United States District Court Southern District of Texas

ENTERED

October 11, 2016

David J. Bradley, Clerk

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS GALVESTON DIVISION

EXPERIENCE INFUSION CENTER, LLC,)
Plaintiff,))
VS.	Case No. 3:16-cv-00199
HEALTH CARE SERVICE CORPORATION, A Mutual Legal Reserve Company AND BLUE CROSS AND BLUE SHIELD OF TEXAS, a Division of HEALTH CARE SERVICE CORPORATION, A Mutual Legal Reserve Company,	Hon. George C. Hanks, Jr. Hon. George C. Hanks, Jr.
Defendant.)

AGREED CONFIDENTIALITY ORDER

A party to this action has moved that the Court enter a confidentiality order. The Court has determined that the terms set forth herein are appropriate to protect the respective interests of the parties, the public, and the Court. Accordingly, it is ORDERED:

- 1. Scope. All materials produced or adduced in the course of discovery, including initial disclosures, responses to discovery requests, deposition testimony and exhibits, and information derived directly therefrom (hereinafter collectively "documents"), shall be subject to this Order concerning Confidential Information as defined below. This Order is subject to the Local Rules of this District and the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure on matters of procedure and calculation of time periods.
- 2. <u>Confidential Information</u>. As used in this Order, "Confidential Information" means information designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" by the producing party that

falls within one or more of the following categories: (a) information prohibited from disclosure by statute; (b) information that reveals trade secrets; (c) research, technical, commercial or financial information that the party has maintained as confidential; (d) medical information concerning any individual; (e) personal identity information; (f) income tax returns (including attached schedules and forms), W-2 forms and 1099 forms; or (g) personnel or employment records of a person who is not a party to the case. Information or documents that are available to the public may not be designated as Confidential Information. Further, as used in this Order, "Confidential Attorneys Eyes Only" means information designated as "CONFIDENTIAL – ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" by the producing party that: (a) is pricing or rate information that is not already in the possession of the non-producing party and that is not publicly available; or (b) is information that this Court, by order, allows a party to mark "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY."

- 3. <u>HIPAA Information</u>. The Parties desire to ensure the privacy of patient/insured/member medical records, patient/insured/member claims information, and other information that the Parties have determined might contain sensitive personal information, including Protected Health Information, Individually Identifiable Information, and any other protected information, as defined by the Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information, 45 C.F.R. parts 160 and 164, and agree that any such information may be designated as "Confidential."
 - (a) Protected Health Information. Protected Health Information, as used herein, shall have the same scope and definition as set forth in 45 C.F.R. § 160.103. Without limiting the generality of the foregoing, Protected Health Information includes, but is not limited

to, health information, including demographic information, relating to: past, present, or future physical or mental health or condition of an individual; the provision of health care to an individual; or the past, present, or future payment for the provision of health care to an individual, which identifies or reasonably could be expected to identify the individual. It also includes, but is not limited to: medical bills; claims forms; charges sheets; medical records; medical charts; test results; notes; dictation; invoices; itemized billing statements; remittance advice forms; explanation of benefits; checks; notices; and requests; and includes all notes, summaries, compilations, extracts, abstracts, or oral communications that are based on or derived from patient health information.

Individually Identifiable Information. Individually Identifiable Information, as used herein, means information referred to and identified in 45 C.F.R. §164.514(b), including, but not limited to: name; address; names of relatives; name of employers; all elements of dates; telephone numbers; fax numbers; electronic mail addresses; social security numbers; medical record numbers; health plan beneficiary numbers; account numbers; certificate/license numbers; Internet Protocol (IP) address numbers; biometric identifiers; full face photographic images; or any other unique identifying numbers, characteristic, or code of any patient.

