
COMCAST CORPORATION**

/s/ Kevin A. Smith (with permission)

Charles K. Verhoeven
Howard Y. Chen
Jennifer A. Kash
Kevin A. Smith
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP
50 California Street
22nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 875-6600
E-mail: charlesverhoeven@quinnemanuel.com
E-mail: howardchen@quinnemanuel.com
E-mail: jenniferkash@quinnemanuel.com
E-mail: kevinsmith@quinnemanuel.com

J. Thad Heartfield
M. Dru Montgomery
The Heartfield Law Firm
2195 Dowlen Rd.
Beaumont, TX 77706
Telephone: (409) 866-3318
E-mail: thad@jth-law.com
E-mail: dru@jth-law.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DISNEY ONLINE AND
IAC SEARCH & MEDIA, INC.**

/s/ Julien Adams (with permission)

S. Calvin Capshaw
State Bar No. 03783900
Elizabeth L. DeRieux
State Bar No. 05770585
Brown McCarroll, L.L.P.
1127 Judson Road, Suite 220
Longview, TX 75601
Telephone: (903) 236-9800
Facsimile: (903) 236-8787
E-mail: capshaw@mailbmc.com
E-mail: ederieux@mailbmc.com

Gregory Scott Dovel

CA State Bar No. 135387
Julien Adams
CA State Bar No. 156135
Dovel & Luner, LLP
201 Santa Monica Blvd., Suite 600
Santa Monica, CA 90401
Phone: (310) 656-7066
Fax: (310) 656-7069
E-mail: greg@dovellaw.com
E-mail: julien@dovellaw.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF
BENEFICIAL INNOVATIONS, INC.**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that all counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service are being served with a copy of this document via the Court's CM/ECF system per Local Rule CV-5(a)(3) on October 22, 2010.

/s/ Melissa Richards Smith

Melissa Richards Smith