# Exhibit 1

### Exhibit 1

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA NORFOLK DIVISION

I/P ENGINE, INC.

Plaintiff.

v.

Civil Action No. 2:11-cv-512

AOL, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

# PROPOSED ORDER

Before the Court is the Motion to Seal filed by Defendants Google, Inc., Target Corporation, IAC Search & Media, Inc., Gannet Co., Inc. and AOL Inc. (collectively "Defendants") ("Defendants' Motion to Seal") (1) Portions of the Memorandum in Support of Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment ("Defendants' Memorandum in Support"); (2) Exhibits 4-9, 21-22 and 25-31 to the Declaration of Howard Chen in Support of Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment ("Certain Exhibits to Chen Declaration"); and (3) the Declaration of Bartholomew Furrow in Support of Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment ("the Furrow Declaration"). After considering the Motion to Seal, Order and related filings, the Court is of the opinion that the Motion to Seal should be granted. It is therefore ORDERED as follows:

- Defendants have asked to file under seal Defendants' Memorandum in Support,
   Certain Exhibits to Chen Declaration, and the Furrow Declaration.
  - 2. There are three requirements for sealing court filings: (1) public notice with an

opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific

findings in support of a decision to seal and rejecting alternatives to sealing. See, e.g., Flexible

Benefits Council v. Feldman, No. 1:08-CV-371, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 93039 (E.D. Va. Nov.

13, 2008) (citing Ashcroft v. Conoco, Inc., 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4th Cir. 2000)). This Court finds

that Defendants' Memorandum in Support, Certain Exhibits to Chen Declaration, and the Furrow

Declaration may contain data that is confidential under the Protective Order entered in this

matter on January 23, 2012; that public notice has been given, that no objections have been filed;

that the public's interest in access is outweighed by the interests in preserving such

confidentiality; and that there are no alternatives that appropriately serve these interests.

3. For the sake of consistency with practices governing the case as a whole,

Defendants' Memorandum in Support, Certain Exhibits to Chen Declaration, and the Furrow

Declaration shall remain sealed and be treated in accordance with the terms and conditions of the

Protective Order.

Accordingly, it is ORDERED that Defendants' Motion to Seal is granted and Defendants

are permitted to file under seal Defendants' Memorandum in Support, Certain Exhibits to Chen

Declaration, and the Furrow Declaration. The Court shall retain sealed materials until forty-five

(45) days after entry of a final order. If the case is not appealed, any sealed materials should then

be returned to counsel for the filing party.

Dated: September \_\_\_\_\_, 2012

\_\_\_\_/\_\_\_/\_\_\_\_ Entered:

**United States District Court** 

Eastern District of Virginia

2

### WE ASK FOR THIS:

# /s/Stephen E. Noona

Stephen E. Noona Virginia State Bar No. 25367 KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C. 150 West Main Street, Suite 2100 Norfolk, VA 23510

Telephone: (757) 624.3000 Facsimile: (757) 624.3169 senoona@kaufcan.com

David Bilsker
David A. Perlson
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
SULLIVAN, LLP
50 California Street, 22nd Floor
San Francisco, California 94111
Telephone: (415) 875-6600
Facsimile: (415) 875-6700
davidbilsker@quinnemanuel.com
davidperlson@quinnemanuel.com

Counsel for Defendants Google Inc., Target Corporation, IAC Search & Media, Inc., and Gannet Co., Inc.

# /s/ Stephen E. Noona

Stephen E. Noona Virginia State Bar No. 25367 KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C. 150 West Main Street, Suite 2100 Norfolk, VA 23510

Telephone: (757) 624-3000 Facsimile: (757) 624-3169 senoona@kaufcan.com

Robert L. Burns
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,
GARRETT & DUNNER, LLP
Two Freedom Square
11955 Freedom Drive
Reston, VA 20190

Telephone: (571) 203-2700 Facsimile: (202) 408-4400

Courtney S. Alexander FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW, GARRETT & DUNNER, LLP 3500 SunTrust Plaza 303 Peachtree Street, NE Atlanta, GA 94111

Telephone: (404) 653-6400 Facsimile: (415) 653-6444

Counsel for Defendant AOL Inc.

# **SEEN AND AGREED:**

# /s/ Donald C. Schultz

Donald C. Schultz W. Ryan Snow Steven Stancliff CRENSHAW, WARE & MARTIN, P.L.C. 150 West Main Street, Suite 1500 Norfolk, VA 23510

Telephone: (757) 623-3000 Facsimile: (757) 623-5735 dschultz@cwm-law.cm wrsnow@cwm-law.com sstancliff@cwm-law.com

Jeffrey K. Sherwood Kenneth W. Brothers DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP 1825 Eye Street NW Washington, DC 20006 Telephone: (202) 420-2200 Facsimile: (202) 420-2201

sherwoodj@dicksteinshapiro.combrothersk@dicksteinshapiro.com

Counsel for Plaintiff, I/P Engine, Inc.

11920905v1