4. Designation.

- (a) A party may designate a document as Confidential Information for protection under this Order by placing or affixing the words "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" on the document and on all copies in a manner that will not interfere with the legibility of the document. As used in this Order, "copies" includes electronic images, duplicates, extracts, summaries or descriptions that contain the Confidential Information. The marking "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" shall be applied prior to or at the time of the documents are produced or disclosed. Applying the marking "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" to a document does not mean that the document has any status or protection by statute or otherwise except to the extent and for the purposes of this Order. copies Any that are made of any documents marked "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" shall also be so marked, except that indices, electronic databases or lists of documents that do not contain substantial portions or images of the text of marked documents and do not otherwise disclose the substance of the Confidential Information are not required to be marked.
- (b) The designation of a document as Confidential Information is a certification by an attorney or a party appearing pro se that the

document contains Confidential Information as defined in this order.¹

- **5. Depositions.** Deposition testimony is protected by this Order only if designated as "CONFIDENTIAL SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER" on the record at the time the testimony is taken. Such designation shall be specific as to the portions that contain Confidential Information. Deposition testimony so designated shall be treated as Confidential Information protected by this Order until fourteen days after delivery of the transcript by the court reporter to any party or the witness. Within fourteen days after delivery of the transcript, a designating party may serve a Notice of Designation to all parties of record identifying the specific portions of the transcript that are designated Confidential Information, and thereafter those portions identified in the Notice of Designation shall be protected under the terms of this Order. The failure to serve a timely Notice of Designation waives any designation of deposition testimony as Confidential Information that was made on the record of the deposition, unless otherwise ordered by the Court.
- 6. <u>Documents Generated During Suit</u>. All pleadings, motions, memoranda, briefs, deposition transcripts, discovery requests and responses, exhibits, and other documents that produce, paraphrase, summarize, or otherwise contain any information designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL-ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" by a Party, if filed with the Court, shall be filed pursuant to the rules governing sealed documents, as set forth in CM/ECF procedures of the United States District Court for the Southern District of Texas. Any courtesy copies served on the Court shall be filed in an envelope labeled with the caption of the suit, a description of the contents of the envelope,

¹ An attorney who reviews the documents and designates them as CONFIDENTIAL - SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER must be admitted to the Bar of at least one state but need not be admitted to practice in the Southern District of Texas unless the lawyer is appearing generally in the case on behalf of a party. By designating documents confidential pursuant to this Order, counsel submits to the jurisdiction and sanctions of this Court on the subject matter of the designation.

the words "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL-ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY," and the following statement:

THIS ENVELOPE CONTAINS INFORMATION SUBJECT TO THE AGREED PROTECTIVE ORDER ENTERED BY THE PARTIES IN THIS LITIGATION, AND IS NOT TO BE OPENED NOR THE CONTENTS THEREOF DISPLAYED OR REVEALED EXCEPT BY THE COURT OR BY AGREEMENT OF THE PARTIES WHOSE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION IS CONTAINED WITHIN.

If any request to seal is made and not granted in whole or in part, the Confidential Information at issue shall be filed in whatever manner the Court directs.

7. Protection of Confidential Information

- General Protections. Confidential Information shall not be used or disclosed by the parties, counsel for the parties or any other persons identified in subparagraph (b) for any purpose whatsoever other than in this litigation, including any appeal thereof.
- Authorized Users of "CONFIDENTIAL" Materials. The parties and counsel for the parties shall not disclose or permit the disclosure of any materials designated "CONFIDENTIAL" pursuant to this Order to any third person or entity except as set forth in subparagraphs (i)-(vii). Subject to these requirements, the following categories of persons may be allowed to review materials designated "Confidential":
 - 1. In-house counsel and outside counsel of record for any Party engaged in the litigation of this Proceeding and the regular employees of such outside counsel to whom it is necessary that the material be shown for purposes of this Proceeding;
 - 2. Any individual Party and employees of a corporate Party

- actively engaged in assisting that Party's counsel in the litigation of this Proceeding, to the extent reasonably necessary to enable the counsel for that Party to render professional services in this Proceeding;
- 3. Persons officers. not owners. directors, managers, shareholders, or employees of any Party who are expressly retained to assist such Party's counsel ("Retaining Counsel") in the preparation of this Proceeding for trial including, but not limited to, consulting and testifying experts, independent auditors, accountants, statisticians, economists, and other experts, and the employees of such persons ("Outside Experts"), after such Outside Expert has signed and delivered to Retaining Counsel a statement in the form annexed hereto as Exhibit A.
- 4. Any Party's outside copy/document preparation service, which includes any e-discovery consultants and trial consultants;
- 5. Any mediator engaged by the parties for this case;
- 6. The Court, other court officials (including court reporters) and the trier of fact, pursuant to a sealing order; and
- 7. Any other person who subsequently is designated by (i) written agreement of all the Parties after a request by one of them, or (ii) by order of the Court upon motion by a Party, after notice to all the Parties.

