# Exhibit 1

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA NORFOLK DIVISION

I/P	EN	GINE,	INC.

Plaintiff,

v.

Civil Action No. 2:11-cv-512

AOL, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

### **PROPOSED ORDER**

Before the Court is the Motion to Seal filed by Google Inc. and IAC Search & Media, Inc. ("Defendants' Motion to Seal") Portions of Defendants' Reply Brief in Support of Motion to Compel ("Portions of Defendants' Reply Brief") and Exhibits AA and BB to the Declaration of Emily C. O'Brien in Support of the Reply ("Certain Exhibits to O'Brien Declaration"). After considering the Motion to Seal, Order and related filings, the Court is of the opinion that the Motion to Seal should be granted. It is therefore ORDERED as follows:

- 1. Defendants have asked to file under seal Portions of Defendants' Reply Brief and Certain Exhibits to the O'Brien Declaration as set forth in their motion.
- 2. There are three requirements for sealing court filings: (1) public notice with an opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific findings in support of a decision to seal and rejecting alternatives to sealing. *See, e.g., Flexible Benefits Council v. Feldman*, No. 1:08-CV-371, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 93039 (E.D. Va. Nov. 13, 2008) (citing *Ashcroft v. Conoco, Inc.*, 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2000)). This Court finds that Portions of Defendants' Reply Brief and Certain Exhibits to the O'Brien Declaration may

contain data that is confidential under the Protective Order entered in this matter on January 23, 2012; that public notice has been given, that no objections have been filed; that the public's interest in access is outweighed by the interests in preserving such confidentiality; and that there

are no alternatives that appropriately serve these interests.

3. For the sake of consistency with practices governing the case as a whole, Portions of Defendants' Reply Brief and Certain Exhibits to the O'Brien Declaration shall remain sealed and be treated in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Protective Order.

Accordingly, it is ORDERED that Defendants' Motion to Seal is granted and Defendants are permitted to file under seal Portions of Defendants' Reply Brief and Certain Exhibits to the O'Brien Declaration. The Court shall retain sealed materials until forty-five (45) days after entry of a final order. If the case is not appealed, any sealed materials should then be returned to counsel for the filing party.

Dated: April, 2012	Entered:/
	United States District Court
	Eastern District of Virginia

#### WE ASK FOR THIS:

\_\_\_\_\_

Stephen E. Noona Virginia State Bar No. 25367 KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C. 150 West Main Street, Suite 2100 Norfolk, VA 23510

Telephone: (757) 624.3000 Facsimile: (757) 624.3169 senoona@kaufcan.com

David Bilsker
David A. Perlson
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
SULLIVAN, LLP
50 California Street, 22nd Floor
San Francisco, California 94111
Telephone: (415) 875-6600
Facsimile: (415) 875-6700
davidbilsker@quinnemanuel.com
davidperlson@quinnemanuel.com

Attorneys for Google Inc., and IAC Search & Media, Inc.

#### **SEEN:**

Donald C. Schultz W. Ryan Snow Steven Stancliff CRENSHAW, WARE & MARTIN, P.L.C.

150 West Main Street, Suite 1500

Norfolk, VA 23510

Telephone: (757) 623-3000 Facsimile: (757) 623-5735 dschultz@cwm-law.cm wrsnow@cwm-law.com sstancliff@cwm-law.com

Jeffrey K. Sherwood Kenneth W. Brothers DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP 1825 Eye Street NW Washington, DC 20006 Telephone: (202) 420-2200

Facsimile: (202) 420-2201

sherwoodj@dicksteinshapiro.com brothersk@dicksteinshapiro.com

Counsel for Plaintiff, I/P Engine, Inc.

# **SEEN AND AGREED:**

\_\_\_\_\_

Stephen E. Noona Virginia State Bar No. 25367 KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C. 150 West Main Street, Suite 2100 Norfolk, VA 23510

Telephone: (757) 624-3000 Facsimile: (757) 624-3169

senoona@kaufcan.com

Attorneys for Google Inc., Target Corporation, IAC Search & Media, Inc., AOL Inc, and Gannet Co., Inc.

11659947\_1.DOC