#### Exhibit 1

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA NORFOLK DIVISION

I/P ENGINE, INC.

Plaintiff.

v.

Civil Action No. 2:11-cv-512

AOL, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

#### PROPOSED ORDER

Before the Court is the Motion to Seal filed by Defendants, Google Inc., IAC Search & Media, Inc., Gannett Co., Inc. and Target Corporation ("Defendants' Motion to Seal"): (1) Portions of Defendants' Brief in Opposition To Plaintiff's Motion For Discovery Sanctions ("Defendants' Opposition Brief") and (2) Exhibits M and N to the Declaration of Emily O'Brien in Support thereof ("Certain Exhibits to the O'Brien Declaration"). After considering the Motion to Seal, Order and related filings, the Court is of the opinion that the Motion to Seal should be granted. It is therefore ORDERED as follows:

- Defendants have asked to file under seal (1) Defendants' Opposition Brief and
   (2) Certain Exhibits to the O'Brien Declaration in support thereof.
- 2. There are three requirements for sealing court filings: (1) public notice with an opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific findings in support of a decision to seal and rejecting alternatives to sealing. *See, e.g., Flexible Benefits Council v. Feldman*, No. 1:08-CV-371, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 93039 (E.D. Va. Nov.

13, 2008) (citing Ashcroft v. Conoco, Inc., 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4th Cir. 2000)). This Court finds

that Defendants' Opposition Brief and Certain Exhibits to the O'Brien Declaration may contain

data that is confidential under the Protective Order entered in this matter on January 23, 2012;

that public notice has been given, that no objections have been filed; that the public's interest in

access is outweighed by the interests in preserving such confidentiality; and that there are no

alternatives that appropriately serve these interests.

3. For the sake of consistency with practices governing the case as a whole,

Defendants' Opposition Brief and Certain Exhibits to the O'Brien Declaration shall remain

sealed and be treated in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Protective Order.

Accordingly, it is ORDERED that Defendants' Motion to Seal is granted and Defendants

are permitted to file under seal Defendants' Opposition Brief and Certain Exhibits (M and N) to

the O'Brien Declaration. The Court shall retain sealed materials until forty-five (45) days after

entry of a final order. If the case is not appealed, any sealed materials should then be returned to

counsel for the filing party.

\_\_\_\_\_

United States District Court Eastern District of Virginia

2

### WE ASK FOR THIS:

## /s/Stephen E. Noona

Stephen E. Noona Virginia State Bar No. 25367 KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C. 150 West Main Street, Suite 2100 Norfolk, VA 23510

Telephone: (757) 624.3000 Facsimile: (757) 624.3169 senoona@kaufcan.com

David Bilsker
David A. Perlson
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
SULLIVAN, LLP
50 California Street, 22nd Floor
San Francisco, California 94111
Telephone: (415) 875-6600
Facsimile: (415) 875-6700
davidbilsker@quinnemanuel.com
davidperlson@quinnemanuel.com

Counsel for Defendants GOOGLE INC., IAC SEARCH & MEDIA, INC., TARGET CORP., and GANNETT CO., INC.