Authorized Users of "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS

EYES ONLY" Material. Except as agreed to by the designating Party or its counsel or as otherwise provided herein, materials designated as "CONFIDENTIAL - ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" subject to this Protective Order, or extracts or summaries therefrom, shall not be given or shown to any person except the following:

(c)

- Outside counsel of record for any Party engaged in the litigation of this Proceeding and the regular employees of such outside counsel to whom it is necessary that the material be shown for purposes of this Proceeding;
- 2. Persons officers. directors, managers, not owners. shareholders, or employees of any Party who are expressly retained to assist such Party's counsel ("Retaining Counsel") in the preparation of this Proceeding for trial including, but not limited to, consulting and testifying experts, independent auditors, accountants, statisticians, economists, and other experts, and the employees of such persons ("Outside Experts"), after such Outside Expert has signed and delivered to Retaining Counsel a statement in the form annexed hereto as Exhibit A:
- 3. Any Party's outside copy/document preparation service, which includes any e-discovery consultants and trial consultants;

- 4. Any mediator engaged by the parties for this case;
- 5. The Court, other court officials (including court reporters) and the trier of fact, pursuant to a sealing order; and
- 6. Any other person who subsequently is designated by (i) written agreement of all the Parties after a request by one of them, or (ii) by order of the Court upon motion by a Party, after notice to all the Parties.
- 8. <u>Control of Documents</u>. Counsel for the parties shall make reasonable efforts to prevent unauthorized or inadvertent disclosure of Confidential Information. Counsel shall maintain the originals of the forms signed by persons acknowledging their obligations under this Order for a period of three years after the termination of the case.
- 9. Inadvertent Failure to Designate. An inadvertent failure to designate a document as Confidential Information does not, standing alone, waive the right to so designate the document; provided, however, that a failure to serve a timely Notice of Designation of deposition testimony as required by this Order, even if inadvertent, waives any protection for deposition testimony. If a party designates a document as Confidential Information after it was initially produced, the receiving party, on notification of the designation, must make a reasonable effort to assure that the document is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order. No party shall be found to have violated this Order for failing to maintain the confidentiality of material during a time when that material has not been designated Confidential Information, even where the failure to so designate was inadvertent and where the material is subsequently designated Confidential Information.
 - 10. Inadvertent Production of Privileged Materials. In the event that a Party

asserts that it inadvertently failed to designate any production materials or other information as privileged or work product materials, it shall promptly notify all Parties to whom such privileged material was produced or disclosed of the producing Party's intent to assert a claim of privilege or work product over such materials. Upon such notice:

- document(s) as privileged material, it shall promptly sequester all copies of the document(s), pending Court resolution of the challenge. Following notice by the producing Party, the receiving Party: (i) must not use or disclose the privileged material until the claim is resolved; and (ii) must take reasonable steps to retrieve the privileged material if the Party disclosed it before being notified. If the receiving Party intends to challenge the designation of the document(s), it shall move the Court for relief within ten (10) business days following notification by the producing Party.
- (b) If the receiving Party does not intend to challenge the designation of the document(s) as privileged material, the receiving Party shall:

 (i) take reasonable steps to retrieve the privileged material if it disclosed or disseminated such information before being notified; and (ii) promptly return or certify destruction of the privileged material, including all copies. For purposes of this provision, return or certification of destruction of the material shall be considered prompt if it occurs within seven (7) days of notification.

- Receiving Party. Nothing in this Protective Order shall relieve counsel for any receiving Party of any existing duty or obligation to return, and not to review, any privileged or work product materials without being requested by the producing Party to do so. Rather, in the event a receiving Party knows or reasonably should know it is in possession of what appears to be inadvertently produced privileged material, then the receiving Party shall immediately: (i) cease any further review of that material; and (ii) notify the producing Party of the apparent inadvertent production, requesting whether the producing Party intended for the material to be produced. Upon such notice:
 - (a) If the receiving Party intends to challenge the designation of the document(s) as privileged material, it shall promptly sequester all copies of the document(s), pending Court resolution of the challenge. Following notice by the producing Party, the receiving Party: (i) must not use or disclose the privileged material until the claim is resolved; and (ii) must take reasonable steps to retrieve the privileged material if the Party disclosed it before being notified. If the receiving Party intends to challenge the designation of the document(s), it shall move the Court for relief within ten (10) business days following notification by the producing Party.
 - (b) If the receiving Party does not intend to challenge the designation of the document(s) as privileged material, the receiving Party shall: (i) take reasonable steps to retrieve the privileged material if it disclosed or disseminated such information before being notified; and (ii) promptly return or certify destruction of the privileged material, including all copies. For

purposes of this provision, return or certification of destruction of the material shall be considered prompt if it occurs within seven (7) days of notification.

- 12. <u>Filing of Confidential Information</u>. This Order does not, by itself, authorize the filing of any document under seal. Any party wishing to file a document designated as Confidential Information in connection with a motion, brief or other submission to the Court must comply with this Court's rules and procedures.
- 13. No Greater Protection of Specific Documents. Except on privilege grounds not addressed by this Order, no party may withhold information from discovery on the ground that it requires protection greater than that afforded by this Order unless the party moves for an order providing such special protection.
- 14. <u>Challenges by a Party to Designation as Confidential Information</u>. The designation of any material or document as Confidential Information is subject to challenge by any party. The following procedure shall apply to any such challenge.
 - (a) Meet and Confer. A party challenging the designation of Confidential Information must do so in good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly with counsel for the designating party. In conferring, the challenging party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the designating party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the designation, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the designation. The designating party must respond to the challenge within five (5) business days.

- (b) Judicial Intervention. A party that elects to challenge a confidentiality designation may file and serve a motion that identifies the challenged material and sets forth in detail the basis for the challenge. Each such motion must be accompanied by a competent declaration that affirms that the movant has complied with the meet and confer requirements of this procedure. The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the designating party.

 Until the Court rules on the challenge, all parties shall continue to treat the materials as Confidential Information under the terms of this Order.
- 15. Action by the Court. Applications to the Court for an order relating to materials or documents designated Confidential Information shall be by motion. Nothing in this Order or any action or agreement of a party under this Order limits the Court's power to make orders concerning the disclosure of documents produced in discovery or at trial.
- Order shall be construed to affect the use of any document, material, or information at any trial or hearing. A party that intends to present or that anticipates that another party may present Confidential information at a hearing or trial shall bring that issue to the Court's and parties' attention by motion or in a pretrial memorandum without disclosing the Confidential Information. The Court may thereafter make such orders as are necessary to govern the use of such documents or information at trial.

17. <u>Confidential Information Subpoenaed or Ordered Produced in Other Litigation.</u>

- (a) If a receiving party is served with a subpoena or an order issued in other litigation that would compel disclosure of any material or document designated in this action as Confidential Information, the receiving party must so notify the designating party, in writing, immediately and in no event more than three court days after receiving the subpoena or order. Such notification must include a copy of the subpoena or court order.
- (b) The receiving party also must immediately inform in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is the subject of this Order. In addition, the receiving party must deliver a copy of this Order promptly to the party in the other action that caused the subpoena to issue.
- (c) The purpose of imposing these duties is to alert the interested persons to the existence of this Order and to afford the designating party in this case an opportunity to try to protect its Confidential Information in the court from which the subpoena or order issued. The designating party shall bear the burden and the expense of seeking protection in that court of its Confidential Information, and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a receiving party in this action to disobey a lawful

directive from another court. The obligations set forth in this paragraph remain in effect while the party has in its possession, custody or control Confidential Information by the other party to this case.

18. <u>Challenges by Members of the Public to Sealing Orders.</u> A party or interested member of the public has a right to challenge the sealing of particular documents that have been filed under seal, and the party asserting confidentiality will have the burden of demonstrating the propriety of filing under seal.

19. Obligations on Conclusion of Litigation.

- (a) Order Continues in Force. Unless otherwise agreed or ordered, this Order shall remain in force after dismissal or entry of final judgment not subject to further appeal.
- (b) Obligations at Conclusion of Litigation. Within sixty-three days after dismissal or entry of final judgment not subject to further appeal, all Confidential Information and documents marked "CONFIDENTIAL SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER" under this Order, including copies as defined in if 3(a), shall be returned to the producing party unless: (1) the document has been offered into evidence or filed without restriction as to disclosure; (2) the parties agree to destruction to the extent practicable in lieu of return;² or (3) as to documents bearing the notations, summations, or

² The parties may choose to agree that the receiving party shall destroy documents containing Confidential Information and certify the fact of destruction, and that the receiving party shall not be required to locate, isolate and return e-mails (including attachments to e-mails) that may include Confidential Information, or Confidential Information contained in deposition transcripts or drafts or final

other mental impressions of the receiving party, that party elects to destroy the documents and certifies to the producing party that it has done so.

- Retention of Work Product and one set of Filed Documents.

 Notwithstanding the above requirements to return or destroy documents, counsel may retain (1) attorney work product, including an index that refers or relates to designated Confidential Information so long as that work product does not duplicate verbatim substantial portions of Confidential Information, and (2) one complete set of all documents filed with the Court including those filed under seal. Any retained Confidential Information shall continue to be protected under this Order. An attorney may use his or her work product in subsequent litigation, provided that its use does not disclose or use Confidential Information.
- 21. <u>Deletion of Documents filed under Seal from Electronic Case Filing</u>

 (ECF) System. Filings under seal shall be deleted from the ECF system only upon order of the Court.
- 22. Order Subject to Modification. This Order shall be subject to modification by the Court on its own initiative or on motion of a party or any other person with standing concerning the subject matter.
- 23. No Prior Judicial Determination. This Order is entered based on the representations and agreements of the parties and for the purpose of facilitating discovery. Nothing herein shall be construed or presented as a judicial determination that any document or material designated Confidential Information by counsel or the parties is entitled to protection under Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure or otherwise until such time as the Court may rule on a specific document or issue.

24. Persons Bound. This Order shall take effect when entered and shall be

binding upon all counsel of record and their law firms, the parties, and persons made subject to

this Order by its terms.

25. Non-waiver. The unintentional or inadvertent production of documents and

information shall not constitute a waiver in this Proceeding, or any other litigation or matter,

of any privilege (including, without limitation, the attorney-client privilege and the attorney

work product privilege) applicable to the produced materials or for any other privileged or

immune materials containing the same or similar subject matter provided that the holder of

the privilege or protection took reasonable steps to prevent the disclosure. This Protective

Order encompasses an Order under Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) that any privilege that

may have been raised in documents produced in this Proceeding is not waived as a result of

disclosure of those documents in connection with this Proceeding, and this Protective Order

governs all persons or entities in all state or federal proceedings, whether or not they were

parties to this Proceeding. The fact of production of privileged information or documents

by any producing Party in this Proceeding shall not be used as a basis for arguing that a

claim of privilege or work product has been waived in any other proceeding. Without limiting

the foregoing, this Protective Order shall not affect the Parties' legal rights to assert privilege

claims over documents in any other proceeding.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: /0/11/16

Hon, George C. Hanks, Jr.

17

ATTACHMENT A

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS GALVESTON DIVISION

EXPERIENCE INFUSION CENTER,)
LLC,)
Plaintiff,)))
VS.) Case No. 3:16-cv-00199
HEALTH CARE SERVICE) Han Garage C Harles In
CORPORATION, A Mutual Legal	Hon. George C. Hanks, Jr.
Reserve Company AND BLUE CROSS)
AND BLUE SHIELD OF TEXAS, a)
Division of HEALTH CARE SERVICE)
CORPORATION, A Mutual Legal)
Reserve Company,)
Defendant.)

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

The undersigned hereby acknowledges that he/she has read the Confidentiality Order dated _______ in the above-captioned action and attached hereto, understands the terms thereof, and agrees to be bound by its terms. The undersigned submits to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Southern District of Texas in matters relating to the Confidentiality Order and understands that the terms of the Confidentiality Order obligate him/her to use materials designated as Confidential Information in accordance with the Order solely for the purposes of the above-captioned action, and not to disclose any such Confidential Information to any other person, firm or concern.

	The undersigned	acknowledges	that violation	of the	Confidentiality	Order may	result
in penal	ties for contemp	t of court.					

Name:	 		
Job Title: _	 	 	
Date:	 	 	
Signature			